AN ASSESSMENT OF RURAL WOMEN’S CO-OPERATIVES IN THE TSOJANA VILLAGE AS REGARDS MEETING THE OBJECTIVES OF SUSTAINABLE LIVELIHOOD AND SOCIO-ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

JT NTSALUBA

2012
AN ASSESSMENT OF RURAL WOMEN'S CO-OPERATIVES IN THE TSOJANA VILLAGE AS REGARDS MEETING THE OBJECTIVES OF SUSTAINABLE LIVELIHOOD AND SOCIO-ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

BY

JOYCE THEMBELA NTSALUBA

SUBMITTED IN FULFILMENT FOR THE DEGREE OF MASTERS IN DEVELOPMENT STUDIES TO BE AWARDED AT NELSON MANDELA METROPOLITAN UNIVERSITY

DECEMBER 2012

PROMOTER/SUPERVISOR: MRS AISLING DE KLERK
Declaration

I, Joyce Thembela Ntsaluba, student number 211283355 hereby declare that, the treatise/dissertation/thesis for Masters to be awarded is my own work and that it has not previously been submitted for assessment or completion of any postgraduate qualification to another University or for another qualification.

Joyce Thembela Ntsaluba
DEDICATION

This study is dedicated to all rural women who strive to sustain their livelihoods using available rural development initiatives like Projects and Co-operatives.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I would like to thank God for instilling hope in me, that, I can achieve anything I set my mind into. He guided me and gave me wisdom to complete my study. I now know that, God’s blessings delayed are not God’s blessing’s denied.

Acknowledgement goes to all those who have contributed directly and indirectly to this study from the beginning to its completion, through their consistent sharing of experiences, discussions, support, motivation and encouragement.

I would like to express my gratitude and deep appreciation to my supervisor for her academic guidance, encouragement and constructive criticism throughout the whole period. Your patience, understanding and prompt response whenever I needed your advice are much appreciated. I would like to thank the Development Studies Department for their motivation, constructive advices and for organizing well-educated and knowledgeable lecturers for us. I wouldn’t have managed to complete my thesis without the knowledge and skills they inculcated in me. Special thanks go to Dr Janet Cherry, Amanda, Sis’ Thembeka and the entire Development Studies Department staff.

I wish to convey my special gratitude and appreciation to the Tsojana community for opening their homes, hearts and minds, so that I could conduct my research study up to the end with their full support, more especially the three co-operatives, i.e. Vukani Baking and Catering Co-operative, Qwili Masizame Poultry Co-operative and Qwili Ilitha Sewing and Vegetable Gardening Co-operative.

Special thanks go to the following people and Departments: Intsika Yethu Local Economic Department, Intsika Yethu Co-operative Department, Chris Hani Land Affairs and Rural Development, and Lukhanji Agricultural Department; as well as Gcogco, Mr Ndaba, Mr Luzipho, Mr Maseti and Mr Kobese.

My research study wouldn’t have been completed without my family: My husband (Tat’aKwanda) for supporting me throughout my study years; you sacrificed so much for me, for that thank you, Nkomo. My father-in-law, thank you, Nkomo, for your constant support, informative inputs and blessings. My mother-in-law, thank you, Jwara, for always encouraging me, supporting me and giving me strength to persevere. My kids, Thulisa, Kwanda, Luto, Thina and Mihle, thank you, boNkomoshe for being patient and understanding, for motivating me, and for those computer skills.
Last but not least, to my colleagues and study partners Phumeza and Khitha for sharing knowledge, experiences and our highs and lows, you kept on encouraging and motivating me up to this stage, thank you girls.
## ACRONYMS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A/A</td>
<td>Administrative Area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANC</td>
<td>African National Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASGISA</td>
<td>Accelerated Shared Growth Initiative of South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO-OPS</td>
<td>Co-operatives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECSECC</td>
<td>Eastern Cape Socio-Economic Consultative Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEAR</td>
<td>Growth, Employment and Redistribution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDP</td>
<td>Integrated Development Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILC</td>
<td>International Labour Conference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISRD</td>
<td>Integrated Sustainable Rural Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDGs</td>
<td>Millennium Development Goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PGDP</td>
<td>Provincial Growth and Development Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RD</td>
<td>Rural Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REG. NO.</td>
<td>Registration Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA</td>
<td>South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
GLOSSARY OF MEANINGS

Consensus pertaining to meanings of words arises from different uses of words. The meanings of the key words which are used in this study are as follows:

- **Deprivation**: Lacking what is needed for well-beings, as in physical, social, economic, political, psychological and spiritual well-being. People are unable to reach a certain level of functioning or capability, thus this includes physical weakness, isolation, poverty, vulnerability and powerlessness.

- **Development**: Change for the better.

- **Employment**: Remunerated permanent job, or earning a salary or wage.

- **Ill-being**: Experience of poor/bad quality of life.

- **Integrated Sustainable Rural Development Strategy**: The achievement, promotion and development of holistic, connected approaches to building the capacity of rural poor communities to drive their own social and economic development, leveraging linkages with their local and national environments and thus creating systematic change towards becoming a vibrant rural economy with viable social structures and sustainable social service delivery.

- **Isolation**: Being peripheral and cut-off from all necessary, important and basic amenities, e.g. geographically living in a remote rural area with no communication, proper infrastructure, lack of access to social services, market, health facilities; lack of social and economic support etc.

- **Livelihood**: Means of gaining a living utilising the available capabilities, assets, or resources, both tangible and intangible, like capital resources, social resources, natural resources, financial resources and human resources, and activities, which make up a living.

- **Participation**: An organized, active and collective effort and process by the concerned people to pool their efforts and other resources to attain set objectives. The participants take initiative and action that is stimulated by their own thinking and deliberation, and over which they can exert effective control.

- **Poverty**: Lack of physical necessities and basic needs, capabilities, assets, social inclusion and income.
• **Rural Development:** - A multi-dimensional strategy designed to improve the socio-economic life of the rural poor people.

• **Sustainable:** - Happening continuously over a long-term period.

• **Sustainable Livelihood:** - A living which is adequate for the satisfaction of basic needs and a living which is secure against anticipated shocks and stresses. It is a living which allows a livelihood to cope with and recover from day-to-day stresses and shocks, and to maintain and enhance its capabilities and assets now and in the future without depleting the natural base.

• **Vulnerability:** - The insecurity of the well-being of people due to environmental changes like ecological, economic, social and political factors that threaten their welfare, which this bring about increasing risk-taking, uncertainty and self-undermining, or declining self-respect.

• **Well-being:** - Experience of high/good quality of life.

**REFERENCES OF THE MEANINGS**


ABSTRACT

This thesis is based on an in-depth assessment of the three rural women co-operatives in the Tsojana village, within the Intsika Yethu Local Municipality, which is the largest and most rural municipality within the Chris Hani District Municipality. 95% of households in this municipality live in rural areas or villages (Integrated Development Plan (IDP), 2010-2011). Rural areas are characterised by high levels of poverty, deprivation, poor infrastructure, and poor linkages to markets. Rural women are the ones experiencing poverty at first hand due to the fact that they are less mobile; when food crisis hits, men tend to leave to look for work or income in towns/cities, while women stay behind to look after their families (Moyo-Mhlanga, 2001). In 1975, the World Bank addressed the question of how women can become effective in economic development, hence the establishment of Women in Development Projects to encourage them to be more involved in income-generating activities like rural projects, co-operatives (co-ops) and self-help groups.

A co-operative is an autonomous association of people who join voluntarily to meet their socio-economic and cultural needs through a jointly-owned and democratically-controlled enterprise (International Labour Organization (ILO), 2002). The United Nations (UN) recognized the contribution cooperatives can make to achieve the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) through productive employment, eradicating poverty, enhancing social integration and promoting the advancement of women.

This research study was motivated by the fact that- there are various women development projects/co-operatives in Tsojana Administrative Area (A/A) which aim to improve the lives of the rural people for the better, but most of these co-ops are not sustainable and financially viable. Rural women have realized that in order to sustain development they have to integrate themselves into village development structures, as in various co-operatives, informal rural entrepreneurs and agricultural and non-farm income-generating activities.

The study proposes to investigate the reasons for the failure of these co-ops to create sustainable rural livelihoods. The study further attempts to explore development strategies that will assist to transform and advance the co-ops towards sustainable development for all. It also aims to explore strategies that will alleviate poverty, create jobs, and address all factors of underdevelopment and deprivation.

The overall methodological approach in this study is qualitative in nature, as it is based on the understanding of the situation from the participant’s point of view, or perspective. It seeks to describe, investigate and explore aspects of development projects, and to also understand the aspects of socio-economic life of rural women. It combines three traditions of
enquiry, i.e. case study, phenomenology, and ethnography. A non-probability type of sampling, in particular purposive sampling, was used for the study because the researcher’s samples are based on her judgement.

Interpretive research paradigm was used to allow the researcher to study meaningful social action, not just the external or observable behaviour of people, and various research tools were used to collect data.

These co-operatives have been identified as struggling for survival, and lacking training, and material and financial resources. The co-operatives require support for expansion and modernizing their operations.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Introduction and Background ...........................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.1 Modernization Theory ....................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.2 Dependence Theory ........................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.3 Community Development and Empowerment ..........................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Rationale and Background to the Study .............................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Research Problem and Hypothesis ........................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 Research Problem/Question .................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 Research Purpose ..............................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6 Research Aims and Objectives .............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7 The Three Co-operatives under Study ..................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.1 Vukani (Wake Up) Baking and Catering Co-operative ..........</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.2 Qwili Ilitha (Light) Sewing and Vegetable Gardening Co-operative ..........</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7.3 Qwili Masizame (Let’s Try) Poultry Co-operative ..........</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8 Overall Research Approach ..................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9 Sampling ..........................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10 Research Paradigm ..........................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.11 Data To Be Collected .......................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.12 Data Collection Tools ......................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.13 Data Analysis and Interpretation .........................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.14 Ways In Which Data Will Be Justified as Evidence ...............</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.15 Ways In Which Evidence Will Be Validated as Knowledge ........</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.16 Ways In Which Knowledge Will Be Communicated ....................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.17 Ethical Considerations .....................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.18 Summary ..........................................................</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TABLE OF CONTENTS
Chapter 2: (Literature Review)

2.1 Introduction ..............................................
2.2 Demographics and the Rural Poor ......................
2.3 Co-operative Values .....................................
   2.3.1 Co-operative Principles ..........................
   2.3.2 First Principle: Voluntary and Open Membership ....
   2.3.3 Second Principle: Democratic Member Control ......
   2.3.4 Third Principle: Member Economic Participation ....
   2.3.5 Fourth Principle: Autonomy and Independence ......
   2.3.6 Fifth Principle: Education, Training and Information
   2.3.8 Seventh Principle: Concern for Community ........
2.4 Similar Studies or Research Conducted to Assess and investigate the Impact of Co-operatives on Sustainable Livelihoods ........................................
2.5 Core Objectives of South African Government ...........
2.6 Establishment of Co-operatives/Self-Help Groups in SA .......
2.7 Rural Entrepreneurs ......................................
   2.7.1 Who Are the Primary Co-operative Stakeholders? ...
2.8 Strategies Developed ....................................
2.9 Challenges Extracted from Literature ....................
2.10 Conclusion ..............................................

Chapter 3: (Research Methodology)

3.1 Introduction ..............................................
3.2 Locality or Geographic Profile ..........................
3.3 Intsika Yethu Municipality with the District Context ....
   3.3.1 Intsika Yethu Population Spatial Distribution ........
   3.3.2 District Municipality Settlement Distribution Pattern .
3.4 Methodological Framework .................................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
3.5 Research Paradigm ................................................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
3.6 Sampling ............................................................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
3.7 Unit of Analysis ................................................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
3.8 Delimitation of the Study Area .............................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
3.9 Research Delimitation .......................................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
3.10 Data Collection Tools and Research Process ...................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
3.11 Motivation for the Selected Data Collection Tools .......... Error! Bookmark not defined.
3.11.1 Interviews ................................................................ Error! Bookmark not defined.
3.11.2 Semi-Structured Interviews ............................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
3.11.3 Focus Groups and Community Forums ....................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
3.11.4 Participant Observation .................................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
3.11.5 Field Notes ................................................................ Error! Bookmark not defined.
3.11.6 Documents ................................................................ Error! Bookmark not defined.
3.11.7 Photographs and Tape Recording .................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
3.11.8 Narratives ................................................................ Error! Bookmark not defined.
3.12 Data Analysis .................................................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
3.13 Challenges or Limitations .................................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
3.14 Conclusion ........................................................................ Error! Bookmark not defined.

Chapter 4: (Findings from the Assessment of Women's Co-operatives in the Tsojana Village)

4.1 Introduction ................................................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
4.2 Research Purpose .............................................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
4.3 Research Aims and Objectives .............................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
4.4 The Background of the Three Co-operatives .................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
4.5 Sampling ............................................................................ Error! Bookmark not defined.
4.6 Criteria for the Selection of Co-operative Members .......... Error! Bookmark not defined.
4.7 The Three Co-operatives ..................................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
4.7.1 Vukani Baking and Catering Co-operative ...................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
4.7.2 Qwili Lilitha Sewing and Vegetable Co-operative

4.7.3 Qwili Masizame Poultry Co-operative

4.8 Gender Distribution of Members

4.9 Data Analysis

4.9.1 Transcript Excerpts 1: Semi-Structured Interviews

4.9.2 Transcript Excerpt 2: The Description of Events and Daily Activities

4.9.3 Transcript Excerpt 3: Semi-Structured Interview with Local Government Authorities

4.9.4 Transcript Excerpt 4: 21- to 30-Year-Olds Focus Groups

4.9.5 Transcript Excerpt 5: Co-operative Members and Villagers

4.10 Interpretation of the Findings from the Three Co-operatives

4.11 Conclusion

Chapter 5: (Conclusion and Recommendations)

5.1 Introduction

5.2 Summary of Findings

5.3 Recommendations

5.3.1 Building of a viable and sustainable rural women co-operatives

5.3.2 Marketing of rural Products

5.3.3 Feasibility study

5.3.4 The 4 P's of marketing strategies by Gminder:

- Production strategies
- Price strategies
- Placement strategies
- Production Strategies

5.3.5 Building a network with other co-operatives and business structures
5.3.6 Government and its levels (Local Municipalities)

ANNEXURE A : INTERVIEW GUIDE ............................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
ANNEXURE B: Informed consent and introduction during the first visit. Error! Bookmark not defined.
ANNEXURE C: Transcript excerpt 1: Semi-structured Interviews......Error! Bookmark not defined.

Annexure D: Transcript Excerpt 2: Semi-structured interviews with Government Authority

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2. 1: Number of registered co-ops in eight African countries from 2005 to 2008.. Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 4. 1: Active Vukani Co-operative members over the years.........Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 4. 2: Financial support from various structures/organizations ......Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 4. 3: Active Qwili Ilitha Sewing and Vegetable co-operative members over the years.
Table 4. 4: Interpretation of the findings from the three co-operatives.....Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 4. 5: Qwili Masizame co-operative’s chronological membership (2006 – 2012)... Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 4. 6: Research and Interview Questions .......................Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 4. 7: Semi-structured Interviews.................................Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 4. 8: Interpretation of the Findings from the three Co-operatives .Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 4. 9 : criteria for required documents .........................Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 4. 10: Service Providers and Their Role in Assisting the Three Co-operatives .... Error! Bookmark not defined.

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3: Intsika Yethu Map with the district context

Figure 4.5: Gender Distribution
Figure 4.6: Age distribution of the three co-operatives

Figure 4.7: Literacy Levels of members

Figure 4.8: Schematic diagram analysis from the Municipal officials

Figure 4.10: Community members and villagers

Figure 4.11: People’s perspectives re co-op impact on people’s lives.

LIST OF IMAGES

1.1: Vukani Baking and Catering Equipment’s

1.2: Qwili Sewing and Vegetable Products

1.3: Qwili Masizame Poultry co-op, Mrs Manala feeding the chicks

1.4: Chickens ready to be sold

4.1: Active youth involved in co-operatives

4.2: Photos during Focus group
CHAPTER 1

1.1 Introduction and Background

Rural development projects are viewed as a way of alleviating poverty, and a strategy for job creation, through women entrepreneurship, once development projects are established (Swanepoel et al., 2006). In order to ensure that poverty is alleviated and entrepreneurship is conducive for job creation, rural women need to be empowered and capacitated, assessed for readiness so that they can embark on rural development projects and co-operatives offered by various government and non-governmental organizations. Women empowerment is imperative, since it will determine the failure, or success, of their co-operatives. This study will indicate the influence of culture or customs on the overall management of the projects. It is imperative to mention these factors as they will determine the sustainability of rural women’s projects.

The study is informed by the following theories:

1.1.1 Modernization Theory

With modernization, the emphasis is on viewing everything, that is, progression, development and growth, with the eyes of the West, or developed countries. These countries are seen as pioneers of development, and developing countries have to assimilate or blind copy what is advanced by the developed countries (Ayyitey, 2005). Developing countrie’s
ways of doing things are viewed as traditional and backwards. Rural communities have been engaged in activities designed to improve the well-being of their members, and they have been taking the initiative and responsibility by partaking in activities such as hunting and gathering (Swanepoel and De Beer, 2000: 125). Large-scale industrial projects were seen as central components in the promotion of economic growth and this was bound up with the inception and elaboration of the macro-developmental discourse, also known as the modernization approach. Within this theory/approach, developing countries adopt innovations that are applicable to developed countries rather than examining them to determine their appropriateness within the context of their development, especially rural development. The modernization approach assumes that all societies progress in a linear fashion from a traditional state to modernity (Swanepoel and De Beer, 2000: 32). We have, however, benefited from the modernization theory, but that does mean that we must discard the indigenous ways of doing things.

1.1.2 Dependence Theory

This theory emphasises that, the lack of sufficient development in developing countries is the result of policies of developed countries (Bilateral and International Agencies). Developing countries have difficulty in moving themselves out of poverty, underdevelopment and/or development traps because of their dependency on more powerful countries that exploit them (Turner, 2006: 375). The reason for this is that the developed countries extract resources from the developing countries without reinvesting capital in ways that would encourage broad-based development, and multinational corporations gain control over significant segments of the economy and political system of poor countries, leaving poor societies dependent upon more powerful countries for capital, technology and employment opportunities. The emphasis here is the fact that developing countries depend on the transfer of a significant amount of aid and the provision of extensive technical assistance by developed countries (Swanepoel and De Beer, 2000: 39-45).

1.1.3 Community Development and Empowerment

Community development seeks to promote human development; in other words, it is aimed at empowering rural communities by strengthening their capacity for self-sustaining development through rural development projects or co-operatives (Swanepoel and De Beer, 2000: 125). The success of community development is when people participate actively in all development activities, so that at the end they are able to fairly evaluate the improvement of their livelihood.
It seeks to meet the felt needs of rural people (Jeppe, 1985: 28-29), hence community members are the only people who can identify and define their needs, not anybody else. Community members have always worked together to promote their welfare, i.e. their socio-economic development, as poverty is more pronounced in rural areas (Chambers, 1983: chapter 1; Todaro, 1997: 295-296). The only strategy that has been overlooked in encouraging community development has been the Integration of activities, since the problems of development are multi-faceted, and they should be tackled together in a co-ordinated fashion. The integration strategy emphasises the fact that social, political and cultural aspects of development should be treated together with economic aspects, because they are all interrelated; and that different role-players in development should co-ordinate their efforts.

In as far as empowerment is concerned, we have to look at the fact that rural people lack the power to influence decisions in their favour; it is difficult for them to speak with a strong voice as they are less organized. Empowerment is an important aspect of rural development as it transfers skills and knowledge required to produce the goods and services which satisfy the people’s needs (Mokgohloa, 1995: 2). Once people are empowered, they can then influence the decisions that affect their lives.

1.2 RATIONALE AND BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY

The new, democratic South Africa (SA) inherited one of the most unequal societies in the world (May, 1998; Modiselle, 2001; Wonderchem, 1997), which is characterised by the following:

- High levels of poverty; rural people are primarily engaged in subsistence agricultural and associated activities
- Unequal health and educational services, and restricted access to economic support services, especially in rural areas, where the majority of the people live
- Weak manufacturing base due to poorly developed infrastructure and linkages to the market
- Rural local governments with little or no tax base and weak human capacity, especially in former homelands
- Communal land tenure that has resulted in villagers not having any legal claim to land, which is now owned by either government or private entities. In common occasions, those in power expropriate the land for personal gain. This is evident
in the three projects under study: they are still waiting for permanent sites for their operation from the local authorities.

- Rural livelihood depends on subsistence agriculture, non-farm incomes and remittances from urban industry and mines (D’Haese, 1995; Wonderchem, 1997; Modiselle, 2000). The democratic government developed a decentralization strategy in which the municipalities are responsible for providing basic services and this was stipulated in the White Paper on Local Government of 1998.

Since 1994, the initial rural development strategy for SA was formulated within the framework of the Reconstruction and Development Program (RDP), followed by a macro-economic framework provided by the Growth, Employment and Redistributive programme (GEAR) adopted in 1996 to redress the past and present socio-economic inequalities. Government departments have contributed towards the Rural Development Strategy through programs in the following areas:

- Economic development,
- Social development,
- Human resource development, and
- Natural resource based programs

The Rural Task Team spearheaded the Rural Development Programme. *Rural Development (RD)* is a strategy designed to improve the socio-economic life of poor rural communities. It is a vehicle that is used to increase rural production and productivity using the available resources. Rural development policy targets the marginalized rural population, facilitates change in them, and builds local capacity to enable them to identify opportunities and to act on them in a sustainable manner (Van Rooyen et al., 2001: 37). RD has been central to the development efforts since the 1960s as a research and policy guide, and got full momentum in the 1970s as development economists realized that, whilst economic growth and industrialization were important, the rural areas and rural development had an important role to play in a country’s development. It has focused on economic growth and put less emphasis on the holistic approach that targets all sectors of one’s livelihood (Harris, 1982), hence it was faced with challenges, or it failed, before.

The ISRD Strategy (ISRDS) was designed to realise a vision that would attain socially cohesive and stable rural communities with viable institutions, sustainable economies that able to attract and retain skilled and knowledgeable people, who are equipped to contribute
to growth and development (Todaro, 1997). This approach is more often concerned with the manner of delivery and empowerment or emancipation of people.

After the election in 1999, the government renewed its commitment to RD towards Integrated Sustainable Rural Development Strategy (ISRDS), with particular emphasis on integration, co-ordination, sustainability and empowerment of women and the youth. ISRDS takes account of the impact of development on the environment and the distribution of benefits to different sections or areas of the rural population, hence it is also regarded as an "area-based" approach to development. In other words, the integrated rural development policy targets rural areas and the marginalized rural population, facilitates change in them, and builds local capacity to enable them to identify opportunities and to act on them in a sustainable manner, as mentioned earlier (Van Rooyen et al. 2001: 37). For rural communities to sustain rural development, they must be major participants in all stages of development programmes (Gillis et al., 1992). The multidimensional nature of the development process and its problems are now clearly recognized, and solutions are to be multi-factorial. There needs to be extensive and meaningful participation of rural people, from all walks of life, women and men, young and old, and, indeed, all stakeholders in the process of rural development (Cohen and Uphoff, 1980). This needs participation to be bottom-up and democratic so as to enhance provision of services, to enhance opportunities for income generation, improved physical structure, social cohesion and active participation in local political processes, and effective provision for the vulnerable (De Lange et al, 2001).

The core objective of the SA government, as set out from 1994 to date, is to meet the Millennium Development Goals and their targets, so many initiatives have been formulated, as mentioned before, to achieve socio-economic objectives like those set out in the following policies and programmes: Provincial Growth and Development Plan (PGDP); Local Economic Development; Spatial Development Plan; Accelerated and Shared Growth Initiative for SA (ASGISA); Creation of Small Enterprises and Jobs in the Second Economy to address the challenges of poverty, underdevelopment and marginalization, comprising those people caught within the lower level; the development of SA Women Entrepreneurs Network; Technology for Women in Business; Techno-girls; National Biodiversity Strategy and Action Plan; Community-Based Natural Resource Management; Co-operatives; Transformation of Agrarian Agriculture to Commercial agriculture; etc. All these initiatives are supported by various government structures and NGOs.
1.3 RESEARCH PROBLEM AND HYPOTHESIS

Rural areas are scattered in remote locations where there are high levels of poverty, with poor health and education services and restricted access to economic support services, especially for the vulnerable and marginalized groups like women, children, the aged and physically challenged people. Rural areas have weak manufacturing base due to poorly developed infrastructure and linkages to markets and their local governments have little or no tax base and weak human capacity, as with the case of the Intsika Yethu local municipality. As mentioned before women are the primary caregivers, so they stay at home looking after everybody, but they are largely expected to supply the basic needs to families like food, decent shelter and clothing. Where are they expected to get these with no capital assets? That is why they form village development structures to ensure that their families are fed, clothed, educated and have access to health care services.

There are various development initiatives established by various organizations to address problems of rural poverty and underdevelopment, like projects, co-operatives, small enterprises, etc., and these are financed by various rural development financial institutions and organizations.

The only challenge is that these rural development initiatives are not sustainable. They collapse now and again before reaching the full potential; that of alleviating poverty, creating jobs, and addressing all factors of underdevelopment and deprivation. The researcher’s interest in this research study originates from the fact that there are various development projects/ co-operatives in her village, that is, Tsojana, which aim to improve the lives of the rural people for the better. Most of these projects are not sustainable and financially viable, and that is why this study was initiated to investigate the reasons for the failure of these projects to create sustainable rural livelihoods. Development strategies will be sought to transform and advance the projects towards sustainable development for all concerned. The research paper seeks to investigate the situation of the three development projects/ co-operatives run by Tsojana rural women, in the Intsika Yethu local municipality of the Chris Hani District; and to explore development strategies that will assist in sustaining these development projects.

1.4 RESEARCH PROBLEM/QUESTION

The central question in this study is “How can the three rural development projects/co-operatives run by women in Tsojana rural village, in Intsika Yethu local municipality, be improved to sustain development?” In order to further explore the main question the following guiding questions will help to focus the research:
• What is their knowledge/perspective about sustainable growth and development?

• Why are the development projects not sustainable, i.e. what are the challenges and problems?

• What is it that needs to be changed? Or how can these women overcome these barriers to growth?

• Who are the stakeholders responsible for the running of these development projects; their roles, responsibilities and accountability?

• What are the barriers that keep them from growing/developing their co-operatives from micro to medium enterprise?

• How do these barriers influence the development/growth of women co-operatives?

• What assistance do they need to capacitate themselves to manage and run sustainable growth-oriented businesses?

• How do these barriers affect the future of these women?

1.5 RESEARCH PURPOSE
The primary purpose of the study is to identify the barriers of growth and development for rural women in the study, and to investigate and understand how those barriers influence their attitude towards their co-operatives and entrepreneurship. To understand their personal empowerment needs of women entrepreneurs in the micro-sector to overcome their barriers to growth and development.

1.6 RESEARCH AIMS AND OBJECTIVES
The aim of this study is to look at the concept of ISRD in relation to three rural development projects/ co-operatives run by Tsojana women.

The research is also aimed at achieving the following objectives:

• To describe people’s perspectives and experiences of development, and the role they play in fulfilling the goals of development.

• To understand the relationship between the people’s culture and development projects in their area, since these are women’s projects.
To assess the role played by all stakeholders, primary and secondary; for example, funders, community at large, women, government structures, NGOs, financial institutions, developers, and various leadership structures. The research aims to investigate if and how these projects can enhance sustainable increases in the incomes of, particularly, the poor households in the Tsojana rural community - to find possible lasting solutions to improve and sustain their socio-economic status through the improvement of their projects, while also promoting marketable, sustainable and profitable production within the resource potential.

To mobilize them for joint action in everything they do so that they can jointly identify their challenges, and actively participate in putting ideas together, at their level, about production, opportunities, and marketing skills.

The study also aims to find possible solutions to improve sustainability of development co-operatives, seeing that these co-operatives are the drivers of rural economic development; they are promoting food security, trade and distribution, and they help rural women to meet their immediate needs while strengthening household livelihoods and laying the foundation for livelihood diversification.

1.7 THE THREE CO-OPERATIVES UNDER STUDY

REG. NO. 2006/000213/24

Vukani (Wake Up) Baking and Catering Co-operative

This co-operative was started in 2003 by 20 women from different villages, with the aim of improving their livelihoods and that of their families, as they were unemployed and struggling to make ends meet. They were supported by a local shop owner who gave them space to
bake. From then they were also supported by local businesspeople, enabling them to buy a gas stove for baking. Due to lack of material resources and financial resources the project collapsed. In 2006, some of the women, who were previously involved in the project revived it and recruited extra members. They marketed their idea to local structures like the local municipality and its sectors, and the community. The project was registered as a co-operative in 2006, and they received, and are still receiving, assistance from different sources like Intsika Yethu municipality, the Department of Agriculture, Small Enterprise Development Agency, and Chris Hani Co-operative Centre for training, workshops, funding and buying materials. However they do encounter numerous challenges, which will be detailed during the research.

1.7.2 Qwill Ilitha (Light) Sewing and Vegetable Gardening Co-operative

REG. NO. 2006/000563/24

This co-operative was established in 2004 as a rural women’s socio-economic development initiative by a retired teacher with a sewing background as she was teaching Needlework at school. She was prompted by the plight of rural women in her area who were literally begging in order to feed their families. They would wait for their husbands to send money from the big cities, and many of these men were retrenched, but they could not come back home as they were waiting for their pension monies; others were looking for alternative casual jobs. She taught them sewing using her one-hand sewing machine. They were enthusiastic about the project, and the number kept on increasing. The group decided to keep busy by doing something else meanwhile waiting for their turn, as there was only one machine. The idea of the growing vegetables came along, and the same lady sacrificed her garden for the project. It was registered, under the new Co-operative Act 14 of 2005, on the 22nd of June 2006. The project has been supported by numerous organizations with funding, training and material. These women, however, still have challenges that are beyond their control.

1.7.3 QWili Masizame (Let’s Try) Poultry Co-operative
This one was started in the late 1980s by an old retired lady who was working as a domestic worker in Cape Town. She bought 20 chickens from a previous women project called ACAT, which strived to restore women’s dignity by introducing them to agriculture, and letting them choose the type of chickens they wanted to raise, that is, for meat, or for eggs. They would buy one–week-old chickens, raise them, and eventually sell them. The women were also involved in vegetable gardens. Due to the lack of material and financial resources, and ill-health of its founder, the project collapsed. The Qwili Masizame poultry co-operative was resuscitated by a member of the Qwili Ilitha sewing and vegetable garden co-operative with the aim of coaching and mentoring the Qwili Masizame members so that they can also better their lives. The project was also registered in 2006 with the Co-operative Act 2005.

The details of the documentation, the running/management of the projects, support and challenges will be discussed in later chapters. No research has been done on the sustainability of these projects. The general goal for the establishment of these cooperatives was to encourage the marginalized, poor rural women to pursue their business interests; through capacity building or empowerment, and through participation in economic development for the betterment of their livelihood.

1.8 OVERALL RESEARCH APPROACH
The broad methodological approach in this study can be described as Qualitative in nature. It is based on the understanding of the situation from the participant’s point of view or perspective. Qualitative research in this study seeks to describe, investigate, explore aspects of development projects and understand the aspects of socio-economic life of rural
women. It combines Case study to get an in-depth understanding of the situation with Phenomenology enquiry to explore what people experience, the meaning they ascribe to the experience, and Ethnographic enquiry to describe and interpret people’s culture as these projects are managed by women. How does culture impacts on their project management? The researcher continuously observes people’s behaviour at their natural setting and listens to various explanations. Qualitative research gives the researcher an opportunity to gather large amount of information and looks at events as they happen. Qualitative research allows researcher to document real events, to observe special activities and behaviours at natural setting, listen to various explanations and descriptions of specific cases AND record what people say in words, gestures and tone.

1.9 SAMPLING

It is important to increase feasibility, comparison, accuracy and manageability of study by taking the portion of a population to be studied as a representative of that population, and that is a sample (Arkava and Lane, 1983: 27). A sample is influenced by homogeneity and heterogeneity of the population under study; in this case the study is influenced by the fact that all the co-operatives are run by unemployed rural women from the same location.

A sample is a subset of measurements drawn from a population in which the researcher is interested. The sample is studied in an effort to understand the population from which it is drawn (De Vos, 1998: 194). The three samples are drawn from the Tsojana rural village, from the sampling framework of rural development co-operatives. A non-probability type of sampling was used, and, in particular, purposive sampling was used for the study because the samples are based on the researcher’s judgement, in that these samples are composed of elements that contain the characteristics that are representatives or typical of the Tsojana rural women who are trying to uplift their livelihood through development projects/co-operatives; their characteristics make them the holders of data needed for the study (Singleton et al., 1988: 153). The samples are based on the researcher’s own understanding of the community of the Tsojana village, where she stays.

The following criteria were used in the selection of the participants of this study:

- Rural women
- Xhosa-speaking
- Unemployed
- Same geographical area (Tsojana village)
1.10 RESEARCH PARADIGM
The researcher used an interpretive paradigm due to the fact that she seeks to understand the details of interaction among the stakeholders, i.e. the community, the project funders, women, local structures and political organizations (it allows the researcher to study meaningful social action, not just the external or observable behaviour of people). Social action is the action to which people attach subjective meaning to their lives. Social action is therefore an activity with a purpose or intent (Neuman, 1997: 67-70). Interpretive paradigm is vital in this study as it will allow the researcher to gather a large amount of detailed, qualitative data to establish the reasons for the failure and unsustainability of the projects. This paradigm will help the researcher to explore alternative strategies that will assist in sustaining the projects, or to establish what needs to be changed or developed in order to sustain rural income generation, entrepreneurship and rural industrialization.

1.11 DATA TO BE COLLECTED
Field research gives an opportunity to gain access to the site, adopt a social role in the setting, and begin to observe the situation. Participatory action research is utilized as it has a participatory element which emphasizes the involvement of beneficiaries throughout the research process (De Vos, 2005: 408-422). This research focuses on rural women who have been marginalized in all development processes; development strategies have been imposed on them. A case study has been conducted for some time to make an in-depth examination of the three projects, the environment and the community. This makes the case study to produce detailed, varied and extensive data or knowledge.

1.12 DATA COLLECTION TOOLS
A variety of data collection tools have been constantly used in the form of single-system and group formats listed as follows:

- Face-to-face interviews using unstructured and semi-structured approaches: This is a first-hand predominant mode of data/information collection in qualitative research as it allows the researcher to understand the world from the participant’s point of view; it unfolds the meaning of people’s experiences of the world around them (Sewel, 2001: 1). This tool extends and formalises the conversation, hence the conversation with a purpose; it allows the researcher and the participants to explore issues. It determines the people’s perceptions, opinions, facts, and their reactions to the current situation and potential solutions (Collins, 1998: 8).
• Focus group and community forums: They help the researcher to obtain an additional perspective and to validate some of the information from the previous sources. They allow self-disclosure among participants, as they are experiencing the same challenges and constraints; so the participants get the platform to listen and learn from others. Certain issues are discovered, explored, interpreted and understood by participants. These forums give an opportunity for alternative development strategies to come from the participants, meaning they plan, implement and own their development co-operatives.

• Field notes: This technique allows the researcher to collect a large amount of raw data on the site without interfering with the activities, and record every event. The notes help the researcher to organise data at the end of the day.

• Participant observations and transact-walks in the study areas: They help the researcher to better understand the diversity of rural women’s activities, and to explore ways of helping out to improve the situation (Huysamen, 1993: 143-144). These allow the researcher to get a first-hand experience of people’s daily living, of which the researcher becomes the insider and outsider at the same time. The researcher captures people’s conceptions of reality as accurate as possible as she is able to watch their activities, and physical settings in which the activities take place (Schurink, 1998).

• Photographs and tape-recording of information give the true evidence of events and activities as they happen.

• Narratives from the villagers, traditional leaders and other community-based structures help to compile the information from various sources, as they have the rich knowledge and experience of the area and its situation.

• Community meetings: These also generate ideas from various people; the researcher gains an impression of the community’s perspective of the problems, and creates awareness of these issues among the community. Brainstorming is also done during these sessions by allowing anything related to the issue to come up for discussion without any criticism (Weyers, 200: 115-116). All the ideas are discussed one-by-one and when this happens, it shows the level of community interest in the sharing and discussion of various viewpoints on the issue.

• Checking of policies and other legislations relevant to rural development programmes and initiatives.
1.13 DATA ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION

Data analysis is the process of bringing order, structure and meaning to the mass of the collected data, i.e. deeper understanding of the collected raw data. It searches the relationship among categories of data, and it builds grounded theory (Marshall and Rossman, 1999: 150). The researcher moves from the description of historical events or social settings to a more general interpretation of the meaning. Cresswell’s spiral data analysis is used (Creswell, 1998: 140-146), as the researcher supports his idea that ‘the researcher moves in analytic circles rather than using a fixed linear approach’. In this approach the researcher has that raw collected data of pictures sketches, video tapes etc., but after she has used this approach, she comes out with a general simple narrative. The data is analysed following these Creswell, and Marshall and Rossman steps:

a. Plan for recording of data in a manner appropriate for the research setting and participants; recording that will not offend the participants.

b. Preliminary analysis of data at the research site after collection of data to build a coherent interpretation of data. In this stage the researcher will be guided by the initial concepts and development of understanding from there; he/she will be able to modify them as data is collected, and analyse the data at the same time (Marshall and Rossman, 999: 151).

c. Managing/organizing data: This happens away from the site. Data is organized in researchers preferred method, i.e. by filling it or using colour codes. It is important for the researcher to re-check if he/she has all the information collected on the site.

d. Researcher has to re-read data over and over again to familiarize him/herself with the information.

e. Generating categories, themes and patterns to make sense of the data collected.

f. Coding of data using several forms like abbreviation of key words, coloured dots, etc. depends on the researcher preference (Marshall and Rossman, 1999: 155 - 157).

g. Testing the understanding of information by trying to understand and explore what is at hand.

h. Searching for alternative explanations for the data, and the linkages among them (Marshall and Rossman, 1999: 157). Data is reprocessed to establish the validity and reliability of the material. Validity and verification can be evaluated using the Lincoln and Guba (1985: 290) model to establish the true value of the study; its applicability,
consistency and neutrality. The model uses the following criteria to determine or test the findings of the study as the accurate reflection of the initial intentions: Credibility to ensure that the subject was accurately identified and described; transferability using triangulation - multiple sources of data to corroborate and elaborate the study in question; dependability and conformability, in which Lincoln and Guba stress the need to ask whether the findings of the study can be confirmed by another.

i. Report writing by the researcher once the researcher is convinced that the collected data is a true reflection of the study, and is responding as objectively as possible to the research question formulated at the beginning of the analysis.

Domain analysis is used as it is an innovative and comprehensive approach to analyse cultural settings. Network analysis helps the researcher to map the connection among the women, organizations, community, events, etc. Triangulation makes the researcher more confident of her data as this approach uses more than one data source or method, i.e. interviews, observations etc. are used. The following methods have been used: visual sharing of information, peer checking, and feedback from the people concerned. Sustainable livelihood framework is also utilized to analyse the state of the three co-operatives, and to identify the factors of constraints. Once the root cause of the problem is identified, it will be easy to plan for intervention.

1.14 WAYS IN WHICH DATA WILL BE JUSTIFIED AS EVIDENCE

It is important for the researcher to re-read all the evidence for details. The researcher will evaluate alternative interpretation of evidence and look for areas where the evidence fails to address an event or topic. The researcher will generalize themes, refine concepts and move toward a general explanation. The researcher will use concepts of credibility which ensures that the enquiry was accurately identified and described, and dependability which attempts to account for changing conditions, and changes in the design of the projects’ plan.

1.15 WAYS IN WHICH EVIDENCE WILL BE VALIDATED AS KNOWLEDGE

Discoveries and findings will be released for public consumption after refining concepts and creating new ones. The report will be a critical stage of the transformation of data into knowledge. The researcher will chronologically organize information, structure and organize the report according to meaningful themes from the data. Critical events will be organized accordingly. Data will be narrowed to, probably, a theory.
1.16 **WAYS IN WHICH KNOWLEDGE WILL BE COMMUNICATED**

The knowledge will be communicated to the community, leaders, and all stakeholders, to improve the implementation of rural development projects, through a report, local rural project publication, oral presentation of the findings, building of a road map using sketches of information and photographs, and compilation of a Digital Video Disc (DVD).

1.17 **ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS**

During research, people are the objects of study and this brings complex ethical problems which need to be recognized and handled carefully (Williams et al., 1995: 30). Too often these ethical issues lapse and cause problems. The followings are some of the few ethical issues that need to be avoided: inaccurate reporting of results or bias shown in favour of the researcher’s hypothesis, entry to the research site without informed consent, etc. The followings have been considered during meetings with the respondents:

- Avoidance of any form of harm to respondents
- Informed consent has been obtained after full explanation of the purpose of the study.
  Babbie (2007: 68) emphasizes the importance of accurately informing participants about the nature of the research.
- Deception of respondents has been continuously avoided throughout the study: The avoidance of deliberately misrepresenting facts to make another person believe what is not true.
- Avoidance of violation of privacy or confidentiality.

1.18 **SUMMARY**

This chapter introduces the aspect of rural development as a strategy to address/alleviate rural poverty through the empowerment of rural women in initiating their own village projects and co-operatives. The research question tries to find out the barriers to rural growth and development; why are these co-operatives, which are meant to improve the rural economy and better rural livelihood, not sustainable? What are the strategies that need to be developed to improve the existing methods? One of the aspects that inform the study is community development and empowerment, which promotes human development; it emphasises the relationship between economic, social and political aspects. Community development emphasises people's participation and empowerment as the key elements for rural development.
1.19  PROVISIONAL LAYOUT OF CHAPTERS

The following is an outline of chapters that are included in the study:

Chapter 1

Introduction and problem formulation are presented. Research problem and central research question accompanied by sub-questions that act as the framework for the study are explained. The rationale and background of the study are discussed. The study will look at the concept of enhancing rural livelihood through co-operatives. The overview and principles of sustainable livelihood framework are explained. The three co-operatives are explained; data collection tools and ethical issues are also explained.

Chapter 2

It looks at the literature review that is relevant to issues in the research question. It is expected to support the findings relating to the study.

Chapter 3

Research design and methodology that will give a detailed description of data collection and analysis.

Chapter 4

It entails the interpretation of data, justification of data as evidence and validation of evidence as knowledge. The analysis of the three co-ops using a framework for analysis and other methods has been done to highlight the specific areas of concern.

Chapter 5

This chapter entails the conclusion, summary of findings, limitations of the research, and recommendation indicating possible areas for future research.
CHAPTER 2: (LITERATURE REVIEW)

2.1 INTRODUCTION

Literature is reviewed to see and check how other researchers have investigated the same/similar research study problem (i.e. review work already done on the topic); how other researchers have conceptualized on research problem issues and what they have discovered. Literature is reviewed to familiarize the researcher with previous and current state of knowledge regarding the research problem, so as to identify the assumptions behind the general research problem, and to also identify the gaps from the previous research.

Literature will be reviewed based on the qualitative research designs. *Ethnographic literature* review describes the nature of the research study, as it relates to cultural and social groups of the research study (Leedy and Ormrod, 2001: 152). The focus of the study is on the sustainability of three rural women's co-operatives in Tsojana village. *Phenomenological literature* describes the people's perceptions, perspectives and understanding of the situation (Creswell, 1998: 61). *Case study literature review* gives an in-depth analysis of the three rural women's co-operatives; it investigates them, and then explores strategies that can help sustain them.

Literature review looks at the concept of integrated sustainable rural development (ISRD) as a broader poverty alleviation initiative in relation to three rural development co-operatives run by the Tsojana women (this has already been mentioned in Chapter 1). It looks at other
government development and growth initiatives like Accelerated Shared Growth Initiative for South Africa (ASGISA) to enable the country to achieve its social objectives, and, in so doing, meet the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs).

2.2 DEMOGRAPHICS AND THE RURAL POOR
Developing countries share the common colonial legacy of underdevelopment and poverty; the majority of the population lives in rural areas and are regarded as poor because the rural economy is not sufficiently vibrant to provide them with remunerative jobs or self-employment opportunities (May, 1998; Modiselle, 2001; Wonderchem, 1997). In South Africa (SA), Zimbabwe and Namibia, the differences in rural areas have been complicated by past policies of apartheid; especially in SA, with the creation of severely poor, self-governing and independent homelands (World Bank, 2001). Rural women are the ones experiencing poverty at first hand, due to the fact that they are less mobile; when the food crisis hits, men tend to leave to look for work or income to support the family in towns/cities, while women stay behind to look after their families. The question is “How are they expected to get the asset capital to do that?”. In 1975, the World Bank addressed the question of how women can become effective in economic development through the establishment of Women in Development Projects to encourage them to be more involved in income-generating activities like rural projects, co-operatives and self-help groups.

2.3 Definition of a Co-operative
A co-operative is an autonomous association of persons united voluntarily to meet their common economic, social, and cultural needs and aspirations through a jointly-owned and democratically controlled enterprise (Department of Trade and Industry, Co-operative Act NO, 14 of 2005).

Former United Nations (UN’s) Secretary-General Kofi Annan indicated the UN’s understanding of and willingness to support co-operatives when, in his speech in 2001, he said, “The United Nations recognizes the contribution co-operatives can make to achieve the Millennium Development Goals of full and productive employment, eradicating poverty, enhancing social integration and promoting the advancement of women. For the co-operative movement to fulfil this potential, governments need to develop and sustain a supportive environment that allows autonomous co-operatives to grow.” (Kofi Annan, 29/06/2001).
2.4 CO-OPERATIVE VALUES

Co-operatives are based on the values of self-help, self-responsibility, democracy, equality, equity, and solidarity. In the tradition of their founders, co-operative members believe in the ethical values of honesty, openness, social responsibility, and caring for others.

2.4.1 Co-operative Principles

The co-operative principles are guidelines by which co-operatives put their values into practice. The seven principles of co-operatives are listed below.

2.4.1 First Principle: Voluntary and Open Membership

Co-operatives are voluntary organisations; open to all persons able to use their services and willing to accept the responsibilities of membership, without gender, social, racial, political, or religious discrimination.

2.4.2 Second Principle: Democratic Member Control

Co-operatives are democratic organisations controlled by their members, who actively participate in setting their policies and making decisions. Men and women serving as elected representatives are accountable to the membership. In primary co-operatives members have equal voting rights (one member, one vote), and co-operatives at other levels are also organised in a democratic manner.

2.4.3 Third Principle: Member Economic Participation

Members contribute equitably to, and democratically control, the capital of their co-operative. At least part of that capital is usually the common property of the co-operative. Members usually receive limited compensation, if any, on capital subscribed as a condition of membership. Members allocate surpluses for any or all of the following purposes: developing their co-operative, possibly by setting up reserves, part of which at least would be indivisible; benefiting members in proportion to their transactions with the co-operative; and supporting other activities approved by the membership.

2.4.4 Fourth Principle: Autonomy and Independence

Co-operatives are autonomous, self-help organizations controlled by their members. If they enter into agreements with other organisations, including governments, or raise capital from external sources, they do so on terms that ensure democratic control by their members and maintain their co-operative autonomy.
2.4.5 Fifth Principle: Education, Training and Information
Co-operatives provide education and training for their members, elected representatives, managers, and employees so they can contribute effectively to the development of their co-operatives. They inform the general public, particularly young people and opinion leaders, about the nature and benefits of co-operation.

2.4.6 Sixth Principle: Co-operation among Co-operatives
Co-operatives serve their members most effectively and strengthen the co-operative movement by working together through local, national, regional, and international structures.

2.4. Seventh Principle: Concern for Community
Co-operatives work for the sustainable development of their communities through policies and constitution approved by their members. This Statement on the Co-operative Identity was adopted at the 1995 Congress and General Assembly of the International Co-operative Alliance, held in Manchester to celebrate the alliance's centenary. Recommended to the congress by the ICA Board, the statement was the product of a lengthy process of consultation involving thousands of co-operators around the world.

2.4 Similar Studies or Research Conducted to Assess and Investigate the Impact of Co-operatives on Sustainable Livelihood
It is widely accepted that the presence of co-operatives in the poor countries listed below was found to be significant, though poorly documented in many cases. Findings by Develtere, Pollet and Wanyama (2008) indicated that approximately seven per cent (7%) of the African population have an affiliation to primary projects and co-operatives in their countries and, also, in other developing countries. These findings have been confirmed by BangladeshWCD (REOPA-CST Project, UNDP, 2007: 03) and Source: http://www.undp.org.bd).

Strategic Humanitarian Services in Cameroon (SHUMAS)
SHUMAS is a Non-Governmental Organisation involved in a wide range of sustainable development issues, aiming to benefit disadvantaged rural people, especially rural women. Women in Cameroon, as in other developing countries, are responsible for feeding their families in addition to their everyday domestic chores.

The findings have been confirmed by the increase in the number of new co-operatives registering every year. This increase is largely due to expansion of Savings and Credit Co-
operatives (SACCOs) (Table 2.1), which now tend to make a larger proportion of the co-operative movement than it has in previous years. Table 2.1 below lists the results of work done by Develtere, Pollet and Wanyama (2008) on the number of new co-operatives in eight African countries in 2005 and 2008.

Table 2.1: Number of registered co-ops in eight African countries from 2005 to 2008

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COUNTRY</th>
<th>2005</th>
<th>2008</th>
<th>NUMBER OF SACCOs 2008</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>14400</td>
<td>24167</td>
<td>6236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>10640</td>
<td>11635</td>
<td>5122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rwanda</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>2500</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swaziland</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tanzania</td>
<td>5730</td>
<td>8597</td>
<td>4780</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>7476</td>
<td>10641</td>
<td>1513</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zambia</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>16133</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Below are some of the co-operative initiatives that are taking place in other developing countries:

- In Lebanon women are members of agro-processing co-operatives which are transforming raw agricultural products into desirable products for the market (Traboulsi, 2011).

- Women in Iran established a ball-making co-operative (Aazami, Sorushmehr and Mahdei, 2011).

- The study “Rural development and women lessons from the field” issued by the International Labour Organization in Geneva, Switzerland in 2003 looked at the impact of co-ops in poor rural areas of Geneva.

- A report was compiled after an intensive study of “Women in Rural Development” by the Afro-Asian Reconstruction Organization, New Delhi in India.

- Another research by Doman Prakash in New Delhi in India in 2003 where she was looking at Rural Women, Food Security and Agricultural Co-ops.
- ILO issued a report in 2009 after the study of "Resilience of the co-ops in times of crises" in Geneva.


- Shahin Rumina of the University of Murdoch performed a research study on the rural poor areas of Bangladesh on “Towards Sustainable Entrepreneurship and Social Development for Rural Women”

- A report by the UN in New York 2007 was compiled on “Developing Women’s Entrepreneurship and E-Business in Green Co-operatives “in the Asia and Pacific Region.

- Mqingwana (2010) also confirmed the role played by co-operatives in his research of the three rural co-operatives in the Idutywa village in the Eastern Cape.

- Their impact is also confirmed by the researcher of this research study with her three identified co-operatives in Tsojana rural Village, but the challenge is failure of the members to sustain them of which that would be investigated further during the course of the research.

- The impact of the co-operatives has been confirmed by the South African Government, hence the development policy formulation to increase the number and variety of viable and sustainable economic enterprises (Co-operative Act. No. 14 of 2005). This policy deals with an important variant of economic enterprise, namely, co-operatives, and outlines the government’s approach to defining co-operative enterprises as well as the policy instruments that will be utilized to achieve its objectives. The policy also deals with the promotion and support of developing/emerging co-operatives enterprises, creates an enabling environment for co-operative enterprises and entrepreneurship. These include small, medium, micro and survivalist co-operative enterprises which will contribute to the creation of jobs, income generation, and resource mobilization, and broad-based black economic empowerment (BBBEE), thereby enhancing sustainable human development in South Africa. The policy intends to promote the development of economically sustainable co-operatives that will significantly contribute to the country’s economic growth (Co-operative Development Policy for SA, 2004).
2.6 CORE OBJECTIVES OF SOUTH AFRICAN GOVERNMENT

The core objective of South African government, as set out in 2004, is to halve poverty and unemployment by 2014 (Mlambo-Ngcuka, Stakeholder Dialogue & Program Conceptualization Colloquium, 2006), and ASGISA was recommended as another development and growth initiative to do that after consultation and discussions with various stakeholders. The ASGISA Task Force, led by former Deputy President (Mlambo-Ngcuka) included the ministers of finance and other departments like Trade and Industry and; Public Enterprises; Premiers of the Provinces; Organised business and Labour; Religious Leaders, and Youth and Women in various groupings and forums. The government’s vision for development and growth path is to improve the environment and opportunities for labour-absorbing economic activities. Another government’s vision for development and growth path is a vigorous and inclusive economy where products and services are diverse, and their costs are reduced so that labour is absorbed into sustainable employment and new businesses proliferate and expand.

More broadly, ASGISA wants to ensure that the fruits of growth are shared in such a way that poverty comes as close as possible to being eliminated (i.e. people come out of poverty for good), hence ASGISA emphasises the need to create opportunities for the poorest of the poor, especially women, to enter the economy through the National Program for the Creation of Small Enterprises and Jobs through a collaborative effort between the government, social partners and the private sector (www.info.gov.za/asgisa).

Minister Didiza, T. (2006) lamented on the fact that development and growth must positively impact on the ordinary lives of rural women, to avoid rural areas becoming reservoirs of employment for the cities; there must be an establishment of sustainable livelihood where the majority of people live, i.e. in rural areas. She also indicated that, there have been a number of initiatives in the past aimed at alleviating poverty and unemployment; they have often failed to uplift those in the margins - those who benefit the least - legislation, education programs and services. In an effort to meet the targets, “we must draw in these people, the ‘MaZondi’ of our society - the subsistence farmer who is not only female, but also illiterate. The self-help groups and co-operatives could be ideal vehicles to create a base in which these people can learn and collectively participate and have access to resources”.

Development at the local level must be stimulated and activated, i.e. there must be increasing levels of income and expanding economic opportunities (Mbongwa, 2006). “The Government will place more emphasis on the development of a co-operative movement to combine the financial, labour and other resources among the masses of the people, rebuild our communities and engage the people in their own development through sustainable economic activity.” Thabo Mbeki, 25/06/1999.
2.7 ESTABLISHMENT OF CO-OPERATIVES/SELF-HELP GROUPS IN SA

The continued consultations and debates aiming at removing obstacles to economic growth led to exchange visits to India in 2005, to visit a Hand in Hand Non-Governmental Organization (NGO) in Tamil Nadu, and to expose SA to India's mass mobilization of women into entrepreneurship and economic growth. The visit led to SA adopting the idea hence in 2005 there was a launch of a national program aiming at formation of self-help groups (SHGs) or co-operatives with access to micro-financing and business support. An Interdepartmental working group that included Dr Percy Barnervick, a member of the International Investment Council (IIC) who facilitated the Hand in Hand Indian connection, was formed. In 2006 he presented on behalf of the working group the National Program for the Creation of Small Enterprises and Jobs in the Second Economy in a meeting that was chaired by Deputy President with a number of cabinet ministers and premiers. Minister Didiza, T of the then Department of Agriculture and Minister Mphahlwa of Trade and Industry were appointed to facilitate the implementation of the program.

2.8 RURAL ENTREPRENEURS

These were represented by Ms Matshusa Nwanedi of the farmer's association (Tomato Growers Co-operative) in Limpopo, Ms Salome Mnguni of the Tshwaranang Co-operative in Mpumalanga, MaZondi of the Eastern Cape, and others. Generally their view was that "the economy is in the soil and every resource found in the rural areas" starting from ordinary gardening, poultry farming, livestock farming to non-agricultural activities like sewing, baking, crafts, etc. In these occasions, women have grouped themselves in well-structured village organizations with the aim of sustaining their livelihood and, by so doing, also grow their co-operatives to well-established business enterprises.

2.7.1 Who Are the Primary Co-operative Stakeholders?

- **Rural Women’s Self-Help Groups (SHGs)**
  Groups of women from the same poor economic class who come voluntarily to work together for their own uplift, and that of their community.

- **Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs)**
  These are closer to the grass roots; hence they are helpful in motivation for social mobilization and collective action, formation and strengthening of co-operatives and facilitate linkages with local institutions. Examples of NGOs are Small Enterprise Development Agency (SEDA), Eastern Cape Development Co-operation (ECDC), and Kellogg’s Foundation.
• **Government**
  Plays facilitation and also support role to the co-operatives. The role of government is to manage the co-operatives and facilitate all stakeholders working together; it is responsible for selection and monitoring of NGOs, for designing and facilitating training at all levels; and it facilitates linkages with NGOs, line departments and banks.

• **Bankers**
  They work in partnership with government, NGOs and all organizations involved in co-operatives (Lessons from the International and Local Initiatives, 2005: Part 3)

• **Others**
  The Cooperative Facility for Africa (Coop-Africa) is a regional technical co-operation programme of the International Labour Organization (ILO) contributing to the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals and the promotion of decent work in Africa by promoting self-help initiatives, mutual assistance in communities and cross border exchanges through the co-operative approach (Pollet, 2009).

### 2.9 STRATEGIES DEVELOPED

Different countries have different approaches or strategies with regard to co-operative management. The following are parts of South African government’s approach to co-operative management:

1. The South African Government has developed various approaches to support the country’s economic growth and development through Local Economic Development Strategy with its objectives on:
   - Shared understanding on the need for sustainable rural community investment programs and this can be developed through rural community stakeholder participation strategies and actions.
   - Shifting towards a more strategic approach to the development of rural co-operatives and overcoming challenges and failures in respect of instances where municipalities themselves try to manage various non-viable projects, co-operatives, or start-ups.
   - Supporting local economies in realising their optimal potentials and making local communities active participants in the economy of the country.
   - Improving community access to economic initiatives, support programmes and information.
- Improving the co-ordination and integration of economic development planning and implementation across government, and between government, communities and non-governmental players.

2. The former minister of Agriculture, Didiza, and T identified a number of areas that were often overlooked; like the resources that rural areas already have that can form the potential base of a pooled asset, like agriculture, and non-agricultural assets. There has been communal and emerging farmer’s mobilization to join various farmers’ organizations so that they can actively participate in all farming issues.

3. The Department of Trade and Industry has its own strategies like Small Enterprise Development Agency (SEDA), Khula Enterprise Finance Limited, South African Women Entrepreneurs Network (SAWEN), and Technology for Women in Business (TWIB) and Techno girls, and National African Chamber of Commerce and Industry (NAFCOC).

4. Independent Development Trust has developed a model for effective management of projects and co-operatives through monitoring and evaluation for sustainability purposes.

5. The government is offering small business or co-operative development through training, workshops, and other forms of empowerment or emancipation.

6. The Government supported the establishment of Co-operative Bank Act No. 40 of 2007, and this is part of its financial inclusion initiation in rural poor people’s lives as the initiative provides the people with limited liability and democratic controls over their co-operative management.

2.10 CHALLENGES EXTRACTED FROM LITERATURE

These are some of the challenges faced by co-operatives:

1. Difficult in accessing local and international markets due to the undermined contribution of agricultural produce in boosting economy.

2. Poor enabling policies for investment.

3. Poor state of infrastructure (agriculture, roads, electricity, etc.) to meet the requirements.

4. Poor protection from risks.

5. Incomplete documentation (legal, administrative, financial, minutes of meetings, etc.).


7. Ill-planning, hence collapse, or short lived existence.
8. Restrictive social norms, as in traditional or cultural practises; patriarchal modes and practices by cultures, politics and religions.


10. Overload of work experienced by rural women (unpaid, unaccounted for and invisible care-work and care-burden).

11. Less participation in decision-making.

2.11 CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS
Co-operatives have a significant direct impact on rural women’s lives, through services and goods they deliver as mentioned in this chapter. Literature reviewed in the study has sought to provide information to address questions and doubts relating to the effectiveness of co-operatives as a development model. It has been established that the majority of rural women are affiliated to primary co-operatives, and others have advanced to well establish business enterprises. Some severe deficiencies and challenges have been identified as mentioned above. Co-operative education is imperative as co-operation requires co-operative members and staff, as well as government departments or ministries to be aware of and informed about procedures, policy and norms; a proper training system should be in place. The cooperative training/education is offered by co-operative colleges in other countries like Kenya, Tanzania, Uganda, Zambia, Lesotho, and Swaziland. Most of these institutes were founded before or just after independence, and have been a part of the co-operative movement in these countries. Co-operative institutions can help accelerate the process of development and participation of women in their organisational and business activities.
CHAPTER 3: (RESEARCH METHODOLOGY)

3.1 INTRODUCTION
This chapter provides insights into where and how research study was conducted and the description of the three study areas. It discusses the research design, research inquiries used, research paradigm, methods of data collection, sampling, delimitation of the research area, research delimitation, research assumptions, limitations/ problems and data analysis.

3.2 LOCALITY OR GEOGRAPHIC PROFILE
Intsika Yethu is a local municipality situated within the Chris Hani District Municipality in the Eastern Cape Province. It was established in terms of the Municipal Structures Act of 1998, consisting of two main towns, namely, Tsomo and Cofimvaba. The rural component of the municipality is composed of 213 villages with 23 wards, including villages extracted from the neighbouring municipalities of Sakhisizwe (Cala), Emalahleni (Lady-Frere), Engcobo and Mbashe (Idutywa), and Mnquma (Ngqamakhwe) during the re-demarcation process (Intsika Yethu Municipality Integrated Development Plan (IDP), Cofimvaba, 2010-2011). The study area falls under Ward 16 which consists of 10 scattered villages. Ward 16 is under the administration and leadership of one ward councillor and various ward committees from each village, traditional leaders like Chief (Inkosi) and Board (Usibonda). All these structures are responsible for the development and growth of the villages together with interested business owners, the private sector and Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs). The three co-operatives under study are formed by people from three neighbouring villages, i.e.
Mawodini, Ncwane and Qwili, but the village is commonly known as Mawodini, hence the researcher will also refer to Mawodini village when she is talking about the co-operatives.

3.3 INTSIKA YETHU MUNICIPALITY WITH THE DISTRICT CONTEXT

Figure 3. 1: Intsika Yethu Map within the District Context.
3.3.1 Intsika Yethu Population Spatial Distribution

In the figure below, it is shown that 95% of households live in rural areas (villages), 3% in formal urban, i.e. in two towns, while 2% live in informal settlements (Figure 3.2). Intsika Yethu is the largest and most rural municipality within the Chris Hani area, as evident in the district municipality settlement distribution pattern (Figure 3.3).

![Population spatial distribution](image)

Figure 3.2: Intsika Yethu Population Spatial Distribution

3.3.2 District Municipality Settlement Distribution Pattern

![Household Income Distribution](image)
The distribution pattern above shows that Intsika Yethu has the highest number of households receiving income below R1500.00 (from agriculture, non-agricultural activities and remittances from the cities) a month (Intsika Yethu Municipality IDP; 2010-2011). That is why the municipality has identified the need to invest in growing local economy so as to create income-generating opportunities and livelihood security through community-based/village organizations, like projects and co-operatives.

3.4 METHODOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK
This is an Investigative and exploratory study involving case studies dealing with the issue of people participation (PP) in participatory activities (three co-operatives). The investigative and exploratory research methodologies are followed by an interpretative study to enable a deeper and clearer picture of the issue of PP in the study area. Therefore, research data in this study is qualitative in nature, based on the understanding of the situation from the participant’s point of view or perspective. The qualitative method used in this study seeks to investigate and explore aspects of development co-operatives and understand the aspects of the socio-economic life of rural women. It combines a case study to get an in-depth understanding of the situation with the phenomenological enquiry to explore what people experience, and the meaning they ascribe to the experience; and the ethnographic enquiry to describe and interpret people’s culture, as these projects are managed by women. How does culture impacts on their project management? The researcher continuously observes
people’s behaviour at their natural setting and listens to various explanations. Qualitative research gives the researcher an opportunity to gather a large amount of information and look at events as they happen. Qualitative research allows the researcher to document real events, to observe special activities and behaviours at natural setting, to listen to various explanations and descriptions of specific cases, and record what people say in words, gestures and tone.

The research strategy considered the "case study" research to achieve the main objectives of the study. Literature shows that case study research is becoming increasingly important in current research on rural development (Robson, 1993; Miles and Huberman, 1994; Yin, 1994). This kind of study could help gain a deeper identification of the process of PP, and allow clarification of the appropriate information on the factors that affect PP as well. In this study, the appropriate tools chosen for collecting data are observation, semi-structured interviews, focus groups and community forums, document reviews, narratives from the villagers, field notes, and photographs.

The samples were selected from active women’s co-operatives in the community. Out of the two broad sampling types - "probability" and non-probability" - the non-probability sampling was adopted in this study. A non-probability sample is also called  purposive sampling; it is chosen for a particular purpose, as the name suggests. This has been chosen as a typical method to represent the diverse perspectives of the study. This type is more likely to produce representative samples and enable estimates of the sample’s accuracy (De Vos, 1996).

3.5 RESEARCH PARADIGM

The researcher has used Interpretative paradigm due to the fact that the researcher seeks to understand the details of interaction among the stakeholders, i.e. the community, the project funders, women, local structures and political organizations. The researcher gathers a large amount of detailed qualitative data to establish the reasons for the unsustainability of the co-operatives. The researcher then explores alternative strategies that will assist to sustain the co-operatives, or to establish 'what needs to be changed in order to sustain rural income generation, entrepreneurship and rural industrialization'.

Women play an indispensable role in various projects and in improving the quality of life in rural areas. However, their contributions often remain concealed due to some social barriers and gender bias. Even government programmes often fail to focus on women empowerment programs. This undermines the potential benefits from such programmes, especially those
related to food production, household income improvements, nutrition, literacy and poverty alleviation (Prakash, 2003).

It is believed that co-operative development is a viable tool for economic development in the rural areas. This can help many South Africans and many communities come out of poverty, and the statement was supported by Presidential Growth and Development Summit, held in July 2003, which endorsed special measures to support co-operatives as part of strategies for job creation in the South African economy. However, emerging and well-established co-operatives have been identified as struggling for survival and lacking training. The type of support needed is that which will strengthen these co-operatives by way of building their capacity, financial support and assistance with marketing. Some of these co-operatives will require support for expansion and modernizing their operations.

Despite challenges of many kinds, and diverse approaches to development, the co-operative model has continued to inspire many people, and co-operative movements have endured and thrived in many countries in the world, like Asia, India, and some parts of Africa and Europe.

3.6 SAMPLING

It is important to increase feasibility, comparison, accuracy and manageability of a study by taking the portion of a population to be studied as a representative of that population, called a sample (Arkava and Lane, 1983: 27). A sample is influenced by homogeneity and heterogeneity of the population under study, in my case the study is influenced by the fact that the identified co-operatives are run by unemployed rural women from the same location.

Sample is a subset of measurements drawn from a population in which the researcher is interested. The sample is studied in an effort to understand the population from which it is drawn (De Vos, 1998: 194). The researcher’s three samples were drawn from Tsojana rural village, from the sampling framework of rural development co-operatives. Non-probability type of sampling, specifically purposive sampling, was used in the study because the samples are based on the researcher’s judgement, in that these samples are composed of elements that contain the most characteristics representatives, or typical attributes, of the rural Tsojana women, who are trying to uplift their livelihood through development projects/co-operatives, i.e. these characteristics make them the holders of data needed for the study (Singleton et al., 1988: 153). The samples are based on the researcher’s own understanding of the community of Tsojana village, where she stays.
The sampling unit in research can be an individual, group, or other entity that is selected for study (Fink, 1995).

3.7 UNIT OF ANALYSIS

Tsojana women: the study will assess and investigate the state of the three co-operatives, the capacity of the women and the management of the projects.

Projects/ cooperatives: to assess their potential for sustainability and projects sites/venues.

Local leaders: to look at their involvement during the planning phase and the implementation of the projects. Their responsibility and accountability in the running of the projects.

Community members: to assess their support.

Local government (Intsika Yethu Municipality): to look at its integrated development planning that allows them to liaise with other sector departments in order to fulfil their goals, i.e. those of supporting and implementing strategies that are supportive to household livelihood and the rural socio-economic stability.

3.8 DELIMINATION OF THE STUDY AREA

There are many registered co-operatives in the Intsika Yethu local municipality, but their (the municipality’s) database for registered co-operatives is inconclusive as they have different points of registration. Some co-operatives get help (re-registration) from the municipal offices, others from agencies like Small Medium and Micro Enterprise (SMME) support agencies, others from the Department of Land Affairs, and others from private companies like Accountant Offices, from the Eastern Cape Development Co-operative (ECDC) and Chris Hani District Co-operative Centre. The Intsika Yethu co-operative coordinator/officer working in the Land Affairs and Rural Development Department could also not give the estimates of the number of registered co-operatives in the municipality, citing the same challenge of different registering points.

There are also other income-generating social groups, of both women and men, like small stokvels, other co-operatives, money-lending and burial Societies, all with different purposes, but this research was unable to encapsulate all of them, even though their purposes are about sustainable livelihood. The researcher’s focus is on investigating the unsustainability of women’s co-operatives, and exploring suitable strategies that can be employed to sustain
these co-operatives in the identified area, with the hope that in future the study will share inputs for broader rural development strategies.

Instead of doing research on the whole number of co-operatives and other income-generating social groups, only the three co-operatives were sampled producing different products as mentioned in Chapter 1.

### 3.9 RESEARCH DELIMINATION

The study is subject to some limitations, in that it does not concentrate on all community groups and activities but it rather focuses on rural women that are running the co-operatives under study. It has been followed by some significant and similar ideas and opinions by different experts, like Dr Prakash, D in his research on “Rural Women, Food Security and Agricultural Co-Operatives”, Traboulsi, O. 2011 in his presentation on “Promoting Sustainable Lives and Livelihoods: Challenges faced by rural Lebanon women’s co-operatives”.

### 3.10 DATA COLLECTION TOOLS AND RESEARCH PROCESS

Data collection is a series of interrelated activities aimed at gathering good information or empirical evidence to answer research questions (Creswell, 1998: 110). The data can be qualitative (expressed as words, pictures and objects), or it can be quantitative (expressed as numbers). In order to collect the required data the researcher has to select an appropriate tool(s) she will use to collect the required data that will address the research questions (Creswell, 1998: 110). The purpose of the research (it’s exploratory, descriptive and investigative research) guides the researcher to choose the most effective tool (De Vos. et al., 2005: 286) to answer the questions below, which will in turn help to achieve the purpose or aim of the research study.

Before conducting research, the researcher had to enter the research site by asking permission from the Intsika Yethu municipality, with special mention of Local Economic Development dealing with co-operatives, asking permission from the area Headman, the Councillor and ward committees, from co-operative co-ordinators and co-operative members. The purpose and justification of the study/research was explained, i.e. the researcher has experienced and witnessed poverty and underdevelopment in her village, which it is the research area of Tsojana village, and in order to address poverty and underdevelopment, the municipality has identified the need to invest in building local economy so as to create income-generating opportunities and livelihood security through community-based/ village organizations, like projects and co-operatives.
The researcher’s interest is more on investigating:

- How the three identified co-operatives can enhance sustainable increases in the incomes of, particularly the poor, households in the area, i.e. Tsojana village/community?

- To explore possible solutions to improve sustainability of development co-operatives, seeing that these co-operatives are the drivers of rural economic development, they are promoting food security, trade and distribution, they help rural women to meet their immediate needs, while strengthening household livelihood and laying the foundation for livelihood diversification.

Data collection tools were also explained and ethical issues were highlighted like:

- They have a right to participate and withdraw from the study at any time.

- Their names will not be associated with the research findings in any way and their identity as participants will be known only to the researcher (They will be protected and their confidentiality will be of utmost importance).

- The researcher assured them that there are no risks or discomfort associated with this study.

The answers from all the participants will be compiled as a report and presented to the panel of moderators at NMMU. At a later stage the information can be presented to relevant departments as an input to motivate for change or improvement.

On the first day of the visit which was pre-arranged with the above-mentioned stakeholders, the researcher introduced herself as Nomzamo (traditional/cultural name given to a newly wed (makoti) by in-laws) to co-operative members and officially introduced herself as Joyce to the municipal officials. It was agreed at the first meeting that for focus group discussions and any other gathering, the researcher and participants must meet in a church hall, which is used as a community hall for all the activities happening in the area; which is also used by the Vukani Baking and Catering Co-operative as its working area. It was also explained that there would be follow-up visits after the first one so they must not be surprised to see the researcher frequently. The research and Interview questions are tabulated in Annexure 3.
3.11 MOTIVATION FOR THE SELECTED DATA COLLECTION TOOLS

A variety of data collection tools have been constantly used in the form of single-system and group formats during the cause of the research, due to the fact that the purpose of the research is to describe, investigate and explore the situation at hand.

3.11.1 Interviews

Interviewing is the first-hand predominant mode of data/information collection in qualitative research as it allows the researcher to understand the world from the participant’s point of view; it unfolds the meaning of people’s experiences of the world around them (Sewel, 2001: 1). This tool extends and formalises the conversation, hence the conversation with a purpose; it allows the researcher and the participants to explore issues. It determines the people’s perceptions, opinions, facts, and their reactions to the current situation and potential solutions (Collins, 1998: 8).

Interview questions are normally specified, flexible tools, freer to probe beyond the answers, seek clarification and elaboration about the research problem and question. Allow observation of reaction of participants during one-on-one and focus group sessions. Interviews allow the participants to open up and express ideas clearly.

Semi-structured interviewing has been utilized:

3.11.2 Semi-Structured Interviews

It offers maximum flexibility to pursue information in whatever direction appears to be appropriate, depending on what emerges from observing a particular setting, or from talking with one or more individuals in that setting. Some of the questions may flow from the immediate context, i.e. during observations and conversation, but the researcher is guided by the overall purpose of the inquiry and the interview guide (Patton, 2002: 342).

The researcher had conversations and interviews with all units of analysis mentioned above; the researcher recorded these in field notes and transcripts. The semi-structured interviews included the questions above. The researcher conducted the similar interviews with all focus groups.

3.11.3 Focus Groups and Community Forums

These tools have been utilized in the study, because the participants have common characteristics that relate to the research problem (De Vos, 2005: 299). Focus groups and community forums help the researcher to obtain additional perspectives, and to validate some of the information from the previous sources. They allow self-disclosure among participants as they are experiencing the same challenges and constraints, so the
participants get the platform to listen and learn from others and also to share and compare their situations (Morgan and Krueger, 1998: 9). Certain issues are discovered, explored, interpreted and understood by participants. They give an opportunity for alternative development strategies.

The above questions were asked during focus group. Chairperson for conducting the meeting was chosen by the group, the secretary was also chosen by them, and the researcher was there to oversee the smooth running of the meeting. It was agreed that, the discussions had to be in the form of interviews. The procedure of conducting the focus group was explained to the group, but it was difficult to stipulate the number of participants as the group felt that everybody was party to development in the area. The focus group discussions were treated as a community forum attended not only by co-operative members, but by everybody interested.

### 3.11.4 Participant Observation

This tool has been chosen as it allows the researcher the opportunity to get closer to the people in a natural setting to discover things no one has ever really paid attention to so she can record information as it is revealed (Creswell, 2003: 186). The researcher had a first-hand experience with the participants to learn things people would be unwilling to talk about in an interview, like cultural issues or sensitive topics. It helps to better understand the diversity of rural women activities and explore ways of helping out to improve the situation (Huysamen, 1993: 143-144). It gives the researcher an opportunity to experience and understand the situation, thus allowing her to fill in missing gaps during interviews. The researcher is able to ask appropriate and relevant questions; able to absorb program’s language, to understand concepts even if they are meaningless, understand participant’s experiences, and capture what happens outside the formal activities and feel the intensity of the environment/ situation. The researcher has freedom to explore the situation in many ways and decide which approaches are appropriate (Patton, 2002: p 261-293).

Observations were conducted over period of time during different visits to look at the activities at their natural setting.

### 3.11.5 Field Notes

This technique allows the researcher to collect a large amount of raw data on the site without altering the environment and record every event as it happens. It includes one’s insights, perceptions, and interpretation about what is happening in the setting and what it means (Field, and Morse; 1994: 298-299). Notes were taken during interviews and participant observations.
3.11.6 Documents
These are public and private documents like newspapers, minutes, journals, diaries, e-mails, budget records and policies that are traditionally rich in information pertaining to the development programs and initiatives. It’s a kind of trail that can be taken as part of fieldwork like photographs that informs and enriches the study subjects. It enables the researcher to obtain the language and words of the participants (Hill, 1993). It exposes sensitive information like mismanagement and misappropriation of funds and co-operatives. The researcher went to the district municipality to look at the relevant documents concerning co-operatives, e.g. policies guiding the implementation of rural development programs; how many registered co-operatives are in Intsika Yethu, their monitoring and evaluation strategies; types of assistance and support; and integration and coordination of sector departments in dealing with rural development programs.

3.11.7 Photographs and Tape Recording
These give the true evidence of events and activities as they happen. These were taken before the commencement of the research to have a baseline of the co-operatives, and then during the research.

3.11.8 Narratives
These were found from the villagers, traditional leaders and other community-based structures that help to compile the information from previous sources and experiences, as they have the rich knowledge and experience of the area and situation. The researcher listened to all participants and key informants in the community and organizations that have assisted the co-operatives, like the Small Enterprise Development Agency (SEDA), Agriculture and Land Affairs.

3.12 DATA ANALYSIS
Data analysis has been mentioned in Chapter 2, but most importantly data categorization of information is crucial in identifying theme patterns, organizing the information into coherent categories, always linking the information to research questions and objectives, and the use of tested data analysis methods like case study analysis, thematic analysis and triangulation and comparison.

3.13 CHALLENGES OR LIMITATIONS
Challenges encountered were caused by participants not honouring time for the scheduled meetings, thus delaying the starting time. Participants were not consistently attending the meetings due to engagement in cultural and traditional activities, especially during the
season of July (school holidays) as there were many traditional activities like circumcision celebrations, i.e. the return of young men from initiation schools. Municipal officials were always engaged and kept on postponing their appointments.

The criteria for focus group discussions were explained, but the participants invited everybody to attend as they regarded the focus group meetings as the general community meeting. Even though the purpose of the study was explained and no hopes were raised, they wanted immediate intervention and they forwarded lots of their problems (these will be discussed in chapter 4). Participants saw interviews as a platform to express themselves, hoping that the research would bring changes. Focus Group Agenda is tabulated in Annexure 4.

The selected methods and tools for collecting data during the research study were reliable and appropriate. The researcher managed to collect as much data as possible using the comprehensive tools and methods.

3.14 CONCLUSION

The researcher was able to gather as much information as possible to answer the research questions. This in turn will help explore a turn-around strategy to change the ways of doing things and improve on the existing strategies. The exercise has explored the steps taken to collect data in qualitative design using various tools to answer problematic questions. The data collection tools are increasingly involving active participation of respondents (Marshall and Rossman, 1999). The data was based on observations, interviews, documents and photographs. The research took place in the natural setting; employed multiple methods of data collection, used various methods of enquiries; and explored processes, activities and events; and examined the broad culture - sharing the behaviour of participants.
CHAPTER 4

FINDINGS FROM THE ASSESSMENT OF WOMEN'S CO-OPERATIVES IN TSOJANA VILLAGE

4.1 INTRODUCTION

Findings emerged from analysis of data collected using a qualitative overall research approach. This research approach gave the researcher an opportunity to gather a large amount of data and looked at events as they occurred in the three co-operatives. This approach managed to mix various enquiries like case study, which gave the researcher an opportunity to get an-in-depth understanding of the situation. Phenomenology allowed the researcher to explore people's perspectives, experiences and perceptions, while ethnography allowed the researcher to explore the impact of the broad-based culture and its activities.

An extensive data using various data collection tools have been analysed using various types of approaches like Content Analysis, Thematic Analysis, Schematic Diagram Analysis and various types of charts. From these, major themes and grouping of responses have been identified. This chapter begins with the re-identification of research purpose, research aims and objectives and the comprehensive background of the three co-operatives.
4.2 RESEARCH PURPOSE
The primary purpose of the study is to identify the barriers of growth and sustainable development for rural women in the study and to investigate and understand how the barriers influence their future vision concerning their co-operatives and entrepreneurship.

4.3 RESEARCH AIMS AND OBJECTIVES
- The aim of the paper is to look at the concept of INTEGRATED SUSTAINABLE RURAL DEVELOPMENT (ISRD) in relation to 3 rural development projects/ co-operatives run by Tsojana women
- To describe people’s perspectives and experiences from their point of view of development and the role they play to fulfil the goals of development.
- To understand the relationship between the people’s behaviour, culture and development co-operatives in their areas since these are women projects.
- To assess the role played by all stakeholders i.e. primary and secondary e.g. funders, community at large, women, government structures, NGOs financial institutions, developers, various leadership structures etc. The research aims to investigate if and how these co-operatives can enhance sustainable increases in the incomes of particularly the poor households in the project area i.e. Tsojana rural community. I.e. to find possible lasting solutions to improve sustainability of their socio-economic status through improvement of their co-operatives and to promote marketable, sustainable and profitable production within the resource potential.
- To mobilize them for joint action in everything they do so that they can jointly identify their challenges and actively participate in putting ideas together at their level about production, opportunities, marketing skills.
- The study also aims to find possible solutions to improve sustainability of development projects seeing that these co-operatives are the drivers of rural economic development, they are promoting food security, trade and distribution, they help rural women to meet their immediate needs while strengthening household livelihood and laying the foundation for livelihood diversification.

4.4 THE BACKGROUND OF THE THREE CO-OPERATIVES
The three co-operatives under study are formed by people from three neighbouring villages i.e. Mawodini, Ncwane and Qwili, they are commonly known as Mawodini, their collective
name, in Tsojana administrative area, hence the researcher will always refer to Mawodini village or Tsojana when she is talking about the co-operatives.

4.5 SAMPLING
It is important to increase feasibility, comparison, accuracy and manageability of study by taking the portion of a population to be studied as a representative of that population and that is a Sample (Arkava, M.L & Lane, T. A. 1983:27). A sample is influenced by homogeneity and heterogeneity of the population under study, in my case the study is influenced by the fact that all the co-operatives are run by rural unemployed women from the same location.

Sample is a subset of measurements drawn from a population in which the researcher is interested in. The sample is studied in an effort to understand the population from which it is drawn (De Vos, A. S. 1998: 194). The 3 samples are drawn from Tsojana administrative area, from the sampling framework of rural development co-operatives. Non-probability type of sampling was used and in particular Purposive sampling was used for the study because the samples are based on researcher’s judgement in that, these samples are composed of elements that contain the most characteristics, representatives or typical attributes of the rural Tsojana women who are trying to uplift their livelihood through development projects/co-operatives i.e. the characteristics make them the holders of data needed for the study (Singleton et al., 1988: 153). The samples are based on the researcher’s own understanding of the community of Tsojana village where she stays.

4.6 CRITERIA FOR SELECTION OF PARTICIPANTS

- Rural women.
- Xhosa speaking.
- Unemployed.
- Same geographical area.
- Different age groups (21-78).
4.7 THE THREE CO-OPERATIVES

4.7.1 Vukani Baking and Catering Co-operative

It started in 2003 as a socio-economic initiative by 20 women from neighbouring villages, with the aim of improving their livelihood and that of their families, as they were unemployed and struggling to make ends meet. The co-operative failed in 2005 (Table 4.1) because of limited resources as in material and financial resources. In 2006, some of the women in same area, who were involved in other projects, revived the Vukani project and recruited more members. With the help of Mrs Nowethu Ntsaluba, who has been very active, the project blossomed.

She attended all meetings, workshops and training offered by various organizations and sectors using her own money to finance the transport costs, accommodation and material required. She would call community meetings and give feedback. She empowered community members about the concepts of rural development and co-operatives, and invited appropriate organizations to explain the same concepts; many people were convinced, and various co-operatives were established. She is the now co-ordinator of the Mawodini co-operatives. The project was registered as a co-operative in 2006. Vukani Co-operative marketed its idea to local structures like the local municipality and its sectors, the community, etc. They have been receiving assistance from different organizations like Intsika Yethu Municipality, Department of Agriculture, Small Enterprise Development Agency, Chris Hani Co-operative Centre, etc., for training, workshops, funding and materials. However they do encounter numerous challenges, which will be detailed below during under Data Collection.

Table 4.1: Active Vukani Co-operative members over the years

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Members</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Membership**

  Membership is voluntary and open to women of all ages, with a joining fee is R1000.00 and annual subscription of R10.00. It was decided that the money must be paid at once or be paid in instalments over a period of six months. The idea of the amount was decided by the three co-ops at a meeting to raise funds for their bank accounts, and at that time they were getting a stipend/grant of R60.00 an hour from Public Works. The stipend was stopped, and the members are no longer complying with the agreed
arrangement and no measures have been taken for those who did not finish paying their fees. The co-operative has been operating in different places, but it is now operating from a church hall, meanwhile the building of it premises, which is funded by Intsika Yethu and Chris Hani municipalities, is taking place.

- **Leadership, Management and Governance**
The co-operative democratically elected five executive members (chairperson, deputy chairperson, secretary, deputy secretary and treasurer), a supervisor (retired principal) and two additional members. All members are aware of the co-operative principles, values and objectives, but are not implementing accordingly. They hold meetings monthly and when need arises to discuss important issues affecting the co-operative. The co-operative members have decided to divide themselves into three groups, each with a leader and they work shifts according to their groups' requirements. They meet on month-ends to discuss their progress and challenges. The co-operative does not have control measures like duty register, delegation/allocation of duties register, grievance register and disciplinary register/code of conduct, making it difficult to enforce a code of conduct, or discipline.

Their first constitution was imposed on them so as to meet the criteria for complying for registration. They realized that it was not talking to them, and formulated another one. There is no effective and efficient record-keeping. They have received many workshops and training on site, and sometimes per invitation off site from different Institutions.

- **Co-operative Activities**
They are baking a variety of products like bread, rolls and muffins and sell them to the community, and they also bake per orders. They do not have reliable customers, like schools or supermarkets. They also do catering on request, e.g. when there are workshops or training, but mostly they are asked by families to cook when there are traditional activities or funerals, and they charge for that.

Table 4. 2: Financial support from various structures/organizations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ORGANIZATION</th>
<th>AMOUNT</th>
<th>ACTIVITY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Chris Hani District</td>
<td>R89,000.00</td>
<td>For the baking equipment they are using presently</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Chris Hani District</td>
<td>R68,000.00</td>
<td>For the material for their building.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.Chris Hani District</td>
<td>R42,000.00</td>
<td>For the builders.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.Intsika Yethu Municipality</td>
<td>R78,000.00</td>
<td>For the building material.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Various organizations have empowered them with training and workshops on skills like the following: governance, business management, financial management, time management, administration, management and leadership, and food handling and catering.

- **Daily Routine**
  
  There is no duty register for recording time in and time out, they come in at around eight o’clock and knock off at four or even work till late if there are orders, but this action is not consistent. No action is taken for absenteeism, late-coming and other excuses. There is no structured routine for the day in as far as delegation of duties is concerned. The group discusses issues and decide on the allocation of tasks for the day. Whenever there are remaining products for the day, they sell them among themselves on credit, but there is no proper collection of the money; no records are kept for that. The payment depends on a person’s conscience. Other members are involved in other projects, they come in the mornings, just to be seen by others and later go to other projects.

### 4.7.2 Qwili Ilitha Sewing and Vegetable Co-operative

Table 4.3: Active co-operative members over the years.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>year</th>
<th>2004</th>
<th>2005</th>
<th>2006</th>
<th>2007</th>
<th>2008</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
This co-operative was started in 2004 by Mrs Speelman, a retired teacher, with a sewing background as she was teaching Needlework at school. She was prompted by the plight of rural women in her area who were literally begging in order to feed their families. They would wait for their husbands to send money from the big cities, and many of these men were retrenched, but they could not come back home as they were waiting for their pension monies; others were looking for alternative casual jobs. She taught them sewing using her one-hand sewing machine. They were enthusiastic about the project, and the number kept on increasing. The group decided to keep busy by doing something else meanwhile waiting for their turn, as there was only one machine. The idea of the growing vegetables came along, and the same lady sacrificed her garden for the project. It was registered, under the new Co-operative Act 14 of 2005, on the 22nd of June 2006. The project has been supported by numerous organizations with funding, training and material. These women, however, still have challenges that are beyond their control.

The group is still working from Mrs Speelman’s place, with her sewing machine and their unreliable machines. They are still using her garden for vegetables, and they have been promised gardening material and tools by Department of Agriculture. They were once given seeds by department.

**Membership**

Membership is voluntary and open to women of all ages, joining fee is R1000.00 and subscription annually is R10.00. The amount has been like above. They do have male members who voluntarily come and assist them with vegetable garden. Other members are involved in other activities outside the co-op but wanted to retain the membership, they have asked the co-op members to allow their husbands and family members to be in their places. They are still operating in Mrs Speelman’s house and use her garden.

**Leadership, Management and Governance**

They have democratically elected the executive committee and Mrs Speelman as chairperson and supervisor of the co-operative. They also hold meetings monthly and when need arises to discuss important issues affecting the co-operative and their minutes book is up to date together with other records and documents. The chairperson is transferring the skills to others; hence they are able to function effectively during her absence. They meet every morning, have a short discussion about the day’s work and allocate tasks accordingly among themselves, i.e. in the garden and sewing. Members are very committed and dedicated. They have drafted all the necessary plans for the
effective running of the co-op, like vision, mission statement, objectives and code of conduct. They drafted their own documents like constitution and business plan; and only received advises from the experts. They do have control measures, though not up to date, like duty register. They do utilise the co-operative values, principles and other regulations to reinforce their code of conduct.

- **Co-operative Activities**
  They specialize in traditional attire, school uniforms and tracksuits. They do not have stable contracts, but they rely on casual orders. Even when they do have big orders it is difficult for them to meet their target in time due to the fact that they do not have enough sewing machines. Some of them keep themselves busy in the vegetable garden, when others are working on the machines. They sell their vegetables to the community; they also do not have a stable market for them.

- **Daily Routine**
  They meet every morning; to have a short discussion about the day's work and allocate themselves accordingly, i.e. in the garden and sewing. Members are very committed and dedicated. They only work long hours when they have orders, otherwise they do their morning routine of watering their garden and go home for the day.

- **Financial Support from Various Structures/Organizations**
  They never received any financial nor material support from any organization. The Department of Agriculture gave them a once-off supply of seeds. Various organizations have empowered them with training and workshops like: governance, business management, financial management, time management, administration, management and leadership, sewing and pattern building or construction. They were promised sewing material and machines, but that has not yet materialised.

- **Factors Affecting Its Natural Resources**
  The co-op is unable to fully access arable land for crop plantation due to community land processes that have to be followed. Sites have been allocated to community members for residential purposes. To get a site the co-op has to negotiate with the relatives who are not using that particular site, which sometimes becomes a problem because owners/their relatives tend to reclaim their land. The co-op is using a temporary venue for its operation, that is, Mrs Speelman's premises. The co-op does not have access to regular water supply; It relies on community taps that usually run dry.
4.7.3 Qwili Masizame Poultry Co-operative

Table 4.4: Masizame co-operative’s chronological membership (2006 – 2012).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>2006</th>
<th>2007</th>
<th>2008</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MEMBERS</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It was started in the late 1980s by an old retired lady who was working as a domestic worker in Cape Town. She bought 20 chickens from a previous women project called ACAT, which strived to restore women’s dignity by introducing them to agriculture, and letting them choose the type of chickens they wanted to raise, that is, for meat, or for eggs. They would buy one–week-old chickens, raise them, and eventually sell them. The women were also involved in vegetable gardens. Due to the lack of material and financial resources, and ill-health of its founder, the project collapsed. The Masizame poultry co-operative was resuscitated by a member of the Qwili Ilitha sewing and vegetable garden co-operative with the aim of coaching and mentoring the Qwili Masizame members so that they can also better their lives. The project was also registered in 2006 with the Co-operative Act 2005.

Membership

Membership is voluntary and open to women of all ages, joining fee is R1000.00 and subscription annually is R10.00. The idea of the amount was decided by the three co-ops. This co-op is composed of older ladies who have introduced their children to the daily running of the co-op, doing tasks like cleaning the environment and feeding the chickens as they are old to wake up early and do those duties every day. As mentioned before, this co-op was refreshed by a Qwili Lilitha member who in turn was democratically elected as the chairperson with four executive members and two additional members.

- Leadership, Management and Governance
  Members are not effectively accountable and responsible for the daily running of the co-op, it becomes the responsibility of Mrs Manala Matomane who is housing the co-op to clean the environment and feed the chickens from her money, especially during holidays and busy months like July and December. This has resulted in a huge loss of chickens as they die of hunger, lack of regular feeding, thirst, coldness and overheating. The co-op has no control measures like duty register, effective code of conduct and delegation of duties. There is no Institution of plans, with a vision, mission statement and objectives.
• **Co-operative Activities**
  They are raising two-week-old chickens for meat, not for laying eggs. Once they are old enough with required weight they sell them. They do not have a stable market; they sell them to community members. They have started a vegetable garden.

• **Daily Routine**
  Those that have managed to arrive in the morning clean the environment, feed the chickens, assess and treat them for illnesses, and separate them according to their ages.

• **Financial Support from Various Structures/Organizations**
  They also never received any financial or material support; they were supplied by the Department of Agriculture with a once-off supply of feeds. They also received numerous training and workshops together with the other co-ops.

4.8 **OVERALL DESCRIPTION OF EVENTS AND DAILY ACTIVITIES IN THREE CO-OPS**

• Women in these co-operatives are not consistent in clocking on duty in the mornings and knocking off.
  
  • Only one co-operative i.e. Vukani Baking and Catering co-op with a draft clocking/time book which is not adhered to.
  
  • Vukani Baking and Catering co-op is the only one with delegation register.
  
  • Absenteeism is very high on three co-operatives.
  
  • Others have complained that they are over-worked as they are to fulfil multiple duties, i.e. as a wife preparing for their husbands, as mothers preparing for kids, as care givers looking after the sick, and they are to fulfill duties of village women. They are expected to attend to funerals as well as traditional, cultural and ritual activities in the village hence high rate of absenteeism.
  
  • Others complained that gender/patriarchal issues are still rife as they are not allowed to knock off late from their co-operatives, sometimes they are not allowed to go to town to buy stuff for their projects.
  
  • Co-operatives are not treated as businesses. Members do as they please.
  
  • Limited human resource skills.
  
  • Lack of resources, like financial and material resources.
• Poor infrastructure, as in roads, electricity and network.

• Poor marketing strategy for the products produced, they rely on selling at the site.

• During the researcher’s visits, no formal co-operative meetings were held, except when there were training sessions and workshops by various sectors.

• The money accrued from sales of products is re-used for buying and fixing equipment, for buying material and for catering for training and workshops and the rest is utilized for transport fares for the members going for co-operative responsibilities.

• The left-over products like bread or buns are divided among the members to sell at home, but sometimes they do not bring the money back to the co-operatives, and no strict measures are put in place to recover the money.

4.9 GENDER DISTRIBUTION

The three co-operatives have male members this year, as they have expanded their activities and included vegetable gardening, so the male members help the co-operatives with gardening activities.

Figure 4. 5: Gender distribution of members.

Gender distribution of members

Rural women are the ones experiencing poverty at first hand due to the fact that they are less mobile, when food crisis hits, men tend to leave to look for work or income to support the family in towns/cities meanwhile women stay behind to look after their families. The
question is “how are they expected to get the asset capital to do that? In 1975 The World Bank addressed the question of how women can become effective in economic development hence the establishment of Women in Development Projects to encourage them to be more involved in income generating activities like rural Projects, Co-operatives and Self Help Groups.

The pie chart shows that there are more women than males due to the fact that, during interviews women:

- Women wanted to develop and own something for themselves without interference and intimidation from men.

- Culturally and traditionally men are the decision-makers and formulators of laws, principles and regulations; often women’s voices are not heard, women wanted to plan and implement development activities and at the end are self-reliant, empowered, skilled enough and knowledgeable.

- Women wanted to feel free and be able to assign duties to each other, reprimand each other when need arises and require responsibility and accountability, which becomes difficult to do when you are dealing with males.

- The 5% of males were allowed for the running of the vegetable gardens, but it was ensured that they will abide by the co-operatives’ constitutions and principles.

Figure 4. 6: Age distribution of co-operative members

The pie chart shows the age distribution among members. During interviews it was discovered that, 10% are 21- to 30-year-olds (Youth):
• They were unable to finish even their senior secondary schooling due to financial constraints; hence they decided to join the co-operatives.

• Others have been to the cities, but came back due to lack of permanent jobs there.

• Others have dropped out from tertiary due to financial constraints.

Image 4. 1: Active youth in the women corporative

31- to 49-year-olds are more in the co-operatives due to the fact that:

• They are unemployed and went to school as far as junior level, so they do not have academic certificates for formal employment.

• They got married at an early age, the youngest being 16 years, and all their lives they have been housewives. Most of their marriages were traditionally arranged.

• Some decided to join as they were doing nothing at home.

• They are still active and want to explore opportunities.

• They want to develop and enrich themselves with skills.

• They want to sustain development for their future generations.

• They saw co-operatives as a way out of poverty as their husbands are also not working (some have been retrenched from manufacturing industries, some passed on, etc.)

It was also discovered that the 50- to 59-year-olds are also more due to the fact that:

• Some of the reasons have been mentioned above.
Some have retired from their jobs as domestic workers cities like Cape Town and Johannesburg, and decided to keep busy whilst at home.

They joined co-operatives so as to build and live a legacy for the next generation.

They joined the development programs so as to share their experiences and skills for the betterment of the co-operatives.

Figure 4.7: Literacy Levels of Members

The level of education of the members as you can see above affect the administration and management of the co-operatives. Two members are retired teachers and are utilized by co-
operators for interpretation and explanation of challenging issues like constitution, business plan, tax returns, etc.

4.10 DATA ANALYSIS

All research requires logical reasoning, for example, qualitative researchers make considerable use of inductive reasoning. They make specific observations and then draw inferences about large and more general phenomena (Leedy and Ormrod, 2010: 96). Their data analysis is more subjective in nature; they scrutinize the body of data in search of patterns, themes and categories.

Data analysis is the process of bringing order, structure and meaning to the mass of collected data, i.e. deeper understanding of the collected raw data. Qualitative research has various data analysis procedures and the analysis differs for each of the traditions of enquiry (Fox and Bayat, 2007: 105). Qualitative research poses a challenge to the researcher of how to reduce what may feel like an overwhelming amount of data gathered from interviews, observations and written documents.

Various approaches of data analysis were utilized, like content analysis using documents like policies and other secondary information, and information from the field was analysed to identify gaps, similarities and differences between policies and regulations. Thematic analysis was also utilized (Merriam, 2002). Data have been analysed within the traditions of enquiries employed by the researcher like:

- **Phenomenological Enquiry**
  The researcher wanted to understand people’s perceptions, perspectives, and understanding of women socio-economic development in Tsojana rural area.

- **Case Study Enquiry**
  The researcher wanted to assess and know the details, and have an in-depth understanding, about the co-operatives (cases) and their settings in a logical, chronological order.

- **Ethnography Enquiry**
  The researcher has looked at the entire group, i.e. rural women who share a common culture and goal. The standard of ethnography provides an account of some cultural processes like rituals, laws, traditions and the way of life of these rural women, and the impact of this culture on women’s co-operative development.
During the interviews and focus groups discussions with co-operatives’ members and other stakeholders, the research questions were the same but the interview questions were sometimes rephrased differently according to the understanding of the respondents. All these questions were meant to assess the sustainability of the three co-operatives. The three co-operatives are composed of 51 members.

4.11 MAJOR THEMES AND GROUPING OF RESPONSES: (From various data collection tools)

TRANSCRIPT EXCERPT 1: SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEWS WITH THE THREE CO-OP MEMBERS

The research questions and interview questions can be found in Annexure C, only the major themes and responses from respondents will be highlighted.

Responses from: Masizame Poultry=M

Iqwili Ilitha Sewing=I

Vukani Baking & Catering= V

Table 4.5.: Semi-Structured Interviews

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Families experience uncertainties | • M: “We formulated these co-operatives because we were told that they are going to take us out of poverty, we sacrificed a lot, i.e. our time money and material resources to start up”. We are still struggling, thus other people have lost interest (a member from Masizame Poultry Co-operative)  
  • I: “Government officials come and tell us about IDP, Policies, Development Strategies, etc., and then live us like that without even knowing what IDP’s and Policies are (a member from Qwill Ilitha Sewing Co-operative).  
  • M: “Some come from different departments/institutions like SEDA, Agriculture, DEDEA, Trade and Industry, and talk to us in the Language we don’t even understand and leave us |

| Community experiences a variety of emotions. | V: “We have mixed feelings, some of us have hope that we will succeed if we get all the support from various sectors and also commitment and determination from all of us as members”.  
I: “Some of us we are helpless as we do not know what to do and where to go for help”.  
I: “We sometimes feel helpless, confused and frustrated when things do not go according to the original plan”. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Women feel marginalized.</td>
<td>V: “It is going to be difficult for us women in rural areas to succeed businesswise as we do not treat our co-operatives as businesses because we have to conform to the values, culture and traditions of our societies e.g. if there is a funeral we are to prepare for that; July and December are busy months due to many traditional and ritual activities going on like coming back of the boys from Bush Schools/Circumcision etc. Sometimes we have to close and attend to all those activities”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Pressure to conform to traditions, culture and societal norms.

- I: “A village woman is expected to multitask’ that is why it is difficult for us to attend consistently the meetings, workshops and even the co-operative activities”.

4.12 RESPONSE FROM TRANSCRIPT EXCERPT 3: SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEW WITH LOCAL GOVERNMENT AUTHORITIES

- Local economic development manager - LED.
- Intsika Yethu Co-operative Coordinator - CC.
- Intsika Yethu Co-operative Coordinator from the Land Affairs and Rural Development Department - LA

LA “The United Nations recognizes the contribution co-operatives can make to achieve the Millennium Development Goals of full and productive employment, eradicating poverty, enhancing social integration and promoting the advancement of women. For the co-operative movement to fulfil this potential, Governments need to develop and sustain a supportive environment that allows autonomous co-operatives to grow” (Kofi Annan, 29/06/2001).

LA: “Rural Development projects are viewed as a way of alleviating poverty and a strategy for job creation through women entrepreneurship once development projects/co L operatives are established”.

LED: “In order to ensure that poverty is alleviated and livelihoods are uplifted, entrepreneurship is conducive for job creation, rural women are empowered and capacitated, assessed for readiness so that they can embark on the rural development projects and cooperatives offered by various government and non-government organizations. Their empowerment is imperative hence the local government is making every effort to render those services”.

LED: “SA inherited one of the most unequal societies in the world with; High levels of poverty, unequal health and education services, restricted access to economic support services especially in rural areas where the majority of people live, weak manufacturing base due to poorly developed infrastructure and linkages to market, rural local governments have
little or no tax base like Intsika Yethu Local Municipality and weak human capacity”. Intsika Yethu Local Municipality intensified the development of projects and co-operatives for the betterment of rural livelihood.

**CC**-In 1994 the initial rural development strategy for SA was formulated within the framework of the Reconstruction and Development Program (RDP), followed by many other initiatives. The Rural Task Team spearheaded the Rural Development program. Rural Development (RD) is a strategy designed to improve the socio-economic life of rural poor communities. It is a vehicle to increase rural production and productivity using the available resources. Rural development policy targets the marginalized rural population, facilitates change in them and builds local capacity to enable them to identify opportunities and to act on them in a sustainable manner. This approach is more often concerned with the manner of delivery and empowerment / emancipation of people”.

**CC**-“Government intends to promote the development of economically sustainable co-operatives that will significantly contribute to the country’s economic growth.

**CC**- “You asked about existing Co-operatives in the Intsika Yethu, the sustainable ones and how do we monitor and evaluate them? It is difficult for us to give you the exact number of the existing co-operatives as the co-operatives register in different areas e.g. Land Affairs, Chris Hani District Co-operative Centre and others are helped by private Companies. We are still developing the Monitoring and Evaluation strategy for all the co-operatives”.

**CC**-“There is no coordination and integration in implementing development programs among sectors e.g. Social Development, education, health, agriculture etc. are allocated their own budgets and do not communicate with Municipality concerning rendering of services/programs hence you’ll find repetition of programs”.

**LA**- “There is no structure to do follow up on the funds injected by various sectors, hence co-operatives request funds continuously, no auditing of books and funds.”
Figure 4. 8: Schematic diagram analysis from the above officials.

4.13 RESPONSE FROM TRANSCRIPT EXCERPT 4: 21- to 30-Year-Olds Focus Groups

Researcher-“Can you take me through, why you decided to join the co-operatives? What impacts do they have in your lives?

No. 1 "Most of us in this area as you know did not manage to go further than Grade 12 due to financial constraints, even those that have managed to get government funds dropped out of tertiary once the government funds failed to pay. We have been to big cities looking for jobs, but in vain. My mother who is also a member of the Vukani Baking and Catering Co-operative registered me and asked me to come back and life has been better compared to where I was”.

No. 2 “The trainings from different departments have empowered us a lot as a result some of us are eligible for formal employment as we are having qualifications and credentials”.

No. 3 "I have much more choices and opportunities now than before. I would love to grow and develop the co-operative further, but due to limited resources, marketing opportunities
and other constraints we are unable to grow from the periphery to the core economic structure”.

No. 4 “I just wish the Municipality can acknowledge our efforts and give due support and open opportunities for all emerging co-operatives and projects to grow into recognised businesses and tertiary co-operatives”.

Figure 4. 9: Responses from 21- to 30-yr-olds.

The 21 to 30-year-olds have the needs to be:

- Acknowledged.
- Recognized.
- Supported
- Independent.
- Succeed.
- Self-reliable.
- Respected
• To contribute to the community.

4.14 TRANSCRIPT EXCERPT 5: (Co-operative Members and Villagers)
It was mentioned earlier on that once there is an announcement of a meeting, even if it is for members, the whole community comes.

AGENDA: (Focus Group)

• Understanding of the concepts of Rural Development, Co-operatives and Sustainability.

• Challenges faced by each co-operative.

• The way forward/development strategies towards sustainable development and growth for each co-operative.

Researcher:- What is your perspective and knowledge concerning development co-operatives?

Response:-

• 1: "It’s about taking us out of misery we are in as in poverty, poor health services, poor education, poor infrastructure and many more".

• 2: "It’s about freedom of expression, having more choices and opportunities hence so much have happened since 1994.

• 3: "Projects and co-operatives are opening opportunities for us because we have we benefited from some agricultural programs e.g. Wool Growers Livestock co-operative and Masizame Poultry co-operative. We received Nguni bulls; we received food for the chickens, but only a once off occurrence.

• 4: "Not much have improved instead they (co-ops) become the burden of those willing to work e.g. during holidays and community activities I'm the one looking after the chickens since they are in my house."

Image 4. 2: Some of the photographs taken during focus group and interviews
Researcher: - Were you actively involved in the planning, decision-making and formulation of the co-operatives?

- **1**: "Open meetings were held by various departments to introduce rural development strategies of which Projects and co-operatives were introduced as drivers of development".

- **2**: "I became interested when they were already formulated, because we tried before doing something of this nature and they failed, my interest became more once there was a mention of a stipend from Public Works".

- **3**: "Some of the community members were not attending the meetings hence they have no knowledge of the development programs.

Researcher: -

- What has been their impact (co-operatives) in the community since formulation?

- Are these co-operatives serving the purpose they are meant to serve? I.e. sustainable livelihood.
• Are they contributing towards poverty alleviation and unemployment?
• Do they assist your families, if so how?
• How has your life changed as a result of the development programs?

Response: - “The establishment of co-operatives has a positive impact in our community as we are benefiting a lot from them.

Response: - “We have not experienced much improvement in our livelihood, but it’s better than not having anything at all.

Researcher: - How many of you have been getting monthly salaries or incentives from the co-operatives?

Response: - The issue of salary was not explained properly and people joined because they thought they will get monthly salary, but it was explained that the stipend will be received from Public Works and there is a procedure that has to be followed in order to get it. The co-operative members can pay themselves once the co-operative is established with a profit.

![Impact of co-operatives in people's lives](image)

- No response during interviews
- Not sure whether the impact is good or not
- The impact has been good, our lives have been changed for the better.
- We have not seen much of improvement in our lives, but we are hoping for the better with the skills and trainings we’ve got
- We were promised salaries nothing forthcoming since, others received stipend from Public Works, others did not get and it was also not the amount mentioned.

Figure 4.11: People’s perspective of co-operatives’ impact on their live.
## TRANSCRIPT EXCERPT (Sense of ownership and entitlement of the co-operatives)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Response 1</th>
<th>Response 2</th>
<th>Response 3</th>
<th>Response 4</th>
<th>Response 5</th>
<th>Response 6</th>
<th>Response 7</th>
<th>Response 8</th>
<th>Response 9</th>
<th>Response 10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The execute is responsible for the running of co-operatives.</td>
<td>We just listen to them, and do what they suggest.</td>
<td>There is no sense of entitlement or ownership, we just come and go because people are not committed and determined enough to make this work.</td>
<td>There are no clear rules and guidelines of how to deal with those that are underperforming and not complying with work ethics hence most of us we loose hope.</td>
<td>No regular meetings to discuss important issues. We only meet when there are trainings, visitors and anything pertaining to money.</td>
<td>People absent themselves without valid apology because they know that there won’t be penalties.</td>
<td>There is lack of management and leadership skills that is why others become tired of working hard and yet others are members only in the books, they are not actively involved</td>
<td>No monitoring and evaluation, no proper book keeping and auditing of funds hence no sustainability of our co-operatives.</td>
<td>No response.</td>
<td>Others are not willing to respond as they claim they do not want to appear as sell outs.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 5 | 3 | 7 | 5 | 6 | 4 | 6 | 6 | 5 | 4 |
4.15 INTERPRETATION OF THE FINDINGS FROM THE THREE CO-OPERATIVES

They are outputs or achievements of people’s aspirations (DFID, 1997). They are important to influence stakeholders to re-evaluate the way they have done things; to motivate people to find alternative strategies, and to motivate people to respond to new opportunities.

The above responses using various forms of data collection, (i.e. focus groups, informal interviews and meetings) have shown that the respondents attach different meanings to the following concepts:

- Poverty alleviation
- Sustainability,
- Co-operative,
- Rural Development,

The responses give a picture of how they view their co-operatives/what they mean to them.

- The co-operatives are going to take them out of poverty.
- They are going to create jobs for them.
- They are going to earn money to support their families.
- The members are well-skilled and well-experienced as business women with the training/empowerment from several organizations.
- The co-operatives are about the betterment of people’s lives.
- They have given people opportunities and choices.
- They have improved people’s existing opportunities.
- The co-operatives are to develop rural areas so that they do not become employee reservoirs for the cities, i.e. people immigrating to the cities for better job opportunities.

According to the other respondents and the researcher, the objectives of sustainable socio-economic development have not yet been met, based on the assessment of these three co-operatives (i.e. they are still striving after many years of inception).
- The members have joined the co-operatives for different reasons, and therefore they do not share the same vision, mission and objectives, and this leads to unsustainability of co-operatives. This is evident in the management and leadership skills mentioned in these co-ops, which are not based on the co-operative principles, values and framework.

- An Enterprise Development Agency official added that during the Local Economic Development Road Shows they discovered that “rural women lack experience of independently organizing and running mere small business operations, of handling significant amounts of money, of doing financial transactions, of establishing direct relations with relevant government, private and public institutions, which causes steady development of co-ops”

- Others have agreed on not being fully active members, they rely on others to make decisions on their behalf. They do not feel they belong to the co-ops. They do not have that sense of ownership. The question remains: ‘how are they going to work hard and strive for excellence and sustainability of the co-ops if they rely on others to do everything?

- They are still financially struggling like before, but they do have hope that once they get full support from the government, they will grow into sustainable enterprises, especially the Qwili ilitha Sewing and Vegetable Garden and Masizame poultry co-operative, which have not received any financial support from the government.

- The Vukani Baking and Catering Co-op has received so much support and yet it is not sustainable. It has not been generating income to sustain itself and improve the lives of the members. Other co-ops have applied for funding from various organizations, but they have been told that they do not meet the criteria and their documents are not complete. The following documents are required:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Co-operatives</th>
<th>Tax Clearance Certificate</th>
<th>Constitution</th>
<th>Co-op Registration Certificate</th>
<th>Business Plan</th>
<th>Minutes</th>
<th>Financial Statements and Reports</th>
<th>List of donators and funders</th>
<th>List of trainings</th>
<th>Hours Worked</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Expire</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Not up</td>
<td>Scram</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vukani Baking and Catering</td>
<td>d</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>up to date</td>
<td>to date</td>
<td>bled in many papers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.Qwili Ilitha Sewing and Vegetable gardening</td>
<td>Expired</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Not up to Date</td>
<td>Not up to date</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.Masi zame Poultry</td>
<td>Only Tax Number</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4. 7 : criteria for required documents

- Government structures have been injecting capital as in financial and material capital to the Vukani Co-op, but no monitoring and evaluating the how the funds are spent. Strategy has been drafted to assess the progress, and effective and efficient spending of resources.

- The coordinator of the Intsika Yethu co-operatives has been asked about the duplication of activities by other government structures, he was even asked ‘who is responsible for communicating with other structures so as to collaborate the activities?’ He told the researcher that each structure has its budget and mandate to practise independently, the way it sees fits. Therefore they do not have the vision of developing and supporting sustainable development/co-operatives, they (structures) want to spend the money allocated to them.

NB This shows lack of strategic planning in as far as Integrated Sustainable Rural Development is concerned. It has been mentioned in Chapter1 that after the election in 1999, the government renewed its commitment to RD towards Integrated Sustainable Rural Development Strategy (ISRDS), with particular emphasis on Integration, co-ordination, Sustainability and Empowerment of women and youth. The Integrated Sustainable Rural Development Policy targets rural areas and the marginalized rural population, facilitates
change in them, and builds local capacity to enable them to identify opportunities and to act on them in a sustainable manner as mentioned before (Van Rooyen et al., 2001: 37). For rural communities to sustain rural development, they must be major participants in all stages of the project or program (Gillis et al., 1992). The multidimensional nature of the development process and its problems are now clearly recognized, and solutions are to be multi-factorial. There needs to be extensive and meaningful participation of rural people, from all walks of life, women and men, young and old, and indeed all stakeholders in the process of rural development (Cohen and Uphoff, 1980). This needs participation to be bottom-up and democratic so to enhance provision of services, to enhance opportunities for income generation, improved physical structure, social cohesion and active participation in local political processes, and effective provision for the vulnerable (De Lange et al., 2001).

- There are no sustainable markets for the co-operative’s products, which were supposed to be identified during the planning phase of the co-ops. All the three co-ops are unable to secure stable contracts with local businesses and are also unable to secure marketable commodities. The lower or poor standard of their products prohibit the effective market, e.g. Masizame chickens are to be fed a special feed and also be raised in a certain environment so as to be able to meet the required weight. Due to the lack of funds to meet those requirements, it is difficult to sell the chickens at the market price, hence their price is lower and, at the end, they make no profit.

Vukani products are sold on credit at the end of the day, and, most of the time, the money is not recovered. The poor quality of electricity (frequent load shedding) spoils their products and they lose their profit almost on a daily basis. That is why they are unable to meet their targets sometimes.

Qwili Sewing is also experiencing the same challenge as the other co-ops: It has one hand sewing machine that has been converted into electric foot pedal for speeding up the sewing process. The co-op is also experiencing load shedding now and again, compelling the members to borrow hand-sewing machines to do their orders.

There are no contingency plans, or risk management, in cases of above crisis, i.e. load shedding. Eskom and other relevant service providers need to be on board.

- Infrastructure is poor, for example, electricity, which affects the co-ops (baking and sewing); roads are poor and there are no permanent building structures for the co-ops, they are still operating in temporary structures after these years.
Management, administration and leadership are not according to co-operative principles and values, leading to a lack of control measures.

Some of the problems that hinder women empowerment in entrepreneurship development in rural areas are lower levels of literacy, as it can be seen from the bar graph above, they hinder them from constructive learning, some of the problems are inadequate government support as evident in the other two co-ops; and traditional and customary laws and lack of Institutional framework.

Due to lack of access to networks and technology, their activities/products are not incorporated in industry, trade and business participation. Most of the things have been presently modernized and yet rural women lack access to technological innovations like Internet facilities. This affects an effective and efficient running and management of the three co-ops. During most of the training and workshops, the program facilitators have referred the co-op members to the internet for more information and documents (‘kindly Google some information please’; ‘You’ll get further information from the Web Site-----’; Please get a Memory Stick so that you can save the information from the internet’; ‘Please do a presentation so that people have a clear picture of the your co-op progress’). The above requests have been from the people of whom the majority have a primary level of education, they have never worked before and are not even familiar with the co-operative set-up.

Some of the members feel stupid, feel undermined and lose hope that they will ever do anything positive in their own lives. Their interpretation is that, all these development programs are for the educated people. They (members) are just there to work and somebody must hire them. They do not believe that they will ever be independent and self-reliant.

Table 4. 8: Service Providers and Their Role in Assisting the Three Co-operatives

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SERVICE PROVIDER</th>
<th>TYPES OF SERVICES PROVIDED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Government</td>
<td>The role of government is to manage the co-operatives and facilitate all stakeholders working together, is responsible for designing and facilitating training at all levels and facilitates linkages with NGOs, line departments and Banks.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Economic Development (LED)</td>
<td>It is a program of the Provincial Growth &amp; Development Plan designed to support socio-economic activities like the three co-operatives by means of mobilizing funds as it has done with Vukani Baking and Catering.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Economic Development, Environmental Affairs &amp; Tourism (DEDEAT)</td>
<td>Has availed the Municipal Support Grant Fund (MSGF) to support the three co-ops with trainings and filling of Funding documents.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural Development &amp; Land Affairs.</td>
<td>Has given Technical support to the co-ops and promised to ask for material and monetary support on behalf of the co-ops.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eastern Cape Development Co-operation (ECD)</td>
<td>It has helped them with registration, Business management, marketing, trainings support for co-ops.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intsika Yethu &amp; Chris Hani Municipalities</td>
<td>Promoted and supported alignment of LRED with LED strategy, facilitated co-ops prioritisation, contributed capital &amp; material to co-ops and tried to supply infrastructure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEDA</td>
<td>Has provided Leadership in the establishment and growth of viable, sustainable and collectively owned co-ops to facilitate their successful participation in the economy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Works</td>
<td>Gave them stipend of R60. 00 per 8 hours, but since ceased.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Agriculture</td>
<td>Has given them chicken feeds and seeds.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chris Hani Co-operative Centre</td>
<td>Has assisted them with Registration, Constitution, Business Plans and Trainings (Governance, Financial Management etc.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**4.16 What then needs to be done to enhance Co-operative Governance?**

To follow the rules and regulations designed by the Government to:

- Ensure that, co-ops have a legal status the same as that of any registered company.
• Ensure that, co-ops are governed according to accepted standards of good governance as laid down in the regulations under the Co-operatives Act. 2005 (Act No. 14 of 2005).
• Protect the members of a co-op by ensuring transparency and equality in the operations of the enterprise (Department of Trade and Industry, 2008).

The government has availed funds to achieve social objectives of reducing unemployment to below 15%, and the poverty rate to less than one-sixth of households by 2014 and a growth rate averaging 5% (National Programme for Creation of Small Enterprise & Jobs in the Second Economy. 2006) through co-operative planning, implementation and implementation. The funds are distributed across different departments and parastatals of which each department is governed by its own mandates and tend to overlook the regional or district strategy i.e. IDP. This has created poor integrated and co-ordinated rural development programmes or plans.

4.17 CONCLUSION

These co-operatives have been identified as struggling for survival and lacking training. Various types of analysis have been used to give meaning to the mass of collected data so as to deeply understand the collected raw data. The type of support needed is that which will strengthen these co-operatives by way of building their capacity, financial support and assistance with marketing. These co-operatives require support for expansion, and modernizing their operations. The government recognizes that co-operatives may operate in all sectors of the economy. All sectoral strategies should include proposals for strengthening co-operatives in the sector.

The government acknowledges that a genuine, autonomous and economically viable cooperative movement and its membership have a vast development potential to fulfil certain objectives like:

(a) Create and develop income-generating activities and sustainable decent employment;
(b) Develop human resources capacities and knowledge of the values, advantages and benefits of the co-operative movement through education and training;
(c) Develop their business potential, including entrepreneurial and managerial capacities;
(d) Strengthen their competitiveness as well as gain access to markets.
(e) Increase savings and investment.

Recommendations to achieve the above objectives will be done on the next chapter.
CHAPTER 5
5.1 INTRODUCTION

This study introduces the aspect of rural development as a strategy to address/alleviate rural poverty through the empowerment of rural women in initiating their own village projects and co-operatives. This is supported by the former, Eastern Cape Premier Noxolo Kiviet in the Daily Dispatch (2012) as she called for renewed focus on better implementation of rural development programs that would change the face of rural communities, like development projects and co-operatives. She acknowledges the role played by rural women in sustaining socio-economic co-operatives.

The United Nations also recognizes the contribution cooperatives can make to achieve the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) which were adopted in 2000 by 189 countries for the purpose of economic growth and development, full and productive employment, eradicating poverty, which is the first target of MDGs, enhancing social integration and promoting the advancement of women. Various factors have been identified as inhibiting growth and sustainability of rural co-operatives. For the co-operative movement to fulfil its potential, governments need to develop and sustain a supportive environment that allows autonomous co-operatives to grow from primary to tertiary co-ops (United Nations, 2005).

The research question tries to find out the barriers to rural co-operative growth and development, why are these co-operatives that are meant to improve the rural economy and better rural livelihood are not sustainable? What are the strategies that need to be developed to improve the existing methods? One of the aspects that informs the study is Community development and empowerment which promote human development, it emphasises the relationship between economic, social and political aspects. It emphasises people’s participation and empowerment as the key elements for rural development. It also emphasises the active and inclusive participation of all stakeholders. It emphasises the bottom-up participation as the principle for inclusiveness.

The study has been divided into five chapters to address the research question and topic, the first chapter has introduced the study to the crucial concepts of Rural Development, Women Empowerment, Active Participation, Women Co-operative Development, Government Development and Growth Initiatives like Accelerated Shared Growth Initiative.
for South Africa (ASGISA) to enable the country to achieve its social objectives and in so doing meets the Millennium Development Goals and the theories that influenced and still influence rural societies.

The second chapter viewed various literature sources to see and check how other researchers have investigated the same research study problem and topic and how they have conceptualized on research problem issues and what they have discovered. Literature has helped the researcher to familiarize herself with previous and current state of knowledge regarding the research problem, the assumptions behind the general research problem have been identified and the gaps from the previous research have been noted. It has been established in the literature, that the majority of rural women are affiliated to primary co-operatives and others have advanced to well establish business enterprises. Some severe deficiencies and challenges have been identified and recommendations have been provided. Cooperative education is imperative as it requires cooperative members and staff, as well as government department or ministries to be aware and informed about procedures, policy and norms; a proper training system that are to be in place.

The third chapter provided an insight into where and how research study was conducted and the description of the three study areas. It discussed the research design, research inquiries used, research paradigm, methods of data collection, sampling, delimitation of the research area, research delimitation, research assumptions, limitations/ problems and data analysis. With the research methodologies used, the researcher was able to gather as much information as possible to answer the research question. This in turn has helped explore turn- around strategies to change ways of doing things and improve on the existing co-operative development strategies. These will be elaborated upon on the recommendations.

The fourth chapter has analysed the collected data using various data analysis approaches in search of patterns, themes and categories. The findings have deduced that, rural women co-operatives might play a crucial socio-economic growth and development role in remote rural areas but they have been identified as having challenges that hinder their full and sustainable growth and development.

The fifth chapter has provided the conclusion and recommendations of the study.

5.2 SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

The Government recognizes that, Co-operatives contribute to the development of the nation or communities through the improvement of the socio-economic situation of their members at local level/grassroots and the co-ops main purpose is to render services to members
(Department of Trade and Industry, Co-op Development Policy for SA. 2004). The SA Government is committed to ensuring that co-operatives have a stake in the overall economy by facilitating their expansion into areas in which they have never existed like in rural areas. Such expansions promote greater participation of rural women in economic activities. The SA Government encourages Local Municipalities to play a crucial role in supporting co-operative development in all sectors of the economy and all sectoral strategies should include proposals for strengthening co-operatives. In so doing, co-operatives can flourish through existing programmes such as Integrated Sustainable Rural Development Strategy (ISRDS) and Local Economic Development (LED) Strategy.

Regardless of the level of development, women play a pivotal role in rural development in most developing countries as mentioned in chapter two. Evidently there are serious constraints which hinder the promotion of an effective role for women in development; this is also evident in three co-operatives under study. Vukani Co-operative has received funds as compared to the other two, but it not sustainable.

The study focuses upon Tsojana rural women’s background, socio-economic state and cultural viability from different perspectives. It also explores their actual situation in the rural community and identifies the core impediments to sustaining a small or medium business to defeat against poverty. The study also makes recommendations to ensure women’s empowerment and rights and investigates the way to achieve the MDGs especially the first one which is “eradicating poverty” to improve the vulnerable situation of Tsojana rural women co-operatives.

Efforts have been directed at empowering the three co-ops and special programmes have been instituted to improve their social and economic status through provision of empowerment programs like training courses according to their needs.

The research study has been designed to advance our understanding of rural development initiatives of the three rural women co-operatives in Tsojana village. This thesis shows how the three rural women's co-operative explicit awareness, self-reliance, determination, development in education and training, technological innovation and infrastructural advancement can positively benefit their progress as well as the entire society.

The study shows that, by boosting their opportunities and facilities, these women can be empowered and thereby achieve more sustained growth and poverty reduction. Improved women’s entrepreneurship will not only benefit the rural community of Tsojana as mentioned
above, but also will encourage and inspire other emerging projects and co-op members to overcome the fears and circumstances that afflict poor village women.
The study also mentions government’s particular and immediate steps to speed up women's entrepreneurship development and economic growth. Clearly, such progress in entrepreneurial business can bring sustainable development for rural women and help to reach the MDGs.

5.3 RECOMMENDATIONS

In the background of the above discussion and in view of the constraints faced by women in these three co-ops, the study recommends some definite steps to protect rural women from poverty and an introduction of better ways to motivate rural women to find opportunities to develop themselves both socially and economically through entrepreneurship development. Therefore, the research suggests that social attitudes towards women should be changed as well as raising the social value of women is crucial. Furthermore, in terms of government’s steps, government should be seen to be taking particular steps to support rural women development initiatives and to set up the plans and procedures to assist them, but, those plans should be more understandable to them.

5.3.1 Building of a Viable and Sustainable Rural Women Co-operatives
- By organizing marginalized groups e.g. women, youth and disabled so as to pull their resources to gain access to benefits and economies normally attainable only by larger enterprises. Once they are organized, they are able to acquire new knowledge, skills, experiences for high quality and value products and access to business support services.
- They will be able to create an effective formal and informal support network with markets.
- To encourage women co-ops to develop a culture of mutual self-help, self-reliance and collective action and these are the major principles and values of a co-operative.
- Co-op members to be aware of their purpose, their scope, benefits, disadvantages, internal regulations governing their co-op.

5.3.2 Marketing of Rural Products
This is important as the products are dynamic and competitive. There is a need for new technologies, development of business skills to help co-ops to thrive and be in line with other businesses. Co-ops to be able to identify market contracts and product purchasing conditions as in quality, price and sales. Co-ops to organize themselves as a group so as to sell their products to wholesales, traders or directly to consumers. This joint planning and marketing help the co-ops to have sufficient quantity/ volume of products available. Effective and efficient handling of products, how to deal with logistics? Control, monitoring and evaluation are very crucial in business circles. Women need a platform through which they could justify their participation in cooperative action. Creating conditions to market and sell their products through outlets established by Cooperatives and government structures and
identification of customers, marketing strategy and major competitors in the area. Other alternative marketing strategies for their products would be to:

- To sell to neighbours.
- Sell to local markets.
- Sell in Stalls in town (Hawker).
- Sell to visitors.
- Sell to local businesses and Spaza shops.

5.3.3 Feasibility Study

Feasibility studies to be performed by all stakeholders before funding and planning of the development programs to explore appropriate products that would meet consumer needs and which products are to be most successful in terms of cost, demand, quality and seasonality e.g. in poultry farming, gardening and sewing what is in demand and in season at that time. This is crucial even before you start a project to investigate and explore appropriate products that meet client’s needs considering available resources e.g. land, labour, funds, material and production. Co-ops to look at the quality of their products compared to products from other areas. They must also look at the best season to produce, the variety favoured and the best time to supply them. This can be supported by the Government, private businesses and NGOs. There has been a growing acceptance that, Appropriate use of Information Technology and modern communication can lead to improved knowledge and productivity necessary for long-term economic growth and sustainable development (Ruminska-Zimny, 2002). They can also harness communication and act as networking tools to bring forth economic opportunities, employment opportunities and entrepreneurship development women need. These can provide access to wealth of information resources and provide access to services that would empower and enhance the livelihood of rural women. Even though these have great potential for development, access as mentioned before is non-existed in rural areas and these should be considered when planning in Integrated Development Plans (IDP), when formulating policies and development programs.

5.3.4 The Four P’s of Marketing Strategies by Gminder, 2003:28

1. **Production Strategies**: Identify buyers, understand their needs, design and modify the products to offer them what they want e.g. Vukani Baking and Catering Co-op gives their clients choices when it comes to their baked products. Qwili Sewing also is open to client’s choices when it comes to the pattern of their sewing products.

2. **Price Strategies**: The co-op to consider client’s purchasing power and compare with other competitors.
3. **Placement Strategies:** - To be sure that the right products are available at the right time and place with the right quality and quantity with small pecks like minimal delivery charges.

4. **Promotion Strategies:** - Promotion and public relations are important to increase the awareness of the existence of the co-op, then the products through advertising in local papers, local radio stations, flyers, posters, public events, community outreach etc.

5.3.5 **Building a Network with other Co-operatives**

It has helped the three co-operatives a lot as they have managed to expand their businesses, access to information and knowledge; of which they were not going to get if they did not have the alliance with others, access to markets, finances and affordable suppliers (Ruminska-Zimny. 2002; IFC2004). This alliance with others will help them to create and strengthen ties with other business community. They will be able to share basic information, skills, practises and these are the vital ingredients for successful and sustainable co-operatives.

5.3.6 **Government and its levels:** - (Local Municipalities)

- Government cooperative legislation and policies should be reviewed and revised to facilitate and encourage women to become members of cooperatives and participate in decision-making processes. Governments, Local Authorities and Co-operatives need to take advantages of policy guidelines that have been established by United Nations and International Labour Organizations on Co-operatives (United Nations, 2005; ILO Recommendation no. 193 on Promotion of Co-ops).
- Development of Plans of Action at all levels. Women’s cooperative organisations at primary levels should be encouraged to federate themselves into higher federations or association so that their bargaining power is strengthened.

Feasibility studies to be performed by all stakeholders before funding and planning of the development programs to explore appropriate products that would meet consumer needs and which products are to be most successful in terms of cost, demand, quality and seasonality e.g. in poultry farming, gardening and sewing what is in demand and in season at that time.

It is of significance that, the findings and lessons learnt in this study will add value to the body of limited knowledge relating to the topic and more research is needed covering the broader aspects of sustainable co-operative development.
5.4 CONCLUSION Development initiatives like co-operatives are the key to create sustainable community projects and co-operatives that will benefit the whole economy and rural society. Sustainable economic development can be ensured through the women's co-operatives with the help from social, economic, cultural, and political sectors (DBSA, HSRC & UNDP, 2005).

This initiative once sustainable can act as an instrument of rural industrialization and economic growth and development especially in rural areas. The SA government has already enacted some regulation relating to the women entrepreneurship development in the rural area as mentioned above. Due to complications at the period of implementing those policies, several times the support of the government was not enough, mostly in the rural areas rather than the urban areas. e.g. No monitoring and evaluation of all development programs, they do not have the data base for all co-operatives in Chris Hani. It is difficult to check the well established and emerging co-ops so that others can bench mark from the established ones. While such circumstances occur frequently, rural women entrepreneurs continue to be victims of deprivation. Even though there are some initiatives to facilitate access to different micro-credit policies, rural women do not receive sufficient training from different development organizations, which effectively constrains their proficiency capability.

This lack of widespread basic education, training, and experience remain serious obstacles making rural women less self-reliance and more dependent and unable to break the cycle of poverty, inequality, starvation, and poor health condition.
It has shown that initiatives for the co-op development program are the key instruments in the fight against poverty. The study mentioned the MDGs which need to be met to overcome many rural women's vulnerable situations. Finally, the thesis showed that policies and actions under the government regulatory framework are necessary to foster rural women's development through rural co-operative programs.

The evidence shows that, empowerment particularly when provided to relatively poorer rural women increases incomes and savings, improves nutrition and health, and empowers women substantially. Therefore, the key significance of the research is how poor women can be privileged through sustainable development initiatives to escape their poverty and find new opportunities in society. The study encourages rural women to be part of advocacy activities which includes: the identification of joint activities as group village co-ops, working in the area of promoting a better environment for the development of women's entrepreneurship in rural areas, establishing correlation between government, NGOs, civil society, financial institutions, and international donor community in order to improve the current legal and regulatory environment or framework related to co-operatives /development for women. In summary, rural Tsojana women and other rural women from other areas need more sustainable and efficient environment to improve women's skills and experiences as a tool to reduce poverty in the current state of the economy.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Dr Sanka. *Lessons from International and Local Initiatives; India. Hand in Hand*. Tamil Nadu


Harris, J etc. (1982). Rural Development: Why People Remain Poor?


Ogbul, Oyeyinka & Mlawa. *Technology policy & Practices in Africa*. Edited by Osta, M.


86


Rural Development Framework, A Report Compiled by the Rural Development Task Team and the Department of Land Affairs, SA.


ANNEXURE A:

INTERVIEW GUIDE

GAINING ACCESS TO THE SITE

Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University
P O Box 77000
Port Elizabeth
6031
S211283355

The Executive Committee (3 Co-operatives)/Intsika Yethu Municipality/Traditional Leaders

Intsika Yethu Local Municipality
Tsomo
5400

REQUEST TO CONDUCT RESEARCH

Madam/Sir

I hereby request your permission to conduct a research in your area for a period of six months. I am doing Master’s in Development Studies with Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University (NMMU) and my research interest is to investigate how the three identified co-operatives can enhance sustainable increases in the incomes of particularly the poor households in the area i.e. Tsojana rural community.

The study also aim to explore possible solutions to improve sustainability of development co-operatives seeing that these co-operatives are the drivers of rural economic development, they are promoting food security, trade and distribution, they help rural women to meet their immediate needs while strengthening household livelihood and laying the foundation for livelihood diversification.
During the research period the researcher will use various methods of data collection tools like interviews, taking photographs, field notes, focus groups and looking at documents to gather as much information as possible.

Hoping that my request will attain your favourable and positive consideration.

Yours sincerely

Joyce T. Ntsaluba (0733192385)
ANNEXURE B:

INFORMED CONSENT AND INTRODUCTION DURING THE FIRST VISIT.
Hello, my name is Joyce Ntsaluba and most of you know me as Nomzamo (i.e. the name usually given to a newly wed or Makoti), I am doing Master’s in Development Studies with Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University (NMMU). In order to fulfil the requirements for my studies I have to choose a topic of interest and conduct a research. Growing up in this area, I have experienced and witnessed poverty and underdevelopment and the community has been introduced to rural development program hence formulation of co-operatives as rural development initiatives. My research interest is more on investigating:

- How the three identified co-operatives can enhance **sustainable increases** in the incomes of particularly the poor households in the area i.e. Tsojana rural community?

- To explore possible solutions to improve sustainability of development co-operatives seeing that these co-operatives are the drivers of rural economic development, they are promoting food security, trade and distribution, they help rural women to meet their immediate needs while strengthening household livelihood and laying the foundation for livelihood diversification.

During my research period I will use various methods of data collection tools like interviews, taking photographs, field notes, focus groups and looking at documents to gather as much information as possible. Each session will not be more than an hour. I might do follow up visits after this visit.

During the research:

- You have a right to participate and withdraw from the study at any time.

- Your names will not be associated with the research findings in any way and your identity as participants will be known only to the researcher (They will be protected or confidentiality will be of utmost importance).

- I would like to assure you that there are no risks or discomfort associated with this study.

**NB** The answers from all the participants will be compiled as a report and presented to the panel of moderators at NMMU. At a later stage the information can be presented to relevant departments as an input to motivate for change or improvement.
Do you agree with the above information? If so, can you sign for me to show that you have agreed to participate in the study:

Name of the participant:  

Institution:  

Department:  

Time of interview:  

Position of participant:  

Signature of participant:  

Date:  
ANNEXURE C:

TRANSCRIPT EXCERPTS 1: SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEWS

Institution: NMMU

Time of Interview: -----------

Date: -----------

Place: ------------------

Interviewer: ------------

Participant: -------------

Position of Participant: ------------

RESEARCH STUDY: POSSIBLE SOLUTIONS TO IMPROVE AND ENHANCE SUSTAINABLE INCREASES IN THE INCOMES OF TSOJANA RURAL WOMEN CO-OPERATIVES.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>RESEARCH QUESTIONS</th>
<th>INTERVIEW QUESTIONS</th>
<th>CLARITY, PROBING, ELABORATION.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>-What is the significance or the purpose of the three co-operatives in the community? -What does development mean to you?</td>
<td>-What is your perspective and knowledge concerning development co-operatives? -Were you actively involved in the planning, decision making and formulation of the co-operatives? -What has been their impact (co-operatives) in the community since formulation? -Are these co-operatives serving the purpose they are meant to serve? i.e. sustainable livelihood. -Are they contributing towards poverty alleviation and unemployment? -Do they assist your families, if so how?</td>
<td>-can you show some evidence? -Tell me more about their effects in the community?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 1 | -How has your life changed as a result of the development programs?  
-How many of you have been getting monthly salaries or incentives from the co-operatives?  
-Do you have a sense of ownership of the co-operatives or do you feel you are part of the development process and running of the co-operatives? | -Show your financial reports and duty register. |
| 2 | The governance structure of the three co-operatives.  
-Do your policies, vision, mission statement, business plan and constitution trickle down to your co-operatives (i.e. meaningful)?  
-Were you all actively involved in their formulation?  
-Who are the main actors running the co-operatives?  
-What are their responsibilities?  
-What roles do other members play?  
-Which organizations are supporting you financially and materially? | -Show your documents. |
| 3 | -Challenges or barriers that hinder your co-operatives from progressing to sustainable enterprises.  
-What is the current strategy of the Municipality in Monitoring and Management and leadership skills and strategies.  
-Literacy level of the members.  
-Marketing skills.  
--Linkages from your rural area to central business zones.  
-Availability and reliable rural infrastructure i.e. roads, electricity and communication network.  
-Your commitment and determination to the co-operatives.  
-Who are your competitors?  
-The reliability of your customers. | -Skills development audit.  
-Budget, total quality assurance proof.  
-Minutes of meetings, duty registers and duty delegations.  
-Proof of registration with recognised commercial bodies and Associations like Companies and |
| Evaluation of co-operatives? | - Availability of working structures as in buildings, material and financial resources.  
- How do you handle cultural and traditional practices that might have impact in the running of the business?  
(a) How do you balance your duties as wife, mother, village women and co-operative members?  
(b) How do your husband’s feel about your involvement in the co-operatives?  
- Evaluation of your internal and external constraints, your reviews and controls.  
- How do you monitor and evaluate your co-operatives? | Intellectual Property Commission) (CIPC), Trade and Industry, project/co-operatives management forums etc. for purposes of funding or any form of assistance and empowerment. |
ANNEXURE D:

TRANSCRIPT EXCERPT 2: SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEW WITH LOCAL GOVERNMENT AUTHORITIES

- What were the Municipality's vision and objectives in implementing the rural development Initiative like Projects and co-operatives?
- What implementation plans are in place for the departments?
- Are the communities fully/effectively utilizing this rural socio-economic initiative?
- How many registered co-ops in the Intsika Yethu Local Municipality alone? How many are sustainable?
- The researcher has identified some challenges in the sustainability of the co-operatives, like the identified three co-ops, from asking the question “what have you identified as the challenges or barriers that hinder these co-operatives from progressing to the level of sustainable enterprises?”
- What is the current strategy of the municipality in the monitoring and evaluation of co-operatives?
- What sustainable development strategies do you offer to co-ops like those in Tsojana?