EXPLORING THE IMPACT OF TEACHING MUSIC WITHIN THE CREATIVE AND
PERFORMING ARTS SUBJECT IN SELECTED UPPER PRIMARY SCHOOLS IN
BOTSWANA

by

KHO LISANI MOSWATE

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Magister Musicae Educationis in the Faculty of Arts at

Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University

November 2011

SUPERVISOR: Dr Zoliswa Twani
I, Kholisani Moswate, declare that this scholarly research represents my own original work. It is being offered here for the first time and has not been submitted in any other form. All sources used and quoted have, to the best of my knowledge, been properly acknowledged in the text and by means of references.

Author: _______________________________ Date: __________________________

K. Moswate
DEDICATION

This research study is dedicated to my late mother Meya Mojiwa who inspired and always reminded me that education is the gift that no one will ever take away from me. I will also surely, pass this wisdom to my children as they are a reward from the LORD.

I trust in You, O LORD; “You are my God.”

Kholly
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My sincere gratitude and appreciation is extended to a number of people who have played a significant role in the completion of this research:

1. My supervisor, Dr. Z. Twani for her scholarly supervision, enthusiasm, patience, complimentary opinions and for her perceptive guidance in all aspects of this study.

2. Dr M. S. Mengwe for his profound influence, kindness towards the outcome of my research and Dr V. Musara, my mentor for supporting the completion of the research proposal.

3. Ms. Jennalee Donian, the external language editor for her professional services and Dr N. Mabovula of Walter Sisulu University for her constructive criticism of my work.

4. The Government of Botswana and the NMMU Research Capacity Development unit for their generous support for funding this research for two years.

5. The Botswana Department of Education authorities of Francistown and North-East inspectorial areas for granting me permission to conduct the research in the schools under their jurisdiction. Also my gratitude goes to the school heads and teachers who shared their valuable knowledge and experience on the teaching of music within the Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA) subject. Without their participation my research would not have materialised.

6. The NMMU statistics department, particularly Dr J. Pietersen who helped analyse the quantitative data of the study and the NMMU Writing Centre for the corrections and advice on language usage and writing style.

7. To my husband, Bushy Moswate and my children - Tino, Matlhogonolo, Ofentse and Bose, who patiently understood, encouraged and wished me the best in completing the degree. Bushy, you are a darling for keeping the fires burning and providing warmth to our beloved children.

8. Members from my two families: Mojiwa and Moswate for their continuous support and encouragement during my study.

9. More importantly, I give glory to God for taking care of me and sustaining my health to the realisation of this dream.
The introduction of Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA) in the school curriculum is one of the changes brought about by the educational reforms in Botswana’s education system. Fullan (2005:42) observed that “any educational change becomes a reality when it is implemented with the involvement of the key role players.” In the case of my research, the primary school teachers and school management teams are the key role-players. This research was, therefore, conducted to explore the impact of teaching music within the CAPA subject as one of the changes brought about by the educational reforms in Botswana upper primary schools. I have found the phenomenological design appropriate for my research. Babbie and Mouton (2009:28) explain this paradigm as emphasising that “human beings are engaged in the process of making sense of their lives and that they continually interpret, create and give meaning to, define, justify and rationalise their actions.” In collecting and analysing data, a mixed method of quantitative and qualitative approaches was used to explore trends regarding the teachers’ perceptions, views, emotions, feelings, experiences and preparedness for the introduction of the CAPA subject.

Questionnaires from 30 sampled participants were used to gather quantitative descriptions, while narratives from journals of three randomly selected participants helped obtain qualitative data. The findings of the research are presented and discussed according to at least five broad themes. The results reveal that, the implementation, training and teaching of CAPA were fraught with problems, challenges and difficulties. Although the teachers are willing and determined to teach the subject, they are struggling with integrating the eight subject fields within CAPA. Such findings confirm what other scholars like: Alter, Hays and O’Hara (2009); Hallam, Burnard, Robertson, Saleha, Daviesc, Rogers and Kokatsaki (2009) and Goodlad (2004) contend that, integrating many subject areas within one is ineffective. The study concludes with a number of suggestions and recommendations that might assist the ministry of education, CAPA authorities and teachers to strengthen the teaching of music within CAPA.
Key Words: upper primary schools; creative and performing arts; music teachers; learning organization; curriculum design; curriculum change, integration.
# LIST OF ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CAPA</td>
<td>Creative and Performing Arts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RNPE</td>
<td>Revised National Policy on Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NMMU</td>
<td>Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GET</td>
<td>General Education and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOE</td>
<td>Ministry of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSLE</td>
<td>Primary School Leaving Examination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RTI-HDC</td>
<td>Research Technological Innovation-Higher Degrees Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTC</td>
<td>Primary Teachers Certificate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPE</td>
<td>Diploma in Primary Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GS</td>
<td>General Studies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DECLARATION</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEDICATION</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

1.1 BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY .................................................................. 1

1.2 THE RATIONALE .............................................................................. 4

1.3 RESEARCH PROBLEM ........................................................................ 6

1.4 AIM, OBJECTIVES AND QUESTIONS ................................................... 6

1.4.1 Research aim ......................................................................... 6

1.4.2 Research objectives .............................................................. 6
CHAPTER TWO: THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK AND RELATED LITERATURE

2.1 INTRODUCTION ...........................................................................................................23

2.2 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK .................................................................................23

2.2.1 Personal mastery .................................................................................................27

2.2.2 Mental models .....................................................................................................28

2.3 THE EDUCATION SYSTEM IN BOTSWANA .........................................................29

2.3.1 Education reforms in Botswana ..........................................................................30

2.4 CREATIVE AND PERFORMING ARTS (CAPA) SYLLABUS ..................................34

2.5 INTERDISCIPLINARY TEACHING AND INTEGRATION .......................................39

2.6 IMPLEMENTATION AND IMPACT OF AN INTEGRATED LEARNING PROGRAMME .........................................................................................................................46

2.7 SUMMARY ..............................................................................................................51

CHAPTER THREE: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 INTRODUCTION .........................................................................................................52

3.2 RESEARCH DESIGN ..................................................................................................52
3.3 MIXED METHOD ........................................................................................................53
  3.3.1 Quantitative research approach .................................................................54
  3.3.2 Qualitative research approach ..................................................................55

3.4 METHODS OF DATA COLLECTION .................................................................57
  3.4.1 Questionnaires ..........................................................................................58
  3.4.2 Journals ....................................................................................................60

3.5 POPULATION AND SAMPLING PROCEDURES .............................................61
  3.5.1 Sampling procedures ..............................................................................61

3.6 DATA ANALYSIS .............................................................................................62

3.7 RELIABILITY AND VALIDITY .......................................................................63

3.8 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS ........................................................................64

3.9 SUMMARY .......................................................................................................65

CHAPTER FOUR: DATA PRESENTATION, ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION

4.1 INTRODUCTION ...............................................................................................66

4.2 DATA PRESENTATION .....................................................................................66
4.2.1 Presentation of quantitative data .................................................................67

4.2.1.1: Section A: Graphs .................................................................................67

4.2.1.2: Section B: Tables ..................................................................................69

4.2.1.3: Section C: Presentation of responses to open-ended statements:
implementation process of the CAPA subject ..................................................74

4.2.2 Presentation of qualitative data (Journals) ..................................................81

4.2.2.1: Implementation process of the CAPA subject ........................................81

4.2.2.2: CAPA syllabus expectations .................................................................81

4.2.2.3: Teaching of the subject CAPA and teaching of music within CAPA ....82

4.3 SUMMARY .................................................................................................88

4.4 DISCUSSION OF THE FINDINGS ...............................................................88

4.4.1 Theme 1: CAPA syllabus expectations ....................................................88

4.4.1.1 Planning for the subject ...........................................................................89

4.4.1.2 Integration of the CAPA disciplines ......................................................91

4.4.2 Theme 2: Classroom practice ...................................................................92

4.4.2.1 Content knowledge of CAPA subject areas ..........................................92
CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSION, SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................104

5.2 SUMMARY OF THE STUDY ......................................................................................104

5.2.1 Botswana Education System and introduction of CAPA ..................................104

5.2.2 Theoretical framework and methodology ..........................................................105

5.2.3 The results .........................................................................................................106

5.3 RECOMMENDATIONS ..........................................................................................108
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY

In exploring the impact of teaching music within the Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA) subject in the upper primary schools of Botswana, it is important that I provide a historical perspective on the education system of Botswana along with its designed curriculum for the upper primary schools. The description on the segmentation and the curriculum of the sampled schools is detailed in the methodology section, which I will discuss later. I begin by explaining the location of Botswana and providing a brief historical mapping of the education system from 1966, post-independence.

Botswana is an independent country in the southern hemisphere of Africa, with a population of about 2,065,393 Batswana. Historically, it was one of the British colonies until it gained its independence in 1966. The country inherited a “poorly developed education system” (Kamau, 2008:184) with teachers drawn mainly from the neighbouring countries like South Africa and Zimbabwe. There were very few, if any, trained “indigenous” teachers at all levels of education (Kamau, 2008:184). The greatest challenge then, was to train manpower of Botswana nationality and build schools within the shortest time possible. Thus, the government of Botswana established the Ministry of Education to focus on educational issues such as the designing and implementation of the curriculum, while urgently addressing the training of the needed national manpower (Republic of Botswana, 1993: ii).

The Ministry of Education, established with a specific mandate and focus of addressing educational concerns in the country, conducted a review of the education system through the First National Commission on Education of 1977. After 15 years of

1 In the context of my study the word “indigenous” refers to Botswana citizens in the teaching profession.
establishment, the commission found that the society and the economy evolved in new directions and that there was greater demand for further developments regarding attitudes, skills and abilities. Despite this pressure on socio-economic development, the education system had been found to be very slow in responding and producing the quality of education needed by the state to satisfy the escalating demands (Republic of Botswana, 1977:1). The slow turnover of the first commission resulted in the establishment of the Second National Commission on Education of 1993 (Republic of Botswana, 1977:1). This commission was mandated to make recommendations to the Government with particular emphasis on a number of educational aspects, such as: universal access to basic education; vocational education and training; preparation and orientation towards the world of work; and re-examination of the system education, particularly articulation from one level to another (Republic of Botswana, 1993: ii). Since the establishment of these two commissions, the education profession in Botswana has “developed significantly, with the education system expanding and striving to improve quality at all levels” (Mautle & Weeks, 1997:340). One of the recommendations of the second commission, which directly relates to my research, was the grouping and combining of practical subjects to form one umbrella subject, as in the case of the Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA) subject (Republic of Botswana, 1994:17).

Creative and Performing Arts is one of the eight subjects offered in upper primary schools in Botswana and is a non-examinable subject. CAPA was introduced in Botswana’s primary schools in 2002, leading to changes in the syllabi. It was designed to meet the requirements of the Revised National Policy on Education (RNPE) of 1994 (Republic of Botswana, 1994) with a specific mandate for teachers to “facilitate project teaching and integration” (Ministry of Education, 2002:1). According to the recommendations of the National Commission on Education of 1993, that drew up the RNPE of 1994, the packaging of CAPA for the upper primary schools included diverse areas, thus drawing content from the following: Music; Art and Craft; Physical Education; Design and Technology; Home Economics; Business Studies; and Dance and Drama (Ministry of Education, 2005:11). According to the syllabus of the Ministry of Education (2005:11) the CAPA subject seeks to help learners to:
1. Develop creative, aesthetic, psychomotor skills and love for the arts;
2. Develop an understanding and appreciation of technology, and manipulative skills;
3. Acquire basic knowledge, practical skills and self-expression, as well as familiarity with tools, equipment and materials.

It was also envisaged that CAPA would offer learners “suitable time to acquire generic and specific skills in designing, performing and comprehending, whilst using a wide variety of materials and processes” (Ministry of Education, 2005:11). In the next chapter of this treatise I discuss in some depth further details relating to the purpose and provisioning of the subject as outlined in the upper primary school syllabus. However, suffice to note that the CAPA syllabus expectations are guided by the associated policy guidelines such as: principles, organisation of the syllabus, assessment procedures and attainment targets for effective teaching and learning of the subject in Botswana. The upper primary school syllabus is divided into units with topics, and the topics have general and specific objectives to be used by the teachers to prepare for their teaching lessons. These objectives describe clearly what the learners are expected to achieve at the end of their studies.

Through reading the Botswana educational documents and other Botswana scholars' research on the implementation of CAPA in Botswana primary schools, I developed an interest in exploring the impact of teaching music within CAPA and ascertaining its impact on teacher’s perceptions, morale, and preparedness to teach the subject. My approach to this research was influenced by previous studies on the teaching of CAPA in Botswana that similarly focused on CAPA as a learning area for the teaching of other subject areas within CAPA but not necessarily on the teachers’ perceptions about this phenomenon. For example, Phuthego (2007) evaluated the integration of the indigenous musical arts in the CAPA syllabus and the implementation thereof in the lower primary schools curriculum. My investigation differs from Phuthego’s on two aspects: firstly, his research looked into music in lower primary schools in Botswana
which has six subject areas, while CAPA in upper primary schools (which is the focus of my study) has eight.

Secondly, Phuthego (2007) evaluated the integration of indigenous musical arts in the CAPA syllabus, whereas I am exploring the impact of teaching music within CAPA and teachers’ perceptions thereof. The one similarity between the two investigations is that both are addressing music teaching within the context of CAPA. Other studies dealing with CAPA in Botswana, investigated other subject areas within the broader subject, such as Moalosi and Molwane (2008) investigating challenges facing teachers in the teaching of design and technology education in Botswana primary schools, and Mannathoko (2009) interpreting the new lower primary art and craft component of CAPA.

Scholarships such as Dodd (2008), Terada (2008) and Parks (2010) investigation of the teaching of music in other countries abounds but the closest scenario to that of Botswana in the teaching of music within the Arts and Culture learning area in South Africa. In the South African context the Arts and Culture learning area is a name given to an examinable subject in the General Education and Training (GET) band that combines four art forms, namely music, drama, dance and visual arts (Mbeshu, 2010). The similarity lies in the combination of music with other art forms (subject areas), which is expanded in the case of CAPA in Botswana, with other non-art forms. Other significant research studies in various parts of the world deal specifically with music education which is outside the focus of my research. A more detailed literature on the teaching of music as an integrated subject is provided in Chapter Two.

1.2 THE RATIONALE

My interest in conducting this research stems from studies undertaken on Botswana’s current education system which reveal that the CAPA syllabus has brought new challenges with which the teachers have to contend (Phuthego, 2007:ii; Moalosi & Molwane, 2008:27; Mannathoko, 2009:25). In view of the challenges that CAPA
teachers are faced with, my study sought to investigate the phenomenon in order to understand the effect that teaching music within CAPA and CAPA itself has on teachers in the upper primary schools of Botswana. CAPA is a non-examinable syllabus containing eight subjects as earlier observed.

It should be noted that the recommendations of the RNPE of 1994 on the basic education programme were intended to continually evolve to reflect new needs and directions for Botswana, including the use of a variety of teaching and learning strategies in place for the CAPA teachers (Republic of Botswana, 1994). However, Phuthego (2007:i) contends that there are currently limitations caused by the teachers’ shortcomings in terms of appropriate teaching approaches and their vague understanding of the main concepts that they should master. In addition, Phuthego (2007: ii) argues that teachers are unable to integrate the content of music and physical education due to a lack of knowledge and competencies on their part. Moalosi and Molwane (2008:33) concur that the CAPA primary school teachers were never given an opportunity to voice their opinions in the development of the CAPA curriculum. Thus, the implementation of CAPA is hampered by the absence of appropriate resources and facilities, as well as the necessary support in the form of needs-oriented in-service training. Furthermore, these studies reveal challenges surrounding integrated teaching and learning within CAPA in Botswana’s upper primary schools. The challenges discussed above and my awareness of the learning organisation of practical subjects like music at colleges of education (since I am currently a college music lecturer), where teachers are trained, generated my interest in investigating the impact of teaching music within the context of CAPA.

Having read and comprehended the policy and other Botswana educational documents on the implementation of CAPA in primary schools in Botswana, as earlier mentioned, I hope that the results of the research would assist in the decision-making processes on issues relating to the teaching of music under the subject and syllabus of CAPA in upper primary schools in Botswana. In addition, this research is likely to offer an
opportunity to critically engage in debates on alternative approaches to the teaching of music within CAPA.

1.3 RESEARCH PROBLEM

Music in Botswana is integrated with seven other subject areas to form one umbrella subject, the Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA), a phenomenon which trainee teachers that I am involved with have often complained about because of the many subject areas combined together. Authors such as Alter, Hays and O’Hara (2009) have indicated that integrating many subject areas within one is ineffective. The feasibility of offering music as one of the eight subject areas within a single non-examinable subject CAPA, the implications this has for the preparedness and morale of the teachers and the teaching and learning of the subject prompted this investigation.

1.4 AIM, OBJECTIVES AND QUESTIONS

1.4.1 Research aim

The research aimed at exploring the impact of teaching music in the context of the CAPA subject in Botswana’s selected upper primary schools and to suggest alternative approaches to teaching and learning strategies to suit the CAPA curriculum and learning outcomes, based on teachers’ perceptions and experiences.

1.4.2 Research objectives

Arising from this all-embracing aim were the following more specific objectives that buttressed the study:

1. To explore the perceived impacts that teaching music within CAPA has on the teachers;
2. to investigate the teachers’ experiences in teaching music as an integrated part of CAPA;
3. to examine the possible challenges that the music teachers are faced with in teaching music within CAPA;
4. to make recommendations based on the teachers’ perceptions about teaching music within the context of CAPA, the challenges they are faced with in integrating music with other CAPA subjects and the possible impact that teaching music within CAPA has on them.

1.4.3 Research questions

The study had one research question with three subsidiary questions, namely: What impact does the teaching of music within CAPA have on the teachers?

1.4.3.1 Sub-questions

1. What are teachers’ perceptions regarding the teaching of music within CAPA?
2. Do the music teachers experience any challenges in integrating music with other CAPA subjects?
3. How do the teachers handle the challenges of teaching music within CAPA?

1.5 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK AND RELATED LITERATURE

The conceptual ideas and literature on which the treatise is framed emanates from theoretical-based and evidence-based literature, as will be extensively discussed in Chapter Two of the dissertation. In exploring the impact of teaching music within CAPA and the way in which the subject itself is organised in the upper primary school setting in Botswana, I drew ideas from Senge’s (1990) critical theory perspective of learning organisations which are hinged on five disciplines: personal mastery, mental model, shared vision, team learning and system thinking. Two such disciplines, namely
personal mastery and mental models seem to occupy centre stage in my research, although the other three are also applicable but to a lesser extent.

Senge’s principle of personal mastery and the mental model largely focuses on the teachers’ perceptions and experiences about what they do and where they want to be in the future. Senge (1990:139) posits that personal mastery is about how people continually learn from their experiences and think about the mapping out of their future (vision), regarding the mastery of the task they are undertaking for proficiency and development in a particular environment. Senge’s principle of the mental models also suggests a futuristic plan that an individual imagines in his mind and then strives to achieve. Both these notions relate to how individuals and groups of individuals articulate their views, experiences, feelings and perceptions to influence their development, and how they collaborate, think, and work together as a team in bringing about positive change to situations in which they are involved. In the case of CAPA, for example, policymakers, teachers, learners, parents and other stakeholders in the schooling system could collaborate in coming up with plans, ideas and views on how CAPA can be successfully developed to embrace policy imperatives. It is in this regard that my research significantly drew on Senge’s theory in exploring the teachers’ views, experiences, feelings and perceptions for making the teaching and learning of CAPA, and more specifically, music, sustainable and successful as expected by the Botswana Ministry of Education.

Policy documents on education system and curriculum reforms in Botswana since 1993 are other relevant literature that I have found useful in addressing the problem of my research. The rollout of CAPA through the work and recommendations of the National Commission on Education of 1993 that drew up the Revised National Policy on Education (RNPE) of 1994 also played a major role. The recommendations of the commission resulted in the packaging and implementation of CAPA in the upper primary schools as a non-examinable subject that includes and combines diverse areas drawing content from: Music; Art and Craft; Physical Education; Design and Technology; Home Economics; Business Studies; Dance and Drama (Ministry of Education, 2005:11).
I also investigated literature on curriculum design and curriculum change, generally and in Botswana specifically, which provided insight into how such aspects impact on the teaching and learning of any subject, including CAPA. One example of this might be the gaps that exist between curriculum expectations and the implementation of CAPA in the classroom which brings about change in the system. Fullan (1993; 2003; 2005) outlines a variety of contexts in which changes may have a negative effect on the implementation process. One such example might be the lack or distorted understanding of the organisation structure and culture, on the part of those in charge of the implementation efforts. Other related theoretical and evidence-based literature on aspects such as implementation, integration and curriculum changes in education are comprehensively discussed in Chapter Two.

1.6 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This section focuses on the methodology aspects which include research design, research approaches, population sample and sampling procedures, data collection and analysis methods.

1.6.1 Research design

A research design is “a plan or blueprint of how you intend conducting the research, and it focuses on the end-product” (Babbie & Mouton, 2009:74). It therefore provides an idea of how the research is laid out, what happens to the subjects, and which methods of data collection are used. Mouton (2001:55) concurs that “a research design can be seen as a sketch of how the research will be conducted.” De Vaus (2005:9) on the other hand, contends that a research design is a structure before data collection or analysis can commence and not just a work plan. A work plan details what has to be done to complete the project but the work plan will flow from the project's research design, the function of which is to ensure that the evidence obtained enables us to answer the initial question as unambiguously as possible.
The research design for this study is a phenomenological one since it focuses on perceptions, experiences and understanding of the research participants. This is confirmed by Fer (2004:562) who explains that:

[…] phenomenology focuses on understanding the nature of reality through people’s experiences via subjectively constructed processes and meanings. The phenomenological approach emphasises the subjective processes of the situation.

I found this design suitable for my study because participants described and interpreted their perceptions, feelings, views and experiences to show their understanding of the teaching of music within CAPA. In addition, Leedy (1997) declares that phenomenology seeks to understand a person’s or persons’ perceptive as he/she or they experience and understand an event, relationship, programme and emotions. To this end Babbie and Mouton (2009) posit a phenomenological approach as research based on the innermost of human perceptions. The paradigm was used to determine what the experiences of the music teachers within CAPA as research participants meant to them, as they provided comprehensive descriptions and explanations of their experiences.

In explaining the two-fold nature of my research, I draw ideas from De Vaus (2005:1) who suggests that social researchers ask two fundamental types of research questions:

1. What is going on (descriptive research)?
2. Why is it going on (explanatory research)?

My research is therefore, descriptive and explanatory as it focuses on interpreting trends, participants’ views, experiences, feelings and perceptions about teaching music within CAPA. De Vaus (2005:1) argues that good description is fundamental to the research enterprise and that it has added immeasurably to our knowledge of the shape and nature of our society as it encompasses much government sponsored research, including the collection of a wide range of social indicators, patterns and the like. In the
light of this argument, descriptions can be concrete or abstract and according to De Vaus (2005:1-2), alternatively, accurate descriptions have historically played a key role in social policy reforms. By demonstrating the existence of social problems, like the positive or negative impact of teaching music within CAPA, competent descriptions can challenge accepted assumptions about the way things are and can provoke action.

Good description, in turn, provokes the ‘why’ questions of explanatory research where researchers are forced to ask ‘why is this happening?’ But before asking ‘why’ we must be sure about the facts and dimensions of the phenomenon. In making choices about the research design for this study my focus was also on the ‘why’ questions. For example, it is one thing to describe the preferences, views, and experiences of CAPA teachers in Botswana, and to examine trends and impacts over time, but it is quite a different thing to develop explanations about ‘why’ the morale of teachers is as low or as high as it is, ‘why’ some teachers are increasingly successful and others not or ‘why’ the rate is higher in some places rather than in others. De Vaus (2005:2) asserts that the way in which researchers choose research designs is fundamentally affected by whether the researcher’s questions are descriptive or explanatory. In the case of my study, I believe it is both.

1.6.2 Research method

I begin by highlighting the difference between research design and method. De Vaus (2005:9) emphasises that research design is different from the method by which data is collected and that there is nothing intrinsic about any research design that requires a particular method of data collection. This research employed the mixed method approach to data collection and analysis to capture the best of both strategies and to uncover any unique difference that might not have otherwise appeared with a single method of study. The choice of the mixed approach of quantitative and qualitative strategies for data collection and analysis methods was influenced by the descriptive and explanatory nature of my research as discussed above. Although, for example, cross-sectional surveys are frequently equated with questionnaires and case studies
are often equated with participant observation, “data for any design can be collected with any data collection method […] how the data are collected is irrelevant to the logic of the design” (De Vaus, 2005:11).

As expressed above, quantitative and qualitative approaches were useful in this research to describe and explain the relevant phenomena and trends. Creswell (2005:39) asserts that the “quantitative approach is a type of an approach in which the researcher decides what to study, asks specific, narrow questions, collects numeric (numbered) data from participants, analyses these numbers using statistics and conducts the inquiry in an unbiased, objective manner.” On the other hand, the researcher also “relies on the views of participants, asks broad, general questions, collects data consisting largely of words (or text) from participants, describes and analyses these words for themes and conducts the inquiry in a subjective, biased manner” (Creswell, 2005:39), and here, qualitative approaches thrive.

According to Creswell (2003:15) both methods have some “limitations”. The mixed method is therefore “a way of neutralising the bias inherent in each method.” Neuman (2006) argues that despite the differences between quantitative and qualitative research, the two approaches should not be considered as oppositional but rather as complementary components of scientific and disciplined inquiry.

1.6.3 Data collection tools

Two data collection tools - questionnaires and journal narratives - were used to capture the quantitative and qualitative results. The two tools were combined in my study because of the possibilities each offered for this research. The questionnaires were used to survey and measure variables and to describe trends that could not be reflected by qualitative means. These were guided by closed and open-ended questions in a structured five-point likert scale questionnaire (Appendix A). The use of narratives related to the qualitative aspects of the research where journals were used to document participants’ perceptions, views, feelings and experiences. Clandinin and Connelly
(2000) argue that the narrative process enables the participant to begin to re-tell and reconstruct their lives and critically reflect on the conditions that constrained their actions and created difficulties, while Bleakley (2005) asserts that narrative inquiry takes stories as either its raw data or its product. The two methods were combined in my study because of the possibilities that each can offer for this research.

1.6.4 Population and sampling procedures

The population of my study is formed by the CAPA teachers from 18 selected upper primary schools in the northern inspectorial area of Botswana and I have purposively sampled 30 music teachers within CAPA. According to Maxwell (1997:87), purposive sampling is a type of sampling in which a particular setting, persons, or events are deliberately selected for the important information they can provide that cannot be obtained from other choices. I particularly selected these teachers because they were first cohort to experience and actually implement the teaching and learning of the new subject, CAPA. Some of the teachers were my former music students at College, while others were handpicked by the head teachers of their respective schools. A variety of other reasons for the selection of these teachers include the history, experience, and better understanding of the teaching of CAPA disciplines. It is these teachers who could combine the past, present and future on paper as a story. This is supported by Miles and Huberman (1994:34) who assert that purposive sampling is useful for accessibility and availability of research participants. For these reasons, this technique was advantageous because it was faster, less expensive and conducive to reach a larger population as advocated by Sandelowski (2000). This sample was large enough for the scope of this treatise as Burns (2000:85) explained that, with the quantitative approach, the sample size generally is large, “the larger the sample the better, because a large sample tends to have less error.”

Due to the use of the mixed method approach in this research, a further sample of three teachers was selected from the 30. The three participants were randomly picked through the blind draw or closed-eyes technique agreed upon by all participants.
Merriam (1998) explains that in using the qualitative approach the sample is usually purposive and small. Onwuegbuzie and Leech (2007) recommend that sample sizes in qualitative methods should not be too large because it is more difficult to extract thick and rich data, and also that sample sizes should not be too small because it will be difficult to achieve data saturation. The goal is not to generalise to the population of music teachers within CAPA throughout the country, but to obtain insights and trends about the phenomenon of the study. Thus, I opted to use a sample of three participants to write about their perceptions, views, feelings and experiences in teaching music within CAPA.

1.6.5 Data analysis

Due to the mixed method of quantitative and qualitative strategies used in my research, the results from both approaches were consolidated as presented in Chapter Four. Likewise, I combined quantitative and qualitative approaches in analysing the data to understand my research problem and achieve my goals. The quantitative approach helped me yield specific numbers that were statistically analysed and produced results with which I used to assess the frequency and level of trends. On the other hand, the qualitative approach provided rich actual words and expressions from the participants of the study. The approach also offered many “different perspectives on the topic and provided a complex picture of the situation” as advocated by Creswell (2005:510).

In analysing quantitative data, I used graphic representations of the numerical data to indicate representativity of thoughts, ideas, feelings and experiences about the phenomenon as derived from the questionnaires. This was systematically done following the sub-topics of the questionnaires in Appendix A. The presentation of the findings was transcribed in a continuous descriptive form and statistics were presented with the use of frequency counts and percentages in the form of diagrams such as bar-graphs, pie-charts and tables. Some of the sub-topics from the questionnaires were in turn, used as the “pre-set themes” (Taylor-Powell & Renner, 2003:3). Pre-set themes are words and phrases derived from the one data collection tool and re-appear in
another and are subsequently used by the researcher as sub-topics to give direction to the participants. The qualitative part of my research were narrations from the three participants used to provide descriptions of the participants’ stories, experiences and their impact on teachers, based on their recollections and statements about their own feelings and perspectives on the impact of teaching music within CAPA. The quantitative and qualitative data were then consolidated in order to understand the phenomenon in the proper depth.

1.7 DEMARCATION

This study was based in Botswana. Botswana is an independent country within Southern Africa. It is located at the northern end of South Africa and is also surrounded by Namibia, Zimbabwe, Zambia and Angola, as indicated in the map below:
Map 1: Indicates the location of Botswana in Southern Africa and the location of the study area (northern region) of my research.
There are 745 upper primary schools in Botswana and these are dispersed over ten regions as represented in the regional map above. One of the regions is the northern region which comprises this study. Map 2 indicates the primary schools in the northern region.

Map 2: Illustrates the study area (the used eighteen primary schools) in the northern region of Botswana.
The 30 participants involved in my research were sampled from 18 (six rural, six peri-urban and six urban) out of 60 upper primary schools in the northern region. I have chosen the northern region out of ten educational regions in the country since it has an appropriate mix of upper primary schools representing the rural, peri-urban and urban divide. The emphasis of the research was on the teachers' perceptions and experience and their ability to teach the integrated subject area using a variety of methods. Rather than finding fault with the curriculum and suggesting ways in which it should be amended, this study attempt to identify strategies, based on teachers’ perceived needs that will equip them to meet CAPA curriculum outcomes.

1.8 GENERALISATION

Polit and Hungler (1991:645) define the word ‘generalisation’ as the degree to which the findings can be regarded as comprehensive from the study sample to the entire population. I found generalisation to be useful in making judgments on my study about its comprehension, portability, accessibility, reliability, validity and its use in other contexts, other than the sampled population. This implies an understanding of how much the result can be applied to represent the group of music teachers within CAPA as a whole. The second point concerns truth-seeking and the determination of the results. Mejia (2008:1) stresses this point by saying that the results need to be generalised, so that they are useful for other contexts and situations, or even for policy-making on levels that go beyond the local, while Shuttleworth (2008:1) asserts that generalisation is an essential component of the wider scientific process. In his findings, Shuttleworth (2008:106) reports that in order to generalise, a number of considerations and observations must be made, such as:

1. The sample size must be as truly representative of the whole population as possible;
2. that time is a critical thing to be looked into as the behaviours can change yearly, monthly or even by the hour;
3. that the size of the group must allow the documentation to be safely extrapolated to an entire population.

Stake (1980) in arguing about generalisability of the results, asserts that some researchers may not have access to the same subjects, and if other subjects are used, results may differ. Subjects (respondents) may openly communicate with one researcher and remain distant with others. My aim was to produce research that could inform and enhance readers’ understanding, even with the knowledge that some differences in response may be experienced. The 30 teachers’ responses were thus used to generalise the information to refer to a larger population of music teachers in Botswana.

1.9 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

Babbie (2001:25) asserts that it is essential to keep ethical considerations in mind, as they affect decisions at all levels of the social research process. By this, Babbie meant that no harm, however unintentional, should be brought upon the research subjects. The trust of the participants should not be betrayed and their confidence should not be taken for granted. In conducting this research, I attempted to subscribe to the principles expressed in the code of conduct of the American Association for Public Opinion Research as stated by Babbie (1998:446). Thus I observed the following:

1. I exercised due care in gathering and processing data, taking all reasonable steps to ensure the accuracy of results.
2. I also obtained permission to conduct my research in schools from the Principal Education Officers, School Heads and the teachers as the participants.
3. In collecting data, I did not lie to the respondents or use practices and methods which abused, or humiliated them.
4. I have protected the anonymity of the participating schools and respondents (in presenting the data), and have also kept all information pertaining to the respondents confidential and anonymous by referring to them numerically.
1.10 THE CONCEPTUAL AND OPERATIONAL DEFINITION OF CONCEPTS USED

Mouton (1996:114) asserts that conceptualisation means defining the key concepts in the problem statement, while the operationalisation definition links the key concept of the problem statement to the phenomena to be studied. The following are the conceptual and operational definitions concerned in this study.

**Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA):** A group of practical subjects put together under one umbrella having related outcomes. These subjects are Music, Art and Craft, Design and Technology, Physical Education, Home Economics, Business Studies, Dance and Drama.

**Integration:** In the context of Botswana, integration refers to teaching, assessing, and practice of related practical subject areas as in CAPA subjects, with the aim of using them to enhance the understanding of related outcomes by combining practical subjects to form an umbrella subject CAPA.

**Learning organisation:** This is an organisation that facilitates the learning of all its members and consciously transforms itself and its context, emphasising that change should not happen just for the sake of change, but should be well thought out.

**Music teachers’ perceptions:** The idea, the belief, or the image that the music teachers have of the challenges in integrating music with other subjects within CAPA.

**Impact:** The powerful effect that the teaching of music has on the music teachers within the context of CAPA.

1.11 CHAPTER LAYOUT

This research study is divided into five chapters that address the aims and objectives that provide answers to the research questions, and the theoretical framework of the study.
Chapter One introduces the focus of the research. It provides a brief historical background of Botswana’s education system. The chapter includes the formulation of the research problem, the research aim and objectives, the research questions, and clearly states the research design and procedures.

Chapter Two covers the literature review regarding the theoretical framework of this study. It begins by looking at the theory that deals with perceptions and experiences in learning organisations such as schools. The chapter then proceeds to discuss the implementation of CAPA in Botswana’s basic education system with emphasis placed on the recommendations of the National Commission on Education. Included herein are the expectations of the upper primary school syllabus regarding the teaching and learning of CAPA.

Chapter Three explains the research design of this study. It provides a description of the methodology and research methods used to gather data. This chapter also describes how data was collected and analysed and also spells out the ethical considerations.

Chapter Four presents the research findings. The results are presented in continuous prose as well as in tables and graphs. The data presentation is followed by an in-depth analysis and discussion of the findings, with the theoretical perspectives provided in Chapter Two, offering a critical lens through which the research findings are ascertained and supported.

Chapter Five summarises the principal findings of the research and provides recommendations of ways in which the findings can be used to improve the teaching of music within CAPA in Botswana before a concluding statement is reached.

1.12 SUMMARY

This chapter is the orienting chapter of my research, presenting an overview of the study and rationale of the study, the problem statement, the aims and objectives of the
study, the research designs and ethical considerations. Its purpose is to introduce the readers to the topic of the research and to give a background of how the research came about and what I aim to do. In this chapter, I also briefly outline the theoretical framework and literature on which research ideas and argumentations were drawn. Furthermore, I briefly discuss the research methodology and concerns of the subsequent chapters. The next chapter (Chapter Two) focuses on an extensive discussion of the relevant theoretical framework and literature as it applies to my research of exploring the impact of music teaching in Botswana’s upper primary schools.
CHAPTER 2

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK AND RELATED LITERATURE

2.1 INTRODUCTION

In this chapter I discuss the conceptual theory and literature review on which the research is framed. I first present Senge’s (1990) theory of the five disciplines (personal mastery, mental models, shared visions, team learning, and systems thinking), which I discuss below and how it relates to my research. Secondly, I interrogate the policy documents to discuss the Botswana education system, the curriculum and the curriculum changes, the syllabus expectations for the CAPA subject (principles, assessment, delivery mode, purpose and envisaged outcomes) that brought about the organisation and teaching and learning of CAPA in the upper primary schools. Thirdly, I discuss literature on the principle of integration, the reasons (and how) the subject areas are combined, organised and expected to be implemented. Such ideas have implications on the integration and organisation of the CAPA subject areas. Finally, I discuss impact and perception studies and how these connect with my research on the perceptions of music teachers within the CAPA subject.

2.2 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

Theory is important to this study because it informs my methodological approach, as the framework for setting the scene for the study. Senge’s (1990) theory of a learning organisation takes centre stage in the research because it articulates how people continually learn and develop in order to improve situations and obtain better results. The theory suggests that learning organisations are innovated by the converging of five key disciplines: “personal mastery, mental models, shared visions, team learning and systems thinking” (Senge 1990:69). The mastery of these basic disciplines is seen as the dimension that distinguishes learning from more traditional organisations.
The five disciplines further help articulate the application of the theory in my research in that they seem to operate as technologies and processes through which people learn and develop in an organisation. In this regard, teachers could continually learn from their experiences, through collaboration, perceptions, ideals, teamwork, planning, discussions and suggestions on how best they could improve their practice for better results in schools as learning organisations. Such actions would do well to help CAPA teachers in Botswana upper primary schools to map ways on how best to teach the subject. This, among other things, could involve discussing the curriculum changes that took place in the Botswana learning organisations and how such changes were implemented as a result of the recommendations of the Revised National Policy on Education (RNPE) of 1994 and The National Commission on Education of 1993. The changes that took place within the Botswana educational system were, for instance, efforts to improve teaching and learning. For this reason, my research sought to explore the teaching of music within CAPA and how these impacted on the teachers.

Before discussing the theory, it is important that I define a learning organisation, how it operates and literature relating to it, as it also affects this study. Many scholars have given various definitions of a learning organisation. Senge (1990) defined a learning organisation as:

\[
\text{[...] an organisation where people continually expand their capacity to create the results they truly desire, where new and expansive patterns of thinking are nurtured, where collective aspiration is set free, and where people are continually learning to see the whole together.}
\]

Senge (1990:3) also emphasises the importance of “a group of people who are continually enhancing their capabilities to create what they want to create.” In this research, an organisation refers to schools where teachers continually learn from their experiences and from others by meeting as staff, coming up with ideas as individuals, discussing issues of concern and coming up with better ways of how best they could improve the teaching and learning of CAPA.
Senge’s learning organisation theory has been influential to other researchers like Prosser (2010:69) who defined a learning organisation as “an organisation skilled at creating, acquiring, and transferring knowledge and at modifying its behaviour to reflect new knowledge and insights.” This would be an organisation where members learn from each other, share knowledge, learn with and along each other, plan and construct knowledge together and finding alternative ways of doing things, thus adding to what they had. Smith’s (2001) definition, on the other hand, focuses on an enabling environment that will help teachers, as in the case of my research, realise the need and want to transform the nature of the environment in a well-planned manner for all to own and therefore, willingly and freely contribute to the process of change. Both scholars point to inherent transformations that are initiated by the members themselves. The essence of these definitions emphasise a change in thinking and ways of doing things, to improve practice and my research aligns to these ideals.

In explaining learning in an organisation Senge (1990:4) further argues that all people constituting the organisation have the capacity to learn despite the existence of non conducive environment of the structures in which they operate to reflect and engage themselves. In addition, Senge (1990) assumes that although people have the capacity to learn, they may lack the tools and guiding ideas to make sense of the situations they face. His theory provides the lens through which I have been able to investigate the implementation of CAPA, whether the teachers’ perceptions, ideas, experiences have been part of the construct and in which ways such ideals have been useful in implementing the CAPA curriculum. Also, the theory became central to my research since it guided me to uncover whether or not the schools, as structures in which teachers work, are conducive to reflection and engagement for implementation of the subject.

Inadvertently, curriculum implementation presupposes change and according to Senge’s (1990) theory, there are certain factors influenced by particular types of learning that prompt learning organisations to change. Firstly, there should be real
learning which gets to the heart of what is to be human since we are able to recreate ourselves, which applies to both individuals and organisations. Senge (1990:14) posits this learning as “survival learning and adaptive learning” for both individuals and organisations. Secondly, he contends that survival learning is necessary in a learning organisation, but that it should be accompanied by “generative learning”, which Senge (1990:14) explains as learning that enhances our capacity to create. Thirdly, according to Senge (1990), learning organisations need to understand what is happening outside the environment and produce creative solutions using the knowledge and skills of all within the organisation. Thus, according to Smith (2001), a learning organisation requires cooperation between individuals and groups, free and reliable communication, and a culture of trust. This is possible because “people are agents able to act upon the structures and systems of which they are a part” (Senge, 1990:69).

Consequently, all the disciplines outlined above are in this way concerned with a “shift of mind from seeing parts to seeing wholes, from seeing people as helpless reactors to seeing them as active participants in shaping their reality, from reacting to the present to creating the future” (Senge, 1990:69). As observed above, Senge (1990:23) created the vision of a learning organisation as anchored and defined by his five disciplines which centred on the notion that:

*We learn best from our experience, but we never directly experience the consequences of many of our most important decisions […] therefore in problem situations people focus on solutions than looking at actions that produce improvement over a long time.*

Seemingly, for the five disciplines to work there must be a “fundamental shift of mind” among the members in the organisation (Senge, 1990:373). According to Senge (1990:373), once the fundamental shift has occurred, people in organisations are able to continually expand their capacity and become learners for life. The shift occurs, relying heavily on the five key disciplines of “personal mastery, mental models, shared visions, team learning and systems thinking” (Senge 1990:69), as members of a
learning organisation interact, work together and influence one another on a daily basis and by sharing experiences. In Smith’s (2001) view, Senge’s five disciplines complement each other. The five disciplines are, therefore, a series of principles and practices that people study, master and integrate into their lives (Smith 2001). All these disciplines can be approached at one of the three levels of “practice (what you do), principles (guiding ideas and insights) and essence (the state of being those with high levels of mastery in the discipline)” (Senge, 1990:373). It should be noted that each of the disciplines is necessary to each other if people in the organisations are to learn for a vital dimension in learning. Having noted Senge’s advocacy about the inter-dependence of the five disciplines, this research is confined to two of the five disciplines anchoring the learning organisation theory, although I acknowledge and time and again refer to, the interactions that are generated by operations in the schools as learning organisations. I now explain and discuss the two disciplines I have used, namely, personal mastery and mental models.

2.2.1 Personal mastery

Personal mastery² “is the discipline of continually clarifying and deepening our personal vision, of focusing our energies, of developing patience and of seeing reality objectively” (Senge, 1990:7). In defining personal mastery, Senge (1990:142) explains that this is “how people learn continually from their experiences and map out their future (vision), regarding the mastery of the task they are undertaking for proficiency and development in a particular environment.” Personal mastery can work like a two-way mirror where the subjective and objective interface. Here, individual CAPA teachers can consciously and continually learn from their experiences, interaction with others and teamwork and aim to objectively achieve and improve the teaching of music within CAPA. Teachers could

---

² Senge, Kleiner, Roberts, Ross and Smith (1994:194) explain the term mastery as descending from the Sanskrit root maharajah, meaning greater. Through the centuries, in Latin and Old English, the meaning of mastery as domination over something else (I am your master) has endured. But a variation of the word evolved in medieval French: maitre, meaning someone who was exceptionally proficient and skilled a master of a craft. Mastery as the word is used today reflects maître, meaning the capacity not only to produce results. In mastery, there is a sense of effortlessness and joyousness. It stems from your ability and willingness to understand and work with the forces around you. Personal mastery teaches us not to lower our vision, even if it seems as if the vision is impossible.
learn better through mapping, planning and acting for development and growth as learning is a lifelong process. Personal mastery is about personal choices for an individual to live in a mode of continuous learning, where teachers individually learn and assess their current reality in relation to progressing toward their vision to find ways to fulfil their dreams to achieve their personal goals. Teachers should understand the syllabus requirements and expectations of the CAPA curriculum so that they can envision, through planning, how they can move forward and improve their teaching practices to keep interest in the subject at a high level.

2.2.2 Mental model

Mental model is one of the disciplines described by Senge (1990:8) as “deeply ingrained assumptions, generalisations, or even pictures and images that influence how we understand the world and how we take action.” Mental model suggests a futuristic plan that an individual imagines in his mind and then strives to achieve. In the context of CAPA, if each music teacher could learn to challenge each others’ ideas and assumptions, they can discover their inner thoughts and voice them out for discussion to enhance teamwork and collaborative improvements in teaching and learning. In addition, Senge, Kleiner, Roberts, Ross and Smith (1994:235) defined mental models as “stories which people carry in their minds, about other people, institutions, and every aspect of the world.” In this case, teachers might also introduce their experiential learning over time to change their mental models towards building shared mental models. They could come together and expose their thinking for open discussions on issues concerning the teaching of music within CAPA and CAPA itself. Furthermore, Senge (2000:68) affirms that people in organisations and even individually, continue to generate opinions, evaluate and re-evaluate and process ideas in their minds because they are trying to learn more about their situations, actions, their own and each other’s most deeply held attitudes and beliefs. Teachers can learn best from each other by reflecting on how they are collectively addressing problems related to their subjects, questioning assumptions and receiving feedback from their colleagues and from their practice. If the music teachers could learn to reflect, talk more openly, and make their
assumptions explicit, they can have more penetrating conversations and strategic discussions. Senge’s (1990) discipline of the mental models requires openness and honesty among teachers for them to develop better skills through critical thinking, discussion, practice, listening and inquiry.

The interaction through these two disciplines is very important for my research. With the two personal mastery and mental models, the CAPA teachers can see how parts and pieces of things happen, and how they can develop them by clarifying their thoughts, visions, mapping their future and deepening their thinking for effect. Senge (1990) and Smith (2001) include components such as: hierarchical relations, process flow, attitudes and perceptions, product quality, production, delivery, cash flow, customer service, research and development, decision-making processes, and many other factors. This discipline, therefore, draws on perceptions and experiences of people from different levels and functions in the organisation, providing diverse perspectives for improving the quality of thinking. The two disciplines call for teachers’ attitudes and willingness to do things differently, and have real commitment and passion to do things for improvement. In this vein, teachers should come together, communicate, share ideas and experiences, critically think about matters and situations as individuals and strive to obtain their targeted goals in the teaching of CAPA as schools. In using the learning organisation theory, I purported, among other things, to explore what teachers do to keep the learning of music within CAPA alive, how they imagine their practice in the future as well as explore their personal mastery and the mental models they have about how the teaching of CAPA impact on their lives. To do so, one should narrate how CAPA evolved within Botswana’s education system and how the evolution, particularly, the teaching of CAPA, is perceived by the teachers.

2.3 THE EDUCATION SYSTEM IN BOTSWANA

This section of the chapter focuses more on two national projects, the 1977 and the 1993 National Commissions on Education that brought about educational reforms and therefore, changes that focused the Botswana education system to what it currently is.
Educational reforms are about change, which also relates to Senge’s theoretical principles of a learning organisation which I discuss later in the chapter. However, prior to these two government reviews, it is important to highlight the historical aspects of the Botswana education system that led to the reforms.

2.3.1 Educational reforms in Botswana

Since 1963 the education system in Botswana was known as 7+3+2, which meant seven years of primary schooling from Standard One to Seven, three years in junior secondary (Form One to Form Three) and the last two years were spent at senior secondary (Form Four and Form Five) (Republic of Botswana, 1994:6). Leburu-Sianga and Molobe (2000:1) provide details on the number of schools and “indigenous teachers” who were in the system at the time when there were about “251 primary schools, only nine secondary schools, and less than ten indigenous Batswana teachers with first degrees in the whole country” (Leburu-Sianga & Molobe, 2000:1). This posed one of the greatest challenges faced by the government, namely to train manpower and build schools within the shortest time possible. Thus, the government of Botswana established the Ministry of Education whose principal role became the provision of skilled workers for all sectors of the economy as well as to equip learners with effective knowledge, skills, attitudes and behaviour to enable them to participate in a rapidly changing society (Republic of Botswana, 1994). In turn, the government, through the Ministry of Education, instituted the two National Commissions on Education of 1977 and 1993 whose mandate, amongst others, was the key focus area of providing trained personnel for all sectors by designing and implementation of a relevant curriculum, other than relying on the old 7+3+2 (referring to seven years of primary schooling, three years in junior secondary and two years spent at senior secondary) as inherited from the missionaries.

The first National Commission came into being through the directive of the then President of Botswana, Sir Seretse Khama, in January 1976, to report its findings within a year, hence it is known as the 1977 Commission (Republic of Botswana, 1977). It
included a number of international and local academics, parliamentarians from Sweden, Ethiopia, Swaziland, Columbia University, London University, Botswana government department senior officials, and representatives from donors and funders such as; Ford Foundation, Rockefeller Brothers Fund, African-American Institute, United Kingdom Ministry of Overseas Development, United Nations Development Programme/UNESCO (Republic of Botswana, 1977).

One of the major recommendations of this international profile of the National Commission on Education of 1977 (Republic of Botswana, 1977), was the establishment of the Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation within the Ministry of Education to provide leadership in curriculum matters. Consequently, this Commission formed the base for curriculum design and implementation through its recommendation that “The National Commission on Education Policy should be the main coordinating body and should regularly review progress towards plan and policy implementation” (Republic of Botswana, 1977:192).

Even before the work of the first National Commission of 1977 could be holistically implemented and finalised, there were a lot of other concurrent socio-economic developments nationally which necessitated changes in national policies and strategies in education and other sectors. Also, the change in the education system from the 7+3+2 to the proposed Revised National Policy on Education of 1994, 6+3+3 system, as stipulated by the National Commission on Education 1977, was another challenge (Republic of Botswana, 1977:18 & 1994:6). The proposed new system recommended six years of primary school (Standard One to Six), three years in junior secondary school (Form One to Form Three) and three years at senior secondary school (Form Four through Form Six). There were many difficulties to be encountered in changing to a 6+3+3 structure. Such difficulties would have affected the education system in two ways. Firstly, at the point of change, a double group of entrants to form one would be created (that is, the Standard Six and Seven learners). This group would strain the existing facilities of junior secondary schools for the three-year period that they remain
in the system, leading to arrangements such as double shifts or other special programmes (Republic of Botswana, 1994:6).

Secondly, there would be a problem of teacher supply, with a shortage of junior secondary school teachers but a surplus of Standard Seven teachers, not all of whom (primary teachers) could be converted to secondary school teachers (Republic of Botswana 1994:6). As a result of the above scenario, the 6+3+3 basic education system as recommended by the 1977 commission was never implemented. It was at this point that the government of Botswana realised that the socio-economic imperatives, within which the 1977 review took place, had greatly changed and therefore, there was need to review some of their policies and strategies for education development. In this way, the second commission of 1993 was set up. The second commission arose out of two major socio-economic and educational concerns in Botswana. More importantly, the time lapse between the first commission and the second one was of major significance: 15 years from 1977 to 1992. Of further significance, was the overarching view of “developing an education system that would see the country into the twenty first century” (Republic of Botswana, 1993:i). With these critical considerations, the second commission was constituted to review the education system, the education system goals and major problems, and to submit recommendations for improvements in education, to the government, which, amongst its recommendations, ultimately recalled the previous 7+3+2 basic education system (Republic of Botswana, 1994:1).

The second commission, comprising of 15 members, was again sworn in on 15 May 1992 by the former President, Sir Ketumile Masire. It included three external members from Germany, Malaysia and Singapore for international flavour and experience, and twelve local personalities such as: Local Minister and Permanent Secretary of Commerce and Industry; Directors and Managers from the Public and Private Sector such as; the Principal Education Officer (Training) from Ministry of Education, Botswana Technology Centre, Department of Architecture and Building Services, Department of Nursing Education, Department of Adult Education, Department of Civil Engineering Debswana Diamond Company and Subscription Manager and Buyer of Botswana Book
Centre (Republic of Botswana, 1993:ii). Its terms of reference required the commission to conduct a broad ranging view of the entire education system with particular emphasis on: universal access to basic education, vocational education and training, preparation and orientation towards the world of work, articulation between the different levels of the education system and re-examination of the structure. The work of the second commission was completed after 12 months of deliberations and consultations “with far-reaching financial implications because Batswana called for quality education” (Republic of Botswana, 1993: ii).

Currently, as the result of the two reviews, the education in Botswana is a ten year basic education system that follows a ten year programme of compulsory schooling, with the first seven years in primary and three years in junior secondary school. Within this arrangement the learners can exit school with a junior certificate and either proceed to two years of senior secondary school education or seek employment. With such changes it was envisaged that products from the basic education system would be equipped not only with knowledge but also with skills to survive and compete for the global market. Tsheko and Mogapi (2008) explain the purpose of basic education as to give the pupils knowledge and skills necessary in life and to give everyone an equal educational foundation. This means that today’s teachers do not require knowledge only but also skills and competencies to deliver the curriculum to meet the market needs by providing learners in the classroom with relevant survival and competitive skills. Thus, the government of Botswana established the ministry of education to focus on designing and implementation of the curriculum aimed at training the needed manpower.

Since the institution of these two commissions (the first National Commission on Education of 1977 and the National Commission on Education of 1993), the education profession in Botswana has developed significantly with the education system expanding and striving to improve the quality of education at all levels (Mautle & Weeks, 1997:340). The expansion of the education system through the commissions entailed changes in the curriculum from the primary level to High school education. For example, one of the improvements came with the new subject CAPA that was introduced to bring
together practical subjects some of which were not taught in schools before. Also, CAPA was taught at primary schools (lower and upper) as a merged subject that included various fields, practical and theoretical, with a view of bringing together theory and practice. Furthermore, practical subjects and financial skills within CAPA were integrated, where artistic and skills-oriented subject areas, like Music and the other arts and business studies were incorporated to improve skills competencies and prepare learners for the world of work. I discuss further changes and the introduction of CAPA into the primary school syllabus in the subsequent sections.

The extent of analysis of the issues led to comprehensive findings, conclusions and recommendations intended to guide future educational development into the next century and beyond and such analysis informed and guided Botswana’s curriculum development. As explained in the commission’s report, (Republic of Botswana, 1993:ii), one of the vital issues was the call for effective preparation of learners’ lives, citizenship and the world of work out of which is the recommendation that has purposed this study, namely, the inclusion of a number of practical subjects in CAPA such as Music, Art and Craft, Physical Education, Home Economics, Design and Technology, Business studies, Drama and Dance to form one big subject from lower to upper primary schools. As a way of fulfilling the goals and aims of this recommendation of the revised national policy on education, the CAPA primary syllabus was developed and implemented in 2002 (Ministry of Education, 2002 & 2005). It is also important to note that while CAPA is an integrated subject at primary school level, it is disintegrated at junior and senior secondary school level into single and separated subjects in which students can specialise in preparation for tertiary education and the world of work.

2.4 CREATIVE AND PERFORMING ARTS (CAPA) SYLLABUS

Following the recommendations of the revised national policy on education, the primary education programme has been split into two levels, namely lower primary (Standard One to Four) and upper primary (Standard Five to Seven). Thus, the current primary school syllabus is also divided into two: the lower primary and upper primary school
syllabus with the primary school syllabus running from Standard One to Four and the upper primary from Standard Five to Seven. As explained in the upper primary school syllabus, the primary school program blueprint guided the development of the upper primary curriculum. The upper primary level builds on the lower primary programme and forms a base for the secondary school one. Each of the two levels (lower and upper primary) has a syllabus that outlines the coverage depth and breadth of what the syllabus intends to provide in the teaching and learning environment (Ministry of Education, 2002:1 & 2005:11).

The primary school syllabus implied above all the emphasis of teaching the “basic concepts and principles of Music, Dance, Drama, Physical Education, Art and Craft, Design and Technology, Home Economics and Business Studies” (Ministry of Education, 2005:11). Learners’ skills, creativity, and performance are also of great importance as part of the long term outcomes. The objectives of these principles, concepts and skills overlap and call for the use of integrating activities to achieve them. According to the Ministry of Education (2005:11) it is intended that at the end of Standard Seven learners should have developed several skills and competencies which include the following:

1. Psychomotor skills in the use of materials, tools, instruments, equipment and implements.
2. The ability to compose, design and make products (e.g. art crafts and musical arrangements).
3. Competence in performing skills such as manipulative, locomotors, vocal and stability.

Basic skills, principles and concepts of Music, Dance, Drama and Physical Education are to be imparted to the learners so that they are aware of the possibilities of making a living in the world of arts. There is emphasis on skills development, creativity and performance in the arts subjects (Ministry of Education, 2002: ii & 2005:11). This emphasis emanates from the RNPE of 1994, in which it was recommended that
immediate initiatives should be taken to develop a syllabus for Art and Craft, Home Economics, Music and Physical Education (Republic of Botswana, 1994:17). A foundation on which the learners develop their skills as they climb their educational ladder in the schools need to be well built, because when the learners proceed to the higher levels of education they can choose to major in one of the CAPA subjects. Currently, the CAPA subject is included in the curriculum. This gives the teachers the opportunity to teach all the subjects within CAPA in a way that should enrich the learners’ theoretical and practical abilities. Klopper (2005:2) states that the “inclusion of music as an optional discrete subject in the education programme provides students with the opportunity to develop their innate music abilities.” He continues to say that it is important to have Music in the curriculum as Music can be used as a way of preserving and transmitting cultural heritage of Botswana. This is one of the changes that took place in the primary curriculum of Botswana. The lower primary school syllabus was designed to have six subjects while the upper primary school syllabus has eight subjects that form CAPA. The syllabus, according to the Ministry of Education (2005:11) could be summed up as follows:

1. **Music**: sound, rhymes, choreography, body percussion, pitch, duration, pentatonic scale, notes, types of notations, composers and artists.
2. **Art and Craft**: drawing, painting, collage, mosaic, montage, modelling, illustration, pattern making and print making.
3. **Physical Education**: sprints, throws, jumps, gymnastics, movements, invasion, contact games and exercises.
4. **Home Economics**: clothing and textiles, food and nutrition.
5. **Design and Technology**: materials, sculptures, dimensional crafts, structures, mechanisms, design and making processes.
6. **Business studies**: needs and wants, satisfaction of needs and wants, budgeting and business.
7. **Dance**: elements and traditional dance.
8. **Drama**: dramatization.
According to the syllabus, the above mentioned subjects were grouped in order to “develop an understanding and appreciation of technology, manipulative skills and familiarity with tools, equipment and materials” (Ministry of Education, 2005:11). An initiative has been taken to develop a framework for integrating all these subjects into the existing curriculum in 2002. The Revised National Policy on Education of 1994 reflects that:

_**CAPA was designed to incorporate a sound pre-vocational preparation through comprehensive and selected practical experience of the world of work; provide a foundation that enables individuals to cultivate manipulative ability and a positive work attitude and make optimum choices for further careers.**_

(Republic of Botswana, 1994)

The aim was to “provide quality basic education that is successful in developing fully productive Botswana citizens for the 21st Century” (Republic of Botswana, 1994). For these reasons the upper primary school CAPA syllabus was designed to have five modules with each one having a broad content area divided into units with topics. According to the Ministry of Education (2005:13) the topics have general and specific objectives that describe what the learners are expected to achieve and these are as follows:

1. **Health and Safety:** The module focuses on aspects of safety as well as principles of keeping healthy and fit. It also aims at introducing learners to the concept of food and nutrition. Learners will be exposed to the importance of exercise in relation to health.

2. **Communication:** This module seeks to develop an awareness and understanding of visual and written forms of communication. The objectives focus on the acquisition and application of knowledge, skills and techniques of different media used in visual arts.
3. **Composing and Performing**: This module centres on providing the learners with basic concepts and principles of music, dance, drama and physical education. The emphasis is on skills development, creativity and performance.

4. **Design and Production**: The aim of this module is to equip learners with concepts of design, principles of technology and the process of production through a problem-solving approach. Learners will also be exposed to the essence and importance of technology. This will be achieved through experiments and hands-on activities. Materials and basic making processes have been included to develop learners’ manipulative and fabrication skills.

5. **Entrepreneurship**: This module introduces learners to basic skills required to start and run a successful business. It places emphasis on finding out about business opportunities in their communities and the necessary steps they should consider to open up a business.

Based on the above modules and subjects which constitute CAPA, the syllabus emphasises certain attainment targets for CAPA (Ministry of Education, 2005:12-13), Table 2.1 below illustrates those attainment targets.

**Table 2.1: Attainment targets for CAPA.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attainment target</th>
<th>Description: At the end of upper primary education, learners should have:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge and Understanding</td>
<td>Acquire knowledge and understanding of: materials, tools, equipment, instruments, implements and processes in CAPA; acquired knowledge and understanding of production processes used in CAPA; acquired knowledge and understanding of own culture and others, and how they relate to CAPA; developed awareness of rules and regulations pertaining to CAPA; acquired knowledge and understanding of safety precautions in the use of tools, equipment, instruments, implements and materials; acquired knowledge and understanding of the elements, principles and concepts as applied in CAPA; acquired knowledge and understanding of ways of prospecting, procuring and improvising materials, tools and equipment; acquired basic knowledge and understanding of health needs and regulations in relation to producers, consumers and the environment; recognized factors that contribute to a healthy individual and environment; acquired knowledge and understanding of methods of conservation and preservation of the environment; and acquire problem-solving skills using design process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>Developed understanding, and use of the CAPA language; and developed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
understanding and appreciation in the use of verbal and non-verbal forms of communication.

| Practical/Manipulative Skills | Developed dexterity through working with materials, tools, equipment, instruments, and implements; developed practical skills in manipulating materials into useful products; and developed skills in the efficient use and management of resources. |
| Creativity | Developed creative skills through composing, performing, designing and making products; and developed a project from a simple theme or concept. |
| Attitudes | Developed awareness and appreciation of indigenous materials/activities; developed positive attitudes towards practical activities; developed a spirit of self-reliance; developed interpersonal skills through participation in teamwork activities; developed awareness and appreciation of the value of culture, beliefs and practices; and developed desirable attitudes towards health and safety practices. |

Thus, looking at the above description of the CAPA syllabus, the primary school curricular has since changed to address the emerging socio-economic issues as well as the global technological advancement. This change took place in 2002, when the CAPA syllabus was introduced. The implementation of the syllabus as described above proves to be giving teachers a problem. This is shown by data from the teachers involved in my research, which I talk about in detail in Chapter Four of the study. Data also revealed that the way the subjects integrated within CAPA and taught to college students (as also indicated in Section 1.2 in Chapter One), is different from how they are expected to teach CAPA in primary schools. In colleges of education, student - teachers specialise in any two subjects of their choice (whether they are inside or outside CAPA), and do two other subjects in the primary curriculum. Hence, the integration of Music with other CAPA subjects was one of the challenges if they did not specialise in the other subject.

2.5 INTERDISCIPLINARY TEACHING AND INTEGRATION

Interdisciplinary teaching and learning is described by Burton (2001:18) as “involving the interaction between two or more disciplines.” This may range from “simple communication of ideas to the musical integration of organising concepts, methodology, procedures, epistemology, data, and organisation of research and education in a fairly large field” (Burton: 2001:18). His ideas directly relate to the organisation of subject areas within CAPA where eight disciplines interact. While Burton describes what
interdisciplinary teaching and learning is, Ellis and Fouts (2001:23) see it as “a method for achieving outcomes on specified actions and conditions of learning the various disciplines.” I posit that CAPA, as an integrated subject, places emphasis on the interaction of a variety of disciplines that aim at creativity, subjective learning and achievement of practical competences, where skills development is the main focus.

Rhoten, Mansilla, Chun and Klein (2006:17) most appropriately concur with the previous scholars as they address the relevance of the interdisciplinary method in planning and teaching the arts subjects. They argue that this approach can be better suited to teaching the arts subjects as it engages learners in practical activities in which teachers from different disciplines work together on the schemes of work and lesson plans. This has implications on the planning of teaching and learning CAPA with its eight disciplines, where four arts disciplines (Music, Drama, Dance and Art and Craft) are integrated within themselves and across four other disciplines.

In addition, Burrack and McKenzie, (2005:45) explain that such a “cross-disciplinary approach attempts to encourage teachers to increase their understanding by working within each discipline to focus on concepts the disciplines share.” According to the Arts Education Partnership National Forum (2002:5), interdisciplinary learning “enables teachers to identify and apply authentic connections between two or more disciplines, and/or to understand essential concepts that transcend individual disciplines.” It is therefore important to expose the learners to interdisciplinary learning in order for them to identify and solve problems by engaging in activities that will require them to transfer knowledge gained from one subject to the other for processing of new information in other subjects. For example, form (referring to structure or shape of constructed matter), is one of the simplest concepts that transcends several CAPA subjects like Music, Physical Education, Art and Craft, and Dance, and it can be easily taught by using illustrations from various subjects as it cuts across several disciplines.

Lorimer (2009:10) believes that “by weaving the visual arts, music, dance, and drama into other content areas, interdisciplinary arts experiences have the potential to enhance
students learning in authentic and meaningful ways.” In relation to CAPA, such ideas as expressed above can bring together teachers who offer Art and Craft, Drama, Music, Physical Education, Design and Technology, Business Studies, Home Economics and Dance, to scheme, generate lesson plans and particular themes guided by outcomes from these subjects to achieve a common project that will reflect learners' understanding and application of concepts from the different disciplines as well as how they impact on each other. This in turn is likely to boost the confidence and self-esteem of teachers, thus, resulting in a positive change in the way they perceive the teaching of music within CAPA.

On the other hand, Snyder (2001:36) acknowledges that interest in inter-disciplinary learning came as a result of current research on “Brain-based learning”. According to Snyder (2001:36) the “brain-based learning” theory is based on the structure and function of the brain to which Snyder’s asserts that “as long as brain is not prohibited from fulfilling its normal processes, learning will occur”. The core principle of the learning theory is that the brain is a parallel processor, meaning it can perform several activities at once, like tasting and smelling. I theorise that through brain-based learning, learners’ education can improve if music teachers within CAPA, design learning around learners’ interests and make learning contextual, allowing them to learn in teams (as influenced by their interaction with others) and use prior, experiential and embedded knowledge, for example. Good results can also be achieved through encouraging learners to learn in settings outside of the classroom and the school premises, and assessing learners to help them understand their own learning styles and preferences. This way, learners monitor and enhance their own learning process.

In the same vein, Snyder (2001) relates this to Gardner's (1999) theory of the nine Multiple Intelligences, which he suggests should be treated independently of each other as individual people possess' different capabilities in specific fields of intelligence. Similarly, Natassa, Smaragda and Harris (2011) premise the interdisciplinary approach as hinging on Gardner’s (1999: 41-43) multiple intelligences such as: spatial, linguistic, logical-mathematical, body-kinaesthetic, musical, interpersonal, intrapersonal,
naturalistic and existential. I now briefly explain the applicability of selected multiple intelligences that are relatable and applicable to CAPA.

Spatial intelligence deals with spatial judgement and the ability to visualise with the mind’s eye. Gardner (1991) argues that careers which suit those with this type of intelligence include artists, designers, and architects. The inclusion of typical disciplines in CAPA where visualising with the mind’s eye is appropriate should aim to identify learners who are good in Music, Art and Craft and Design and Technology so that they concentrate on their capabilities and strengths in order to nurture them into future professionals. At yet another level, the core elements of the bodily-kinaesthetic intelligence are control of one’s bodily motions and the capacity to handle objects skilfully. It also includes a sense of timing, a clear sense of goal of a physical action, along with the ability to train responses so that they become like reflexes. People who have this intelligence learn better by involving muscular movement and are generally good at physical activities such as sports, dance and physical education. Careers that suit those with this intelligence include athletes, dancers, musicians, actors and physical educators, hence the grouping of these disciplines within the CAPA subject to promote such disciplines for the benefit of society. Musical intelligence, specifically, deals with sensitivity to sounds, rhythms, tones and music. People with this intelligence are able to sing, play musical instruments and compose music. They sometimes use songs or rhythms to learn. The concentration and inclusion of this aspect in CAPA from primary level will help produce professionally trained artists who are fully equipped with such knowledge and skills.

Interpersonal intelligence seems to be more generic and group targeting in its application as it is particularly about relations and relationships among different individuals in a group. It deals with interaction with others. People who have this intelligence are characterised by their sensitivity to others’ moods, feelings, temperaments and motivations and their ability to cooperate in order to work as part of a group. They communicate effectively and empathise easily with others, being either leaders or followers. They typically learn best by working with others and often enjoy
discussions and debates, a very important aspect for all disciplines in CAPA. Both teachers and learners need to possess the interpersonal intelligence for effective communication and interaction. In turn, naturalistic intelligence has to do with nurturing and relating information to one’s natural surroundings. The naturalistic intelligence will enable those involved with CAPA teaching and learning processes to be conscious of the environment, within which CAPA could be used to encourage locally manufactured instruments and materials. They will be able to teach society about the importance of environmental preservation. On the one hand, existential intelligence, which mainly focuses on spiritual contemplation and religious nature of existence, do not directly apply to CAPA, but have a place in it with respect to the teaching and learning of values in education.

While the intelligences discussed above are appropriate to most of the creative and expressive nature of the art disciplines in CAPA, logical-mathematical intelligence immediately speaks to Business Studies in CAPA and indirectly to other disciplines, hence the inclusion of the Business Studies in CAPA as an overarching focus. I theorise that logic abstractions, reasoning and dealing with numbers is a key factor in Business Studies. Its inclusion in CAPA may be necessitated by the need to approach teaching and learning in the subject from a project point of view, where calculations of finances and time effects, mapping and planning are essential. Biehler and Snowman (1997:176) assert that it is important to develop all these intelligences because each “individual is likely to exhibit different levels of skill in each of these domains” and this is very likely the desired effect for CAPA learners, to be all-rounder and to be effective in more that one of the eight disciplines.

The multiple intelligence theory poses an all-time important role of CAPA teaching and learning. That is, to give each of the disciplines under CAPA the attention they deserve in order to develop the different intelligences in the different learners. This puts the problem of the training received by CAPA teachers prior to taking up employment as CAPA teachers in Botswana upper primary schools into perspective. Also, the rationale of CAPA starting at primary school level becomes important in that at this stage all the
intelligences provided by the various CAPA disciplines individually and collectively, through an interdisciplinary approach and in an integrated fashion, need to be explored and developed amongst learners until they can master one or two at a higher level, for example, specialising in one at secondary level. According to Morin (2003:28) “interdisciplinary learning encourages a holistic approach to teaching” and involves integrating ideas about how the world works (content disciplines, for example, social studies and science) with ways to represent how we see and make sense of the world (sign systems such as music, language, art, mathematics and movement).

In addition, Morin (2003:28) marries interdisciplinary teaching and learning with integration as he continues to highlight the characteristics of inter-disciplinary learning as: integration and connection through broad themes; the use of disciplines as learning tools; authentic and collaborative learning experiences; expanded use of sign systems for making; sharing meaning and emphasis on social learning. In this regard, the integration of CAPA subjects may help learners identify their strong and weak areas to prepare themselves for the working world. Integration and interdisciplinary teaching and learning as mentioned by Morin (2003:28) “manifest themselves as useful tools that can be used interchangeably and to support each other especially that they are found with similar characteristics”. In this approach, a broad theme is chosen with the outcomes of all the disciplines planned together in a meaningful way that brings the subjects together. At the same time, as Snyder (2001:36) cautions, care must be taken that the “integrity of each intelligence should be maintained while critically thinking and applying such approaches”, as integration and interdisciplinary teaching and learning discussed above. In this scenario, the application and synthesis of ideas from one discipline to another is encouraged, leading to a deeper understanding and critical thinking through comparing and contrasting of ideas.

Just like in interdisciplinary learning, integration requires that a main theme be chosen and addressed by bringing together outcomes from different disciplines. In the context of CAPA, this can be made effective if teachers combine the content of each subject, like the message of a text (words) from a song or poem in CAPA, for example. If the
learners understand the meaning of the song, this meaning can be communicated through music, as in a song, recited in a poem, dramatised into a play that is also enacted through drama and it can be danced to. Also, they can understand the applicability of an unfamiliar concept and can understand it to be a similar construct in another discipline, as it applies to the various disciplines. For example, the concept of rhythm cuts across several disciplines and can be articulated musically, dramatically, in dance and art and craft. Learners can, in this case, use their understanding of rhythm (movement in time) from one discipline to another as a similar construct. This approach also helps teachers understand how one subject relates to another, therefore enhancing their planning and delivery of instruction.

In the quest to achieve a quality product under interdisciplinary learning, the most important thing is common planning which gives the teachers the opportunity to share ideas and help each other in areas with which they are not comfortable. When planning for interdisciplinary teaching, one should consider the following hints in scheming and lesson planning (The Consortium of National Arts Education Associations, 2002:5):

1. Making meaningful connections between disciplines since there are disciplines and outcomes that can be used together for a certain project but the same cannot be done with the others. Teachers can only use outcomes that can be combined together to come up with a good project. In identifying and applying meaningful relations between subjects, in-depth learning must be promoted by having learners use background knowledge from one subject to unravel and understand the problems in another.

2. Using high quality examples from the arts and related subjects.

3. Use appropriate terminology so as to avoid misunderstandings.

4. Incorporating the artistic processes (performing, creating, and responding) when teaching. Learners usually enjoy hands-on experience and it makes them feel they own the work. They should all be given the opportunity to express themselves as they learn differently, so Gardner’s theory of multiple intelligences should be applied.
5. Using portfolios assess each part of the main project at the time when the project is on-going. Give the learners time to critique and evaluate each other’s work, this is an easy way of giving feedback so that they improve on what they have already done. Comments written by other learners should be kept together with the projects in their portfolios. For the final evaluation invite other teachers from different disciplines or streams to assist with the evaluation. A presentation of one class can be done in the presence of the school mates or parents.

The interdisciplinary teaching and integration as described above guided me in designing the questionnaire categories used to gather information on how the upper primary CAPA teachers in Botswana integrate Music within CAPA.

2.6 IMPLEMENTATION AND IMPACT OF AN INTEGRATED LEARNING PROGRAMME

This section focuses on the implementation and impact of the integration of subjects into one by looking at case studies from other countries such as Britain, Australia, Hong Kong, Sweden and Norway. In this study, the three main words described are implementation, impact and learning programme. According to Vio (2002), “implementation is the carrying out, execution or practice of plan, a method, or any design for doing something.” As such, “implementation is the action that must follow any preliminary thinking in order for something to actually happen” (Vio, 2002). The American Heritage Dictionary (2009) defines impact as an “act of accomplishing some aim or executing some order. Learning programme is “a well defined package of study that consists of distinct components or modules where the emphasis is on the tailoring of the package to the individuals needs” (Nicats University of Ulster, 2002). The literature review on these case studies is important in my research as evidence to support my findings on the exploration of the impact of teaching music within CAPA.

Chan (2005:1) looked at the general studies (GS) core primary curriculum that integrates primary science, social studies and health education in Hong Kong. As
explained by Chan, an integrated curriculum provides wider and better learning outcomes than that from learning through separate subjects. The study also revealed that teachers perceived the existence of holistic learning relevant to learners’ lives, since there was development of problem-solving skills through innovation by learners. The study shows that the integration was successfully implemented. Although important to my study in terms of teachers’ perceptions about the existence of features of the curriculum and the gaps between the curriculum intention and the real classroom situation, the study did not explore the impact of the integration. Nevertheless, it gives my research a forward bearing in terms of exploring the existence of gaps within the CAPA syllabus expectations and the classroom practice. In addition, I looked at the impact such gaps (if any) have on the music teachers as well as how the teachers could bridge such gaps in an attempt to satisfy the expectations of the curriculum. The study is important because it, inter alia, concluded that the proponents of curriculum integration, including Cromwell (1989), Shoemaker (1989), and Marsh and Wills (1995), agree that a good integrated subject is able to achieve more aims than that from separate subjects.

Alter, Hays and O’Hara’s (2009) study is yet another significant work related to my study, as they looked at the challenges of implementing the integrated primary arts education in 19 Australian primary schools. This study revealed that the curriculum expected teachers to teach all the key learning areas comprising Drama, Music, Art and Craft. However, as explained in the study, “the expectation of creative arts teaching and learning was considered a rather unrealistic expectation, demanding a breath of knowledge and skills that most of the 19 school teachers felt they did not possess” (Alter, et al 2009:25). The study also revealed that the teachers considered it impossible, even for people specifically trained in the arts, to know and be competent in all teaching facets of the field. All these, according to the study, negatively impacted on the teachers’ confidence levels in relation to teaching in the four arts disciplines, particularly Music.
As explained in Chapter Four (Section 4.3.2) of this study, teachers felt least confident with Music and according to Alter et al (2009:26) “this was attributed to insufficient music training, the complexity of music as a subject, and their own perceived lack of talent in the subject.” Thus, the teachers involved in the study tended to avoid speaking about areas within the creative arts where they believed they did not have adequate skills and knowledge, with Music being the most avoided. Such an impact of avoidance is critical in my research, particularly when relating to the feelings, perceptions, views and experiences of CAPA teachers about integrating all the subject fields. The findings of this research are important for my study, despite the fact that it is particular to the Australian education context, because it confirms that when creative arts are integrated, there is an undeniable gap that exists between the expectations of the curriculum frameworks and the preparation in arts areas that can be provided by initial teacher education courses. I discuss this further in Chapter Four of the thesis. In addition, the study highlighted the integration of the four subjects that impacted negatively on teachers. Therefore, in my study, I explored the impact of teaching music within CAPA with the aim of finding ways of satisfying the CAPA curriculum content.

In a study closely related to mine, Hallam, Burnard, Robertson, Saleha, Davi, Rogers and Kokatsaki’s study (2009) in the United Kingdom, researched on teachers’ effectiveness in teaching music even though they dealt with trainee primary school teachers, whereas participants in my study are professional teachers, but the same level with the United Kingdom teachers. The importance of this study emanates from the fact that progress in engendering change in British schools has been slow because schools have prioritised other areas of the curriculum, resulting in Music remaining a low priority. This study went on to echo sentiments similar to those postulated by Alter et al (2009) that teachers lacked confidence in teaching music particularly if they are non-specialists. Thus, the logical conclusion is that music is not adequately taught because it is classified under the umbrella of the performing arts.

Therefore, as explained by Hallam et al (2009:223), it is possible that teachers may have no direct experience in teaching music despite the fact that teachers do a course
in teaching music during their training. Such conclusions are significant to my study because the music teachers teach Music within the context of CAPA yet when they are being trained the aspect of integration is not considered as earlier observed. Teachers may have the necessary music qualifications but teaching it within CAPA may have its own impact on them as music teachers. Thus, my study purports to explore the impact of teaching Music within CAPA to augment the rather limited information on CAPA, as well as make recommendations regarding the integration of Music within CAPA.

Hovland and Soderberg's (2005) paper on evaluating the practical and artistic school subjects in Sweden and Norway is another study relevant to my study. The importance of their research lies in the analysed relationship between the goals of the curriculum and the content of education, students’ satisfaction and the students’ activities in the practical and artistic subjects. According to Hovland and Soderberg (2005:2) in Swedish schools five practical and artistic subjects - Art and Crafts (Sloyd), Physical Education, Music, Health, Home and Consumer Studies are compulsory (but separated) for all pupils up to Grade Nine (junior secondary school level). Although these subjects are not combined into one subject (as in the case of CAPA in Botswana), they are a compulsory curriculum content from the lowest grade to Grade Nine. Just like in Botswana, the integrated CAPA subject, which includes similar fields as in Sweden, is a compulsory curriculum component from lower primary to junior secondary level. Similarly, in Norwegian schools four practical and artistic subjects - Art and Craft, Music, Home Economics and Physical Education are compulsory for all pupils up to Grade Ten.

The study by Hovland and Soderberg (2005:21) revealed that “some practical and artistic school subjects may have special problems in terms of teaching quality and teacher quality as well as in terms of formal teacher education”. In addition, the study revealed that some of the subjects, particularly Physical Education, for example, suffer huge problems in teachers’ competence since the teachers do not have time for students when they (the students) do not understand the concept. This work resonates with my study in so far as the way in which the CAPA teachers should adopt an interdisciplinary dimension in meeting the curriculum expectations.
Another interesting study was conducted by Goodlad (1983) on the “prerequisite for an integration and curriculum to function” (cited in Hovland & Soderberg 2005:7). Here, teachers’ understandings of the intention of the curriculum (the ideological curriculum) and their actions in accordance with the guidelines and principles of it (the formal curriculum) is the major prerequisite for a curriculum to function the way it was intended. In addition, Goodlad (cited in Hovland & Soderberg 2005:7) further asserted that it is necessary to know something about the “actual content of the teaching that takes place (the operational curriculum) in order to get a picture of what the students are supposed to learn.” I found Goodlad’s (1983) work useful to my research in that I explored the extent of the correspondence between the perceived and the operational curriculum through narratives written by the teachers on their perceptions of the curriculum (the perceived curriculum) and the actual education (the experienced curriculum).

In spite of the evidence suggested by the above reviewed literature on the impact that integration of subjects have on the teachers, attempts to evaluate the impact of integrating subjects including Music within CAPA in Botswana are comparatively recent. As earlier intimated, there appears to be an apparent lack of concern in evaluating and synthesising key issues relating to the integration of CAPA subjects, including the impact that the integration of Music within CAPA has on teachers. The few articles available (locally) appear to be lacking in focus regarding the impact that the integration of the subjects have on teachers. Some of them generally deal more with teachers' preparation, for example, Kanasi (2007). This study revealed that teacher trainees admitted that they had little or no formal music education at colleges of education. This, as explained by Kanasi (2007:i), makes it difficult for them to choose Music as an area of specialisation. Hence, one would wonder how such teachers are in a position to satisfy the CAPA curriculum where they are expected to integrate Music with other CAPA subjects. Also, Mannathoko’s (2009) research appears to problematising the curriculum, although it is important to my study in that it highlights some of the problems faced by the teachers in teaching CAPA.
Regarding the administration and management aspects of the CAPA syllabus, Phuthego (2010) researched the role of the school administration in implementing an integrated arts syllabus in Botswana and found that the implementation of the CAPA syllabus at lower primary school level in Botswana has been hampered by some administrative and logistical problems. At another level, the findings of this study further revealed that school administrators felt that they had not been dually recognised as key players in the implementation of the CAPA syllabus. To this effect, the school administrators recommended the encouragement of subject specialisation in terms of teaching CAPA fields, as well as the reviewing of the syllabus in which teachers would have more input (Phuthego, 2010:42). Such findings are important for my current study because they reflect the lack of organisation on the part of management and consultation with some of the stakeholders for an efficient and effective implementation process.

2.7 SUMMARY

Botswana’s basic ten year education system has undergone changes over the years. The introduction and implementation of CAPA was one of such significant changes arising from the recommendation of the 1994 Revised National Policy on Education to include a number of practical subjects such as Music, Art and Craft, Physical Education, Design and Technology and other subjects constituting CAPA. Attempts to explore the impact that the teaching of integrated disciplines has on the teachers has been minimal as suggested by the paucity of books and research attempting to synthesise key issues on the implementation of curricula. Ideas for carrying out this research are drawn from Senge’s theory of learning organisations, which was used to formulate procedures followed and analysing the main issues in the study to deal with the teachers’ perceptions about the impact of teaching music within CAPA. The theoretical framework and evidence-based literature as presented in this chapter was used to help me interpret and analyse data to support my findings in Chapters Three and Four respectively.
CHAPTER 3

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter outlines the research design, methodological approach, sampling procedures, data collection and analysis processes used in exploring the impact of teaching music within CAPA. The focal point, here, is the methodological and theoretical understanding of the related designs and mixed method approach in conducting the research. The chapter also highlights the population and sampling procedures with particular reference to the type, size of the sample, how and why the sample was chosen. These are discussed because the information yielded on the mentioned variables forms the basis for evaluating and analysing the impact of teaching music within CAPA in Botswana upper primary schools. The fact that the research deals with human beings, warranted a discussion on how ethical matters were handled.

3.2 RESEARCH DESIGN

The research design is phenomenological in its approach. According to Leedy (1997:161) phenomenology is a “research methodology that attempts to understand research participants’ perceptions and views of social realities.” It is according to Babbie and Mouton (2009:28) that phenomenologists emphasize that “all human beings are engaged in the process of making sense of their life and that they continuously interpret, create and give meaning to, define, justify and rationalise their actions.” In this case, I used the phenomenological design because it focuses on the continuous learning, development and changing day to day interpretations of what was learnt by CAPA teachers. The design was also useful in exploring, obtaining thick rich data, understanding the perceptions, views, feeling, ideas and experiences of the participants regarding the teaching of music with other CAPA subject areas.
3.3 MIXED METHOD: QUANTITATIVE AND QUALITATIVE APPROACHES

Since this study is of a descriptive and explanatory nature, I found the mixed method approach useful in tracking trends and describing causes and effects to explain the impact of teaching music within CAPA. Creswell (2005:510) defines the mixed method design as a “procedure for collecting, analysing and mixing both quantitative and qualitative data in a single study to understand a research problem.” Creswell and Clark (2007:5 & 2011) present a dual explanation and function of a mixed method:

As a methodological approach, it involves philosophical assumptions that guide the direction of the collection and analysis and the mixture of qualitative and quantitative approaches in many phases of the research process. As a method, it focuses on the collecting, analysing, and mixing both qualitative and quantitative data in a single study or series of studies.

My choice of a mixed method approach was influenced by its central premise that the use of quantitative and qualitative approaches, in combination, provides a better understanding of research problems than either approach alone. This was useful in generating descriptive and explanatory data. In addition, Creswell and Clark (2011) pointed out that a mixed method approach is practical in the sense that the researcher is free to use all methods possible to address a research problem. It is also practical because individuals tend to solve problems using both numbers and words, combining inductive and deductive thinking, and employing skills in observing people as well as recording behaviour. Thus, the mixed method approach provided me with rich information on the estimated number of teachers affected by the phenomenon, teachers’ views, feelings, experiences and their perceived impact on teaching music within CAPA since its implementation. This method enabled me to interact and acquire both quantitative and qualitative data through the use of survey questionnaires and narratives in the journals respectively, which I discuss later in this chapter.
Within this mixed method approach, the quantitative approach strove to “identify and isolate specific variables” within the context of the study, while the qualitative approach focused on the “holistic view” of the study (Leech, Dellinger, Brannag, & Tanaka, 2010: 23). The quantitative approach sought to obtain the replicability of the findings, while the qualitative aspects of the research sought to obtain “validity of the constructs” under investigation (Molina-Azorin, 2011: 16). In the next section, I further explain how the two approaches were used and what they generated in this research.

3.3.1 Quantitative research approach

Neuman (2006:149) explains that “quantitative researchers are more concerned about issues of design, measurement and sampling because their deductive approach emphasises detailed planning prior to data collection and analysis.” In the light of the above explanation, I used a quantitative survey approach to assess and measure, for example, teachers’ abilities, qualifications, gender and teaching experience variables. I also used the idea of variables in describing and analysing the phenomena. Babbie and Mouton (2009:209) assert that the “independent variable is the cause while the dependent variable is the effect.” For example, the teaching of music within the integrated CAPA syllabus is the independent variable while the impact that it has on the teachers was the dependent variable. The questionnaires used involved the quantification of items in the form of the five point likert scale.

A survey was used as a procedure in quantitative research in administering questionnaires to the sampled 30 teachers. Babbie and Mouton (2009:232) and Mouton (2001) explain that surveys are “excellent vehicles for measuring attitudes and orientations in a larger population.” Echoing Babbie and Mouton (2009:232), Hayman (1968:66) states that a “survey is a means through which opinions, attitudes and suggestions for improvement of instruction can be obtained.” Furthermore, Creswell (2005:354) states that:
[...] surveys are procedures in quantitative research in which investigators administer a survey to a sample or to the entire population of people in order to describe the attitudes, opinions, behaviours, or characteristics of the population. In this procedure, survey researchers collect quantitative, numbered data using questionnaires or interviews and statistically analyse the data to describe trends about responses to questions and to test research questions or hypotheses.

I found the survey method attractive for collecting quantitative aspects of the study because it helped me achieve rich and relevant information and I found it cheaper and easier in managing the data collection process. This technique helped to obtain a larger amount of information, on a representative number of the population of CAPA teachers, which also gave them an opportunity to freely express their views about the teaching of music within CAPA. My choice of the survey method was influenced by its advantages suggested by Neuman (2006:299) that: “surveys allow the researcher to gain a lot of information about a phenomenon; data can be easily gathered while using minimal facilities; costs are minimised while time management is maximised and there is greater privacy for participants in exercising their freedom in completing the questionnaires” which I discuss in 3.4.1 below.

3.3.2 Qualitative research approach

The study was also anchored on a qualitative approach which Shank (2002:5) defines as “a form of systematic empirical inquiry into meaning.” Inquiry means that researchers try to understand how others make sense of their experiences. Denzin and Lincoln (2000) refer to qualitative research as an activity that locates the observer in the world and consists of a set of interpretive, material practices that make the world visible. According to Bell (1996) qualitative research is a method that seeks for deeper meaning of research. Such deeper meaning was also explained by Wiersma (1995), as a system of inquiry which seeks to build a holistic, largely narrative, description of the researcher's understanding of a social or cultural phenomenon.
Qualitative researchers are more concerned with issues of the “richness, texture and feeling of raw data because their inductive approach emphasises developing insights and generalisations out of the data collected” (Neuman 2006:149). In this approach, researchers study things in their environment, trying to comprehend and interpret the phenomena in their own understanding. They turn the world into “a series of representations, including field notes, interviews, conversations, photographs, recordings and memos to the self” (Neuman 2006:149). In the case of my study, such views implied the narration of the perceptions, ideas, experiences, feelings and views of CAPA teachers and their subjective interpretation of the situation as proponents directly involved and affected by the CAPA syllabus.

Furthermore, Miles and Huberman (1994), and Merriam (1998) suggested several characteristics that I incorporated into this study as they are common to all forms of qualitative research. These characteristics are:

1. The researcher plays the key role in data collection and analysis;
2. qualitative research usually involves fieldwork;
3. it primarily employs an inductive research strategy; and
4. typically, research findings are in the form of themes.

Furthermore, Stead and Struwig (2001:16) emphasised that with qualitative research “the researcher is part of the reality” and Ehigie and Ehigie (2005:622) concur that in qualitative research “the investigator takes an active role in interacting with the research participants." In this sense, the voices of the research participants (teachers) in the form of narratives was placed in the centre of the study. I became the connection between the field text, the research text and the research participants in making certain that all such voices are heard, explored and interpreted as suggested by Lincoln & Denzin (2000:1051).

I considered the narrative method as a qualitative procedure most appropriate in collecting the experiential stories of the participants as earlier observed. Narratives are
linked to the qualitative approach to research and according to Webster and Mertova (2007:3), a narrative “is set in human stories and it provides researchers with a rich framework through which they can investigate the ways humans experience the world depicted through their stories.” The narrative method applies the technique of description scene, plot, character and events in drawing the narrative sketches or critical events that constitute the narrative (Connelly & Clandinin 1990 cited in Webster & Mertova, 2007:22). In addition Webster and Mertova (2007:16) assert that “the method acts as a self adjusting compass, seeking the true north, the special meaning and direction of each individual life.” With this technique, I hoped to capture some of the thoughts and actions of participants which could not be addressed in the survey questionnaires.

To this end, the narratives helped obtain in-depth perceptions and experiences of selected music teachers who were already in the field before, during and after the implementation of CAPA in 2002. Participants’ stories on their perceptions, experiences, ideas and opinions were documented in their individual journals, which I explain in the next section on data collection tools.

3.4 METHODS OF DATA COLLECTION

Leedy and Ormrod (2010) define data as the information that lies closest to the source of the ultimate truth underlying the phenomena. Busha and Harter (1990) state that data collection is a process through which the researcher collects information required for his or her research. Since the research entailed the use of a mixed method of quantitative and qualitative approaches, data collection and analysis procedures followed suit. Two types of research tools were used namely, survey questionnaires and journals (narratives) for collecting participants’ stories. According to Webster and Mertova (2007:24), there is a potential in combining questionnaires with narratives as the researcher draws from the strengths of both methodological approaches. The use of a mixed-method approach to collect data was not only to gain understanding of the trends and impact of music teaching within CAPA, but also to determine the extent to which the
experiences are conducive to the teaching and learning of music within CAPA in upper primary schools in Botswana. Ultimately both questionnaires and narratives instruments helped to obtain the knowledge about the experiences, beliefs or expectations, feelings and needs of the teachers as role players in the implementation of CAPA. Questionnaires were used as a series of questions and prompts for the purpose of gathering information from the respondents on the impact of teaching music within CAPA. Narratives were used to collect data on the subjective perceptions and experiences of individual participants and these were collected through journals of the individual participants. In light of the above, I now discuss the data collection tools and how they were implemented in this research.

3.4.1 Questionnaires

According to Hayman (1968:67) questionnaires are "pencil and paper" written forms where questions are asked in order to gather information about a research study, while Leedy and Ormrod (2005) see them as a type of communication tool from which participants are asked information about a research phenomenon under study. I found the use of the questionnaire technique useful for written accounts as they produced data which was easier to engage with and analyse (Letherby & Zdrowski 1995:584). In my study the questionnaires were guided by closed and open-ended questions in a structured five-point likert-scale approach and structured questions with spaces to write on their responses (see Appendix A). The questionnaire was also used to help in the sequencing of questions for better analysis. Furthermore, it allowed for the collection of data from a larger coverage of the population in a shorter period of time (Letherby & Zdrowski 1995:584).

When designing the questionnaire I remembered that Colosi (2006) advised that, firstly, as a researcher, I should know the type of information needed to capture the important objectives of the investigation and fulfil the purpose of the investigation. Secondly, as the questionnaires were investigative, I needed to know the type of questions and responses that would best guide me to the deeper investigation of the phenomenon.
Thirdly, Colosi (2006) argues that although questionnaires capture only one person’s experience on a given question, and that it is difficult to report results for the entire group, open-ended data can be useful when exploring the range of possible responses to a question as is the case with my study.

Regarding aspects of the distribution and collection of questionnaires, these were distributed to the 30 sampled teachers who teach music within CAPA in the upper primary levels (standards five to seven). Issuing of questionnaires was conducted on different days, over a period of a week because of the distance between schools and appointments for collection of questionnaires were negotiated on delivery days. Teachers were given a month to complete the questionnaires and the return rate was 100%. Probably, this was enhanced by the researcher’s decision to use the School Heads (Head Teachers) as distribution agents. Periodically, for purposes of control and management of the process, I telephonically requested school heads (on two occasions) to check the progress of the participants and to remind them of the date of my collection of completed questionnaires.

With regards to the distribution process, my initial contact with the participants in some schools was not a smooth and easy one. Some teachers were suspicious of me because of their belief that I might expose their weaknesses (as far as their teaching of CAPA was concerned) to the Ministry of Education. Participants’ suspicions and fears were allayed by my explanation of my boundaries as a researcher and issues of ethics in conducting research, which was understood by everyone, hence their participation in the research. Also, the important role that participants played in the study was emphasised, along with explanations of how to fill in the questionnaires, since without their participation results could not be conclusive. In addition, the teachers were assured of the confidentiality of their responses as discussed in Chapter One (Section 1.9). Questionnaires guaranteed anonymity and avoided bias as they were completed independently and away from the researcher, thus, addressing ethical issues.
Having completed the distribution process above, I needed to ensure that the type of questions and responses that would best guide the deeper investigation, were sufficient and explanatory enough to yield conclusive results. I was mindful of the limitations from enumerative and statistical aspects of possible findings and variables that the quantitative tool would yield, as highlighted in the discussion in 3.3.1 above. I then focused on the journals to gather narrative data that would explore individual and perhaps collective trends and perceptions among participants about the phenomena. I discuss this in the next section.

3.4.2 Journals

A journal is “a series of writings done by a person in response to daily life” (Writing the journey, 2007). It also contains descriptions of events and reflections about the events and ones feelings about them. According to Dörnyei (2001) the major purpose of the journals is to help participants (including the researcher) identify, investigate, analyse the information for specifying and developing data and knowledge. In the case of my research, the journals were used to gather and analyse data from three participants who narrated their perceptions, feelings, views, and experiences about teaching music within CAPA, which I further discuss in Section 4.4 of Chapter Four. The technique provided me with richer data to explore the phenomenon. My choice of using journals was provoked by its advantages as listed by Webster and Mertova (2007) which are as follows:

1. Narratives help reveal qualities of experience in a way that other forms of research cannot;
2. it calls on storytelling tradition which gives structure to expression;
3. Narratives often involve a moral lesson to be learnt.

The narratives were also useful in collecting personal reflections and accounts of the participants, which would not have been possible and clear with the questionnaire instrument. This, in turn, helped me to get closer to the field text on the phenomenon. It
should be noted that narratives produce huge amounts of data that are not always easy to handle with a huge population, hence narratives from only three of the sampled participants were used. At this point, I discuss the population and sampling procedures that I followed in this research.

3.5 POPULATION AND SAMPLING PROCEDURES

There is a variety of definitions on population for any research. Bell (2005), Mouton (1996), Borg, Gall and Gall (2003) define the population of the research as a target group from which the researcher finds information. Seemingly, Mouton (1996:134) emphasises the importance of some common characteristics that the researcher is interested in studying. In addition, Borg, et al (2003) focus on the subject of the research about which the researcher wants to determine some characteristics. The target population of my study was mainly the upper primary CAPA teachers in the northern region inspectorial area of Botswana as they are the characters that have lived the history of, and experienced and are involved in, the teaching and learning of CAPA. Ideally, I would have liked to study the entire population of music teachers within CAPA in upper primary schools in Botswana to investigate the phenomenon from a broader perspective, but the limited scope of the research as a treatise influenced my decision in this regard hence the sampling of the 30 music teachers.

3.5.1 Sampling procedures

According to Neuman (2006:219) sampling is an important measure in both quantitative and qualitative research processes which he describes as a “smaller set of cases from which a researcher selects and generalises to the population.” Similarly, Bailey (1999), and George and Thompson (1996) defined a sample as a subset or a portion of the population of study, rather than studying the entire population. In deciding on the sample for my research, I chose to work with teachers who specialised in music within CAPA other than those who teach any other CAPA discipline. Purposive sampling of participants from the 18 selected upper primary schools in Botswana was used. Here, I
selected individuals “not by chance” but based on my “judgment and convenience”, as advocated by Sandelowski (2000:249). I opted to use this technique because the identification and location of the teachers was faster, less expensive and conducive, since I trained and knew them as student teachers who specialised in music from the College. Therefore, with a list of their names, it was easier for the Officials of the Department of Education to locate the schools where they were teaching and others were identified by their School Heads. From the 30 purposively sampled teachers, I randomly selected three teachers by the “blind draw” or with the “closed eyes” method (Babbie & Mouton 2009:259; Neuman 2006:228). We agreed to list all the names of the participants, cutting the individual names and putting them in a hat (standard by standard) for the draw and the hat was shaken before the draw. One name from each standard (Standard Five, Six and Seven) was drawn. This method helped in limiting issues of biasness where I would possibly choose participants from one school, from the same standard, or those that I like.

3.6 DATA ANALYSIS

I have used two techniques to analyse data for this research due to the mixed method design used in my study, in order to accommodate both the quantitative and qualitative aspects of the research. Creswell (2005:520) argues that in using the mixed method design “the results from the quantitative data collection are directly compared with results from qualitative data collection […] quantitative and qualitative data are combined to form new variables”. Before the actual analysis, all data was presented, starting with quantitative and following with qualitative data.

The quantitative data was presented statistically through the use of graphs, pie charts, and tables as indicated in the next chapter. The results were drawn from the five-point Likert-scale (see Appendix A) I designed ranging from 1-5 (SA) ‘strongly agree’, (A) ‘agree’, (N) ‘neutral’, (D) ‘disagree’ and (SD) ‘strongly disagree’ as suggested by Creswell (1994:245). Also, the quantitative data was first interpreted and analysed
resulting in identified themes which were compared with those from qualitative data as advocated by Creswell (2005:520).

In analysing qualitative data, I firstly identified “preset themes” (Taylor-Powell & Renner 2003:3) as the initial process of analysis. Here, the focus was on identifying themes or categories that already appear in the earlier analysed quantitative data, for comparison with the qualitative data in this study. I have used the preset themes from the quantitative data (Appendex A, Sections B-E) to provide direction on what I was looking for in the data. I then searched for the qualitative data that matched the preset themes, from the open-ended questions in Section F of the questionnaire (Appendix A). Secondly, through an “open-coding” process (Strauss & Corbin 1990:61) I proceeded to identify further, or similar themes from the journal narratives. Open coding involves “highlighting, breaking down, examining, comparing, conceptualising and categorising data in terms of properties and dimensions, such as: words, phrases, sentences and other expressions emanating from the data.” In this study codes were used to divide and organise the larger amounts of data into manageable groupings and these also provided me with relevant techniques to analyse and discuss the data.

In coding the qualitative data to match the preset themes from the quantitative data, I read the narratives a number of times underlining key words, phrases and sentences. I also examined, compared and manually conceptualised the highlighted areas in order to gain more understanding of their meanings using letters to categorise the underlined areas. Furthermore, a comparison of data from both quantitative and qualitative sources was prepared to consolidate and elicit findings on the impact of teaching music. This resulted in identification of four broad themes which I discuss in the next chapter.

3.7 RELIABILITY AND VALIDITY

Babbie and Mouton (2009:119) argue that reliability is a matter of whether a particular technique, applied repeatedly to the same object, would yield the same results each time. This is a question of similarity in the outcome through using the same instrument
on another occasion. In addressing the issue of reliability, the questionnaires administered to the 30 music teachers revealed consistency of results, which I discovered by checking if all the items in the questionnaires communicated what they were designed to communicate.

Joppe (2000:1) explains the concept of validity as the “degree that determines whether the research truly measures what it was intended to measure or how truthful the research results are”. In my study, the validation of the data was attempted by collecting narratives from three participants through a journaling process of their stories on their experiences and challenges as music teachers within CAPA. In this way, the narratives helped to validate the quantitative data (questionnaires). This was done to ensure that the questionnaires were dependable as well as credible in uncovering the information that the quantitative tool (questionnaires) could not reveal. All this was done with due care to the ethical considerations further discussed in the next section.

3.8 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

In conducting this research, I subscribed to the basic ethical considerations of the Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University (NMMU) which has an ethics approval process to be followed. This process of approval starts at departmental level with the Faculty of Research Technology Innovation–Higher Degrees Committee (RTI-HDC) and an ethics reference number was granted on approval. I also got permission from the Botswana Education department (see Appendix B) and the participants consented to their involvement and use of information from their questionnaires and journals (see Appendix C) from the participants relating to their participation, while undertaking to maintain anonymity and confidentiality.

Also, a reflection was made to the principles expressed in The Belmont report (1979:4-7) such as: respect for persons, beneficence and justice. Through these principles, I protected the anonymity of schools and every respondent since respondents were assured that no physical or emotional damage would occur. As explained in Chapter
One, I also held as privileged and confidential all information that tended to identify the respondents and beneficence and justice were practised by “human protection” (Babbie 1998: 276). I assert that in this way, my research complied with ethical considerations and the respect for confidentiality, since in presenting the research results from the questionnaire schedules and narratives; the names of the participants were not identified.

3.9 SUMMARY

This exploratory and descriptive research was based on the mixed method of quantitative and qualitative approaches. These approaches allowed me to gain more information on the impact of teaching music within CAPA. In using two types of research techniques, namely questionnaires and journals, broader insights into the phenomenon yielded rich data from which results were drawn and conclusions made, as discussed in the next chapter. The reasons for using these techniques and the limitations to the choice were discussed. I believe that the mixed method approach was an effective research design for this study since teachers expressed their feelings, views, perceptions and experiences using the two research techniques mentioned above. Sampling methods, size and sampling techniques were also laid out and the chosen sample gave me an opportunity to collect data that was easy for me to monitor. This data allowed me to analyse thick and rich descriptions from different perspectives of respondents, yet experiencing the same challenges. In conducting this study the Belmont basic ethical principles were observed and applied. The collected data as discussed and herein yielded the research results as presented in Chapter Four.
CHAPTER 4

DATA PRESENTATION, ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION

4.1 INTRODUCTION

In this chapter I present, analyse and discuss data. I first present quantitative data through graphs, tables and percentage values of responses on open-ended statements, followed by a thematic presentation of qualitative data. Here, data is analysed using a statistical version 10 package through an expert statistician in the Statistical Consulting Department at the Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University (NMMU). Finally, I discuss the findings on the exploration of the impact of teaching music within CAPA in Botswana upper primary schools as represented by the selected teachers, with specific attention and emphasis given to the teachers’ experiences in teaching music as an integrated part of CAPA and the impact this has on them.

4.2 DATA PRESENTATION

In this section, I begin with presenting quantitative data in Section 4.2.1 below, from closed and open-ended questionnaires as observed earlier in Sections 1.6.3 and 3.4.1 of this study. The data is presented in the form of graphic representations of selected biographical information (Appendix A, Section A). Tables indicating trends on: the impact of teaching music within CAPA; syllabus expectations and classroom practices; the nature of the support given to CAPA teachers by their respective managers; challenges and problems encountered by the teachers are also provided in (Appendix A, Sections B-E). This is subsequently followed by numerical calculations and estimations to present data on the implementation process of CAPA in Section F of the questionnaires. Finally, a thematic representation from the journal narratives of participants on their experiences, descriptions and expressions is provided in Section 4.2.2 as evidence of qualitative data.
4.2.1 Presentation of quantitative data

4.2.1.1 Section A: Graphs

This section provides selected biographical information of the 30 participating teachers.

Figure 4.1: Teachers qualifications

![Bar graph showing teachers' qualifications: 73% of teachers hold a Diploma in Primary Education (DPE) over three years, 13% hold a Professional Teacher Certificate (PTC), and 13% hold a Degree.]

*Note, due to the rounding off of the percentages the sum does not necessarily add up exactly to 100% in figure 4.1 above and figure 4.2 below.*

With regard to qualifications, the findings reveal that all 30 teachers are qualified primary school teachers, although they hold different qualifications as suggested in Figure 4.1 above. The majority of the teachers, at 73%, hold a Diploma in Primary Education (DPE) over three years; a few participants (13%) hold the two-year Primary
Teachers Certificate (PTC) and 13% obtained University qualifications with a music degree.

Figure 4.2: Training providers and duration of training for music teachers.

Figure 4.2 above reflects the means of how teachers received their training and the duration of their studies. The data indicates that most primary teachers, 63%, were trained in Colleges of Education for a holistic training in music in a three year diploma course. Of the respondents, 13% obtained a three year University degree. Also, the results reflect that some 10% of the teachers studied music theory through correspondence and obtained Graded certificates (Grades 1 and 2) with The Associated Board of the Royal schools of Music. The data also reveals that the last 13% of the teachers received a month’s training through departmental workshops.
4.2.1.2 Section B: Tables

In this section, I have engaged in the use of percentages, mean and standard deviation to indicate the responses of the participants. It should be noted that the mean value of three was used as the centre of the scale.\(^3\) I used standard deviations to assess the spread of the mean value, thus showing how close or wide the difference is between them, where closeness or difference relates to the level of agreement and disagreement with the statements.

Table 4.1: The impact of teaching music within CAPA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SECTION B</th>
<th>CATEGORIES</th>
<th>RESPONSES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B1</td>
<td>I am confident with teaching music within the context of CAPA</td>
<td>13.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B2</td>
<td>My learners enjoy music lessons</td>
<td>16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B3</td>
<td>I am able to identify and help learners with music skills</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B4</td>
<td>I do improvise when teaching music within CAPA</td>
<td>16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B5</td>
<td>I can help my colleagues with understanding music within CAPA</td>
<td>10.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B6</td>
<td>I help my colleagues deal with negative attitudes towards music</td>
<td>16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B7</td>
<td>I do believe that I will help learners become responsible citizens</td>
<td>46.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^3\) The mean value of three or less suggested that the respondents’ tend to agree rather than disagree with the statements while the mean value above three indicates the respondents’ tendency to disagree with the statement by comparing it to the middle value of the scale.
Table 4.1 above, relates to a number of aspects where participants were to respond to ten statements addressing the impact of teaching music within CAPA. There are fewer instances where teachers disagree with the statements. The most problematic was B3 with a mean value of 3.3 whereby teachers lack the ability to identify and help learners acquire musical skills. Most teachers tend to agree with the statements, especially B7 on developing citizenship among learners (relating to the ability to help learners to be responsible citizens of Botswana) and B10 on their need for more music training, both of which the level of agreement was at the mean value of 1.7.

Table 4.2: CAPA syllabus expectations and classroom practice

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SECTION C</th>
<th>CATEGORIES</th>
<th>RESPONSES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C1</td>
<td>I am able to scheme and plan for music within CAPA</td>
<td>26.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C2</td>
<td>I am able to integrate music with other CAPA subjects</td>
<td>13.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C3</td>
<td>I am able to deliver music content within the context of CAPA</td>
<td>13.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C4</td>
<td>I understand and use assessment standards</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C5</td>
<td>I am able to use musical instruments within CAPA</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C6</td>
<td>I am able to design musical learning</td>
<td>10.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
and teaching aids within CAPA

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C7</td>
<td>I use various teaching methods to equip my learners with music skills within CAPA</td>
<td>20.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C8</td>
<td>I use learner-centered and activity-based approaches</td>
<td>26.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C9</td>
<td>I am able to explain concepts of music within CAPA to learners who do not understand</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C10</td>
<td>I am able to control and monitor learning of music within CAPA in my class</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It can be deduced from Table 4.2 above that 90% of teachers plan for music teaching within the broader CAPA subject, flowing from the combined percentage responses on C1 from the above table. However, with regards to the integration of music with other CAPA subjects, the majority, at 63.4%, are found wanting and are unable to teach the music content within CAPA. There are only two statements, C1 and C8, where the participants agree, whilst seven statements imply that the majority of teachers are unable to meet the syllabus and teaching requirements as indicated in C5 with the highest mean value of 3.6.

Table 4.3: Support given to music teachers by the management

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SECTION D</th>
<th>CATEGORIES</th>
<th>RESPONSES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D1</td>
<td>Effectiveness of the teaching programme is frequently monitored</td>
<td>10.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D2</td>
<td>Smooth provision of resources, for example, instruments</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D3</td>
<td>Administrators support teachers initiative and risk taking</td>
<td>13.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The lack of support from managers seems to make the teaching of music within CAPA problematic as indicated in table 4.3 above. For example, teachers are struggling with lack of motivation from managers, the monitoring of the programme, poor provision of resources, lack of infrastructure in schools, teachers not being taken seriously and lack of encouragement for decision making on the part of teachers. In this regard, all the statements listed above illustrate a mean value greater than three, an indication from the data that they disagree with the statements. In contrast, some managers, at 60%, encourage teachers’ collaboration for better results and also 56.7% of management allow teachers to voice their opinion on sensitive issues as indicated in D7 and D8, respectively.

*Table 4.4: Challenge encountered by music teachers within CAPA*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SECTION</th>
<th>CATEGORIES</th>
<th>RESPONSES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>E1</td>
<td>Cannot cope with workload</td>
<td>20.0 33.3 26.7 16.7 3.3 2.5 1.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The 20 statements in the table above relate to challenges pertaining to the teaching and learning of CAPA. The most problematic statements include: workload experienced by teachers; teachers being unable to integrate CAPA disciplines; inadequate resources
and facilities in schools; lack of confidence of teachers and inadequate content knowledge of the CAPA subject areas. The majority of participants, at 65%, tend to agree with the contents of 13 statements, which are less than the mean value of three, indicating that there are a number of challenges in the teaching of music within CAPA. Regardless of so many challenges, teachers do not want to leave the teaching profession because of this subject (E20). Also, the statement in E18 has the highest mean value of 4.1, suggesting that teachers tend to disagree with the statement, and they see themselves committed to their work. Flowing from the indications in the tables which are summarised above, I move on to Section C below where numerical aspects from section F of the questionnaires are presented.

4.2.1.3 Section C: Presentation of responses to open-ended statements: implementation process of the CAPA subject

In this section I am presenting data from section F of the questionnaire which contained a selection of open-ended questions relating to the implementation of CAPA. In presenting these, percentage values are used to highlight the low and high rates of occurrence of the phenomena. In this section, the questions asked (to participants) from the questionnaire, are italicized and selected responses from participants are, on occasion, directly quoted. I begin by presenting questions followed by relevant responses from participants as follows:

Question: How were you introduced to the CAPA syllabus before its implementation?

The 24 participants were introduced to the CAPA syllabus in various ways through: national workshops and seminars; school-based workshops; resource persons and through self-initiated research. Data reveals that, 16 teachers were introduced to the CAPA syllabus through the national workshops and seminars, while eight participants attended school-based workshops. Also, findings indicate that some music teachers who attended the workshops served as resource persons to escalate training to their counterparts who did not attend the workshops. Furthermore, data indicated that six
participants were introduced to CAPA through self-initiated research. One participant stated: “I understand some workshops on the teaching of CAPA were held in some parts of the country, but personally I cannot confirm that as I was never part of one.”

**Question:** Explain how CAPA workshops helped you to kick start the CAPA programme.

The 24 participants who attended the CAPA workshops indicated that the workshops worked as an eye opener for them and helped them interpret the CAPA objectives and integrate music with other CAPA disciplines. Some participants were of a view that the information they received was not sufficient because the workshops only introduced the subject and not all subject areas were covered, as indicated by one of the respondents: “The information I got from the CAPA workshop did not help in the teaching of CAPA because it was based only on music and it did not cover everything in music.” In support, one other participant responded: “The CAPA workshop I attended was only on the teaching of music and some few objectives were covered on music.” Another participant added that the subject areas covered did not cover all the CAPA disciplines: “Some workshops included some aspects in the CAPA syllabus that’s Music, Art and Craft and Design and technology.” The six teachers who did not attend any of the workshops revealed their views: “I have not attended any CAPA related workshop; by this no information was got about CAPA.” Another participant contributed: “We are supposed to integrate but it’s not easy as we were not work-shopped.” The other teacher further explained that: “I understand some workshops on the teaching of CAPA were held in some parts of the country, but personally I cannot confirm that as I was never part of one.”

**Question:** In your own view how would you like workshops to be carried out?

Revelations from data were that participants had different views about the nature and duration of the CAPA workshops, for example: 12 of them wanted workshops on an annual basis, while 18 preferred regular and cluster workshop, where schools in the
same area would come together and hold workshops on a rotational basis. From the 18, nine called for the issuing of certificates in workshops in order to motivate participants.

**Question:** What were the initial problems you faced at the time you started teaching music within CAPA?

Data revealed that 27 participants indicated the problems they experienced as: a lack of content knowledge and practical skills to operate instruments; a lack of music books; too much workload within the CAPA syllabus; difficult objectives to accomplish, such that many are left incomplete; insufficient time allocated for lessons; learners lack of understanding the music concepts and inadequate support from administrators and relevant stakeholders. Three of the respondents indicated that they did not encounter any problems.

**Question:** Describe how you dealt with the concerns or problems you experienced in teaching music within the context of CAPA?

Participants indicated that most of them improvised where possible. Others requested help from other teachers and even went to the extent of discussing those problems in staff meetings. Some 16 teachers indicated that they practice “peer teaching”, whereby they teach whilst the others are observing and giving feedback to each other for improvement. A lesser number of the teachers gave extra lessons to help slow learners as indicated by one of them asserting that: “Through commitment and interest in music you have to improvise time management and attend to after teaching hours.” Data revealed that three teachers did not have any problems with teaching music within the context of CAPA and only two participants did not respond to the above question.

**Question:** What experience did you have as a music teacher before the introduction of CAPA?
Data revealed that the majority of participants had a variety of experiences in teaching music before the introduction of CAPA. While 13 participants did not have any experience, six teachers explained that they had basic knowledge from working with their school choirs. On the other hand, some eight participants disclosed that they acquired knowledge and experience with their PTC qualification, and three even obtained further knowledge by correspondence with private colleges of music.

Question: How does your current experience as a CAPA teacher compare to your initial experience as a music teacher?

Of the participants, 13 had no basis for comparison since they started teaching music with the introduction of CAPA. In contrast, 14 teachers preferred teaching music as a standalone subject rather than teaching it in combination with other subject areas within CAPA. One teacher asserted that “as a music teacher, I have experienced confusion when teaching CAPA as it comprises of some subjects that I have not been trained in or did not specialise in during training.” Interestingly, only three participants found the teaching of CAPA easier as the number of the subjects they were teaching had been reduced as indicated: “Prior to the introduction of CAPA teachers in primary schools were made to prepare and teach about twelve (12) separate subjects areas which is now less.”

Question: What are your views about the teaching of music within the context of CAPA?

There were a variety of responses in this regard, however, two teachers did not respond to this question. Of the participants, seven had no problems as long as there were many workshops and enough resources. Some six teachers complained about ineffectiveness of the teaching because subject areas “suffocate” each other whereby other areas suffer at the expense of others. One teacher indicated that “some subject areas obviously suffered.” Also, data revealed the views of 14 participants who suggested the re-matching or re-packaging of the subject areas within CAPA, such that those that relate to each other should be combined like Music, Art and Craft, Dance and Drama.
Question: Explain how other teachers within your school view CAPA?

Data reflected that some teachers in schools assume that CAPA teachers now enjoy teaching the subject as compared to the implementation stages. In contrary, others find it difficult with more and unnecessary content being expected to be taught at upper level. Also, they are of the feeling that CAPA teachers teach the subject for the sake of pleasing the authority figures. A few identified it as a practical and hands-on subject that lacks adequate resources and needs experts with knowledge and skills on how to teach all the CAPA disciplines. One teacher indicated that: "those who try to teach do not teach effectively because of lack of knowledge."

Question: What alternative strategies would you suggest to teach CAPA in your schools?

A lot of teachers made useful comments in this regard and only a minority of three did not answer this question. Of the participants, nine suggested that there should be a central scheming and planning according to cluster schools for standardisation, one of which concurred, “I would suggest that all those who teach CAPA should come together when planning so as to help each other.” Another eight teachers felt that schools should practice resource sharing whereby they share both human and material resources. Some nine participants believed that rotational teaching according to the teachers' abilities can rescue them.

Question: What challenges are you faced with in the teaching of music within CAPA?

All teachers identified common problems they encounter in the teaching of music within CAPA such as: the objectives that are difficult to articulate; inadequate time allocation; lack of teaching resources and infrastructure; too much work; lack of content knowledge and practical skills and inadequate support from both administrators and stakeholders.
Question: How do those challenges impact on your performance as a teacher?

Some five participants could not respond to this question, while 24 participants commented on the negative impact of the challenges on their performances. Again, there were common views listed like: loss of interest in the subject, stress and frustration and one teacher gave a litany of examples saying that “objectives are not fully driven home or not attended to, obviously performance is limited; interest is also jeopardised; too much fatigue; stress and frustration is caused.”

Question: What are your perceived gaps that exist between the CAPA syllabus and the classroom practice?

The common gaps highlighted by the 24 participants were: incomplete objectives; a high rate of failures; lack of assessment; skipping of subject areas; and lack of content knowledge and skilled manpower. One teacher expressed the concern that, “the country is crying for lack of skilled manpower, which skills could have been prompted or provoked at primary level and rendered possible.” Of the participants, five preferred not to share their views.

Question: What impact do these gaps have on you as a CAPA teacher?

Data revealed that the gaps mentioned above had some adverse impact on the CAPA programme in general. The most commonly mentioned factors by 24 participants were poor performance by both teachers and learners that is manifested through poor results and high rates of failure by learners and that both teachers and learners have lost interest and motivation in the subject. One respondent shared his concern that “these gaps demotivated me especially in music which I have specialised in at training and they make me dislike my job” and five participants did not respond.
Question: What recommendations would you make regarding the teaching of music within CAPA?

These were the eleven recommendations made by the teachers:

1. The CAPA subject should be disintegrated and subject areas be treated as independent subjects, because each area has its own objectives and requirements.
2. Music should be an option from primary to secondary level for better development of theoretical and practical skills of learners.
3. Provision of new music syllabus with the matching subject areas such as Music, Art and Craft, Dance and Drama should be put in place.
4. There is a need for fully trained experts or specialised teachers to teach each respective subject area.
5. If the integration continues, there should be a full-time teacher training programme for CAPA.
6. There should be enough time allocated to the subject in order to cover all the objectives that come with the subject.
7. CAPA should be examinable so that both teachers and learners are motivated to teach and learn the subject.
8. CAPA authorities should provide specialised learning resources in schools.
9. The authorities should promote the construction of music rooms and laboratories for practical work carried out indoors.
10. CAPA authorities should make some follow-ups in schools in order to supervise and evaluate the progress made in the teaching and learning of CAPA.
11. The authorities have to go back to the drawing board and involve teachers in the development and implementation of CAPA if anything is to be achieved by this subject.
4.2.2 Presentation of qualitative data (journals)

In this section I present data from journals of three participants in which they reflected on their views, feelings and experiences about the implementation process, syllabus expectations, teaching of CAPA and teaching of music within the subject. The three participants were issued with books to narrate their stories individually. The narrations were unstructured and highly subjective as teachers were not provided with guidelines to follow, except for verbal instructions given by me that focused on the reflectivity and reflexivity modes of narrating their stories. Letherby (2003:92) supports my views when he argues that “when participants are given the opportunity to write about their experiences they feel they have more control in that they can take their time and reflect on what they do and do not want to disclose.” Thus, I gave the teachers time and space to contribute openly and freely towards the phenomena. All three of the participants managed to complete their stories within the agreed period of a month. The journal books were collected on the agreed date from the school heads as they were the distributing agents. The comments and responses of the participants are presented verbatim below:

4.2.2.1 Implementation process

Data revealed that the introduction of CAPA was worthwhile as Teacher A said “the introduction of CAPA was good”, while Teacher B commented that “CAPA came up with the introduction of the new primary syllabus around the year 2002.”

4.2.2.2 CAPA syllabus expectations

The data revealed that music in Botswana is taught as part of the CAPA subject. Teacher B explained that “in primary schools music is taught within the context of CAPA.” The same teacher also identified other subject areas covered in CAPA: “CAPA is a subject which embraces four subjects which are Home Economics, Art and Craft, Physical Education and Music.” In agreement Teacher C commented that “this is a
subject that is based on combination of Music, Physical Education, Art and Craft and Home Economics.”

Regarding the planning of the subject only Teacher C expressed her views as follows: “The teaching of music has never been effective in primary schools; this is evident from the initial stage of scheming.” She also observed that, “during scheming, all subject areas within the content of CAPA are to be inclusive each term.” Furthermore, she identified some shortfalls on planning, saying that “with music little is done or indicated in the scheme of work” […] “still even if music is included in scheming some teachers do not teach it fully”, to which she gave an example of a plan, as illustrated in Figure. 4.3 (page 89) that I discuss in Section 4.4.1.1 below.

Teachers are of the view that if CAPA can be taught well, it could benefit learners and the nation. Teacher A felt that “CAPA can benefit our learners in such a way that they will be able to make wise decisions/choices when at secondary school either to do music, home economics, design or commerce.” Teacher B concurred with Teacher A on the benefits of the subject while advocating for independence of the subject disciplines: “It will be for the benefit of learners and the nation for it to be given much attention and be treated as independent subjects.” Teacher C had a broader understanding of the impact of CAPA on learners stating that:

> Understanding that CAPA can bring out engineers, musicians, various artists and even journalists, one would realise how much was lost by those learners who would or should have been provided with such relevant skills.

### 4.2.2.3 Teaching of the subject CAPA and teaching of music within CAPA

Participants identified a number of problems they encounter when teaching CAPA. Teachers observed that the time allocated to CAPA is not sufficient. Teacher B asserted that “the subject is not given enough time.” He went on to elaborate with an example, saying that “time is too little that is why the content is shallow […] CAPA is allocated to
two lessons of 30 minutes per week which is really not enough when you look at the content of it in the syllabus.” In contrast, Teacher A added that, “CAPA is given five hours / week in a master timetable and you will find that sometimes music is taught only once a week or not at all and this is not enough.” The same teachers concluded that “CAPA needs more time than any other subject because it has many subject areas.”

Seemingly, the time allocated to CAPA was a cause for concern as Teacher B commented that “music, compared to other subjects in primary schools is given less attention since it is not time-tabled […]to my perception music is a special subject which needs to be given much attention like other subjects in the curricular.”

Teaching of music within CAPA

The respondents also indicated another concern of teachers using the time allocated to music teaching for other things. Teacher B reported that “many primary schools’ staff has developed their own culture of utilising time scheduled for music within the context of CAPA by resorting to some school activities.” The same teacher clarified that “in most primary schools during CAPA lessons when is time to teach, music teachers have clubs, ball sports, traditional groups and athletes for annual competitions.” Furthermore, Teacher B stated that “most primary school teachers encounter a lot of problems in the teaching of music due to their limited or lack of personal musical experience.”

According to the teachers, their incompetence is caused by a lack of knowledge. As teacher A stated: “we are not familiar with the content nor were we work-shopped.” Teacher B harmonised, saying that “due to the problems primary teachers are encountering, they fail to equip learners with knowledge and skills.” Furthermore, he showed his willingness to teach: “I am willing to teach music within CAPA, however, I lack the skills of integrating it with other CAPA subjects, hence, not competent to teach CAPA. Teachers’ competencies in teaching CAPA have been neglected.” The same teacher also affirmed that “the government of Botswana is advocating for pupils to be taught musical skills and knowledge on the basis of listening, performing and creative
skills which we do not have.” Teacher A confirmed that “those who try to teach do not teach effectively because of lack of knowledge” and Teacher C said, “I am not sure of what I am teaching as in some instances I do not really understand some of the objectives or how to use some of the available aids.”

Teachers expressed their views on issues concerning music content. As teacher B explained: “we don’t deliver objectives and content of music as expected within the context of CAPA.” Teacher A declared that, “The problem is that teachers are not equipped with the content so they chose not to fumble in front of learners and leave out interesting topics to children.” The two assertions were supported by Teacher C who believed that problems encountered “make it even worse and it makes it difficult for the teacher to conduct some lessons.” Teacher C detected that a “lack of knowledge lead to skipping other topics we thought to be difficult to teach.” The same teacher remarked: “Let’s say I enjoy teaching music of Botswana and dramatisation in Standard 7, but I will ignore and leave out pitch, time and rhythm as I found them not easy to teach.” The teacher further explained that:

Most teachers do not have adequate skills of teaching music but they are bind to teach music in the schools, by that it leads to them not teaching the objectives of music instead passing time by singing or skipping the music objectives.

Participants continually identified reasons for skipping lessons. Teacher A indicated that:

The other reason why they skip these topics is the materials; teachers are to neither improvise in almost everything in music, no instruments, and no books for reference nor even stave books to write music items in.

Another contribution was made by Teachers B and A who cited problems with resources: “teachers work is ineffective because of lack of relevant and enough materials to the subject” and Teacher A further explained that “the objectives may tell
the teachers to play this rhythm using guitar, drums, tambourine or any other, but none of them are there.”

Data reflected that training is one of the contributing factors towards the teachers’ performance. According to Teacher A:

Most teachers who did PTC did very little in music, so there is need for them to be equipped or at least supply the material to make the job much easier and interesting for them as they have to research to teach the subject.

Teacher B indicated that “music has shortage of specialists’ teachers in primary schools.” Teacher C highlighted that, “no teacher is trained to teach all the subjects and in our country we only have few teachers who are trained to teach music.” Teacher A further pointed out that:

Music is not taught in a systematic way however, this expectation is not fulfilled properly since classroom teachers undergo very limited musical instruction in their own training programme, and they were not taught all aspects of music.

Also, participants found lack of skills impacting on assessment. Teacher B argued that the “skills could assist us to appraise learners musical work and also help learners to distinguish different sorts of musical work.” Teacher C commented on why CAPA is not assessed, noting that “even the administrators don’t like assessing us when teaching CAPA, they overlook it, and this is because it is not tested nor examined.” The teacher further explained that “in Botswana curriculum CAPA is taught but not tested or examined in the primary school leaving examination.”

According to the participants’ assumptions, teachers displayed a negative attitude towards the teaching of CAPA as a whole. As Teacher A said: “what I hated most in CAPA is that it depend upon individual schools how they divide the modules with some schools not doing it accordingly, where I was, was better, but here, it is not reasoning.”
The same teacher also gave an example on how they teach the modules:

> You teach each module once per week for example, let’s say CAPA is on Monday and Wednesday. Then I teach Module 3 which is about pitch on Monday then Wednesday I move to Module 4 which is about construction, not finishing the subtopics under pitch, which really confuses learners and they get bored”.

Commenting on the division of modules the same teacher said that “the problem with CAPA is that as it is divided into modules; other items like in music are very difficult for us teachers to deliver”. The teacher concluded with a suggestion that “there should be uniformity when dividing CAPA modules just like any other subject.”

Furthermore, Teacher B verified that “in most primary schools in Botswana teachers have no interest in the teaching of music; some have developed negative attitudes towards the subject”. The same teacher explained that:

> Pupils fail it and the more they fail CAPA, the more they dislike it. In fact, pupils love doing it, but with a negligent teacher coupled with lack of resources and support, what is imbibed within CAPA ends up lost. Thus we lose our future musicians, artists and engineers.

Teacher C agreed with the two respondents saying that “some teachers have a negative attitude towards music more so that they know at the end of Primary School Leaving Examinations (PSLE) pupils are not tested nor examined.”

The three participants made recommendations for the CAPA subject:

Teacher A said:

> CAPA should be broken as even at colleges you specialise not doing all those subjects so that even when assessing one will feel great with knowledge not like
now, people are not familiar with commerce or Design that is why they don’t feel free to assess us.

Teacher C concurred saying that “Music should be taken out from CAPA and be given full attention as practical subject deals with skill development so it takes long for one to develop e.g. drum beating, playing recorder.”

Teacher A is of the opinion that, “it’s high time that the government supply the relevant equipment for teachers to teach effectively.” Teacher B also insisted that:

Classroom specifically for music should be created in primary schools and should be equipped with resources or materials with relevant information as well as musical instruments to enhance the teaching and learning of the subject.

Teacher C further said that “music rooms should be built in schools where proper music lessons will be conducted.”

Teacher A suggests that, “teachers holding PTC should be work-shopped so that they won’t find music topics difficult, while waiting for further studies.” Teacher B found it wise to have, “in-service music workshops run regularly or annually to help equip teachers with more knowledge and skills for teaching music concepts.” The same teacher further suggested that:

The government or curriculum developers identify those teachers who are capable and have displayed much interest in music for further training and specialise in the teaching of music in primary schools […] during their training they should be provided with much knowledge and skills on music teaching rather than general knowledge on many subjects.

Teacher A explained that “there should be uniformity when dividing these CAPA modules just like any other subject.” Teacher B agreed saying that “a balanced music
curriculum and syllabus should be well developed with appropriate objectives to be taught to primary school children.” Teacher B also asserted that “music should be examined in primary schools like other examinable curriculum subjects.”

4.3 SUMMARY

In short, the data was presented in two ways that is, graphically and thematically. The preset and broad themes were drawn from quantitative and qualitative data as presented above. The main findings from the presented data are discussed in Section 4.4 below and I summarise these as:

1. CAPA syllabus expectations
2. Classroom practice
3. Time allocated to music within CAPA
4. Support given to music teachers by the management
5. Impact of teaching music within CAPA on teachers

4.4 DISCUSSION OF THE FINDINGS

In this section of the chapter, I discuss the findings of the research. Some of the themes are divided and discussed according to categories and others are simply singular themes.

4.4.1 Theme 1: CAPA syllabus expectations

This theme is accompanied by two categories - the planning for the subject and the integration of the CAPA disciplines.
### 4.4.1.1 Planning for the subject

Data revealed that teachers have problems with planning for CAPA disciplines. Teachers’ planning is inadequate because they plan for those subject areas they feel comfortable with when teaching and leave out others. The syllabus requires teachers to develop a year plan for all the eight subject areas in CAPA and these should include objectives, topics and subject matter, activities, methods of teaching, assessment and resources for each subject area per term. The inadequacy of CAPA planning by the teachers was validated when one teacher gave an example of a plan for upper primary level (Standard Six) as shown below:

Figure: 4.3: Example of a plan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A. SCHEME OF WORK</th>
<th>B. TEACHING PLAN</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Topic</strong></td>
<td><strong>Objective</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety and first aid</td>
<td>- Apply preventative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>measures in dealing with</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>infections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Needs and wants – importance of</td>
<td>- Explain the meaning of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>production</td>
<td>production - differentiate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>between production and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>consumers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time and rhythm</td>
<td>- Identify a minim and a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>semi-breve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- State time values of a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>minim and semi breve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Draw a minim and semi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>breve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Demonstrate rhythmic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>combination of quaver,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>crotchet, minim and semi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>breve</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

89
- Create a short rhythmic combination of quaver, crotchet, minim and semi breve
- Identify the equivalents of quaver, crotchet, minim and semi breve in tonic solfa

| - Create a short rhythmic combination of quaver, crotchet, minim and semi breve | Not indicated | Not indicated |
| - Identify the equivalents of quaver, crotchet, minim and semi breve in tonic solfa | Not indicated | Not indicated |

Even though this was provided by one of the teachers as an example of a plan it is incomplete because music content and activities are not indicated as they should be. Since the given plan does not include all of what is expected of the teachers, thereby indicating that teachers do not plan for all subject areas, I argue that syllabus expectations are not met. In the above plan there are a number of aspects that have not been indicated under content and activities.

As explained by the teachers in Sections 4.2.1 above, inadequate planning is caused by a number of factors including lack of knowledge and skills, lack of subject content interpretation because teachers were not trained in some of the CAPA disciplines and the fact that CAPA is a non-examinable subject. In some instances, these come as a result of some teachers being non-music specialists but are expected to teach it within CAPA under the assumption that qualified classroom teachers are capable of teaching all subjects as earlier observed in Section 4.2.2. Thus, I would conclude that the teaching of CAPA is not different from the British music education system as presented by Hallam et al (2009) where it has been concluded that music is not adequately taught because it is classified under the umbrella of the performing arts. The primary school teachers in Botswana may have studied music during their training but do not have the experience in teaching music within CAPA.

Atherton (2010:12) states that, “it is the belief of many teachers that the scheme of work exists only to satisfy the management and inspectors, longing for evidence of adequate
practice.” Using Atherton’s (2010) idea, I posit that CAPA teachers in Botswana may be generating their plans, such as the one above, to please the curriculum authorities knowing that there are no effective monitoring and evaluation processes in place and so they get away with things. Teachers are of the view that for them to overcome such problems, schools should have a central scheme of work and teaching plan according to cluster schools for standardisation and improved subject coverage articulation and lesson delivery.

4.4.1.2 Integration of the CAPA disciplines

This category focuses on the teachers’ ability to integrate music with the other seven subject areas within CAPA. According to McNeil (1985:3) integration means “to coordinate, blend or bring together separate parts into a functioning, unified and harmonised whole.” Findings reveal that the integration of the subject areas within CAPA is not executed as expected. Teachers stated that they teach subjects in isolation and there is little integration of music with other CAPA fields as expressed by Teacher B when he said that “I lack the skills of integrating it with other CAPA subjects.” The same teacher argued that “the government of Botswana is advocating for pupils to be taught musical skills and knowledge on the basis of listening, performing and creative skills which we do not have.”

Such utterances clearly demonstrate teachers’ lack of knowledge and skills on how to teach the CAPA disciplines which would help them integrate the subject disciplines and challenges that come with the workload whereby teachers end up not teaching some of the disciplines. It could thus be argued that although several authors, including Shoemaker (1989), Marsh and Wills (1995), and Chan (2005), are of the contention that a good integration of subjects help achieve more aims than that from separate subjects (Section 2.4), the integration of CAPA subjects in Botswana may result in serious gaps between the syllabus expectations and the classroom practice and I discuss this aspect within one of the five categories of the second theme.
I therefore concur with Alter et al (2009), that the expectation of the CAPA syllabus of teachers integrating all the CAPA disciplines (Music, Dance, Drama, Physical Education, Art and Craft, Design and Technology, Home Economics and Business Studies) is rather unrealistic in that teachers are not adequately trained in how to integrate such subject areas. Of course, some teachers possess knowledge of music, but they were of the inclination that it would be impossible for them to know and be competent in teaching facts about CAPA. Thus, the teachers recommended that the CAPA disciplines should be disintegrated and aligned according to similarity in terms of content, for example, grouping Music with Art and Craft, Physical Education with Dance and Drama, so that training on integration is effectively streamlined. This combination, as suggested by the teachers, will then make them more confident in integrating the subject areas.

4.4.2 Theme 2: Classroom practice

This theme focuses on a number of aspects relating to the teaching and learning of CAPA generally and specifically, music within CAPA at classroom level. Here, the discussion is on the interaction of teachers and learners, the handling of the teaching and learning situation, including content, resources, assessment, attitude and activities, as well as teaching and learning approaches and strategies. The elements listed above relating to classroom practice are combined and discussed under five categories: content knowledge of CAPA subject areas; resources; teaching and learning approaches and strategies; assessment and attitudes and values.

4.4.2.1 Content knowledge of CAPA subject areas

Most teachers have limited content knowledge about some subject areas, while a few have adequate content knowledge about some subject areas. The inadequacy of content knowledge is brought about by a lack of experience in integrating the CAPA disciplines and insufficient training in the implementation of CAPA. This was essential because the subject was new and had complexities about the combining and integrating
eight subject areas. Teachers admit to having received training of varying durations and in different ways. Data indicates that at least more than half of the sampled teachers were trained through a month long national education department workshop - eight received their training through a week’s school-based workshop while others did not receive any at all. Also, data revealed that such workshops focused on a selection of subject areas and these were addressed as single subjects with no attention paid on skills for integrating the CAPA subjects.

I argue that the implementation of CAPA was somewhat flawed as teachers were insufficiently trained and therefore, lacked the appropriate preparation and skills for teaching the subject, thus impacting negatively on the classroom practice. The magnitude and complexities of the subject required more than a month of training, particularly that even at College the teachers only majored in two of the integrated subjects. The situation is even worse for those who received a week’s training or no training at all. Due to limited training, teachers experienced confusion in the teaching of CAPA, combining the known and the unknown. As Teacher A indicated: “As a music teacher, I have experienced confusion when teaching CAPA as it comprises of some subjects which I have not been trained in or did not specialise in during training.” Participants indicated that the training provided was not sufficient to empower them with adequate content knowledge and strategies for teaching all of the CAPA subject areas.

This is confirmed in the statement that “I am not sure of what I am teaching … I do not really understand some of the objectives.” This confirmation leads me to believe that even the articulation of the objectives was challenging for the teachers and consequently, became one of the problematic issues for classroom practice. Coupled with this, there is ample evidence that the teaching of CAPA and that of music in the classroom did not occur as expected. For example, “the problem is that teachers are not equipped with the content so they chose not to fumble in front of learners and leave out interesting topics to children.” One of the teachers also commented that: “we don’t deliver objectives and content of music as expected within the context of CAPA.” Such confessions demonstrate, I argue, that teachers depended on their sudden desires and
thoughts about what to teach and what not to teach and this was purely based on impulse rather than reason or necessity.

I conclude that content knowledge about subject areas within CAPA is a problem and even the integration of subject areas is not happening because teachers have insufficient content knowledge about the CAPA subject areas. When teachers are not able to integrate, learners also have limited content knowledge of some subject areas and may never learn about connectivity and relational aspects of the subject areas. For learners to acquire knowledge and skills from all the CAPA subject areas, Goodlad (1983) cited in Hovland and Soderberg (2005:7), asserts that “it is necessary to know something about the actual content of the teaching that takes place (the operational curriculum) in order to get a picture of what the students are supposed to learn” as discussed in Chapter Two. The view by Goodlad (1983) suggests that for teachers to achieve their goals they need to know what is in the CAPA curriculum, know the content of the subject areas, and use appropriate resources and strategies to impart the knowledge to the learners. This leads me to discuss the category of resources and how they impacted on classroom practice.

4.4.2.2 Resources

In the case of this research, resources refer to the three normally understood types, namely, human, financial and materials. In this section, I therefore discuss all three resources in the order of human, materials and finances. As indicated in the discussion above, the training of teachers was discovered to be inadequate. I posit that when teachers enrol for teacher qualification, they do so to acquire skills and strategies on teaching in order for them to be productive in the classroom. This was particularly important in the case of CAPA as they also needed to have integration strategies to produce good results.

Although Figure 4.1 indicates that all teachers are qualified, there are some discrepancies in their training that is evident and this had a negative effect on classroom
practice. Some teachers who qualified with the PTC, for example, studied Music as a general subject where they acquired knowledge and teaching methods in Music Theory and singing, as indicated by the data: “Most teachers who did PTC did very little in music.” Also, Figure 4.2 reflected workshops and self-initiated research as some of the forms of training for music teachers within CAPA. This further demonstrates inadequacies in the preparation of teachers “The information I got from the CAPA workshop did not help in the teaching of CAPA because it was based on music and it did not cover everything in music.” Another teacher reported that “Some workshops included some aspects in the CAPA syllabus that’s Music, Art and Craft and Design and technology only.” Again, another teacher complained: “I understand some workshops on the teaching of CAPA were held in some parts of the country but personally I cannot confirm that as I was never part of one.” Here, teaching and learning strategies and approaches to CAPA teaching, the teaching of music within the subject and above all, the integration of the subject areas was sadly lacking. Since teacher training involves equipping teachers with methods, skills and the use of apparatuses in the classroom situation, I now pay attention to materials resources.

Material resources are key aspects in the teaching and learning of music and the arts in general. Evidence from data indicates serious shortages of teaching materials for the smooth running of teaching and learning in the classroom. A Shortage of materials results in teachers being ineffective or ignoring the practical aspects of the subject areas, such as instrument playing, painting, dancing, and the use of props for dramatic plays. Participants indicated that “teachers’ work is ineffective because of lack of relevant and enough materials to the subject.” Even though materials are insufficient, the teachers do improvise in some subject areas to make their teaching fruitful and enjoyable for the learners. For example, “teachers are to neither improvise in almost everything in music, no instruments, and no books for reference nor even stave books to write music items in.”

At another level, data revealed that teachers lack the skills of how to play musical instruments, as most of them did not acquire instrument playing skills during their
training like those who corresponded and the PTC holders. Seemingly, even if the materials were to be available they would still have problems, because they do not know “how to use some of the available aids.” The inadequacy of materials can cause hatred or a loss of interest in both teachers and learners. The syllabus on resources states that “by the end of primary education learners should have developed through working with materials, tools, equipment and instruments to develop skills in working with resources into useful products” (Ministry of Education, 2005:12). In the case of CAPA, the expectation expressed above is unrealistic because of the insufficiency of materials, tools, equipment and instruments in schools. In addition, the inadequacies of materials might de-motivate teachers and make them unproductive. In Botha’s view (2011:165), the total absence of the physical resources is a barrier to effective learning in the classroom. Furthermore, data reflected that there is also lack of infrastructure in schools. The schools are available, but are under-resourced and ill-equipped to teach subject fields in CAPA. For example, there are no music rooms, no laboratories and some schools do not even have electricity. Shortage of materials and lack of infrastructure in schools could lead teachers to neglect the subject and deny learners the knowledge and skills to enjoy and pursue the various subject areas (within CAPA) for their future careers.

One other resource found lacking in the schools was finances. According to policy, government does not provide schools with finances. Instead they supply materials, but these are not sufficient and sometimes there are no resources at all. In light of the above policy guidelines, I argue that if schools were in control of finances, regardless of the percentage, they would be in a position to use their financial resources to purchase needed materials, particularly seeing that there is usually a shortage of equipment provided by the government. Ornstein and Hunkins (1998:296) assert that “money is required for materials and equipment to institutionalise a new program and also necessary to provide often- overlooked human support for the implementation effort.” Due to a lack of resources, teachers tend to ignore practical aspects in the CAPA subject fields and there are no contingency plans to cater for this shortfall. Also, teachers are of the view that government should take the initiative and provide
adequate, relevant and needed resources to schools. If practical aspects of the CAPA curriculum are not addressed, learners are denied skills that can develop them for a better life.

### 4.4.2.3 Teaching and learning approaches and strategies

Regarding teaching methods, data as indicated in Section 4.2.1 above, revealed that teachers struggled with the integrated approach to learning and found themselves incompetent in using a variety of teaching methods, except for the child-centred method. This resulted in teachers teaching selected CAPA subject fields as single subjects and completely ignoring others. Consequently, integration only occurred on paper and not at classroom level. Although teachers have a problem with integration, it could be deduced that teachers help one another as they planned together to deal with negative attitudes towards music teaching. This evidence from data resonates with Senges' (2000) five disciplines theory, especially vision-sharing and team learning, an assertion that encourages groups to work, plan and share ideas to hit their target, thus working together towards a common goal. Smith (2001) concurs that learning requires cooperation between individuals and groups, free and reliable communication, and a culture of trust. All of this supports the idea of collaboration and partnership where teachers could come up with new positive ideas and knowledge on how best to improve teaching and learning, in the case of this research, the integration of CAPA subject areas for better development at schools. Through “team learning and shared vision” (Senge, et al 1994) teachers could also create a variety of assessment methods which I discuss in the next section.

### 4.4.2.4 Assessment

Data reflected that assessment is not effectively conducted by both teachers and their immediate supervisors, as confirmed by the statement that “even the administrators don’t like assessing us when teaching CAPA, they overlook it, and this is because it is not tested.” I posit that the ineffectiveness of assessment is caused by a number of
factors such as: teachers’ insufficient knowledge of the content of the different CAPA subject areas, lack of instrument playing skills, objectives that are left incomplete or ignored, the understanding that CAPA is a non-examinable subject and limited support from the school and departmental managers (I discuss this aspect later under theme 4). I therefore argue that without valid and reliable forms of assessment, learners’ abilities and competences are not developed and explored because there is lack of opportunity for learners to demonstrate the skills they have gained throughout their learning.

The assessment framework from the syllabus includes attempts to measure students' knowledge and skills in creating, performing, and responding to works of the subject areas through “practical tasks, assignments, tests and quizzes to assess learners’ performance throughout the course” (Ministry of Education, 2005:13). In agreement, Goodlad (2004:16) asserts that “the main purpose of learners’ assessment is to promote learning and development.” Goodlad's (2004) idea confirms that assessment can bring better results if effectively handled and fulfilled. Teachers are of a view that better results can only be produced if subject areas are disintegrated with fewer objectives. The ineffectiveness of classroom practice as previously discussed, with respective categories above, might result in negative attitudes towards the subject as discussed in the next category.

4.4.2.5 Attitudes and values

The findings indicated a lack of confidence in teaching music within CAPA as one of the problems encountered by teachers (as graphical and tabular data reflects). Low confidence levels of teachers might be caused by insufficient training and a lack of knowledge and musical skills, as evidenced by less informative workshops attended by teachers which lead to low confidence and low morale. Sihera (2007:64) describes self-confidence as “an attitude that allows one to have positive and realistic perception of oneself and ones abilities.” This presupposes that if teachers can be aware of their needs, have knowledge of their feelings, preferences, strengths, self-acceptance and
have a positive attitude, they can make wise decisions to strengthen their weaknesses and improve their level of confidence in teaching music within CAPA.

Teachers also confirmed that they lack the ability to identify and help learners with the playing of different instruments because they themselves cannot play those instruments, which may result in low self-esteem. The teachers view themselves as having the capacity to learn despite their current limitations as in this example: “I am motivated to further my studies in the field of music.” Senge (1990) supports this view as he asserts that all people constituting the organisation have the capacity to learn despite the existence of non-conducive environment of the organisations in which they operate. I believe that if teachers are given more time to learn all the CAPA subject areas, including instrument playing, they could be in a position to teach music within CAPA in a cost-effective way. Thus, I find it important to look at the time allocated to the subject.

4.4.3 Theme 3: Time allocated to music within CAPA

One significant finding of the study deals with time factors. Data reflected that the time allocated to music teaching within CAPA is not sufficient. Teachers expressed the view that more time is needed for CAPA: “CAPA needs more time than any other subject because it has many subject areas.” The limited time affects the completion of teaching objectives for the particular day. This leads to frustration and high stress levels because lessons and ultimately the syllabus are left incomplete. This has a negative effect on both teachers and learners, especially being that the subject is non-examinable. Both the teachers and the learners see no reason to concentrate on a subject that has no bearing on their examination results for further education. Teachers would instead, rather use the time slot for CAPA, to teach other subjects that are examined. Chapman (2009) suggests ways on how CAPA teachers could manage their time and control in their classrooms in order to produce fruitful results, as he states that time could be improved through better planning, prioritising, controlling your environment, understanding yourself and identifying what you will change about your habits, routines
and attitude. Allocation of time in the timetable needs collaboration, agreement and management between the department of education with regards to school and working hours for learners and teachers, respectively, and school managers and teachers on the one hand. In light of this, I subsequently discuss professional support for teachers in the next section.

4.4.4 Theme 4: Support given to music teachers by the management

Lack of adequate support from school and department administrators also contribute to the under-performance of teachers towards teaching CAPA disciplines as earlier indicated. According to the teachers, this leads to the neglect of the subject, particularly that there are no monitoring and evaluation mechanism for the teaching of CAPA. Teachers believe that curriculum developers need to support schools morally and materially. The other possible reason for lack of support for CAPA teachers is that CAPA is not tested in Primary School Leaving Examinations (PSLE), which lowers the morale and support of the managers as observed earlier. Fullan (1993:64) argues that in the presence of support, “individuals feel encouraged to take risks, by trying something they have never tried before with the knowledge that they will share their success or failures with their colleagues.” Fullan’s (1993) view validates that the presence of positive support from school and department managers could bring about positive results and success in the teaching of CAPA. If teachers are not supported, this could negatively impact on them. I continue, in the next section, to discuss the impact the teaching of music within CAPA has on the teachers.

4.4.5 Theme 5: Impact of teaching music within CAPA on teachers

This theme looks into the number of ways in which the teaching of music within CAPA impacts on the teachers. I discuss this theme in relation to positive and negative impacts, that is, failures and successes, challenges encountered and problems and resolutions to these, as revealed from the data.
The first problem experienced by teachers is the integration of the CAPA disciplines. Data revealed that integration was not taking place because teachers were not properly prepared on how to integrate the CAPA disciplines, yet were expected to integrate all the CAPA fields, including Music, regardless of whether or not they had knowledge on the subject area. The impact aspect comes in when teachers are to integrate what they know with what they do not know. Data revealed that “no teacher is trained to teach all the CAPA subjects” and one participant added “I am willing to teach music within CAPA, however, I lack the skills of integrating it with other CAPA subjects.” This failure might impact on teachers’ confidence and morale, as it also leads to a loss of interest in the integration of the subject areas. Teachers then choose to teach the CAPA subject areas as single subjects and leave other lessons incomplete. All these findings reveal that the syllabus expectations and objectives are not met.

Such problems and impacts however, as expressed by the participants, are not without a solution. As indicated in the data, the integration of music within CAPA should not be a problem as long as there are sufficient workshops and in-service training programmes to equip teachers with skills and provide them with the necessary supervision of the programme to check on the progress made. Therefore, teachers should continually improve and learn as a team on how best to integrate music with other CAPA disciplines. Workshops could form the basis for such learning. Hence, I am inclined to recommend that schools should organise workshops on integrating CAPA disciplines for CAPA teachers as a way of nurturing new and expansive thinking on teaching CAPA subject areas as implied by Senge’s (1990) definition of learning organisation.

Another observed problem of teaching CAPA has to deal with CAPA being a non-examinable subject for the PSLE. As explained by the participants, the fact that CAPA is not examinable lowers teachers’ morale and interest, which leads to a negative attitude towards the subject. As noted earlier, such a negative attitude has since led to assessments not been completed and the omissions of certain subject areas even though they are planned for. A lack of assessment demonstrates that the syllabus expectations are not achieved because the problem was not solved. Hence, the
recommendation, similar to those proposed by Phuthego (2007:ii), Moalosi and Molwane (2008:36) and Mannathoko (2009:227), is that there is need to review the CAPA syllabus with emphasis put on teacher preparedness and other problems that need to be solved at strategic planning levels by policy makers in the department of education.

Data also indicated that all CAPA disciplines are practical subjects that need a lot of teaching resources. As explained earlier, with the necessary teaching resources and equipment, CAPA is supposed to motivate learners practically thereby building practical skills that help them to determine their professional lives. It is apparent from the data that teachers came up with solutions to overcome the challenges and problems they encountered in the teaching of music within CAPA. These solutions enhanced teachers’ capacity to create a favourable learning environment as suggested by Senge (1990:69). This could be explained by the fact that the teachers solve the problem of lack of resources and skills through improvising so as to meet the curriculum expectation of integrating Music with other CAPA fields.

In addition, data indicated the teachers’ initiatives of helping one another deal with the negative attitudes towards the teaching of CAPA. Teachers are also positive that they can help learners to be good and helpful citizens of Botswana. Thus, I am inclined to conclude that, despite all the challenges and the negative impacts that the integration of music within CAPA has had on teachers, the teachers are inflexible that with proper training on how to integrate the CAPA subjects, as well as the appropriate grouping of the CAPA subject areas, they are in a position to carry out their mandate of educating learners. I strongly believe that teachers do not see themselves as helpless, but as active agents able to act upon the structures and systems of which they are a part of, as advocated by Senge (1990:69).

From the forgoing presentations and discussions on the explanation of the impact of teaching music within CAPA, it is evident that the major impacts on teachers are the problems and challenges they encountered in teaching music within CAPA. These
manifest themselves in terms of the difficulty of meeting the curriculum expectations due to a lack of personal musical experience. Hence, the teachers do not deliver the objectives and content of music within the context of CAPA as expected by the CAPA curriculum. Notwithstanding the fact that the teachers were not consulted or that no proper training was provided on how to execute the CAPA syllabus, the teachers operate under the assumption that as general classroom primary school teachers, they are capable of teaching most curriculum subjects regardless of their training. Thus, they see themselves as able to act upon the structures and systems in the primary schools including the teaching of the CAPA syllabus. Therefore, I could intimate that the teachers do not see themselves as helpless reactors but as active participants in shaping their reality, as argued by Senge (1990:69) in Chapter Two.

4.5 SUMMARY

The findings of this study suggest that the lack of proper consultations with the teachers when CAPA was introduced has led teachers to develop a negative attitude towards the subject. According to teachers, they view the subject as a waste of time since it is non-examinable. Some of the teachers acknowledged possessing knowledge in music but a lack of the appropriate skills in integrating it (music) with other CAPA disciplines. In addition, the situation is farther compounded by a lack of support and monitoring from the school administration and other relevant department managers, as well as by the shortage of equipment and relevant material including music books. Thus, for the most part, music is planned for as per the syllabus expectation, but not adequately taught as expected, indicating a major gap between syllabus expectations and classroom practice. Teachers struggle with the integration, ending up omitting those disciplines, including Music, which they feel are difficult to integrate and teach. During the process, teachers have since lost interest, feel frustrated and their level of confidence in teaching music has deteriorated. Therefore, the teachers recommend that CAPA disciplines be disintegrated, followed by formal training in teaching music with related subject areas. The conclusion and more recommendations are discussed in the next chapter (Chapter Five).
CHAPTER 5

CONCLUSION, SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 INTRODUCTION

This is the final chapter of the study in which I present the conclusion, summary and recommendations drawn from the findings of the study. I begin with the summary followed by the recommendations and concluding statement.

5.2 SUMMARY OF THE STUDY

I have divided the summary of the study into three sections. Firstly, I discuss the Botswana education system, which culminated with the introduction of the CAPA subject, followed by the theoretical framework and methodology and lastly the findings.

5.2.1 Botswana education system and the introduction of CAPA

Prior to the two national commissions on education of 1977 and 1993, very few, if any trained indigenous teachers at all levels of education were active employers of the education department (Kamau, 2008; Leburu-Sianga & Molobe, 2000). Consequently, as observed in Chapters One and Two, the training of manpower and construction of more schools became one of the greatest challenges faced by the government of Botswana, especially since this had to be accomplished within the shortest time possible. With this scenario, the Ministry of Education was established to address this challenge as well as to equip learners with the effective knowledge, skills, attitudes and values to enable them to participate in a rapidly changing society (Republic of Botswana, 1994). With this mandate, educational reforms and changes that shaped Botswana’s education system to its current state were imperative. This also resulted in the introduction of CAPA into the school curriculum as a non-examination subject. The introduction of CAPA was not smooth as it brought about new challenges with which
teachers had to contend and (my emphasis) this has attracted the attention of researchers such as Phuthego (2007), Moalosi and Molwane (2008) and Mannathoko (2009), as discussed in Chapters One and Two, (Sections 1.1 and 2.6) respectively. Although these researchers focused on certain aspects of CAPA, as observed in the above-mentioned sections, they did not necessarily focus on the topic of my research, that is, how the teaching of music within CAPA impacted on the teachers.

5.2.2 Theoretical framework and methodology

In this study I have drawn ideas from Senge’s (1990:3) learning organisation theory of the five disciplines, namely, personal mastery, mental models, shared visions, team learning and systems thinking. Such ideas, particularly the two principles of personal mastery and mental models, were used to find out what teachers do and how they implement the learning of music within CAPA. By exploring the notions of personal mastery and mental models teachers have, about teaching music within CAPA and the integrated teaching of music with other CAPA subject areas, I was able to learn how this impacts on their daily teaching and learning of the subject.

In addition, Senge’s (1990) theory helped in situating CAPA curriculum changes, learning and practice in Botswana’s upper primary schools. Evidence from data indicated that CAPA teachers are expected to implement a curriculum designed to integrate music with seven other subject areas within CAPA with limited content knowledge and less consultation about the change process. They were expected to comply with the changes and implement them with very little support from the department. Senge’s theory thus became central to my research and with its application it became apparent from the findings of the research that despite the potential of the CAPA teachers, the teaching and learning of CAPA (and that of music within CAPA) was hampered by a number of anomalies such as: lack of content knowledge (of the eight subject fields that were to be integrated) and a lack of skills and resources, thus making the task almost impossible. This, in turn, affected their ability to teach music within CAPA and eventually to practice integrated teaching of the eight subject fields.
that make up CAPA. As explained by Senge (1990), people making up an organisation have the capacity to learn despite the existence of a non-conducive environment of the structures in which they operate to reflect and engage themselves, as it happened with CAPA teachers, there were elements of success.

The study while aimed at investigating the feasibility of offering music as one of the eight subject areas within a single non-examinable learning area, it was also intended to suggest alternative approaches to teaching and learning strategies to suit the CAPA curriculum and learning outcomes, based on the teachers’ perceptions and experiences. Therefore, to successfully explore the impact of teaching music in the context of CAPA as intimated in Chapter One (Section 1.4.1), this research became a descriptive and explanatory one based on a mixed method approach of quantitative and qualitative processes of triangulation to provide validity and generalisability. The study made use of questionnaire surveys and narratives as data collection tools which yielded the results presented in Chapter Four and as summed up below.

5.2.3 The results

This research produced some interesting results where a range of characteristics (in terms of some CAPA syllabus, geographic location, teacher qualification and training) were explored which allowed me to draw conclusions and lessons that could be generalised to all primary schools in Botswana. The results presented were also centred on the teachers’ perceptions, views, attitudes and experiences in teaching music within CAPA. As noted in Chapter Four, teachers were generally of the view that they were not adequately consulted and not well guided on how to integrate the CAPA subject areas. Thus, teachers found it difficult to integrate CAPA as they were not trained in all the subject areas during their studies. The lack of proper consultation by the education authorities as explained by the teachers and as observed in Chapter Four, has led teachers to develop a negative attitude towards the subject, more so because they view the teaching of CAPA as a waste of time since it is a non-examinable subject.
The overriding impression gained from the research study as explained above, was the apparent insufficient training of CAPA subject areas which led to a lack of content knowledge and skill of how to integrate the CAPA disciplines. Also, it emerged that teachers plan for those subject areas they are comfortable with and ignore those they find difficult to teach (see Table 4.1). Thus, it could be concluded that such teachers lack confidence, and the knowledge and skills necessary for the integration of CAPA disciplines. Another significant outcome was the challenges the teachers faced in teaching music within CAPA and how such challenges impacted on the teachers as noted in Chapter Four, such as lack of support, congestion of the CAPA syllabus and lack of the necessary resources. As explained earlier in Chapter Four, these had a negative impact on the teachers which resulted in low levels of morale, a lack of interest in teaching CAPA, as well as a lack of confidence in their ability to meet the syllabus expectations during the actual classroom practice as indicated above.

Apart from the overriding impression gained from the CAPA syllabus expectations and the classroom practice, there are other aspects learnt related to my study. These include practicing survival, adaptive and generative learning by teachers to enhance their capacity to create an acceptable learning environment. Teachers achieved this through finding other alternative resources when striving for better results and trying to meet the syllabus expectations. Moreover, it is also apparent from the findings, that there are voices among the teachers concerning the nature of the CAPA disciplines; the number of subject areas within CAPA; and the level of content taught at primary school level.

As noted in Chapter Four, some teachers are of the view that there has been a mismatch of too many subject fields within CAPA, with the subject areas consequently suffocating each other. Hence, the teachers recommended that the CAPA subject areas be separated and matched accordingly. For instance, music should be grouped with Art and Craft, Physical Education, Dance and Drama. Teachers also felt that through proper consultation, there should be a repackaging of the objectives of the CAPA subjects, such that there are those for primary and secondary schools. However, this
recommendation cannot be concluded in this research, as it remains in the hands of the departmental officials to further explore and consider.

5.3 RECOMMENDATIONS

During my research, certain pertinent issues have been raised and generally these included challenges (and the impacts of such challenges on teachers) as well as the number of subject areas within CAPA. All these are practical issues that form the recommendations from my study as indicated below:

1. There is a great need for proper discussion among stakeholders (curriculum developers, principal education officers, school managers and teachers) on what should be done regarding the problems or challenges facing the integration of the CAPA subject areas. It became evident, from the data, that teachers were not happy with the heavy workload in the syllabus, especially for a non-examination subject. The authorities should thus ensure that they include teachers in the developments of the curriculum so that they also own it.

2. A consideration at colleges of education should be made to design the curriculum in such a way that it covers all the CAPA subject areas for training teachers in all the CAPA disciplines. Such training should be incorporated into the teachers' training programmes and may also include intensive in-service training through regular workshops and seminars. Teachers should be guided on how to integrate subject areas when planning and delivering instructions in CAPA. There is a need to re-align teacher training and integration for ensuring quality teaching in the Botswana education system.

3. The ministry of education together with the CAPA authorities should make adequate provision of resources for CAPA subject areas including indigenous and musical instruments manufactured from locally available materials and infrastructure.
4. CAPA subject areas should be disintegrated and repackaged according to subject similarities such that for example, Music is grouped together with other art forms like Art and Craft, Physical Education, Dance and Drama. The study focused on primary schools in the northern inspectorial area of Botswana only, but this can be applied to other inspectorial areas since they follow the same syllabus. Another study may include the teaching of music in Community Junior and Senior Secondary Schools.

5.4 CONCLUDING STATEMENT

Using the mixed method of quantitative and qualitative approaches centred on a questionnaire survey and narratives, this descriptive and explanatory research has holistically explored the impact of teaching music within CAPA in Botswana upper primary schools. Through this research, I have established in clear and passionate language the challenges faced by the teachers in teaching music within CAPA and the impact the challenges have on the teachers. In addition, I have also unearthed the teachers’ experiences in teaching music as an integrated part of CAPA. The greatest challenge faced by teachers is a lack of knowledge about the CAPA subject areas and a lack of appropriate skills in integrating music with other CAPA subject areas. Although music is schemed for, the teachers struggle with the integration as expected by the CAPA syllabus. They resort to omitting those subjects, including music, which they find difficult to integrate and teach. Thus, generally, I will conclude that during such a process, the teachers have since lost interest, feel frustrated and their level of confidence in teaching CAPA has gone down. In spite of all this, I believe departmental officials; planners and teachers will work as a team and act positively to develop the teaching of music and other CAPA subject areas.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Connelly, F. M. & Clandinin, D. J.  1990.  Stories of experience and Narrative Inquiry:  


APPENDICES
APPENDIX A: Questionnaire

I am a masters research student in the department of music at the Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University in Port Elizabeth, South Africa. The research is an exploration on the impact of teaching music within the Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA) subject in Botswana upper primary schools. I would highly appreciate it if you could kindly assist me by responding to this questionnaire.

Please complete this questionnaire to the best of your ability by placing an “x” to the answer that meets your response. Your participation in this research is greatly appreciated.

SECTION A: BIOGRAPHICAL INFORMATION

A1: To which age group do you belong?

<p>| | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>21 - 35</td>
<td>36 - 45</td>
<td>46 - 55</td>
<td>56 - 65</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A2: Can you indicate your gender?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A3: What is your highest qualification?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PL</th>
<th>PH</th>
<th>PTC</th>
<th>DPE</th>
<th>Degree</th>
<th>Masters</th>
<th>Doctorate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

TEACHERS’ LEARNING AREA DUTIES

A4: Do you teach music in CAPA?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A5: If yes at which level(s)?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Upper Level</th>
<th>Standard 5</th>
<th>Standard 6</th>
<th>Standard 7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

A6: TEACHERS’ EXPERIENCE / TRAINING AS A MUSIC TEACHER

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>College</th>
<th>University</th>
<th>Department Workshops</th>
<th>Own Initiatives</th>
<th>Untrained</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

FOR SECTION B-E: Read the provided statement carefully and tick off the responses that best describe to what extent the statement apply to your school.

Answer these using the five-point likert scale.

The key to the five-point scale are as follows:

1 = Strongly Agree (SA)          2 = Agree (A)          3 = Neutral (N)
4 = Disagree (D)                  5 = Strongly Disagree (SD)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>B</th>
<th>The impact of teaching music within CAPA</th>
<th>RESPONSES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>SA  A  N  D  SD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B1</td>
<td>I am confident with teaching music within the context of CAPA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B2</td>
<td>My learners enjoy music lessons</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B3</td>
<td>I am able to identify and help learners with music skills</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B4</td>
<td>I do improvise when teaching music within CAPA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CAPA syllabus expectations and classroom practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B5</td>
<td>I can help my colleagues with understanding music within CAPA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B6</td>
<td>I help my colleagues deal with negative attitudes towards music</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B7</td>
<td>I do believe that I will help learners become responsible citizens</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B8</td>
<td>I do manage to assess my learners on music within the context of CAPA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B9</td>
<td>I am motivated to further my studies in the field of music</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B10</td>
<td>I still need more training on aspects of music</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>C</th>
<th>CAPA syllabus expectations and classroom practice</th>
<th>RESPONSES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C1</td>
<td>I am able to scheme and plan for music within CAPA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C2</td>
<td>I am able to integrate music with other CAPA subjects</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C3</td>
<td>I am able to deliver music content within the context of CAPA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C4</td>
<td>I understand and use assessment standards</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C5</td>
<td>I am able to use musical instruments within CAPA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C6</td>
<td>I am able to design musical learning and teaching aids within CAPA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C7</td>
<td>I use various teaching methods to equip my learners with music skills within CAPA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C8</td>
<td>I use learner-centered and activity-based approaches</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C9</td>
<td>I am able to explain concepts of music within CAPA to learners who do not understand</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C10</td>
<td>I am able to control and monitor learning of music within CAPA in my class</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>D</th>
<th>Support given to music teachers by the management</th>
<th>RESPONSES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>SA  A  N  D  SD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D1</td>
<td>Effectiveness of the teaching programme is frequently monitored</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D2</td>
<td>Smooth provision of resources, for example, instruments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D3</td>
<td>Administrators support teachers initiative and risk taking</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D4</td>
<td>Administrators empower the staff to make decisions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D5</td>
<td>Administrators are open to change</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D6</td>
<td>Music teachers within CAPA are valued</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D7</td>
<td>Administrators encourages collaboration among the staff</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D8</td>
<td>Sensitive issues can be raised for discussions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D9</td>
<td>Administrators do encourage the CAPA teachers to develop in all CAPA areas of learning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D10</td>
<td>Motivational comments and lessons are given by the management</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>Challenges encountered by music teachers within CAPA</td>
<td>RESPONSES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E1</td>
<td>I cannot cope with workload</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E2</td>
<td>I cannot integrate music with other CAPA subjects</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E3</td>
<td>I am unwilling to change</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E4</td>
<td>I have inadequate content knowledge of teaching music within CAPA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E5</td>
<td>Lack of resources</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E6</td>
<td>No facilities suitable for CAPA subjects</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E7</td>
<td>I am demotivated to be a good music teacher</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E8</td>
<td>Less interest on learning music within CAPA by learners</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E9</td>
<td>Unable to demonstrate the required music skills within CAPA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E10</td>
<td>Unsatisfactory support from the management team</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E11</td>
<td>Incompetent learners</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E12</td>
<td>Never included in most significant school level policies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E13</td>
<td>I am able to improvise during my musical lessons within CAPA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E14</td>
<td>I am unable to assess learners in music within the context of CAPA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E15</td>
<td>I do not have an idea of designing learning and teaching aids for CAPA lessons</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E16</td>
<td>I am not confident with teaching music within the context of CAPA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E17</td>
<td>I teach CAPA subjects independently not integrating</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E18</td>
<td>I am not committed to work</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E19</td>
<td>No continuity climate for professional improvement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E20</td>
<td>I want to give up teaching because of CAPA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SECTION F: Open-ended statements relating to the implementation process of the CAPA subject.

Instructions: Please respond to the following questions as sincerely and honestly as possible.

F1. Information on CAPA

F1.1 How were you introduced to CAPA syllabus before its implementation?

______________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________

F1.2 Explain how CAPA workshops helped you to kick start CAPA programme.

______________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________

F1.3 Explain how you make use of the information you got from the workshop on music and other CAPA subject areas?

______________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________

F1.4 To what extent were the workshops relevant for the music teachers?

______________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________
F1.5 In your own view how would you like workshops to be carried out?

F1.6 Besides the workshops mounted for teachers to introduce the CAPA syllabus, how many other workshops have you attended and how have these workshops benefited you?

F2 Implementation experience

F2.1 What experience did you have as a music teacher before the introduction of CAPA?

F2.2 What were the initial problems you faced the time you started teaching music within CAPA?
F2.3 Describe how you dealt with the concerns or problems you experienced in teaching music within the context of CAPA?

______________________________________________________________________

______________________________________________________________________

______________________________________________________________________

F2.4 How does your current experience as a CAPA teacher compared to your initial experience as a music teacher differ?

______________________________________________________________________

______________________________________________________________________

______________________________________________________________________

F2.5 What are your views about the teaching of music within the context of CAPA?

______________________________________________________________________

______________________________________________________________________

______________________________________________________________________

F3 General experience of music teachers within the context of CAPA.

F3.1 Describe how other music colleagues feel about teaching music within CAPA?

______________________________________________________________________

______________________________________________________________________

______________________________________________________________________

F3.2 What are your views about the teaching of music within the context of CAPA?
F3.3 Explain how other teachers within your school view CAPA.

F3.4 What alternative strategies would you suggest to teach CAPA in your schools?

F4 Challenges

F4.1 What challenges are you faced with in the teaching of music within CAPA?

F4.2 How do those challenges impact on your performance as a teacher?

F4.3 What are your perceived gaps that exist between the CAPA syllabus and the classroom practice?
F4.4 What impact do those gaps have on you as a CAPA teacher?

F4.5 What recommendations would you suggest regarding the teaching of music within CAPA?

THANK YOU FOR YOUR COOPERATION.

Kholisani Moswate (71869299)
APPENDIX B: Narratives

Verbal information given to the three teachers: who participated in writing their stories on the teaching of music within the Creative and Performing Arts

Good morning ladies and gentlemen. As you know that you are the selected three to write about your work, I would like you to write about your perceptions, feelings, views and experiences on teaching music within CAPA and make recommendations.

Thank you for your cooperation.
APPENDIX C: Oral information

Oral information given to participants prior their participation: on the aims objectives of the study and requirements on their input.

Ladies and Gentlemen: my name is Kholisani Moswate. I am a music lecturer at Francistown collage of Education but currently a student at Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University studying for my Masters in music. The aim of my study is to explore the impact of teaching music within the Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA) subject. However, the aim is further divided into objectives which are:

- To explore the perceived impact that teaching music within CAPA has on teachers.
- To investigate the teachers’ experiences in teaching music as an integrated part of CAPA.
- To examine the possible challenges that the music teachers are faced with in teaching music within CAPA.
- To make recommendations based on the teachers’ perceptions about teaching music within the context of CAPA the challenges they are faced with in integrating music with other CAPA subjects and possible impact that teaching music within CAPA has on them.

I kindly request your assistance in the study by filling in the questionnaires. In these questionnaires you should not write your name, telephone number, school’s name or any information that can identify you or link you to the questionnaire. The information you provide will be treated with great confidentiality. It will be used for the purpose of this study only and nothing else. Feedback from this study will be made available electronically to anyone upon request. This is a voluntary participation and you may pull out of the study at any time, if you feel uncomfortable or otherwise. Thank you for taking time off your busy schedules to listen and answer my questionnaires.

Moswate K
APPENDIX D: Permission letters

SAVINGRAM

FROM: Director Regional Operations
Ministry of Education & Skills
Development (North East Region)

TEL: 2412266
FAX: 2418269

TO: School Heads:
Pelotshwaana
Ikhutseng
Aerodrome
Our Lady
Maradu
Nyangabgwe

REF: PE/FR/IA 1/19/171 (7) 2nd July 2010

INTRODUCTION: MS KHO LISANI MOSWATE

Ms. Kholisani Moswate is a student with the University of Nelson Mandela
Metropolitan doing her masters in Music. Please allow her to do her research
in your school.

Thank you.
REF: PENEW 11971 (13)

30 June 2010

Ms Kholisai Moswate
Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University

Dear Madam

REQUEST TO USE CAPA MUSIC TEACHERS

Reference is made to your letter dated 24/06/10 on the above subject matter.

Permission is granted to you to use North East School:

Yours faithfully

S. Mokgachane
For PEO I-North East

Cc: Principal Education Officer – I North
    Regional Director – North East
Music Department
Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University PO
Box 77000. PORT ELIZABETH 6031 South
Africa
Tel. 041 504 2059; Fax No. 086 699 2490;
E-mail address: zo.twani@nmmu.ac.za

24 June 2010

The Regional Principal Education Officer 1
North Region Inspectorial Area
FRANCISTOWN
To Whom It My Concern

RE: LETTER OF INTRODUCTION: KHOLISANI MOSWATE

This letter serves to introduce Mrs Kholisani Moswate. She is a registered student for the
degree of master in music (student no: 204034000) in the Music Department of the Nelson
Mandela Metropolitan University in Port Elizabeth (South Africa). Mrs Moswate is currently
doing research titled: Exploring the impact of teaching music within the context of CAPA in
Botswana upper primary schools. She will be conducting her field work in some of the northern
region inspectorial areas, focusing on upper primary schools in Botswana. Initially she will
commence with her pilot survey from 2 July to 15 July 2010 and then followed by a final survey
in the month of September 2010.

Mrs Moswate would require assistance from the School Heads and CAPA teachers in your
inspectorial area, for the purpose of her research. Thus we seek permission for her to conduct
her field work in primary schools in the northern region of Botswana.

Your assistance and guidance will be highly appreciated.

Yours faithfully

Mrs Z. Twani: Research Supervisor, Department of Music (NMMU)
Music Department

Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University PO Box 77000. PORT ELIZABETH 6031 South Africa

Tel. 041 504 2059; Fax No. 086 699 2490;

Email address: zo.twani@nmmu.ac.za

24 June 2010

The Principal Education Officer II
North Region
North-east west

Dear Sir/ Madam

**RE: REQUEST TO USE THE CAPA (MUSIC) TEACHERS IN YOUR INSPECTORIAL AREA FOR MY FIELDWORK**

I write to request your permission to interview CAPA teachers in your inspectorial area with regard to my research towards the degree of Master in music (M MUS Ed) with the Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University (South Africa)., I am conducting research on the topic: Exploring the impact of teaching music within the context of CAPA in Botswana upper primary schools.

Your assistance is highly appreciated.

Thanking you well in advance

Yours Faithfully

__________________________

Kholisani Moswate (NMMU music student)
Music Department

Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University PO Box 77000. PORT ELIZABETH 6031 South Africa

Tel. 041 504 2059; Fax No. 086 699 2490;
E-mail address: zo.twani@nmmu.ac.za

24 June 2010

The Principal Education Officer II
North Region
North-east east

Dear Sir/ Madam

RE: REQUEST TO USE THE CAPA (MUSIC) TEACHERS IN YOUR INSPECTORIAL AREA FOR MY FIELDWORK

I write to request your permission to interview CAPA teachers in your inspectorial area with regard to my research towards the degree of Master in music (M MUS Ed) with the Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University (South Africa). I am conducting a research on the topic: Exploring the impact of teaching music within the context of CAPA in Botswana upper primary schools.

Your assistance is highly appreciated.

Thanking you well in advance

Yours Faithfully

______________________________

Kholisani Moswate (NMMU music student)
Music Department
Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University PO Box 77000. PORT ELIZABETH 6031 South Africa
Tel. 041 504 2059; Fax No. 086 699 2490;
E-mail address: zo.twani@nmmu.ac.za

24 June 2010

The Principal Education Officer II
North Region
Francistown

Dear Sir/ Madam

RE: REQUEST TO USE THE CAPA (MUSIC) TEACHERS IN YOUR INSPECTORIAL AREA FOR MY FIELDWORK

I write to request your permission to interview CAPA teachers in your inspectorial area with regard to my research towards the degree of Master in music (M MUS Ed) with the Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University (South Africa), I am conducting a research on the topic: Exploring the impact of teaching music within the context of CAPA in Botswana upper primary schools.

Your assistance is highly appreciated.

Thanking you well in advance

Yours Faithfully

Kholisani Moswate (NMMU music student)
Music Department

Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University PO Box 77000. PORT ELIZABETH 6031 South Africa

Tel. 041 504 2059; Fax No. 086 699 2490;
E-mail address: zo.twani@nmmu.ac.za

24 June 2010

The School Head
North Region
Francistown
Dear Sir/ Madam

**RE: REQUEST TO USE THE CAPA (MUSIC) TEACHERS IN YOUR SCHOOLS FOR MY FIELDWORK**

I write to request your permission to interview CAPA teachers in your school with regard to my research towards the degree of Master in music (M MUS Ed) with the Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University (South Africa). I am conducting a research on the topic: Exploring the impact of teaching music within the context of CAPA in Botswana upper primary schools.

Your assistance is highly appreciated.

Thanking you well in advance

Yours Faithfully

---------------------------------------------

Kholisani Moswate (NMMU music student)
Music Department
Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University PO Box 77000. PORT ELIZABETH 6031 South Africa
Tel. 041 504 2059; Fax No. 086 699 2490;
E-mail address: zo.twani@nmmu.ac.za

24 June 2010

The School Head
North Region
North-east east

Dear Sir/ Madam

**RE: REQUEST TO USE THE CAPA (MUSIC) TEACHERS IN YOUR SCHOOLS FOR MY FIELDWORK**

I write to request your permission to interview CAPA teachers in your school with regard to my research towards the degree of Master in music (M MUS Ed) with the Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University (South Africa),. I am conducting a research on the topic: Exploring the impact of teaching music within the context of CAPA in Botswana upper primary schools.

Your assistance is highly appreciated.

Thanking you well in advance

Yours Faithfully

________________________________________
Kholisani Moswate (NMMU music student)
Music Department
Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University PO Box 77000. PORT ELIZABETH 6031 South Africa
Tel. 041 504 2059; Fax No. 086 699 2490;
E-mail address: zo.twani@nmmu.ac.za

24 June 2010

The Principal Education Officer II
North Region
North-east west

Dear Sir/ Madam

**RE: REQUEST TO USE THE CAPA (MUSIC) TEACHERS IN YOUR INSPECTORIAL AREA FOR MY FIELDWORK**

I write to request your permission to interview CAPA teachers in your inspectorial area with regard to my research towards the degree of Master in music (M MUS Ed) with the Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University (South Africa)., I am conducting a research on the topic: Exploring the impact of teaching music within the context of CAPA in Botswana upper primary schools.

Your assistance is highly appreciated.

Thanking you well in advance

Yours Faithfully

________________________________________

Kholisani Moswate (NMMU music student)
APPENDIX F: RT I – clearance letter

Ref: H/11/ART/MUS-011
11 April 2011
Mrs K Moswate
Student Number 204034000
9 Wavecrest Beach Road Homewood
PORT ELIZABETH

Dear Mrs Moswate

THE IMPACT OF TEACHING MUSIC WITHIN THE CREATIVE AND PERFORMING ARTS SUBJECT IN SELECTED UPPER PRIMARY SCHOOLS IN BOTSWANA

Your above-entitled application for ethics approval served at the RTI Higher Degrees sub-committee of the Faculty of Arts Research, Technology and Innovation Committee. We take pleasure in informing you that the application was approved by the Committee. The Ethics clearance reference number is H/11/ART/MUS-011, and is valid for three years, from 6 April 2011 – 6 April 2014. Please inform the RTI-HDC, via your supervisor, if any changes (particularly in the methodology) occur during this time. An annual affirmation to the effect that the protocols in use are still those, for which approval was granted, will be required from you. You will be reminded timeously of this responsibility. We wish you well with the project.

Yours sincerely

Ms Jannet Nxati

N XATI

FACULTY OFFICER

cc: Promoter/Supervisor

HOD School Representative: Faculty