COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN URBAN REVITALIZATION IN BUFFALO CITY

BY

TANDISWA MAGWALA

DISSERTATION SUBMITTED IN FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF

MASTER OF ARTS (DEVELOPMENT STUDIES)

IN THE

FACULTY OF BUSINESS AND ECONOMIC SCIENCES

AT THE

NELSON MANDELA UNIVERSITY

SUPERVISOR: ELIZABETH SAUNDERS

2018
NELS N M NDELA
UNIVERSITY

PERMISSION TO SUBMIT FINAL COPIES
OF TREATISE/DISSERTATION/THESIS TO THE EXAMINATION OFFICE

Please type or complete in black ink

FACULTY: Business and Economic Sciences

SCHOOL/DEPARTMENT: Development Studies

I, (surname and initials of supervisor) Saunders, E

and (surname and initials of co-supervisor) ________________________________

the supervisor and co-supervisor respectively for (surname and initials of

candidate) McNeil, T

(student number) 203 347 181 a candidate for the (full description of qualification)

MA Development Studies (Coursework)


Community Participation in Urban Revitalization in Buffalo City

It is hereby certified that the proposed amendments to the treatise/dissertation/thesis have been

effected and that permission is granted to the candidate to submit the final bound copies of

his/her treatise/dissertation/thesis to the examination office.

__________________________________________  ________________________________
Supervisor                                       Date

And

__________________________________________  ________________________________
Co-Supervisor                                   Date
DECLARATION

I, Tandiswa Magwala, hereby declare that:

• the work in this dissertation is my own original work;

• all sources used or referenced have been documented and recognised; and

• the dissertation has not been previously submitted in full or partial fulfilment of the requirements for an equivalent or higher qualification at any other recognised education institution.

November 2017
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS:

I would like to thank the Lord Almighty for his divine guidance during my study.

I wish to express my gratitude to my supervisor Mrs Elizabeth Saunders (NMU) for her guidance, and patience in dealing with me. Thank you for your support and in the development of my proposal and dissertation.

I would also like to thank Mrs Judith Dye for editing my dissertation.

I wish to extend my sincere gratitude and appreciation to: the Dimbaza residents for availing themselves to my study and for going out of their way to assist me and share their experiences during the interviews; the management and staff of Eastern Cape Development Cooperation, Buffalo City Municipality Metropolitan and Department of Economic Affairs and Tourism in the provincial office in King William’s Town.

Lastly, I would like to thank my mother and father for their constant support during my study. To my son, Dumisani and daughter Xolelwa for being such an inspiration to me.
DEDICATION

This dissertation is dedicated to my parents (Mr Mthimkhulu Mgijima and Mrs Zowie Mgijima). All my blessings and achievements are through the sacrifices that they have made for me as a single parent. Without your love and guidance, I would not have accomplished this.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Community participation relates to the process by which community members are involved in the projects that determine pertains to their development needs. It is a means of empowering people by developing their skills and abilities to enable them to negotiate and make appropriate decisions for their development. However, community participation faces many challenges in South Africa and some other countries. For instance, in most, if not all, development projects commenced by local municipalities, community participation is often neglected or becomes an afterthought.

In most cases, the communities are consulted after decisions have already been made by government agencies in relation to the kind of development projects that need to be executed. As a result, community participation is a prerequisite in development projects which are meant to improve the livelihoods and standard of living of the majority of communities in South Africa.

The Buffalo City Municipality Metro (BCMM) is not an exception to this. The BCMM is located in the Eastern Cape Province, which is one of the poorest provinces in South Africa. In one of the towns in the municipal area, namely Dimbaza in the former Ciskei ‘homeland’, where there are high levels of unemployment and poverty, a prominent feature in the landscape is the many abandoned factory buildings. In recent years, the BCMM has recognized the need to revitalize the nodal areas such as Mdantsane, Dimbaza and Bisho, but due to the fragmented patterns of Bantustan policies the program was negatively affected (BCMM 2014/15/141). As a consequence, the BCMM has supported the implement an urban revitalization project within its area.

The aim of this study was to investigate and interrogate whether local communities are involved in urban revitalization in the BCMM. That is, to evaluate community participation in urban revitalization projects in the BCMM, and focusing on Dimbaza community in the Eastern Cape province of South Africa as a case study. The study asks the following questions:

Do the BCMM’s urban redevelopment initiatives have community participation component?

How can the community be more involved in neighbourhood revitalization?
To what extent do these perceptions and priorities of the people living in
neighbourhood of the disused factories match those of the policy makers?

What are the perceptions of the people living in the neighbourhood of the disused
factories in Dimbaza with regard to redevelopment?

What recommendations can emanate from the study to address the current challenges
regarding community participation in urban revitalization in BCMM?

The study revealed that the majority of the respondents did not participate in the
initiation and planning stages of the urban revitalization projects. The study further
showed that a considerable proportion of the surveyed Dimbaza residents did not
know about the urban revitalization programme, but learnt about it only in the local
newspaper.

It is therefore recommended that, the BCMM should support the community at all
levels of planning to ensure a strong commitment to participation in their urban
revitalization or development projects.

It is hoped that this study will sensitize the community members of Dimbaza and the
roles players involved in the Dimbaza urban revitalization projects including, among
others, the Buffalo City Municipality Metropolitan, the Eastern Cape Development
Cooperation and the Department of Economic Development, Environmental Affairs
and Tourism of the Eastern Cape, to realise the significance and advantages of
community participation, and that they will work through the challenges therein in order
to increase community participation in development projects.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION .......................................................................................................................... i

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ........................................................................................................ ii

DEDICATION ........................................................................................................................... iii

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY ........................................................................................................ iv

LIST OF ANNEXURES ........................................................................................................... xi

LIST OF FIGURES ................................................................................................................ xii

LIST OF TABLES .................................................................................................................. xii

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION AND CONTEXT OF THE STUDY

1.1 INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY .............................................. 1

1.2 COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN URBAN REVITALIZATION ................................. 1

1.3 URBAN REVITALIZATION IN DEVELOPED COUNTRIES ..................................... 2

1.4 URBAN REVITALIZATION IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES .................................... 2

1.5 COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN URBAN REVITALIZATION IN SOUTH AFRICA ................................................................................................................. 3

1.6 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN URBAN PLANNING IN BCMM ................................. 3

1.7 PROBLEM STATEMENT ................................................................................................. 4

1.8 RESEARCH AIMS AND OBJECTIVES ........................................................................ 4

1.8.1 Overall Aim of the Study ......................................................................................... 5

1.8.2 Objectives of the Study ............................................................................................ 5

1.9 KEY QUESTIONS PERTAINING TO THE RESEARCH .............................................. 5

1.10 SCOPE AND DELIMITATION OF THE STUDY ....................................................... 6

1.11 RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY ......................................................... 6

1.12 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS ..................................................................................... 6
CHAPTER 2
LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 INTRODUCTION .......................................................... 9

2.2 DEFINITION OF TERMS .................................................. 9
2.2.1 Community participation .............................................. 9
2.2.2 Public participation .................................................... 10
2.2.3 Urban revitalisation ................................................... 10

2.3 COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN URBAN REVITALISATION .......... 10

2.4 OVERVIEW OF URBAN REVITALISATION IN DEVELOPED AND DEVELOPING COUNTRIES .............................................. 11
2.4.1 Urban revitalisation in developed countries .......................... 11
2.4.2 Urban revitalisation in developing countries ......................... 13

2.5 THEORETICAL AND POLICY FRAMEWORK OF URBAN REVITALISATION .......................................................... 14
2.5.1 Theoretical framework .................................................. 14
2.5.2 Policy framework ....................................................... 15
2.5.3 White Paper on Local Government .................................. 15
2.5.4 DEVELOPMENT FACILITATION ACT ............................... 16
2.5.5 Municipal Systems Act ............................................... 16
2.5.6 Integrated Development Planning .................................... 16

2.6 COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN SOUTH AFRICA .................... 17

2.7 OVERVIEW OF PLANNING PROCESSES OF URBAN REVITALISATION IN BCMM AND ECDC ................................. 18

2.8 COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION AND URBAN REVITALISATION IN BCMM 19
CHAPTER 3
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 INTRODUCTION .................................................................................................................. 22

3.2 RESEARCH METHODOLOGIES ......................................................................................... 22
  3.2.1 Alternative research methodologies .............................................................................. 22
  3.2.2 Qualitative research ........................................................................................................ 23
  3.2.3 Strengths and weaknesses of qualitative research ......................................................... 23
    3.2.3.1 Strengths .................................................................................................................. 24
    3.2.3.2 Weaknesses ............................................................................................................ 24
    3.2.3.3 Mitigation to minimise negative aspects of questionnaire surveys ....................... 24

3.3 RESEARCH PARADIGM ....................................................................................................... 25

3.4 RESEARCH TECHNIQUES .................................................................................................. 25
  3.4.1 Questionnaire administration ....................................................................................... 26
  3.4.2 Advantages and disadvantages of questionnaire surveys ......................................... 26
    3.4.2.1 Advantages ............................................................................................................. 27
    3.4.2.2 Disadvantages ........................................................................................................ 27
    3.4.2.3 Mitigation to minimise negative aspects of questionnaire surveys ....................... 27

3.5 DATA ADMINISTRATION ..................................................................................................... 27

3.6 DATA COLLECTION ............................................................................................................. 28

3.7 SAMPLING ............................................................................................................................ 28

3.8 LIMITATIONS TO THE STUDY ............................................................................................ 29
CHAPTER 4

FINDINGS

4.1 INTRODUCTION ................................................................................................. 31
4.2 A PROPOSAL TO REVITILISE THE INDUSTRIAL AREA IN DIMBAZA ........ 31
4.3 THE BCMM’S POLICY ON COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN PLANNING. 33
4.4 THE ECDC POLICY ON COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION ON THE PROPOSED URBAN REVITALIZATION ................................................................. 35
4.5 COMMUNITY RESPONSES ON PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON PROPOSED URBAN REVITALIZATION IN DIMBAZA ........................................ 37
   4.5.1 Profile of respondents .................................................................................... 38
   4.5.2 Profile of Dimbaza respondents ..................................................................... 38
   4.5.3 Residents’ experience with public participation in Municipal Planning 38
      4.5.3.1 Responses of participation in IDP meetings ............................................. 38
      4.5.3.2 Participation in meetings on the urban revitalization of the Dimbaza Project ............................................................. 39
      4.5.3.3 Means of communication about planning, including urban revitalization meetings ......................................................... 39
      4.5.3.4 Extent of community satisfaction with BCMM with respect to their participation regarding urban revitalization .............. 40
      4.5.3.5 Views from the community respondents on the preferred future of the Dimbaza industrial area ....................................... 40
4.6 CONCLUSION ....................................................................................................... 41
CHAPTER 5
CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 OVERVIEW ....................................................................................................................... 42

5.2 SUMMARY OF THE KEY FINDINGS WITH REGARD TO COMMUNITY
PARTICIPATION IN THE BCMM............................................................................................. 44

5.3 RECOMMENDATIONS REGARDING COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN
URBAN REVITALIZATION IN THE DIMBAZA PROJECT.................................................. 46

5.4 CONCLUSION...................................................................................................................... 51

REFERENCE LIST ..................................................................................................................... 52
LIST OF ANNEXURES

APPENDIX A: INTERVIEW CONSENT FORM ............................................................ 57
APPENDIX B: INTERVIEW QUESTIONS ................................................................. 59
APPENDIX C: ETHICS CLEARANCE ................................................................. 61
APPENDIX D: PHOTOGRAPHS ................................................................. 63
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1: Xxxxxxxxxx ........................................................................................................... 4

Figure 4.1: One of the derelict factory buildings in Dimbaza ............................................. 33

LIST OF TABLES

Table 4.1: Profile of Dimbaza respondents ........................................................................ 38
CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION AND CONTEXT OF THE STUDY

1.1 INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY

After the new South African democratic government took office in 1994, most of the factories in the homelands, such as the Ciskei, were closed down. These factories were owned by industrialists that had been attracted to these sites by generous government subsidies and cheap labour and when these subsidies were phased out, had to be closed down.

The resettlement town of Dimbaza, located 75 km from the industrial port city of East London (now part of the Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality) in the Eastern Cape was severely impacted by the closure of many of the factories. The Dimbaza industrial estate remained underutilized for over twenty years, until plans for its revitalization were announced in 2016.

The study will be focused, in the wider context, on community participation in general, and, more specifically, the urban revitalization of underutilized industrial premises in Dimbaza. The aim is to reverse urban decay and to create employment opportunities, both in South Africa and further afield. For example, creation of jobs in Dimbaza may create job opportunities in the Eastern Cape. Looking at employment trends in South Africa (S.A) specific in the Eastern Cape (E/C) it is stated that; males employed 75% are in the private sector and 18% in the public sector, while 57% of the females are employed in the private sector with 26% employed in the public sector (BCMM IDP Review 2015/16/17/18).

The main focus of this study is on the extent to which the main role players in this revitalization, namely the Buffalo City Metro (BCMM) and the project implementing agent, the Eastern Cape Development Agency (ECDC) have communicated with and consulted the affected communities about these revitalization plans.

1.2 COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN URBAN REVITALIZATION

Community participation is a practice where the general populace is involved in the development projects within its community (Mohanty, 1993:332). The Municipal
Systems Act (2002) also enshrines the notion of involvement of local communities in urban renewal projects. This means that local government activities, including urban revitalization, should directly involve the local population. In particular, section 152 (1) (b) of the Constitution provides for the objects of the local government which includes, inter alia, ensuring the provision of sustainable and effective services to communities.

Section 153 of the Constitution (Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996) endows the municipalities with developmental duties. In addition, all municipalities in South Africa, including the Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality (BCMM), are expected to involve their respective communities in urban renewal projects. Therefore, it is noteworthy that community participation in urban development projects is a constitutional mandate in South Africa. In addition to the constitutional provisions, there are other legislative provisions that have embraced this notion.

### 1.3 URBAN REVITALIZATION IN DEVELOPED COUNTRIES

In the United Kingdom, urban revitalization is widely known as urban regeneration (Roberts and Sykes, 2000) and it is implemented under the British urban regeneration policy which emphasizes the role of the local communities in urban renewal projects (McCarthy, 2007). For a very long time, the United Kingdom has had an array of policy initiatives aimed at increasing community involvement in urban regeneration in place.

In Germany, urban revitalization is commonly referred to as urban renewal or redevelopment. Public or community participation is inseparable from urban renewal processes in Germany (Friesecke, 2011: 2).

### 1.4 URBAN REVITALIZATION IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES

Urban revitalization is a concept aimed at improving the economic, physical, social and environmental state of area that has been subject to change (Tallon, 2013:5). It is referred to by different names such as urban renewal, redevelopment or renaissance in many countries (Couch, 1990).

In Tanzania, it is known as urbanization or urban renewal and refers to projects or strategies to alleviate neighbourhoods and add value to areas by helping in the reinvestment of these regions, and by also concentrating on innovative improvement
where it is most suitable. Some of the successful projects of urban renewal are in the areas within and around major cities in Tanzania, particularly in Dar es Salaam.

1.5 COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN URBAN REVITALIZATION IN SOUTH AFRICA

In South Africa, public participation is implemented within the auspices of the National Urban Renewal Program (UPR, 2001) which focuses on eight urban nodes of poverty and is aimed at focusing the resources of government in an integrated manner towards breaking the circle of underdevelopment in urban areas (South Africa, National Urban Renewal Program: Implementation Framework 2001).

In addition, this policy framework is to promote a consistent urban development policy approach for effective urban reconstruction and development, to guide development policies, strategies and actions of all stakeholders in the urban development process and to steer them towards the achievement of a collective vision.

1.6 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN URBAN PLANNING IN BCMM

The BCMM has recognised that there is a need to revitalize the urban areas which include Dimbaza, Mdantsane and King Williams Town (BCMM Spatial Development Framework, 2002). In 2016, the BCMM announced that there would be a project on urban revitalization of the Dimbaza industrial area, with their responsibility focusing on infrastructure issues (Daily Dispatch, 29 August 2016). The facilitation of the economic growth and identification of the main drivers of development is one of the major roles of ECDC (DAIP, February 2016). The ECDC would ensure that the Master Plan was developed to include the previously marginalised sections of the populations to take part in the mainstream economy.
1.7 PROBLEM STATEMENT

The BCMM is located in the Eastern Cape Province which is listed among the poorest provinces of South Africa and which is also characterised by a high rate of unemployment and poverty. This purpose of the study seeks to investigate and question whether communities are involved in urban revitalization in the BCMM as was stated very clearly in the White Paper on Local Government. It is therefore important to investigate whether the BCMM includes community participation, especially in the initiative project, on revitalization of the abandoned factories in Dimbaza near King Williams Town.

Since 2000 the BCMM made no attempt to revitalise the industrial area in Dimbaza and the fact is that, the majority of people are living in poverty, the majority of the people are living in poverty and are unemployed. The abandoned factories should be reused and replaced, and those that have badly deteriorated in value should be demolished. In recent years, the BCMM has recognized the need to revitalize its urban areas (BCMM Spatial Development Framework, 2002).

1.8 RESEARCH AIMS AND OBJECTIVES

The Research Problem is the most crucial section of the study, and it needs to be clear and indicate on what and to what end the study is focusing. The inclusion of communities might increase the efficiency and effectiveness of development activities
and possibly lower the costs of urban revitalization projects. In order to meet the specific aims, the objectives of the study must be explained.

1.8.1 Overall Aim of the Study

The overall aim of this study is to assess the extent to which the Dimbaza Community were included in the urban revitalization of the Dimbaza Industrial Project which was announced in the Daily Dispatch on the 29 August 2016.

1.8.2 Objectives of the Study

- To investigate urban revitalization in the BCMM and ECDC with a view of determining the inclusion of the local community.
- To explore and determine urban revitalization strategies in South Africa and other countries to draw some lessons for the BCMM.
- To examine the effective implementation of the BCMM Spatial Development Framework (SDF) regarding public participation in urban revitalization projects.
- To access the extent to which local communities take “ownership” and pride in urban revitalization in their areas.
- To investigate and assess development planning in general and urban revitalization in particular in the BCMM with the view of determining its inclusion of local communities in the planning processes.
- To explore urban revitalization strategies in other provinces or countries in order to draw some lessons for BCMM.

1.9 KEY QUESTIONS PERTAINING TO THE RESEARCH

The study is designed to understand community participation in urban revitalization in the Buffalo City Municipality (BCMM). Research problems implicitly or explicitly embody research questions.

Some of the research questions this study seeks to address include the following:

- What are the urban redevelopment strategies being employed by BCMM?
- What are the tools used by the BCMM in its urban redevelopment processes?
• Do the BCMM’s urban redevelopment initiatives have community participation components?
• How can the community be more involved in neighbourhood revitalization?
• What are the perceptions of the people living in the neighborhood of the disused factories in Dimbaza with regard to redevelopment?
• To what extent do these perceptions and priorities of the people living in the neighborhood of the disused factories match those of the policy makers?
• What recommendations can emanate from the study to address the current challenges regarding community participation in urban revitalization in BCMM?

1.10 SCOPE AND DELIMITATION OF THE STUDY

The purpose of the study is to make it more controllable and manageable, and therefore it is crucial to ensure that demarcation of research is manageable. The scope of the research is limited to the proposed revitalization of the long-abandoned and under-utilized factory buildings in Dimbaza, which is supported by information on the roles of the BCMM and ECDC in this initiative, and interviews with a sample of Dimbaza residents to gauge their perceptions on public participation in planning.

1.11 RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

Research methodology focuses on the research process, research design and the kinds of tools and procedures to be used, and it also focuses on individual steps to be employed (Mouton, 2001:56). The specific method for this research will be based on the qualitative method, and will later include mixed methods due to the fact that at a certain stage the researcher will investigate more about the various assumptions and forms of data analysis (Creswell, 2003).

1.12 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

The information that will be shared by participants will remain anonymous as they have a right to privacy. According to Fick’s (2006) ethical theory confidentiality of the research participants will be protected at all times during research process.
1.13 OUTLINE OF THE CHAPTERS

The study will be divided into five Chapters:

Chapter one covers the introduction and background of the study, problem statement, research aim and objectives, research design and methodology, location of the study and how it will be linked provincially and nationally, delimitation of the scope, and an outline of the research study.

Chapter two focuses on the literature review. It will cover the various community participation strategies for effective community participation in urban revitalization, relevant terminology and theoretical framework. The supporting literature includes government documents and policies and comparative studies of the same problem to complement discussions. This includes case studies on urban renewal projects, urban regeneration or revitalization from other countries.

Chapter three covers research methods used in the study, wherein the qualitative and quantitative research methods are employed, and why and how research paradigm is embedded. The population and sampling procedures are also covered in this chapter where the relevant stakeholders such as local communities and government officials are the sample of the study.

Chapter four presents a discussion of the data design, data collection and analysis and discussions. Data analysis for the closed and open-ended questions to be carried out and tabulated on community participation in urban revitalization; the comparison of various data and analysis in categories are presented. Relevant stakeholders will be asked to participate by responding to the structured questionnaires. After the questionnaires have been administered, the results will be analyzed Data will be assessed by direct observations, document analysis and case study.

Chapter five summarizes the overview of the research process, a summary of the findings, and conclusions and recommendations emanating from the study are made. Concluding remarks and recommendations are included to close the gaps identified in the BCMM; and new strategies regarding the role of community participation.
1.14 CONCLUSION

This chapter served as an introduction with the background explained and included the status quo about community participation in urban development programmes in the BCMM which are aimed at transforming the physical, social, economic and environmental conditions of nodal areas within the BCMM in the Eastern Cape economy (IDP 2014/15:108). The scope and delimitation of the study, problem statement, aims and objectives and the key questions are clearly defined as they are also crucial to explain and guide the research process. Research methodology and further deliberations on critical matters of the topic were discussed followed by the research outline. The next chapter is the literature review which focuses on definitions, urban revitalization in developed and developing countries, and the South African legislative framework public participation in planning in the BCMM.
CHAPTER 2
LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 INTRODUCTION

The present chapter provides a comprehensive literature review regarding community participation in urban revitalisation and effective implementation of government policies at local level. The chapter covers the analysis of previous studies related to community participation and relevant supporting literature to complement discussions.

In post-apartheid South Africa, the democratic government sought to incorporate previously excluded groups or communities not only in the decision-making processes but also in the development activities (David, 2005:18). One of the ways in which this was done was to involve local or poor communities in planning, including in urban revitalisation projects. For example, if communities are not involved in urban development projects, they (the communities) may find themselves in the risky situation where the available resources may be misused.

2.2 DEFINITION OF TERMS

The key terms below are defined to ensure clarity and common comprehension:

2.2.1 Community participation

The definition of what constitutes community participation differs among development scholars and practitioners. However, the generic definition of community participation alludes to “an active process by which beneficiary/client groups influence the direction and execution of a development project with a view to enhancing their well-being in terms of income, personal growth, self-reliance or other values they cherish” (Paul, 1987:2). In addition, community participation relates to a practice where the general populace is involved in the development projects within its community (Mohanty, 1993:332). Community participation in South Africa is discussed later in the chapter.
2.2.2 Public participation

Generally speaking, public participation is the involvement of the civil society in dealing with cooperative issues such as political processes for public contribution. The World Bank (1996 cited in Buccus, 2007: 6) defines public participation as “a process in which stakeholders’ influence and share control over development initiatives and the decisions and the resources which affect them”.

2.2.3 Urban revitalisation

Urban revitalisation is the process whereby an area is restored or renovated (Roberts and Sykes, 2000). In other countries, urban revitalisation is widely known as urban regeneration (Roberts and Sykes, 2000) and is implemented under the British urban regeneration policy which emphasizes the role of the local communities in urban renewal projects.

Urban regeneration is being viewed as a process of restoring the area especially the old buildings and replacing them with the new ones (McCarthy, 2007). In Germany, urban revitalisation is commonly referred to as urban renewal which relates to the rejuvenation of old buildings (Friesecke, 2011). In South Africa, urban revitalisation is known as urban renewal, a programme aimed at combating unemployment and crime and improving the quality of life for township residents (South African Urban Renewal Programme, 2001). Urban revitalisation in South Africa will be discussed below.

2.3 Community participation in urban revitalisation

Arstein (2009) believes that there are generally eight levels of community participation in urban revitalisation including manipulation, therapy, informing, consultation, placation, partnership, delegated power and citizen control. Lwasa and Nyakaana (2005), in their analysis in Uganda, observed that communities were involved directly in the redevelopment process only in the consultation stage.

According to Masango (2002:60) this includes “cultivating a culture of participation, public education, organizing for participation, capacity building for participation, reforming attitudes towards participation, utilizing appropriate methods of participation and publicizing local government affairs”. Cultivating the culture of public participation
involves enacting an enabling legislation to ensure that ordinary people participate in policy making (Almond and Verba, 1989:3).

Civic participation also embraces information sharing, consultation and decision making, among other things, of the beneficiaries. The aspect of consultation is entrenched in section 15 (1) (a) of the Local Government: Municipal Planning and Performance Management Regulations which calls for “consultations with locally recognized community organizations, and where appropriate with traditional authorities”.

The concept of civic participation in urban development resonates with the White Paper on Local Government’s (1998) developmental local government notion which entails that the local government is “committed to working with citizens and groups within the community to find sustainable ways to meet their social, economic and material needs and improve the quality of their lives”. Notably, central to the developmental local government is the requirement for community participation in municipal processes.

Urban revitalisation can be understood from the competitive city theory. In this sense, urban revitalisation is perceived to revive urban decline, creating an environment that better enhances a city’s investment prospects and enables it to compete more effectively for investment (Ngwabi, 2009). Urban revitalisation therefore, has positive effects on a city’s local economy and harnesses its competitive advantage over others. The competitive cities’ theory can therefore be linked to the emergence of neoliberal approaches which dictated principles of managing the post-industrial city. It can also be framing ideas about urban regeneration and urban planning in which case these two are means to achieve competitiveness (Harrison, 2002).

2.4 OVERVIEW OF URBAN REVITALISATION IN DEVELOPED AND DEVELOPING COUNTRIES

2.4.1 Urban revitalisation in developed countries

The concept of urban revitalisation is not something new within the development discourse in general. That is, the concept has always been part of the development
discourse in developed countries such as the United Kingdom (UK), the United States of America (USA) and Hungary, among others.

As mentioned earlier, urban revitalisation in the UK is implemented under the British urban regeneration policy which emphasizes the role of the local communities in urban renewal projects (McCarthy, 2007). In the 1980s, the UK introduced an array of policy initiatives aimed at increasing community involvement in urban regeneration in the 1980s. The countries like Britain succeeded in implementing urban renewal projects because the communities were actively involved in planning, decision-making processes and implementation of the governmental programmes (Anstein, 1969). The urban landscape and buildings of the early industrialisation brought great assets to British cities over a century ago, but also created new social problems which became the subjects for renewal or regeneration in later years (Anstein, 1969).

Urban revitalisation in the USA is understood as cities that have been shaped through: instrumentalism, contestation and compromise, and explicit and inadvertent strategic action. In the USA, urban revitalisation entails strategies in which people are both the means and ends, or are pure people-oriented strategies aimed at renewing, developing or improving local neighbourhoods (Sutton, 2008).

In the third-quarter of the twentieth century, when manufacturing firms and employment migrated to overseas, “industrial cities of the USA encountered a decline in the middle-class population and an increase in low-income and poor residents, which decreased the city’s tax base at the same time it placed an unprecedented burden on municipal services” (Sutton, 2008: 3). Consequently, municipalities were compelled to innovate spatial and social strategies to revitalize neighbourhoods and stimulate urban growth and development (Sutton, 2008:3). The process involved demolishing and renovating deteriorating buildings.

Similarly, in Hungary the urban revitalisation or restructuring process provides that local communities, among other stakeholders: have the right to become involved in the planning process; they must be informed according to local custom about the proposed project; they have the right to put forth statements and proposals (Enyedi, 2004: 16). The urban renewal programme was adopted in Hungary with the aim of revitalising the deteriorating cities.
2.4.2 Urban revitalisation in developing countries

The idea of urban revitalisation is not new in developing countries either. For example, in Hong Kong urban revitalisation is well known as urbanization or urban renewal. It refers to projects or strategies to alleviate neighbourhoods and add value to areas by helping in the investment of these regions and by also concentrating on innovative improvement where it is most suitable.

Other notable urban revitalisation projects in Hong Kong happen by way of restoration, preservation and rejuvenation of old historical buildings of the city (Rosly and Rashid, 2013: 8). This project is argued to have given a new lease of life to an area which has since become a major tourist attraction. This study focuses not on urban revitalisation itself but on the role of community participation in planning urban change and revitalisation.

Some of the successful projects of urban renewal are in the areas within and around major cities in Tanzania, particularly in Dar es Salaam. Legal reforms on the issue of land as well as housing have taken place in the country since the 1990s and the variations in efficiency and parity of procedures whereby poor urban dwellers are able to access housing as well as land within the city of Dar es Salaam. This urbanisation has resulted in unintended consequences. That is, poorly remunerated people have been able to access housing within the city where there is a scarcity of land coupled with a rising demand for housing and where urban poverty is prevalent. This has led to the development of sub-standard houses, with poor living conditions and health hazards. To alleviate this, the government of Tanzania embarked on urban renewal programmes (Kiwara, 2016: 26-27).

In South Africa, as noted earlier, urban revitalisation is implemented through the Urban Renewal Programme which involves revitalisation of strategic urban localities through the refurbishing of infrastructure, local economic development projects and social integration. The Urban Renewal Programme focuses on eight urban townships, the so-called “urban nodes”. The characteristic features of the selected urban renewal nodes are: Apartheid townships, poverty and high crime; formal engineering infrastructure installed but decayed and in need of rehabilitation/upgrading; majority of formal housing stock but also an informal housing component; need for substantial
improvements in maintenance and operating; low in internal economic opportunities; low education and skills levels of resident population; and poorly connected to surrounding neighbourhoods (Kusel, 2009). Typical projects undertaken through this Urban Renewal Programme include schools’ refurbishment, roads construction, backyard rental accommodation, skills and development centres for local communities.

2.5 THEORETICAL AND POLICY FRAMEWORK OF URBAN REVITALISATION

2.5.1 Theoretical framework

There are many theories that been considered when discussing urban revitalisation. These theories include the competitive cities theory and new managerialism; world cities theory; new urbanism and compact cities; elite theory; regime theory; pluralism; growth machine (elite and regime theories in application); classical and contemporary theories on crime; and the modern portfolio theory (Harrison, 2002; Todes, 2000). This study covers new urbanism and compact cities and the competitive cities theory because they are relevant to South African urban revitalisation.

Urban regeneration is inspired by ideas associated with the new urbanism theory (Grant, 2006; Harrison, 2002). New urbanism relates to the modern approach to physical planning concerned with creating vibrant and compact spaces for community life. It involves new ways of thinking and planning about urban form and development. New urbanism affirms the appeal of compact, mixed-use, walk able and relatively self-contained communities, instead of car oriented development (Grant, 2006).

In South Africa, the New Urbanism development has been reflected as part of the policies and planning discourse that seek to integrate development spatially and sectorally through mechanisms such as integrated development planning (Ngwabi, 2009). While the South African version of new urbanism draws from the works “it developed in a context where a primary concern was with knitting together fragmented and dysfunctional cityscape produced under apartheid” (Harrison, 2002: 8). The ensuing section discusses South Africa’s urban revitalisation policies, focusing
particularly on the urban renewal programme and the role of community participation in urban revitalisation.

2.5.2 Policy framework

In South Africa, the concept of community participation in urban regeneration is implemented within the auspices of the National Urban Renewal Program (UPR), 2001 which focuses on eight urban nodes of poverty and is aimed at focusing the resources of government in an integrated manner towards breaking the circle of underdevelopment in urban areas (South Africa, National Urban Renewal Program: Implementation Framework 2001). With the launch of these programmes, it was the intention of government to “conduct a sustained campaign against rural and urban poverty and underdevelopment, bringing in the resources of all three spheres of government in a coordinated manner” (State of the Nation Address, 2001). The urban renewal projects in South Africa were dominated by challenges due to the lack of the following: lack of clear objectives linked to the short and the long term; lack of commitment from the community and poor communication processes (Thual, 2008).

2.5.3 White Paper on Local Government

The White Paper on Local Government requires municipalities to promote and dynamically encourage and involve local communities in municipal activities including development projects. It urges local governments to devise mechanisms to ensure community participation, including, inter alia: forums to influence policy formulation both from within and outside local government; structured stakeholder involvement in certain council committees.

This applies to issue-oriented committees that have a short lifespan, rather than for permanent structures for participatory budgeting initiatives to ensure that community priorities are aligned to capital investment programmes; and focus group participatory action research to gather information on specific needs and values of communities.

The requirement is that this function should be carried out together with NGOs and community-based organisations; and provide support to associations to enhance their organisational development. In addition, the White Paper on Local Government suggests that this is particularly important for poor marginalised societies, where there
might be lack of skills and resources for participation. Its reasoning for this position is that, in these areas, “citizens tend to participate via associations rather than as individuals” (White Paper on Local Government, 1998).

2.5.4 DEVELOPMENT FACILITATION ACT

The Development Facilitation Act (DFA) (1995) promotes civic participation in development at municipal level. In terms of section 3 of the DFA, one of the legislation’s objectives is to set general principles governing land development across the nation of South Africa. Section 3 (d) provides for the encouragement of participation of all sectors of the economy (public and private) to land development to maximise South Africa’s capacity to undertake land development.

It is of utmost importance to note that the DFA does not only provide for the involvement of communities in land development but also capacity building for those local communities affected by land development (Section 3 (d) and (e)). In addition, section 3 (1) (g) of the DFA provides for the affected communities’ access to legislation and procedures. The communities should thus have access to adequate information on the land development that is directly or indirectly affecting them. Equally important, section 27 of the DFA requires the community to determine or set out the objectives for land development.

2.5.5 Municipal Systems Act

The Municipal Systems Act also promotes community participation at municipal level. One of the Act’s principal objectives is to provide for a framework that enhances community participation. Thus, the municipalities are mandated to develop a culture of municipal governance that complements formal representative government with a system of participatory government. The Municipal Systems Act requires municipal governments to actively involve communities in local government matters such as planning, service delivery and performance management”.

2.5.6 Integrated Development Planning

The Integrated Development Planning (IDP) is a plan generally conceived as a vehicle for development in local government (Department of Provincial and Local
Government, 2000: 19). According to section 35 of the Municipal Systems Act, IDP entails the “principal strategic planning instrument which guides and informs all planning, and development, and all decisions about planning, management and development, in the municipality”. The IDP is aimed at guiding all the developmental activities of the municipalities (Department of Provincial and Local Government 2000: 20).

One of the key objectives for developing the IDP is that it would assist municipalities in alleviating challenges facing communities in development processes (White Paper on Local Government 1998). Thus, the IDP would meet the challenges by, inter alia: enabling municipalities to better understand the “dynamics” that exist in their development areas, to allow them to meet the needs of communities and improve their quality of life; helping municipalities develop clear visions and strategies to deal with problems that exist in their development areas; enabling local municipalities to develop development plans for their areas over a period of time, including “short term, medium and long term”; and ensuring prioritisation and appropriate allocation of resources (White Paper on Local Government 1998).

2.6 COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN SOUTH AFRICA

As previously indicated civic participation embraces information sharing, consultation and decision making. It is legal mandate to ensure that the aspect of consultation is entrenched as stated in section 15 (1) (a) of the Local Government: Municipal Planning and Performance Management Regulations which calls for consultations with locally recognized community organizations, and where appropriate with traditional authorities. Furthermore, the World Bank refers to community participation in urban development as a process that involves people who are directly affected by the development concerned (Buccus, 2007:6).

The definition of the World Bank alludes to the idea of power of the community with regards to participation in the development process. This means therefore, that communities should have control or power over decisions of the development projects. This is also echoed by De Villiers (2001: 11), who says that for communities to influence and share control of their development depends on whether or not they have access to power and decision makers.
In addition to the foregoing, Arnstein (1969: 216) states that “citizen participation is a categorical term for citizen power. It is the redistribution of power that enables the have-not citizens, presently excluded from the political and economic processes, to be deliberately included in the future”.

The dawn of democracy in South Africa saw a commitment from the national government to ensure the inclusion of ordinary citizens and particularly communities and groups in the development plans. The Integrated Development Plan (IDP) was seen as one of the ways to achieve this. IDP is a planning tool of municipal government.

2.7 OVERVIEW OF PLANNING PROCESSES OF URBAN REVITALISATION IN BCMM AND ECDC

Local community is one of the key participants in urban revitalisation projects among the local government, private sector and non-governmental organisations (NGOs). In general terms, community is perceived to include residents, ratepayers, civic organisations, NGOs, business sector and labour (Municipal Systems Act 2000). Participation in urban redevelopment is about people and development of their communities.

The BCMM IDP Review indicated the future plans for “Re-shaping Buffalo City in 2023”. This focuses on clear objectives and strategies for SDF and Land Use Management and provides guidelines to manage development and investment plans as well as the socio-economic benefits for all communities (BCMM IDP 2014/15:138); and also the involvement of other relevant stakeholders and private companies in order to form partnerships and establishment of integrated development plans to boost economy of the province and even nationally.

For this reason, underdeveloped urban areas should be replaced in Dimbaza to reduce poverty and create jobs in the former homelands. This would be successful only with the effective involvement of local communities (BCMM IDP, Review, 2015/16/17) which include Dimbaza Industrial Projects on the revitalisation of abandoned industrial factories for poverty alleviation and creation of employment opportunities in the BCMM and across the province.
In 2016, the BCMM and the Eastern Cape Development Cooperation (ECDC) presented the plan for revitalisation for the Dimbaza industrial area in the local newspaper, the Daily Dispatch, 29 August 2016). The Dimbaza industrial hub was once an active industrial node under the apartheid government, but in the last decade several companies have pulled out and several factories in the area have been abandoned (Invest Buffalo City, 2016). The BCMM has, therefore undertaken to manage several projects aimed at revitalising the area. The newspaper article stated the roles and responsibilities for the BCMM and the ECDC. The BCMM will focus on infrastructure issues, and the ECDC will focus on strategic matters but public participation strategy was not clear. The ECDC is spearheading and managing the project, and the BCMM is the key player and partner in this programme and will upgrade the infrastructure, issue planning approvals, environmental health permits and re-zoning processes.

According to the article in the Daily Dispatch, 29 August 2016, “a food factory, recreation and eating space, retail centre, upgrading of roads and infrastructure are just some of the projects in the pipeline for the area.” In addition, the presentation submitted to stakeholders in April revealed that the project would include construction of a hydroponics complex, where produce such as vegetables, berries, edible flowers and spices and herbs would be produced (Daily Dispatch, 29 August 2016). Further, the programme intends to construct residences for professionals and the higher income work force and encourage informal settlement upgrading within the BCMM. The Department of Trade and Industry and the Provincial Department of Economic Development and Environmental Affairs and Tourism have acknowledged this initiative. The project is designed for urban development of the community therefore, public involvement is crucial to share power and control over the projects (De Villiers, 2001:11).

2.8 COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION AND URBAN REVITALISATION IN BCMM

Despite the above mentioned urban revitalisation plans of the BCMM, recognising that the importance of community participation is key to the achievement of their goals there is no information regarding actual programmes that include public participation in the BCMM urban renewal projects, and there is no publicly available information or if there is it was not made available to the researcher. For example, the BCMM IDP
requires various stakeholders to be involved in spatial planning with various roles and responsibilities. The public participation process was structured and driven through a Representative Forum, which consisted of community leaders, civic organisations, Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs), Community Based Organisations (CBOs), commerce and industry, advocacy groups, traditional leaders and a broad range of civil society stakeholders representing citizen interests (United Nations Development Programme, South Africa, 2016).

In relation to community participation, the BCMM IDP recognises that public community participation in all documents, that is, policies, by-laws and the IDP is lacking (BCMM 2016-2021 IDP, 2016: 485). As a consequence, it acknowledges that “community needs and priorities in developing the integrated development plan Buffalo City Metro takes its tune from residents and the broader public of the Metro who participate in a number of public consultation processes and programmes” and that “It is through these engagements that residents are able to define and shape their needs and priorities which must be taken into consideration during planning and budgeting” (BCMM 2016-2021 IDP, 2016: 27-28).

Accordingly, the BCMM IDP requested to:

- commission a study to explore the challenges facing the existing community participation process of BCMM;
- Conduct a civic education programme targeting the youth;
- Increase the presence of the communications department on community radio and other community media channels;
- Set aside funds for a pilot project on ward based planning (BCMM 2016-2021 IDP, 2016: 430).

In addition, the newspaper article stated that the urban revitalisation of Dimbaza industrial factories is at an advanced stage (Daily Dispatch, 29 August 2016). However, with specific reference to community participation in the urban renewal programme of Dimbaza, the article merely states that “public consultations are expected to be held with the communities earmarked to benefit from the project” (Daily Dispatch, 29 August 2016). Nevertheless, the article shows that the BCMM economic development project specialist urged the city to partner with various departments already working towards the revitalisation of Dimbaza, to reverse the dismal economy in the hub after the collapse of industrial activity in the area (Daily Dispatch, 29 August 2016).
Accordingly, there were consultations with various stakeholders including the Eastern Cape Economic Development (ECDC) and the BCMM’s City Manager. The community participation in urban revitalisation plans of the BCMM remain more of an aspiration than a reality as mentioned previously. That is, though plans exist in the documents such as policies and by-laws the revitalisation does not seem to be happening in reality.

2.9 CHALLENGES OF COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN BCMM AND ECDC

The challenges that may affect these projects may include the following: integrated development plan communication strategy, community outreach programme and stakeholder involvement strategy (Schubeler, 1996). The exclusion of local communities in the Dimbaza Revitalisation Project may have negative impact in and unnecessary conflict with local structures. If the local communities are not adequately consulted and informed about this urban development project, of which they were supposed to be partners and participate in such development initiatives and decisions about resources which directly affect them (Buccus, 2007). This may result in conflict which could negatively affect the proposed Dimbaza project. This study intends to address these challenges.

2.10 CONCLUSION

In conclusion, the above discourse revealed that South Africa has a robust theoretical and policy/legislative framework for urban regeneration and community involvement. This Chapter has also considered the various community participation strategies for effective community participation in urban revitalisation and forces driving it. It has also included historical background, theories, and concepts on relevant terminology. The discussion also highlighted some of the challenges of community involvement in urban regeneration.

The rationale behind outlining the theoretical and policy/legislative framework for urban regeneration and community involvement is to attempt to translate it into practice, with particular reference to the proposed Dimbaza Revitalisation Project which is discussed in the subsequent chapter(s).
CHAPTER 3
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter covers research design, methodology and data collection employed in the execution of this study and includes the research objectives to address the purpose of the study as related in the introductory chapter. This study employs a plethora of diverse research tools such as questionnaires, observations, interviews, and assessment of resources and surveys. The method in this study is carried out in terms of paradigm research methodology. The study uses qualitative research methodology as its research paradigm and data collection methods.

3.2 RESEARCH METHODOLOGIES

3.2.1 Alternative research methodologies

There are various research methodologies. The most common research methodologies are qualitative, quantitative and mixed method. Qualitative research methodology involves the exploration and understanding of meanings ascribed to social or human problems (Creswell, 2013: 4). It is a research process involving emerging questions and procedures, data collection, analysis and interpretation (Creswell, 2013: 4; Kothari, 2004: 5). One of the characteristics of the qualitative research method is that it attempts to understand the people’s views, perspectives and social realities.

Quantitative research” is an approach of testing objective theories by examining the relationship among variables. These variables, in turn can be measured, typically on instruments, so that numbered data can be analysed using statistical procedures” (Creswell, 2013: 4). Mixed research methodology involves philosophical assumptions that guide the direction of the collection and analysis of data and the mixture of qualitative and quantitative data in a single study or series of studies (Creswell and Plano Clark, 2007: 5). It is based on the premise that the use of quantitative and qualitative approaches in combination provides a better understanding of research
problems than either approach used alone (Creswell, 2013: 4). The specific method for this research is based on the qualitative method.

### 3.2.2 Qualitative research

The major approach for the study is the qualitative approach, due to the fact that it can describe events, including observations such as fieldwork, interviews, use of questionnaires and document analysis. According to Durrheim (2006: 47), “qualitative researchers collect data in the form of written or spoken language, or in the form of observations that are recorded in language, and analyse the data by identifying and categorizing themes”. Therefore, the study required an in-depth literature study of the secondary sources such as books, journal articles, internet sources, newspapers and relevant municipal and other relevant government documents with pertinence to community participation in urban revitalization. In addition, questionnaires were developed to obtain information on the extent of community participation in planning in the BCMM.

The data from interviews and questionnaires about theory of community participation contributed to the development of a framework which was utilised to suggest possible solutions for the possible shortcomings in the BCMM and ECDC public consultation process.

The focus is on residents living close to the industrial areas in Dimbaza, as they are most likely to have strong opinions on the future of the abandoned factories on their doorstep. A sample of 20 people (Males, both youth and older people, Females, youth and old), have been randomly selected and they have been asked to complete a structured questionnaire which seeks to examine community participation in urban revitalization and particularly the future plans for the abandoned factories in the industrial areas.

### 3.2.3 Strengths and weaknesses of qualitative research

As the study is about understanding the trends in the body of knowledge from the books and journals, information may have some gaps (Kumar 1999:29). Documents such as government or semi-government publications in South Africa collect data on a regular basis in a variety of areas and use some interest groups for publications.
Some examples of these government documents include the strategic plans, annual and quarterly reports, legislations and policy documents (Kumar, 1999:124).

There are several strengths and weaknesses in any methodological approach. In the following section, Bryma’s (2001) analysis of the strengths and weaknesses of the qualitative approach that was selected for the purposes of this research is summarised.

### 3.2.3.1 Strengths

- Can be tape recorded with the permission of the interviewee and is more accurate than writing notes.
- Data is based on the participants’ categories of meaning
- It provides an understanding of people’s personal experiences
- Useful to study in depth limited number of cases, and provides individual case information.

### 3.2.3.2 Weaknesses

- It takes longer for transcription of recordings.
- It may be difficult to make qualitative predictions.
- Interviewee can be guided in a special direction.
- Data is often time consuming, and results may be influenced by researchers’ personal biases.

### 3.2.3.3 Mitigation to minimise negative aspects of questionnaire surveys

In order to mitigate the mentioned weakness, as a researcher you need to be neutral and not lead the respondents. According to Cresswell (2009:180) information must be protected. As indicated, because of the difficulties the researcher experienced with the BCMM during the data collection, reports from the website were used. This may have an impact on the aims and objectives of the study due to insufficient evidence. The researcher felt that the non-cooperation demonstrated by BCMM added more challenges as the recommendations of the study could be linked to the roots of the problems.
The said disadvantages may, in general, have adverse effects as to the viability of the research information. However, there are many ways that could mitigate these negative effects.

3.3 RESEARCH PARADIGM

According to Matthew and Ross (2010:111) research design is the most crucial step in refining research questions. This study was conducted within an interpretive paradigm. The reason for using this paradigm is the fact that the researcher believed that different people define their experiences and circumstances in various ways. The survey therefore focused on the Dimbaza residents, using face to face interviews at the taxi rank close to the industrial area. An array of diverse research methods was employed such as observations, interviews and assessment of resources and surveys.

The method in this study was employed in terms of paradigm methodology, an empirical study within an interpretive paradigm. In addition to the afore mentioned, the study required detailed literature of available resources such as books, journal articles, newspapers and other relevant government documents including the BCMM in urban revitalization. This included their views about future planning about community participation in urban revitalization in BCMM.

3.4 RESEARCH TECHNIQUES

To achieve the aims and objectives of the study, the Questionnaires Surveys will address the following key issues:

- What are the urban redevelopment strategies being employed by BCMM?
- What are the tools used by the BCMM in its urban redevelopment processes?
- Do the BCMM’s urban redevelopment initiatives have community participation components?
- How can the community be more involved in neighbourhood revitalization?
- What are the perceptions of the people living in the neighbourhood of the disused factories in Dimbaza with regard to redevelopment?
- To what extent do these perceptions and priorities of the people living in the neighbourhood of the disused factories match those of the policy makers?
3.4.1 Questionnaire administration

The study used questionnaires to obtain the information on the extent of community participation in the BCMM’s planning processes. Questionnaire administration is aimed at gathering the community’s knowledge, views and responses on the qualities of public participation in urban revitalization in the BCMM. Prior to actual questionnaire administration, the household survey was pre-tested with ten residents from the BCMM community in order to:

- Review the list of variables to ensure that the conditions indeed exist in the neighbourhood.
- Test the questions which provided the opportunity to garner community feedback on the content and general direction of the questionnaire in ensuring that the delivery of the question is relevant, understood and acceptable to the respondent, questions capture sufficiently what the survey is aiming to find and time duration of administering the questions is acceptable.
- Familiarise the applicant with an entry strategy to be employed in the field during the actual sample survey.
- And test the capability of the applicant in administering the questions and make necessary adjustments before deploying them in the field.

The questionnaires included standardised questions both in English and were translated into their home language (Xhosa) where required. The questionnaire administration was used as a first step of a consultative planning process as well as introducing the community to the intended urban regeneration of the industrial premises in Dimbaza. The copies of the questionnaires are added as annexures to the research report.

3.4.2 Advantages and disadvantages of questionnaire surveys

There are advantages and disadvantages in questionnaire surveys and a few are listed below as follows:
3.4.2.1 Advantages

- Practical, simple for respondent to respond to, and also simple for researcher to administer.
- Large amount of information can be quickly collected and quantified, and is simple for researcher to administer at low cost.
- After data collection, it can be compared and be used to measure change.
- Questionnaires are usually straightforward to analyse.

3.4.2.2 Disadvantages

- Respondents may give superficial answers.
- Questionnaire may appear impersonal, and respondents may ignore certain questions.
- Data may be analysed differently and responded to base on that interpretation.
- It takes time to analyse data, and may require follow up for further investigation.

3.4.2.3 Mitigation to minimise negative aspects of questionnaire surveys

The said disadvantages may, in general, have adverse effects as to the viability of the research information. However, there are many ways in which these negative effects could be mitigated. The ways to mitigate these negative effects are listed below:

- Cross check validity with a peer or colleague.
- Ensure the applicant is fully informed about the nature of the exercise.

3.5 DATA ADMINISTRATION

A number of key informants from the BCMM and ECDC officials would be interviewed in order to get practical information about community participation in planning for the urban revitalization of Dimbaza Industrial Factories in Buffalo City Municipality Metropolitan (BCMM). A sample of stakeholders was asked to participate by responding to the structured questionnaires. The interviews were structured with both closed and open-ended questions oriented by a list of questions. The standardised questionnaire is in English.

The primary data collection was obtained from a number of local resident respondents who were interviewed through the use of questionnaires. The study conducted in-
depth interviews with a sample of local residents of Dimbaza. Ritchie and Lewis (2003) describe in-depth interviews as content focused discussions with key informants who have lived in an area for a long period of time and have rich knowledge about a particular subject of interest. A random sampling technique was used to select households to participate in the survey.

3.6 DATA COLLECTION

As indicated before, the nature of the study is descriptive research and the primary purpose of the study described how communities are involved in urban revitalization. For that reason, the research focused on descriptive data and as such the researcher collected data directly from the people. The researcher used government documents; the study used secondary data that was obtained from BCMM IDP and SDF, from ECDC and the documents were Strategic Plans, Annual and Quarterly Reports and newsletters. The study identified potential gaps in public participation in planning for urban revitalization and recommended strategies to address the gaps.

The researcher made appointments to personally interview respondents in the Dimbaza Community, the BCMM officials and the Eastern Cape Development Cooperation (ECDC) Officials and other Community Representatives. The initial session took place with both BCMM, ECDC and Department of Economic Development, Environmental Affairs and Tourism (DEDEAT) in order to agree on scheduled meetings. The data was accessed from the above-mentioned sources (primary and secondary data), by direct observations, document analysis and case study.

3.7 SAMPLING

Sampling is a statistical analysis technique used to select, manipulate and analyse a representative subset of data points in order to identify patterns and trends in the larger data set being examined. The researcher used a random sampling method to complete the data collection. The study targeted Dimbaza residents, a small sample of the officials from the BCMM and ECDC to ensure validity and reliability of the project; the sample was chosen according to aims and objectives of the study.
3.8 LIMITATIONS TO THE STUDY

The most crucial purpose of delineation is to ensure that the focus of the study is manageable and controlled. The BCMM Spatial Development Framework and Integrated Development Plans do not indicate very clearly the implementation strategies that involve local communities in local economic development and/or urban revitalization. The research focused specifically on the role of community participation in planning in the area of the Buffalo City Municipality, with particular reference to urban revitalization.

The community members in Dimbaza may be ignorant about urban revitalization due to various reasons and this background, therefore the researcher explained the concept to them so they felt confident to participate in the survey. The complex nature of the study coupled with involvement of BCMM officials and possibly the politicians as well as other specific limitations, may negatively affect the execution of this research.

3.9 ETHNICAL CONSIDERATIONS

The information shared by participants will remain anonymous as they have a right to privacy. The confidentiality of the research participants will be protected at all times as participant’s names and surnames were not used when the data was captured. Permission to conduct interviews was approved by the ECDC manager and approval from BCMM had not yet been received by the last day of the submission.

According to Fick (2006), the following issues in ethnical theory are very crucial, because they act as a guide to what is expected during the research process. They are as follows:

- **Non-malfeasance**: this cautions the researcher that participants should not be harmed in any way
- **Beneficence**: since research involves human beings, it should be more productive and have fruitful results
- **Justice**: this should be always practiced because everyone needs to be treated with dignity
- **Confidentiality**: the respondents will not be identified by name or in any other manner so that their privacy is respected
• Vulnerable groups such as children and people living with HIV/AIDS will not be interviewed according to the NMMU short ethics clearance form for guidance on ethical considerations.

Research ethics involves the protection and welfare of research participants and extends to areas such as scientific misconduct. For this reason, the researcher had to sign an ethics form which assures compliance with scientific research processes (Terre Blanche, Durrheim and Painter, 2006:61). Therefore, there was a need for arrangements to be made in respect of indemnity in order to meet the potential legal liability to the Nelson Mandela University.

3.10 CONCLUSION

In conclusion, this chapter covered the research methodology design for the study. The chapter has outlined the research design, methodology and data collection that the study intends to employ in conducting the research. Thus, the study used several techniques such as questions, observations, interviews and assessment resources and surveys. The chapter also depicted that the methods that were used the study were the paradigm research methodology and an empirical study within an interpretive paradigm.

The study used qualitative research methodology, research paradigm, data collection methods and sampling; development of survey questionnaires and other issues including limitations and ethical considerations. The subsequent chapter focuses on detailed data interpretation and analysis in relation to community participation in urban revitalization in the BCMM. Chapter four focuses on interpretation and analysis of data gathered from the fieldwork.
CHAPTER 4

FINDINGS

4.1 INTRODUCTION

When this research project was initiated early in 2016, the emphasis was not only on public participation in planning, but also focused on community perceptions of possible other uses (‘adaptive reuse’) for the abandoned factories in Dimbaza. During the course of the research, the Daily Dispatch published a headline article on the BCMM plans to revitalize the Dimbaza factories (Daily Dispatch, 29 August 2016).

In view of this development and new information, the focus of the research changed to assess the extent to which the Dimbaza residents had been consulted in planning for their community, and, more specifically on the role of public participation in the proposed urban revitalization project of Dimbaza.

A document search was undertaken to establish the community participation policies of the two major players in the proposed Dimbaza revitalization, namely the Eastern Cape Development Corporation (ECDC) and the Buffalo City Municipality (BCMM). The intention was to follow up the document search with personal interviews with officials of these two entities to focus specifically on the extent to which the Dimbaza community had participated in the planning for the revitalization initiative.

A survey was furthermore undertaken with a sample of Dimbaza residents to shed light on their perceptions on community participation in planning in general, and with respect to the proposed Dimbaza revitalization in particular.

This chapter will analyse the results of these research initiatives.

4.2 A PROPOSAL TO REVITILISE THE INDUSTRIAL AREA IN DIMBAZA

On 29 August 2016 an article in the Daily Dispatch newspaper, which serves the greater Buffalo City region, announced plans for the revitalization of the under-utilized and sometimes long-abandoned factory buildings in Dimbaza (Daily Dispatch, 29 August 2016, 8).
The initiative to revitalize Dimbaza industrial area is likely to contribute to poverty alleviation and reduction of unemployment in the BCMM, and more specifically, for the local community of Dimbaza. The unemployment is largely due to the closure of many state-subsidized factories in the 1990s which has led to high levels of unemployment in this town.

With regard to public participation, there was not much mentioned in the newspaper about the consultation processes with the communities. The newspaper article presented a summary of the BCMM’s role in the proposed revitalization of the Dimbaza industrial area, which included the following:

- upgrading the bulk of the infrastructure (abandoned factories)
- Issuing planning approvals and communication of the master plan in order to contribute a needs basis together with engagements with other departments such as the Department of Trade and Industry (DTI) and Department of Rural Development and Agrarian Reform (DRDAR) including major stakeholders like the Industrial Development Zone (IDC)
- Environmental health permits and rezoning processes

Despite these intentions that appeared in the 2016 newspaper article, there was no mention in the latest BCMM 2016-2021 IDP (2016) that related to the infrastructure upgrade for urban revitalization of the abandoned factories in Dimbaza. The article stated that the BCMM meet with local community targeting women and youth, and they meet through the ward councillor. However, they indicated that the consultation was not complete, and seemed unaware of the communication strategy.

Such omission in the BCMM IDP may indicate that the Dimbaza upgrade may still be many years in the future, unless new funding for this initiative is obtained from other sources. It is clear that the industrial projects may form part of the medium-term plan, hence the availability of the public participation strategy is crucial to drive and promote structural transformation towards dynamic industrial growth in the province (Department: Economic Development, Environmental Affairs and Tourism, 2016).

The omission of the project in the BCMM’s IDP suggests that the Dimbaza upgrade may be identified as one of the future government’s efforts. The Department of Trade and Industry’s strategic goals guarantees the implementation of an Industrial Policy
Action Plan (IPAP2) which promotes the long-term industrialization and industrial diversification.

The DTI objectives also emphasized broadening participation of the previously disadvantaged individuals in the economic growth which must be aligned with the BCMM IDP for effective implementation (DTI, 2016).

![Image of derelict factory building]

**Figure 4.1: One of the derelict factory buildings in Dimbaza**

### 4.3 THE BCMM’S POLICY ON COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN PLANNING

In order to obtain information on the BCMM’s policy on community participation in planning, the researcher tried on several occasions to organize meetings with the BCMM managers to gather the required information for the study. The research was conducted and the following directorates were identified as possible sources of information: Information Knowledge Management and Research Unit, the BCMM Policy Unit and the Office of the City Manager. Most identified officials appeared reluctant to participate in the survey and kept on referring the questionnaires to other offices. Unsuccessful attempts to reach the BCMM officials compromised the researcher’s ability to make progress, as engagements that began in the initial stages of this research in 2016 carried through much of 2017.

The Municipal Systems Act proscribes that the municipality is the custodian of the local sphere of government. The principal objective of the Municipal Systems Act is to
enhance community participation in municipal governance in order to involve the communities to co-operate in the study. Development projects according to the specific needs of the communities include urban revitalization programs (White Paper on Local Government, 1998).

Public consultations were expected to be held with the communities earmarked to benefit from the Dimbaza Project as reviewed in the White Paper on local Government (1988) which stated that local communities must be encouraged to participate in municipal affairs. Despite no specific mention of a community participation policy in the latest BCMM IDP, there are, however, several references to community participation – some merely suggestions by some of the key stakeholders in this regard. For example, the BCMM IDP (2016: 27-28) notes:

> The BCMM IDP takes its tune from residents and the broader public of the Metro who participate in a number of public consultation processes and programs through the annual mayoral imbizo and IDP/Budget road show. In addition, it is through these engagements that residents are able to define and shape their needs and priorities which must be taken into consideration during planning and budgeting. This should be followed by the practical tool for implementation especially in preparation of revitalization of Dimbaza Industrial Area.

In addition, the Buffalo City Development Agency is expected to take actions within its scope of authority to further its mandate regarding the lack of public participation in all documents, policies, by-laws and the IDP in the BCMM. As such, the Development Agency is requested to explore the challenges facing the existing community participation process of the BCMM by; conducting a civic education programme targeting the youth; increasing the presence of the communications department on community radio and other community media channels (BCMM 2016-2021 IDP, 2016: 430).

It was stated in the press report that the urban revitalization project for the Dimbaza Industrial Hub is at an advance stage, but the communities and other stakeholders had not yet been consulted at the time of press report (Daily Dispatch, 29 August 2016). The revitalization of the Dimbaza industrial zone is a major initiative that will be of great importance to the Dimbaza community, particularly to those that may seek employment in the revitalized factories. It is crucial that in the spirit of BCMM’s community participation policy, the Dimbaza community should have been informed
of the initiative at an early stage, preferably before the proposed initiative was publicised in the press.

Although the White Paper on Local Government (1998) and subsequent government strategies clearly state that a municipality must include communities in planning, which should include urban revitalization initiatives, it is no wonder that communities believe that the BCMM does not seem to be committed in engaging the public in local government matters on issues that directly affect the people’s lives.

4.4 THE ECDC POLICY ON COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION ON THE PROPOSED URBAN REVITALIZATION

According to the Daily Dispatch article, the ECDC will be the implementing agent for the revitalization of the Dimbaza Industrial Hub. The article further states that the ECDC is one of the custodians of the Master Plan for the Dimbaza Project and will also be responsible for the investment promotion component. It was also indicated that the plans were in an advance stage for the urban revitalization of the abandoned factories in the Dimbaza Industrial area.

As stated before, the ECDC was mandated to drive the collaborative work to address the socio-economic and socio-political challenges in the Eastern Cape Province regarding revitalization of the abandoned factories. The ECDC is a public entity of the Eastern Cape Department of Economic Development, Environmental Affairs and Tourism (DEDEAT). One of the strategic objectives of DEDEAT confirms that it is committed to the transformation of the provincial economy, to promote industrial development, investment, competitiveness and employment creation especially for the historically disadvantaged individuals (DTI, 2016).

The ECDC prepared the Dimbaza Agro-Industrial Project (DAIP) Report (2016) as part of the Dimbaza urban revitalization project. The DAIP Report has not been published. The DAIP Report summarizes the aims and objectives of the Dimbaza Industrial Hub as follows:

- To alleviate poverty; reduce unemployment through job creation and inequality
- To stimulate the local economy through SMME opportunities by facilitating the informal sector through stimulation of local economy and conducive environment for business
- Facilitate training and development opportunities and thereby widen the skills base of the In-Year Monitoring (IYM).
- Ensure that the previously marginalized sections of the populations become meaningful role-players in the mainstream economy.

The IYM falls in the ECDC Planning and Monitoring which provides a holistic approach and integrated planning for prioritization of sector Department Projects and Budgeting, where the project is monitored during construction and post construction. All this was completed in line with the packaging of the Legislative Requirements such as the In Year Monitoring (IYM) and the Integrated Social Infrastructure Delivery Program. The IYM are meant to implement the infrastructure programme on behalf of Eastern Cape government and Department of Economic Affairs and Tourism (DEDEAT).

The ECDC was also mandated to implement Maintenance and Renewal of existing infrastructure and other development programmes in the province (ECDC, 2015). According to the ECDC policy documents and discussions with the ECDC officials there is no specific policy on community consultation and participation in planning for ECDC projects.

The Eastern Cape Development Plan (ECDP), however, makes several mentions of community participation, community based planning, ‘meaningful engagement with citizens, citizen empowerment and enabling condition for citizen participation’. Community participation is thus integral to all activities by provincial government departments and the public entities.

The recent information from DEDEAT regarding the Dimbaza revitalization project stated that the documents regarding the final plans for the Dimbaza Project were not yet available for public circulation.

The DEDEAT and Department of Trade and Industry (DTI) worked in collaboration on the Dimbaza Project and highlighted the following: “few companies currently operate and owned inherited by ECDC; construction work, planning design and approved the role of stakeholders to assist and a few jobs were created. They have acknowledged
the initiative according to their presentation in the newspaper article” (Daily Dispatch, 29 August 2016). Although there was a mention of collaborative work with the above departments in preparation for the implementation of the Dimbaza Project, the strategy on public participation is not clear in order to ensure the inclusion of the local community and relevant stakeholders in the revitalization of old factories in Dimbaza.

In the Metro Growth Development Strategy (MGDS), Implementation Plans and ECDC strategic plans, there was a mention of a partnership of agreements (IDP Review, 2017/18). Again, even though the ECDC mentioned the availability of the Master Plan to implement the Dimbaza Project. The plan remains silent about public policy which may include affected communities especially related to the Dimbaza initiative as they should be directly involved in the development project which may affect them.

4.5 COMMUNITY RESPONSES ON PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON PROPOSED URBAN REVITALIZATION IN DIMBAZA

The researcher has conducted a survey among a sample of the Dimbaza residents about their knowledge of the proposed factory revitalization that was announced in the Daily Dispatch in 2016. Interviews were organized to find the views of the local community regarding the revitalization of the Dimbaza factories, but more specifically, to obtain their views on the extent of community participation in planning for important initiatives that may affect their lives. It is anticipated that the outcome of the research will be beneficial to BCMM and ECDC, as it is expected to highlight challenges related to community participation during planning and implementation stages of the IPD and other initiatives.

Firstly, the analysis briefly presents demographic and socio-economic profiles of the respondents, and thereafter, focuses on community participation in planning, first in general, and then specifically with regard to the Dimbaza revitalization planning process. The minimum number of residents to be interviewed in Dimbaza was determined to be 20 residents because their interest in the study. Out of 20 participants, 4 officials from BCMM and ECDC officials who in the end did not take part in the survey. Out of the 20 selected participants from the community, only sixteen people were interested in participating in the survey, 10 females and 6 males.
4.5.1 Profile of respondents

The analysis below was obtained based on the information of the age, gender and some socio-economic characteristics of the sample of Dimbaza residents. The following figure presents a summary of the gender and ages of the Dimbaza Residents that participated in the community survey. The age groups were as follows: 25 – 34; 35 – 44 and 45 – 55. There was a slight majority female participants, namely 10 with six males participating. Most responses came from females because the male participants were reluctant to answer questions raised by the researcher.

4.5.2 Profile of Dimbaza respondents

Table 4.1: Profile of Dimbaza respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AGE GROUP</th>
<th>MALES (M)</th>
<th>FEMALES (F)</th>
<th>EMPLOYMENT STATUS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>25 - 34 younger</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Unemployed both (F &amp; M)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35 – 44 middle age</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2 Females and 1 Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45 – 55 older group</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Interviews were organized to establish the views of the local community regarding the revitalization of the Dimbaza factories. The interviews were organized so that the local community could participate in the study on urban revitalization planning in the BCMM. It is anticipated that this study will be beneficial to the BCMM because of the new models and by addressing challenges related to community participation during the planning and implementation stages of the IPD processes.

4.5.3 Residents’ experience with public participation in Municipal Planning

4.5.3.1 Responses of participation in IDP meetings

The majority of the respondents from younger age groups, both males and females, presented their dissatisfaction and indicated that they attended IDP meetings but were not given time to present their views according to their needs as residents of the area.
The older people from both gender groups (males and females) further indicated that it became a norm for government to impose the Development programmes on the people, and as residents they felt that this tendency of taking huge decisions for the communities was contrary to the democracy.

**4.5.3.2 Participation in meetings on the urban revitalization of the Dimbaza Project**

The male youth respondents strongly emphasized that the exclusion of communities in development projects, such as the Dimbaza revitalization initiative, may result in service delivery protests in their areas. The youth females also felt the same and strongly emphasized that the government was supposed to learn from previous protests and improve on how to deal with development projects especially those that involved the communities. They also indicated that they were not aware of any strategy on the proposed Dimbaza Project. This was due to the fact that senior government officials promised the community the initiative long ago but to their surprise they were not involved during the planning stages of the project.

In relation to community participation regarding the urban revitalization project of Dimbaza, no female respondent had ever attended BCMM meetings and they were not aware of the urban revitalization project that was presented, including the proposed Dimbaza Development. However, the majority of the respondents from all age groups felt that the development initiatives that were planned without community participation would not succeed.

People from the older age groups (45-55 years old) mentioned issues like ‘new behaviour’ and ‘foreign leadership style’ by their officials in the current government especially in the municipality. They felt that the public views were continuously ignored, and they also felt that it became a norm for the current government to forget their mandate regarding community participation, of which the public must own development initiatives to avoid failure.

**4.5.3.3 Means of communication about planning, including urban revitalization meetings**

Generally ward meetings were announced through the media such as the local radio, fliers and the ward councillor using a loud speaker around the location. The
respondents indicated that they were not aware of any plans related to the revitalization of the Dimbaza industrial area, and they were disappointed by BCMM presentation of the initiative about the Dimbaza industrial area as they had not yet been consulted as the local community. One respondent’s comments reflected the opinions of many when she said,

“I did not even see the newspaper and had no access to it; government took us for granted and do not understand that most residents are unemployment and cannot access the Daily Dispatch as we are living in poverty; it is clear that the current government did not care about the people who voted for them.”

4.5.3.4 Extent of community satisfaction with BCMM with respect to their participation regarding urban revitalization

Based on the results of the survey, all respondents from all the age groups were not satisfied about communication on the urban revitalization of Dimbaza especially in the initial stages. The respondents were particularly unhappy that they learnt about the proposed redevelopment in the newspaper before it was tabled to the local community. Both males and females indicated their dissatisfaction and lack of confidence with BCMM due to various reasons such as, exclusion of residents when planning for urban revitalization of the Dimbaza industrial area. This may have negative impact in the implementation of the project as the community may not have same vision about the objectives of the project. Again, due to insufficient consultation of the local communities, other residents (two female respondents) find themselves being employed at a boarding school which operates in one of the old risky buildings in Dimbaza industrial area, where they experience bad working conditions, but they cannot stay at home without jobs.

4.5.3.5 Views from the community respondents on the preferred future of the Dimbaza industrial area

All respondents felt that the abandoned industrial area in Dimbaza should be redeveloped and used to reduce the high rate of unemployment in the BCMM region and particularly in Dimbaza, so that local community can benefit economically and socially. Again, the project should be central to poverty alleviation by ensuring that the needs and priorities of the local community are catered for.
All respondents suggested that in order to improve community participation in the BCCMM, the municipality must involve the community when planning for development that will cater for the needs of the people. They furthermore suggested that BCMM as well as ECDC as the implementing agency, should improve their communication strategies regarding inclusion of people in the BCMM. These would go some way to avoid service delivery protests on development projects initiated by the government, which has become common among disaffected communities.

4.6 CONCLUSION

In both BCMM and ECDC initiatives regarding Dimbaza Project on revitalization of old industrial area, the plans do not clearly indicate the strategies or a policy about community involvement. In practice, the reports by BCMM and ECDC suggest that it is still difficult for government and its agencies to embark on meaningful public engagement particularly with people that are likely to be most directly affected by its initiatives, and, more specifically, those initiatives that promise job creation in areas with high levels of poverty and unemployment, such as in Dimbaza.

Some respondents suggested that in order to improve community participation in the BCCMM, the municipality must involve the community when planning for development that will cater for the needs of the people. One respondent’s comments reflected the opinions of many when she said, “I did not even see the newspaper and had no access in it; government took us for granted and do not understand that most residents are unemployed and cannot access the Daily Dispatch, [as] we are living in poverty; it is clear that the current government did not care about the people who voted for them.” This is a powerful general observation about the respondents; opinion of the extent of public consultation and participation in planning.
CHAPTER 5

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 OVERVIEW

This chapter presents conclusions based on the literature review in line with the aims and objectives of the study. This includes the summary of the key findings with the objective of providing recommendations to assist in improving community participation specifically in urban revitalization in the Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality (BCMM). The significance of the study was outlined in Chapter One as well as the key research questions pertaining to the study, namely the focus on community participation in urban revitalization in the BCMM.

The key research questions for the study are as follows:

- How can the community be more involved in neighbourhood revitalization?
- Do the BCMM’s urban redevelopment initiatives have community participation components?
- What are the perceptions of the people living in the neighbourhood of the disused factories in Dimbaza with regard to redevelopment?
- To what extent do these perceptions and priorities of the people living in the neighbourhood of the disused factories match those of the policy makers?
- What are the urban redevelopment strategies being employed in the BCMM?
- If there are any, what recommendations can be made to reduce the gap in order to address the current challenges regarding community participation in urban revitalization in the BCMM?

The study examined the extent to which the community has been involved in the planning of the urban revitalization of the Dimbaza industrial area in the BCMM. The key aims of this study are explained in the following paragraphs:

- The understanding of the current situation, problems, legislative measures and the successes regarding community participation in urban revitalization programs in the BCMM.
• Investigate and question urban revitalization in the BCMM with a view to determining the inclusion of the local community.

• Finding out information from the legislation of South Africa about the ideal state of community involvement in urban revitalization in line with the national mandate in order to promote, and involve local communities in development programmes.

• Recommend community participation in urban revitalization of the Dimbaza Industrial Area to improve what has been done by the BCMM

According to the BCMM IDP 2016-2021, the BCMM communicated with residents and the public of the Metro through the annual mayoral Imbizo. These programmes included the IDP/Budget road show which aimed to address 28 priorities for the 2016-2021 IDP/Budget.

In the Buffalo City Metropolitan Development Agency, Strategic Plan 2016-2021, the Dimbaza project and the Public Participation Policy were not mentioned (BCMM IDP 2016-2021, 443).

In addition, in the Economic Development and Re-Industrialization research by University of Fort Hare FHISER BCMM WSU, UFH, BCC which indicated strategies to unlock economic development, there was no mention of the Dimbaza industrial revitalization initiative.

Lastly, according to the Draft 2017/2018 IDP Review, there were recommendations which were suggested to rectify the challenges related to public participation, including the development of the Public Participation Policy which should be used as a guide to implement the communication strategies for the inclusion of the public in development programmes. This policy would also assist the implementation of the local government programmes in the BCMM including the external stakeholders.

According to the recent IDP reports the challenges related to community participation appear to have not yet been addressed. In the most recent BCMM IDP Review, a number of recommendations were made, which include the following:

• Establishment of a commission to study and explore the challenges facing the existing community participation process of the BCMM;
• Conduct a civic education programme targeting the youth;
• Increase the presence of the communications department on community radio and other community media channels;
• Set aside funds for a pilot project on ward based planning.

(IDP Review 2017/2018, 430 -432)

In addition, the ECDC is committed to address socio-economic and socio-political challenges within the Eastern Cape Province in relation to the revitalization of the abandoned factories. The ECDC will then be the implementing agent for the revitalization of the Dimbaza Industrial Hub (Daily Dispatch, 29 August 2016). The Eastern Cape Development Plan makes several mentions of community participation, community based planning, "meaningful engagement with citizens, citizen empowerment and enabling conditions for citizen participation". Community participation is thus integral to all activities by provincial government departments and the public entities. Nevertheless, the ECDC policy documents and discussions with the ECDC officials show that there is no specific policy on community consultation and participation in planning for ECDC projects.

5.2 SUMMARY OF THE KEY FINDINGS WITH REGARD TO COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN THE BCMM

It became clear during the course of the research that while the BCMM was committed to consulting communities, it had not yet completed a clear policy on community participation in planning. The same may be said of the ECDC, the provincial public entity that is responsible for the implementation of the Dimbaza revitalization initiative.

The study nevertheless aimed to determine whether the Dimbaza residents were ever informed or consulted by either the BCMM or the ECDC on the proposed urban revitalization of the Dimbaza Industrial Area.

The previous chapters have provided the information necessary to fulfil the aims and objectives of the study as well as the provision of answers to the above research questions.

The findings of the community survey done by the researcher shows that a considerable proportion of the sample of Dimbaza residents did not know about the
proposed urban revitalization programme for Dimbaza. What most of the respondents knew about the proposed programme was what appeared in the Daily Dispatch 29 August 2016. In relation to community participation regarding the urban revitalization project of Dimbaza, no respondent has ever attended the BCMM meetings on urban revitalization, including the proposed Dimbaza Development.

The main findings from the community survey are summarised below.

- The majority of the respondents from the youth and middle age group also presented their dissatisfaction by indicating that they attended IDP meetings but were not given time to present their views according to their needs as residents of the area.
- The youth respondents (males) strongly emphasized that the exclusion of communities in development projects, such as the Dimbaza revitalization initiative, may result in service delivery protests in their areas.
- All females strongly emphasized that the government was supposed to learn from previous protests and make improvements on how to deal with development projects especially those that involved the communities, as they indicated that they were not aware of any strategy on the proposed Dimbaza Project although they had previously been promised this initiative. People from the older age groups (45-55 years old) felt that the public views were continuously ignored, and they also felt that it became a norm for the current government to disregard their mandate regarding community participation.
- They also indicated that they were not aware of any plans related to the revitalization of the Dimbaza industrial area, and were disappointed by the BCMM presentation of the initiative about the Dimbaza industrial area as the local community had not yet been consulted.

The White Paper on Local Government (1998) is a policy to encourage the involvement of local communities in the development and implementation of development projects such as urban revitalization programmes. The policy clearly outlines the importance of the inclusion of local communities in order to cater for the needs and priorities of the community in order to achieve the intended outcome, which indicates that communities must be directly involved in urban revitalization programmes. In response to the aims and objectives of the study, the research
focused on community participation in the revitalization of the Dimbaza industrial area to create job opportunities in the BCMM.

In addition, the Municipal Systems Act (MSA, 1998) also indicated that the local communities must be directly involved and their views accommodated in municipal governance. The aim of this study was to determine and investigate the inclusion of the local communities by the BCMM in the urban redevelopment initiatives, including the Dimbaza Project (White Paper on Local Government, 1998). Other problems related to service delivery protests that resulted from the exclusion of the community and stakeholders by government especially for development programmes.

In terms of Municipal Systems Act No 32 of 2000, the administration of development programmes in the municipalities should be responsive to the needs of the local community. According to the Development Facilitation Act (1995) the affected communities should be directly involved in development processes and share their plans with the public.

The recent documents revealed that there was still a challenge in engaging the public in development programmes in the BCMM and in some other areas in the country. The discussion below outlines the recommendations that have resulted from the findings.

5.3 RECOMMENDATIONS REGARDING COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN URBAN REVITALIZATION IN THE DIMBAZA PROJECT

The BCMM and the ECDC are the two major players in the proposed Dimbaza revitalization initiative. Based on the findings of the research, the researcher will attempt to make recommendations to the different role players in order to improve participation and consultation with communities that may be directly affected by new initiatives.

The recommendation is that the consultation processes for urban revitalization of the Dimbaza Industrial Area should include the local communities from the initial stages of the project. This was indicated in the media report that stated that the community and other stakeholders had not yet been consulted about the revitalization of the Dimbaza Industrial Hub when the news about this development appeared in the local
press (Daily Dispatch, 29 August 2016). The local communities should be encouraged to participate in municipal affairs at the initial phases of the development project to ensure that their needs and priorities are catered for. It is crucial for the BCMM to ensure that the communities and relevant stakeholders have ownership in the government initiatives during the planning stages of projects including for the Dimbaza Industrial Hub.

Local government must involve the communities as it a legal mandate. The BCMM must ensure that the specific needs of the communities are accommodated (White Paper on Local Government, 1998). This proves that local government must not make decisions for the communities in order to avoid failure of development projects. Lastly, according to the White Paper on Local Government (1998), the BCMM should not operate against the government policy, where the culture of community participation in social and economic matters was emphasized (India, 2011).

This included the attitude of the BCMM officials, where the researcher noted that they did not seem ready to share any information regarding the Dimbaza Project although the information had already been presented in the local newspaper (Daily Dispatch, 29 August 2016). Furthermore, this also indicated that the BCMM was not committed in engaging the public in the local government matters to improve the lives of the people. This has a direct effect on the number of challenges in our local government especially in the BCMM.

The BCMM IDP (2016-17) clearly outlined the roles and responsibilities for a representative forum for stakeholders as follows - Government and Non-government (NGOs) Business Partners and Political and Technical leaders— representing the needs and interests of their constituents during the IDP Process as follows:

- To be part of discussions and decisions with Municipal Government
- To ensure the flow of information between their stakeholder groups and planning performance, implementation and review programmes

The recommendation is that public processes must include the local communities and affected stakeholders to ensure local communities participate in public meetings especially for the revitalization of the Dimbaza industrial area.
Carrim (2011) stated that IDPs should be open and transparent to allow communities to evaluate the performance of municipalities. The information will assist the BCMM to develop new strategies related to Spatial Planning and IDPs in order to improve public participation in urban revitalization in the BCMM region.

This is especially crucial in the implementation of development projects such as the Dimbaza initiative, and the availability of the public participation policy should assist the department in allowing the local communities to participate in the initial stages of the project. The policy should be used as a guide for the actual implementation especially for the urban revitalization of Dimbaza factories as it would be to their benefit economically and socially.

The other recommendation is that the BCMM Strategic Objectives and Five Key Performances must be practical and show the true reflection of community involvement in the planning for the urban revitalization project in Dimbaza (BCMM Review, 2016 – 2017). The focus should encourage the inclusion of the public during the initial stages of development plans with the municipal council so that there could be continuity of strategic objectives in the municipalities, and be more creative in the engagement of a cooperative governance system (India, 2011)

The ECDC and CDC as custodians of the master plan for the Dimbaza Project should collaboratively work together to improve the socio-economic and socio-political challenges in the Eastern Cape Province regarding the revitalization of the abandoned factories. The ECDC Project Inception and Project Report for Dimbaza Agro-Industrial Park (DAIP, February 2016), stated that the plan includes the following aims and objectives for the Dimbaza Project:

- To alleviate poverty; reduce unemployment through job creation and reduce inequality
- To stimulate the local economy through SMME opportunities by facilitating the informal sector through stimulation of the local economy and a conducive environment for business
- Facilitate training and development opportunities thereby widening the skills base of the IYM; and
- Ensuring that the previously marginalized sections of the populations become meaningful role players in the mainstream economy.

The master plan should include the local community and affected stakeholders. According to the Eastern Cape Development Cooperation (ECDC), the documents for the Dimbaza Project are still confidential and not available for circulation. This could be seen as the exclusion of the public and stakeholders to access information about the project. For this reason, the (ECDC) should have committed to engage with local communities and stakeholders before presenting the project in the newspaper. Again, this indicates that it was their intention to consult the communities and stakeholders after the completion of the document as indicated in the newspaper (Daily Dispatch, 29 August 2016).

The DEDEAT is also another role player in the proposed Dimbaza urban revitalization initiative. The same attitude was also displayed by some officials from the DEDEAT Local Economic Development Section (LED) at the regional level until the researcher managed to secure another session and appointment with the DEDEA Provincial Office. In relation to the public participation of the local community, their response only revealed a brief statement about the organizations they consulted but did not indicate any communication strategy for the Dimbaza Project. While news about the proposed development had already appeared in the press a year earlier, the officials indicated that documents relating to the proposed development were still private and not available for circulation.

Due to the fact that the current information regarding the Dimbaza Project is treated as confidential by the ECDC and DEDEAT, the BCMM, ECDC, and DEDEAT should use the collaborative sessions to provide advocacy campaigns with the affected communities and stakeholders in developing the public participation strategy. This exercise would assist in further challenges related to community involvement in the Dimbaza Agro-Industrial Park Project (DAIP). A more important recommendation is that both the BCMM and ECDC should commit to engage local communities in devising a strategy to fix this challenge of public participation in the initial and planning stages of the development programmes, including the urban revitalization projects in the BCMM.
A recommendation from the Buffalo City Ratepayers' Forum on the Public Participation Policy recommended that the policy should be completed and implemented as a guideline on the involvement of communities in participating effectively in the BCMM. The strategies from the latest BCMM IDP 2017/18 should contribute to the development of the new strategies for the community participation policy in the BCMM. They include the following:

Metro Growth Development Strategy (MGDS); Implementation Plans; Innovative and Productive City with the outcome to Maintain Inclusive and sustainable economic Growth.

It must be noted that the strategies on the latest BCMM IDP 2017/18 did not mention a plan related to the urban revitalization of the Dimbaza industrial area, especially the Dimbaza Project. This clearly indicates that the challenge of the operationalization of development projects in the BCMM exists and the intervention strategies on the matter should be prioritized in order to achieve the aims and objectives.

To improve public participation in the BCMM, there is a need for effective implementation of communication strategy. The overall challenge is related to consultation with the local community so that they could express their views regarding the future plans of the Dimbaza industrial area. The strategy should include formal and informal strategies:

- A formal strategy includes: The decision makers inform the public about planning intentions and investment to allow their input, local committees must be involved and notified in advance about the projects.
- Informal strategy includes: The various forums of interested groups from the public must be formed and made to feel worthwhile and involved. These forums include: municipal forums, round table discussions, future workshops, and public expert workshops (IDP/Budget/PMS Process Plan: 2016\17:10).

As custodian of the local sphere of government with the mandate to promote, encourage and involve local communities in planning activities, the development projects especially urban revitalization of the Dimbaza Industrial are a priority (White Paper on Local Government, 1988). The review of policies related to public participation should result in a positive impact on community involvement in the
effective implementation of the urban revitalization of old factories in Dimbaza in the BCMM and the creation of job opportunities in the province.

The civil society is encouraged to adopt measures that could ensure that their voices are heard in the urban revitalization programmes of Dimbaza. This can be done in various ways, namely actively participating in the meetings through an active ward committee system. This system would be an ideal forum where civil society can bring their needs and opinions and concerns to the attention of the municipality. In addition, there are likely to be other civic groups of activists that can play a role to ensure that the communities are consulted and kept informed.

5.4 CONCLUSION

In conclusion, the proposed Dimbaza revitalization initiative is very significant to the residents of the town. Many of them have been faced with high levels of unemployment and poverty, particularly since most of the factories closed in the mid-1990S. They were disappointed that they first learned about this major proposed redevelopment in the press and were unhappy that they had not been informed by the BCMM or ECDC at an earlier stage. Engagement with affected communities needs to be greatly improved in order to comply with government’s commitment to community participation in municipal planning, which is a cornerstone of the Municipality Systems Act No 32 of 2000.
REFERENCE LIST


APPENDIX A: INTERVIEW CONSENT FORM

Dear respondent(s)

This study forms part of the economic development research at the Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University in the field of Development Studies. The research focuses on the Community Participation in Urban Revitalization in the Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality (BCMM).

The purpose of both questionnaire and semi-structured interviews is to measure role of community participation in the Buffalo City Municipality Region. Therefore, in order for the research to be successfully, the researcher needs your own contribution by filling the close-ended question and semi-structured interview questions. The Information provided will be treated confidentially hence no name is required and the analysis will be group referenced.

Your opinion is valuable for the research and it will be significantly appreciated, so feel free to answer the questions. Findings of this research will be used for creation of employment opportunities and for the improvement of economic growth in Eastern Cape, especially for the Buffalo City Region.

Thank you for your anticipated cooperation

Yours sincerely

Student: Tandiswa Magwala

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me at 0733 604 405 or email me at s202347184@nmmu.ac.za.
INTERVIEW CONSENT FORM

UNIVERSITY OF NELSON MANDELA METROPOLITAN UNIVERSITY

FACULTY OF BUSINESS AND ECONOMIC SCIENCES

Department of Development studies

QUESTIONNAIRE: Community Participation in Urban Revitalization in Buffalo City

Date: 26 JUNE 2017
APPENDIX B: INTERVIEW QUESTIONS

Questionnaire:

You are kindly requested to participate in this interview. This information will be used to assess information about the role of community participation in urban revitalization in the Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality. A set of recommendations strategies on improvement can be implemented in improving the role of community participation in the urban development. All information given will be treated with confidentiality and anonymity and will only be used for the purposes of this study.

1. BIOGRAPHICAL INFORMATION

1.1 Gender

F [ ] M [ ]

1.2 Disability

Yes [ ] No [ ]

1.3 Age

25 - 34 [ ] 35 - 44 [ ] 35 - 44 [ ] 45 - 54 [ ] 55+ [ ]

1.4 Highest level of education.

No formal education [ ] Grade 7 [ ]

Grades 8-11 [ ] Grade 1 [ ] Tertiary [ ]

1.5 Are you working at present?

Yes [ ] No [ ]

1.6 If so, what is your main occupation?


1.7 Where is your place of work (name or town)


1.8 Have you ever been employed at one of the closed Dimbaza factories?

Yes [ ] No [ ]

1.9 If yes, what was reason for the closure or non-use of these factories?


2. COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION QUESTIONNAIRE *(Please mark in a box)*

2.1 Do you have any understanding about community or public participation?

Yes ☐ No ☐

2.2 If yes, have you ever participated in Buffalo City Municipality public meetings for development projects in your area?

Yes ☐ No ☐

2.3 If yes, please explain the topic(s) that was discussed at such municipal public meetings?

………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………

2.4 If the respondent does not specifically mention Integrated Development Planning (IDP) meetings or meetings that relate to the future of the abandoned/under-used factories

Two specific questions about these two topics, Integrated Development Planning:

2.4.1 Have you heard about Buffalo City Municipal Integrated Development Planning?

2.4.2 If yes, how did you hear about those meetings?

Public ☐ Local ☐ Local newspapers ☐ Local radio ☐ Other ☐ means of communication ☐

2.4.3 Do you understand about Buffalo City Municipality IDP all about? *(Please elaborate)*

………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
APPENDIX C: ETHICS CLEARANCE

ETHICS CLEARANCE FOR TREATISES/DISSERTATIONS/THESIS

Please type or complete in black ink

FACULTY: BUSINESS STUDIES & ECONOMICS

SCHOOL/DEPARTMENT: BUSINESS STUDIES: DEVELOPMENT STUDIES

I, (surname and initials of supervisor) MAJWALA T

the supervisor for (surname and initials of candidate) SAUNDERS E

__________________________ (student number) 8202347184

a candidate for the degree of M.A. DEVELOPMENT STUDIES


COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN URBAN REVITALIZATION IN BUFFALO CITY

considered the following ethics criteria (please tick the appropriate block):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YES</th>
<th>NO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Is there any risk of harm, embarrassment of offence, however slight or temporary, to the participant, third parties or to the communities at large?</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Is the study based on a research population defined as ‘vulnerable’ in terms of age, physical characteristics and/or disease status?</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Are subjects/participants/respondents of your study:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Children under the age of 18?</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) NMMU staff?</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) NMMU students?</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(d) The elderly/persons over the age of 60?</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(e) A sample from an institution (e.g. hospital/school)?</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(f) Handicapped (e.g. mentally or physically)?</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

61
3. Does the data that will be collected require consent of an institutional authority for this study? (An institutional authority refers to an organisation that is established by government to protect vulnerable people)  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Answer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Are you intending to access participant data from an existing, stored repository (e.g. school, institutional or university records)?</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Will the participant’s privacy, anonymity or confidentiality be compromised?</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are you administering a questionnaire/survey that:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Collects sensitive/identifiable data from participants?</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Does not guarantee the anonymity of the participant?</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Does not guarantee the confidentiality of the participant and the data?</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(d) Will offer an incentive to respondents to participate, i.e. a lucky draw or any other prize?</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(e) Will create doubt whether sample control measures are in place?</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(f) Will be distributed electronically via email (and requesting an email response)?</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note:  
- If your questionnaire **DOES NOT** request respondents’ identification, is distributed electronically and you request respondents to return it manually (print out and deliver/mail); **AND** respondent anonymity can be guaranteed, your answer will be NO.  
- If your questionnaire **DOES NOT** request respondents’ identification, is **distributed via an email link and works through a web response system (e.g. the university survey system)**; **AND** respondent anonymity can be guaranteed, your answer will be NO.

Please note that if ANY of the questions above have been answered in the affirmative (YES) the student will need to complete the full ethics clearance form (REC-H application) and submit it with the relevant documentation to the Faculty RECH (Ethics) representative.

and hereby certify that the student has given his/her research ethical consideration and full ethics approval is not required.

SUPERVISOR(S) ___________________________ DATE ___________________________

HEAD OF DEPARTMENT ___________________________ DATE ___________________________

STUDENT(S) ___________________________ DATE ___________________________

Student(s) contact details (e.g. telephone number and email address):

080835920 (20234784@nmu.ac.za)  

Please ensure that the research methodology section from the proposal is attached to this form.
APPENDIX D: PHOTOGRAPHS

Figure 1: Dimbaza Industrial Area: Unused factory used to keep livestock

[Image: https://www.dailypedestrian.co.za, 29 August 2018]

Figure 2: Private school in the old factory in Dimbaza Industrial Area

[Image: ]
Figure 3: Abandoned factory in Dimbaza industrial area

Figure 4: Abandoned factory in Dimbaza. Unused to keep livestock