An investigation into Public Participation in the formulation of the Local Economic Development (LED) strategy for Emalahleni Local Municipality.

M. Mente

2011
An investigation into Public Participation in the formulation of the Local Economic Development (LED) strategy for Emalahleni Local Municipality.

By Mtutuzeli Mente

SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS OF THE DEGREE OF MAGISTER ARTIUM IN DEVELOPMENT STUDIES AT THE NELSON MANDELA METROPOLITAN UNIVERSITY (NMMU)

2011

Supervisor: Mr D. Date
## Contents

Abstract \hspace{1cm} v
Declaration \hspace{1cm} vi
Dedication \hspace{1cm} vii
List of abbreviations & acronyms \hspace{1cm} viii

Chapter: 1. Introduction and context  \hspace{1cm} 1
1.1 General Introduction \hspace{1cm} 1
1.2 Delimitation of the study \hspace{1cm} 3
1.3 Problem Statement \hspace{1cm} 5
1.4 Research Questions \hspace{1cm} 6
1.5 Aims of the Research \hspace{1cm} 9
1.6 Definition of terms \hspace{1cm} 9
1.7 Overview of chapters \hspace{1cm} 11

Chapter: 2. An overview of Authentic Public Participation and Local Economic Development (Examining links between the two concepts) \hspace{1cm} 13
2.1 Introduction \hspace{1cm} 13
2.2 What is meant by Authentic Public Participation? \hspace{1cm} 15
2.3 Participation tools \hspace{1cm} 19
2.4 Levels of commitment to public participation \hspace{1cm} 20
2.5 Legislation that supports Public Participation \hspace{1cm} 23
2.5.1 The South Africa Constitution Act 108, 1996 \hspace{1cm} 23
2.5.2 The Municipal Systems Act 32, 2000 \hspace{1cm} 25
2.5.3 The Municipal Structures Act 117, 1998 \hspace{1cm} 26
2.6 Other Policy Instruments supporting Authentic Public Participation \hspace{1cm} 26
2.6.1 The Public participation Policy Framework, 2005 \hspace{1cm} 26
2.6.2 The White Paper on Local Government, 1998 \hspace{1cm} 28
2.7 The Concept of Local Economic Development. \hspace{1cm} 31
2.8 Conclusion \hspace{1cm} 37

Chapter: 3. Research Methodology \hspace{1cm} 38
3.1 Introduction \hspace{1cm} 38
3.2 Conceptualization and Operationalization of Authentic Public Participation. \hspace{1cm} 38
3.2.1 Conceptualizing Authentic Public Participation \hspace{1cm} 38
3.2.2 Operationalizing Authentic Public Participation 39
3.3 Research Plan 42
3.4 Research Methodology 44
3.4.1 Qualitative Research Methodology 44
3.5 What is a Case Study? 46
3.6 Interviewing 47
3.6.1 Sampling for interviews 49
3.7 Content Analysis 51
3.7.1 Application of Content Analysis to LED strategy (2010-2015) Document. 55
3.8 Discourse Analysis 57
3.8.1 Application of Discourse Analysis 60
3.9 Qualitative Interviews 61
3.10 Conclusion 62

Chapter 4: Findings
4.1 Introduction 64
4.2 Results from Content Analysis of LED strategy (2010-2015) 64
document.
4.3 Results from applying Discourse Analysis to the LED document 70
4.5 Analysing Qualitative Interviews 72
4.6 Conclusion 72

Chapter 5: Conclusions, Limitations of the study and recommendations
5.1 Introduction 76
5.1.1 Problem statement 76
5.1.2 Research questions 76
5.1.3 Aims of the Research 77
5.2 Summary of findings 77
5.3 Recommendations 79
5.4 Conclusions 80

Bibliography
Appendixes
Abstract
This research study examined public participation activities in Lady Frere during the LED strategy formulation process. Lady Frere is one of the three small towns constituting Emalahleni Local Municipality (ELM). A review of existing literature and legal frameworks suggest that authentic participation by the public occurs when the dimensions of representativeness, interactiveness, use of stakeholder/public inputs and the quality of public inputs are satisfied. The current study sought to identify conditions that would serve as a measurement to be satisfied before we can say authenticity was factored into the public participation effort during the Local Economic Development (LED) strategy formulation process in Lady Frere.

A three-tier model was adopted to assess the performance of the ELM public involvement initiatives during the LED process. Key indicators of the four dimensions of authenticity were formulated and used to determine authenticity of these initiatives (programs). The data for this study came from analysing the LED strategy (2010-2015) document and the qualitative interviews held with purposively selected respondents. Nineteen respondents representing different institutions in Lady Frere agreed to be interviewed for the study. Organisations represented included public service institutions in operation in Lady Frere, private formal businesses in operation in the area and some civil society structures present in the town.

The results of this study suggest that the municipality fell short of implementing public participation programs that achieved authenticity during the LED strategy formulation process. A careful and well-intentioned use of various public participation tools that embrace increased interaction between municipal employees and the public can assist in achieving better levels of authenticity in their public involvement initiatives. The willingness of municipal staff to adopt new ideas and innovations learned during public engagements is key to achieving higher levels of authenticity in their programs. Municipal participation programs would greatly benefit from training that increases individual acceptance of public participation as a valid service delivery mechanism. The researcher took opportunity to suggest the following recommendations for the ELM to work towards:

- Increased opportunities for occurrence of authentic public participation.
- Creation of individual ownership of authenticity in public participation.
- Creation of community partnerships to foster authenticity in public participation.
DECLARATION

I, Mtutuzeli Mente, solemnly declare that this treatise is my own work, and has not been submitted by me for evaluation at any other University. It is the product of my work through the professional guidance of my supervisor.

Mtutuzeli Mente

........................................

Date: 04-04-2012
Dedication

Firstly, I thank the Almighty God for the successful completion of my studies. He is omniscient and presides over all knowledge and wisdom.

This study is dedicated to a range of people who are important to me. My late mother Nompucuko Mente encouraged me to be the person I wanted to be, even in challenging circumstances. May her soul rest in the comfort and splendour of the Almighty. My adorable wife Homba and my pretty daughter Sibabalwe will always occupy a special place in my heart and my life. I owe this study to them, the support and tolerance they have shown throughout the period of this study is remarkable. I love them very much and I thank the Lord for them. My family in Komga believed in me to carry out this project. That invigorated me in a big way - I thank God for them too. My fellow worshipers at His Grace Tabernacle in Queenstown put up with my absence and non-participation in some important church programs, my brethren in Christ Jesus I owe this to your love and compassion. Thank you for demonstrating patience with me during this rather lonesome period. I am greatly indebted to you. Finally, to all the children of God out there, who are on the brink of loosing hope - this study aims to assist in the endeavour to bring change to your everyday socio-economic realities. I dedicate this study to every one of you. Thank you ever so much, I love you.
# List of abbreviations and acronyms

ANC – African National Congress  
CBO – Community Based Organization  
CHD – Chris Hani District  
ELM – Emalahleni Local Municipality  
ELM-LED - Emalahleni Local Municipality Local Economic Development  
IMF – International Monetary Fund  
IPED – Integrated Planning and Economic Development  
ISRDS – Integrated Sustainable Rural Development Strategy  
LED – Local Economic Development  
NGO – Non-Governmental Organization  
PGDP – Provincial Growth and Development Plan  
PPF – Public Participation Framework  
SA – South Africa  
SWOT – Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities & Threats
Chapter 1: Introduction and context

1.1 General introduction

The focus of this study was the level of participation allowed the public of Lady Frere, in the Emalahleni Local Municipality (ELM) during the formulation of the Local Economic Development (LED) strategy (2010-2015). The primary interest here was to establish how authentic the participation by the public was during this process, if there was any. Authentic public participation – referred to a ‘situation in which citizens are allowed space as equal partners in municipal planning and decision-making. Envisaged, is a situation where the voice of the public influences the decisions taken by councillors and municipal officials.’ (Davids, 2005)

Public participation provides citizens with platforms to access and influence public institutions at various levels including the technical, planning and implementation levels. In the context of governance, public participation is a way of ensuring representation and accountability. (Figueroedo, 2005)

Just how much space was allowed the public of Lady Frere to participate during the formulation of the current LED strategy? The current study sought to find answers to this question.

Accordingly, literature on Local Economic Development (LED) calls for wide participation by all the stakeholders in an economy – to achieve the commitment required it to succeed. This economic strategic planning process thrives on participation by all identified relevant stakeholders, to give multiple perspectives about the circumstances of their locality. LED requires all citizens to jointly assess the circumstances of their locality (SWOT analysis) and decide on pathways to bring about the changes deemed necessary to make their economy developmental and growing. In growing economies, jobs are expected. Importantly, this strategy aims at bringing about employment and effectively reducing poverty in local spaces. Participation by all stakeholders is key to gaining a multidimensional perspective of that temporary situation – (the situation that must be changed) and carve alternative ways of dealing with it. This means a collective vision, from a collective assessment of the locality by its constituents or stakeholders, for change. (Blakely, 2002; Nel, 2001)

Local Governments and their attendant municipalities are constitutional entities charged with ensuring development and service provision in their localities. They
execute on a myriad of government functions at a local level. They must see to infrastructure development and maintenance, they must provide basic services like water and sanitation, they must ensure that there is electricity for both businesses and households, and they must ensure a secure living environment for their citizens – mentioning just a few. All these municipal functions add to the sense of local citizens enjoying their constitutionally guaranteed rights to the full. The critical nature of public participation in local governance in South Africa made public participation, by Lady Frere public, in the LED strategy formulation process an important subject of academic research.

It was therefore important for this study to find out the experiences and understandings the Lady Frere public had about the LED strategy formulation and its implementation processes. Their initial involvement and sustained support for the process had to be established, it is important that stakeholders should be involved throughout the policy/project cycle. For this reason, qualitative interviews were scheduled with purposively selected respondents in Lady Frere. In addition, a critical analysis of the LED strategy (2010-2015) document was conducted using content and discourse analysis methods. This preceded the interview schedules with willing respondents. The LED strategy (2010-2015) document was available as secondary source of data and did not have to be sought like primary data (interviews). For that reason analysis of the available data was the first to be carried out.

The researcher chose Lady Frere as a case study for three reasons. Firstly, Lady Frere is the seat of the ELM – it promised better insights into the LED process that was of interest to the researcher. Indeed, policies and regulations governing the locality are conceived there. Secondly, Lady Frere is the more economically active of the three towns that constitute ELM – co-ordination of such efforts as required when formulating the LED strategy and public participation would likely start there. Thirdly, the researcher works for an agency with the main office serving the municipal area in Lady Frere – it was convenient and cost effective to conduct the study with respondents in Lady Frere than in Dordrecht and Indwe (other towns forming the ELM.). Time was another major factor – the researcher settled to using the lunch hour breaks for interviews to avoid disrupting the work done by the respondents and to balance own work schedule.
Significant attempts are said to be made in the ELM, Lady Frere particularly, to ensure authentic and effective involvement of the public in matters of development and governance in the locality. The results of these attempts remain unclear since no research has been conducted in that area in the ELM. The sense that seems prevailing, however, is that most South African municipalities are struggling to coordinate multiple efforts required to bring about viable LED strategies. (Nel, 2001)

A review of literature, legal frameworks and policies suggests that authentic public participation occurs when certain dimensions of authenticity have been satisfied. These dimensions include representativeness, interactiveness, use of public inputs in decision-making and the quality of inputs by the public. (Figueredo, 2005; Zamor, 2005; Municipal Systems Act, 2004; Public Participation Framework, 2005)

1.2 Delimitation of the study

This study examined the formulation process of the ELM-LED strategy (2010 -2015) with specific interest being authentic participation in these processes by the public of Lady Frere. The study was therefore limited to Lady Frere. As earlier pointed out in the introduction, Lady Frere is the seat of the ELM, which comprises of two other small towns of Dordrecht and Indwe. The ELM is in the Chris Hani District (CHD) in the northwestern part of the Eastern Cape province. The ELM has six directorates but the study focuses on only one, the IPED directorate. The directorate is located at the ELM municipal offices in Lady Frere, 43 Indwe Road.

Thus, the study inevitably enquired into the processes building up to the LED strategy (2010-2015) formulation. A thorough analysis of the LED policy document was conducted (using content analysis and discourse analysis methods). In addition, qualitative interviews with selected stakeholders in the Lady Frere economy were conducted to check the level of their participation in LED strategy formulation. The purposiveness of this selection is characteristic of qualitative studies and negates the requirement of representativeness placed on quantitative studies.

Ezzy D. (2002) observes that where qualitative data analysis is concerned; the most important thing to remember when sampling cases for observation is that it is purposeful. “A purposeful sample is one that provides a clear criterion or rationale for the selection of participants or places to observe or events that relate to the research.
questions”. It was the initial intention of this study to cover a broad spectrum of stakeholders but certain stakeholders could not make the scheduled appointments for interviews, others were just too busy and could not be reached to schedule interviews. The respondents who participated in the interviews included a youth representative, representatives of the various businesses operating in Lady Frere, including representatives from the local taxi industry, representatives of the various government departments in operation in Lady Frere and efforts to interview political organizations and officials of the municipality (including councillors) drew a limited response. Only two respondents came from that front. The researcher had to, then, settle for available respondents as available sources of data. Thus, data from analysing the LED policy document and the transcriptions from interviews, provided insights into what processes were actually followed when formulating this policy. In total, only nineteen respondents freely agreed to be interviewed. The insights they shared illuminated certain points on the issue of interest to the researcher. Participation by stakeholders in strategy formulation was the focal point. The interest was using an appropriate measure that would provide insights into the process of formulating the LED strategy. As earlier intimated, satisfying of four-dimensional requirements of authentic public participation – during the LED strategy formulation process was tested. These four dimensions were representativeness, interactiveness, use of public inputs in decision-making and quality of public inputs. These would aggregately constitute a measure to be used to test the authenticity of participation by the Lady Frere public in the LED strategy formulation process. Findings from operationalizing authentic public participation in this way and applying content analysis and discourse analysis methods follow in the relevant sections of this report.

Time constraints and ethical concerns prevented the researcher from pestering other intended respondents once it became clear that, for reasons better known to them, they were reluctant to participate in the study. The researcher picked up the sentiment that people do not want to be seen as bad mouthing councillors and public officials. Therefore, I settled for relevant available respondents.

A more extensive research is required to investigate authenticity and effectiveness of Public Involvement programmes currently in use in the ELM and other local municipalities in the district.
1.3 Problem Statement

The idea of Authentic Public Participation resonates well with the one of Local Economic Development. They both envisage all stakeholders in a community coming together to collectively determine the opportunities that can be explored to make sure that their economy/environment creates employment opportunities, thereby reducing poverty of its citizens. This interactive process requires broad commitment from all
sectors of the local economy or locality to succeed. The effort to reduce unemployment and poverty should be a collective endeavour, it cannot be individual. In the ELM, the researcher’s observation is that LED forum meetings are not as representative as they should be. These meetings are mainly attended by some officials of the various government departments in operation in the area. The private business sector and the civil society are marked for their absence from this very important economic debate platform. This fragmented approach to planning and doing things, undermines the idea of participatory decision-making by all stakeholders, which defines LED planning, and is mandated by legislation guiding developmental local governance in South Africa.

1.4 Research Questions
The two central questions of this study are the following:

1. How was the notion of *authentic public participation* factored into the formulation of the LED strategy (2010-2015) in the Emalahleni Local Municipality (Using Lady Frere as a case study)?
2. What are the indicators to show that authentic public participation occurred during the LED strategy (2010-2015) formulation process?

This research project seeks to find out the extent to which the Lady Frere public was allowed space to contribute as equal partners in the LED formulation process.

As alluded to earlier, four dimensions of authenticity were identified to measure the authenticity of the LED strategy formulation process. (See Figueredo, 2005)

1. **Representativeness of the LED formulation process:** This dimension examines the extent to which the LED strategy formulation process was successful in attracting and engaging stakeholder’s representative of the population to be impacted by this economic policy direction in Lady Frere. It relates to the validity of the data gathered during the process as being representative of the Lady Frere population being served.

2. **Interactiveness of the LED strategy formulation process:** This measures the extent to which the process of formulating the LED strategy employed participation mechanisms that encouraged active participation by the public of
Lady Frere – processes that encouraged person-to-person dialogues and information exchanges.

3. **Use of Public Inputs in the LED strategy formulation process:** This refers to the degree to which stakeholder inputs, received from public involvement initiatives preceding LED strategy formulation, were used in the final designing of the LED strategy (2010-2015). This dimension is central to the theories of citizen empowerment in governance matters. Failure to use public inputs is associated with citizen disempowerment. Citizen disempowerment often results in distrust of government by the citizens, manifesting in protest actions opposed to government or agency initiated projects. The recent Eldorado Park unrest pertaining to installation of new electrical meters by the municipality provides an example.

4. **Quality of public inputs into the LED strategy formulation process:** This dimension sought to establish how the LED strategy that resulted, accurately reflected the true interests of the Lady Frere public that would be served or affected by this strategy. Participation tools that are more integrated and involving, position public agencies to better articulate public interests and needs.

The representativeness dimension accounts for the validity of the input and data collected during the public involvement process (preceding strategy formulation) as being representative of the Lady Frere community – to be served or affected by the economic policies adopted. Literature on public participation seems to suggest that, in large part, public participation efforts do not reflect fair representation of individuals and groups to be affected by the decision. (Poisner, 1996) Failure of public institutions to ensure random participation is seen as the precursor of stakeholder input reflecting interests of dominant individuals who are motivated to participate and pushing their views through.

Interactiveness dimension seeks to establish the extent to which the public involvement initiatives taken by the ELM during the process, provided for active participation by the public – encouraging opportunities for two-way engagements between the municipality and the public. Initiatives emphasizing active participation are meant to provide high degree of interaction between representatives of that public
institution and the citizenry during planned encounters. By contrast, passive participation tools allow public agencies (including municipalities) the ability and opportunity to push large amounts of information to the public without expecting any feedback. While the active participation tools are notably resource intensive to implement, they provide platform for two-way engagements with the population affected by the institution’s decision or programs. Two-way communication is seen as a prerequisite for the notions of authentic participation and citizen empowerment, respectively. Institutions that employ active participation tools benefit from the dialogue and understanding that comes with ongoing communication and quality inputs by the public.

The use of public inputs dimension is in accord with theories of citizen empowerment in governance related matters. Figueredo(2005) suggests that decision making that fails to consider public input as legitimate and worthy of utilizing, can often lead to disempowerment of the public. This normally gives rise to a negative reaction to government initiatives. In South Africa, impatience with non-delivery of services is manifested in sometimes violent community protests, akin to the ones that engulfed Gauteng’s townships last year and this year. The people need to feel and see that their input is valued, as they know better- what their needs are.

The dimension on the quality of inputs examines institutions ability to correctly asses the true needs and interests of the communities they serve through using public involvement initiatives and public participation tools. The Local Economic Development process takes time to yield fruits and can suffer communication disruptions as to its projects’ developmental phases. The real interest here will be to establish the extent to which Lady Frere public sees the LED document as reflecting their true interests and needs.

These four stated dimensions of participation aggregately form a measure adopted to test authentic public participation in LED strategy formulation process in Lady Frere, in this study. This is a measure used to determine participation by the said public in the strategy formulation process. (Figueredo, 2005)
1.5 Aims of the Research

- The main aim of this study was to find out if the process of formulating the LED strategy in ELM, Lady Frere, embraced the notion of authentic public participation. Authentic public participation was generally defined as active and meaningful participation of various sectors of the community in municipal planning and decision-making, wherein the voice of the public influences decisions taken by councillors and municipal officials.
- Furthermore, an analysis of the practical engagements with the various sectors of the ELM was carried out, culminating in the writing of a research report on empirical findings thereof.
- The study also aimed at suggesting recommendations geared towards ensuring authentic and effective participation by all relevant stakeholders in LED strategy processes.

1.6 Definition of terms

The current study contains terms and concepts that can be interpreted in different ways, it is important that these terms and concepts be interpreted in line with the purposes of this study. Next, is the definition of terms that are important for understanding this study. The meaning they carry in current study is given below.

Accountability - Accountability means to give an account for one’s actions or inactions. In a democracy, government (national, provincial or local) is voted into power by its citizens to satisfy the needs, desires and aspirations of its citizens. Accountability in this context implies the government taking responsibility for its failures and successes in delivery to those who put it in power.

Authentic public participation – this refers to a situation in which citizens are allowed space as equal partners in municipal planning and decision-making. Envisaged, is a situation where the voice of the public influences the decisions taken by councillors and municipal officials. Accountability is at the core of this process.
Community – De Beer and Swanepoel (2000:211) define community as referring to the relationships and interactions between individuals, living and working in a geographically demarcated area. The human dimension of community reflects the values and norms governing individual action, setting parameters for acceptable social behaviour.

Community development – De Beer and Swanepoel (2000:125) describe community development as an activity seeking to promote human development. It is aimed at empowering communities and strengthening their capacity for self-sustaining development.

Community participation – Theron (2008:127) explains participation as a strategy for achieving human development, social development, or people centred development.

Development – is gradual growth of something so that it becomes more advanced and better. Applied to the context of communities and people, development means a change in the quality of life because of growth in the economy leading to employment and reduction of poverty. Development means improvement change.

Developmental local government – is “...a local government committed to working with its citizens and groups within the community, to find sustainable ways to meet their social, economic and material needs and improve the quality of their lives”.

Integrated Development Planning – is defined as a planning approach that involves the entire municipality and its citizens in finding the best solutions to achieve good long-term development. It is a master plan that gives an overall framework for development of an area. It aims to co-ordinate the work of local and other spheres of government into a coherent plan to improve the quality of life for all the people living in an area. It should take into account the existing conditions and problems and resources available for development. The plan should look at economic and social development possibilities of the area as a whole.
(http://www.etu.org.za).
Local Economic Development (LED) strategy - is a strategic plan for the development of a local economy driven by local stakeholders. Blakely (2002: xvi) further defines LED as a process in which local governments and/or community based (neighbourhood) organizations engage to stimulate or maintain business activity and/or employment. The principal goal of local economic development is to stimulate local employment opportunities in sectors that can improve the community using existing human, natural and institutional resources. It builds from the inside.

Local government - is the level of government that is closest to the people and is in a better position to satisfy the needs, desires and aspirations of their local communities. Ismail et al. (1997:2) opine that, “…local government is that level of government which is commonly defined as a decentralized representative institution with general and specific powers devolved to it by a higher tier of government (central or provincial) within a geographically defined area.”

Poverty - is a multi-dimensional concept that must be understood as meaning more than mere lack of income. It is primarily characterised by a lack of access to opportunities for a sustainable livelihood (income, assets, skills, knowledge, self-confidence and access to decision-making).

Sustainable development – Fox and Van Rooyen (2004), explain sustainable development as the integration of social, economic and environmental factors into planning, implementation and decision-making to ensure that development serves present and future generations.

1.7 Overview of chapters

This research study is reported in five chapters. Following, is a brief outline of these chapters.
Chapter 1:
This chapter introduces the study, giving it context and setting its parameters. The research problem and questions are also covered and the aims of the study clearly set out.

Chapter 2

This chapter gives an overview of the concept of authentic public participation. It explores legal and policy instruments that support public participation in local governance. Beyond that, the concept of LED is explained and its links to the idea of public participation established. It provides a theoretical framework of the study.

Chapter 3:

This chapter examines the methods used in this study. It also justifies their choice for the current study. Among other approaches, Content Analysis and Discourse Analysis are discussed. Their importance in the present endeavour is explained. An explanation of the data collection and analysis processes is also given.

Chapter 4:

In this chapter, empirical research findings on the formulation process of the LED strategy (2010-2015) will be presented. This chapter reflects on applications of the various methods used in this study to arrive at conclusions about the nature of participation allowed the ELM citizenry during the LED strategy formulation process.

Chapter 5:

This is a concluding chapter of the current study, a summary of the research, its purpose, its operationalization, and findings therefrom will be highlighted. Consequently, this chapter recommends pathways that could be explored to assist the project of democratizing the various life aspects (especially the socio-economic aspects) of the Lady Frere locality for the benefit of all of its citizens.
Chapter Two
An overview of Authentic Public Participation and Local Economic Development
(Examining links between the two concepts)

2.1 Introduction
Since the inception of a democratic system of governance in 1994, Public Participation has emerged as an important feature of government planning and decision-making in pursuit of a democratic and economically stable South Africa. At a democratic level, the notion advances participation by all stakeholders in processes of decision-making about the potentials of their particular locality – informing choices they will take to make their locality viable and stable. Economically, Public Participation provides means by which local municipalities and their citizens can contribute to the country’s economic profile. This is evident in the choice of local economic development strategy as a guiding instrument of local revitalization efforts by municipalities. Global competitiveness of a country depends on the socio-economic viability of its localities. When we talk about the state of a nation, reference is to the aggregation of localities. This is a realization that appears to be new in South Africa, only coming into prominence with the demise of the racist apartheid system championed by the now defunct Nationalist Party. The Nationalist Party regime was concerned with separating South Africa along racial lines and oppressing the black majority of the population. It mattered less to them that under-developing the majority would harm the economic potentials of the country in future. The majority was left in a state of underdevelopment with inferior education, poor state of health and unemployment. Disparities arising from South Africa’s apartheid past are still with us. The majority of the South African population still lives in conditions of abject poverty with no basic services like water and ablution facilities even today. Neither do they have functional education and health facilities in their immediate communities in some cases. The sprawling informal settlements around South Africa’s cities and towns, and their inherent squalid living conditions bear testimony to this claim. They are a living reminder of poverty that must be dealt with.

The situation sketched above provided platform for the new government to draw an agenda for undoing the iniquities of the racist and oppressive system of apartheid. The initial step was democratizing the society in its entirety. The political, economic and social aspects of the society’s life came into focus. Decentralization of government
functions to provincial and local levels of government became a conspicuous feature
and norm in the effort to democratize the South African society. In South Africa,
decentralization aims to promote development by empowering local communities to
make contributions to the well-being of the country, economically, politically and
socially. (Pillay:2010) The notion of local economic development can thus be seen as
resulting from operationalization of the decentralization process. The aim of the LED
Strategy, as perceived by the Department of Cooperative Government and Traditional
Affairs (2003), is to guide transformation and economic growth in local municipalities
in a way that benefits every member of that locality, including investors and the
government. The affected people and communities are active participants in the
process. In summary, the notion of authentic public participation gives expression to
the notion of democracy and finds expression where the LED strategy has been
appropriately formulated.

This chapter provides a literature review for the current study. Hart (1998:13) thinks
of literature review as a selection of available documents on a topic – which contain
information, ideas, data and evidence written from a particular standpoint. The idea
behind this selection is fulfilling certain aims or expressing certain views on the
nature of the phenomenon under study and evaluate those documents in relation to the
topic. The literature review that follows emphasizes the importance of the subject of
research interest in this study. It indicates how this subject of interest has been dealt
with; and the conclusions that have been made about it. This literature review
provides frameworks for authentic public participation and local economic
development. Books, completed research reports and legislation were used for the
current study. Thus, the literature review that follows provides a lens through which to
see and understand the subject of interest to the researcher. We start by looking at the
concept of authentic public participation as postulated by different authors and then
examine relevant South African legislation that supports and promotes it. Ultimately,
the concept of LED is examined, exploring the links it has with the notion of authentic
public participation.
2.2. What is meant by Authentic Public Participation?

Generally, public participation is about inclusion of citizens in government decision-making. The term is mostly defined as ‘the inclusion of input or dialogue from any or all stakeholders affected by a public decision, process or project into that public effort’, (Figueroedo, 2005:15). It is important to note that the term ‘public participation’ is used interchangeably with such terms as ‘community participation, citizen participation, consumer and/or stakeholder participation in literature.

The term public participation envisages a situation in which a public agency reaches out to the affected public for inputs to its own programmes/projects. Franklin (2001) observes that the public participation process involves individuals acting by themselves or affiliated with others in various forms of associations. Thus, the public can be involved as:

- Individual persons
- Private or public groups
- Formal or informal groups
- Businesses
- Government entities

Therefore, as it can be seen that the term public is broad and all embracing, it encourages wide inclusion. The issue is whether public institutions are in step with these requirements. We seek to use the case of ELM, Lady Frere to find out.

In agreement with the above definition of public participation, Meyer and Cloete (2000:104-109) identify four steps necessary for authentic public participation to occur during the policy making process. These include:

- The involvement of leaders of legitimate organizations, which represent community, interests (e.g. cultural, civic, religious, welfare organizations) – leaders must in turn provide feedback to their constituencies to legitimize their actions.
- The involvement of legitimate and democratically elected political representatives – they are also expected to report to their electorate regularly to ratify the decisions they take on behalf of these communities.
- The involvement of individual opinion leaders of that community – these are highly regarded individuals who can influence the opinions of the community.
- In addition, the direct involvement of ordinary members of the public in mass activities – their numbers indicate the support demonstrated by the community for the identified cause.

Participation affords ordinary people an opportunity to say how their environment should be developed and it gives people space to influence outcomes of planned actions. To a greater degree, public participation has a way of overcoming hopelessness since it imbues the public with a sense of efficacy. Ordinary people gain the belief that they have the ability and competence to influence municipalities through participation. Thus, participation changes dependency into independency.

Davids(2005:19) states that the ideal situation for South African municipalities would be an environment in which citizens have the capacity to claim their space as equal partners in development and governance, by making their voice heard and where the local government has the administrative and financial capacity(as well as political will) to respond voiced concerns. Where this ideal is realized, the voice of the citizens becomes influence. Important to note, for the voice to become influence there must be action from below. The question then is whether the ELM, in Lady Frere, came any closer to the envisaged or idealized situation during the LED strategy formulation process. Davids further opines that authentic public participation at a municipal level should result in transformed municipalities and a citizenry with real influence over policy decisions. The impact of authentic participation by the public will emerge as local government’ actions (from above), in response to the voiced community concerns /interests (from below) start producing tangible outputs and outcomes. These can take the form of new policies, poverty alleviation programmes, redress of grievances and improved service delivery responsive to the stated needs of communities.

Similarly, Garcia-Zamor (1985) sees participative planning and management as consisting in the involvement of the projects’ beneficiaries in the decision-making, implementation and evaluation of that project. Two forms of participation are
highlighted here. One form induces participation and the other merely encourages that suggestions for programs be made. The form that induces participation takes the shape of committees or boards who encourage local community people to make known their views on matters of policy that affect their general welfare. Project coordinators can enlist local involvement when defining objectives of a project and determining the methods to be taken to achieve those objectives. The intended beneficiaries visualize the results and participate in making them.

Grossardt (2003:4) also explained this in terms of a structured public participation process. He characterised it as a protocol for organising the integration of professional and non-professional, characterised by efficiency, accuracy and transparency. This integration of professional and non-professional input into complex development programmes ensures inclusion of everyone. Structured public participation as professional input, presupposes induced forms of public participation. Protocols are associated with formalized institutions. This form tallies with the idea of active participation tools.

The other form merely encourages participation through suggestions without institutionalizing it. This loose form tends to give specialist development planners much greater leeway – to even commit costly mistakes. This leads us to spare some thoughts on the weaknesses of the participative approach, although its merits outweigh the negatives. Awareness of these weaknesses is important if appropriate plans are to be made. The notable infirmities of this emergent approach are the following:

- The dominance of one group over others
- Lack of interest by potential participants (often when no immediate rewards are perceived)
- Lack of sufficient time, and
- Restrictions generated by the present structures and systems.

These weaknesses can be mitigated once known. The project planner/manager only needs to be wary of their effects and handle them with dexterity. This must be done to comply with the relevant legislation and policies that assist this participatory inclination. This primary understanding is important because it shores up the aspirations of the South African populace. Consequent to many years of apartheid
repression, the idea of freedom and having a say in how you are governed has assumed pre-eminence in South Africa. The democratization of the South African society means that its citizens should be active participants in shaping it. This task should not be the exclusive preserve of certain public officials or consultants. It is a collective responsibility of all citizens. Collective engagement is a prerequisite. (Cronin, 2004)

Notably, three dominant methods of public participation are constantly used by public managers. These are public involvement, public information and public relations. Public involvement provides a way for a public agency to acquire citizen inputs to assist creation and implementation of its programs, projects and policies. Public information is a one-way process of disseminating information to the public by way of educating and informing them about agency matters. Public relations, on the other hand, are activities aimed at shaping the public’s perception of the agency’s activities favourably. This is done by also disseminating information, ideas and concepts important and relevant to the agency.

An important thing to remember, public information and public relations by themselves do not constitute public involvement. Public involvement can only be operationalized through the employment of public involvement programs. These programs can and do, at times, make use of both the public information and public relations tools in their implementation. In practice, these three concepts may overlap – public information may serve a public relations purpose. Information may simultaneously be used to convince an individual as well as inform them of important issues. In the same way, favourable public relations can have a positive influence on public involvement. The issue then is the nature of public involvement initiatives taken to ensure authentic public participation in Lady Frere. Therefore, for the purpose of this research, authentic public participation was defined as “a situation in which citizens are allowed space as equal partners in municipal planning and decision-making. Envisaged, is a situation where the voice of the public influences the decisions taken by councillors and municipal officials.”

We now turn to examine the nature of participation tools that may be employed to enhance public participation. We focus on public involvement mechanisms.
2.3 Public Participation tools

Figueroed (2005:16) suggests that public involvement programmes can use many tools and tactics in their implementation. He opines that planning literature offers a broad discussion on the number of participation strategies available to public/government agencies – these can be broadly classified as either active or passive mechanisms. Active participation mechanisms are those interactions with the public that require the representatives of the agency to engage citizens in a dialogue and information exchange. The examples include:

- Public hearings
- Public workshops
- Briefings to social and civic groups
- Use of field offices
- Information centres
- Panel presentations
- Small and large group meetings

Importantly, these tools involve some sort of face-to-face engagement with the public or the citizenry. Used to some purpose, these active engagements can yield modifications in the perspectives that the government agency had about how the intended beneficiaries see their priorities. Public inputs are valued.

By contrast, passive participation mechanisms provide for little or no engagements with the public. Largely, these tools are described as those that allow public agencies to ‘push’ information to the public, expecting little or no feedback from the affected public. Agencies primarily use these tools when they seek to disseminate large amounts of information to a broad audience. These tools can also be used as part of a public involvement program, for instance to support public hearings. They are also handy when educating the public on matters of importance to the agency – increasing awareness about specific projects or efforts. Passive public participation mechanisms can also be used to create a favourable image of the public agency. Examples of passive public participation tools include:

- Press releases
- News conferences
- Websites
Printed information materials (newsletters, fact sheets, brochures, issue papers etc.)

Advertisements (on newspapers, magazines, radio and television)

As earlier hinted, tools associated with passive participation strategy often allow for little or no engagement with the public. They mainly assist with large-scale dissemination of educative information by the agency and agency image building.

Importantly, both active and passive tools are considered valid to achieving desirable public participation outcomes. Designing the participation tool and deciding on its purpose is a matter for that particular public agency to decide, guided by the need to maximize effectiveness of the tool implemented. Accordingly, these different tools can be creatively used together to give effect to the imperatives of the constitution and legislation relating to public participation in local governance matters.

2.4 Levels of commitment to Authentic Public Participation in Public Agencies

Literature on public participation generally conveys the sense that public participation should be authentic. That means all parties potentially to be affected by the agency decision, should be involved. This should stimulate interest and investment by both administrators and citizens in the local collective effort.

Authentic participation has been described as a deep and continuous involvement in administrative processes with the potential for all involved (King et al., 1998) It requires administrators to focus on organizational processes, structures and implementation. That way authentic participation can be a little more than an add on to the daily business of that public institution, it becomes the integral part of what they do. It means authentic participation becomes part of the deliberation from issue framing to decision-making. This is a requirement also placed on municipalities by various pieces of legislation in South Africa. (South African Constitution, 1996; Municipal Systems Act, 2004)

Legislative intent is one thing and official practice quite the other. At an institutional level, good policies can be formulated and promulgated but with little official practice demonstrating that commitment. Public participation tools, active or passive, are vulnerable to manipulation by agencies and stakeholders alike. Agency employees can
use their ability to establish public hearings and conduct the proceedings to dominate the public involvement program. Stakeholders can manipulate the process by ensuring that it is not as representative as it should be, that there is a dominant ideology always pursued at the expense of the less vocal members of the community.

To be more than tokenism, a range of techniques and approaches should be used when designing a public participation program. (Figueroa, 2005:26) notes that the mode of participation by itself does not guarantee that full and representative participation will occur. He suggests that the disposition of the public managers and officials to innovate is crucial to realizing the outcomes of public involvement programmes. They must be willing to set aside rigid bureaucratic measures in favour of mechanisms that will give rise the desired results. Representative participation has the benefit of providing equity for all participants and ensuring broad support and legitimacy. Lack of legitimacy implies lack of public support to implement the determined programs and projects.

Some criteria have been suggested to ensure representativeness of a public involvement programme.

These involve asking such questions as:

- Was access to decision-making open to all stakeholders?
- Have the affected individuals and groups been identified for inclusion?
- Are all appropriate individuals and groups represented?
- Do the groups acknowledge being represented?
- Are the groups adequately represented?

Concerning interactiveness, Arnstein (1969) explained participation in terms of what he termed the Citizen Ladder of Participation (see Fig. 2) below.

In terms of this ladder, citizen participation is defined in terms of the hierarchy of the rungs of the ladder and the corresponding power they have available to them. The lower the rung the less participatory was the involvement.

These rungs are divided into three levels of involvement. The two bottom rungs represent non-participation or passive participation. They are characterized by passive participatory tools. The next three higher rungs represent a second level of involvement and just fall short of empowered citizen participation. this level of
involvement contains a mix of active and passive participation mechanisms, albeit those active participation tools are not necessarily implemented to achieve full interactiveness. In these instances, citizens normally listen to or assist traditional power brokers execute their plans. Advisory committees that merely serve to rubberstamp institutional decisions are another example. The topmost three rungs are defined as partnership, delegated power and citizen control. At this level, citizens truly participate and directly influence policy decisions. Participation tools used within this rung are active and aim at fully empowering the citizens in their implementation. These rungs are the focus of current participation models – wherein citizens are on an equal footing and continuing dialogue with government decision makers.

As earlier intimated, the conditions created by the agency wherein these tools are used are of critical importance. Participation tools used with lack of enthusiasm by agency officials undermine the use value of these instruments. Agency staff must therefore be committed to interaction with the public. This commitment must be demonstrated as they provide would be participants with knowledge, facts and technical context in order to engage meaningfully in the process. This will reduce the feelings of alienation on the part of prospective participants. Feelings of alienation and systematic disempowerment often result in cynicism and opposition to government led projects.

Public participation authors distinguish between consultation, shared decision-making and delegation of decision-making to citizens. Consultation is regarded as the least authentic of the three forms, while shared decision-making has a moderate value of authenticity and full delegation of decision-making to citizens potentially has the highest authenticity value. Thus, a mixture of these participation approaches seems necessary to engage citizens adequately while at the same time being organizationally and politically acceptable. Having examined the notion of authentic public participation, we now turn to legislation that supports and promotes the concept.
2.5 Legislation that supports Authentic Public Participation

Laws are generally meant to regulate conduct in the society. They apply to both natural and juristic persons. Natural persons are human beings. Juristic persons are entities that are not human by nature but are endowed personality by law. Companies, organizations and state institutions fall into this category of personality. As legal persons, these entities can enter into legal agreements with others and with natural persons/individuals to advance a variety of objectives. They can also sue and be sued for commission or omissions. Legislation in South Africa also serves the same purpose of regulating conduct in the society broadly. We start examining legislation that supports authentic public participation by examining the constitution of South Africa (S.A.).

2.5.1 The South Africa Constitution Act 108, 1996

The Constitution is the grundnorm of the South African society – it is the cornerstone of the South African democracy. Any conduct or law that is inconsistent with it is invalid. This basic norm of the South African democratic society regulates every aspect of life in the South African society, including local governance. It is the basic norm of the South African society, from which all other laws derive their legality. This shows the supremacy of the constitution in S.A. and gives the country a character of a constitutional state. The rule of law is an important feature of the South African governance system. Various sections of the constitution mandate public participation in local governance. Section 151(1) (a) obliges municipalities to encourage the involvement of communities and community organizations in local governance. This provision entrenches the idea of democracy as a system that allows for governance by the people. It extends beyond the notion of representative democracy to the one of participatory democracy. Citizens are empowered by taking active part in decisions about what will affect them. This also imbues them with a sense of responsibility. Furthermore, the obligation the constitution places on municipalities gives effect to certain rights entrenched in the Bill of Rights. The right to human dignity finds expression as everyone is given a listening ear to advance his or her views. Accordingly, the right to free expression is also realized as municipalities encourage the involvement of communities and community organizations to participate in local
governance. Therefore, it can be seen that the democratization project, championed by the ruling ANC, aims to empower the citizens of the country at large – much in contrast to the practices common during the apartheid S.A. under Nationalist Party.

In line with section 151 above, section 152(1)(a) and (e) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996 stipulates that the objects of local government are –

- to provide democratic and accountable government for local communities;
- to encourage the involvement of communities and community organisations in the matters of local government.

In essence, this means municipalities and their communities are expected to establish public participation mechanisms that will ensure the achievement of the above local government imperatives. This study therefore, advocates that municipalities should use various mechanisms for co-coordinating and facilitating public participation processes. In addition, section 195(1)(e) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, prescribes that public administration must be governed by the democratic values and principles enshrined in the Constitution, including the following principles:

- people’s needs must be responded to,
- Moreover, the public must be encouraged to participate in any policy-making that affects them personally.

As intimated elsewhere in this report, the incumbent democratic government is faced with the mammoth task of having to undo the effects of an oppressive and separatist system of apartheid – that excluded and oppressed the majority people of this country. Because of this exclusion of the majority, the new democratic government seeks to change the situation and ensure the involvement of the majority in the administration and governance of their country. Accordingly, the constitution has a Bill of Rights, which guarantees South African citizens rights, rights that the different spheres of government must work towards progressively realizing. Socio-economic rights (see section 27) that are enshrined in the constitution have direct implications for the local level of government, as it is the level closest to the people. The constitution also makes provision for specific legislation to be made to deal with matters that are more specific. In the case of local governance, the specific legislation in question takes the
form of the Municipal Systems Act 32 of 2000 (Municipal Systems Act) and the Municipal Structures Act 117 of 1998 (herein after Municipal Structures Act). We now turn to see how these specific pieces of legislation promote authentic public participation.

2.5.2 The Municipal Systems Act 32, 2000

This Act describes the core processes essential to realize a truly developmental local government. It details how the local government should progressively move towards the socio-economic upliftment of its community. This legislation specifically requires the municipalities to involve communities in municipal affairs to promote development in the municipality. Mechanisms envisaged for this purpose include participatory governance, integrated development planning, performance management and reporting, resource allocation and organizational change. Section 16(1) of this Act requires municipalities to “develop a culture of municipal governance that compliments formal representative government with a system of participatory governance”. This provision makes it a legal requirement that democracy be a lived experience of all local citizens. Communities and formations existing within them are legally given space to influence what happens in their localities. Representative democracy alone is not adequate, active participation in planning and decision-making will ensure that institutions and public officials always act within their mandates. Therefore, it is a legal requirement that local government ensures creation of space for local citizens to say what they think and to guide policy directions taken by government at a local level. Once again, the rights and freedoms (free expression, free choice and right to human dignity) entrenched in the constitution are harnessed in this piece of legislation. This piece of legislation is consistent with the constitution and it places a legal obligation to municipalities to conduct their business in a particular way. The same may be thought of the Municipal Structures Act 117,1998.

2.5.3 The Municipal Structures Act 117, 1998

While this legislation is generally concerned with providing for the establishment of different categories of municipalities and their competencies, it also recognizes and allows for participation of traditional leaders in local government administration (in
areas where they reside). This innovative way of entrenching democracy ensures that even traditional institutions (normally steeped towards autocracy) are not left behind in the transformation process. This legislation also creates platforms for public participation via the establishment of ward committees – their efficacy is still dubitable thus far and something needs to be done to empower them.

Read together with the constitution and the municipal systems Act, this legislation makes a unique contribution to the democratization project. It ensures realization of rights set out in the constitutionally entrenched Bill of Rights by outlining structures necessary to activate this perceived democratization project. It adds structure and form to the processes of democratic governance perceived in the Municipal Systems Act. As the two other legislations discussed above, this law aims at regulating how the affairs of local governance should be conducted to ensure participation by all. Other government policies that entrench the idea of participation by the public to review here, include the Public Participation Policy Framework (2005) and The White Paper on Local Government.

2.6 Other Policy instruments in support of Public Participation

Policies generally outline how things are done within that particular setting. An array of policies aimed at enhancing public participation exists in South Africa. Chief among these are the Public Participation Policy Framework and the White Paper on Local Government. The researcher also examines these policies since they make the issue of public participation mandatory for the government in general and local government in particular.

2.6.1 Public Participation Policy Framework, 2005

This policy document aims at rooting the government amongst the people. Listing the assumptions underlying the need for public participation, it states that:

- Public Participation is designed to narrow the social distance between electorate and elected institutions.
- Public participation is about investing in our people.
- Public participation is a fundamental right of all people.
• Public participation is designed to promote the values of good governance and human rights.
• South Africans are encouraged to participate as individuals or as interest groups in order to improve service delivery.
• Community is defined as a ward in the context of public participation
• Ward committees are central in linking up elected institutions and these linkages are reinforced by other forums of communication with communities like the izimbizo, roadshows, and the makgotla.

Notably, public participation is critical to undoing the effects of the past unjust apartheid system. Where apartheid stressed on exclusion the current democratic system emphasizes inclusion. Lady Frere was by no means exempted from the harsh realities of ‘separate development’ and its Bantustan progeny. Exclusion was the strategy. The black majority of this country is still reeling from the effects of exclusion. Poverty and vulnerability are still rife in black communities countrywide owing to being excluded from enjoying basic human rights including equality of opportunities. The black majority may still be excluded from enjoying this democracy. Mechanisms must be activated to include them in enjoying democracy.

Including all concerned parties in planning and decision making empowers the people involved to implement the policy objectives well. It entrenches accountability on the part of those holding positions in elected and public institutions. Furthermore, this policy framework states clearly that public participation is a fundamental right available to all people. Fundamental rights are constitutionally entrenched and they are justiciable. Offended parties can bring action against offending persons or institutions in a public court, to enforce recognition of these rights. Again, it is noted that public participation is flexible. It allows people to participate as individuals or as groups. This pre-empts exclusion of individuals who differ with the popular view, allowing them space to articulate their views freely. This confirms the point made earlier about the new democratic government having to redress the ills of the apartheid system. Democratizing all the aspects of the society’s life is vital for the incumbent government and this is seen in the White Paper on Local Government as well.

This policy document articulates the view that allowing for participation by the public in local governance affairs is mandatory for municipalities. It stresses that ‘...the central responsibility of municipalities is to work together with local communities to find sustainable ways to meet their needs and improve the quality of their lives.’ Maximising economic growth and social development is key to achieving a developmental local government. The Policy further outlines the objectives of community participation as embedded of the following four principles:

- To ensure that political leaders remain accountable and work within their mandates.
- To allow citizens (as individuals or interest groups) to have continuous input into local politics.
- To allow service consumers to have an input on the way services are delivered.
- To afford organized civil society an opportunity to enter into partnerships and contracts with local government in order to mobilize additional resources.

The new democratic arrangement recognizes the need to hold those in office accountable. Participation by the public therefore enhances accountability. When the members of the community know what specific officials and political heads are doing from time to time, these public officials are sure to act with discretion. They will ensure that they deliver on the expectations of those who put them in office. Before the democratic dispensation in South Africa, service consumer never had input in how the services were delivered to them. They only had to accept what they were given; objections were met by repressive state measures. Today, the laws and various government policies make provision for citizens to influence how they receive services rendered to them.

*The Municipal Systems Act* 32 of 2000, section 16(1) requires that a municipality develop, “a culture of municipal governance that compliments formal representative government with a system of participatory governance.”

*The Municipal Structures Act* 117 of 1998 (in section 19) – envisages a municipality that will:
• Develop mechanisms to consult the communities and community organisations in the performance of their functions and exercising of powers; and
• Annually review the needs of the community and municipal priorities; and strategies for meeting the [identified] needs, involving communities in these municipal processes.

The significance of this understanding and ultimately, government disposition can be gleaned from the fact that the Constitution (a grundnorm of the South African society) makes public participation mandatory. Deriving from the broad provisions of the Constitution, legislation specifically dealing with municipal issues reiterates the requirement of community participation in local governance. Therefore, the requirement of public participation is grounded in the legislative and policy frameworks of this country.

The array of policy frameworks adopted by the Department of Local Government also supports this view. The Integrated Sustainable Rural Development Strategy (ISRDS) of 2000 also envisages a collective engagement by all sectors in formulating an alternative vision to be pursued to improve the opportunities of the rural poor. What permeates throughout here is the need for active participation by all critical stakeholders. This suggests a need for municipalities like the Emalahleni Municipality to embrace this approach, as this municipality is largely rural.

Likewise, the Strategy Framework for Growth and Development - Eastern Cape (2004-2014) which envisions the province to be a ‘compelling place to live, work and invest in for all its people’ - recognized the centrality of public participation in shaping the development plan. The introduction of the framework hints on the engagement of the Provincial government with its social partners to formulate the Provincial Growth and Development Plan (PGDP). This clearly indicates the commitment to public participation.

The Provincial Growth and Development Plan (PGDP) in turn sets out key areas critical for development, as agreed upon by the government and its stakeholders. These areas are:

• systematic poverty eradication,
• infrastructure development,
• agricultural and agrarian transformation;
• human resources development,
• manufacturing and diversification, and
• public sector and institutional capacity development

The common thread in all these instruments is the two-pronged approach that defines this policy dispensation as a product of serious engagement between the government and its social partners. Capacities were explored and resources collectively determined. The result was the Provincial Growth and Development Plan.

The planning process of a developmental local government is always large scale—it involves a range of participants or stakeholders and it is long range in its implementation. Implementation is usually carried out utilizing the same beneficiaries. However, it remains unclear how participative are the approaches employed by public officials in executing these programs beyond planning.

In this process, the needy people are employed in the context of addressing their own socio-economic needs. For instance, programs like bringing in water and sanitation, housing and roads—provide job opportunities while the progressive realization of the right to human dignity is also taking shape. In the overall, the quality of human life is improved with the various sectors of the society playing a significant role.

In summary, the legislative and policy frameworks in South Africa all advance the idea of public participation. When this process is regarded as time-consuming by others, it is also important to note that it harnesses the democratization process in South Africa. Participation by the public is thus not something optional, it is mandatory and grounded in legislation and policies. The question the researcher has is whether these policies by national government have influenced policy directions taken by local policy formulators in ELM and Lady Frere in particular, during the LED formulation process. We now turn to look at the concept of LED and find out if it makes any provisions for authentic participation by the public.
2.7 The concept of Local Economic Development (LED)

While the current study is not exactly about LED, theoretical understanding of LED will assist the effort of establishing authenticity of participation by the Lady Frere citizens in the process. This section of the report examines theories and legislative frameworks that advocate local economic development. As earlier intimated, the exercise aims at providing the reader with a lens to see and understand this enquiry into authentic participation in formulation of the LED in ELM generally and Lady Frere in particular, in context. It provides a theoretical framework for understanding the significance of the current study, in the context of evolving democratic practice.

Local Economic Development can be understood as a strategic response to unemployment and poverty being experienced in that particular locality. It stresses the importance of local stakeholders coming together to decide on ways of making the local economy grow in ways that reduce unemployment and mitigate poverty. Its primary concern is with the capacity and the resources available to advance development in that locality. In LED, “we are concerned with both people and place. Therefore, local economic development is a process that emphasizes the full use of existing human and natural resources to build employment and create wealth within a defined locality.” (Blakely & Bradshaw, 2002:71).

Blakely and Bradshaw (2002) go on to assert that for any form of local economic development to be successful, individuals and institutions must build on indigenous resources that create opportunities to generate sustainable wealth for the locality. This calls for a joint careful assessment of the local economy’s strengths and weaknesses by critical stakeholders and the determination of opportunities that can be explored including threats that have potential to thwart local efforts. Plans can then be made armed with this critical information about the local economy, to embark on projects that will alter the undesired situation. Employment creation and poverty alleviation are the focus.

At a theoretical level, LED can be seen as synthesizing elements of previously dominant economic theories of the neo-classical economic mould, with the emergent alternative economic theories (see Blakely and Bradshaw, 2002:57). Neo-classical, economic theorists reject the involvement of government and structured community interventions on the economic markets. They argue for unfettered markets and a currency environment not defined by government regulation. Neo-clasical economic
theorists contend that community or government interference hampers the free flow of capital, which is critical for development. They argue that free capital, not tethered to any single community by unnecessary instruments such as equity local participation, will result in equilibrium. The movement away from high wage/cost economies to low wage/cost economies would result in every part of the globe being touched by economic growth. This is very akin to the ‘trickle down effect theory’ previously advanced by the IMF. Its obvious defect is that it results in growing inequality than provide solutions to unemployment and eliminate poverty. Moreover, local economic development comes as a response to outcomes of such economic models as the neoclassical approach. Free movement of capital has often meant disinvestment and retrenchment of thousands of employees as those with capital find new investment destinations. High levels of unemployment and poverty can be attributed to this notion of freely moving capital and a non-interfering government. Capital in such a situation seems to be a law unto itself. It enjoys free reign exploiting cheap labour and resources, before moving on to new hunting grounds to exploit their untapped wealth.

Alternative economic theories refute the idea of an even-handed market that will supposedly allocate resources equitably. They point to the growing inequality between countries of the world and the growing gulf between the rich and the poor within those countries, as resulting from this system. Moreover, they charge that this model fails to explain why certain areas grow economically when others do not. They simply blame government intervention on markets without addressing the social ills arising with operationalization of the free market approach. They seem oblivious to market imperfections that often result to cases of massive famine in the Southern countries. The emergent Alternative Economic Theories instead advocate for carefully planned interventions calculated to cure market imperfections. In that way, the government can play its regulatory function in ways that assists economic growth of the society.

*The New Market Friendly Approach* is one such a theory, coming because of the failure of the *Free Market Approach* to explain the astronomical growth of the East Asian economies in the context of active state involvement in the economy. These East Asian ‘tigers’ disconfirmed the free market argument for a rolled back state, hence the shift in thinking within BrettonWoods institutions. The New Market Friendly Approach seems a shy acceptance that markets are not exactly perfect after all, and a space exists for government to articulate policies that assists economic
development of their constituencies where markets are imperfect. Since government purports to serve the interest of the public, it has a role to play in stimulating the economy to creating employment. Economic development envisages a growing economy that creates employment and eliminates poverty. A productive local economy is vital to sustainable LED.

Todaro and Smith (2006:17) observe that development is a process with many dimensions and one that involves major changes in social structure, popular attitudes and national institutions. This makes development a large-scale transformation process that affects various aspects of human and societal life. Todaro and Smith suggest that development must mean [actual] change in the localities in order to be effective. This should be manifested in growth of the economy, increased employment and the consequent elimination of poverty and inequality. The adoption of a developmental approach mainly results from socio-economic pressures (unemployment and poverty) brought by changes in the world around us. Consequently, the responsiveness of localities to these pressures influences the direction to be taken by local development initiatives. This response by localities is important for local economic development. It indicates how they will maximize their resources and capacity, for embetterment of the lives of their citizens. It makes LED not only a coping strategy but also futurist one – led by an alternative vision. It is vital that stakeholders formulate an alternative vision for their locality. That will guide them when deciding on the strategy to pursue and the projects to implement it. The Manual for Strategic Planning for Local Economic Development (ECOPLAN international, 2003) explains that “Economic development is a participatory process where local people from all sectors work together to stimulate commercial activity, resulting in a resilient and sustainable economy. It is a tool to help create decent jobs and improve the quality of life for everyone, including the poor and marginalized”

Coming through clearly here is that LED strategy formulation is a participatory process. All sectors must take part in the effort to distil local solutions to problems confronted locally. People participation is essence of local economic development. Likewise, the Toolkit for Local Economic Development notes that the main purpose of engaging in planning for the LED strategy is to provide the foundations for a working action plan that will:
• Provide an updated economic and policy framework within which the actions can be implemented.
• Bring together partners from all sectors of the economy to deliver common agreed aims and objectives.
• Demonstrate how Local Economic Development Strategy will be delivered and monitored.
• Act as a tool to attract and access additional sources of funding to ensure overall effective operation.

This policy instrument suggests five stages that need to be covered when designing an LED strategy. These stages are enumerated below in their sequential order as the following:

• Bringing the stakeholders together
• Assessing the Local Economy and conducting a SWOT analysis.
• Development of joint and separate plans.
• Implementing the plans.
• Reviewing achievements and blockages.

The important thing to note here is that, when planning for LED, the community begins by firstly identifying the people, public institutions, and businesses; community organizations that represent and have an interest in the local economy. The skills and resources that each stakeholder brings to the process provide a critical foundation for success. It provides a wide-angle view of experiences and aspirations the individual stakeholders have about the local economy – inclusivity is vital for successful LED strategy formulation. This explains its need for greater participation.

Assessing the local economy provides the joint planners insights about the structure of that economy, its human resource capacity to carry out economic development as well the difficulty or ease of doing business in that particular economy. This assessment will also help determine the opportunities and threats to the local economy. The primary aim of this assessment is to create an economic profile for that local economy and derive comparative information about the position of neighbouring communities and other regional and national competitors. The development of an LED strategy then follows, with all groups concerned having achieved an informed perspective of the challenges facing their local economy. This understanding enables
achievement of a shared economic vision for the locality, decision on goals, objectives, programmes, projects and action plans. In this way, all the stakeholders are aware of what is to be achieved, who will be responsible and timeframes associated with the implementation of the strategy. The assumption here is that a shared vision builds ownership across all groups. Moreover, the strategy must be finely assessed against the human resource capacity to carry them out, including the budgetary constraints. Clear action plans will then drive strategy implementation. Effective implementation requires that plans be clear with clearly defined criteria /indicators of progress. Ultimately, good monitoring and evaluation techniques help to quantify outcomes, justify expenditures, determine needed improvements and develop good practices – enabling the review of the entire strategy.

Nel (2001:2) opines that local economic development is not exactly a new phenomenon. He suggests that it has been practiced in the North for almost a century. He contends that it has been a defining character of local government in most European and American cities and towns, as a way of revitalizing their declining economies. He further contends that what is new is the increasing incidence of such activities. Nel suggests that LED has been referred to in various ways, including self-reliance, local coping and endogenous or bottom up development. He further notes that even in the South, it has been practised for almost similar reasons as in the north and its use continues to grow. Moreover, he suggests that LED can be conceptualised as operating at two levels, namely: Formal LED level – associated with involvement of local and higher authority structures, and formal business and Informal LED level – defined by action at the level of community-based organizations and NGOs. He further observes that in South Africa the concept has been in practice since apartheid days if one considers that the major cities of the country (like Pretoria and Johannesburg) have always been engaged in such activities as place marketing and investment attraction. He concedes though that it occurred under strict government control. The difference with the current dispensation is that local economic development functions of the local government are mandated by law. It is a legal requirement that local government and municipalities use their planning, budgeting and institutions to improve the quality of life in their localities.

Nel further suggests that four variants of LED are currently practised in South Africa, namely:
• **Formal Local Government initiatives** – consistent with the traditional Northern thinking of place marketing and investment attraction. This is common in large cities like Cape Town, Durban, Johannesburg and Pretoria – where the pursuit is one of global competitiveness and poverty alleviation. Key activities include building excellent metropolitan economic environment, involving disadvantaged communities in economic activities and ensuring a sustainable economic development.

• **Community-based/Small Town Initiatives** – this is normally associated with NGO facilitation and support. These civil society institutions are noted for successfully operating with destitute communities. This variant thrives well in conditions where churches or socially responsible organizations act in partnership with communities to change the local circumstances.

• **Establishment of Section 21 Development Companies** - these structures have proven useful where the local government has limited capacity to carry out the LED programmes. This not-for-profit organization has forged partnerships with the communities and the private sector to encourage small business development and employment creation initiatives.

• **Top down approach** - comes in the form of government programmes directly affecting local communities. This has been hailed as having a potential to unlock local potentials because of its direct impact on localities. The LED fund and The Social Plan can be mentioned as exemplifying attempts to assist the programme in South Africa. This approach is criticized for its lack of breadth and depth, it does not adequately embrace and support structures outside of government. Structures like NGOs that clearly have demonstrated potential to help communities deal with crises are still with little or no government support. Resource constraints hamper efforts to empower communities.

The important thing to keep in mind is that anyone of the four variants can be used as and when it is deemed appropriate. The initial step is to establish a proper perspective of the local economy. Every stakeholder should have some sense of what the opportunities and limitations of the local economy are and be part of the efforts to pursue the agreed upon goals. As intimated above here, the choice of an LED strategy
that will be used will depend on the outcomes of the analysis of the local economy. Where the local government, for instance, has limited or no capacity to drive the local economic development process, it may be useful to think about using a section 21 development company to play the role. Likewise, CBOs and NGOs can be used to spread the use of self-help, and coping mechanism, breeding a sense of self-reliance on local people. Finally, it is clear that LED is not a single institution’s exclusive preserve. It requires that participation by a range of stakeholders in that local economy be encouraged. LED is about improving chances of a place and its people – people are best thought of as crucially linked to their place.

2.8 Conclusion

This chapter sought to outline the concepts that are important to understanding the subject of interest to this study. Authentic public participation was identified as the concept of key interest and would be investigated in the context of formulating LED strategies. Since LED by its very nature requires public participation, it was suggested that the four-dimensional requirements for authentic participation would be used to measure participation by the Lady Frere public. As of necessity, the chapter explored the idea of public participation in S.A by also examining legislation that supports the idea. The concept of LED was also explored to shed light on the inevitable links between the two concepts and their contribution to the greater democratization project of the country. It became clear that public participation is the essence of LED. The legislation examined in this chapter emphasized the importance of public participation in efforts aimed at socio-economic upliftment of the locality and its people. The Public Participation Framework emphasized the importance of closing the social distance between elected institutions and the electorate to ensure accountability and affirm the constitutional rights of the citizenry to participate in the governance of their communities. LED strategies available to municipalities were also discussed emphasizing the need to be responsive to collectively identified felt needs of that locality. We now turn to methods used to put the enquiry into operation. The various methods employed to reach the conclusions the researcher did are the subject of the following chapter.
Chapter Three
Research Methodology

3.1 Introduction
This chapter looks at the research methodology used to carry out this study successfully. It takes the reader through the steps that make up the research methodology, data collection process and the processes of arriving at conclusions. This research relates to public policy formulation and the significance of people involvement in planning and decision-making. This means identifying an approach that will be appropriate to deliver on the research questions, problem statement, aims and objectives of the study. Will it take a qualitative or a quantitative approach or will both approaches be used? Moreover, to what effect will any of the methods be used? We address these questions next but we start with the essential steps of conceptualization, operationalization and measurement of authentic public participation.

3.2 Conceptualization and operationalization of Authentic Public Participation

Conceptualization and operationalization are key procedures in the definition and measurement of the construct of Authentic Public Participation. Conceptualization refers to the process through which researchers specify what they mean by the use of certain terms and constructs to be operationalized for measurement. Operationalization is the development of specific research procedures to be used for measuring purposes of the study. (Babbie, 2005)

3.2.1 Conceptualizing Authentic Participation

The concept to be examined is Authentic Public Participation in the Emalahleni Local Municipality, Lady Frere, during the LED strategy formulation process. Specifically we seek to observe the implementation of public involvement initiatives during the LED strategy formulation process. The occurrence of public participation during the LED strategy formulation process and the degree to which it satisfied the four stated requirements of authenticity was our primary concern. These dimensions included representativeness, interactiveness, use of inputs by the public in decision-making, and the quality of inputs by the public.
If these requirements were satisfied that would imply the LED formulation process catered for authentic participation by the public.

3.2.2 Operationalizing Public participation

Literature on public participation, planning, and organizational development provided basis for operationalization of public participation. The measurement of the dimensions of authenticity was done by identifying what would be indicators of the existence of authentic public participation in the LED strategy text.

Each of the four dimensions was explored for indicators that would adequately demonstrate its existence. The first dimension, representativeness, had the following as indicators:

- The degree to which the ELM had successfully attracted representative stakeholders to the LED strategy formulation process.
- The degree of concern shown by the ELM about engaging representative stakeholders to the LED strategy formulation process.
- The degree to which the ELM successfully engaged representative stakeholders to the LED strategy formulation process.
- The degree to which efforts were taken by the municipality to implement responsive outreach efforts where responses were weak.
- Degree to which the citizens saw and recognized the participation as accurately representing them.

For second dimension, Interactiveness, the following indicators were identified:

- The extent to which ELM selected and used tools that encouraged the municipality meeting the stakeholders in person.
- Degree to which the ELM LED strategy provides appeal processes on LED projects decisions.
- Extent to which participation mechanisms that encourage information exchange were used during the LED strategy formulation process.
- Degree to which participants saw the process as open and accommodating.
- Degree to which public involvement is sustained throughout the life cycle of the LED projects.
The third dimension, Use of inputs by the public in LED projects decision-making, had the following indicators:

- Degree to which the ELM used stakeholder inputs in the LED strategy formulation process.
- Degree to which the LED forum can review project decisions to ensure inclusion of public inputs.
- Degree to which councillors and public managers review project decisions to ensure the inclusion of inputs by the public.
- Extent to which managers are willing to accept and include new ideas based on what was received during the public involvement process.
- The extent to which the ELM leadership and management mandated that issues raised during the public involvement be adequately dealt with.
- Extent to which provisions are made for the review of public involvement programmes.
- Degree to which senior public managers reviewed public inputs received through the public involvement initiatives.

In addition, the fourth dimension – quality of inputs made by the public had the following indicators:

- The degree to which the ELM accurately assessed the true public interests and needs.
- Extent to which citizens of Lady Frere see the LED formulation process as having provided enough opportunity for the Lady Frere public to assess their real needs.
- Degree to which the LED strategy reflects the interests and needs of the Lady Frere community as forwarded by the public participants during the formulation process.
- Degree to which the citizens see public participation allowed during the process as the correct way of assessing their needs.

Having conceptualized and operationalized authentic participation in this way, the researcher went on to apply various research methods to test the occurrence of the
concept of authentic public participation when formulating the LED strategy (2010-2015), to measure the authentic participation variable.

The current study employed a qualitative approach. Schwandt (2001:213) observes, “To call a research activity qualitative enquiry may broadly mean that it aims at understanding the meaning of human action.” Schwandt’s view that qualitative research is interested in giving meaning to human action seems to assert that behind every human action there is a meaning to be gleaned. It seems to suggest that in actions and interactions that individuals engage in there is a lot of meaning. In informal everyday conversations as well as in formal conversations, when individuals communicate they convey messages. Thus, qualitative approach will assist a study to uncover what messages are communicated about a certain topic or theme.

That point gave the researcher the first reason to think that a qualitative enquiry was suited for the current study. This study also sought to understand human action and its inherent meaning. We wished to establish the inclusion or exclusion of the public in the formulation of the Emalahleni Local Municipality – Local Economic Development strategy (2010-15) (hereinafter ELM-LED strategy) – we had to find out about their levels of involvement in the process.

Again, qualitative research may be understood as seeking to generate information about a phenomenon. The phenomenon may be human action, or linked to it, as the case may be. The important thing is that the approach centres its attention on the methods and tools the researcher uses to reach results, recommendations, and conclusions he/she makes. The design of this approach details the plan for the research undertaking – showing how data collection gives rise to the results.

This was the second reason for designing the current study to be qualitative. We wished to establish the nature of public participation during the Local Economic Development (LED) strategy formulation process in the Emalahleni Local Municipality (ELM), Lady Frere. We paid great attention to the methods and tools we used to reach the results we did. Ultimately, the researcher generated information about the LED strategy and the messages it contains for the people of ELM.

In another sense, qualitative is a word that denotes quality. By quality, we mean the inherent, essential characteristic of something. For instance, it may be said that the essential feature of a qualitative enquiry is that it is interested in non-numeric data –
data in the form of (spoken/written) words. It is interested in the rich descriptions of phenomena that reveal meanings, hidden behind mere incidences and number of occasions, about the observed phenomenon.

As earlier intimated, the current study employed a qualitative research approach for reasons associated with the idea advanced by Schwandt (2001) of a research seeking to understand human action. Non-numeric data deriving from document analysis and qualitative interviews was used to get the rich descriptions that come with words. The interest was finding out if the public was allowed participation in the formulation of the ELM – LED (2010-2015) strategy. If public participation was factored in the process, what explained the perceived apathy in other critical stakeholders – who seem not to realize that they have contributions to make towards economic viability of their place?

Rich descriptions were sought of the instances wherein authentic public participation could be said to be occurring or not, within the programmes and projects aimed at economic development in Lady Frere.

Consistent with the idea that qualitative studies generate information about phenomena, it was important for this study to generate information about the ELM-LED strategy and the processes of its formulation. This is a policy document that must guide economic growth and lead to employment in Lady Frere and Emalahleni Local Municipality (ELM) broadly.

3.3 Research Plan

A research plan is a plan or blue print of how you intend conducting your research. A plan aims to tackle the research questions and stated objectives of the research. This means the plan must be appropriate to the context. It must heed the purpose of the study. (Mouton, 2001:55).

This study was an empirical study. Empirical studies mainly gain knowledge through observation and measurement; viewed and experienced in contemporary periods. Tools that are based on logic and reason are used to gain this knowledge. The idea of gaining insight by observation or measurement hints that these studies can be either qualitative or quantitative. A qualitative empirical study is noted for its low control of data whereas its quantitative counterpart is marked by high control of data.
Therefore, because of its inclination to rich descriptions, this study is a qualitative empirical study. The primary aim is to achieve greater understanding by gaining qualitative empirical data and providing accurate interpretation of information that arises therefrom. Qualitative empirical studies often distinguish between primary empirical data and secondary empirical data. Primary empirical data is data that must be firstly sought prior to it being analysed – this is often the case with data gathered by way of interviews. Secondary empirical data, by contrast, is data that is readily available – ready for analysis. The case in point is the ELM-LED strategy document; it is readily available for analysis. Therefore, secondary data is existing data whereas primary data is the kind that must still be sought.

For the reason that secondary data is existing data, analysis of this data preceded that of primary data. The researcher did that to establish a sense of what themes are uppermost in this government communicative matter. For instance, we sought to glean messages about authentic participation by the public in the LED formulation process and assign meaning to results that we obtained by systematic application of such methods as content analysis and discourse analysis. (These are explained later as the chapter develops – specific attention will be give to both.) Since this study sought to establish participation by the public in formulating the ELM-LED strategy, it had to describe the process and later explore it for fuller meaning. The evaluation of this LED strategy will be achieved by employing a descriptive and exploratory approach. The strategy document will firstly be described before it can be evaluated. Describing the document will give background to the researcher regarding the development challenges facing the ELM – including poverty levels and unemployment. Therefore, description will provide a narrative account of the ELM-LED strategy.

Exploration, on the other hand, will provide means to get relative themes that emerge from the study as it continues. In characterizing the LED strategy, attempts will be made to analyse it in terms of its relations with the projects aimed at giving effect to it. Content analysis will also be used to identify the intentions, focus and communication trends embedded in the LED strategy. Moreover, it will help to analyse the transcriptions from the proposed one to one interviews. This form of analysis will assist the exploration process by providing a comprehensive understanding of the topic.
3.4 Research Methodology

Research methodology refers to “the methods, techniques and procedures that are employed in the process of implementing the research design/plan, as well as the underlying principles and assumptions that underlie their use.” Babbie et al (2001)

Mouton (2001: 56) also sees research methodology as focussing on the research process and the kinds of tools and procedures used. Its point of departure is the specific task that must be performed, for example – the collection of data. Thus, research methodology focuses on the individual steps in the research process and the most objective procedures to be employed.

Paraphrased, methodology directs the implementation process. It aligns plan implementation to the set objectives in a bid to ensure that the procedure used is responsible for the outcomes that result. These used procedures have underlying assumptions and principles regarding their use. Consequently, the choice of methodology is linked to the purpose, problem statement, aims and objectives of the study. A qualitative research approach will be used in this study. It will be a case study, in combination with a content analysis and a discourse analysis method to ensure a systematic examination of all the research data. Interviews will also be used to collect data – to be consequently transcribed for analysis by content analysis.

3.4.1 Qualitative Research Methodology

Bloomberg and Volpe (2008:10) regard qualitative research as a broad approach to studying social phenomena, which is essentially on a constructivist and or critical perspective. This definition tells us that qualitative research enquires social phenomena with a critical analysis and an aim of constructing explanations that are based on the collected data. It does this by employing an inductive approach – examining the available relevant data to develop theories about the nature of that phenomenon. It does not hypothesize and test the hypothesis against available data. Theories or explanations about the nature of the phenomenon are grounded on the data; they emerge from collected data.
Characteristically, qualitative research is defined by its inductive approach – usually defined as working from specific cases to reach more general conclusions about a phenomenon. (Schwandt, 2001:126) Its efforts are grounded in data and not speculative or abstract. At times, this may mean using available relevant data to draw conclusions that may be generalizable. The ELM-LED strategy provides a useful example here. It is available and relevant to the study and it could shed some light pertaining to the questions raised in this study.

Qualitative study is also flexible. It embraces all three known purposes of conducting a research. Qualitative research can be descriptive, exploratory, and/or explanatory. Descriptively, the study would describe situations and events – the researcher observes and simply describe what he/she observes. Exploratory, it seeks to satisfy the researcher’s curiosity, test the feasibility of undertaking a more extensive study, and to develop methods to be used in a subsequent study. Explanatory – it may be the purpose of the research to explain why and how things occur.

Accordingly, it embraces both the critical and interpretive research paradigms. The critical paradigm aims at integrating theory and practices in a way that alerts the individuals and groups to the contradictions and distortions in their beliefs and social practices – then inspire them to change. Interpretivist view holds that social sciences have their own unique and appropriate logic and need not conform to the constraints of natural sciences. Moreover, since qualitative research is inductive in nature, its design should be such that it generates ideas about the studied phenomenon. Designs should be open and allowing new information to emerge as the research unfolds. The open framework of qualitative research makes it flexible – for instance it allows for content analysis and discourse analysis methods to be used in conjunction with a case study. This flexibility eliminates limitations formerly placed on quantitative researchers and the need to control data. It allows the researcher to seek the relevant data with purpose.

Finally, qualitative research methodology is appropriate for the current study for all the features outlined above here. This study aimed to establish the extent of public participation during the formulation of the ELM-LED strategy. The inductive point of this study is the ELM – LED strategy document. It will shed significant insights about the process of its own creation and adoption.
The researcher will examine the contents of this policy document to establish the centrality it places on public participation. Qualitative research is useful for its interpretive inclination, which will encourage the interpretation of the LED strategy in our case. This may for instance cover such points as extent of public involvement, hint on mechanisms used to draw data from the critical sectors of ELM and shed light on agreed upon sector contributions to enact the projects that give impetus to the strategy.

A case study approach was used to study comprehensively the inclusion process adopted when formulating the LED strategy. It was empirical in that it made use of both primary and secondary data. To collect primary data, interviews were used—with content analysis and discourse ultimately used to analyse received relevant data and assigning meaning to results.

3.5 What is a case study?

Leedy (1997:157) thinks of a case study as occurring when the researcher “explores a single entity or phenomenon bounded by time and activity, and collects detailed information by using a variety of data collection procedures during a sustained period of time.”

Robert Yin (in Schwandt, 2001) regards a case study as strategy to find answers to how and why questions, used when the enquirer has little control over what is being studied. The object of study should be a contemporary phenomenon in a real life context. It must also be the desire of the researcher to use multiple sources of evidence.

These two explanations agree about the need to use various sources of evidence (data collection). This is a flexible feature normally associated with case study research. As both authors suggest, case study research must use various sources of data to come to conclusions about the studied phenomenon.

Interestingly, both Leedy and Yin explain a case study to embrace the parameters of the current study. The qualitative study conducted by the researcher fits the characterizations made by the authors above-here. The interest of this research was finding out how the idea of authentic public participation was factored into the LED
strategy formulation process. Additional questions about why things were done the way they were, revealed information about capacity of various structures critical for the LED process to succeed. These were explored in terms that are more comfortable during the interviews as well.

Accordingly, the current study also fits Yin’s observations about a case study. As an enquirer, the researcher had little or no control over the phenomenon to be studied. Consistently, the study was about a contemporary phenomenon that existed in a real life situation, and the researcher used multiple sources of evidence to find answers. Reliance was not on primary empirical data (interviews) alone, secondary data (written documents) was also used. So, for all the reasons given herein, case study strategy was used to execute on this research study. We look at interviewing as one of the ways used to collect data in this study.

3.6 Interviewing

Schwandt (2001:135) suggests that there are mainly three ways of looking at and explaining interviews within qualitative studies. Firstly, they can be viewed as a set of techniques for generating and analysing data from structured, semi-structured, unstructured interviews with group and or individual respondents. Secondly, interviews may be seen as a kind of person-to-person encounter (between the researcher and the researched) that entails ethical considerations on the role of the researcher, the consequences of the use of information, confidentiality, and anonymity. Thirdly, interviews can be seen from the angle of what the researcher does when interviewing. Two primary perspectives are important to note with this way of looking at interviews. One is the most common way of regarding interviews as a way of gaining direct access to the interviewee’s experiences. Seen this way, an interview is a behavioural event (verbal exchanges using the stimulus-response logic of question and answer). In this arrangement, the researcher aims to ask the right question to elicit responses in the form of authentic feelings and meanings of the interviewee. The other is the perspective that regards interviews as a discursive (moving from one point to another without any strict structure) narrative or linguistic event unfolding in a specific socio-political context. Here, the meanings of questions and responses are contextually grounded and jointly constructed by the interviewer and the interviewee.
Therefore, interviewing is an active joint construction of plausible stories or accounts of social life.

Barbour (2008:113 -121) opines that while most researchers think of interviews as a gold standard of qualitative enquiry, interviews are rarified, in-depth exchange between the researcher and the researched. Interviews are interactional. He notes that interviews conducted for research purposes usually attempt to add to the knowledge base by either questioning a new group of people about a topic or questioning people about a new topic or both. She opines that the rarefied nature of interviews requires researchers to ensure a match between them and the methods they choose.

Barbour emphasizes the need for interviewers to give the interviewee space to emphasize points they choose and give them the latitude to start where they want. Barbour acknowledges that actual research encounters are rich and varied and are at times the co-production between the researcher and the researched.

She advises though, that even where interviews are semi-structured, the researcher should develop and use interview schedules to ensure that the same information is routinely collected from each interviewee. Clarifying the purpose of the research and ultimately the interview ensure that respondents give accounts with a bearing on the aims of the research. The focus of qualitative research on lay knowledge and understanding is emphasized. She cautions that interviews could be also a two-way exchange where both parties may have agendas.

Accordingly Quinn (2002:340-341) adds, “We interview people to find out from them those things we cannot directly observe ...The fact is we cannot observe every thing. We cannot observe feelings, thoughts and intentions. We cannot observe behaviours that took place at some previous point in time...We have to ask people questions about those things”. He suggests that there are three alternatives to interviews, namely the informal conversational interview, the general interview guide approach and the standardized open-ended interview. Commonly, interviews allow the interviewee to bring you (researcher) in his/her own world. They allow us (researchers) to enter into the other person’s perspective.

All these points were instructive to our case. The researcher had chosen interviews as a way of eliciting primary data about the inclusion /exclusion of the various
stakeholders when the ELM-LED strategy was formulated. The view was to find out information from respondents about things we could not directly observe now. The information to gather was about a process that took place before 2010 and indeed, that could not be observed now for the purposes of the current study. We relied on the recollections of those who were involved in the process. Care was taken to ensure that relevant questions were asked of the participants and that the undertaking was not a waste of time. These questions bordered on the four dimensions of authentic participation identified for operationalizing the variable of interest in this study.

Semi-structured or standardised open-ended interviews were used for the current study. They were favoured for their flexibility even when predefined subjects for discussion have been identified. Interview questions were used to ensure that while the interviewee was given space to articulate his/her points, the interviewer still maintained what little control he/she might in terms of guiding the process to address the key questions. Evincing this flexibility, the interviewees expressed their ideas freely on any raised question about their participation in the LED strategy formulation process, and they chose which information to stress on and at what point. (Barbour, 2008:119; Quinn, 2003:339; Wilkinson & Birmingham, 2003:45)

Decisions about how data would be collected were made right from inception. In this study, the researcher used an audio (voice) recorder. Permission to use the gadget was always sought from each interviewee before its use. All respondents were comfortable with the idea.

Conversations are fleeting things wherein enormous and wide ranging amounts of information can be shared in a short time. Reliance on memory and field notes alone seemed inadequate. Yet, transcriptions from recorded interviews offered a great deal. Importantly, case studies embrace interviews (one of the multiple sources of evidence) and audio recorders lack the intrusiveness associated with tools like video-recorders. Clearance was sought with the participants on this matter.

3.6.1 Sampling

Babbie (2007: 183) notes that there are two types of sampling to be used in selecting participants for a study. These are non-probability and probability sampling. Non-
probability sampling is “any technique in which samples are selected in someway not suggested by the probability theory. Examples include reliance on available subjects, as well as purposive (judgemental), quota and snowball sampling.”

To illustrate the difference, Babbie (2007.187) also notes “Probability sampling - the general term for samples selected in accord with probability theory, typically involving some random-selection mechanism. Specific types of probability sampling include...simple random sampling and systematic sampling”

Schwandt (2001:232-3) agrees and explains further that, “there are two general strategies or logics for selecting units (organizations, events, people, documents, locations etc) to study in qualitative work... an empirical or statistical strategy, sample units chosen based not on their representativeness.. but for their relevance to the research question, analytic framework, and explanation or account being development in the research...”

Summarily, two forms of sampling may be used – probability sampling and the non-probability sampling approach. Probability samples are appropriate when generalizations will be made from data. This is based on random thinking. Non-probability sampling on the other hand is done with the purpose of the study in mind. It selects respondents according to the purpose they will serve in the study. The researcher must think purposively and conceptually about sampling. This study used purposive sampling strategy. (Denzin &Lincoln 1998:204)

This study utilized a non-probability sampling method. In keeping with the nature of a qualitative study, rich descriptions in (spoken /written) words were sought using document and interview analysis. Initially the intention was to interview two groups of people – managers / heads of businesses and government institutions operating in Lady Frere in one group and respondents from various social structures represented in Lady Frere in the other. The researcher needed to have a general sense of the level of awareness of this inclusive discourse (LED) by senior private and public officials in Lady Frere before gauging the same understanding with people of Lady Frere broadly. The researcher’s selection would be arbitrary in this regard. Selections would be judgemental based on relevance in answering the research questions.
Worth noting, the piloting phase, which would be carried out with the business managers and heads of locally represented government departments and agencies never occurred as planned. Neither did the intended second phase occur as intended. One group of people was successfully interviewed and this was the group comprising of private and public sector managers, including representatives from labour, the youth and women’s structure. Other intended respondents could not keep to scheduled interviews when others just could not be reached. In total nineteen respondents were successfully interviewed. All respondents were senior officials in their institutions. Seven of these respondents came from public sector institutions when another seven came from the business (retail) sector and the remaining five comprised of two labour representatives, a youth representative, a representative from one of the women’s leagues in operation in the area and a councillor. In all, nineteen respondents were interviewed for the current study.

As alluded to, and based on theoretical understanding the researcher had achieved regarding sampling for interviews, this study used theoretical or purposive sample. This non-probability strategy was chosen for the allowance it gave the researcher to select sample units according to the purposes he had for the study. This allowed for a more accurate account of the unit of analysis observed – samples were drawn, as they were judged relevant to answer the research questions. (Creswell 1998:118)

3.7 Content Analysis

Content Analysis may be understood as a systematic way of examining communicative matter. This communicative matter or substance must be fixed or recorded. Content analysis extracts content from various forms of data – numeric and non-numeric to give results regarding the unit of analysis observed. It may enumerate incidences or frequency in occurrence of a particular theme or concept. Beyond that, it can trace relationships between themes to give interpretations bent on constructing new meanings about social reality.

“In essence, content analysis is based on the assumption that an analysis of the language in use can reveal meanings, priorities and understandings, and the ways of organizing and seeing the world.”(Wilkinson &Birmingham, 2003:68)

Gomm (2004: 1889, 246-47) and Rubin et.al (2010:217) agree that the essence of content analysis method is found in communication occurring between the subject
matter and the receiver (reader) of information. The focus is therefore on the subject matter (content) of that communicative matter. The question may be whether the subject matter is actually conveyed to the receiver in the text being analysed. In a way content analysis also examines the impact the communication has on those who interact with it.

Rubin et.al (2010:217) explains that content analysts “... look at the characteristics of communication messages. Their purpose is to learn something about message content and about those who produce the messages.” Thus, the primary concern of content analysis is to understand the content of the messages being sent out and learn about its authors.

As earlier alluded to, this method is a pliable approach that embraces both the qualitative and quantitative traditions. It has been also used in varying situations (see Wilkinson & Birmingham, 2003:68). Depending on the purpose of the researcher, it may be used to analyse anything ranging from numeric to non-numeric data.

At a quantitative level, it focuses on the frequency in the occurrence of certain words, themes or concepts. These concepts ought to have a bearing on the content of the communicative matter analysed. The frequency of certain themes as against others may be compared and thereafter given meaning. This would mark the end of the first phase of content analysis.

To analyse the data received from a quantitative content analysis and give it meaning, a certain process must be followed. It comprises of a series of eight steps, namely:

- Decide on the unit /level of analysis
- Identify the concepts
- Define the concepts
- Decide on whether to code for incidence or frequency of concepts
- Establish coding rules
- Trawl through the information
- Code the information
- Analyse the results

(Wilkinson & Birmingham, 2003: 72)
On completion, it may be possible to say how many times, the concept of authentic public participation appears in the transcripts and the text. We may also wish to compare it to the occurrence of concepts cognate to the one of public participation, such as citizen participation, stakeholder participation, group participation, individual participation and so on. We may also wish to compare positive and negative things that promote or hinder authentic participation by the public in decision-making and policy formulation. Results will then be reported as they emerge from data.

Useful as quantitative content analysis may be in conceptual and thematic analysis, it is still noted for its limitations. The failure to divulge true meanings behind information and data is often cited as a limitation. The argument goes on to suggest that to better understand the information or the text before us, we must consider the relationships between words and phrases and explore their emphasis.

This is where qualitative content analysis comes in. It seeks to make up for the real meanings lost in favour of frequencies. Qualitative research is concerned with richness and describing the unique complexities of data (Wilkinson & Birmingham, 2003:76)

Wilkinson & Birmingham suggest that tracing relationships will yield better results at satisfying the need for real meanings of communicative matter. They call this approach relational analysis. Relational analysis begins by identifying the themes or issues to be explored. The thrust of this approach is identifying and exploring relationships between themes. Emphasis is not on themes but on relationships between the themes.

Like its quantitative counterpart, qualitative content analysis also comprises of eight steps. These are:

- Deciding on the question
- Framing the analysis
- Deciding on the relationship types to examine (affective extraction, proximity analysis or cognitive mapping)
- Deciding on the codes and categories
- Exploration of relationships
• Coding the relationships, and
• Mapping the relationship

Through graphic representation of the relationships, strengths and weaknesses inherent in those relationships including positive and negative attributes can be visualised. The process of content analysis as suggested by Wilkinson & Birmingham is elaborate – involving a number of steps to be satisfied prior to claiming validity.

Henning (2004) and Gomm (2004) suggest a shorter version. This involves the use of three research techniques of summarizing, coding and inductive category formation. Using this approach the researcher could summarize by:

• Defining the subsections of the LED strategy,
• Paraphrasing data within subsections to be consistent with content of that subsection,
• Defining the paraphrased information in terms of abstract meaning contained in the information – this is followed by elimination of paraphrases that are synonymous.

Coding may be used by a researcher as a technique of content analysis method. The process is described as standardization of data by transforming it into a form suitable for analysis. (Babbie, 2005:481)

Schwandt (2001:26) sees coding as a “procedure that disaggregates data, breaks it down into manageable segments and identifies and names those segments.” Constant comparisons and contrasts of various segments are necessary to put them finally into the appropriate categories. Summarily, coding is in itself an analytical process that will expedite the analysis for content.

Inductive category formation – is a technique that builds on the coding process. It takes the categories emerging from the coding process into a broader context:

• It examines the formed categories in the context of their environmental and institutional impact.
• The categories will then be analysed in terms of external influences and challenges and their impact. This will give a holistic view of the strategy and its components (aims, goals and objectives)
The background of concepts will be justified and summarizing can once again be used to reduce the material into a manageable text form. Inductive category formation technique may help produce structured categories of themes that may be linked to the LED strategy for ease of understanding.

Triangulation of these techniques presented the advantage of describing the LED strategy document and interview data through summarization. Inductive category formation techniques would then help produce structured categories of themes that may be linked to the LED strategy for ease and better understanding. Subsequently, using content analysis method in this study would give the researcher a basis for the research and an instrument for deeper analysis.

3.7.1 Application of the Content Analysis to the ELM-LED strategy (2010-2015)

As earlier hinted, analysis of the LED document preceded the scheduling of interviews. This meant gaining useful insights by the researcher as to what happened during the process. “In essence, content analysis is based on the assumption that an analysis of the language in use can reveal meanings, priorities and understandings, and the ways of organizing and seeing the world.”(Wilkinson & Birmingham, 2003:68)

The researcher first applied latent coding on the document to gain information about the LED process contained in the document but not evident. This was achieved by reading through the document to get an overall picture before analysing specific sections of the document. As the researcher read the LED policy document, some words just kept on constantly coming out of the text. This led the researcher to doing frequency counts of each of these words to see if any meaning could be gleaned from emphasis of certain words. These words were Municipality, stakeholders, participation, and integration. The frequency in the occurrence of these themes/words was determined by counting the number of times they appeared in the text. All the pages of the text were examined for these words. The results gained from this exercise were then used to shape further analysis of the document; they informed the decision on further coding of the LED document. (Babbie, 2007)
The 8-step model suggested by Wilkinson & Birmingham was used to analyse the LED for content further.

The model involved:

- Decide on the unit /level of analysis
- Identify the concepts
- Define the concepts
- Decide on whether to code for incidence or frequency of concepts
- Establish coding rules
- Trawl through the information
- Code the information
- Analyse the results

(Wilkinson & Birmingham, 2003: 72)

Our unit of analysis was the LED strategy document and the researcher decided that statements or sentences contained in the text would be units of observation. Statements carry information or opinions about a range of phenomena. Using them as our units of observation in this process would assist the endeavour to analyse the LED text. The variable identified for further examination was authentic participation. This was defined as a situation in which citizens are allowed space as equal partners in municipal planning and decision-making - a situation where the voice of the public influenced the decisions taken by councillors and municipal officials. Accountability is at the core of this process. The construct of authentic public participation was then operationalized by adopting the four dimensions of authenticity as a measurement for observing implementation of authentic public involvement in the LED strategy formulation process. Each of these dimensions was further given specific attributes/indicators exclusive and exhaustive to them. These indicators would assist in establishing if any of the dimensions of authenticity obtained in the LED document. The researcher sought to establish if the LED text conveyed any messages about these public intervention initiatives.

The coding rules were that if all the dimensions of authenticity were satisfied, the LED strategy formulation process in ELM, Lady Frere, probably allowed for authentic participation (participants were empowered to some degree). In the case of only three of these dimensions being satisfied, the indication would be that the public involvement initiatives followed were tokenistic. In the event that only two and less of
the indicators of the dimensions obtain, the participation in LED strategy formulation would then have been non-participatory. Findings there from are discussed in the next chapter on findings.

Then the researcher sought more information about the processes, more than mere frequency counts. A qualitative analysis of the document followed with a view to achieving a deeper understanding of the contents of the document. The process extended from frequency counts of the statements indicating authentic participation and went on to discovering of patterns in the data. By using frequency counts, the researcher sought to understand how often the idea of authentic participation found expression in the data. The magnitude /levels of participation by the public were then also established. The researcher also examined the structure of participation allowed the Lady Frere public during the process. The idea was to determine if any different approaches to participation were employed and what their relationship was. We also intended to find out if any order existed within the elements that form this structure – in this way it would be easy to say whether public participation allowed Lady Frere people during the process allowed for any formal platforms or representation. The researcher also examined the causes for inclusion /exclusion of the public that may have occurred during the LED process. Finally, we had to explore how this inclusion/exclusion affected the commitment to the realization of the vision and objectives of the LED strategy. The findings from that exercise are the subject of the next chapter.

The content analysis method was also used on the transcriptions of the interviews that were scheduled with purposely-selected respondents. Both the quantitative and qualitative aspects of the content analysis method were used. As is the case with analysis of the LED document, the results from that exercise will be dealt with in the chapter that deals specifically with findings. To ensure rigour in analysing data the discourse analysis methods was also used.

3.8 Discourse analysis

Before looking at discourse analysis as process, let us look at what a discourse is. Understanding what a discourse is will enable a better understanding of the analysis process. Fisher (2003:90) thinks of a discourse as an ensemble of ideas and concepts that give social meaning to social and physical relationships. In another sense a
discourse may understood as a *socially recognisable identity* that is forged by combining and integrating language, actions, interactions, ways of thinking and believing; the use of various symbols, tools and methods to enact it. (Gee, 2005:24)

Foucault (1920: 84) saw a discourse as a broad system of thought that shapes the subjects and their worlds. In other words, it is some form of a guiding thought (thinking). This guiding thinking carves the subjects and their worlds. The way subjects and their worlds are – can be explained by the thought (thinking) guiding them. This makes a discourse such a powerful instrument or force in terms of guiding human conduct – we can better understand human action by examining discourses guiding them. (in Schwandt 2001)

The consistent theme here is that a discourse is some form of thinking or socially recognizable identity that is forged and enacted (through combining language, thinking, actions etc.) to shape the subjects and their worlds. Discourse Analysis therefore will be defined as simply the breaking down of a discourse into its component parts. It is one of the tools for textual analysis. Its focus is on actually occurring language or speech – to unearth the content of that text. Meaning is understood as socially constructed. Therefore, discourse analysis addresses the means used to constitute and operate a particular discourse.

Indeed, discourse analysis will entail examination of the many things that compose a discourse; the language used to advance the awareness of this discourse; the effect that this awareness has on those who interact with the communicative matter. What actions arise because of this awareness? How do these actions shape the interactions that define the current discourse of inclusiveness, as opposed to the apartheid discourse of exclusion? What tools, methods and symbols are currently in use to enact the newly acquired ‘socially recognizable identity’? These highlight some of the issues that will be raised during a discourse analysis.

Discourse Analysis is relevant for use in this study for four reasons. Firstly; it is one of the tools use for textual analysis – it will assist in ensuring that results arrived at in this study, are a product of rigorous and systematic processes. It will also be used in conjunction with content analysis. Used this way, discourse analysis will confirm and
elaborate on the findings achieved by using content analysis. Triangulation of methods and techniques has the benefit of taking the systems thinking further – where a particular method seems to fall short; the other comes in to cover up. Even where no deficiencies seem present, the use of different analytical models to arrive at the same conclusion will attest to the validity of that conclusion.

The ELM-LED strategy and the transcripts from interviews with selected members of the Emalahleni community will be subjected to this method of data collection and analysis. This will help determine and compare the findings as they emerge from data. In this way, room or space is created to contrast the urgency of messages in the communicative matter using different methods of analysis. Construction of interpretations occurs against the backdrop of shared language, understanding and practices. All forms of data will be subjected to the various forms of qualitative data analysis.

Secondly, Discourse platform for government policy and strategies in South Africa derives from social factors engineered by the former apartheid state. It arises from injustices and effects of oppression by the apartheid state that existed before 1994. Effects of that social reality inform many themes in this new democratic dispensation. Current government policies and strategies are formulated to address discourses that have evolved and are evolving on the state. South Africa has produced a fair share of discourses including racism, unemployment, inequality and underdevelopment. The LED strategy is one of the policies created on the above premise. It deals with themes of underdevelopment, inclusion and empowerment – aimed at curing defects arising from discourses that were centrally controlled and co-ordinated.

The LED strategy (2010-15) is a prerequisite for socio-economic redistribution. It should be connected to social realities experienced by people of ELM- Lady Frere. This strategy bears objectives and targets that must be worked at – as cued by the guidelines provided in the National Framework for LED.

Thirdly, discourse analysis enabled extensive analysis of social interactions at varying levels. Social interaction discernibly occurs at two levels: (a) between individuals, and (b) interaction between policy and its citizens. The second type of interaction is
directed towards change. Thus, the role of the ELM-LED strategy (2010-15) is of serving as a communicative document and a working tool for the people of ELM. We will see how the strategy fares in this regard as we apply discourse analysis to the document.

Fourthly, in some sense discourses are seen as mechanisms for inducing behaviour. This mechanism exercises power by regulating the citizens’ thoughts and actions by means of policy directives. (Wodak & Meyer, 2009:35-7) This is in line with the view that discourses should be understood in context with their institutions. The analysis of language context of actors should give due regard to institutions they are in. (Fischer, 2003:76) The interest is in establishing the extent to which the current discourse of inclusiveness has induced behaviours consistent with its dominant thoughts.

Finally, because of their ability to shape reality, discourses are applied in the current study to determine justifications about decisions on strategic interventions chosen to advance the ELM-LED strategy. In all, discourse analysis establishes the reasoning behind political strategy decisions and other concerns, which may have guided the formulation of the ELM-LED strategy. This bears with the thinking that discourses are mechanisms to induce behaviour. Next, we trace the application of discourse analysis method in the LED text.

3.8.1 Application of Discourse Analysis to the LED strategy document.

Fischer described a discourse as an ensemble of ideas and concepts giving meaning to social and physical relationships. Gee described a discourse as a socially recognizable identity created by combining and integrating language, cultural practices, actions and interactions, including ways of thinking. In addition, Foucault regarded a discourse as a guiding thinking that shapes subjects (Individuals) and their world. A consistent theme in these explanations is that discourses influence the directions chosen by those participating in them.

In applying discourse analysis to the text, the researcher searched for statements indicating existence of what could be called a common identity of the Lady Frere people. The idea was to test how consistently the themes of socially recognizable
identity came through in the text. How was the notion of a discourse being some form of thinking or socially recognizable identity that is forged and enacted to shape the subjects and their worlds represented in the LED document? What social and physical relationships emerged in Lady Frere in the process? The researcher sought to uncover meanings assigned to these relationships in the LED strategy document. Did the LED document assign new meanings to relations of dependence than hitherto known in South Africa, generally and Lady Frere in particular? Alternatively, did this strategy document imbue the people of Lady Frere with a new sense of responsibility and need for active involvement in matters affecting them?

The environment is as much a part of us as anything – we live in it. How does the LED policy document attach meaning to environmental issues?

With Gee’s definition of a discourse in mind, the researcher sought to find out if the LED document referred to new sets of relationships or assigned any new meanings to existing relations. Answers to some of these questions appear in the next chapter on findings. We now turn to interviews.

### 3.9 Qualitative Interviews

As earlier alluded to letters of request were sent out to potential respondents asking them to participate in the current study and to sign in indication of their agreement to participate. The aims of the study and their role in it were explained to them. No financial rewards were promised to would be participants; every respondent participated in their own volition. Issues of privacy and protection of their identity were also explained to their reasonable understanding. Interviews took place in the respondent’s places of work during the lunch hour breaks. Accordingly, permission was sought from participants to use the voice-recording device during the interviews. The reasons for the request were explained and permission granted. The interviews took about forty-five minutes to conduct except with the interview scheduled with taxi operators. It took the whole hour and fifteen minutes. This was probably because the researcher was given three respondents all at once to answer the questions of interest.

In total, nineteen people responded positively to the request to participate in the study. These respondents came from the original pool of potential respondents purposively selected by the researcher according to their perceived significance to the study. The
respondents comprised of senior officials from various institutions operating in Lady Frere. They all had been serving their various institutions in Lady Frere since the year 2007.

Seven of these respondents came from public service institutions, while another seven came from the private business sector and the remaining five came from civil society structures (youth representative, women’s representative, two labour representatives, and a councillor.) The gender composition of the respondents was nine females and ten males. Given that, most of the respondents were senior officials in their organizations; this gave a fair reflection of how organizational leadership in Lady Frere looked like. The same set of questions was posed to all the respondents, the only difference being wording that varied with the situation the researcher faced at that moment. The questions were open-ended allowing the respondent space to choose which information to share, how and at what time. The questions bordered on the four dimensions of authenticity and probes were made where relevant to find out information or opinions of the respondents on the issue of their participation in the LED strategy formulation process. The results of the interviews are discussed under findings in the next chapter.

3.10 Conclusion

This chapter sought to give a clear outline of the research plan and methodology used to carry out this study. Research methods were individually described and explained. Their individual applicability and importance was recognized and pointed out in terms of the current study. We hinted that the study is a qualitative empirical study that employed the case study strategy, in conjunction with content and discourse analysis methods to collect relevant data. Therefore; it worked from the basis of available data to avoid speculation associated with the traditional approach to doing research. The aim was to investigate than to prove a hypothesis. Explanations were therefore grounded on available data.

Interviews were also used to collect data. The inductive approach (defining all qualitative studies) would then be used to generate theories from available data. The LED strategy (2010-2015) document provided the researcher an inductive point of entry. It is a policy document that must guide the economic development process in
Lady Frere and ELM broadly. Using the document enabled the researcher to develop an understanding of the LED strategy for the local municipality in context. The researcher could then generate theories about the apathy perceived in attending LED forum meetings. Next, we explore the results of the systematic collection and analysis of data. That is subject of the next chapter.
Chapter Four: Findings, analysis and interpretation of data

4.1 Introduction

This chapter gives the results obtained from applying the various research methods explained above to investigate authenticity of the participation of the Lady Frere public during the LED strategy formulation process. It sets out the findings deriving from the use of each of the chosen methods and then gives an interpretation of those findings. We start with content analysis. The LED strategy document was fixed data and available for analysis.

4.2 Results from Content Analysis on LED strategy (2010-2015) document.

The researcher alluded that during the initial and subsequent readings of the LED document certain words constantly emerged from the text. These words were municipality, stakeholders, participation and integration. A frequency count of these words was conducted and the results were the following:

- Municipality = 198
- Stakeholders = 21
- Participation = 39
- Integration = 96

As the results show, the word municipality occurred more than the other three words put together. This indicates an emphasis on the centrality placed on the municipality as the agent of change and economic development. The LED strategy document is a policy document that must communicate the expectations of the local people (stakeholders) concerning the economic viability of their locality. These expectations are crystallized in the shared vision the local citizens craft from carefully analysing their status quo and deciding on pathways to change what is undesirable about it. The word stakeholder/s appears merely twenty one times and this is the lowest scored by any of the words identified for frequency counting. This may be taken to mean that the role of stakeholders was minimal in the LED formulation process. Broadly, it may come across as implying that stakeholders have little or no role to play in economic development – economic development is an exclusive preserve of the municipality. The same can be said of the word participation it appears only thirty nine times in
the whole document. This may indicate the kind of significance attached to the idea of participation. The concept of integration fared better than the other two concepts (i.e. Stakeholders and participation) with a frequency occurrence of 39 in the whole document. Again, the sense that one has is that the document predominantly purports the view that LED is a Key Results Area (KRA) for municipal officials in the IPED section. When the document is supposed to be advancing participation by all stakeholders, it, wittingly or unwittingly, managed to centralize the LED strategy formulation process to the municipality. That integration scored better than the other words (participation & stakeholders) could imply that the municipality is more disposed to incorporating/integrating programs advanced by other institutions than create a space for joint planning of the programs to guide Lady Frere and ELM to economic viability.

Beyond frequency counts of words and themes occurring in the text, the researcher went on to code certain sections of the text to achieve a better and fuller insight into the processes building up to the final production of the LED strategy document. To this end, it was earlier intimated that since the LED strategy document was our unit of analysis, we focussed on the statements or sentences contained in the text to determine whether, in fact, give information about the participation of Lady Frere public in the LED process. These sentences were therefore our units of observation. The attributes of the various dimensions of authentic participation would be sought by observing these statements.

As earlier intimated, specific sections of the LED document were identified for coding and further analysis. These sections included the Mayor’s Foreword, the introductory section, the process section and section on strategic goals of the municipality. The researcher saw these sections as those that would be resourceful in illuminating important processes followed to ensure citizen participation. The coding rule was simple. Either a statement gave information about the LED formulation process or it did not. Information given was tested against the set criteria for authenticity. The Four dimensions, together with their attributes, enabled a careful examination of the LED strategy by the researcher. This process began with the coding of the Mayors foreword.
The **Mayor’s foreword** was chosen since, by its very nature, a foreword serves the same function as an abstract or preface in a book or document. It briefly introduces the book or document; explain the author’s aims while also providing information on key aspects of the document. This section was coded at a sentence /statement level. The search was for statements giving information/opinion about public participation allowed the Lady Frere people during the strategy formulation process. These statements had to contain information about at least contain any of the four dimensions of authenticity. The attributes /indicators set out for each of the dimensions would help to determine whether the statements depicted participation by the Lady Frere public. The results of coding the eight statements in this section were as follows:

- Representativeness = 1
- Interactiveness = 0
- Use of public inputs in decision-making = 0
- Quality of public inputs = 0

Therefore, out of eight statements contained in this section only one statement depicted attributes of one dimension. This statement reflected on the degree of concern shown for the stakeholders who were still not part of the process. “We look forward to collaboration …”

**The introduction section** – like all the sections of the text identified for coding, the introduction section was coded for content analysis. Since introductions tend to provide an overview of book or a document, the researcher hoped that contents would also reflect on the extent to which the public was allowed participation during the process. As in the case of the Mayoral Foreword, all the statements in the section were coded as either depicting any one /or combination of the four dimensions of authentic participation. The indicators were used to operationalize the variable of authentic participation and its dimensions. Out of forty-two statements contained in the section, the following were the results:

- Representativeness = 3 statements (degree of attracting Stakeholders)
  - 1 statement (degree of concern for weak Participation by stakeholders)
- Interactiveness = 1 statement
- Use of public Inputs = 0
- Quality of public inputs = 0

Summarily, of the forty-two statements coded in the introductory section of the LED document, only five statements depicted the dimensions of authenticity. It would seem that even in this section little could be applauded by way of authentic participation by the public in the programme.

The section outlining the process followed during LED strategy formulation process was also coded for data collection and analysis. This section of the document promised rich descriptions of processes followed during the strategy formulation process. The same measurements used in other sections were used in this section as well. The four dimensions of authenticity were operationalized by searching for statements depicting scenarios characterized in the indicators. In all, the section comprised of seven statements, which were all coded to determine if they matched the four dimensions of authenticity.

The results of the coding process were as follows:

- Representation = 1
- Interactiveness = (1)
- Use of public inputs = 0
- Quality of public inputs = 0

In summary, the section consisted of seven statements and all were coded for analysis. Only one statement was found to depict authentic participation. This statement was found to embrace at least two of the four stated dimensions, namely Representativeness and Interactiveness. 

Section 3.6 of the LED strategy deals with **strategic goals of the LED**. The section comprised of sixteen statements in all and only two statements depicted authentic participation. The two statements represented the first two dimensions of the variable being measured.
- Representativeness = 1
- Interactiveness = 1
- Use of public inputs = 0
- Quality of public inputs = 0

The frequency counts of statements depicting authentic participation in these sections revealed that the total number of statements contained in the coded sections (put together) is seventy-eight statements. Of these seventy-eight statements, only eight statements could be said to depict authentic participation by the Lady Frere public. Put differently, the seventy other statements say little or nothing about the nature and extent of participation allowed the Lady Frere public during the process. Only 6.24% of the statements contained in the said sections depicted authentic participation by the public.

These results seem to confirm the findings earlier made when frequency counts focussed only on words that seemed pervasive in the LED strategy document. The researcher earlier noted that despite all the talk about inclusiveness in planning and decision –making in municipal governance, the municipality still saw itself as having a very central role to play in matters relating to economic development. This was evidenced by the significance and centrality placed on the municipality. The frequency in the occurrence of this word in the LED text confirms the conspicuous nature of the municipality in the LED document. All the other three words that have a bearing on involvement of stakeholders (e.g. participation, integration and stakeholders) did not score well. To illustrate this point the researcher added up the frequency counts of the three words and found that their total was still forty-two times less the count of the occurrence of the word municipality. Therefore, it can be concluded that the ELM is struggling to evince, in its communicative matter, the kind of actions and interactions deemed necessary to imbue the public with a common sense of purpose.

Likewise, the word municipality occurred in statements about what the municipality did, and /or will do for the people of Lady Frere and ELM in general. Seldom is reference made to other stakeholders and the roles they played in the process of formulating this LED strategy. This may not be conscious on the part of the policy
formulators but be due to incapacity on those charged with implementing policies. Policies as transformative as the South African policies require agility to deal with situations as they emerge and the best way to achieve this is involving other stakeholders and gain multi-disciplinary perspectives on the issues confronted in that locality. This way each participant contributes to collective wisdom while also drawing from it. This legitimises the programmes and projects aimed at developing the locality since they are perceived as designed and owned by the local citizenry. (See Garcia-Zamor, 1995)

The researcher also applied a qualitative analysis of the LED document. Schwandt noted qualitative can also imply the actual quality of something – its essence. It was in this sense that the researcher initially approached analysis of the LED document. Qualitative data analysis went beyond frequency counting to examine patterns in the data for analysis. This began by examine the LED document as a whole and noting certain aspects about it. The researcher noted that the document was a bulky material that would not likely appeal to an average reader let alone that it notes the low literacy levels of the Lady Frere community and the ELM broadly. The researcher observed that the LED strategy was a convoluted piece of writing, not organized to help the illiterate locals understand what is planned for their future. LED presupposes active involvement by the locals in the attempt to change their locality for the better. The document in question failed to portray that sense of collective involvement. As a strategy document, it would have been admirable for it to be straight forward in telling the reader about the status quo that must be changed; the alternative arrangement envisioned by the stakeholders (vision), the methods that will be used to change the situation to achieve the vision; the people and the roles they will play in pursuing the vision. A straight forward document like that would enable an average person to learn about opportunities arising from the decisions they took part in making and exploit those opportunities. In its current form, the LED strategy document lacks that appeal - there is no logical structure to it.

Secondly, the document is written in a prescriptive than a descriptive and/or narrative style. The document contains about ninety-seven statements that suggest the need for public participation. Notably, these are suggestive statements not statements about how it occurred. These are all-embracing statements that do not exactly tell much
about representativeness, interactiveness, use of neither public input nor quality of those inputs by the public. They merely suggest what ought to be done in pursuit of the vision. Information about participation of the Lady Frere public cannot be conclusively established.

Thirdly, the document was short on detail regarding the exact public involvement initiatives used to gather the information needed to decide the economic future of the ELM, Lady Frere included. Consultation stands out as the only public involvement program used and nothing much is said about it. Wittingly or unwittingly, this initiative was used to raise “awareness about LED and to galvanize support”. Used this way, it became a passive participation tool than the active tool it was supposed to be. Neither did it provide enough detail about the outcomes of the research purportedly conducted in the Lady Frere and other areas of the ELM.

Fourthly, it is unclear whether this is a strategy document or a feasibility study report. Its structure and style of writing suggest inclinations to the latter. As intimated earlier, a simple style that would enhance the readability of this very important document would have been more appropriate and involving. After all LED is about inclusion, involvement, participation and collective engagement by all stakeholders.

Finally, the voice of the service provider that facilitated the programme is louder than the one of participants. The views articulated in certain parts of the document barely represent the sophistication to be expected from the population of ELM, Lady Frere included, that is famished and illiterate. Lack of data about Participatory Rural Appraisal (PRA) instruments used during the process remains question begging. Some of the observations made by the researcher come under discourse analysis below.

4.3 Results from applying discourse analysis to the LED document

It was suggested earlier that a discourse might be seen as a socially recognizable identity that informs its subjects and their worlds. This identity is carved by combining and integrating language, beliefs, actions, interactions, symbols and methods to reflect the dominant or guiding thinking. In this way, a discourse may also
be regarded as a way of inducing behaviour. Once the socially recognizable identity is forged, everyone is expected to be in step with current way of doing things. (Gee, Foucault, Wodak & Meyer)

Our analysis began with examining the text to find out messages that sought to rally the people of ELM, Lady Frere in particular, behind a shared identity. It appears that discoursing has not taken root in Lady Frere. The current discourse in South African system of governance is inclusivity. This can be gleaned from various government policy documents including the Provincial Growth and Development Plan, the Integrated Development Plan and the Local Economic Development strategy. All these policy instruments advocate an inclusive and participatory approach to dealing with challenges. Relevant stakeholders are identified and engaged with the plan of action being the result of their deliberations. This disposition was not evident in the content of the ELM LED strategy document. Inclusive participation was only being limited to consultations and interviews.

In examining the language used in drafting the policy document, the researcher found that it portrayed the municipality as having constructed the strategy for the people of ELM rather than with them. In the Mayor’s foreword, “on behalf of the council and the municipality I am honoured to present the LED ....” From there on, the whole text is festooned with the municipality did this; the municipality will do that for the people of ELM. In this way, the underlying message is that the municipality is doing things for the people instead of doing things with the people (which would be an inclusive approach)

Relations of dependence are perpetuated when the citizenry is not encouraged to take active participation in programs aimed at changing their lives. When delays occur and expectations are not met, resentment and opposition to government projects grow. Discourses are to be understood in the context of the institutions in which they occur. The dominant discourse in South Africa is the one of inclusivity. It is aimed at undoing the effects of the exclusionary apartheid orientation and assist individuals and communities to find strength in each other to tackle problems confronting them commonly. In South Africa, this discourse of inclusive participation in local
government and municipalities is expressed in legislation and a myriad of policies as illustrated in the chapter on literature review. There seems to be a disjuncture between actions of the municipal agents and this all-important government discourse in South Africa.

Clear methods of implementing this inclusive participation in decision-making are insufficiently played out in the LED strategy document. There is no clear way of ensuring that representativeness, interactiveness, use of stakeholder input and quality of stakeholder input are all dimensions of authentic participation that are featured in the LED document. The dominant disposition is the one of the municipality doing everything while stating that this should not be the case.

In conclusion, conducting discourse analysis at these three levels (i.e. as a socially recognizable identity, institutional context and the methods used to implement it) helped to understand the limitations of the LED strategy. We noted that the document did not evince any socially recognizable identity that would induce certain behaviour on those who encounter it. Without this socially recognizable identity, there is no vision to be collectively implemented by the local citizens. Expediency may dictate that there be something to show at a particular stage in time but that should not imply avoiding the crucial issues to deal with.

4.4 Analysing the Qualitative interviews

The question about how the institutions represented by the respondents contributed to the local economy demonstrated that they had a clear sense of the roles they had to play in sustaining the economy of the area. All respondents explained the roles of their institutions in developing the local economy with great ease but for one institution. The nature of the work done in that public institution made it hard for the respondent to say exactly how they contributed to the local economy. Therefore, almost 99% of the respondents articulated the roles of their institutions fairly well. The implication here is that there is much to be drawn from the various stakeholders as they have the intricate knowledge of their areas of operation.
Concerning their thoughts about local economic development. All respondents thought developing the local economy was important for the survival of the local citizens. They expressed frustration at what they perceived as their deliberate exclusion from participating in decision making about the local economy by the municipality. One respondent commented, “We only hear about these things on TV...” One even commented that they are excluded from decisions because most of the managers and officials of the municipality were not locals, they came from elsewhere. This had a bearing on the point about the minimal skills base the area had.

The researcher noted that apart from the respondents representing the council and the municipality, not a single respondent remembered partaking in the LED strategy formulation process. Almost 98% of the respondents complained about the tendency of the municipality to exclude them in programmes that affect them. These respondents all claimed to know nothing about LED or vision to improve the local economy. Probing questions to test the veracity of these claims yielded no different answers, they were sure that they were never invited to any meeting to talk about the economy of Lady Frere. In view of the claims of non-participation and the apparent lack of knowledge these stakeholders had about the ELM LED strategy, it seemed pointless to enquire about the their individual contributions as institutions to the ultimate production of the LED strategy. Neither would the question about factors that attracted their individual businesses to participate be relevant in the circumstances. Again, it was pointless to ask them about the procedures followed during the process because they were not participants.

Responding to questions concerning their thoughts about public involvement in municipal programs, 45% of the respondents thought that public participation was a good idea to ensure awareness and accountability. 35% of the respondents thought that public involvement occurred when the municipality hosts a big event like the recent visit by the National Council of Provinces to the town and municipality in 2009. Apart from being co-opted for big events, they felt that there was no platform for continuous dialogue and information exchange. All respondents from the private formal business sector complained of inaccessibility of the municipality and the councillors when they need to raise critical issues. One even complained about lack of communication even when changes in schedules for refuse collection were made.
All respondents from public sector institutions thought inclusion of their programs into the IDP was mere window dressing. They complained about what they saw as cooption to advance programmes of the municipality when they had their own to achieve.

All retailers employed local people as an indication of their readiness to contribute to economic development of the area. They claimed that they employed local youths and trained them on different aspects of their businesses and that increased the depth of the local skills base.

Civil society structures also claimed not to know anything about processes building to the formulation of the LED strategy. They felt there was not enough space to influence the municipality.

One respondent complained of lack of professionalism within the municipal employees even when they eventually are invited to a meeting by the municipality. They pointed to frequent confusions about venues and equipment necessary to carry out the meetings. More to the point, all the stakeholders except those in municipality claimed not to have participated in the LED strategy formulation process. They claimed not to know anything about LED despite claims by the authority’s representative that the process was preceded by consultations by sector. The representatives of the local authority conceded that they let the service provider run the process as he deemed fit.

4.5 Conclusion

This chapter provided the results from application of various methods of data collection and analysis used to investigate authentic participation in the study.

It started by giving the results from applying content analysis and discourse analysis methods on the LED strategy(2010-2015). It then provided account for the qualitative interviews conducted with purposively selected respondents, noting their claims of not knowing anything about the LED strategy formulation process. The researcher notes that claims of non-participation in the process rendered some of the questions for the interview irrelevant. There seemed to be little or no point in trying to find if the procedures employed during the strategy formulation process allowed stakeholders spaces to influence the ultimate decision when they did not participate.
Responses to the question about changes respondents would like to see indicated that no respondents were happy about the current format of the LED policy. Causes of their discomfiture differed. When the respondents from the municipality and the council complained about readability of the LED document, other respondents complained about being excluded from participating in the process. It then became apparent that designing the LED strategy was more a case of ensuring that the municipality complied with legislative requirements than a genuine engagement of the local public in pursuit of a common vision for the development of their locality. Chapter 5 provides conclusion of the study.
Chapter Five: Conclusion

5.1 Introduction
The previous chapter dealt with empirical findings of the current study. These were based on the following key elements of the study:

- Problem Statement
- Research questions, and
- Aims of the research

5.1.1 Problem Statement

The idea of Authentic Public Participation resonates well with the one of Local Economic Development. They both envisage stakeholders in a community coming together to collectively determine the opportunities that can be explored to ensure that their community/economy creates employment opportunities, thereby reducing poverty of its citizens. This interactive process was noted as one that required broad commitment from all sectors of the local economy to succeed. The effort to reduce unemployment and poverty should be a collective endeavour, it cannot be individual. The researcher observed that many LED forum meetings were marked by absence of other important stakeholders like the private business sector and the civil society. Only some government departments bothered to attend these important platforms of economic debate. This fragmented approach to planning and implementation of programmes undermines the idea of participatory decision-making by all stakeholders, which defines the LED and is mandated by legislation that guides developmental local governance in South Africa.

5.1.2 Research Questions

The two central questions for the current study were the following:

- How was the notion of authentic public participation factored into the formulation of the LED strategy (2010-2015) in the Emalahleni Local Municipality?
What are the indicators to show that authentic public participation occurred during the LED strategy (2010-2015) formulation process?

To augment the research questions, an interview schedule comprising of two sets of ten (10) structured questions was designed to capture responses from purposively selected respondents from the local economy.

5.1.3 Aims of the research

- The main aim of this study was to find out if the process of formulating the LED strategy in ELM, Lady Frere, embraced the notion of authentic public participation. Authentic public participation was generally defined as active and meaningful participation of various sectors of the community in municipal planning and decision-making, wherein the voice of the public influences decisions taken by councillors and municipal officials.
- Furthermore, an analysis of the practical engagements with the various sectors of the ELM was carried out, culminating in the writing of a research report on empirical findings thereof.
- The study also aimed at suggesting recommendations geared towards ensuring authentic and effective participation by all relevant stakeholders in LED strategy processes.

In the next section, summary of the research findings are briefly discussed.

5.2 Summary of research findings

Research findings discussed in the previous chapter are summarised as follows:

- The official communicative matter (LED strategy document) stressed the centrality of the municipality as an agent of change and economic development.
- Messages about stakeholder participation prior and during the LED strategy formulation process are less expressed in this official policy document.
- Messages about participation were also not uppermost in the LED strategy document.
• Integration received more favourable attention and expression on the LED policy document.
• That the words municipality and integration appeared more frequently on the LED text could indicate a conception that emphasizes the centrality of the municipality as an institution and its predisposition to integration than encouraging broad stakeholder participation.
• The LED document fell short of evincing the kinds of actions and interactions necessary to imbue the public with a common sense of purpose.
• The dimensions of authentic participation (use of public inputs and quality of public inputs) and their attendant attributes did not find any form of expression in the coded sections of the document.
• The readability of the LED document in its current form was questionable in the context of illiteracy levels the same document reflects.
• There seemed to be no commonly shared socially recognizable identity portrayed in the LED document.
• There seemed to be a disjuncture between the municipal actions the dominant government discourse of inclusivity.
• Some internal discourses may be more expedient and compelling than the one of inclusivity.
• Most respondents were clear about the contributions made by their individual institutions to the local economy. 99% clearly articulated the point.
• All respondents thought developing the local economy was important for the survival of all. 98% expressed frustration at what they perceived as deliberate exclusion from participating in decisions about the economy by the municipality.
• About 98% of the respondents did not remember participating in the LED formulation processes.
• A substantial number of respondents thought public involvement initiatives ensured public awareness and accountability and were therefore good.
• Platforms for continuous dialogue and information exchange were minimal and constrained.
• Most respondents from the public institutions saw the inclusion of their fraternal programs as a mere formality and no more than window dressing.
• All respondents thought the LED strategy document should be brief, clear and understandable to the average citizen of the locality.

Largely, the answer that seems to come through to the main research question of the current study is that authentic public participation was not adequately factored into the process of LED strategy formulation. This was evidenced by the minimal discovery of such indicators as those associated with the four stated dimensions of authentic public participation. Beyond that, the responses of the interviewed respondents largely indicate exclusion than inclusion in the LED strategy formulation process. Recommendations in line with the stated aims of the current research will follow in the next section.

5.3 Recommendations

According to the findings of this study, critical challenges exist with regard to coordinating public participation initiatives that can be said to be authentic in the ELM. These challenges will continue to pose a threat to local economic development and other related efforts if they remain unchecked.

The following recommendations based on the findings of the study aim at assisting ELM to nurture the potential of its employees, councillors and civil society structures. If these recommendations are implemented the ELM community could make substantial strides towards making inclusive participation in municipal planning and decision making a reality. This will not only ensure accountability and transparency but also a sense of a common socially recognizable identity in the ELM at large. Being mobilized behind a common vision is a necessary condition for any collective engagement.

• Training of municipal employees and councillors on legislative compliance and participatory methods of planning and decision-making.
• Use of public involvement initiatives that encourage continuous dialogue and information exchanges.
 Ensuring the broadest possible representation of views in all matters relating to economic development and employment creation.

- Simplification of the LED strategy document for easy consumption by all citizens of the municipality.
- Mobilization of the ELM community behind a commonly established vision.

For the ELM to ensure authentic participation in LED programmes, it is important to ensure that all relevant stakeholders are on board. The formal business sector, for instance, is a critical player in economic growth and cannot be left out when planning and deciding on the economic directions of the locality. The same is true for the civil society organs – they cannot be left out of the show. These sectors form the immediate environment of the municipality as an institution, defined by a specific purpose for their existence. They are the lifelines of the municipality in that they provide what the institution needs to carry out successfully the mission of its existence. They provide labour, capital and raw materials to the municipality so that it can succeed in executing on its mandate. Therefore, this network of exchange relationships needs to be carefully managed and nurtured to ensure the success of public involvement initiatives including LED efforts. Use of public inputs and their quality as shown in the policies that result from these engagements is also critical. To achieve a buy in on its programs and curb existence of public protests, the municipality should ensure broad participation by the public and should take the inputs of the public seriously and ensure that they reflect in the final projects that result. In this way, the initiatives employed can be active and responsive to the issues raised by the various sectors of the economy.

5.4 Conclusion

It is suggested that if the ELM can heed the above recommendations, public involvement will be a lot more than tokenism. It will be a meaningful exercise that enriches the municipal policies and programmes with diverse views and capabilities that can see the locality sustainably utilizing its current resources effectively and efficiently for the benefit of all its citizens. The notion of a developmental local government would find expression.
Bibliography

Appendix 1

2188 Rosewood Avenue
Zone D
Ezibeleni
5326
24-06-2011

The Municipal Manager
Emalahleni Local Municipality
Lady Frere
5410

Sir

Re: Requesting permission to conduct a research study with your municipality.

My name is Mtutuzeli Mente and I work for SASSA in the local office as Acting Area Manager. Presently, I am completing my studies towards an M.A. (Development Studies) degree. A research study must be conducted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the degree. I therefore request permission to conduct a research study with the IPED division of your municipality. My study will focus on the public participation during the LED strategy formulation process. I trust that you will find a research study in this area a worthy exercise.

I thank you in anticipation

Yours truly

....................
M.Mente
24-06-2011
Appendix 2

The ……………………..
Emalahleni Local Municipality
Lady Frere
5410

Sir / Madam

Re: Request for you to participate in my research study

My name is Mtutuzeli Mente and I work for SASSA in the local office as Acting Area Manager. Presently, I am conducting a research study that forms part of the overall Masters studies I am working towards completing this year. I am currently exploring authentic public participation in the formulation of the Local Economic Development (LED) strategy 2010 -15. I intend to establish the extent to which various stakeholders contributed during the formulation process of this strategy. Likewise, I would like to examine their level of participation in implementing the said LED strategy.

I request that you avail yourself for an interview that will help me make sense of the processes followed to arrive at the vision as espoused in this strategic document. Participation is purely based on your willingness to share your insights with the researcher. In addition, please remember that you are free to withdraw from the study when and if you should feel so. The results from this study can play a useful role in refining the approaches employed by the municipality and indeed government
officials broadly, in the executing of their tasks in accordance with the developmental ideology.

I would greatly appreciate any date you may set me next week (ie.29-08-2011 to 02-09-2011) from your busy schedule. Please sign on the space provided to indicate your agreement to participate

I thank you in anticipation.

Yours truly,

……………………………..
M.Mente

I………………………agree to participate freely in your research study.
Signed ………………..Date………………….
Appendix 3.

Interview Questions for councillors and /municipal officials

The researcher thanked the participant(s) for agreeing to share his/her experiences and opinions on the subject of interest to the researcher. The purpose of the research and the process to be followed will be explained. Issues of confidentiality and privacy were discussed and explained to them. Moreover, an agreement to use a voice recorder during these interview sessions was secured. The questions fielded to these respondents included the following:

1. You have been part of the previous administration; you are uniquely positioned to share with me some useful insights into the LED strategy formulation process. Please tell me, how did you manage attract all relevant stakeholders to the process?
2. What kind of activities did you engage these stakeholders in, during the process?
3. How did you ensure that people who missed out on participating from the start of the process, were brought on board?
4. Please describe the public involvement initiative taken by your Institution during the strategy formulation process.
5. To what extent would you say the mechanisms used constrained or promoted dialogue and information exchange between municipal staff and the relevant stakeholders?
6. How much influence would you say stakeholders had over adjustment to the programs and how they were run?
7. In what ways do you think the LED strategy (2010-2015) was influenced by the Lady Frere public?
8. What are your views regarding effectiveness of inputs by the public during the process?
9. Can you recall the public service institutions that took part in the LED strategy formulation process?
10. What would you point to in the current LED strategy and say it clearly reflects inputs made by a specific stakeholder during the strategy formulation process?
11. Do you think the Lady Frere stakeholders feel that their interests and needs are adequately represented in the current LED strategy?

12. If anything, what would you like to see changed about the current LED strategy?
Appendix 4  Research Questions for all other respondents

The researcher thanked the participant(s) for agreeing to share his/her experiences and opinions on the subject of interest to the researcher. The purpose of the research and the process to be followed was explained. Issues of confidentiality and privacy were discussed and explained to them. Moreover, an agreement to use a voice recorder during these interview sessions was secured. The questions fielded to these respondents included the following:

1. Please tell me, how does your institution contribute to economic development of Lady Frere?
2. What are your thoughts about the idea of Local Economic Development (LED)?
3. What role did you play (individually/institution) during the process of formulating the LED strategy (2010-2015) in Lady Frere?
4. What attracted your business or institution to participate in the process?
5. In what ways would you say the procedures followed allowed for a free dialogue and information exchange?
6. Are there any specific suggestions you made as an institution on how the program could be improved to deliver on its objectives?
7. How did the activities during the process allow you to articulate the concerns and interests of your organization?
8. To what extent would you say your business/ institution influenced the contents of the LED strategy (2010-2015) document?
9. What can you point to as indicating the influence you/your institution had over the strategy formulation process?
10. What would you like to see changed about the current LED strategy?( If anything)
### Table 1. Active Public Participation Tools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participation Tool</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Strengths</th>
<th>Weaknesses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public Hearings</td>
<td>Formal meetings with scheduled presentations offered.</td>
<td>• Provides public opportunity to speak without rebuttal.</td>
<td>• Does not foster dialogue.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Meets legal requirements.</td>
<td>• Breeds the us vs. them syndrome.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Comments are recorded.</td>
<td>• Many citizens dislike public speaking.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Workshops/Large Group Meetings</td>
<td>Informal large group meetings that may include presentations and exhibitions. They typically include interactive discussions.</td>
<td>• Maximizes input from participants.</td>
<td>• May be dominated by hostile or overly supportive stakeholders.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Excellent for discussions relating to analyses of alternatives.</td>
<td>• Can require several small group facilitators.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Fosters public ownership in solving problems.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Builds credibility.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Briefings/Panel Presentations</td>
<td>Make presentations at regular meetings of social and civic clubs and</td>
<td>• Able to control information &amp; process.</td>
<td>• Project stakeholders may not be in audience.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Opportunity to</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Method</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Pros</td>
<td>Cons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Organizations to provide project information. | reach a variety of individuals who do not normally participate.  
- Can build community goodwill. | - Topic may be too technical for general audiences. |  |
| Field Offices/Information Centres | Offices established with prescribed hours to distribute information and meet interested stakeholders. | - Information is easily accessible to public.  
- Provides opportunity for more responsive interaction with the public. | - Relatively expensive, especially for project specific use.  
- Access limited to those in vicinity of centre unless transportation is available. |  |
| Small Group Meetings | Small meetings at existing groups or in conjunction with another event. | - Provides opportunity for in-depth information exchange in non-threatening forum. | - May be too narrow in reach and can leave out important groups. |
# Table 2. Passive Participation Tools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participation tool</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Strengths</th>
<th>Weaknesses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Press release      | Informational written releases to media | • Informs the media of project details.  
• Press release language is often used verbatim in media coverage. | • Generally low media response rates.  
• Frequent poor placement of press releases in newspapers. |
| News conferences   | Schedule event for live dissemination of information to media. | • Opportunity to reach all media in setting | • Limited to newsworthy events as determined by the media. |
| Web sites          | World wide web sites which contain project information. | • Capable of reaching very large audiences with enormous amounts of information  
• Can be very low cost way of distributing larger documents. | • Many people still cannot access the web.  
• Information overload and poor design can prevent people from finding what they need. |
| Printed Public Information Materials | Fact sheets, Newsletters, Brochures | • Can reach large audiences  
• Encourage | • Only as good as mailing lists/distributio |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue Papers</th>
<th>written responses if comment form enclosed.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Facilities documentation of public involvement process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertisements</td>
<td>Paid advertisements in newspapers, magazines, radio &amp; television</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Potentially reaches broad public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• May satisfy legal notification requirements.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Limited capability to communicate complicate concepts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• No guarantee materials will be read.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Expensive especially in urban areas.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Allows for relatively limited amounts of information.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Appendix 6

### Table 3: Arnstein’s Ladder of Citizen Input

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Citizen Participation</th>
<th>Mechanisms</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Degrees of Citizen Power</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Citizen control</td>
<td>Partnership/Community Boards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Delegated power</td>
<td>Management Boards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Partnership</td>
<td>Advisory committees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Degrees of Tokenism</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Placation</td>
<td>Public Hearings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Public workshops</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Small/Large Group Meetings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Consultation</td>
<td>Briefings to Social/Civic Groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Panel Presentations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Informing</td>
<td>Information Centres</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Field Offices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non participation</td>
<td>2. Therapy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Manipulation</td>
<td>Websites</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>News letters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fact Sheets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Brochures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Issue Papers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Technical reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>News conferences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Press releases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bill Stuffers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Advertisements: Newspapers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Magazines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Radio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Television</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>