AN EVALUATION OF THE RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION POLICY AND PRACTICE IN THE DEPARTMENT OF WATER AFFAIRS AND FORESTRY.

HEINRICH METTLER

20110034

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Magister in Business Administration at the Port Elizabeth Technikon

Promotor: M. Peens

Submitted on: 15 January 2004
I, Heinrich F.W. Mettler, hereby declare that:

- The work in this research paper is my own original work;
- All sources used or referred to have been documented and recognised;
  and
- The research paper has not been previously submitted in full or partial
  fulfilment of the requirements of an equivalent or higher qualification at
  any other recognised education institution.

__________________________________________________________
HEINRICH METTLER                                           DATE
ABSTRACT

The objective of this study was to evaluate the current recruitment and selection policy of the Department of Water Affairs and Forestry (DWAF) and to determine whether the recruitment and selection practices comply therewith. To establish whether the policy enhances DWAF’s objective to improve its service delivery, a content analysis of the recruitment and selection policy was executed. To determine whether the recruitment and selection practices comply with the written and accepted policy a questionnaire was designed based on the provisions of the policy and best practices. The questionnaire was personally delivered to 50 potential respondents, of which 35 completed it. The completed questionnaires were processed and analysed using Microsoft Excel 2000.

The policy was found to be well researched, comprehensive and efficient to DWAF’s missions and objectives. It however showed signs that indicate the danger of being applied inconsistently. Clarity in terms of procedural sequence and conditions for use eluded some policy provisions, making it acceptable to assume and base decisions on the users discretion. Trained human resource managers guide recruitment and selection practices.

The study concluded that the policy was being implemented: the recruitment and selection practices within DWAF complied with its accepted policy. There are standardisation on advertising as recruitment method, and interviewing as selection method. The recruitment and selection activities that are not mentioned within the recruitment and selection policy are done at the line manager and human resource manager’s discretion - this is found to be inconsistent and potentially dangerous to the process.

DWAF employs recruitment and selection as tool to enhance performance management and effective service delivery. Recommendations are made to assist DWAF in its quest to achieve maximum return on investment from its human capital.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The success I have experienced thus far in my life is directly related to the motivation, inspiration, encouragement and help of many benefactors. I want to thank and honour them through this acknowledgement:

- My study leader, Maritha Peens, for her gentle encouragement, integrity, ingenuity and for being an excellent motivator;
- The Department of Water Affairs and Forestry for financial assistance;
- The employees of the Department of Water Affairs and Forestry who participated in the study, for scheduling me into their hectic programs;
- The Human Resource Development division of the Department of Water Affairs, for organising and supporting the empirical study;
- Editor, Cornelia Watts, for editing the report;
- My wife, Lucy, for her love, patience and support and for inspiring me to achieve this and other milestones;
- My children, Alistaire and Caleb, for helping me to grow and be the best I can be;
- My parents, Francois and Ruth, and brother and sister, for creating a caring environment in which I could make mistakes, grow and learn to achieve;
- My colleague, Jonel Kerspuy, for her input of time and insight;
- Lecturers and staff of the MBA Unit, MBA study group members and other colleagues and friends, for their support and encouragement;
- My Saviour, Jesus Christ, for whom in all things I want to honour.
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE OF CONTENTS</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DECLARATION</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF APPENDICES</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## CHAPTER 1

PROBLEM STATEMENT AND DEFINITION OF CONCEPTS

1.1 INTRODUCTION 1
1.2 THE MAIN PROBLEM 2
1.3 THE SUB-PROBLEM 2
1.4 DELIMITATION OF THE RESEARCH 3
1.4.1 Demarcation of the organization to be researched 3
1.4.2 Geographic demarcation 5
1.5 DEFINITION OF KEY TERMS 5
1.5.1 Human Resource Management 5
1.5.2 Strategic Human Resource Management 5
1.5.3 Strategy 6
1.5.4 Human capital 6
1.6 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE RESEARCH 6
1.7 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY 8
1.7.1 Literature Study 8
1.7.2 Empirical Study 8
1.8 OUTLINE OF THE CHAPTERS 9
1.9 CONCLUSION 9
CHAPTER 4
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

4.1 INTRODUCTION

4.2 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

4.2.1 Qualitative research methodologies

4.2.2 Quantitative research methodologies

4.3 RESEARCH DESIGN

4.4 DATA COLLECTION

4.4.1 Questionnaire

4.4.2 Checklist

4.4.3 Pilot testing

4.4.4 Sampling

4.4.5 Administration of the Questionnaires

4.5 DATA ANALYSIS

4.6 CONCLUSION
CHAPTER 5
POLICY ANALYSIS

5.1 INTRODUCTION 62
5.2 POLICY OVERVIEW 62
5.3 POLICY EVALUATION 63
5.3.1 Checklist analysis 63
5.3.2 Procedural analysis 69
5.4 CONCLUSION 74

CHAPTER 6
PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS OF RESEARCH RESULTS

6.1 INTRODUCTION 75
6.2 RESEARCH RESPONSE 75
6.3 DEMOGRAPHIC CHARACTERISTICS OF RESPONDENTS 76
6.4 PRESENTATION OF DATA 77
6.4.1 Policy referral 77
6.4.2 Needs assessment 78
6.4.3 Approval 78
6.4.4 Job description and Profiling 79
6.4.5 Planning 80
6.4.6 Recruitment source 84
6.4.7 Recruitment method 84
6.4.8 Advertisement design 86
6.4.9 Implementation 87
6.4.10Feedback 88
6.4.11Planning and conducting Interview 89
6.4.12Employment testing 90
6.4.13Selection 91
6.4.14Legal framework 92
6.4.15Time 94
6.4.16Information accuracy 94
6.4.17Training 95
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1   Strategic points to improve service delivery 11
Figure 2.2   Porter’s value chain concept 18
Figure 3.1   Best Practice for Recruitment and Selection 31
LIST OF TABLES

Table 4.1  Response Dynamics 59
Table 6.1  Questionnaire responses 76
Table 6.2  Respondent demographic 77
Table 6.3  Policy usages 78
Table 6.4  Needs assessment 78
Table 6.5  Approvals 79
Table 6.6  Profiling 80
Table 6.7  Panel demographics 81
Table 6.8  Role Player involvements 81
Table 6.9  Panel size 82
Table 6.10 Participation of panel members 83
Table 6.11 Skill level of Panel members 83
Table 6.12 Source preference 84
Table 6.13 Recruitment method 85
Table 6.14 Advertisement 86
Table 6.15 Post detail 87
Table 6.16 Medium used to reach candidates 88
Table 6.17 Notification of the unsuccessful 89
Table 6.18 Interview environment 89
Table 6.19 Questioning 90
Table 6.20 Competency assessment 91
Table 6.21 Selection tools applied 92
Table 6.22 Suitably Qualified 93
Table 6.23 Period between application and Appointment 94
Table 6.24 Accurate job information 95
Table 6.25 Time spent in training 95
Table 6.26 Frustrations encountered during process 96
Table 6.27 Frustrations encountered by line managers 98
Table 6.28 Frustrations encountered by HR managers 98
Table 6.29 Recommendations for improvement: Incumbents 100
Table 6.30 Recommendations from line and HR managers 103
# LIST OF APPENDICES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A</td>
<td>Questionnaire for Incumbents</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix B</td>
<td>Questionnaire for Line Managers and Human Resource Managers</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(Including the Policy Checklist)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix C</td>
<td>Recruitment and Selection Policy of DWAF</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix D</td>
<td>Response to open-ended questions</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1
PROBLEM STATEMENT AND DEFINITION OF CONCEPTS

1.1 INTRODUCTION

What is the most important asset in an organisation? The criteria on which to answer this question must be determined by the competitive advantage that such an asset can provide. Capital, equipment, market readiness, land, cheap labour and human resources are all contenders. Smit and Cronje (1982:350) claim that it is people who give life to an organisation and that they can be regarded as an organisation’s most important resources. Covey (1997:182) agrees, stating that people attain the highest value in an organisation, because they are the programmers – who produce everything else at the personal, interpersonal, managerial and organisational levels.

Grier (1999:122) explains that the economic turbulence, globalisation, technology, changing demographic, and differences in workforce values have created almost unprecedented environmental uncertainty. In these conditions human resources is one of the few factors over which organisations have a measure of control, thus reinforcing human resources as a distinctive factor for competitive advantage. This automatically implies that other factors are conditional for entry into competition. Johnson and Scholes (2002:480) state that the possession of resources, including people, does not guarantee strategic success. However, the way these resources are deployed, managed, controlled and, in the case of people, motivated to create competence in those activities and business processes needed to achieve competitive advantage, differentiate the mediocre from the market leaders.

The Public Service can be regarded as the largest organisation within a country with the most secure resource base. It has a predetermined budget with the government on its side. Its purpose is to develop, implement, monitor, evaluate and to police policy. The Transformation White Paper of South Africa suggests that the competitive advantage of the Public Service is its service delivery. All
resources should enhance the Public Service’s service delivery, so that it can be fast, reliable, flexible, economical and of a high quality.

1.2 THE MAIN PROBLEM

The main problem is:

To what extent does the recruitment and selection practice in the Department of Water Affairs and Forestry comply with its written Recruitment and Selection policy and procedure?

1.3 THE SUB-PROBLEMS

The following sub-problems were identified and will be addressed in order to deal with and solve the main problem:

Sub-problem one:
What is the drive behind the Public Services’ initiative to improve their Recruitment and Selection policies?

Sub-problem two:
What does literature suggest as best practices for recruitment and selection?

Sub-problem three:
How does the policy of the Department of Water Affairs and Forestry (DWAF) compare with best practices as discussed in the literature study?

Sub-problem four:
How does the recruitment and selection practice in DWAF conform to the written policy?
1.4 DELIMITATION OF THE RESEARCH

To ensure that the research is manageable, it is necessary to demarcate the research to the areas mentioned below.

1.4.1 Demarcation of the organisations to be researched

The scope of the research will be limited to the Department of Water Affairs and Forestry (DWAF). DWAF is governed by the National Water Act (No 36 of 1998)(NWA), the Water Services Act (No 108 of 1997)(WSA), the National Forest Act (No 84 of 1998)(NFA), and the National Veld and Forest Act (No 101 of 1998)(NVFA). The NWA has mandated DWAF to ensure that South Africa’s water resources are protected, used, developed, conserved, managed and controlled in a sustainable and equitable manner, for the benefit of all persons or inhabitants of the Republic of South Africa (RSA). The WSA gives DWAF the directive to create a development regulatory framework within which water services can be provided. The NFA authorises DWAF to ensure that South Africa’s forestry resources are protected, used, developed, conserved, managed and controlled in a sustainable equitable manner, to the benefit of all South Africans. The NVFA has commanded DWAF to prevent and combat veld and forest fires and maintain forests throughout the country and thereby limit and reduce the damage and losses caused by fires to; life, fixed property, infrastructure, moveable property, stocks, crops, fauna and flora forest and veld in RSA.

DWAF envisions a democratic people centred nation working towards human rights, social justice, equity and prosperity for all. They envisage a society in which people enjoy the benefits of clean water and hygienic services, where water can be used carefully and productively for economic activities, which promotes growth, development and prosperity for all. DWAF foresees a society of people who understands and protects natural resources; makes them ecologically stable and safeguards them for current and future generations (Department of water Affairs and Forestry: Human Resource Policies and Guidelines).
The mission of DWAF is to serve the people of South Africa by:

- Conserving, managing and developing South Africa’s water resources and forests in a scientific and environmentally sustainable manner in order to meet the social and economic needs of South Africa, now and in the future;
- Ensuring that water services are provided to all South Africans in an efficient, cost-effective and sustainable way;
- Managing and sustaining our forests, by using the Best Scientific Practice in a participatory and sustainable manner;
- Educating the people of South Africa in ways to manage, conserve and sustain our water and forestry resources;
- Co-operating with all spheres of Government, in order to achieve the best and most integrated development in our country and region;
- Creating the best possible opportunities for employment, the eradication of poverty and the promotion of equity, social development and democratic governance.

The values of DWAF are:

- That as public servants, their skills will at all times be used for; the benefit of the people, the reconstruction and development of our country in the spirit of Batho Pele (People First).
- As management, their responsibility is to provide high quality transformational leadership, a disciplined work ethics and to promote a working culture for motivated, accountable and committed teamwork.
- As fellow citizens of the African continent, they are dedicated to long-term integrated regional security and co-operation, and to the spirit of African Renaissance.
- That their working environment should be governed by the principles of representivity, equality, mutual respect and human development.
1.4.2 Geographic demarcation

This research area entails the Western Province, which is one of the nine Provinces in South Africa.

1.5 DEFINITIONS OF KEY TERMS

To ensure a common understanding, the key terms are defined as follows.

1.5.1 Human resource management

Swanepoel, van Wyk, Erasmus and Schenk (2000:56) define Human Resource Management (HRM) as that part of management concerned with all the factors, decisions, principles, strategies, operations, practices, functions, activities, methods, related to employees in organisations and all the dimensions related to people in their employment relationships. All the dynamics that flow from it, are aimed at helping to ensure organisational success through “good fit” employment relationships, in turbulent and ever changing environmental conditions.

For the purpose of this study Human Resource Management will be defined as: all practices and activities related to employees of an organisation, enhancing the organisation’s corporate strategy.

1.5.2 Strategic human resource management

Strategic human resources management is largely about integration and adaptation. Its concern is to ensure that: (1) HRM is fully integrated with the strategy and the strategic needs of the firm, (2) Human Resource policies cohere both across policy areas and across hierarchies and (3) Human Resource practices are adjusted, accepted and used by line managers and employees as part of their everyday work.

Patrick Wright and Gary McMahan, the fathers of the theoretical framework for strategic HRM, define strategic human resources management as the pattern of
planned human resource deployments and activities intended to enable an organisation to achieve its goals (Grier, 1999:123).

1.5.3 Strategy

Johnson and Scholes (2002:10) define strategy as the direction and scope of an organisation in the long term, which achieves advantage for the organisation through its configuration of resources within a changing environment and to fulfil stakeholder expectations.

Hutton (2001:8) states that a strategy is a process that is followed in order to achieve a specific objective, whilst taking into account influences of the environment, and acting on those influences, to ensure that the final objective is met.

1.5.4 Human capital

Human capital is the intangible assets created through the development of employee knowledge and skills; facilitated by management that leads to innovation and creativity that creates conditions in the organisation or region that are unique and as such, creates a competitive advantage (Hutton, 2001:12).

1.6 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE RESEARCH

South Africa as a nation has recently undergone dramatic changes. Its political order changed in 1994, with its first ever all-inclusive election. The Government of National Unity has brought about peace and temporal political stability. A lasting political solution will have to be supported by an environment of sustainable economic growth and equitable socio-economic development, bringing about the challenge to develop appropriate policies aimed at economical and social upliftment.

Sustainable growth requires political stability, policies that encourage economic growth through private enterprise, fiscal discipline, exposure to foreign
competition and sound labour relations. This implies the lowering of trade barriers and inevitably participating in globalisation. Policies should therefore be developed to enhance productivity, and thus create the competitive edge, and to redress inequalities associated with unemployment, poverty and social-economic backlogs.

Historically, South Africa has invested heavily in the first stage processing industries for export and domestic markets, under high protection. International trade has however turned against primary products and low technology manufactured goods, implying that South Africa has lost its competitive edge that in the past was provided by its natural resources. This forces the country to invest more in its most constant resource, the people of South Africa.

The challenges of policy development, implementation, monitoring, evaluation and policing thereof are in the hands of the Public Service. The Public Sector or State departments are of the country’s largest employers and notorious for its bureaucracy, ineffectiveness and low level of service delivery. This intensifies South Africa’s objective to develop global competitive strategies, to enhance economical growth, as it is impossible to reach this objective if the enforcers of the policies are inefficient?

The importance of this research is emphasised by the fact that millions of South Africans are unsure of their future, in the light of the transformation and restructuring of the Public Service. This transformation is aimed at improving services and addressing the inequities of the past. The White Paper on Transformation of the Public Service Delivery published in November 1995 sets Transforming Service Delivery as the key of the eight transformation priorities. The rationale is that a transformed South African public service will be judged by the criterion of its effectiveness in delivery of service, which meets the basic needs of all South African citizens. The initiative implies “people first” and is encapsulated in the name adopted for it, namely Batho Pele. The Transformation White Paper also provides a framework, which enables national and provincial departments to develop departmental service delivery strategies; promote a continuous improvement in quantity, quality and equity of the service provided
by that specific department. An aligned human resource strategy is essential to the success of the Batho Pele initiative.

The purpose of this research is to compliment existing guidelines from literature with new guidelines based on experience gained from practice in order to evaluate the current recruitment and selection policy and design a recruitment and selection procedural model for DWAF.

This research can also compliment the human resource practices in DWAF, enhancing its strategy to supply water for all, forever. Applying best practices in the public service would enhance the competitive edge of service delivery and thus make the country more attractive for foreign investment leading to economic growth.

1.7 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

In conducting the research the subsequent procedure was adopted to solve the main problem as well as the sub-problems.

1.7.1 Literature Study

A literature study was conducted to clarify the significance of recruitment and selection in terms of improved service delivery. This was complimented by a study administered to identify key factors leading to successful recruitment and selection. Literature was gathered from the libraries of the Port Elizabeth Technikon, George Municipality and the Internet.

1.7.2 Empirical Study

The empirical study consists of the following:

- A survey conducted amongst the recently employed in the delimited area to measure the effectivity of espoused recruitment and selection practices.
- A content analysis of the current recruitment and selection policy, based upon a checklist developed from literature.
1.8 OUTLINE OF THE CHAPTERS

Chapter 1: Problem statement and definition of key concepts
Chapter 2: The drive towards service delivery in the Public Service
Chapter 3: Recruitment and Selection
Chapter 4: Research Methodology
Chapter 5: Policy Analysis
Chapter 6: Presentation and Analysis of Research Results
Chapter 7: Conclusion and recommendations

1.9 CONCLUSION

In this chapter, the problem and sub-problems addressed in this study were formulated. To ensure consistency throughout the research paper, the most important concepts and terms were defined. A discussion of the importance of the topic was followed by an outline of the research approach and the report structure.

The next two chapters are dedicated to the literature study. In chapter 2 the motivation for improved recruitment and selection policies and practices are discussed. Government initiatives regarding better people management and its relevance to service delivery are examined and highlighted.
CHAPTER 2
THE DRIVE TOWARDS SERVICE DELIVERY IN THE PUBLIC SERVICE

2.1 INTRODUCTION

The Ministry of Public Service and Administration (PSA) (2000) declared that the Government envisions a better life for all through the effective implementation of strategies and efficient utilization of resources. Different initiatives were launched by the Government to consolidate policy and regulatory achievements, strengthen the management echelon, and to intensify the modernization of the Public Service.

This chapter reviews literature relating to the service delivery in the Public Service. Initiatives such as the White Paper on Transforming the Public Service and the Senior Management Services are discussed, as vehicles, focusing on people management issues, to improve service delivery.

Porter as quoted by Johnson and Scholes (2002:161), believes that support activities, such as people management issues, help to improve the effectiveness and efficiency of primary activities. This chapter therefore conclude with a discussion of human resource management as a support activity and the role of recruitment and selection in service delivery.

2.2 STRATEGIC POINTS

At a conference named the Public Service Learning Academy held from 16 July to 19 July 1998 in Nelspruit, people across the spectrum of the Public Service shared ideas and explored innovative strategies and solutions to the most challenging impediments to service delivery, with a strong emphasis on learning and development (Holdsworth, 1998:1). They envisaged the four strategic points for improved service delivery, as:

- People management
- Financial and Asset management
- Technology and Information, and
Holdsworth (1998:2) proposes the following model, presented in Figure 2.1, to illustrate and discuss the key strategic points and its relation to the main stakeholders.

Figure 2.1: Strategic points for improved service delivery (Holdsworth: 1998:2)

2.2.1 People management

This strategic point proposed that government and other stakeholders, tasked with service delivery, shift the narrow goal-driven paradigm that impedes the abilities and potential of its employees, to a holistic perspective that acknowledges the importance of the workforce. The holistic paradigm is cognizant of the employees’ welfare and health, recruitment and deployment issues, self-actualisation and issues of diversity.
2.2.2 Financial and asset management

This strategic point heeds to the integration and co-ordination of service delivery and financial and asset management into a complementary supportive system. The main challenge to this is to remove unnecessary restrictions as a result of misunderstandings and incongruent policies.

2.2.3 Technology and information

This strategic point seeks to introduce innovative systems and mechanisms that would enhance the quality and scope of service delivery through the introduction of compatible systems throughout the Government and promote computer literacy.

2.2.4 Corruption

Corruption is illustrated as a major debilitating factor in service delivery. It causes major crippling losses of resources. This strategic point seeks to reinforce the integrity amongst the workforce and improve poor workmanship.

2.2.5 The Community and Government

The community, who is traditionally perceived as passive recipients or consumers are placed at the centre or hub of the wheel while the Government who has also been perceived as ‘all-knowing provider’ appears as the rim of the wheel. However, the four spokes can be viewed as conduits of communication between the Government and the community thus signifying the importance of ongoing consultations between the two. The community thus becomes a consumer and also experts in what they need and the Government becomes a service deliverer whose activities are determined by the community. This implies interdependency and not only in responsibility and accountability but also in growth and sustainability.
Hutton (2001:24) remarks that it is interesting to note how the role of human capital in the creation of competitive advantage has changed from being reactive (unskilled labour for the operation of machinery) to being proactive (development, dissemination and management of knowledge and information). Therefore further discussions will concentrate on the issues related to people management and its influence on service delivery.

2.3. GOVERNMENT INITIATIVES

When a Government comes into office, one of its major priorities is to improve the lives of its people through the provision of better services (Holdsworth 1998:1). This objective, in most of the cases is a political tool used to get into office, but also the yardstick by which a government’s successes are measured. In response to the socio-economic needs in South Africa, and in view of public service as a legitimate expectation of every citizen and not a privilege, the Ministry of Public Service and Administration (DPSA) published a White Paper on Transforming Public Service Delivery in the Government Gazette on 1 October 1997. This is also referred to as Batho Pele. The purpose of the White Paper is firstly, to improve service delivery, implying that transformation of Public Service delivery is to meet the basic need of all South Africans and secondly, to provide a policy framework and a practical implementation strategy for the transformation of Public Service delivery. Batho Pele means people first and emphasises that the receiver of Public Service be treated sympathetically. As a foreword to the White Paper proposal, Minister Zola Skweyiya reiterated the Government’s intentions by stating that service delivery must be judged in terms of the practical difference people see in their everyday lives.

Other prominent initiatives by the Government (1999 – 2004) to consolidate the policy and regulatory achievements accomplished during their first term of governance (1994-1999), and to strengthen the management echelon and intensify the modernisation of the Public Service are:

- Negotiations on the transformation and restructuring of the Public Service.
- A review of the macro benefits (housing, medical aid and pension).
• Development of a competency framework with competency-based recruitment and performance management systems for the Senior Management Service.
• Development of an action plan to alleviate the impact of HIV/AIDS in the Public Service.
• Implementation of the Public Service Anti-Corruption strategy.

Although all of the above are related to people management, further discussion will be limited to the Batho Pele and the Senior Management Services Initiatives.

2.4 BATHO PELE

Du Toit (1997:5) summarised Batho Pele as the Government’s attempt to enhance the quality and accessibility of Public Service, by improving efficiency and accountability to the recipient of public goods and services, the communities and other stakeholders, in eight customer driven principles.
• **Consultation** – people should be consulted, and where possible given a choice, about the level and quality of the Public Service they receive.
• **Service Standards** – people should be informed about the quality and level of Public Service they will receive, so that they will know what to expect.
• **Access** – every citizen should have equal access to the services to which they are entitled.
• **Courtesy** – every citizen should be treated with courtesy and consideration.
• **Information** – every citizen should be served with full and accurate information about the Public Service they are entitled to.
• **Openness and Transparency** – people have the right to know how the public sector is run, what costs are involved and who the responsible civil servants are.
• **Redress** – a service deliverer must apologize for below standard service with reason, sympathetically, and remedied speedily.
- **Value for money** – Public Service must be provided effectively and efficiently to ensure economic service delivery and value for money.

The principle of co-operative governance, as stated in chapter four of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa Act 108 of 1996, requires that all sectors of public administration adhere to Batho Pele. This includes national and provincial departments of the public sector, regulated by the Public Service Act of 1994, local Governments, parastatal institutions, and education departments, the South African Police Service, the South African National Defence Force and the Intelligence Services, which amounts to 1 031 594 people (31 December 2001, Ministry of Public Service and Administration).

The White Paper prescribes that all sectors of Public Administration adhering to it must make the necessary institutional arrangements to communicate the principles through their departments. It is also pertinent to the fact that each institution develops improvement programmes, which must be approved of by their relevant minister or member of executive council. Heads of departments are responsible and accountable for the implementation of the improved service delivery programmes. The White Paper on Transforming Public Service Delivery demonstrates the Governments’ drive for service delivery. As a practical document, it makes provision for a ministry or department to shape its service delivery around its objectives and organisational culture, through enforcing compliance to the general principle, of service delivery. This initiative to improved service delivery highlights the Government’s intentions to meliorate the living standards of its people.

### 2.5 SENIOR MANAGEMENT SERVICES

In an address to the National Council of Provinces on 19 September 2000, by the Minister for Public Service and Administration, Geraldine Fraser-Moleketi (19 September 2000) said that a study conducted into the senior management and professional echelons of the Public Service has found that the effectiveness of this group impacts on the overall ability of the Public Service to deliver on its
mandate. To professionalise this critical echelon of the Public Service, Cabinet has endorsed the establishment of a Senior Management Service (SMS).

A new management framework was introduced in July 1999, to ensure and emphasise improved service delivery in all Public Service departments. This led to the formation of the Senior Management Service initiative, comprising of all Heads of Departments and approximately 3000 other senior public servants. This cadre subscribes to professionalism, accountability, good governance, and promotion of Government objectives. This initiative was launched in view of the belief; that an institution, which is ably supported by skilled management operating within an appropriate employment framework, will foster the ideal of attracting and retaining quality managers. According to Policy online (speech and deliberations) senior managers and high-level professionals must realise, and bring to manifestation Government's vision of a better life for all, through effective implementation strategies and the efficient utilisation of resources.

Minister Fraser-Moleketi (2000) added that, “only the finest candidates, imbued with a spirit of selfless service to the community should be appointed.” The talents of these candidates should be carefully nurtured, and once well developed, utilised to the best advantage of the State. The SMS process will distinguish between managers and professionals, rigorous recruitment and selection systems, competency profiling of all new and current senior executives in relation to their jobs, performance assessment systems, training and development regimes, and flexible remuneration systems.

The SMS initiative was further motivated by the pivotal role of senior managers and high level professionals in the delivery of Public Services, and thus, their essential input in the development of new systems, processes and procedures that will;

- Improve recruitment, selection and retention of candidates.
- Establish a more appropriate employment framework with terms and conditions of service designed to attract and retain high calibre individuals with equal recognition being given to senior managers and high-level professionals.
• Introduce greater mobility to enable Government to deploy individuals across departments at national and provincial level.
• Assist departments and provinces in reviewing their management structures with a key focus being the appropriate grading and competency assessment of senior executives.
• Improve training and development.
• Promote high standards of ethical conduct.
• Establish a more appropriate labour relation framework (www.polity.org.za).

2.6 VALUE CHAIN

Government’s intentions to improve value in terms of service delivery and the ability of Public Service to deliver on its mandate, is however complex and cannot be confined to legislation and mere policy writing. Within an organisation or department it involves the integration of functions and an alignment of organisational activities. There is a direct link between “back-office” processes and systems, with the primary objectives of service delivery; best explained by Porter’s value Chain concept. This is effectively explained by the value chain concept. Johnson and Scholes (2002:160) define the value chain as the description of the activities in and around an organisation, which together create a product or a service. Porter (1998, quoted in Johnson, Scholes, 2002:161) presents the value chain as shown in figure 2.2.
Porter describes the primary activities as those directly concerned with the creation of the product or service, similar to the concept of "line functions", while the support activities help to improve the effectiveness and efficiency of primary activities, and are similar to the concept of "staff functions". The latter does not only support the primary activities but also each other.

Johnson and Scholes (2002:503) reason that the value chain concept is important in helping managers understand how and where value may be created within an organisation and in the wider value network. Miller (1998:126) explains that the value chain helps to analyse the contribution of individual activities within a business to the overall level of customer value the firm produces, and thus, ultimately to its financial performance. If each department produces value, the profit margin should increase, either due to the incurrence of lower costs or the ability to charge more. Alignment is of utmost importance, for as Johnson and Scholes (2002:165) have established; if an organisation is to survive they must be competent to provide the product or service features, required by customers, at the threshold level. This concept underlines the importance of people management, and specifically human resource management and its relation to successful business venture.
2.7 HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

In the wake of globalisation and its influence on business ethics and mechanics, Hilltrop and Despres (1994:3) highlight the essence of HRM very adequately. They define it as a range of activities and approaches essential to attract, retain and mobilise a critical mass of human capital. This proves the suggestion made by Walker (1992:59), that there must be an alignment of the management of people with the overall management of business, or strategic context. HRM is therefore crucial in achieving an organisation’s core competency, and must be included in a company’s strategic planning processes.

In a discussion of Integrated Planning, the DPSA (15,16,28,30) underlined the importance of planning as; directing all strategies, plans, practices, procedures and resources at achieving the nucleus of a department’s competencies. Therefore it must begin or have it offset with the strategic priorities of a department’s service delivery needs and mandates. The integrated approach to planning enables employees throughout the department to manage their resources in an integrated way, and it allows procedures and practices to interface with one another, thus promoting information sharing. The DPSA (30) underlines the importance of HR planning by suggesting a 5-step procedure, implying that its core objective is to ensure that departments have the right numbers of people, with the right competencies, in the right places to deliver their mandates and achieve their strategic objectives. These steps are:

- Assess the human resources needed by a department.
- Assess the human resources supply available to meet the need.
- Analyse any differences between the need and supply of human resources.
- Develop a plan or strategy to meet all human resource needs.
- Monitor and evaluate.

The HR Planning procedure motivates the development of an HR Plan or HR Strategy. According to Walker (1992:62) HR strategy is management’s response to emerging issues. Walker defines HR strategy as an integrated, multi-faceted, long-term agenda for changing the character of a company, a guide for development into a more flexible, adaptive organisation.
Walker’s (1992:59,62) discussion on HR strategy reveals that it entails plans to address the opportunities to gain and sustain competitiveness through the management of people. This inadvertently implies the translation of Human Resource issues into action plans, and as a result focussing the position of HRM as the essence of business strategy implementation, thus aligning the management of people with the overall management of business or strategic context. Swanepoel et al (2000:204) confirms this in their definition of strategic human resource management; those long-term, top-level management, decisions and actions regarding employment relationships that are made and performed in a way fully integrated with the overall general strategic management of organisations. This irrevocably implies that the capacities to implement business strategy requires and are enhanced by HR strategies focussing on people related issues.

Delany (2003:37) reports that a global human capital survey, done in 1056 organisations (25 South African), in 47 countries, employing over 6 million employees revealed that although the majority of South Africa’s human resource leaders are members of most organisations’ highest ranking leadership team, they generally do not have an officially documented HR strategy. Further analysis of the data revealed that only around 50 percent of those with a strategy in place, claim close integration of that strategy with the overall business strategy. The research reflects the following prerequisites and suggestions from successful company made during this survey;

- HR strategy that is documented and integrated into the business strategy,
- Effective people policies and practices that delivers the strategy across the business, and
- An HR function that can implement policy and strategy, and can influence the business.

This is corroborated by Huang (1999:134) when he states that effective HR strategy systematically coordinates all individual HRM measures and implements them in such a manner, directly influencing employee attitudes and behaviour in a way that helps a business to achieve its competitive strategy.
2.8 RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION

Recruitment and selection is that activity of HRM that purports attracting and fitting the right person for a specific job or position. The importance of this function is emphasised by Sue Birch, general manager of a vacancy management company (2002:27), when she states that companies have altered their attitude, in that they are now reluctant to leave a vacancy unfilled, even for a relatively short period of time, in their bid to remain competitive. With the emergence of intellectual property as the prime frontier of cooperate competition, Hofmeyer (2003:11) declares, that the centre of power in the employer/employee relationships has shifted. Employers no longer call the shots with impunity, instead talented people prefer to orchestrate their own careers within a company.

Recruitment and selection play a pivotal role in service delivery. If utilised efficiently it can be cost effective in more than one way. From a managers point of view the objective is to get the maximum return on investment from human capital. Investments, such as salaries, cost of recruitment, training, fringe benefits, are expected to be returned in the form of profits or some sort of increase in the bottom-line. Hammersak (2002:6) explained that star performers usually return three to seven times their salary’s worth in productivity. If the right person is appointed, training cost will be minimised, breaks in delivery decreased, and production or service increased, putting the organisation in a position of achieving its key performance objectives of: dependability, cost, speed and quality (Slack, Chamber and Johnson, 2001:45). The wrong appointment implies extended training, thus no service or production, or incorrect service or production, over a longer period, and higher cost to the organisation.

The Government’s drive towards improved service delivery, a departments’ HR planning and HR strategy, would be out of reach if recruitment and selection is not done proficiently and according to best practices for the industry. For this reason recruitment and selection is a strategic people management issue, with a potentially high probability impact on service delivery.
2.9 CONCLUSION

The initiatives discussed in this chapter were those related to people management. The alignment of the related practices to the above mentioned initiatives are essential to the success of the service delivery drive, promulgated by the PSA. This chapter highlighted these initiatives with specific reference to Batho Pele.

In this chapter the role of human resource strategy and human resource management in the value chain of delivery, and the importance of planning in achieving service delivery objectives were described. The impact of recruitment and selection on service delivery was also emphasised in this discussion.

The next chapter highlights recruitment and selection as a tool to improve service delivery. Recruitment and selection are defined and a literature study reveals best practices and procedures.
CHAPTER 3
RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION

3.1 INTRODUCTION

The previous chapter highlighted the significance of recruitment and selection in the government’s initiative to improve service delivery. Government observes the importance of this practice and realises that it should be improved.

This chapter entails a literature study on recruitment and selection. It focuses on the legal framework, the role players and the recruitment and selection policy. A model, based on best practices for the appointment of staff is developed and discussed.

3.2 RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION

Carrell, Elbert and Hatfield (1995:250) describe recruitment as the process of acquiring applicants who are available and qualified to fill positions in an organisation. This is reinforced by Gerber et al (1998:90), who deem that recruitment reflects on the process of locating, identifying and attracting suitable applicants and that it involves those organisational activities that influence the number and/or the types of applicants who will apply for a position and/or affect whether a job offer is accepted. Swanepoel et al (2000:291) defines recruitment as: “... those activities in human resource management, which are undertaken in order to attract sufficient job candidates who have the necessary potential, competencies and traits to fill job needs, and to assist the organisation to achieve its objectives.”

Selection is the process of choosing qualified individuals who are available to fill positions in an organisation (Carrell et al, 1995: 300). Gerber et al (1998:103) believe that it involves the choice from a pool of candidates, of the most suitable candidate who, according to the judgement of the selection panel, best meets the given job requirements. Swanepoel et al (2000:311) define selection, as “...
the process of trying to determine which individuals will best match particular jobs in the organisational context, taking into account individual differences, the requirements of the job and the organisation’s internal and external environments.”

For the purpose of this study, recruitment and selection will be defined as the process of attracting a manageable amount of suitable job candidates, and the extraction of the best fit to the organisation, and the job requirements.

3.3 RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION FRAMEWORK

There are a number of role players in the recruitment and selection process. These include employees, team members, line managers, the human resource department and human resource practitioners. The Employer’s Organisation for Local Government (2002:8) considers the following as the main role players: line managers, human resource department (HRD) and professional human resource practitioners.

3.3.1 Line Management

Line managers are regarded as the most important role players in the recruitment drive. They are prominent in the selection process but can be involved in all the other parts of the process. SPA (1999:74) suggest that line management be responsible for the recruitment and selection of all staff.

3.3.2 Human Resource Department

The human resource department (HRD) provides guidelines or assistance to line management on request. SPA (1999:75) suggests that the HRD must consistently research professional techniques to enhance and ensure effective recruitment and selection practices. Hutton (2001:8) summarises the role of HRD in recruitment and selection process as to:

- provide a central place to apply for jobs, transfers and promotions,
- ensure that selection processes are complied with,
• ensure that legal requirements are adhered to,
• reduce the costs of selection through controlling the process,
• eliminate manager bias, and
• ensure the use of HR tools to ensure selection of most suitable candidate.

The Employer’s Organisation for Local Government (2002:8,10) concluded that the human resource department could offer assistance in the recruitment process through one of the following ways: namely a directorate based human resource team, a corporate based human resource team or a specialist team.

A directorate based HR team may have a greater understanding of the requirements of the job, particularly if it is of a specialist nature, specific to that directorate. However, there may be concerns regarding consistency of practice across the company, unless clear standards are in place, and this may not help to promote the company’s employer brand. In addition there may be duplication of tasks between different directorates and confusion for potential candidates, particularly if there are different contact points for different jobs. A corporate based HR team may help to ensure consistency, provide a central point for enquiries and achieve some economies of scale. A specialist team can provide economies of scale, ensure consistency, and provide a central contact for potential candidates and thus a centralised promotion of the employer brand.

3.3.3 Professional Human Resource Practitioners

The recruitment process can be contracted out partly or wholly to an external organisation. This outsourcing may be for a specific vacancy, such as the use of a recruitment agency to recruit for a senior level post, or for all vacancies. Different parts of the recruitment process may be outsourced; for example using a recruitment advertising agency to proof read and place job advertisements. Benefits may arise from outsourcing because of economies of scale, particularly where the agency has invested heavily in technology. This may mean that the agency can provide a quicker, better and even cheaper service than the company/employer can provide for itself. When outsourcing it is important that line managers remain sufficiently involved in the recruitment process because of
their understanding of a vacancy’s requirements. It is also important for the employer/organisation to set clear roles, responsibilities and standards to ensure that they retain some control over the process. The company/employer needs to be satisfied that the agency is able to comply with anti-discrimination legislation and is experienced in promoting equal opportunities.

3.4 LEGAL FRAMEWORK

Since recruitment and selection is now part of legislation, it can be generally assumed that the time spent in considering, planning and doing a proper job of recruitment and selection process, is indirectly related to the time that will be spent in managing industrial relations problems at a later date (Levy, 1999:51). This connotes that sufficient time and energy should be given to properly recruit and select candidates for vacant positions.

Recruitment and selection are generally governed by the Employment Equity Act (Act No 55)(EEA) that was promulgated in October 1998. Other related legislation is the Labour Relation Act (Act No. 66 of 1995 as by amended Act No. 12 of 2002)(LRA), the Basic Conditions of Employment Act (Act No. 75 of 1997 as amended by Act No. 11 of 2002), the Skills Development Act (Act No. 97 of 1998) and the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (Act No. 108 of 1996). For the purpose of this study emphasis will be placed upon the Employment Equity Act.

The EEA essentially focuses on discrimination, past and present. According to Rautenbach (2003:133) the objectives of the EEA are to eliminate employment discrimination, ensure employment equity to redress the effects of discrimination and to achieve a representative workforce. It regulates and describes the concept of fair discrimination, and bases its legitimacy on the redress of previous discrimination. It demands an Employment Equity Plan, which represents the critical link between the current workforce profile and possible barriers in employment policies and procedures, and the implementation of remedial steps to ultimately result in employment equity in the workplace. Levy (1999:51)
reasons that the essence of this legislation has to do with advancement and development.

This Act defines the routes of disputes with regard to recruitment and selection as twofold:

- Allegations of unfair discrimination, or
- Unfair conduct of the employer with regard to promotion or training.

According to Levy (1999:51) allegations of unfair discriminations are dealt with in terms of Chapter 2 of the EEA. This chapter states that the burden of proof lies with the respondent: meaning that a prima facie case is all that is needed for the Labour Court to proceed, and require the employer to prove that discrimination did not occur, and if it did, that it was fair. When it comes to instituting action against unfair discrimination the Act defines that applicants for employment have the same status as employees. Disputes founded on allegations of unfair conduct of the employee with regard to promotion and training is processed in terms of schedule 7 of the LRA. This however can only be applied by existing employees and not by job applicants. These procedures are simpler, quicker and cheaper than allegations of unfair discrimination and are for the use of internal candidates who question why an appointment from the outside was made.

Section 15(1) of the LRA emphasises affirmative action and defines affirmative action measures as measures designed to ensure that suitably qualified people from designated groups (previously disadvantaged) have equal employment opportunities and are equally represented in all occupational categories and levels in the workplace of a designated employer. The EEA however categorically states that an employer is not required to appoint or promote people who are not suitably qualified. The EEA defines suitably qualified as:

- "A result of any one or combination of –
  - That person’s formal qualifications
  - That person’s prior learning
  - That person’s relative experience; or
- Because that person has the capacity to acquire, within a reasonable time, the ability required for doing the job.”
Section 4 of the Act demands that the abovementioned factors be reviewed during recruitment. Levy (1999: 52) suggests that this implies that an employer must clearly establish:

- What qualifications are required for the job?
- What experience will render an applicant suitable?
- What qualities will determine whether or not the applicant would acquire the skills within a reasonable time?

This legislation accentuates the fact that Employers should exercise caution before ruling out potential candidates lacking formal education, for as Levy (1999: 55) confirms, experience is deemed a synonym for acquired knowledge, which in turn is often substituted for formal qualifications, and therefore a legitimate selection criterion. SPA (1999:74) supports this notice with a statement that discrimination on the grounds of lack of relevant experience alone is considered to be unfair discrimination, unless certain experience is profiled as an inherent job requirement.

It is of essential importance for the employer to ensure that all involved in the recruitment and selection framework, exercise caution at all stages of the recruitment process, in order to avoid disputes, and ensure fair equitable and non-discriminatory action.

3.5 RECRUITMENT POLICY

Gerber et al (1998:342) state that a policy provides proof of commitment and of preparedness to declare views and attitudes and it sets limits of behaviour. They hold that policy shows the intentions of participants (management and staff) to honour stated declarations. The most important implication of policy is consultation and responsibility. Carrell et al (1995:16) agree that the formulation of policy is a corporate initiative. A particular manager may drive it but it involves a consultative process, and must be the responsibility of the top management. This implies that top management must consider and support the policy formulation process; they must approve it and measure performance according to it.
The purpose of a company’s recruitment and selection policy is to provide guidance on the recruitment and selection of staff so as to comply with the provisions and requirements of the Constitution, LRA and the EEA. These human resource activities and decisions must, however, be critically reviewed in terms of profits, growth and other critical organisational goals (Carrell et al, 1995:16).

The Individual Team Organisation Focus (ITO Focus) (2003) suggests that the HR managers (HR manager) should consult with management and proper staff representation such as committees dealing with employment equity, diversity, skills development and Unions. This HR manager must ensure that the policy is comprehensive and provides clear direction, with respect to key procedures. After consulting the policy a line manager must be clear about what to do, how to do it and in what sequence it must be executed, for maximum efficiency.

SPA (1999:69) advises that a proper policy should answer the following questions clearly and without reservation:

- The objectives that are to be met in the implementation of Recruitment and Selection.
- Competitive aspirations and strategic intentions of the company, and its impact on the implementation of Recruitment and Selection.
- Internal or External candidate preference and relevant order of importance.
- The company’s commitment to its status as an Equal Opportunity Employer.
- Its position and adherence to the National Legislator.
- Costs involved, (limitations and framework)
- Conditions for waiver of the recruitment and selection drive.
- Internal recruitment - limitations, sources and ethics.
- External recruitment – its order of preference, sources, methods and practices.
- The Company’s position on Psychometric testing, medial testing and other testing.
- Reference checking.
- Job offers.
• Feedback.
• The company’s recruitment and selection procedure.

ITO Focus (2003:unknown) suggests that companies can safeguard their recruitment policy, by addressing and including the following points:
• Legislation pertinent to recruitment which the company may be subjected to, such as Skills Development, Employment Equity, labour relations and the Occupational health and Safety Acts.
• Regulation agreements that regulate conditions for employment to the sector.
• The company’s policies and procedures that deals with its vision, mission, culture, conduct and short and long term strategies.
• The disciplinary, dismissal and grievance procedure.

While it is important to state what the company’s values and attitudes towards recruitment and selection are, it is just as important for the recruitment policy to provide a clear statement on what must be done and how it must be done. An evaluation of a recruitment and selection policy should therefore include an investigation into the above-mentioned points.

3.6 RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION PROCEDURE

The following model (Figure 3.1) is a combination of suggestions made by Swanepoel et al (2000:303,316), Gerber et al (1998:99,106), ITO Focus (2003), and SPA (1999:71-79) as the best practice, for the appointment of staff, permanently or contractually. Following the model is a comprehensive discussion of the suggested steps necessary to optimise the recruitment and selection drive to the benefit of the firm.
Figure 3.1 Best practice for recruitment and selection procedure
3.6.1 Step 1: Policy Referral

In the interest of consistency every organisation must have a documented view regarding the approaches and procedures to be followed in the organisation, especially with regard to employment since it is so heavily legislated. Swanepoel et al (2000:304) and SPA (1999:73) agree that this step is essential before planning or embarking on a recruitment and selection drive. The purpose of this step is to familiarize line managers with the intent of the company, its prerequisites and preference for employment and how such a process is handled within the company, also in the interest of consistency and long-term efficiency. In case of not having a policy, it is essential to establish one first.

It is the responsibility of the line manager to consult the policy, and that of the HR Manager to ensure that it is kept updated, and approved by management accordingly.

3.6.2 Step 2: Exact Need Assessment

This step entails the ascertainment of the exact need, with reference to the circumstances under which the need for recruitment arose. Jago (1997:14) suggests that the need for new staff, temporary or permanent arose from reasons such as:

- Someone has left and needs to be replaced.
- Maternity leave cover.
- A special project, for a limited period, requiring special skills not available in the existing team.
- Holiday or sickness leave.
- Clearance of a backlog of work.
- New strategic direction demands the creation of a new post.
- Cover necessary while recruiting for a new permanent team member or while waiting for approval to recruit.
Change equals opportunity and the decision to recruit must be thoroughly deliberated by management. Jago (1997:15) submits that alternatives such as, the following demands clarity and careful consideration:

- Not replacing a person.
- Promoting internally.
- Redesigning the job.
- Employing temporary help.
- Leaving the job the same, or
- Learnerships.

The decision to recruit must be sustained with facts obtained from objective measurements or valid management information, implicating that it must comply with the company’s business strategy thus adding value to its competitive intentions. Needs assessment is the responsibility of the line manager, or the person who intends the recruitment action (Swanepoel et al, 2000:302).

The Skills Development Act No 30 of 2002 has recently promoted the option of Learnerships. Learnerships are a combination of practice and theory that culminates in a nation-wide recognised qualification and competence. The Department of Labour (2002:1) views Learnerships as an instrument to help meet the skill shortages in the country, specifically where the social and economic needs are. This option is viable especially if the position intended is one of high skilled and part of the scarce career classes. To the employers, it means enhanced staff development, higher quality and delivery. To the employees, this means personal development and economic flexibility, due to the fact that they will now have a recognised, measurable qualification of which they can be proud. Learnerships provide for a win-win working environment.

3.6.3 Step 3: Approval

This step involves getting the filling of a vacancy approved and opening a recruitment file. According to Lee (1994:1) the corporate response to the environment created by the combination of recession, structural changes in the labour market and pressure for higher performance can either be inductive or
conducive to a recruitment drive. Therefore presentation, for approval to fill a position, must be thoroughly researched and motivated.

Approval must be in terms of the human resource budget and level of appointment. It should be taken into consideration that employment is amongst a company’s major expenditure, and that the company’s budget, strategic plans as well as long-term intentions must be taken into account. The benefits must overtake the cost of the drive. To ensure the latter, approval is obtained from senior management. Swanepoel et al (2000:304) reckons that since management is responsible for the bottom-line and strategic success, alternatives to recruitment, such as overtime, outsourcing, would be thoroughly entertained and researched, implying that the approval or rejection of a recruitment drive, by management would be of strategic value.

It is the responsibility of the line manager to draw up the request, with assistance of the HR manager. The requisition must however be signed by the Head of Department and authorised by the Director, before the drive can continue (SPA, 1999:73).

3.6.4 Step 4: Job Description

A new position description or job description should be compiled or the existing one updated. A job description describes the requirements of a job, and not the person who will do the job. This comprises the point of departure for all recruitment activities. A thoroughly researched and compiled job description, which accurately reflects job activities, is of essence and the base of all the steps that follow. Swanepoel et al (2000:262) prescribes the following requirements as essential:

- Job title.
- Position in organisational structure.
- Main purpose.
- Specific responsibilities.
- Additional information.
This document assists recruiters in determining the exact nature of the vacant job, indicating the purpose, duties, responsibilities, and relevant position in the organisational structure and ultimately describing the key performance areas of the job.

SPA (1999:73) instructs that a job description be compiled and updated by line managers. The Human Resource department are responsible for checking its legitimacy, making sure that it is drawn up in consultation with employees, regularly updated, and that change is negotiated and willingly accepted, especially when extra responsibilities are added.

3.6.5 Step 5: Profiling

Profiling entails the assessment of the key performance areas for the job, in order to compile an ideal person profile. This profile must be classified in terms of the company’s legislative requirements, such as its diversity demarcations or Employment Equity Plan. Profiling basically describes the qualifications, professional experience and other attributes required of the person to do the job. Best practice is to use a disciplined approach, utilising the job description as the working document. This process entails analysing the essential and desirable characteristics of an ideal person for the job. Jago (1997:17) holds the following specifications as a close to accurate picture:

- **Physical make-up**: This relates to appearance and health.
- **Attainments**: This refers to professional and practical experience.
- **Special Aptitudes**: Referring to specific skills and the level of ability sought.
- **Disposition**: Does the personality of the candidate you seek fit the culture of the organisation? Refraining from cloning?
- **Circumstances**: Do these job requirements conflict with domestic, religious, cultural values and commitments of candidate?

In summary, this step implies, that the line manager must check the job description and decide on the inherent job requirements of the post. This is to be done with the assistance of the Human Resource Department.
3.6.6 Step 6: Planning

Designing the recruitment plan entails the following:

- Check inherent requirements;
- Decide whether skills test, medical tests and reference checking be necessary to determine these inherent requirements in candidates;
- Select interviewers or selection team;
- Compile a schedule of deadlines;
- Get the budget approved for travel cost and sources for recruitment.

This step is crucial to the success of the recruitment drive, and if applied right, could be used as a road map for the way forward. The purpose of this step is to recruit a manageable number of the right applicants. It entails research and a partnership between the HR manager and line management.

Based upon the inherent requirements, the recruitment team needs to decide whether the applicant’s abilities could be assessed merely through an interview, or if skills testing or reference checking is necessary. Skills tests and reference checks are good mechanisms to ensure accurate appointment, and are deemed as prerequisites for high level or high cost recruitment drives. It is better to make sure of appointments, before offering employment than to make a wrong or incompatible choice. The recruitment policy should give clear indication on the use of such a mechanism.

In selecting interviewers it is important to use trained, and relevant interviewers. Interviewers should be related to the job, and know what it entails. These interviewers form the selection committee or panel. The Personnel handbook (2003:24) asserts the role of the selection panel as to assess the relative merit of the applicants for a vacant position and to advise the department head of the applicant judged to have the greatest merit. For this reason the panel must be knowledgeable experienced and well trained in employee selection. This implies that participation in the panel on the basis of empowerment, is not an option, for the panel must at all times be independent, thorough, conscientious, fair and
professional in exercising their responsibilities. A mistake in their judgement will be at the cost of the organisation.

In selecting the interviewers or selection panel, the HR managers or line managers must adhere to the following suggestions, made in the Personnel Handbook (2003:24,25,66): The composition of selection committees should generally be three people, but can vary based on the complexity of the position and the profile of applicants, with the availability of a minimum of two people committees for entry-level positions. The gender issue must enjoy attention when selecting a panel. It is best practice to include at least one member of the panel, who is not a current employee of the department with the vacancy, and who preferably is not a former employee. Members of the panel should as far as possible have a higher grading or salary than that of the vacancy. At least one member should be thoroughly familiar with the vacant position, its duties, its environment, and the knowledge, skills, attitude and aptitude required of the successful candidate. Members should preferably represent a variety of backgrounds. The inclusion of someone with the experience of a disability is recommended when the committee must be, and/or seen to be, aware of disability issues.

Of further importance is the schedule of deadlines, which is merely a proposed timeframe, necessary to keep the drive manageable.

Due to the great cost associated with importing applicants from other regions as well as the high cost of advertising, approval from management therefore is necessary. This is important for it influences the design and spread of the advertisement.

3.6.7 Step 7: Choose a Source

Decide on the sourcing process. This process is tied to the recruitment policy, which will normally indicate the priority of sourcing, internally or externally. ITO Focus (2003) argues that most companies first source internally and then externally, especially if they have certain people acting in positions for periods.
Another preferred practice is to source internally and externally simultaneously. This gives recruiters the chance to test the skill of external candidates in relation to internal candidates who are accustomed to certain work routine and outputs.

3.6.8 Step 8: Recruitment Method

Recruiters must decide on a recruitment method, taking into consideration previous experience, and factual data on the effectiveness of different methods, as well as considering the profile of the ideal person to fill the post. A variance of methods may be in order, to protect recruiters against accusations of discrimination, due to the unintentional exclusion of possible candidates by tradition recruitment practices.

According to Gerber et al (1998:94), when employing internal sources, one or a combination of the following recruitment methods can be used:

- Present employees – in the form of promotion, implying immediate return on investment, or production.
- Job advertisements – bulletin boards within the organisation.
- Personnel records – identifying employees’ currently in jobs below their qualifications.
- Skills inventory – redeploying employees with under-utilised skills.

When employing external sources of recruitment on or a combination of the following methods can be used:

- Recruitment Agencies – normally consists of a database of possible candidates.
- Headhunting – personally approaching and luring candidates with an attractive offer.
- Walk-ins – keeping a database of all job seekers approaching the company.
- Referrals – information communicated by existing employees to friends, colleagues and family.
- Professional associations – consists of members, and speciality database.
• Advertisements – the most widely used recruitment method. Advertisements in newspapers, magazines and professional journals reach the unemployed job seeker, but also attract those looking for better job opportunities (Gerber et al, 1998:95).

3.6.9 Step 9: Advertisement Design

Wayne (2002:30), the managing director of FCB Jonssons, advises that the process of designing an advert begins by ensuring, firstly, an awareness of the laws and regulations that prohibit overt discrimination. Secondly a caution not to pre-empt the result of the recruitment process by creating advertising that attracts only the kind of applicant you think would be suitable, for in doing so a potentially good candidate could be deterred from applying for fear of being unable to blend with the culture of the company, or some other reason.

The advertisement should be visually appealing, so as to attract attention to itself. A caveat is never to overcrowd an advert simply to fill the expensive advertising space. Always keep in mind that any public presentation is a form of corporate branding, therefore logos, slogans and other elements that might contribute towards creating awareness and/or enhancing stakeholders’ perceptions of the company’s brand should be used effectively.

The content of the advertisement should comply with the requirements of the relevant legislation and needs to be pitched in a manner that is unambiguous, non-discriminatory and responsive to your own needs as well as that of the candidate. SPA (1999:75) suggests the following concerning the advertisement:

• Include an affirmation that the Company supports equal opportunity and that the occasion to apply is open to all.
• Do not include anything that can be construed as an intention to discriminate against members of a particular group.
• Make it clear that members of all groups with the required qualifications are invited to apply.
• Place it in a medium that reaches all possible candidates.
• Includes the job specification and requirements.
• Include relevant job-related criteria.
• Include the closing date for applications.
• Use gender-neutral language.
• Include any other requirements (CV, where to find application forms, etc).
• Spell out Company’s policy in terms of assistance with travelling expenses for applicants who reside outside a certain area.
• Exclude any references that can be interpreted as unfair discrimination
• Do not include any form of discrimination, except when;
   - Such specifications or exclusions is based on an inherent job requirement.
   - It is an affirmative action appointment.

3.6.10 Step 10: Implementation

Apply the recruitment method, making sure that advertisements are screened as correct and representative of the company’s intentions. Swanepoel et al (2000:305) advise that recruiters must have steps in place not to allow any discrimination other than those issues inherent in the job requirements and in affirmative action appointments. Allow sufficient time for response, depending upon the method of recruitment used and the strategic importance of the post. A clear deadline, flexible enough to allow for maximum response is however essential.

3.6.11 Step 11: Short-Listing

Recruiters must design this process objectively and must guard against prejudice and subjective opinions that could lead to discrimination against applicants. SPA (1997:74) further instructs that the criteria for short-listing must be directly related to the inherent requirements of the position. It must be compiled objectively taking into account the job description and ideal person profile.
The line manager, with assistance of the Human Resource Department, and the selection committee, must review the applicants’ details and agree on a short-list for interviews.

3.6.12 Step 12: Notify the unsuccessful candidates

In order to ensure that the reputation of the company remains unblemished those who are unsuccessful should be notified as soon as possible, and in a way constructive to their individual development and moral. The HR department must notify the successful and unsuccessful candidates.

3.6.13 Step 13: Interview Planning

Planning the interview process involves:
- Prepare the agenda and interview information;
- Brief the interviewers and interpreter on the position and needs of the organisation;
- Design questions but be careful not to ask discriminatory questions;
- Plan the areas that you will cover and design questions to probe and look out for during interviews;
- Finalise the interview agenda;
- Design the interview file/folder/booklet.

Swanepoel et al (2000:320,321) define the aim of the interview as to determine an applicant’s degree of suitability for a job matching the information given by the applicant to the job requirements. Designing the process must therefore ensure that the desired result be attained. Due to the problems associated with interviewing, especially one-to-one and unstructured interviewing, this selection instrument can be very unreliable and of low value. Possible reasons are:
- Interviewers’ tendency to compare applicants with their own perception of the ideal person.
- Interviewers’ tendency to base selection on first impressions rather than on the information gleaned during the interview.
• Interviewers’ inability to improve with training due to their inborn social prejudice distorting any new insight that they may have gained.

The value of interviews can however be redeemed by structuring interviews. Structured interviews are characterised by careful, systematic planning of interviews and the exclusive use of technically skilled interviewers. Another value adding ingredient to interviews is the use of panel interviews, which gives more people the chance to assess the applicant, implying a fairer assessment and thus a better selection. Thus, if it is a structured panel interview, the selection tool can achieve its aim. The line manager Human Resource Department must be included in the selection committee or panel of interviewers.

According to SPA (1999:80) some of the important activities to perform are:

• Review the application form and CV and identify specific areas in which you have to question,
• Review the profile of the job, as is prepared in step 5 and assess the applicant’s degree of fit or potential competence, beforehand.
• Draw up an outline of the information required from the applicant.
• Prepare information to be shared regarding the company.

Kador (1997:xvi) deliberates on the preparation of interview questions, suggesting that a set of good question does not necessarily make a good interview. He implies that a good interview is a function of the interviewers’ capacity for listening, for paying attention, and for maintaining an attitude of complete respect. This implies that the questionnaire should be prepared with the aim to get the applicant talking and expressing his/her innate abilities. Questions should be designed in such a way as to ascertain or determine the candidates: Work history, Fit, Motivation, Teamwork ability, Stress, Background, Thoughtfulness, Money management and Specific Discipline (Kador, 1997:11,23,49,65,75,58,87, 95,103).

This step also involves the organising of a suitable interview environment. SPA (1999:81) suggests a private, clean, well-lighted and comfortable facility is essential to ensure confidentiality and enhance a listening environment. The
venue should also create a favourable impression on the candidate. The interview agenda and schedule should allow sufficient time per candidate. An organised/in-depth interview may take up to two hours depending on the level of seniority of the position.

3.6.14 Step 14: Conducting interviews

Treat all candidates with respect and use this opportunity to promote the company and its culture to all. Remember that the main purpose of the interview is to obtain the required job-related information, to enable interviewers to make a decision (Swanepoel et al, 2000:322). Flood and Gibson (2002:16) emphasise that appointments are made on the basis of the applicant suitable for the job, as well as fitting into the organisation. Therefore the applicant should fit the position on the basis of his/her ability and on the basis of his/her personality.

SPA (1999:81) and Swanepoel et al (2000:322,323) agree that since most interviewees are nervous, especially in the presence of a panel of interviewers, and experience the activity as stressful, it is essential to start the interview with gestures that can put the candidate at ease. This could be done by inviting the candidate to sit, for tea, and through informing the candidate of the procedure and line of questions that will be followed. This will stimulate the candidate’s confidence in the interviewers, hopefully to such an extent that he/she begins to talk spontaneously. This process is referred to as establishing rapport.

During the interview it is essential to let the interviewee talk, ask clear and concise questions and control the interview. Fear and Chiron (1990 as quoted by Swanepoel et al, 2000:322) suggest the following guidelines to achieve the abovementioned environment:

- “Make use of open-ended questions.” This will encourage the candidate to talk.
- “Ask job-related questions.” Your purpose is to require the necessary information for selection.
- In order to ensure that the candidate meets the job requirements “make use of follow-up questions”. This will clarify and enable the interview flow
to be maintained. Clarification of the exact meaning of the candidate’s remarks is essential. Follow-up questions must also be allowed to substantiate hypothesis established earlier, through observed clues.

- “Emphasise the present rather than the past and concentrate on real job experience.”
- “Do not be too direct in questioning”, for it is important not to lose rapport.

Make sure that the interviewee’s answers are relevant and that all the facts needed are acquired. Care should however be taken that interviewers are aware of culturally related issues, which may be job-irrelevant if viewed from a culturally diverse point of view. Factors such as body language, assertiveness, differences in verbal fluency, choice of words and intonation, etc must not be taken into consideration unless they can be proved to be job-related.

Keep in mind that the purpose of the interview is to extract all the relevant information from an applicant in order to make a decision on whether or not to appoint the applicant (Flood et al, 2002: 16) The following should be taken into account when evaluating applicants, to ensure that objectivity is maintained:

- Evaluate the extent of the applicant’s experience against job requirements.
- Determine the level of responsibility previously held by the applicant.
- Evaluate the applicant’s skill and knowledge in terms of the needs of the job.
- Evaluate the applicant’s strengths and development needs in relation to the job.
- Evaluate indicators of stability and progress in terms of past record (SPA 1997:76).

3.6.15 Step 15: Employment testing

Ability tests and psychometric testing are important tools in selection of the best candidate, amongst many suitable candidates. The Employer’s Organisation for Local Government (2002:41) declares that ability tests are especially valuable in
that it measures acquired competencies or skills, in an objective and unbiased manner. The Alexander Hamilton Institute (1995:1) states that employment testing can help the process of selection as follows:

- Forecast success or failure on the proposed job.
- Eliminate subjective judgements of applicants.
- Cut down turnover costs by eliminating candidates destined for failure.
- Slate people who can work effectively in a company’s specific working environment.
- Identify and eliminate candidates whose principal talent is doing well in job interviews.

The line managers and HRD personnel must base the application of test, whether to or not, or what test to be done, on the profiling done in Step 5. The type of job involved plays a significant role in determining the value and necessity of testing in employee selection. Research done by the Alexander Hamilton Institute (1995:1) indicates that tests are more aptly employed in jobs:

- For which the labour pool available is large enough for management to have a real opportunity to choose among applicants.
- For which required skills can be identified and described,
- Whose criteria remains constant over time,
- For which recruitment, training, and turnover are high,
- Where the selection procedure is comprehensive, and tests is not the only tool applied.

As best practice SPA (1999:76) prescribes the following guidelines for the use of tests:

- Tests must only be administered, interpreted and the results discussed with candidates by trained internal or external HR Practioners.
- Test should have predictive value, and thus be relevant to the job.
- Tests should be reliable in terms of the targeted applicant.
- Tests should be free from predictive bias.
- The language proficiency of a candidate should be taken into account before administering any test, requiring verbal competency.
- No selection should be based on test scores only.
• Test results should be used fairly.
• Learning potential and competency assessment should be considered.

The Employer’s Organisation for Local Government’s (2002:31) addition to the above mentioned guidelines are:
• Advise candidates beforehand that testing will be part of the selection process.
• Provide samples of tests, to candidates beforehand, to establish rapport.
• Ensure that candidates have clarity as to what tests will be taken and what the appropriateness thereof is.

The need and use for these lines of testing should be prescribed in your recruitment policy. Conduct competency/skills exercises, psychometric or medical tests before or after the interview. While conducting these tests can be very valuable, this is an area, which is heavily legislated and must be professionally conducted. Candidates must understand the reasons and should preferably sign permission for any exercise or tests. (ITO Focus, 2003). SPA (1999:76) warns that employers and recruiters must safeguard themselves by ensuring that tests and assessments are only used when the tests have been scientifically shown to be valid and reliable, it can be applied fairly to all candidates, and is not biased against any group or employee.

3.6.16 Step 16: Verification

Depending on the inherent requirements of the position an applicant checking or auditing process could include the following, as prescribed by the Employer’s Organisation for Local Government’s (2002:43) and confirmed by Swanepoel et al (2000:325):
• Verification of qualifications;
• Criminal record checks;
• Security clearances;
• Credit checks;
• Reference checks.
Some of the more popular ways of administering this auditing process is through the scrutinising of the CV and the attached written references, or by telephoning or emailing references, asking a preset line of questions. Any discrepancy on this level implies disqualification and can lead to prosecution.

3.6.17 Step 17: Selection

Select the top three candidates, in order of ranking priority. This decision must be based upon a series of data collected. These might include personal interviews, reference checks, self-statements, tests and history (AHI, 1995:5).

Best Practice suggested by the Employer’s Organisation for Local Government, (2002:42) is by means of a scoring system. Scoring must be based upon the importance of the method used (i.e. tests, interview, etc), on the identification of the competencies as profiled in step 5, and the importance thereof. The interview and verification and testing are all scored. The reference to scoring and the preference and priority thereof must be guided by the recruitment policy. For if it is clearly documented and those undertaking the selection process understand the process, it will establish a degree of uniformity across the company. The scoring system must integrate the legal framework of recruitment and adhere to the company’s drive to manage and optimise diversity. This implies that the best candidate would not necessarily be the candidate of first priority. As mentioned previously, during testing the learning potential assessment must be considered, to help assess a person of the previous advantaged group who has the potential to acquire the ability to do the job within a reasonable period, or who has an informal qualification.

Research done by Anderson and Cunningham-Snell (2000) and quoted by the Employer’s Organisation for Local Government (2002:32) as to how reliable various selection methods are, and how well they predict future performance, where perfect prediction is 1.0, scored as follows:

- Work Samples – (0.54)
- Ability tests – (0.54)
- Structured Interviews – (0.44)
• Integrity tests – (0.41)
• Personality tests – (0.38)

Swanepoel et al (2000:328) advise that when making a selection decision, one must ensure that all information used:
• Is objective – not coloured by beliefs and prejudices of the recruiter, interviewer or interpreter;
• Is based on the inherent requirements of the job;
• Has the same meaning to members of different groups;
• Is actually used in a standardised way for a specific purpose;
• Is unquestionably relevant to the selection decision being made.

In conclusion Gerber et al (1998:118) insist that the decision to appoint a candidate must be based upon the expectation of the selection panel and management that the candidate will be able to function on the specific job level.

3.6.18 Step 18: Negotiate Contracts

Make offers based upon approved budget (step 3) and draw up a contract of appointment. SPA (1999:77) prescribe that all job offer letters be written by the Human Resource Department and passed to managers for authorisation and forwarding to successful candidates. Flood and Gibson (2002:22) are of the opinion that the letter of appointment becomes the employment contract, according to Common law, if the following three items that need to be agreed on, are included
• What the person will do (job description)
• For how long they will do it (period) and;
• What they will be paid (remuneration).

Acceptance of the job offer should be made in writing and all authorised documentation should be forwarded to the pay department for processing. If first ranking candidate rejects offer, it must then be made to second ranking candidate.
3.6.19 Step 19: Reporting

ITO Focus (2003) proposes that a recruitment report contains the following:

- The title of the position
- The dates of interviews
- Names and position of interviewers
- Description of the process
- Signatures of the interview chairperson and panel members
- Brief description of each candidate’s strength and weaknesses, their overall rating and ranking from the panel and the related outcome, rejection or offer.
- Also append the total list of applicants together with clear objective reasons for rejections from the short list. Also add you advertisement or circular.

SPA (1999:73) suggests that this step is the responsibility of the HR department, or representative on the selection panel. It must however be approved as correct by the line manager.

3.6.20 Step 20: Evaluation

It is important to evaluate the success of the recruitment and selection process, as well as the use of competencies during the process, in order to ensure that the process is meeting the needs of the organisation and complying with equal opportunity requirement. Gerber et al (1998:119) conclude that the underlying aim of selection evaluation is to direct the selection process in such a way that the right sort, type and quality of job applicants and employees are attracted. This implies the essentiality of these regular audits, research and experiments, with selection techniques.

Hilltrop and Despres (1994:6) highlight the importance of performance indicators to help managers evaluate the relation of their HR practices to both the operational and strategic level of enterprise, and lay a foundation for comparing
the effectiveness of HR practices and policies between companies, divisions or business units. In terms of recruitment and selection performance indicators, Hilltrop et al (1994:17), Klatt, Murdock and Schuster (1985, quoted from Gerber et al, 1998:118), and Leap and Crino (1993, quoted from Gerber et al, 1998:100) suggest that a combination of some of the following would suffice:

- The percentage of the total applicants who qualify for the job.
- The number of qualified applicants in relation to the number of jobs available.
- The cost of the recruitment, step by step, to measure the effectiveness of the overall process, as well as the various methods used.
- The extent to which the pool of applicants is representative of the community or labour market.
- The average length of time to fill vacancies.
- Proportion of vacancies filled internally through promotion, demotion or lateral movement of personnel.
- The contribution and impact of each step in the process toward the success of the recruitment and selection of the successful candidate. The validity of every selection tool.
- The quality of the subsequent performance of the new appointees
- The turnover rate for new appointees, and the rate at the recruitment source (agency).
- The average time spent in job or function per new appointee.
- The legitimacy of the selection process.
- Correlation between the degree of success in the job and the predictions made during selection
- Exit interview to determine how well employees and jobs were matched.

The Employer’s Organisation for Local Government (2002:33) adds that proper evaluation cannot be done without seeking the views of candidates who have undertaken the selection process, or without the analysis of the recruitment statistics and turnover rates. It is also important to review the selection method that was used the last time the post was filled. Is it still relevant and useful, especially in circumstances where the job has changed?
The focus of this step, which is part of the responsibility of the HR department, is to ensure that the recruitment and selection process is effective, and ultimately ensures that the company gets a worthwhile return on investment.

3.7 CONCLUSION

In this chapter best practice for recruitment and selection was discussed. The importance of a clearly stated policy, with well-defined provisions was highlighted, and adherence to the legal framework of recruitment and selection was accentuated. A discussion around best practice for a recruitment and selection procedure forms the core of the discussion in this chapter. The next chapter contains an outline of the empirical study and the method of data collection considered to investigate the stated problem and sub problems.
CHAPTER 4
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

4.1 INTRODUCTION

The previous chapter contained a literature study pertaining to the best practice for recruitment and selection. In this chapter the empirical study designed to address the research problem (formulated in Chapter 1) is outlined. Qualitative and quantitative research methodology is first discussed, followed by a description of the research design, data collection method and data analysis process.

4.2 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Leedy (2001:103-104) asserts that the research method used should take cognisance of the validity of the data, which will be gathered to solve the research problem. Is it accurate, meaningful and credible? There are two main approaches to collecting and analysing data: quantitative and qualitative. The quantitative approach is used to determine the relationships among measured variables to explain, predict and control phenomena, resulting in the conformation or disconfirmation of the hypothesis that was tested. In a qualitative approach the emphasis is on describing and understanding the nature of phenomena, and the end result is tentative answers or hypotheses about what has been observed. Further quantitative studies can then be based on these tentative hypotheses.

4.2.1 Qualitative research methodologies

The most common qualitative research designs include case studies, ethnography, phenomenological studies, ground theory studies and content analysis (Leedy, 2001:157).

In case studies detailed information is gathered in the process of exploring a single phenomena (process, event, person or object) to provide a detailed
description or possible explanation of the phenomena, or to evaluate it (Creswell, 1994:12; Gall, Borg & Gall, 1996:549, both references quoted by Leedy 1997:157). Leedy (2001:151) describes ethnography as the study of a cultural group in their natural setting with the purpose of describing the culture and understanding the relationship between culture and behaviour. Saunders, Lewis and Thornhill (1997:72) explain phenomenological research as the researchers endeavour to understand what is happening and why it is happening, in reference to perceptions and views of social realities. According to Strauss and Corbin (1990, quoted by Leedy, 1997:163) ground theory studies refer to a set of procedures followed in analysing data to develop theory useful to the particular discipline. Content analysis is the detailed and systematic examination of the contents of a body of information, in order to identify patterns, themes or biases(Leedy, 2001:155).

4.2.2 Quantitative research methodologies

Leedy (1997:104,189,229-231) distinguishes between non-experimental and experimental quantitative research. Non-experimental research refers to descriptions of observed phenomena and/or explorations of possible relationships between different phenomena as they are, without manipulating variables. The descriptive survey, longitudinal, correlational and ex post facto research designs are included in this category.

The descriptive survey measures the characteristics of a sample at one point in time. Saunders et al (1997:78) state that this design allows for the collection of a large amount of data in an economical manner. Questionnaires are most often used to gather the data.

In longitudinal research the same group is examined at different time intervals. Saunders et al (1997: 77) view the fact that researchers can study change and development as this design’s main strength.

The correlational design is seen as the simplest non-experimental design. Each individual or unit in the sample is measured on two or more variables at about
the same time and the relationship between these variables is analysed (Welman & Kruger, 1999:86).

With the ex post facto research designs the researcher can examine how specific independent variables affect the dependant variables. According to Cohen and Manion (1980:170), no manipulation of the variables is possible, as the independent variable (or variables) has already occurred. The research entails observing the dependant variables and then studying the independent variables in retrospect, to determine the relationship with the dependant variables.

In experimental research the research situation is controlled to determine cause-and-effect relationships between variables. Experimental designs can be categorised into two groups, functional and factorial designs. Leedy (1997:231) distinguishes between these two types of designs on the basis of the amount of control the researcher has over the independent variable: “whether the researcher can control the independent variables at will (the functional design) or whether, during he cause of the experiment, the researcher cannot control the independent variable (the factorial design).”

4.3 RESEARCH DESIGN

To determine the most applicable research design, the research problem and nature of the data to be collected should be clarified. The main problem researched in this study is:

*To what extent does the Recruitment and Selection practice in DWAF comply with its written Recruitment and Selection policy and procedure.*

The following sub-problems were identified and addressed to deal with and solve the main problem:

- What is the drive behind the Public Services’ initiative to improve their Recruit and Selection policies?
- What does literature suggests as best practices for recruitment and selection?
• How does the policy of the (DWAF) compare with best practices as discussed in the literature study?
• How does the recruitment and selection practice in DWAF conform to the written policy?

A literature study was conducted to address the first sub-problem. Relevant literature on the subject was obtained through searching the electronic databases (Emerald and EBSCOHOST) on the Port Elizabeth Technikon library website. Details of books and additional articles were obtained from the reference lists of the articles accessed on these electronic databases. These were then obtained in the Technikon library, or the George Municipal Library. The Internet was also searched for relevant information. Many articles were obtained from the archives in the DWAF sub-regional office in George.

The second sub-problem also entailed a literature study. This study was based on information obtained from electronic databases (Emerald and EBSCOHOST) on the PE Technikon library site as well as the University of Stellenbosch library site. Relevant articles and books were obtained from the PE Technikon Library, the George Municipal Library and the University of Stellenbosch library. An extensive search of the Internet revealed valuable information concerning current best practice and procedure.

The third sub-problem required an evaluation of the status of Recruitment and Selection policy in DWAF. This study entailed a content analysis of the recruitment policy. The policy was compared with the best practices revealed in the prior study and graded accordingly.

Sub-problem four required information regarding the practical implementation of the recruitment and selection policy. This implied the use of a descriptive survey, a non-experimental method (4.2.2 above). The analysis of the data provided by the survey and the subsequent interpretation of the analysis addressed this sub-problem.
4.4 DATA COLLECTION

Leedy (1997:191, 199, 201) identifies questionnaires, interviews and rating scale checklists as techniques for gathering survey data. Saunders et al (1997:244) deem questionnaires as the most widely used data collection method. It provides an effective way of collecting responses from a large number of respondents beyond the physical reach of the researcher. Interviews allow for probing to obtain additional, clarifying information. Rating scale checklists are lists of items with a scale on which varying degrees of intensity or a range of frequency for certain events can be indicated (Leedy, 1997:201).

In this study a semi-structured interview and a questionnaire were used, to evaluate the perception of different role players in terms of the recruitment and selection process. A rating scale checklist was employed to measure the compliance of the current recruitment and selection policy to best practice. This evaluation was reinforced by the application of a content analysis of the DWAF’s recruitment and selection policy.

4.4.1 Questionnaire

Saunders et al (1997:254) stresses that the validity and reliability of data collected as well as the response rate achieved depends largely on the design of the questionnaire and the effectiveness of the pilot testing. The data needed determines the choice of questions, which can be developed by the researcher or adopted or adapted from other questionnaires. Welman and Kruger (199:172) advise careful choice between open-ended and close-ended questions, since advantages of each type is highly dependant on the situation, and can become disadvantages.

In designing the questionnaire for this study, questions were derived from the literature study. All questions were newly formulated. Two questionnaires were administered, one for the incumbents (Appendix A), and one for line managers and HR managers (Appendix B). The questionnaire for incumbents comprised of one section, which was based on literature discussed in chapter 3. The
questionnaire for line managers comprised of two sections. Section A measured their perception of the recruitment and selection process while Section B, evaluated the current recruitment and selection policy. Section B was only administered to HR managers.

The questionnaire was administered during office hours, which implied that respondents would have limited time. Therefore close-ended questions with options to elaborate were used. Three open-ended questions were included designed to determine the respondents’ opinion regarding the affectivity of the current recruitment and selection process, and to tabulate recommendations.

Saunders et al (1997:265) caution that the length of the survey will affect the response rate. They suggest that the optimal length for a self-administered questionnaire is six to eight A4 pages. The questionnaire for incumbents was five pages long. The questionnaire for line managers and HR managers was nine pages in length. Section A for both line managers and human resource managers comprised of seven pages, while Section B for the HR managers covered two pages.

### 4.4.2 Checklist

The checklist was compiled from the literature study. The suggestions made in section 3.3 were converted into a policy checklist (Appendix B, Section B). The checklist contains 18 questions and focuses on the content of the current recruitment and selection policy of DWAF. The researcher and HR managers studied the recruitment and selection policy and advised whether it contained the information required by the checklist. Due to the constraints described earlier, HR managers was asked to answer: yes, unsure or no.

### 4.4.3 Pilot testing

Saunders et al (1997:269) advise that a questionnaire must be pilot tested to refine it and eliminate potential difficulties in completing it and analysing it. Pilot test respondents must be similar to the members of the research population.
Prior to the pilot testing the questionnaire was checked by a management consultant and industrial psychologist of George. It was decided that a questionnaire should be used as base for a semi-structured interview. After adjustments were made the questionnaire was used in the interviews of five respondents: one human resource manager, one line manager, one permanent appointee, one fixed-term appointee and one short-term appointee.

Valuable feedback was obtained from these respondents, which resulted in a few more adjustments to the questionnaire. These adjustments made it possible for the questionnaire to be used as a self-administered questionnaire. In general the questionnaire was adjusted to be more user friendly. The questionnaires were delivered personally, which implied an explanation and verbal instruction.

4.4.4 Sampling

The population for this study are all the incumbents that have been appointed after the inception of the current recruitment and selection policy. This includes every appointment after 8 December 2001. The DWAF in Western Province appointed 51 new employees. These include six permanent appointments, 30 short-term appointments and 15 fixed-term appointments.

The PSA have signed a framework agreement concerned with the transformation and restructuring of the Public Service in terms of the utilisation of human resources. The agreement involved all trade unions in the Public Service coordinating Bargaining Council and was accepted as Resolution 7 of 2002. This resolution was intended to accelerate and facilitate restructuring in Public Service. All vacancies were to be filled by excess staff, starting with excess staff within a department. Due to the nature of the work in DWAF, there is no excess staff available for certain job classes. This implies that other measures should be taken. According to Smit (Interviewed on 14 Nov 2003) the approved organogram of the organisation (DWAF) in Western Cape does not adhere to the current needs of the department. There is no position available in which to place excess staff. A new organogram has been compiled but has not been accepted.
due to the restructuring of the organisation. A new organogram is necessary because of the change of focus within the department.

The resolution allows external appointment if it is approved by the Departmental Task Team. DWAF Western Province has, however opted to appoint contract workers during this restructuring period. Smit (Interviewed on 14 Nov 2000) describes this as an attempt to address the new strategic need whilst retraining and re-skilling the permanent staff. It seems that this is the reason that there are so many contract appointees as compared to the permanent positions.

Sampling was based upon a non-probability sampling method, which is described by Wegner (2001:171,172) as a method in which observations are not selected randomly. The convenience sampling method was used, implying that the sample suited the convenience of the researcher. This was the only option, due to the time and financial constraints as well as the availability of respondents and the small population. Therefore all available incumbents were surveyed in order to obtain a proper representation of the population. Table 4.1 depicts the population and response dynamics.

**Table 4.1: Response Dynamics**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Respondents</th>
<th>Population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Permanent</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fixed-term</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short-term</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HR managers</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Line managers</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Short-term appointees were included merely to validate the procedure, they were however not a priority for the researcher due to the fact that all were low-level appointments that added no strategic value to the organisation. HR managers and line managers were included to affirm incumbents’ perception and to test trends with the responses of the incumbents. The sample size concluded to be 70 percent of the population.
4.4.5 Administration of Questionnaire

The interview and questionnaire process stretched over a four-day period. From 4 to 7 November 2003 incumbents who were appointed after the inception of the most recent recruitment and selection policy were requested to fill in the questionnaire. Prior arrangement was made with the human resource development manager and the respective HR managers in the Bellville, George and Worcester offices, to ensure that most of the incumbents would be available for questioning during this period.

HR managers were interviewed, based on the questionnaire in order to get as much information as possible as to highlight the fundamentals of recruitment and selection in the department. These interviews were long and intensive.

Other incumbents and line managers were served with a questionnaire, which was personally delivered and explained to avoid possible confusion. Copies of questionnaires were then left with respondents and personally collected half an hour later. Some incumbents were reluctant to complete the questions, but were inspired when the questionnaire was personally collected.

4.5 DATA ANALYSIS

After all the questionnaires had been received, they were divided into 3 categories. Category A contained all the incumbents. Category B all the line managers data and Category C all the questionnaires of the HR managers. The questionnaires were numbered alphanumerically in no particular sequence, within each category. Category A was numbered from A1 to A26, Category B from B1 to B6 and Category C from C1 to C3. A Microsoft Excel Book was developed on a personal computer to facilitate the input and analysis of data. The rows and columns were labelled according to the respondents’ number and question number respectively.

Most of the questions were qualitative, but answers were designed into predefined boxes and adequate space to explain choices. The frequency of
occurrence was translated into a percentage to determine the spread of application of different methods and the most frequent occurrence. Analysis of the frequency of occurrence was used to determine DWAF’s preferred recruitment and selection practices. The checklist was analysed by the researcher, who did a thorough study of the policy’s content. The results were tabulated and checked against the opinions of the HR managers who use this policy daily.

4.6 CONCLUSION

In this chapter the empirical study designed to address the research problem was discussed. Qualitative and quantitative research methodologies were discussed, followed by a description of the research design used in this study. Details were given of the literature study conducted to address the first sub-problem: “What is the drive behind the Public Service initiative to improve their Recruitment and Selection policies?”

Details were also revealed concerning the literature study conducted to address the second sub-problem: “What does literature suggest as best practices for recruitment and selection?”

A qualitative research method, content analysis, was chosen to address the third sub-problem: “How does the policy of the (DWAF) compare with best practices as discussed in the literature study?” For this purpose a checklist was designed consisting of eighteen elements. This checklist was confirmed with a HR manager in DWAF.

A non-experimental quantitative research method, the descriptive survey addressed sub-problem four: “How does the recruitment and selection practice in DWAF conform to the written policy?” A questionnaire was developed, and used as basis for semi-structured interviews, during pilot testing. The questionnaires were then distributed. Thirty-five questionnaires were returned. These were processed using Microsoft Excel spreadsheets. The research results will be presented in Chapter 5.
CHAPTER 5
POLICY ANALYSIS

5.1 INTRODUCTION

The research design and process used in the empirical study was described in the previous chapter. The data collected with the qualitative research is presented in this chapter. An overview of the governing recruitment and selection policy is followed by the presentation of the policy checklist and provision evaluation.

5.2 POLICY OVERVIEW

The directorate Human Resource Management aims to become an excellent reference site with the best recruitment and selection procedures that provide support services to the department. The recently incepted recruitment and selection policy (Appendix C), approved 8 December 2001, underwrites the slogan of the directorates HRM policy drive; building a better life for all, by implementing DWAF policy.

The recruitment and selection policy has been developed, using all relevant legislation. The following has specific relevance:

- Labour Relations Act, 1995
- Employment Equity Act, 1998
- Public Service Regulations, 2001
- Public Service Act, 1994 (as amended)
- Basic Conditions of Employment Act, 1998
- Sanctioning guides

The policy explicitly states that the onus of implementation resides with managers and supervisors who must market, apply, regulate and monitor compliance with its guidelines. The policy holds four main objectives. First it aims to enhance performance and effective service delivery by prescribing fair, consistent, transparent and efficient guidelines to attracting, selection and appointing necessary talent and thus increasing the department’s human capital.
Secondly the policy is instrumental in the achievement of the Department’s Employment Equity goals. Another objective is to establish a positive image, as the best employer in the labour market. The recruitment and selection policy is also a tool to ensure the continuous supply of human capital to meet the department’s present and future needs. These objectives are in line with the government’s initiatives of improved service delivery as discussed in Chapter 2.

The recruitment and selection policy explicitly mentions the principles on which it is based. These include:

- vacancies open to all,
- objectivity, appointment based on inherent requirements,
- values of equity, fairness, and efficiency,
- achievement of representation and
- affirmative action.

Delegation to approve or disapprove appointments is discussed as well as policy provisions such as: the appointment of immigrants, employment of temporary/casual employees, employment of close relatives, re-appointment of former employees, buy-offer/counter offer and other more practical implementation guidelines.

### 5.3 POLICY EVALUATION

The policy evaluation entails a twofold analysis. The checklist analysis aimed to determine and highlight the policy’s shortcomings and adherence to best practice requisites for a policy. The procedural analysis intended to evaluate the policy guidelines against best practices.

#### 5.3.1 Checklist analysis

The checklist will be discussed as follows: The question will be stated (in bold), which will be followed by a motivation and concluded by the answer (in italics).
Question 1: Does the policy state or include the objective that is to be met in the implementation of recruitment and selection?
As discussed earlier, the four main objectives are explained clearly. They are to enhance performance and thus effective service delivery, to achieve employment equity goals, to establish a positive image, and to ensure a continuous supply of human capital. The HR managers agreed and claimed responsibility for ensuring that these objectives are visited with the initiation of every recruitment drive.
*Yes, the policy states or includes the objective that is to be met in the implementation of recruitment and selection.*

Question 2: Does the policy state or include competitive aspirations and strategic intentions of the company, and its impact on the implementation of recruitment and selection?
The policy does describe its objectives, one of which is to become the best employer in the labour market – which can qualify for competitive aspirations and strategic intent. It however did not mention its impact on recruitment and selection. Two of the three HR managers viewed that these objectives need not be discussed in the policy and that the mere mention of these objectives was enough to understand that it drives the change and implementation of the policy. The other felt that the mention of this objective is not supported by the implementation part thereof.
*Yes, the policy does state the competitive aspirations and strategic intent of DWAF. It however does not enlighten its impact on the implementation of recruitment and selection.*

Question 3: Does the policy state or include internal or external candidate preference and relevant order of importance?
It specifically states that it should be linked to succession planning, and as such internal recruitment should take preference over external recruitment. It also guides the exceptions. The HR managers are in agreement with this finding.
*Yes, the policy is clear in terms of internal or external candidate preference.*
Question 4: Does the policy state or include the company’s commitment to its status as an Equal Opportunity Employer?
The policy states in its discussion of the provisions for advertisements, that the department is committed to employment equity. The HR managers are in agreement with this finding.

Yes, the policy states DWAF’s commitments to its status as an equal opportunity employer.

Question 5: Does the policy state or include the company’s position and adherence to the national legislator?
The legislative background is mentioned, as discussed earlier, as well as the adherence to the minimum requirements of the Public Service Regulation, 2001. The HR managers are in agreement with this finding.

Yes, the policy does include DWAF’s position and adherence to the national legislator.

Question 6: Does the policy state or include the costs involved, (limitations and framework)?
Reference to cost implications is only made with regard to the choice of the recruitment medium. Costs related to travelling, selection tools, recruitment sourcing and methods are not discussed in this document. The HR managers agreed with the finding. The fact that there are no explicit guidelines in terms of costs, tends to surrender the power to select the best possible person, to the current position of the budget. This may disempower the process and counter the objective of fair, efficient and consistent recruitment and selection.

No, the policy is not clear about the framework of costs involved in recruitment and selection.

Question 7: Does the policy state or include conditions for waiver of the recruitment and selection drive?
This is not regarded as an option in this policy. The HR managers agreed with this finding. After the initiation of a recruitment and selection drive, delegated authorities are only authorised to approve or disapprove the decisions made by
the selection panels. This implies a disregard for expenses, skill and time. Commodities that no organisation can afford to waste. *No, the policy does not include conditions for waiver.*

**Question 8: Does the policy state or include internal recruitment (limitations, sources and ethics)?**

The policy pertinently states that internal recruitment should take preference over external recruitment. It however limits internal sources to present employees who are supernumerary staff of equal grading, or are part of a programme of rotation and transfer to enhance organisational effectiveness and skill. The HR managers agreed with this finding. They hold that the succession planning policy is not yet in place, therefore all positions are advertised, and open for all including internal candidates to apply. Advertising is waived when supernumerary staff of equal grading are available. *Yes, the policy includes and guides internal recruitment.*

**Question 9: Does the policy state or include external recruitment (its order of preference, sources, methods and practices)?**

The policy is standardised on external recruitment. Headhunting for higher positions and advertising for the rest are accepted as the norm and discussed thoroughly. Two of the three HR managers agreed, but the third holds that the guidelines are not explicit enough to direct the steps to effective external recruitment. *Yes, the policy does include and define external recruitment.*

**Question 10: Does the policy state or include the company’s position on psychometric testing, medical testing and other testing?**

Competency assessments are discussed and are held by the policy as an option for the selection committee to decide upon. No guidelines surrounding its use are however given. Medical testing is limited to the inherent requirements of the job. The HR managers agreed, one in particular questioned the lack of procedural guidelines upon which a selection committee can decide whether or not to use testing.
Yes, the policy does include DWAF’s position on psychometric and medical testing.

**Question 11: Does the policy state or include reference checking?**
The procedural guidelines for reference checking are specified. The HR managers regard reference checking as an integral part of the selection process.
**Yes, the policy includes reference checking.**

**Question 12: Does the policy state or include job offers?**
The offer of employment is discussed. Limitations are mentioned and recruiters can get a clear picture of how the job offer should be managed. HR managers agreed that the policy entails the job offer discussion.
**Yes, the policy guides job offers.**

**Question 13: Does the policy state or include feedback?**
The policy commands that those applicants invited for interviews, but were unsuccessful, are notified within five days after the successful candidate accepted the job offer. Notifying the unsuccessful is regarded by the HR managers as ethics, as an objective of the recruitment and selection policy is to establish DWAF as the best employer in the labour market.
**Yes, the policy guides feedback.**

**Question 14: Does the policy state or include the company’s recruitment and selection procedure?**
The procedure is not stated at all. Policy provisions are discussed by the order of sequence or the procedural sequences are vague. Two thirds of the HR managers viewed this as positive for they believe that it allows for flexibility. They hold that a rigid procedure could be bureaucratic and restrictive to the selection committees and the process. The other HR manager agreed, and holds that recruitment and selections is practiced inconsistently and is liable to step out of its legal framework.
**No, the policy does not specify a clear procedure.**
Question 15: Does the policy state or include legislation pertinent to recruitment, which the company may be subjected to, such as Skills Development, Employment Equity, Labour Relations and the Occupational Health and Safety Acts?

The following legislation has specific relevance and are specifically mentioned:

- Labour Relations Act, 1995
- Employment Equity Act, 1998
- Public Service Regulations, 2001
- Public Service Act, 1994 (as amended)
- Basic Conditions of Employment Act, 1998
- Sanctioning guides

The HR managers agreed with this analysis.

Yes, the policy mentions legislation related to recruitment and selection.

Question 16: Does the policy state or include Regulation agreements that regulate conditions for employment to the sector?

The policy states that it employs the Public Service Regulation (2001) and the Sanctioning guides as reference to its development. The HR managers agreed with this analysis.

*It is unclear whether the policy includes all Regulation agreements that regulate conditions for employment to the sector.*

Question 17: Does the policy state or include the company’s policies and procedures that deal with its vision, mission, culture, conduct and short and long term strategies?

Except for the objectives of the policy, which are in-line with the company’s vision, mission and values, the company’s policies and procedures regarding its vision, mission and culture are not discussed. The HR managers agreed that the abovementioned is not discussed, but they viewed it as unnecessary since the company’s manifesto is available for reference to recruiters.

*No, there is no reference to the company’s vision, mission, culture and strategies in this policy.*
Question 18: Does the policy state or include the disciplinary, dismissal and grievance procedure?

No mention is made of disciplinary action in this policy. The HR managers agreed with this finding. They hold that the inclusion of this information is unnecessary for DWAF has a separate policy that deals with this aspect.

No, there is no reference made to disciplinary, dismissal and grievance procedures.

The content analysis showed clear evidence that DWAF’s recruitment and selection policy adhered to the requirements discussed in section 3.5. It is a comprehensive policy, which covers a large scope of possible provisions and guidelines.

There are however uncertainties, or aspects which are vaguely defined. The impact of DWAF’s competitive aspirations and strategic intentions on the implementation of Recruitment and Selection, the use of competency assessment, and relevant regulations or agreements that regulate conditions of employment to the sector, are aspects not clearly dealt with in this policy.

Most of the issues that the policy did not adhere to, such as disciplinary actions and the companies’ vision and mission are discussed in other documents, which can be appended to or used in tandem with the policy. Some of the more serious shortcomings are: the recruitment and selection procedure, the cost framework and the conditions for waiver. The cost framework and conditions for waiver are not included in this policy, the recruitment and selection procedure, however, is not stated pertinently. This is worrisome and is discussed next.

5.3.2 Procedural analysis

Although it is agreed that the procedure is not spelled out clearly in the recruitment and selection policy, this discussion aims to evaluate the policy provisions, in an attempt to determine whether the procedures revealed in the literature study as best practices are described in the text. It might be that the procedural sequence is not clear, though every step is addressed. The
recruitment and selection policy will now be examined with reference to best practice discussed in section 3.6.

**Step 1: Policy referral**
The policy is in existence. It has been incepted on 8 December 2001, and it governs the recruitment and selection activities in the Department.

**Step 2: Need assessment**
The policy does not deal with this aspect of the recruitment drive. This is left to the discretion of the line managers and supervisors.

**Step 3: Approval**
The policy makes specific reference to delegation of authority. It specifically mentions the mandate of the delegation with regard to the approval or disapproval of appointments/promotions and transfers. It does not indicate whether this refers to the approval to fill a position or to initiate recruitment drives. It is assumed that the same route must be followed.

The policy does not give reference or guidelines either as to what a request for approval of a recruitment drive should look like or what it should entail. It is left to the discretion of the line managers. This could lead to inconsistencies, for some managers are more persuasive than others.

**Step 4 & 5: Job description and Profiling**
Policy guidelines state that the selection criteria should be objective and relevant to the inherent requirements of the job. It also commands that inherent requirements must be specified in the advertisement. Inherent requirements are deduced from the ideal person profile, which is drawn from a job description. This process is thus implied, although not pertinently mentioned. There is no reference made as to what inherent requirement should be based on, and no indication where to find standard job descriptions or profiles. It is left to the discretion of line managers to compile inherent requirements, but not governed by this policy.
**Step 6: Planning**
The policy does not acknowledge this step as it is regarded as obvious. No guidelines as to when competency assessment is to be done is provided whilst interviewing, reference checking and medical checking is thoroughly defined. The use of competency assessment is to be determined by the selection committees.

Clear direction is given regarding the composition of a selection committee, three to six representative, members of equal or higher grading. Chairpersonship, line management involvement as well as that of transformation members are not mentioned. The selection committee is however subject for approval by the executive authority. It is accepted as a norm, though not stipulated in the policy that line managers are the chairpersons and job related experts in selection committees (Smit as interviewed on 14 November 2003). Timeframes are specified clearly in the policy.

**Step 7 & 8: Recruitment source and recruitment method**
The policy indicated that it should be linked and used in conjunction with a succession planning policy, and that except for specified reasons, internal recruitment should take preference over external recruitment. No provision is however made for internal recruitment methods except in cases where posts can be filled by supernumerary staff of equal grading, or where lateral rotating or transferring of employees is planned to enhance the organisational effectiveness and skills. The policy standardises on advertisements and headhunting as the preferred recruitment methods.

**Step 9: Advertisement design**
The advertisement requirements are stipulated extensively and although the physical design and appearance of the advertisement is left to the discretion of the line manager and HR manager, the content thereof is clearly defined.

**Step 10: Implementation**
All advertisements are to be placed in regional and national newspapers. The policy gives clear direction to this regard.
Step 11: Short-listing
Short-listing is described as the responsibility of the selection committee and it is to be done within a timeframe of 30 days after the closing date.

Step 12: Feedback
Clear direction as to whether to perform this and when to perform it is given. Feedback is centred on the applicants that were invited for interviews, but were unsuccessful and does not include the unsuccessful short-listed applicants. This might be for economic reasons.

Step 13 & 14: Planning and conducting of interviews
Interviews are regarded as the main selection tool and therefore intensively discussed in the policy. Clear guidelines to the procedure involved with interviewing are prescribed, and specific monitoring systems are set in place. The policy commands a competency based approach, but does not give explicit examples of such practices.

Step 15: Employment testing
Provision is made for employment testing or competency assessment. Detail as to what kind of tests, how it should be administered, who should administer it, and when it should be used, is not included in the policy. The information concerning competency assessment in the policy discourages the use of this tool, for there are no guidelines that can protect a selection committee, when contested.

Step 16: Verification
The policy limits verification in DWAF to medical testing and reference checking. Medical examinations are restricted to where it is an inherent requirement to a job. Reference checking is a standardised selection tool. Procedures to apply these tools are clearly defined.

Step 17: Selection
The selection of the top three candidates is up to the discretion of the selection committee. No guidelines are given as to what method to use to determine the
best candidate. There is no reference in the policy to a scoring method. Guidelines concerning what the recommendations of a suitable candidate should be based on are clearly stated. The policy requests that minutes, for every selection process be kept. These minutes must include all motivations for the successful and unsuccessful candidates.

**Step 18: Contract negotiation**

The minimum requirements for an offer of employment, as well as the contract of appointment are discussed in the policy. Included are examples of a contract of employment as well as the conditions of appointment.

**Step 19: Reporting**

This is mentioned in the discussion of recommendation and approval provisions. All recommendations, whether successful or not must be motivated. A format of this report is however not appended to this policy.

**Step 20: Evaluation**

No mention of this is made in the recruitment and selection policy. However, the Performance Management and Development System policy (DWAF Human resource Policies and Guidelines, 2001:25) states that incumbents to new positions have to sign a work plan, two months after commencing with their duties, implying an evaluation process.

Thirteen of the twenty steps are thoroughly discussed within the policy provision. Two of the steps are discussed but guidelines remain unclear, and are thus inconsistently used or not at all practiced (e.g. selection and competency testing). Four of the steps (Need assessment, Approval, Job description, Profiling and Evaluation) are not discussed at all. It might be that some of these are assumed, to be clear such as, Need assessment, Job description and profiling as previously mentioned. The analysis proves that although some aspects are not clear or discussed, recruitment and selection though at risk of inconsistent and inefficient implementation, can be accomplished successfully. With the help of trained professionals, such as Human Resources Managers the policy is an effective recruitment and selection tool and if applied, should give good results.
5.5 CONCLUSION

The focus of this chapter was to analyse the content of the recruitment and selection policy of DWAF, in terms of a checklist of requirements and best practices. The analysis indicates that most of the requirements discussed in section 3.5 and section 3.6 were met and that the policy is a sufficient instrument to enhance the achievement of DWAF’s vision for a democratic, people centred nation working towards human rights, social justice, equity and prosperity for all and its objective of becoming a better service provider. Chapter 6 deals with the analysis and interpretation of applied recruitment and selection within DWAF.
CHAPTER 6
PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS OF RESEARCH RESULTS

6.1 INTRODUCTION

In the previous chapter the content of the current recruitment and selection policy in DWAF was discussed. The research design and process used in this empirical study was described in chapter 4. The results of the study are presented in this chapter. Information regarding the research response is followed by a presentation of the respondents’ demographic characteristics. The data is presented in terms of the recruitment and selection model discussed in section 3.6. Open-ended questions, designed to facilitate recommendations for improvement to the current recruitment and selection practices, is also discussed according to themes.

6.2 RESEARCH RESPONSE

As indicated in Chapter 4 (section 4.4.4) the size of the population of new appointees is 51. These were surveyed by means of the convenience sampling method. The population size for line managers and HR manager depended on the availability of the employees and concluded to be 13 and 6 respectively. Table 6.1 depicts the statistics of the data collection process. Although overall participation was good, and above the researcher’s expectation, other respondents were negative and some intimidated.

A great number (67 percent) of the permanent appointees responded while the rest were unavailable, (out of town on official business). The 20 percent non-responding fixed-term appointees and the 53 percent non-responding line managers and the 50 percent non-responding HR managers were unavailable due to workload and other responsibilities. Though short-term appointees were not regarded as a priority for the researcher, they responded enthusiastically.
Overall a 70 percent response rate was sufficient for the researcher to deduce whether the implementation of the recruitment and selection was practice as guided by the policy.

### Table 6.1: Questionnaire Response

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Respondents</th>
<th>Questionnaires distributed</th>
<th>Number of responses</th>
<th>Response rate %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Permanent appointees</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fixed-term appointees</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short-term appointees</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Line manager</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HR manager</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 6.3 DEMOGRAPHIC CHARACTERISTICS OF RESPONDENTS

Table 6.2 indicates that 77 percent of new appointees are women. Seventy-five percent of the permanent appointees are women. Coloured women filled 35 percent of the new positions, while black women filled 19 percent. Black men are also amongst the preferred appointees (15.4 percent). The Western Cape has a high population of coloured inhabitants; therefore the practical implementation of selection complements the region’s demographics. No White or Indian male appointments were made.

Table 6.2 indicates that the order of preference in appointments was:

1. Coloured Female (CF)
2. Black Female (BF)
3. White Female (WF) and Black Male (BM)
4. Indian Female (IF) and Coloured Male (CM)
5. Indian Male (IM) and White Male (WM)

Line managers and HR managers are predominately white. The participating HR managers are all female and 67 percent white, and 33 percent coloured. The
participating Line managers are 33 percent white males, 33 percent white females, 17 percent coloured female and 17 percent black males.

Table 6.2: Respondent demographics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appointees</th>
<th>WM</th>
<th>WF</th>
<th>CM</th>
<th>CF</th>
<th>BM</th>
<th>BF</th>
<th>IM</th>
<th>IF</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Permanent</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fixed-term</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short-term</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Line</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>managers</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HR</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>managers</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.4 PRESENTATION OF DATA

The discussion in chapter 3 forms the bases of the data presentation.

6.4.1 Policy referral

Although a policy existed, it did not imply that it was used. Table 6.3 depicts the usage of the policy, by means of a rating scale, where 1 represents not using the policy at all, and 5 indicates a total dependency on the policy. The table indicates that most line managers do not use the policy, whilst HR managers are depending upon it. Two line managers abstained from commenting. For the purpose of this study this can be regarded as not using the policy therefore 67 percent of line managers do not use the policy, while 67 percent of HR managers are absolutely dependant on the policy. This might be because line managers expect advice and direction from HR managers and that a team effort from the line managers and HR managers can be instrumental in finding the best fit for positions and the organisation.
### Table 6.3: Policy usage

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scale</th>
<th>Line managers</th>
<th>HR managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 6.4.2 Needs assessment

Line management and HR managers claim to investigate a multitude of alternatives before initiating a recruitment drive. Table 6.4 indicates that at least seven other alternatives were investigated. Some of the more popular alternatives are, internal promotion, employing temporary help and outsourcing.

### Table 6.4: Needs assessment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alternatives considered</th>
<th>Line managers</th>
<th>HR managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not replacing a person</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promoting internally</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Redesigning the job</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employing temporary help</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learnerships</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overtime</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outsourcing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 6.4.3 Approval

The request for approval to fill a position, as depicted by Table 6.5, is a team effort for HR and Line managers. Eighty three percent claim involvement and HR managers are key to the effective request for approval to fill a post.
Table 6.5: Approval

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Involvement in Request for approval</th>
<th>Line Managers</th>
<th>HR managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.4.4 Job description and Profiling

Table 6.6 depicts the preference of line managers in compiling inherent requirement for a position. 50 percent of respondents (line managers) rely on a combination of specifications, to compile the inherent requirements for a position. They regard practical and professional experience (attainments) as the indispensable ingredient to a successful compilation of attributes. The candidates’ level of ability and specific skills (special aptitudes) along with their personality or possible fit to the organisational culture (disposition) must also be considered, when compiling an ideal person profile for a position. All the HR managers agreed, with the use of a combination of specifications.

It is evident from the above discussion that there are no structured guidelines for determining inherent requirements for a position. This gives way to inconsistency and allows too much reliance on the discretion of selection panels. Since this step is crucial to the success of the recruitment and selection drive it should be more regulated and included in the recruitment and selection policy.
Table 6.6: Profiling

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inherent requirements preference</th>
<th>Line managers</th>
<th>HR managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical make-up</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attainments</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special Aptitudes</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disposition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Circumstances</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attainment and Special Aptitudes</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attainment and Disposition</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical make-up, Attainment and Disposition</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.4.5 Planning

Table 6.7 proves that representivity in panel selection is the norm in DWAF. Seventy-six percent of appointees are of the opinion that the committee was representative whilst only 16 percent claim that it was not. Line managers and HR managers confirm compliance to representivity. This claim is however biased, or rather cannot be claimed as objective because line managers and HR managers are responsible for the selection panel composition. Further investigation into the 16 percent of appointees who regarded the panel as unrepresentative of the community demographics revealed that 75 percent of them experienced the interview environment supportive and the panel very knowledgeable. This proved that due to the nature of a position it was not always possible to get a representative panel, but that choosing a selection panel was always based on competence.

In summary the panels are as a rule representative of the community demographics. The composition of a selection panel is based on competence.
Table 6.7: Panel demographics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Appointees</th>
<th>Line managers</th>
<th>HR managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Representative of community</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not representative</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>16%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No panel</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6.8 reveals that line managers and HR managers are an integral part of selection panels. If assumed that HR managers are trained and line managers guided through the process by them, it implies that at least 50 percent of the panel is knowledgeable. This however depends on their position within the selection committee. The newly appointees agreed that line managers and HR managers were involved in their recruitment and selection process (92 percent).

Table 6.8: Role Player involvement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role Players Involved</th>
<th>Appointees</th>
<th>Line Managers</th>
<th>HR managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Line Managers</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HR Manager</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In order to ensure the effectiveness of interviews, the literature study revealed that the interviews conducted to select a suitable candidate be structured and implemented by a panel. The panel should include the line manager, regarded as the technical expert, and the HR managers, considered to be the legal, organisational and process expert. This implies a minimum of two persons per panel, depending on the complexity of the post. DWAF uses selection panels to facilitate interviews and the selection of successful candidates.

The Personnel Handbook (2003:24,25,26) suggests that the composition of selection panels be three people, but that it can vary based on the complexity of the position and the profile of the applicants. Table 6.9 revealed that 72 percent of panels consists of between four and six members, thus implying that four to six members are the norm for selection panels.
There was one instance where a single person interviewed an incumbent. This was in the case of a person who was a permanent employee, retired, but was asked to continue employment on a contract basis. This was done due to the high level of skill necessary to accomplish tasks in that position.

The minimum size of panels confirmed by line managers would be two members, and the most popular size would be eight members (28 percent). There is however an even spread of panel sizes between four and six.

**Table 6.9: Panel size**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sizes</th>
<th>Appointees</th>
<th>Line Managers</th>
<th>HR managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In order to evaluate the basis of selection panel composition, a recent appointee was asked to indicate whether panel members were active during interview sessions. If participants were active it could be assumed that the panellists are sufficiently trained or guided by their recruitment and selection policy or HR managers. Evidence revealed that 88 percent of panel members participated in successful appointments (this is confirmed by line managers who claim 80 percent participation and HR managers who insist on 100 percent participation of the panel members). Twelve percent of newly appointees claimed that only some panel members participated. This could be due to insufficient interview planning and an unstructured interview process, or it could be due to a programme of empowerment and training. Further investigation proved that all three of the appointees who indicated that not all panel members participated, indicated that one member of the panel did not participate. All applicants claimed that the interviews were not structured. Some panellists might have had observer status.
or were in training. In summary all members of the selection panel participate in questioning during interviews.

**Table 6.10: Participation of panel members**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Appointees</th>
<th>Line Managers</th>
<th>HR managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Personnel Handbook (2003:24) asserts the role of the selection panel as to assess the relative merit of the applicants for a vacant position. This implies that they be knowledgeable, experienced and well trained in employee selection. Table 6.11 measured the skill level of the selection panel on a rating scale, where 1 represents not knowledgeable, and 5 represents a panel that were perceived as very knowledgeable. The results confirm that panels are regarded as knowledgeable and trained. Fifty-six percent of appointees regarded the selection panel as very knowledgeable. The bulk of line managers (60 percent) review the panels as more than knowledgeable, while all HR managers (100 percent) regarded the panel as knowledgeable enough, and thus capable to assess the relative merits of applicants. The statistical representation of the data collected indicates a negatively skewed distribution, and thus a weighted mean that leans towards, the right or higher side. The mean impression is 4.28 or very knowledgeable.

**Table 6.11: Skill level of Panel members**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Panel impression</th>
<th>Appointees</th>
<th>Line Managers</th>
<th>HR managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6.4.6 Recruitment source

Table 6.12 indicates that external applicants enjoy preference in appointment. Evidence indicated that although line managers claim a 50/50 or fair distribution of appointment amongst internal and external applicants, 85 percent of appointments were made from external applicants. This contradicts the recruitment and selection policy (Appendix C), which states that internal recruitment shall take precedence over external recruitment. Reasons for this phenomenon is that the succession planning policy is not yet in place. The safest option is thus to advertise externally, making it possible for external as well as internal applicants to apply. Though the more expensive way when internal applicants are successful, it protects recruiters against allegations of unfair discrimination. Line managers and HR managers claim a fair distribution whilst practice indicates an overwhelming preference towards external candidates.

Table 6.12: Source preference

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Appointees</th>
<th>Line Managers</th>
<th>HR Managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internal</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fair</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.4.7 Recruitment method

Literature suggests that a variety of recruitment methods must be employed to ensure firstly the best fit and secondly to protect recruiters against accusations of discrimination due to the unintentional exclusion of possible candidates (Section 3.6.8). Table 6.13 depicted the variety of recruitment methods used to appoint employees in DWAF. Evidence indicates that a variety of recruitment methods are employed, which implies, a sense of caution amongst the DWAF recruiters to avoid discrimination accusations.

Advertisements are the most popular method of recruitment. This might be due to the intensive prescriptions and elaborate instructions recommended by the
recruitment and selection policy. Advertisements are favoured by the majority of line managers (50 percent) and regarded as a rule by HR managers (100 percent). Fifty-eight percent of new appointees were recruited using this method. Line managers affirm that this method can be used in 50 percent of successful appointments while HR managers believe, that even when other methods are employed it must always be in tandem with advertisements. HR managers indicated that the advertisement recruitment method is the accepted standard used 100 percent of the time. Job adverts (or internal advertisements) are the second frequently most used recruitment method (8 percent). HR managers claim that 67 percent use of this method of recruitment and line managers 17 percent. Referrals are also of the more frequently used methods (12 percent). This is confirmed by line managers (17 percent) but not viewed as an option by HR managers.

**Table 6.13: Recruitment method**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Methods employed</th>
<th>Appointees Number</th>
<th>Appointees %</th>
<th>Line Managers Number</th>
<th>Line Managers %</th>
<th>HR managers Number</th>
<th>HR managers %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment Agency</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Head-hunting</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walk-ins</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Referrals</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional Associations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertisements</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Present Employees</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Adverts</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personnel Records</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skills Inventory</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bursary students</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personnel records and Skills Inventory</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walk-ins, referrals, Professional associations and advertisements</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

85
6.4.8 Advertisement Design

Best practice suggests that the company should reveal that it is an employment equity employer as soon as possible as to encourage the previously disadvantaged individuals to apply (SPA, 1999:75). It also gives an indication of the company’s equal opportunity status in terms of recognition of prior learning, and its willingness to accept experience as a substitute for formal qualification. This status also implies that a company would give an individual with an ability to learn skills within a reasonable time frame a chance or opportunity to be appointed. Since advertisement is the point of first contact it would be good practice to reveal status at this point. The policy declares that the advertisement must clearly state the Department’s commitment to employment equity, and that preference will be given to candidates of designated groups. According to Table 6:14 the questionnaire revealed that this was not the case with recent appointments. Fifty-two percent of appointees claim adherence to this guideline, whilst the rest claim that they were informed at the interview, or through personal inquiry. Line managers claim that they informed applicants during interviews (83 percent); this might be because they are not so much involved with the advertisement, as were the HR managers (67 percent in advertisements and 33 percent at interviews).

Table 6.14: Advertisement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Company’s position</th>
<th>Appointees</th>
<th>Line Managers</th>
<th>HR managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertisements</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Inquiry</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Best practice (SPA, 1999:75) prescribes that advertisement should include job specification and requirements. Job related criteria must be based upon qualifications, professional experience and other attributes required of the person to do the job. This information would then be the basis of short-listing. The current recruitment and selection policy (2001:4) explicitly states that the
advertisement must specify the competencies required for the post, the key performance area, as well as other pertinent criteria such as security clearance.

According to Table 6.15 advertisements were successful as the exclusive form of information for 29 percent of the appointees. Interviews are also a popular medium of information in terms of job detail. Thirty percent of appointees were informed properly at interviews. Sixteen percent of appointees got the full picture only after the interview. Line managers and HR managers agreed that the combination of advertisement and interview gave incumbents the thorough picture of the position detail (67 percent). This reflects a good advertising strategy since evidence prior discussed indicate that advertisements were used to recruit 58 percent of appointees. Line and HR managers confirm the usage of advertisements as detailed representations of jobs. This is obvious since they are the role players responsible for these representations.

Table 6.15: Post detail

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Appointees</th>
<th>Line Managers</th>
<th>HR managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertisement</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Own Research</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At Interview</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advert, own research</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advert, interview - verbal</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Own Research, Interview - verbal</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.4.9 Implementation

In Table 6.16 the medium used to reach possible candidates is reflected. Literature indicated that all possible candidates should be reached, and that no particular group should be excluded. The evidence derived from this survey indicates a good spread of medium representation. Table 6.16 indicates that 66 percent of appointees are reached by means of national, provincial and local newspapers. Line managers agreed, while HR managers claimed that these were
the only vehicles utilized. Twenty-seven percent of appointees were contacted by means of phone calls or colleagues. Line managers are of the opinion that some (23 percent) suitable candidates were coached or informed by colleagues.

DWAF’s recruitment and selection policy explicitly states that jobs should be advertised to reach an entire pool of potential applicants especially the previously disadvantaged individuals. Advertisement in local, provincial and national newspapers, as well as posters and recruitment agencies, assumes that all potential candidates are looking for work or better prospects, therefore would scrutinize newspapers as a medium for work opportunities, and that most positions require a basic level of literacy, in terms of reading. Line managers and HR managers confirm the usages of newspapers and advertisements as the main recruitment medium and method. Their impression is that the department standardises on advertisements, but not exclusively, other methods and mediums are also used, in order to ensure that all possible candidates are reached.

Table 6.16: Medium used to reach candidates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recruitment medium</th>
<th>Appointees</th>
<th>Line managers</th>
<th>HR managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National newspaper</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment Agency</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provincial News</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local newspaper</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poster</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phone call</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Inquiry</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colleagues</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.4.10 Feedback

It is the policy of DWAF to notify the unsuccessful, as is proved in Table 6.17. All (100 percent) of the interviewed candidates that were unsuccessful were notified accordingly.
Table 6.17: Notification of the unsuccessful

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Line managers</th>
<th>HR managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.4.11 Planning and conducting Interview

Swanepoel et al (2001:322) advise that the main purpose of interviews is obtaining job-related information to enable panels to make a decision. It is therefore essential to establish rapport, for this is assumed to allow the candidate to relax and be confident, thus enabling him/her to perform at his/her best. Table 6.18 proves that the department enrolls to this principle and that the possibility to appoint the best person for a job is eminent. Forty-eight percent of incumbents regard the interview environment as supportive. Thirty-six percent are positive about the environment. Twelve percent view it as sufficient and four percent as negative or intimidating. Line managers and HR managers are of the opinion that the environment is sufficient and better to enable suitable candidates to represent themselves properly.

A continuum scale is used. Where 1 indicated a hostile environment, 3 indicated a sufficient neutral environment and 5 indicated a supportive environment.

Table 6.18: Interview Environment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Appointees</th>
<th>Line managers</th>
<th>HR managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>36</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6.19 depicts the relevance, efficiency and basis of questioning during interviews. Evidence indicates that advertisements are sufficiently designed, for
87 percent of the incumbents regard questioning as relevant to advertisements. Ninety-six percent of the incumbents deem questions as competency based. This indicates that advertisement does depict the inherent requirements of positions. Interviews are structured (87 percent), indicating a fair process to all applicants, for all asked the same questions without allowing any prompting.

In summary, questioning during interviews is competency based, related to the advertisement and interviews are structured.

### Table 6.19: Questioning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questioning</th>
<th>Appointees</th>
<th>Line managers</th>
<th>HR managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Related to Advertisement</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not related to Advertisement</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some were related</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competency based</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structured</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semi structured</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unstructured</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 6.4.12 Employment testing

Competency assessment is not an option that is preferred by line managers, HR managers and the selection panels. Table 6.20 advises that informal assessment is being done, though it cannot be used as a condition for employment. The analysis indicates that although competency assessment is not done (83 percent of appointees were not exposed to any form of competency testing), 76 percent of appointees felt that they were successfully assessed during interviews and reference checking. This implies that a good base of questioning is used.

In summary, competency assessment is not used. Informal assessment is done just to confirm selection, but is inadmissible.
Table 6.20: Competency assessment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Psychometric, ability testing done</th>
<th>Appointees</th>
<th>Line managers</th>
<th>HR managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informally</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Successful in assessment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.4.13 Selection

The Alexander Hamilton Institute (1995:5) advises that the selection of top candidates must be based upon a series of data collected. This implies the use of more than one selection tool. Table 6.21 depicts the status of selection tools employed by the Department to appoint suitable candidates. Ninety-six percent of appointments are based upon interviews. Research revealed that 52 percent of appointments were based on single tool data (interviews). These statistics cannot be accepted as accurate due to the fact that incumbents were not informed of reference checks that could have been done. Line managers claim that 66 percent of appointments adhere to the use of reference checks, whilst HR managers maintain that all top candidates are checked. Evidence however confirms that the basis of appointment or the main tool of assessment for selection is interviews.
Table 6.21: Selection tools applied

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Selection toolsApplied</th>
<th>Appointees</th>
<th>Line managers</th>
<th>HR managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competency tests</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reference Checks</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-statements</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychometric testing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security Clearance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical Clearance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview &amp; Test</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview &amp; Reference check</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview &amp; Self-statement</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview, Reference &amp; Self statements</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview, test &amp; Reference</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reference &amp; Self-statement</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.4.14 Legal framework

In order to ensure that selections are based upon the legal framework supplied by the EEA, the perceptions of the appointees were tested to determine their perception of bases of the qualification for the specific job that they applied for. Table 6.22 depicts the perception of all the main role players in terms of suitable qualification. According to Table 6.22 the term suitably qualified are defined by formal qualification, experience or the ability to learn (96 percent). The formal qualification and experience combination were used 38 percent of the time, whilst formal qualification and the ability to learn represent the definition for 15 percent of the time. The most frequent criteria for this definition were experience
(23 percent used exclusively and 54 percent used in combination with other criteria). Line managers (50 percent) declare a preference for formal qualification, experience and the ability to learn, while HR managers (67 percent) attach informal qualification as criteria. Experience tends to be the common definition for suitable qualification in DWAF.

Table 6.22: Suitably Qualified

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Appointees</th>
<th>Line manager</th>
<th>HR managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number %</td>
<td>Number %</td>
<td>Number %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal Qualification</td>
<td>1 4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience</td>
<td>6 23</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informal Qualification</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to learn</td>
<td>1 17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unsure</td>
<td>1 4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal Qualification &amp; Experience</td>
<td>10 38</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal Qualification &amp; the Ability to learn</td>
<td>4 15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience &amp; the Ability to learn</td>
<td>1 4 1 17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal Qualification, Experience &amp; the Ability to learn</td>
<td>2 8 3 50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal Qualification, Experience &amp; Informal Qualification</td>
<td></td>
<td>1 33</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience &amp; Informal Qualification</td>
<td></td>
<td>1 17</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal Qualification, Experience, Informal Qualification &amp; the Ability to learn</td>
<td>1 4</td>
<td>2 67</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6.4.15 Time

The period between application and appointment is an indication of the importance and urgency of the position within the strategic framework of an organisation. With the help of Table 6.23 and upon further investigation it was found that two of the three permanent positions were filled between one and six months, whilst the others took more than 6 months. Eighteen percent of fixed-term appointees waited for a period between one and six months while the rest (70 percent) of the short and fixed-term positions were filled within a month. This implies that there was a specific urgency surrounding their positions therefore the short period between application and appointment. In summary, a permanent position takes longer to fill.

Table 6.23: Period between application and appointment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Appointees</th>
<th>Line managers</th>
<th>HR managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within one week</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between one week and one month</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between one month and six months</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than six months</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.4.16 Information accuracy

Table 6.24 states that 96 percent of recent appointees confirmed that what they applied for is what they are currently doing. This information implies that data supplied in advertisements and interviews are correct, moreover that the organisation is streamlined in its strategic intent, that alternatives are thoroughly researched, and that recruitment and selection are the result of a definite need that exists within the organisation. Line managers (83 percent) and HR managers (100 percent) support this view.
Table 6.24: Accurate job information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Appointees</th>
<th>Line managers</th>
<th>HR managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did job applied for</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eventually did job applied for</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don’t do job applied for</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.4.17 Training

The purpose of recruitment and selection is to get the best possible fit to the job and organisation. If assumed that training is indirectly related to the best fit, then the less time spent in training of a new appointee the better the fit to the job, especially in cases of short-term and fixed-term appointments. Table 6.25 indicates a positive skewness of the frequency of time spent in training, which implies that less time is spent in training; therefore there is a high probability that the fits were accurate. Forty-three percent of the recently employed had less than one month’s training whilst 35 percent did not need any training. The three permanent employees both undertook less than one month’s training, which implies that at least 22 percent of the appointees were not accurately fitted in terms of the initial assumption. The other 65 percent were successful.

Table 6.25: Time spent in training

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Appointees</th>
<th>Line managers</th>
<th>HR managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than one month</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>43</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between one and three months</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between three and six months</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


6.5 QUALITATIVE DATA

The questionnaire included a few open-ended questions, which provided a substantial amount of qualitative data. The results of all the respondents, including line managers and HR managers are appended for scrutiny in Appendix D.

The first aspect relates to the frustration incumbents encountered during the recruitment and selection process they undertook. The purpose of this question was to determine a trend that countered the effectiveness of recruitment and selection. Respondents differed in their response to this question as can be seen in Table 6.26.

Table 6.26: Frustrations encountered during process

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>No. of references</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Time Schedule</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anxiety</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No proper Induction</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intimidation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No frustration</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Of the 26 different responses, 50 percent did not indicate any frustration. This could be due to the fact that they were unwilling to be exposed or that they may have not trusted confidentiality of the questionnaire; especially if they knew that the line and HR managers were also questioned.

Personal anxieties over which the selection committee had little or no control made up 19 percent of the comments. These relate to individuals’ personality and trust in their own ability. The following comments are some examples:

- The stress of going to the interview and the fear of not getting the job because you are not sure of your abilities.
- Anxiety, whether I will be successful or not.
• I was frustrated because I had fears of not being able to answer any question related to the core business of DWAF.

• Am I going to be able to apply my skills and what I have learnt at Technikon?

Some respondents (15 percent) were frustrated with the absence of orientation and an induction programme. This is however not part of the recruitment and selection process, but essential to the performance of incumbents and therefore the return of investment, that is pursued by the recruitment and selection process. The policy however cannot address this problem. Some of the comments were:

• The induction process was slow, and the job and its expectations were not thoroughly explained.
• No induction and orientation was done.
• There wasn’t a specific person who trained me, and no proper guidelines, for me, to follow.
• No induction or orientation, I had to find out what to do by myself.

The issue of time was a source of frustration for 11.5 percent of the respondents. These include the long waiting periods and disregard of time by selection committees. This is a point that can be addressed by the recruitment and selection policy. The following response summarises this aspect: “The interview was very long ... the evaluation process was frustrating ... the time schedule was not adhered to at all.”

Some respondents also indicated that:

• They were frustrated with the red tape surrounding appointments; and
• The power consciousness of selection committees. They referred to them as power freaks, who don’t know what power is for.

The same questions were asked to line and HR managers, to determine whether there were any similarities, or any composition of problems that could be addressed by proper application of the recruitment and selection policy. The different responses are depicted in Table 6.27 and Table 6.28
Table 6.27: Frustrations encountered by line managers in selection panel

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>No. of references</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Incompetence of applicants</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor HRM assistance</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office politics</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6.28: Frustrations encountered by HR managers in selection panel

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>No. of references</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Office Politics</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Red tape</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short-listing</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Framework</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Line manager Insolence</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Line managers (33 percent) were especially concerned with the effect of office politics on the recruitment and selection process. Office politics negates efforts, made by panel members and seem to make certain participants apathetic. Some of the related comments were:
- Too much interference from higher ranks.
- Frustration with one of the panel members.

Some line managers accused the human resource department of insufficient assistance (17 percent). This comment summarises this aspect: “No assistance from Human Resources department.”

Some line managers also indicated that:
- The student kept on making the same simple mistakes time and time again and I had to be patient.
- The process was too long.
The comments of HR managers overlapped and centered on themes mentioned in Table 6.28. The greatest points of frustration were on the issue of red tape or bureaucracy (67 percent). Some commented:

- Red tape, a large number of highly qualified applicants – with little to eliminate them on.
- A long waiting period for approval of motivation for candidate.

Another serious frustration involved the legal framework for recruitment and selection (67 percent). Comments that illustrate this frustration were:

- Employment Equity status in advertisement.
- Setting people up to fail.

Other comments were:

- In some instances transformation representatives ‘abuse’ their role and responsibility of function.
- The supervisor wants to take full control of process, even wanting to override HR at times. Supervisors sometimes want to be a part of short-listing but of final interviews only.

The next question relates to recommendations to improve the Recruitment and Selection procedure with the department. Table 6.29 gives an indication of the incumbents’ responses.
Table 6.29: Responses relating to recommendations for improvement - Incumbents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>No. of responses</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HR involvement</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training of panel</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panel objectivity</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Induction</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competency assessment questioning</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feedback</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview environment</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confidentiality</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panel demographics</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qualification</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reference check</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The most recommendations were in relation to the time aspect (21 percent) of recruitment and selection. Incumbents declared that the suspense is overwhelming. Related comments were:

- Must not wait for a long time to call people for interviews or for the regret letters.
- I would recommend that the recruitment and selection process should make people aware of the time period from date of interview until date of appointment. People are anxious and it is good to have something in writing and not to make verbal promises.
- Keep to time schedule!
- The process between the application for the position and appointment is too long. They must try to speed up the process
- The time is set out in advertising, interviews and commencing of the new appointed person, the panel should really keep to the time limit
- That the panel sticks to their time schedule; I had to wait very long for my interview (almost half an hour late).
The second most popular recommendation relates to the training (14 percent) of interviewers or the selection panel. Some respondents commented:

- Interviewer/s should be well informed and trained and not just any person that is available.
- The panel members should be fully ‘educated’ when it comes to recruitment and selection.
- The panel should be properly trained to understand how to conduct the interview.
- HR practitioners should lead during interviews to give professional advice to line and production managers.

Human resource department involvement (11 percent) was also advised:

- Less HR people should be involved.
- Must have a more supportive HR manager.
- HR practitioners should lead during interviews.

Panel objectivity (11 percent) is regarded as a priority and advised accordingly. The following comment summarises incumbent’s views: “Interviewer/s should not be biased, ...should give candidates a fair chance, ...and get rid of the subjectivity elements.”

Comments surrounding competency based questioning and assessments (11 percent) are encapsulated in the following remarks:

- A Personal Profile Analysis Test should be conducted when recruitment and selection is in process.
- All depends on position applied for, e.g. Personal Assistant – Test skills and knowledge needed for the position.
- Questions need to be more specific and job requirements clearly defined.

Other comments were:

- The job induction programme should be clearly defined and explained.
- They must inform the candidates who are not successful.
- They must appoint people permanently, not casually or contractually.
• It should be a relaxed, stress free atmosphere.
• The panel should give you a fair chance to prove yourself.
• I don’t know how the selection process works, when you apply for a job you go through emotions, firstly you apply for an answer when you receive a call you prepare for the interview. At the interview if all goes well, you sit and wait for an answer, when you get the job you concentrate on working hard. I don’t think people wonder about the recruitment process or should I say – I didn’t. I was just happy to get the job and my focus was on my job description.
• Confidentiality.
• Candidates should be judged according to their competencies.
• The EEA should be kept in mind when recruiting and selecting is being done and the panel should be representative of as many as possible population groups.
• To do references check on the qualifications of interviewee’s.
• Preparation for the new recruit should be done before the appointment.

The same question was asked to line managers and HR managers, to compile recommendations, as well note where practical pit-falls were. The themes of the recommendations are tabled in Table 6.30.
Table 6.30: Recommendations from line managers and HR managers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>No. of responses</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Training</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interference</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal framework</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inherent requirement specifications</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office Politics</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competency based questioning</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistance from HRM</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Induction</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source preference</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competency assessments</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview planning</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panel objectivity</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reference Checks</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment and selection procedure</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior management support</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

More training for panels (16 percent) was especially recommended by HR managers who are regarded as the experts of the process, and leaned on excessively especially due to the despondent attitude of line managers and other panel members. The following comments encapsulate this need:

- Supervisors need training
- Training of line managers, transformation, representatives and other panel members on the Recruitment policy and procedures as well as why we follow a Competency Based Recruitment process and how it works.
- Training in order to prevent interference.

Attention to the compilation of inherent requirements and job descriptions was advised (12 percent). Some remarks were:

- More emphasis on qualifications and experience as well as personality
- Proper job analysis needs to be done: analysis of competencies and responsibilities.
Recommendation was also made regarding interference (8 percent):
• Prevent interference especially with internal applicants.
• Let the specialist (Human Resource) do their work.

Recommendations regarding competency based questioning (8 percent) were:
• The best qualified must get the job.
• Policy should also make the use of Competency Based Recruitment questions, during the interview, compulsory.

Recommendation regarding source preference (8 percent) can be summarised as follows:
• Preference should be given to internal staff in respect of a higher-level position when filling.
• Upon commencement of duty a work plan to be discussed with new recruit.

Competency assessment (8 percent) was also deliberated on. Some of the comments were:
• We have trained analysts to conduct personal profiles, but still need to train analysts to conduct Psychometric tests. Once we have accredited analysts we are able to conduct potential psychometric tests. We will be able to have some processes, which will reduce the margin of error.
• I recommend that tests should be done.

Other comments were:
• A more supportive Human Resource Management in terms of Policy implementation and advice.
• Induction is made compulsory for all new recruits.
• A career succession programme should be made available for example: To identify a group of potential candidates for future higher-level positions and to subject them to an intensive accelerated training programme.
• Employment Equity plan pushed forward instead of employee competence.
• All panel members need to spend more time preparing for the interview and prepare more thoroughly prior to an ad being placed. We have had instances
where we began short-listing and we found out that the initial criteria had been omitted.

- Panel members need to be more objective and measure against required competencies rather than the person.
- Reference checks to be conducted for all positions and should verify performance vs. responsibilities and not only time-keeping. Must be competency based.
- The Policy should prescribe definite steps and time frames to adhere to. This will ensure consistency and fairness in the process.
- Management’s buy-in to the process. This will include special efforts to be made by Regional Management not to be the cause of delays in the process.

6.6 CONCLUSION

The purpose of this chapter was to analyse and interpret the data obtained through the research questionnaire. The analysis and interpretation of the data was undertaken in terms of the sub-problems defined in Chapter 1.

Seventy percent of distributed questionnaires were returned and used to base assumptions on. An analysis of the demographic characteristics of the respondents proved that coloured females were the most successful group of applicants. Females are a designated previously disadvantaged group and coloureds are the dominant race in the Western Province.

The presented data concludes that recruitment and selection activities are applied within a reasonable range of the policy guidelines. The activities not mentioned within the policy are done at the line or HR manager’s discretion and are potentially detrimental to the practical implementation of recruitment and selection.

The qualitative data here discussed highlights the downside of the practical process. Chapter 7 will focus on various recommendations that are based on these findings. Problems and limitations encountered during the research as well as opportunities for further research are also underlined.
CHAPTER 7
CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 INTRODUCTION

In the previous chapter, the research questionnaire was analysed and interpreted. This was done in relation to the practical implementation of recruitment and selection in DWAF, from the view of the newly appointed, some line managers and HR managers.

In this chapter, the main findings are summarized. The problems encountered during the research process are discussed. Recommendations regarding the written policy, the practical implementation of recruitment and selection are made.

7.2 MAIN FINDINGS

The main problem posed in this research was:

To what extent does the recruitment and selection practice in the department of Water Affairs and Forestry comply with its written recruitment and selection policy and procedure?

To be able to handle the main problem, the following sub-problems were identified:

- What is the drive behind the Public Services’ initiation to improve their Recruitment and Selection policies?
- What does literature suggest as best practices for recruitment and selection?
- How does the policy of the Department of Water Affairs and Forestry (DWAF) compare with best practices as discussed in the literature study?
- How does the recruitment and selection practice in DWAF conform to the written policy?
The four sub-problems have been dealt with in the previous chapters. Although recruitment and selection practice in DWAF generally comply with its Recruitment and Selection policy, which in turn are in line with Best Practice, a number of recommendations need to be made to ensure consistency and a sound process, as well as to meet the standards of the model developed in Section 3.6 (Figure.3.1).

In analysing the content of the Recruitment and Selection Policy, the following conclusions were made:

- The recruitment and selection policy is comprehensive, well researched and legally sound.
- Shortcomings relate to cost, conditions for waiver and a standardized recruitment and selection procedure.
- Due to shortcomings and unclear definitions the policy can easily be manipulated and therefore is at risk of becoming inconsistent in its application.

When comparing the results of the survey to the developed model (Section 3.6) the following main conclusions are derived:

- There is no standardised recruitment and selection procedure.
- The policy is the responsibility of the HR managers.
- Several alternatives are investigated before initiating a recruitment drive.
- Request for approval to fill a position is a team effort from the line and HR managers.
- Selection is based upon the inherent requirements of the job.
- The policy does not provide guidelines or give reference to documentation that guides the composition of inherent requirements for positions; this could lead to inconsistent or biased profiling.
- Panels are representative of the community demographics and consist of four to six members, of which all participate in the interviews, implying that panels are trained.
- The bulk of new appointees are externally sourced.
- Advertisements are the preferred recruitment method but other methods are also employed.
Employment Equity status is revealed in advertisements and affirmed by line managers during interviews. Only some advertisements contain enough detail about jobs while others need interviews to fill the gaps of information.

Regional newspapers offer the best results in informing potential candidates.

Newspapers are the main method of recruitment, implying that most of the appointees are literate, to a point that they can read. Thus literate candidates are preferred.

Candidates that were unsuccessful in the interviews are informed accordingly.

Interviewers establish rapport with interviewees and they create an environment where the potential of candidates can be thoroughly assessed.

Interview questioning is competency based, related to advertisements and structured.

DWAF does not employ competency assessment as a selection tool.

Competency based questions during interviews are successful in assessing candidates.

Selection is based upon interviews, which are backed up by reference checking.

Experience is the highest-ranking element in defining the suitably qualified.

The low need for training of newly appointed employees imply that assessment of candidates were successful and effective.

Some appointees are not accurately fitted.

Most of those newly appointed had no frustrations with the recruitment and selection process.

Although there are no procedures pertinently mentioned, most of the activities involved with recruitment and selection are sufficiently guided by the recruitment and selection policy.

A point to consider is the dependency on HR managers as specialists and the responsibilities of these experts to drive and monitor, but also to manipulate the
system. This is possible due to the lack of procedural guidelines or examples in the policy. The results of the survey showed that in many cases the line or HR managers use their own discretion, allowing for biases and thus for an inconsistent process, liable to legal actions.

7.3 PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED IN THE RESEARCH

A minor problem was the researchers’ inability to contact all the incumbents, and to persuade them to partake in this study. A major limitation is the current restructuring of the Public Service and in specific Resolution 7 of 2002, which limited the number of permanent appointees and increased the amount of short-term (12 month) contract workers. This regulation made it impossible to calculate the turnover rate of employees to substantiate conclusions and recommendations.

7.4 RECOMMENDATIONS

The following recommendations flow from the study with respect to the recruitment and selection policy:

- Amend the policy as to include a standard procedural guideline. This could be in the form of a skeleton framework, suggesting the order of activities, related delegation and responsibilities.

- Define provisions clearly, especially in terms of how to and when to use selection tools or activities. For example: in the definition of competency assessment, the policy should not only state how to apply this tool but also when to use it.

- Include instructions or reference to other documents that contain instructions on issues such as the compilation of inherent requirements, needs assessment and competency testing.
• Include reference to relevant documentation discussing DWAF’s policy in terms of succession planning, disciplinary action, performance management, organisational culture, mission, vision and regulations pertaining to the industrial sector.

• Include a framework of costs, especially in relation to advertising, travelling, selection tools and contract negotiations.

• Append examples for administrative issues such as requests for approval to fill a post, report (motivation), evaluation and scoring methods.

The abovementioned recommendations are not intended to confine the users’ discretion or enthusiasm, but rather to facilitate an effective, consistent, legally sound, though flexible recruitment and selection practice.

The following recommendations flow from the study with respect to the practical implementation of recruitment and selection in DWAF:

• In order to encourage line managers and HR managers to use and adhere to this policy the new recruitment and selection policy should be marketed extensively. This can be done through road shows, the Intranet, competitions or internal newsletters. Ensure to get the support of senior management in this marketing drive.

• Train recruitment and selection specialists in every region, who will be responsible to train selection panels and line managers on a continual basis. Share good suggestions from line managers and HR managers.

• Train HR managers to be knowledgeable, in terms of the Employment Equity Act, the Labour Relation Act and related legislation. Certify them accordingly, thus reinforcing their responsibility for the legal side of the process. This could nullify the inclusion of transformation members in the selection panels.
• Train competency assessment specialists and acquire licensing for certain assessments.

• Employ competency assessments to confirm competency based interviews and reference checking. Use more than one selection tool to confirm selection.

• Do reference checking before interviews and inform interviewees accordingly. This should be done to verify information obtained from reference checks by means of carefully planned questioning, during interviews.

• Use semi-structured interviews, designed to prompt for adequate information. The purpose of the interview is not to determine who can give the best answer, but to ascertain the candidate’s competency.

• Check inherent requirements of the job with relevant documentation, governing the process of profiling.

• Check senior management and biased personnel in time, and reward them observer status, if subjective behaviour is noted.

7.5 CONCLUSION

The purpose of this study was to determine whether the practical implementation of recruitment and selection complies with its written recruitment and selection policy. Research indicates that this is the case, but that adjustments to the policy could ensure better compliance. This chapter encapsulates the conclusions made from research and recommendations to improve the recruitment and selection policy as well as the practical implementation of recruitment and selection in DWAF.
REFERENCE LIST


Department of Labour: *Learnership* Doc no: NSDS 01 – 002.

Department of Public Service and Administration. *Integrated Planning*. Available: www.emerald-library.com

Department of Water Affairs and Forestry. 2001. Recruitment and Selection policy. Available at the Department


Employers’ Organisation for local Government. Recruitment guide
Available: www.lg-employers.gov.uk


Hutton T. Human Resource strategy – presentation for class. 2001, Session 1


Appendix A

Questionnaire

1. Which recruitment method was used?
   \((\text{Indicate your answer by making an } X \text{ in the appropriate box/boxes})\)

   - Recruit agency
   - Head-hunting
   - Walk-ins
   - Referrals
   - Profession Association
   - Advertisement
   - Present Employees
   - Job Adverts
   - Personnel Records
   - Skills Inventor
   - Other

   If other, specify…………………………………………………………

2. Which medium was used to reach you?
   \((\text{Indicate your answer by making an } X \text{ in the appropriate box/boxes})\)

   - National Newspaper
   - Recruitment Agency
   - Provincial News
   - Local Newspaper
   - Poster
   - Rumour
   - Phone call
   - Personal Inquiry
   - Colleagues
   - Other

   If other, specify…………………………………………………………

3. What constitutes your suitability for the post?
   \((\text{Indicate your answer by making an } X \text{ in the appropriate box/boxes})\)

   - Formal qualification
   - Experience
   - Informal qualification
   - Ability to acquire qualities within a reasonable time
   - Unsure
4. Were you an internal or external candidate?
   (Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)
   
   [ ] Internal  [ ] External

5. How were you informed of the Company’s affirmative action position?
   (Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)

   [ ] Advertisement  [ ] Personal Inquiry  [ ] Interview

6. How were you informed of the detail of the position?
   (Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box/boxes)
   
   [ ] Advertisement  [ ] Own research  [ ] At interview – verbal  [ ] At interview – job description

7. How did you experience the interview environment?
   (Indicate your answer by making an X on the following continuum: where 1 represents a hostile environment and 5 represent a supportive environment)

   [ ] 1 [ ] 2 [ ] 3 [ ] 4 [ ] 5

8. How many people were on the selection panel?
   (Indicate your answer in the appropriate box below)

   [ ]
9. Was the selection panel representative of community demographics?
   (Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)
   [Yes]  [No]  [No Panel]

10. How many panelists were active participants (questioning during interview)?
   (Indicate your answer in the appropriate box below)
   [ ]

11. Did the selection panel seem knowledgeable and trained?
   (Indicate your answer by making an X on the following continuum where 1 represents unprofessional and 5 represents very knowledgeable)

12. Was the line manager involved?
   (Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)
   [Yes]  [No]

13. Was the Human Resource practitioners involved?
   (Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)
   [Yes]  [No]

14. Was the interview structured or unstructured?
   (Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)
   [Structured]  [Semi structured]  [Unstructured]
15. Were questions asked related to the Advertisement?
   *(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)*
   - [ ] Yes
   - [ ] No

16. Did the panel test your competencies?
   *(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)*
   - [ ] Yes
   - [ ] No

17. Do you feel that they thoroughly tested your level of competence?
   *(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)*
   - [ ] No
   - [ ] Unsure
   - [ ] Yes

18. Which selection tools were used?
   *(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box/boxes)*
   - [ ] Interview
   - [ ] Competency test
   - [ ] Reference checks
   - [ ] Self-statements
   - [ ] Psychometric testing
   - [ ] Security clearance
   - [ ] Medical clearance
   - [ ] Other

   If other, specify: .................................................................

19. Were you subjected to competency or psychometric testing such as Personality-, ability-, and cognitive testing?
   *(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box/boxes)*
   - [ ] Yes
   - [ ] No
20. In terms of the testing which of the following apply?

(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box/boxes)

- Did you perceive tests to be relevant?
- Were you informed prior to testing?
- Were you aware of the appropriateness of the test (What it measured.)?
- According to you, were you properly instructed before testing?
- Was the test instrumental to your appointment?
- Testing was part of selection process
- Language of test proficient – in line with your language
- Was the environment conducive to testing?
- Was your result shared with you?

21. How long a period between applications for post to appointment?

(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)

- Within One week
- Between one (1) week and one (1) month
- Between one (1) months and six (6) months
- More than six (6) months

22. After being appointed, did you do the job you applied for?

(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)

- Yes
- Eventually
- No

If “no or eventually”, why? .................................................................

23. How much time spent on training during first year?

(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)

- None
- Less than one (1) month
- Between one (1) and three (3) months
- Between three (3) and (6)
24. What was the biggest frustration experienced during the process?

........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................

25. What would you recommend to improve the recruitment and selection process?

........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................

Thank you very much
Appendix B

Questionnaire for Line Managers and Human Resource managers

Name:……………………
Line manager of:……………………………..

Section A

1. To what measure were you led by the recruitment and selection policy?
   (Indicate your answer by making an X on the following continuum, where 1 represents not using the policy at all, and 5 represent an absolute dependence on the written guidelines)

   | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
   ---|---|---|---|---|---|

2. Under which circumstance did the need for the recruitment arise?
   (Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box/boxes)

   - [ ] Someone has left and needs to be replaced.
   - [ ] Maternity leave cover.
   - [ ] A special project, for a limited period, requiring special skills not available in the existing team.
   - [ ] Holiday or sickness leave.
   - [ ] Clearance of a backlog of work.
   - [ ] New strategic direction demands the creation of a new post.
   - [ ] Cover necessary while recruiting for a new permanent team member or while waiting for approval to recruit.
   - [ ] Other

   If other, specify........................................................................................................................................
3. **What other alternatives were researched before recruitment and selection?**

*(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box/boxes)*

- Not replacing a person
- Promoting internally
- Redesigning the job
- Employing temporary help
- Leaving the job the same,
- Learnerships
- Over time
- Outsourcing
- Other

If other, specify........................................................................................................................................

4. **Were you involved in drawing up the request for approval for filling the post?**

*(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)*

- Yes
- No

5. **Did your inherent requirements, or characteristics of the ideal job applicant, for the post include the following?**

*(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box/boxes)*

- **Physical make-up:** This relates to appearance and health.
- **Attainments:** This refers to professional and practical experience.
- **Special Aptitudes:** Referring to specific skills and the level of ability sought.
- **Disposition:** Does the personality of the candidate you seek fit the culture of the organisation? Refraining from cloning?
- **Circumstances:** Do these job requirements conflict with domestic, religious, cultural values
6. Which candidates enjoyed preference?
   *(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box/boxes)*
   
   [ ] Internal  [ ] External

7. Which recruitment method was used?
   *(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box/boxes)*
   
   [ ] Recruit agency  [ ] Head-hunting  [ ] Walk-ins  [ ] Referrals  [ ] Profession Association  [ ] Advertisement
   
   [ ] Present Employee  [ ] Job Adverts  [ ] Personnel Records  [ ] Skills Inventor  [ ] Other

   If other, specify........................................................................................................................................

8. Which medium was used to reach candidates?
   *(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box/boxes)*
   
   [ ] National Newspaper  [ ] Recruitment Agency  [ ] Provincial News  [ ] Local Newspaper  [ ] Poster  [ ] Rumour
   
   [ ] Phone call  [ ] Personal Inquiry  [ ] Colleagues  [ ] Other

   If other, specify........................................................................................................................................

9. What was used to constitute the candidates suitability for the post?
   *(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box/boxes)*
   
   [ ] Formal qualification  [ ] Experience  [ ] Informal qualification  [ ] Ability to acquire qualities within a reasonable time  [ ] Unsure
10. How did you inform the candidates of the Company’s affirmative action position?
(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box/boxes)

- Advertisement
- Interview
- Other

If other, specify.................................................................................................................................

11. How did you inform the candidates of the detail of the position?
(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box/boxes)

- Advertisement
- Verbally during interview
- Job description during interview
- Other

If other, specify.................................................................................................................................

12. How did you experience the interview environment?
(Indicate your answer by making an X on the following continuum: where 1 represents a hostile environment and 5 represent a supportive environment)

1 2 3 4 5

13. How many people were on the selection panel?
(Indicate your answer in the appropriate box below)

14. Was the selection panel representative of community demographics?
(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)

- Yes
- No
- No Panel
15. How many panelists were active participants (questioning during interview)?

(Indicate your answer in the appropriate box below)

16. Did the selection panel seem knowledgeable and trained?

(Indicate your answer by making an X on the following continuum where 1 represents unprofessional and 5 represents very knowledgeable)

1 2 3 4 5

17. Were the Human Resource practitioners / Line manager involved?

(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)

Yes No

18. Was interview structured or unstructured?

(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)

Structured Semi-structured Unstructured

19. Was your questioning related to the Advertisement?

(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)

Yes No

20. Did the panel test the candidate’s competencies?

(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)

Yes No
21. Do you feel that the panel thoroughly tested the level of the candidate’s competence?

(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)

No  Unsure  Yes

22. Which selection tools were used?

(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box/boxes)

☐ Interview  ☐ Competency test  ☐ Reference checks  ☐ Self-statements  ☐ Psychometric testing  ☐ Security clearance  ☐ Medical clearance  ☐ Other

If other, specify..............................................................................................................................................

23. Did you subject candidates to competency or psychometric testing such as Personality-, ability-, and cognitive testing?

(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)

Yes  No

24. In terms of the testing which of the following apply?

(Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box/boxes)

☐ Did you perceive tests to be relevant?
☐ Were you informed prior to testing?
☐ Were you aware of the appropriateness of the test (What it measured)?
☐ According to you, were you properly instructed before testing?
☐ Was the test instrumental to your appointment?
☐ Testing was part of selection process
Language of test proficient – in line with your language
Was the environment conducive to testing?
Were your results shared with you?

25. Did you notify the unsuccessful candidates?
   (Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)
   
   Yes  No

26. How long a period between applications for post to appointment?
   (Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)
   
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Within One week</th>
<th>Between one (1) week and one (1) month</th>
<th>Between one (1) month and six (6) months</th>
<th>More than six (6) months</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

27. After appointment did the appointee do the job he/she applied for?
   (Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)
   
   Yes  Eventually  No

If “no or eventually”, why? ........................................................................................................

28. How much time spent on training during first year?
   (Indicate your answer by making an X in the appropriate box)
   
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>None</th>
<th>Less than one (1) month</th>
<th>Between one (1) and three (3) months</th>
<th>Between three (3) and (6) months</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

29. What was the biggest frustration experienced during the process?
   .................................................................................................................................
   .................................................................................................................................
   .................................................................................................................................
   .................................................................................................................................

129
30. What do you recommend to improve the recruitment and selection process?

……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
Thank you very much
**Policy evaluation - Section B**

Literature study done in Chapter 3.3 gave way to the policy evaluation checklist, which is based on best practices as discussed. The checklist was compiled and evaluated with the help of the HR managers for the Gouritz region in the Western Province.

*(Indicate your answer by making a mark in the appropriate box)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Does the policy state or include. ......</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Not sure</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The objectives that is to be met in the implementation of Recruitment and Selection</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Competitive aspirations and strategic intentions of the company, and its impact on the implementation of Recruitment and Selection</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Internal or External candidate preference and relevant order of importance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The company’s commitment to its status as an Equal Opportunity Employer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The company’s position and adherence to the National Legislator</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. The costs involved, (limitations and framework)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Conditions for waiver of the recruitment and selection drive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Internal recruitment - limitations, sources and ethics</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. External recruitment – its order of preference, sources, methods and practices</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. The Company’s position on Psychometric testing, medical testing and other testing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Reference checking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Job offers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Feedback</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. The company’s recruitment and selection procedure</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Legislation pertinent to recruitment which the company may be subjected to, such as Skills Development, Employment Equity, labour relations and the Occupational health and Safety Acts</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Regulation agreements that regulate conditions to employment to the sector</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. The company’s policies and procedures that deal with its vision, mission, culture, conduct and short and long term strategies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. The disciplinary, dismissal and grievance procedure</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix C

DEPARTMENT OF WATER AFFAIRS AND FORESTRY

CREATE A BETTER WORKPLACE. IMPLEMENT DWAF POLICY.

1. PREAMBLE

- The purpose of this policy is to provide guidelines to the Department of Water Affairs and Forestry on a fair, consistent, transparent and efficient way of attracting, selecting and appointing necessary talent to enhance performance and effective service delivery.

- Recruitment is the prime instrument for obtaining the skills necessary to meet the Department’s strategic and operational needs and for achieving employment equity goals by opening up the Public Service to all sections of society.

2. DEFINITIONS

3. PRINCIPLES

- The stability of the organisation largely depends on its human resources. It is therefore crucial to appoint the most suitable personnel.

- All vacancies shall be open to all applicants irrespective of race, gender, religion and political opinion, ethnic or social origin, sexual orientation, age, disability, culture, language, marital status and no applicant shall be prevented from taking up employment in the department on any arbitrary ground. The only expenses are covered in the regulations C.2.5 in Chapter VII
• Employment practices shall ensure employment equity, fairness, efficiency and the achievement of a representative of the Public Service in general and the Department in particular.
• This policy should be linked to succession planning and as such, internal recruitment shall take precedence over external recruitment, except if specific qualities are required in line with the transformation of the Department.
• Selection criteria shall be objective, related to the inherent requirements of the job and consistently applied.
• Appointments will be done in accordance with the National guidelines (referring to employment Equity Act / affirmative action policy of the Department aimed at a more representative Department. Affirmative Action Policy shall be used to give practical support.
• Foreigners will be appointed only if the South African market cannot provide such expertise. Priority will be given to South Africans citizens and thereafter to non-South Africans with permanent residence permit.

4. SCOPE OF APPLICATION
The Recruitment and Selection Policy applies to all employees

5. LEGISLATION AND GUIDELINES
This Policy has been formulated using all relevant labour legislation but the following have specific relevance:
• Labour Relations Act, 1995
• Employment Equity Act, 1998
• Public Service Regulations, 2001
• Public Service Act, 1994 (as amended)
• Basic Conditions of Employment Act
• Sanctioning guides

6. DELEGATIONS
The authority to approve/disapprove the appointments/promotions and transfers has been delegated by the minister to:
• D: HRM for levels 9-12
• Regional Director for levels 1-8
• DD: HRM for levels 1-8 (in head office)
7. POLICY PROVISIONS

7.1 ADVERTISING

7.1.1 Jobs should be advertised to reach an entire pool of potential applicants especially the previously disadvantaged individuals.

7.1.2 The advertisement for a post should specify the inherent requirements of the job, job title and criteria to be used for selection.

7.1.3 Qualifications should not be defined primarily or solely in terms of formal qualifications but should, for example, include skills, prior learning and relevant experience. If formal qualifications are essential, these should be set in such a way that there is a balance between the need for competence and the goal of accessibility. However, qualifications which are prescribed should be stated in the advertisement, e.g. in the case of engineers, or those professions requiring registration.

7.1.4 The advertisement shall make it clear that the Department is committed to employment equity, and that applications from designated group will be encouraged.

7.1.5 The language and style of the advertisement should be clear, simple and professional. It must present the Department of Water Affairs and Forestry as the “employer of choice” in order to attract the best skills available and any target group sought by the Department.

7.1.6 The additional requirements for health or security clearances, where these are justified by the inherent nature of the work, should be clearly stated in the advertisement.

7.1.7 Posts on senior management level will be advertised nationally both inside and outside the Public Service.

7.1.8 A delegated authority may determine which posts must be subjected to job evaluation before advertising of the relevant post. All newly defined posts from level 9 and above must be subject to job evaluation.
7.1.9 The Department of Water Affairs and Forestry may utilise advertising agencies, which reflect diversity and have a wide network of potential candidates for press advertisement.

7.1.10 The advertisement will be free of reference to discriminatory phrases. The language and style of the advertisement should be clear and simple and be such as to attract candidates from all sections of the South African population; (in particular those whom the Department wishes to attract in order to achieve employment equity).

7.1.11 The advertisement shall specify the number of posts to be filled, competencies required for the post, the key performance areas as well as any other pertinent criteria (security clearance, registration requirements, etc).

7.1.12 The advertisement shall make it clear that the Department is committed to employment equity and that application from Blacks, Women and Disabled will be encouraged.

7.1.13 The advert will be placed in newspapers (i.e. Regional and National) that reach all target groups. The cost implications will be taken into account when selecting a newspaper.

7.1.14 Posts may not be advertised externally if the Department of Water Affairs and Forestry can fill the post from the supernumerary staff of equal grading or plans to fill the post as part of a programme of laterally rotating or transferring employees to enhance organisational effectiveness and skills.

7.1.15 Skills search or head–hunting through recruitment agencies in consultation with the Directorate: Human Resources Management may be used to identify candidates for senior posts or where skills are scarce after the Labour Market has been tested. Once the candidates have been identified, the principles of selection on merit shall apply. A customised competency based assessment battery for senior managers in the Public Service is attached as Annexure D. This assessment battery is based on a number of generic management
competencies which have been identified as particularly important for senior managers.

7.1.16 The advertisement must indicate that if candidates do not receive correspondence within two months after the closure, it should be assumed that their applications are/were unsuccessful.

7.2 SELECTION PROCESS

7.2.1 Time Frames
a) Short-listing will be done within 30 days after the closing date.
b) Interview dates will be confirmed with the candidates at least a week before the interview.
c) Successful candidates will be notified only after approval of appointment.
d) Letters to unsuccessful interviewed applicants will be sent out 5 working days after the successful candidate has accepted the offer.

7.2.2 Selection Committee
a) An executing authority shall appoint a selection committee to make recommendations on appointment to all posts.
b) The selection committee shall comprise of at least three members on a grading higher than the post to be filled and/or persons from outside of the Public Service but not exceeding six in cases of Senior Management posts and an official from HR.
c) A selection committee constituted for the appointment of a head of the Department may include employees of grading equal to the post to be filled and the executing authority.
d) A selection Committee shall where possible include adequate representation of designated groups.
e) The selection committee shall make a recommendation on the suitability of a candidate after considering the following:
i) Information based on valid methods, criteria and/or instruments for selection that are free from any bias or discrimination;

ii) The training, skills, competence and knowledge based on the inherent requirements of the job;

iii) The needs of the Department for developing human resources in the longer run;

iv) The representativity or employment equity plan of the component containing the post;

f) The selection committee shall do the short-listing.

g) The HRM officer in the selection committee should immediately verify the foreign qualifications with SAQA when short-listed. Qualifications obtained within the Republic of South Africa will be verified with the academic institution concerned.

NB: Guidelines on competency focussed assessment are attached as Annexure E

7.2.3 Interview

a) Selection panel must acknowledge and adhere to the principle of equal employment opportunities and ensure that any person who rightfully qualifies will be in a position to present his/her candidature for appointment.

The key points to keep in mind are that:

i) Rigorous short-listing should be applied (i.e. only those assessed as having required competencies or potential for a position should be included);

ii) Final short-lists should, in general, not exceed a maximum of 10 applicants; and

iii) The method of short-listing and final assessment is a matter for each Selection Advisory Committee to determine having regard to the option set out below:

- Establish an interim short-list (using application evidence to identify potential “high calibre” applicants).
• Finalise short-list after contacting referees (when speaking with referees, seek verification of claims made by candidates in their applications). The remaining applicants will be those regarded as being in close contention for selection.

b) The interview atmosphere will be free from a patronising approach and intimidation e.g. sitting arrangements, size of the panel etc.

c) No questions which contain traces of direct or indirect discriminating may be asked during the interview and the principles of the Labour Relations Act, 1995 and Human Rights Bill must be adhered to. Interview questions should be relevant to the requirements of the post.

d) A race, gender and disability profile of the component concerned must be attached to the recommendations for the filling of the advertised post.

e) Minutes of interviews and or score rating will be retained to justify decisions.

7.2.4 Competency Assessment

a) Any assessment of a candidate may only be done following an initial interview.

b) Coaching in test taking will be provided for applicants unfamiliar with testing procedure.

7.2.5 Medical Examination

a) Appointees may be requested to supply medical information in-line with legislative requirements, (only if it is an inherent requirement of the post). Medical examinations will not, however, include pre-employment testing for HIV/AIDS unless if it is legally justifiable. The Department in this regard will incur examination expenses.

7.2.6 Reference Checks

a) Reference checks may be done before the interview, depending on the information necessary for the job. The chairperson shall appoint a member from the panel to do
reference checks. It is highly preferable that the Selection Advisory Committee makes direct contact with referees rather than relies on written reports presented by applicants.

b) Key points obtained from referees must be documented and read back to them, for verification. Any adverse comments obtained from referees must be provided to the applicant for comment prior to the process being finalised.

c) It is often not advisable to contact referees not specifically nominated by the applicant unless permission is sought from the applicant prior to the contact being made. However, short-listed candidates will be compelled to give names of their current supervisors as referees.

7.2.7 Recommendations/Approval

a) All recommendations together with draft letters of appointment/promotion/transfer will be submitted to the relevant Line Manager for recommendation.

b) Submissions will be prepared in a prescribed format designed by the Chief Directorate: Human Resources Management.

c) First and second choices may be identified and submitted as recommendations for approval. Only after the offer has been declined in writing by the first choice the second choice may be considered.

d) All motivations for nominating the successful and unsuccessful candidates should be included in the minutes and submission.

e) a personal file for new appointments must be opened within 30 days of appointment.

8. APPOINTMENT

An offer of employment will be made based on the following minimum requirements:
a) The completion of an application form for employment and health questionnaire (where it is an inherent requirement of the post) signed by the applicant.
b) The submission of a detailed Curriculum Vitae, with references.
c) The new appointee assuming duty must provide proof of qualifications and experience (certified copies of certificates). In exceptional circumstances original copies may be required to verify the copies of the certificates that were provided with the application for the appointment. If the originals are not forwarded the relevant managers must be informed by the local Division Human Resources for corrective steps.
d) Details of the newly appointed official will be captured on the Persal system within five working days after assumption of duty.
e) No Appointments under the age of 16 will be accepted.
f) A person will be appointed to a post as advertised.
g) Appointments will be done in line with the New Public Regulations as well as the Code of Remuneration except in cases where the Director General is requested to relax certain requirements.

8.1 Appointment of immigrants
The head of the Department may authorise the employment of an immigrant in terms of the Minimum Information Security Standard, approved by the Cabinet as official government policy to protect the interest of the Republic as determine in the National Strategic Intelligent Act, 39 of 1994.

8.2 Re-appointment of Former Employees
8.2.1 General Conditions with Regard to the Re-employment of Former Employees
a) The Minister or Delegated Authority as set out in the Delegations of the Department S1/3/1/1, may not re-appoint a former employee where:
i) the former employee left the public service earlier, on the condition that he/she would not accept or seek re-employment;
ii) the original grounds for termination of service mitigate against re-appointment; or
iii) the former employee left the public service or agencies due to ill health and cannot provide recent and conclusive evidence of recovery.

b) The re-appointment of former employees should occur with due consideration to the merit and efficiency principle. Dual appointment in this regard may be recommended with a purpose to mentor new entrants who occupy scarce occupational class. In the request for re-appointment, the following aspects must be stipulated:

i) The recruitment procedures followed;

ii) The selection criteria which was applied;

iii) How the interest of the Department will be served with the re-appointment, especially if the original grounds for termination of services are weighed against it;

iv) Whether the former employee is being re-appointed in the same department or post or the same comparative functions;

v) Whether the need was present when the former employee’s service was terminated; and

vi) Reasons why further recruitment actions are not an option.

c) Former employees who had the opportunity of an extensive career within the Public Service should, as a rule, stand back for young entrants to the labour market and other job seekers who also meet the prescribed appointment requirements.

d) The importance of transfer of skills should be taken into account when a decision to re-appoint is taken (especially if the former employee has skills, which render him/her indispensable).

7.3 Appointment on contract/additional employment

7.3.1 An executing authority may, within the relevant budget, employ persons additional to the approved establishment where:-

a) the incumbent of a post is expected to be absent for such a period that her/his duties cannot be performed by other personnel; or
b) a temporary increase in work occurs; or

c) it is necessary for any other reason to temporarily increase the staff of the department.

NB: The remuneration of a member on a contract with a fixed term will be equal to the remunerative package of an equivalent permanent worker, which derives from:

d) evaluation of the job in line with the Public Service Regulations, or

e) the remuneration package of a similar existing post
8. **CONTRACT OF EMPLOYMENT**

A letter of appointment (i.e. permanent or contract) will be issued which stipulate the conditions and all the service benefits offered by the Department of Water Affairs and Forestry. The employment contract should stipulate the duration of employment, duties to be performed and the remuneration offered by the department:

- Annexure A: Contract of employment.
- Annexure B: Conditions of appointment.
Appendix D

Respondents biggest frustration during the recruitment and selection process.

1. I experienced too much red tape. The rules are too strictly adhered to. It seemed as if people are power freaks, though they do not know how to use that power.
2. The interview was very long.
3. It wasn't a big frustration but I was asking myself if I was able to handle everything and the pressure of so-called colleagues. And am I going to be able to apply my skills and what I have learnt in Tech.
4. Anxiety, whether I will be successful or not.
5. The waiting process.
6. The induction process was slow, and the job and its expectations were not thoroughly explained.
7. No induction or orientation, I had to find out what to do by myself. Also the time schedule, which is not adhered to at all.
8. The stress of going to the interview and the fear of not getting the job because you are not sure of your abilities.
9. There wasn’t a specific person who trained me and no proper guidelines, for me, to follow.
10. When I was interviewed I had never been in any work environment that had anything to do with DWAF, so I was frustrated because I had fears of not being able to answer any question related to the core business of DWAF.
11. As a Bursary student my frustration centered on being trained by people that knew very little about the structure of DWAF.
12. No induction and orientation was done. I was also without an office, computer and phone for a week.

Line Managers
13. The student kept on making the same simple mistakes time and time again and I had to be patient.
14. No assistance from Human Resources.
15. Too much interference from higher ranks.
16. Frustration with one of the panel members (office politics).
17. Time spent on the R&S process.

**Human resources managers**

18. In some instances transformation representatives ‘abuse’ their role and responsibility of function.
19. Red tape, a large number of highly qualified applicants – with little to eliminate them on.
20. A long waiting period for approval of motivation for candidate.
22. Setting people up to fail.
23. Supervisor wants to take full control of process, even wanting to override HR at times. Supervisors sometimes want to be a part of short-listing but of final interviews only.

**Respondents recommendations to improve the recruitment and selection process**

1. Less HR people should be involved.
2. Interviewer/s should be well informed and trained and not just any person that is available.
3. Interviewer/s should not be biased.
4. The job induction programme should be clearly defined and explained.
5. I recommend that a Personal Profile Analysis Test should be conducted when recruitment and selection is in process.
6. Must have a more supportive HR Manager.
7. Must not wait for a long time to call people for interviews or for the regret letters.
8. They must inform the candidates which are not successful.
9. They must appoint people permanently, not casually or on contract.
10. It should be a relaxed atmosphere and stress free.
11. The panel should give you a fair chance to prove yourself.
12. I don’t know how the selection process works, when you apply for a job you go through the motions, firstly you apply for an answer when you receive a call you prepare for the interview. At the interview if all goes well, you sit and wait for an answer, when you get the job you concentrate on working hard. I don’t think people wonder about the recruitment process or shall I say – I didn’t. I was just happy to get the job and my focus was on my job description.

13. I would recommend that the recruitment and selection process should make people aware of the time period from date of interview until date of appointment. People are anxious and it is good to have something on writing and not to make verbal promises.


15. All depend on position applied for, e.g. Personal Assistant – Test skills and knowledge needed for the position.

16. Keep to time schedule!

17. The panel members should get rid of the subjectivity element, candidates should be judged according to their competencies.

18. The EEA should be kept in mind when recruiting and selecting is being done and the panel should be representative of as many as possible population groups.

19. Questions need to be more specific and job requirements clearly defined.

20. I can recommend that the process must not be based on experience so much, but also on experience.

21. The process between the application for the position and appointment is too long. They must try to speed up the process.

22. The panel members should be fully ‘educated’ when it comes to recruitment and selection.

23. The time is set out in advertising, interviews and commencing of the new appointed person, the panel should really keep to the time limit.

24. To do a reference check on the qualifications of interviewee’s.

25. The panel should be properly trained to understand how to conduct the interview.

26. HR practitioners should lead during interviews to give professional advice to line and production managers.
27. Preparation for the new recruit should be done before the appointment.
28. That the panel sticks to their time schedule; I had to wait very long for my interview (almost ½ hours late).

**Line managers’ and HR managers’ recommendations to improve the recruitment and selection process**

1. I recommend that tests should be done. In this case a written test should have been done.
2. A more supportive Human Resource Management in terms of Policy implementation and advice.
3. Induction is made compulsory for all new recruits.
4. Upon commencement of duty a work plan to be discussed with new recruit.
5. Preference should be given to internal staff in respect of higher-level position when filling.
6. A career succession programme should be made available for example: To identify a group of potential candidates for future higher-level positions and to subject them to an intensive accelerated training programme.
7. More emphasis on qualifications and experience as well as personality.
8. The best qualified must get the job.
9. Training
10. Prevent interference especially if internal applicants.
11. Employment Equity plan pushed forward instead of employee competence.
12. Let the specialists (Human Resource) do their work.
13. Supervisors need training.
14. No major problem if you adhere to the policy.
15. Training of line managers, transformation, representatives and other panel members on the Recruitment policy and procedures as well as why we follow a Competency Based Recruitment process and how it works.
16. We have trained analysts to conduct personal profiles, but still need to train analysts to conduct Psychometric tests. Once we have accredited analysts we are able to conduct potential psychometric tests we will be able to have some processes, which will reduce the margin of error.
17. All panel members need to spend more time preparing for the interview and prepare more thoroughly prior to an ad being placed. We have had instances where we began short-listing and we found that the initial criteria had been omitted.

18. Proper job analysis needs to be done analysis of competencies and responsibilities.

19. Panel members need to be more objective and measured against required competencies rather than the person.

20. Reference checks to be conducted for all positions and must verify performance vs. responsibilities and not only time-keeping. Must be competency based.

21. The Policy should prescribe definite steps and time frames to adhere to. This will ensure consistency and fairness in the process.

22. Training of panel members.

23. Policy should also make the use of Competency Based Recruitment questions, during the interview, compulsory.

24. Management’s buy-in into process. This will include special efforts to be made by Regional Management not to be the cause of delays in the process.