Declaration

I, Wendy Leigh Hartwig, declare that this is my own work and where I have used the ideas or words of others, I have acknowledged this.

Signed: ____________________________  Date: ________________________________
Abstract

The animal welfare legislation that is discussed in this Dissertation is just a sample of the available legislation from the chosen foreign jurisdictions and South Africa. The chosen foreign jurisdictions were chosen as a lens to gain a needed perspective on South African animal welfare legislation. The legislation chosen for discussion falls within particular categories that are discussed fully in the later chapters.\(^1\)

Despite the fact that the animal rights and animal welfare movements are recorded to date back as far as 500B.C, the majority of jurisdictions throughout the world still consider animals to be property that can be bought, traded, hunted and after they are killed, their remains kept as trophies or souvenirs. Within these jurisdictions (which includes South Africa and the other four chosen foreign jurisdictions – Kenya, India, Switzerland and the United States of America) there is a demonstrated lack of proper enforcement of the animal welfare/animal anti-cruelty legislation, regulations and industry rules, which is made worse by the actions of uncaring, abusive and/or ignorant people.

South Africa is no better or worse to the four chosen jurisdictions in that it has similar anti-cruelty/animal welfare legislation. The lack of proper enforcement of this animal welfare legislation in South Africa should be of great concern as many studies have indicated that there is a link between animal abuse/cruelty and ‘human’ abuse. The same studies also indicate that animal abusers are at a greater risk of becoming violent criminals or of committing a violent crime. For example, the Federal Bureau of Investigation has noted that most serial killers in the USA had a history of torturing, abusing and killing animals before they moved on to torturing, abusing and/or killing humans in their adult life.

Needed changes to the animal welfare legislation and how people view animals should be made in South Africa to ensure that welfare of animals is protected. For example, the Government could educate people about animal welfare in order to overcome any ignorance that may be the cause of animal pain and abuse, as well as strengthening existing animal welfare legislation. The eradication of ignorance, as well as a necessary change in the current animal welfare legislation, will help to create a real change in how people view and treat animals.

\(^1\)Chapter 5 and 6.
animals. People will come to realise that animals exist in their own right and that they were not created to serve or to be exploited by man.
Acknowledgements

This thesis would not have been possible without the guidance, support and encouragement from my supervisors, Professor Boyce Wanda and Mr. Jacques Mahler-Coetzee.

Special thanks to my family and friends for their continued support in all that I do.

I would also like to give special thanks to Barbara Opperman for all the help she has given me throughout this process.
List of Abbreviations Used in This Work

AU - African Union
TGT Agreement - Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade
ALDF - Animal Legal Defence Fund
ASEAN - Association of Southeast Asian Nations
BUAV - British Union for the Abolition of Vivisection
COK - Compassion over Killing
CoE - Council of Europe
CETS - Council of Europe Treaty Series
CITES – Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Fauna and Flora
Euratom - European Atomic Energy Community
EC - European Communities
EEC - European Economic Community
EU - European Union
FBI - Federal Bureau of Investigation
FAO - Food and Agricultural Organisation
GATT 1994 - General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
IAEA - International Atomic Energy Agency
ITO - International Trade Organisation
KWS - Wildlife Service
KWSTI - Kenya Wildlife Service Training Institute
NSPCA - National Council of Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals
OAS - Organisation of American States
OAU - Organisation of African Unity
OIC - Organization of the Islamic Conference
OSCE - Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe
PETA - People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals
RSPCA - Royal Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals
SPS Agreement - Sanitary and Phytosanitary Agreement
SPCA - Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals
SPALV - Society for the Protection of Animals Liable to Vivisection
SAARC - South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation
UN - United Nations
UNEP – United Nations Environment Programme
USDA - United States Department of Agriculture
FDA - United States of America Food and Drug Administration
UDAW - Universal Declaration on Animal Welfare
WTO - World Trade Organisation
WWF - World Wildlife Fund
Table of Cases Cited in This Dissertation

South African Cases


*R v Heldberg* 1993 NPD 507.

*R v Moato* 1947 (1) SA 490 (O).

*R v Sibeko* 1951 (2) SA (E).

*S v Edmunds* 1968 (2) PH H398 (N).

*S v Gerwe* 1977 (3) SA 1078 (T).

*S v Nkhumeleni* 1986 (3) SA 102 (V).

*Smit NO and others v King Goodwill Zwelithini Kabhekuzulu and others* (10237/2009) Kwa-Zulu Natal High Court, Pietermaritzburg (Unreported).


Indian Cases

*Nair v Union of India*, Kerala High Court No. 155/1999, June 2000 (Unreported).

United Kingdom Cases

*Ford v Wiley* (1889) 23QB 203.

United States of America Cases


*Loggerhead Turtle v City Council* 896 F Supp 1170 (MD Fla 1995).

*Spotted Owl v Hodel*, 716 F Supp 479 (WD Wash 1988).

*Tree Boa v Witt* 918 F Supp 879 (DVI 1996).
Table of Statutes

South African Statutes


The Animals Protection Act 71 of 1962.


The Nature and Environmental Conservation Ordinance 19 of 1974 (Cape).


The Nature Conservation Ordinance 8 of 1969 (Orange Free State).


The Performing Animals Protection Act 24 of 1935.


Indian Statutes


[viii]
Kenyan Statutes


Swiss Statutes


Swiss Animal Protection Ordinance 1981.


United States of America Statutes

Adoption of Military Working Dogs 10 USC 2582.

Animal Health Protection Act 7 USC 8301 – 8321.


Bald and Golden Eagle Protection Act 16 USC 668 – 668d.

Department of Defence Appropriation Acts.


Disposition of Unfit Horses and Mules 40 USC 311b.

Dog and Cat Protection Act 19 USC 1308.
Endangered Species Act 16 USC 1531-1544.

Federal Law Enforcement Animal Protection Act 18 USC 1368.

Federal Pet Protection Act 7 USC 2158.

Horse Protection Act 15 USC 1821 – 1831.

Humane Slaughter Act 7 USC 1901 – 1906.


Lacy Act Amendments 16 USC 3371 – 3378.

Marine Mammal Protection Act 16 USC 1361 – 1421h.

Pets Evacuation and Transportation Standards Act 42 USC 5170(a) (3) (J), 5196(e) (4), 5196(j) (2), 5196(g).

Public Health Act 42 USC 283e.

Shipping Code 46 USC 3901 – 3902.

Twenty – Eight Hour Law 49 USC 80502.


# Table of Contents

Declaration .......................................................................................................................... Page i
Abstract ............................................................................................................................... Page ii-iii
Acknowledgement ............................................................................................................. Page iv
List of Abbreviations ........................................................................................................ Page v-vi
Table of Cases .................................................................................................................. Page vii
Table of Statutes .............................................................................................................. Page viii-x
Table of Contents ............................................................................................................. Page xi-xvi
Main Thesis ...................................................................................................................... Page 1-169
Bibliography .................................................................................................................... Page 170-178
Annexures ......................................................................................................................... Page 179-185

## Chapter 1 – Introduction .............................................................................................. Page 1-13

1.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................... Page 1
1.2 South Africa ................................................................................................................ Page 5
1.3 Foreign Jurisdiction ..................................................................................................... Page 6
1.4 Objectives of the Study ............................................................................................. Page 7
1.5 Definitions ................................................................................................................... Page 7
1.6 Literature Review ....................................................................................................... Page 9
1.7 Significance of the Study .......................................................................................... Page 11
1.8 Research Question ..................................................................................................... Page 11
1.9 Hypothesis of the Study .......................................................................................... Page 12
1.10 Research Methodology .......................................................................................... Page 12
1.11 Outline of Chapters ............................................................................................... Page 12
Chapter 2 - Brief History of the Animal Rights/Welfare Movement ........ Page 14-27

2.1 3000BC – 1000AD .......................................................... Page 15
2.1.1 The Romans ............................................................... Page 15
2.1.2 India ............................................................................ Page 17
2.2 1000AD – 1500AD ......................................................... Page 18
2.3 1501AD – 1700AD .......................................................... Page 20
2.4 1701AD – 1900AD .......................................................... Page 21
2.5 1901AD – Present Day .................................................... Page 25

Chapter 3 - Discussion of Selected Animal Related Issues ....................... Page 28-45

3.1 Natural vs Legal Rights .................................................. Page 28
3.2 Various ways that animals are used and abused ...................... Page 29
3.2.1 Animals as food .......................................................... Page 30
3.2.2 Animals as clothing .................................................... Page 30
3.2.3 Animals as entertainment ........................................... Page 30
3.2.4 Animals as transport .................................................. Page 30
3.2.5 Animals used in experiments ....................................... Page 31
3.2.6 Animals and religious practices .................................. Page 31
3.2.7 Companion Animals .................................................. Page 32
3.2.8 Hunting and Animals .................................................. Page 32
3.2.9 Trading in Animals ..................................................... Page 32
3.3 Animal Welfare vs Animal Rights ..................................... Page 33
3.3.1 Animal Welfare Movement ......................................... Page 33
3.3.2 Animal Rights Lobby .................................................. Page 34
3.4 Animal Rights Approaches ............................................. Page 39
3.4.1 Peter Singer ............................................................... Page 39
3.4.2 Tom Regan .......................................................... Page 40
3.4.3 Steven Wise ....................................................... Page 41
3.4.4 Gary Francione .................................................. Page 42
3.4.5 Bernard Rollin .................................................... Page 43
3.5 Why not give rights to the environment and not just animals? ........ Page 44

Chapter 4 – International and Regional Law .......................................... Page 46-67

4.1 International Treaties .................................................... Page 48
4.1.1 Universal Declaration on Animal Welfare ......................... Page 48
4.1.2 The Convention on Biological Diversity of 1992 ............... Page 50
4.1.3 The Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Fauna and Flora ................................................................. Page 51
4.2 The United Nations ..................................................... Page 52
4.2.1 The Food and Agricultural Organisation (FAO) ............... Page 53
4.2.2 The International Atomic Energy Agency (IAEA) .............. Page 54
4.2.3 The World Trade Organisation (WTO) ......................... Page 55
4.3 United Nations Environment Programme ............................. Page 56
4.4 Regional Agreements ............................................... Page 57
4.4.1 The Americas ...................................................... Page 57
4.4.1.1 The Organisation of American States ....................... Page 57
4.4.2 Africa ................................................................ Page 58
4.4.2.1 African Union .................................................. Page 59
4.4.3 Europe ................................................................ Page 61
4.4.3.1 The European Union ......................................... Page 61
4.4.3.2 The Council of Europe ........................................ Page 63
4.4.4 Asia and Pacific Regions ........................................... Page 66

[xiii]
4.4.4.1 The Association of Southeast Asian Nations .......................... Page 67

Chapter 5 – Legal Protection of Animals in Four Foreign Jurisdictions  Page 68-112

5.1 United States of America ......................................................... Page 69

5.1.1 The Animal Welfare Act of 2007 ........................................ Page 71

5.1.2 The Humane Methods of Slaughter Act of 1978 .................... Page 72

5.1.3 Twenty –Eight Hour Law of 1994 ....................................... Page 74

5.1.4 Other Major Federal Statutes .............................................. Page 75

5.1.5 A Note on State Laws ....................................................... Page 76

5.2 India ..................................................................................... Page 78

5.2.1 The Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act of 1960 ............... Page 79

5.2.2 The Wild Life (Protection) Act of 1972 and the Wild Life (Protection) Amendment Act of 2002 ......................................................... Page 83

5.2.3 Rules .................................................................................. Page 84

5.3 Switzerland ........................................................................... Page 87

5.3.1 The Swiss Federal Act on Animal Protection of 1978 .......... Page 88

5.3.2 The Swiss Animal Protection Ordinance of 1981 ................ Page 91

5.4 Kenya ................................................................................... Page 98

5.4.1 The Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act of 1962 ............... Page 98

5.4.2 Draft Wildlife Policy of 2007 ............................................. Page 101

5.4.3 Other Current Animal Welfare Legislation ....................... Page 108

Chapter 6 – South Africa ............................................................... Page 113-146

6.1 South African Government Departments Responsible For Animal Welfare ........................................................................................................... Page 113

6.1.1 The Department of Agriculture ......................................... Page 114

6.1.2 The Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism ....... Page 116
6.2 Laws Regulating Animal Welfare ............................................ Page 117

6.2.1 The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa ................. Page 117

6.2.2 The Animal Protection Act 71 of 1962 .................................... Page 118

6.2.3 Performing Animals Protection Act of 1935 ......................... Page 123

6.2.4 The Societies for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act of 1993
........................................................................................................ Page 124

6.2.4.1 The National Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals (NSPCA)
........................................................................................................ Page 128

6.3 Other Animal Welfare Legislation ........................................ Page 129

6.4 Provincial Legislation ............................................................. Page 132

6.5 Industry Codes/Rules .............................................................. Page 138

6.6 The Care and Use of Animals for Scientific Purposes .............. Page 142

6.7 Animal Related By-Laws ....................................................... Page 143

Chapter 7 – Proposals for Future Development in South Africa ....... Page 147-163

7.1 Legislative Suggestions .......................................................... Page 147

7.1.1 Legislation concerning domestic and wild animals .............. Page 147

7.1.2 Legislation concerning scientific research ............................ Page 154

7.1.3 Legislation concerning farm animals .................................... Page 155

7.2 Education Suggestions .......................................................... Page 157

7.3 Suggestions for Current Lifestyle Practices ............................ Page 160

7.4 Role of the Media ................................................................. Page 161

Chapter 8 – Conclusion ............................................................... Page 164-168

Bibliography ............................................................................. Page 169-178

Annexure A – An Act against Plowing by the Tayle, and pulling the Wooll off living Sheep
........................................................................................................ Page 179

Annexure B – Massachusetts Body of Liberties of 1641 ................. Page 181
Annexure C – Extracts from The Speech by Lord Erskine ... on the Bill for Preventing Malicious and Wanton Cruelty to Animals (1809) .................................. Page 182

Annexure D – An Act to Prevent the Cruel and Improper Treatment of Cattle. 22nd July, 1822 ............................................................ Page 183