Challenges facing the implementation of Integrated Development Plan (IDP): The Case of Motherwell Township in Nelson Mandela Bay

By

MZIMKHULU MAXWELL MLELE

STUDENT NUMBER: 195474230

SUPERVISOR: Mr David Bogopa

A research treatise is submitted as partial fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of MA in Development Studies at Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University.

November 2013
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declaration</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dedication</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgement</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 1 – Introduction</td>
<td>1 - 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 2 – Historical Background and Context</td>
<td>4 - 10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 3 – Research Methodology</td>
<td>11 - 16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 4 – Literature Review</td>
<td>17 - 28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 5 – Research Findings and Recommendations</td>
<td>29 - 35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 6 – Conclusion</td>
<td>36 - 37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glossary</td>
<td>38 - 40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>41 - 44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX 2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ABSTRACT

This research outlines the challenges facing the implementation of the IDP in the Motherwell Township. Firstly, it is the physical setting and background of the Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality. Secondly, it is the brief background on IDP. Thirdly, it is the legislative framework for the IDP implementation. Fourthly it will be the discussion on the importance of the study. It is followed by the objectives of the study and the research methodology. The discussion on the literature review is also covered. Lastly, It is the chapter on recommendations and a conclusion.
DECLARATION

I, Mzimkhulu Maxwell Mlele, declare that this research is my original work. It is submitted as partial fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of MA in Development Studies at Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University, Port Elizabeth. I would like to confirm that this work has not been submitted before for any degree or examination in this or any other University.

Mzimkhulu Maxwell Mlele

November 2013
DEDICATION

I would like to take this opportunity to give a special thanks to my loving wife, Zanda Mlele, for supporting me through thick and thin in my study journey. She gave me all the support I needed throughout my academic journey.

A special thanks also goes to my son Phawolwethu, my two niece Ayanda and Anda and to my nephew Dalumzi. I would also like to dedicate this work to my late parents Mamtshawe (my late mother) and Tangana (my late father).

Last but not least I wish to send a special thanks to ward councillor Sindiswa Mthimkhulu and all informants that agreed to participate in my research project.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to my supervisor, Mr David Bogopa of the Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University for his support, guidance and constructive feedback starting from the proposal stage up until the final product.

I would also like to acknowledge the community informants, local ward councillors and the chief whip of the Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality for their willingness to participate in interviews and also for providing permission to conduct my research. My research would not be possible without the above-mentioned people interest and understanding and I really appreciate their time.
Chapter 1 – Introduction

This research is divided into six chapters namely: introduction, a brief historical background and context, literature study, research methodology, the research findings and the recommendations as well as a conclusion. Lastly, there are two sections, namely: a glossary and bibliography. Each and every chapter and section is briefly summarised underneath. The literature study focuses on the historical and political background on Integrated Development Plan (IDP). For instance, during the apartheid period, the South African cities were characterised by racial divided areas.

The involvement of communities and community organisations in the matters of local government was minimal. There was no provision of democratic and accountable government for local communities. Meaning that during apartheid local government was imposed without the democratic representation (The Constitution; 1996:84). In 1994 after the African National Congress (ANC) took over from the previous government. The Group Areas Act (1950) and the Natives Land Act (1913) were repealed as part of the reformist strategy (Integrated Municipal Development, 2007: 8).

The Municipal System Act; 2000 prescribe that the IDP is a single inclusive plan of a municipality. The plan links, integrates and co-ordinates service
delivery. The IDP is formulated in order to ensure that integrated service delivery and development goals are achieved in a municipality. The purpose of the IDP is to come up with a single plan that defines development priorities and goals for a five year period. The IDP is an important tool that has to be used for planning. The IDP promotes public participation. The IDP focused on the eradication of poverty in our communities. The IDP processes provides planners with a framework of where to focus resources. In order for the IDP system to work there must be understanding of the intergovernmental system. In terms of the research methodology, this study follows a qualitative approach.

This research methodological approach is relevant in this study because the participants or the informants were afforded an opportunity to provide their own perspectives on issues pertaining to the IDP within the context of Motherwell Township. The research techniques that were used in the study include interviews (primary sources) as well as information gathered from the IDP policy document, journal articles, newspaper articles and scholarly texts. A total number of 30 people who stayed in Motherwell for more than 8 – 30 years which included adult and youth males and female members of the community were interviewed in Motherwell township and the research findings chapter present their perspectives on the Integrated Development Plan. Each and every person interviewed was afforded an opportunity to
speak openly about his or her views on the IDP and there were mixed reactions from the above-mentioned people. This chapter also provides some recommendations with the view that the municipality authorities will utilise them moving forward. The last chapter of this study or research is a conclusion which presents the summary of the entire research. It is followed by two sections namely: the glossary and bibliography.

The glossary section defines some of the concepts used within this research and the bibliography section is a list of all the sources used in this research. In an attempt to understand the study, it is imperative to give historical and political background on the Integrated Development Plan (IDP). In order to give a picture as to how government came up with IDP, it is important to know as to what is this IDP.

The government had a purpose of coming up with an IDP. Such a purpose has to be illustrated in this piece of work. The IDP as a planning tool has benefits. IDP has two sides of the coin, meaning that if it has benefits surely there will be challenges. These challenges will emanate from its processes such as public participation. It must also be noted that to implement this particular tool, you need to have resources. There must also be a promotion of intergovernmental processes. Lastly, the IDP has to promote or influence the socio-spatial landscape.
Chapter – 2 Physical Setting and Background

Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality portrays the differing scenic, cultural, historical, climatic, marine, wildlife and floral riches which make up South Africa (Port Elizabeth, 1995: 1). Port Elizabeth forms part of the Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality which is the industrial and commercial hub of the Eastern Cape. It was named by acting Governor of the Cape, Sir Rufane Donkin, his wife Elizabeth who had died in the Far East and never actually reached Port Elizabeth.

Port Elizabeth is the fifth largest city in terms of the population. It is located on the south eastern coast of Africa and is equidistant (800km) from Cape Town and Durban and 1064km from Johannesburg (Port Elizabeth, 1995: 2). Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality is the manufacturing powerhouse for South Africa. The Motor industry is a massive contributor to the local and the South African economy.

The motor component manufacturers are Volkswagen, General Motors and Ford Company. Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality also hosts tyre manufacturers such as Firestone, Continental and Good-Year. The NMBM has a sound infrastructure that includes sophisticated services, communication systems and health care. Since the general election in 1994
the NMBM established its first non-racial local government. The NMBM has to render services to a number of townships but our focus will be the Motherwell Township. This particular township is facing a number of challenges such as poverty, youth unemployment, crime and so forth.

**Historical and Political Background on IDP**

The South African cities were established by the Group Areas Act of 1950 (Integrated Municipal Development, 2007: 8). The urban structures and life in that era were controlled by legislation segregating racial groups. The city was characterised by racially divided areas. In these racially divided areas there was a lack of services, infrastructure and development in the poor black townships (Integrated Municipal Development, 2007: 8).

The local government was minimal and was imposed without the democratic representation. The access to housing, land, water, electricity, transportation and other services was limited for the majority of the population (Integrated Municipal Development, 2007: 8).

The democratic movement that was developed to put an end to apartheid has mobilized strikes and boycotts of rent and service payments. This situation led to negotiations between the apartheid Government and the
ANC. In 1991 the Group Areas Act (1950) and the Natives Land Act (1913) were repealed as part of the reformist strategy (Integrated Municipal Development, 2007: 8).

Such will be achieved by broadening all facets of integrated development. It did that by addressing the inequalities entrenched by apartheid. Integrated Development Planning (IDP) was introduced in the late 90’s (Integrated Municipal Development, 2007: 31).

In 1996 the first IDP was introduced in an amendment to the Local Government Transition Act 209 of 1993. There was a legislative requirement that all transitional local councils prepare an IDP (Van Donk, Swiling, Pieterse and Parnell, 2008: 232).

There was a need for an instrument that that would assist newly constituted municipalities in performing their functions. The idea of the IDP was constructed for the purpose of promoting coordinated, strategic, developmental and fiscally responsible local government. In order to address the deficiencies and injustices of apartheid planning, the local government legislation required that all municipalities to produce IDP’s by April 2002, to:
Do away with apartheid legacies

Build the new culture of local governance

Foster the cooperation governance (Integrated Municipal Development, 2007: 31).

**The Purpose of the IDP**

The IDP constitutes a single plan that defines development priorities and goals for a five year-period.

The IDP provides a structure for preparing development plans and to coordinate development activities (A practical Guide on Municipal Service Partnerships; 2006-2010: 50).

The IDP aligned financial resources and capacities with development objectives.

The IDP provides the planning and policy framework for annual budgets.

The IDP encourages community participation in local governance.
The IDP promotes social and economic development and a safe environment (Integrated Municipal Development; 2007: 31).

The IDP helps the municipality to improve their understanding of how the components of the process interact. This is in relation to the critical role of capacity and capacity building.

**IDP: A Tool for Planning**

The government put in place the Municipal Systems Act 32 of 2000 in preparation for the final phases of local government transformation (Van Donk, Swilling, Pieterse, and Parnell, 2008: 324). The Act mentioned above provided a stronger legislative basis for IDP’s. The IDP is a vital tool to ensure the integration of local government activities. That is achieved with the other spheres of development planning at provincial, national and international levels (www.dplg.gov.za).

The national government put in place support structures for municipal planning. The support included a nationwide training programme for officials
as well as councillors. Communication and interaction plays a big role in the above mentioned activities. The tool assists municipalities to align their financial and institutional resources. The above can be achieved by weighing up the municipalities obligations and systematically prioritise programmes and resource allocations (www.dplg.gov.za).

The IDP assists municipalities to focus on the environmental sustainability as well as development strategies. Sustainable development refers to development that delivers basic social and economic services to all. Such development must not threaten the viability of the ecological and community systems upon which these services depend (www.dplg.gov.za).

The IDP assists the municipality to develop a holistic strategy for poverty alleviation. By ensuring that there is access to education, healthcare and adequately sized housing with basic services (www.dplg.gov.za).

IDP plans must empower municipalities to prioritise and strategically focus their activities and resources. IDP’s provide a framework for diverse communities, citizens and interest groups to enter into public dialogue and to
debate about the desirable future that they want to construct (Pornell, Pieterse, Swilling & Wooldrige, 2002: 6).

The IDP model seeks to promote a future-oriented, problem-solving approach within local government and the citizenry. In order to achieve a maximum impact, the IDP and budget process need to be linked. Through the IDP and budget processes, the local government may substantiate and secure different political, economic and social investment groups at the local scale (Pornell, Pieterse, Swilling & Wooldridge, 2002: 94). Lastly the location of services, municipal infrastructure and sites of economic growth affect the quality of life of residents.
Chapter 3 - Research Methodology

Introduction

The research follows a qualitative approach to gather data. The data was gathered in various forms, namely: primary sources and secondary sources. Primary sources include person to person interviews and the secondary sources include scholarly journal articles, IDP documents, internet articles, newspaper articles, magazines as well as books. All the above secondary sources are relevant to the topic.

The Research Objectives

The aim and the objectives of this study are as follows:

- To investigate the challenges facing the implementation of IDP in Motherwell.
- To contribute within the development studies discipline.
- To come up with recommendations that will contribute towards the implementation of IDP in Motherwell
The Research Methodology

This particular study follows a qualitative approach which includes person to person interviews. According to Babbie and Mouton (2001: 646) a qualitative approach is relevant in social science research. Therefore this approach is relevant for this study largely because the informants provided their own perspectives on issues pertaining to the Integrated Development Plan within the context of Motherwell township.

Conducting interviews is a technique that is used in social science to collect data. Interview schedules were used in order to get information. The participants participated in this study voluntarily. The researcher visited the members of the community in order to acquire permission to conduct interviews. A total number of 30 members of the community staying in Motherwell township were interviewed. The breakdown was as follows: fifteen (15) females and 15 males from the different units in order to balance the gender perspective. An advantage of interviews is that it gives the informants freedom of expression in attempting to explain issues.
Interviews

The research techniques that are going to be utilised in this study include interviews. Interviews are widely used techniques in the social science to collect data. For example Statistics South Africa and other National organisation use the above mentioned techniques (www.breakoutofthebox.com).

The members of the community will be interviewed using an interview schedule. The researcher must ensure that he/she obtains permission before gathering information (Irvine, 167: 1998).

Anyone involved in research should be a willing participant (Dane, 39:1990). I must be documented in the research project that those who participated in the research did voluntarily and with knowledge of the possible risks and benefits of the research. Voluntary participation also involves awareness of being a part of a research project. The researcher will begin the interview with a personal introduction. The introduction will establish the legitimacy of the research, the institution conducting the research and lastly the credentials of the researcher (www.breakoutofthebox.com). For example, the researcher will show a letter showing the research’s approval by an
ethics committee. The interview forms will be numbered to ensure adequate record keeping. The exercise will also assist in checking the characteristics of those who fail to respond.

The setting where interviews are conducted may vary. But in this study the researcher used the respondent’s residence. For example, an interviewer will appear at one’s door. It has to be noted that the setting has implications for validity (www.greakoutofthebox.com).

Prior to the interviews, the researcher will visit the members of the community to get permission to conduct interviews and also to make appointments for the suitable days and times to conduct interviews.

In conducting interviews, the researcher will use an interview schedule containing open-ended questions. The respondent will be asked to provide his or her own opinion to the question. For example the respondent may be asked. Does the clustering of words when doing public participation assist the ward in coming up with ward priorities? Then the researcher will provide a space in order for the respondent to write their answers (Babbie and Mouton, 233: 2001).
The primary emphasis of interviews is to gain information about the subjective perceptions of respondents. Furthermore its major advantage is its flexibility. The flexibility will assist the researcher to explore more on the opinions and behaviours of respondents. The coding process will require the researcher to interpret the meaning of responses (Babbie and Mouton, 233: 2001).

The strength of interviewing is that it gives the informants freedom of expression in attempting to explain issues. Interviews are more flexible than any other research methods. For example interviews can be used to extract simple factual information from people (Haralambos and Holborn, 736: 1991). Interviews can be used to ask questions about people’s attitudes about various issues.

Further, to supplement interviews, information will be gathered from the secondary sources, namely: relevant scholarly journals, relevant published books, relevant newspaper articles relevant policy documents, reports and the IDP document will also be consulted.
Data Analysis and Interpretation

The researcher is planning to do critical analysis of the data collected. For example different perspectives will be reflected and evaluated in terms of the data. It has to be noted that regardless of the purpose to which our research results may be. As researchers we have an ethical obligation to ensure that we do not mislead anyone who may rely on the information. Different perspectives gathered from published scholarly work on the issues of Integrated Development Plan will also be critically analysed. The researcher will give his own views on the issues raised during interviews as well as issues raised by various scholars in their works.

In conclusion, interviews play a vital role. The research has to be introduced to the study. The research has to be introduced to the participants to show its legitimacy. It is also important to note limitations on the study, for example if the researcher is not allowed to have access to certain documents. The available data plays a significant role in a number of ways. To cite one example it is less time consuming than to gather new data. Lastly the ethical balancing of the data collected cannot be underestimated, when one is conducting a research project.
Chapter 4 - Literature Review

Introduction

This chapter presents the various perspectives on IDP from different scholars and IDP policies from different levels. The first part of this chapter deals with literature from different scholars who wrote about the success of the IDP in various forms and places. The second part of this chapter deals literature from scholars who wrote about the challenges facing the implementation of the IDP within the context of South Africa in various forms and places. The third part of this chapter provides a critical perspective on the above literature review.

Successes of IDP

Scholars who have contributed to the success of the IDP include among others Pretorius (2007: 22) who argued that the IDP was a success in district municipality. In that the IDP has been seen as the vehicle that not only carries the hope of the nation in delivering basic services. But it is also responsible for the empowerment of communities and the creation of job
opportunities. In order to give effect to the above development goals the District Municipality adopted eight priorities that are inline with the ANC Manifesto namely:

1) The promotion of access to land

2) Poverty alleviation

3) The stimulation of economic growth

4) Health care and HIV/AIDS control measures

5) Public safety

6) Job creation and skills development

7) Infrastructure development and maintenance

8) Good and democratic governance

Further, contribution was made by Van Donk, Swilling, Pieterse and Parnell (2008: 328) who argued that the impact of IDP on the lives of ordinary citizens especially the poor requires careful investigation. The impression that derived from the IDP hearings is that there has been an improvement in the level of service delivery country wide. But the challenge is the methodological and data problems. The rate of improvement is highly uneven and is disappointing. There is data available for municipalities and
even province wide. There are few cases where provincial governments are gathering information. But there is no commonly agreed set of measures for quantifying backlogs and progress.

Further contribution was made by Davids, Theron and Maphunye (2009: 140) who argued that the IDP of the Stellenbosch Municipality managed to align the resources and capacity of the municipality with the implementation plan. Their IDP forms the policy framework and general basis on which annual budgets must be based.

**Challenges facing the implementation of the IDP: Public Participation**

The scholars who have written about the challenges facing the IDP include among others, Davids, Theron & Maphunye (2009: 147) who argued about power and control that exist between the three levels of government. It usually leads to tension between a top down and an authentic bottom-up approach to development planning and delivery. The above led to confusion and it shows a lack of legislative clarity on the roles of the three levels of government. Such undermines the significance of the IDP. Considering the fact that IDP’s promote grass-root action based local
development. There is too much control from the three levels of government which frustrates the processes of democracy (Davids, Theron & Maphunye, 2009: 147).

The participatory processes has been uneven and the objective should be deepen and strengthen participation. Mechanisms for participation remain the IDP representative forums and ward committees. But have been extended to include IDP summits and imbizos (Van Donk, Swilling, Pieterse and Parnell, 2008: 328).

It is necessary to promote participatory processes and has impact on the lives of ordinary citizens. For example, experience with public participation has shown that processes are imperfect. If there is going to be an IDP and budget meeting especially in the township. Such a service provider will do the loud hailing an hour before the meeting starts. Taking into consideration that most of the township people do read the newspapers as these meetings get published on the local newspaper. IDP documents deal with strategic and technical issues. But to encourage participation they have to be brief, user-friendly and accessible. Most municipalities do not ensure effective participation of the private sector (www.cogto.gove.za).
Resources in the Implementation of IDP’s

There is usually a tension between the communities’ immediate needs and the municipality’s strategic considerations of a five year plan. Such has to take into account various competing needs and be implemented with limited resources. (www.cogta.gov.za).

The councillors instead of seeing the IDP as primarily a municipal-wide strategic plan, tend to push for their petty projects or the immediate needs of their constituents that can at times undermine some of their constituency long term interests. The emphasis is on quick wins rather than developing a long term strategy with sustainable outcomes (www.cogta.gov.za).

The previous local government system has led to uneven distribution of resources. The eradication of the imbalances and poverty that flows from them is one of the greatest challenges facing the current local government systems. It has to be acknowledged that the current distribution of urban society’s benefit and burdens arose out of an unjust apartheid system. The apartheid system led to the incapability of delivering services to the black areas.
Influences of the IDP on the Socio-spatial Landscape

Post apartheid South Africa planning promotes an equal society whereby the people regardless of race or economic status live with the same opportunities. The IDP is the municipal method of implementation and promotes a participatory approach to planning (www.academia.edu). The is a concern that the IDP process is flawed, and it fails in its intent of creating equal society. The IDP is ineffective largely because it is heavily motivated by political pursuit as opposed as to the initial purpose of servicing the citizenry.

There is a notion that public participation is going through the motions process and integration is difficult to achieve due to economic and political factors. Planning literature suggests that if the right planning model is developed then the process should be successful. The IDP process provides planners with a framework of where to focus resources. But the literature indicates that it has had little success either in promoting social integration or in altering the power dynamics reflected in spatial arrangements (www.academia.edu).
The IDP of all planning options is limited. Public sector planners must be more involved in educating citizens on planning consequences and benefits. There is a widespread consensus about the ineffectiveness of spatial planning in reshaping the apartheid city. This is partially because there appears to have been a decline in the co-ordinating role of spatial planning (www.dag.org.za). Other line departments, such as housing and transport are also required to do their own forward planning and these plans frequently conflict. Also uncertainties over land claims and the slow pace of land reform are key constraints on local development process.

**Intergovernmental Co-ordination and the IDP**

This is a huge task and the resultant challenges and difficulties reflect the complexities that still hold true and still are negotiated on a daily basis. The biggest challenge at local government level is the lack of skills and capacity to develop an IDP. That is representative of all the developmental concerns in the municipality and also the bottom-up as well as top-down engagement amongst the different spheres of government as well as community participation (www.halogen.org.za).
Local government is seen as the sphere of government where all the developmental ambitions and aspirations of national and provincial government come together. Local government has to respond to the issues of poverty alleviation through the creation of sustainable human settlements. They have to provide basic services and also need to take responsibility for the creation of viable economies.

In order to respond to the problems of unemployment and poverty the IDP emerged from all these factors as the instrument for an integrated system of government that brings about development and growth. However in order for this system to work there has to be a clear understanding of the intergovernmental system (www.halogen.org.za).

In light of the complexities associated with intergovernmental coordination and factors like the lack of capacity and skill at local government level, can we realistically expect that the plans articulated in the IDP will be implemented? It cannot be assumed that this will automatically translate into practice and it is important to be realistic about these shortcomings. Another challenge about IDP is the questions on whether or not IDP’s have really had an impact on the lives of ordinary citizens. If one considers the massive backlogs that still exist in terms of basic services provision. Further there is a need for intergovernmental fiscal transfers. Municipalities are dependent on
intergovernmental transfers as well as the ability to influence such transfers (Van Donk; Swilling; Pieterse and Parnell, 331: 2008).

Most IDP’s deal very poorly with environmental management whilst the transportation planning is least recognised. The intergovernmental system is not working at present. Instead the system is working in the favour of local government by streamlining and integrating developmental priorities. As initially intended municipalities that are already under-resourced feel besieged by any new challenge that becomes just another unfunded mandate.

Critical Look on the IDP

IDP is a complex, ongoing, interactional process in which capacities for decision-making, joint action and coordinated implementation are built over time. In any local area there are many different agencies that contribute to development, national and provincial departments, parastatals, trade unions, private sector and community groups (Pretorius and Schurink, 2007: 24).
Van Donk, Swilling, Pieterse and Parnell (2008 : 32) argued that the quality and focus of IDP’s have improved. Department of Local Government (2005) reports have stated that only 37% of municipalities have the independent capacity to prepare effective IDP’s. On the other hand 35% have the basic institutional capacity but require continued support to deliver the plans. Also 28% lack the most basic capacity and even with support will struggle to prepare an IDP (Van Donk, Swilling ; Pieterse and Parnell, 2008).

IDP had to expand to incorporate dimensions like spatial development frameworks, medium-term financial planning, disaster plans, integrated transport plans and performance management systems. The IDP’s can not manage to fund the housing backlog, for example, there is a backlog of 74,411 in the Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality (NMBM). The funding that is gazetted for human settlements for 2013/14 = R206 900 million.

There is a lack of integrated planning between the sphere of government in order to ensure that new communities (such as Joe Slovo informal settlement) have access to a full range of services like schools and clinics.
The IDP’s have a challenge of financing aging and poor infrastructure that leads to leakages, pipe bursts and blockages. The above mentioned shortfalls on the IDP’s culminate in service delivery disruptions. One must bear in mind that the IDP came into effect in order to improve service delivery. Funds are needed in order to give effect to the community. If there is a lack of funding this hampers the service delivery to the communities especially to poor communities (Pretorius and Schurink, 2007: 24).

The participation democratises the planning process, since it is the democratic right of citizens to participate. There is a danger in viewing participatory development as the magic pill that cure all the present development ills (Hofisi, Unknown: 72). Participation could be reduced to a window dressing, where power holders mask elite participation as community participation. The elite if left unchecked could actually become not only the champions of development but the only real beneficiaries of development meant for the ordinary members of the community.
Conclusion

One can conclude that even though an IDP is a legislated document and it is the best tool to have in each and every municipality. It has to be noted that it does have its short comings. It is really a best tool in that it speeds up service delivery, it promotes job creation and it involves everyone in planning but also not forgetting its shortscoming, given the fact that there is a backlog when it comes to infrastructure. It is not possible for this tool to solve infrastructural backlog as well as apartheid planning.
Chapter 5 - Research Findings and Recommendations

Introduction

This chapter presents the research findings based on four sections, namely: the biographical information of the participants, the participants’ knowledge about the IDP and the review mechanism, the participants’ knowledge on the key critical areas within the IDP document, the participants overall perspectives on the IDP and the way forward in terms of improving the situation. Lastly, this chapter presents the recommendations that will attempt to assist in terms of the future implementation of IDP moving forward.

A total number of 30 interviews were conducted in Motherwell township regarding the community members perspectives on the IDP. To be gender sensitive the above mentioned total number of 30 was divided into two, namely: 15 males and 15 females were interviewed.

The interviews were conducted in the following wards 23; 53; 55; 56 and 59. The interviews took 20 minutes and more some more than 20 minutes.
These interviews were mainly conducted in the homes of the participants. Some of the interviews were conducted in the offices of the councillors.

Most of the participants have been living in Motherwell for 8 to 30 years. The above mentioned duration gives a picture that the participants know Motherwell and its challenges. The participants in this study were coming from all walks of life. For example, the unemployed, general workers, retired politicians, the politicians and the professionals such as the teachers were interviewed.

Most of the females that participated in the study are students and that on its own is an indication that woman are empowering themselves through education. Also there are female professionals who participated. The males on the other hand are the majority and have a grade 12 or standard 10.

**The Research Findings**

Some of the findings observed and discovered from the people who participated in this study are as follows: The majority of the participants that were interviewed argued that the municipality does review its Integrated Development Plan (IDP). However, the minority of the respondents were not
aware as to whether the municipality review the IDP while others said that the municipality does not review its IDP.

It was also discovered that both males and females who had participated in the study did not have knowledge of the budget allocation which was provided annually for infrastructure development within Motherwell.

Further, the majority of the participants in this study know about the existence of the IDP document, however, they do not have access to the IDP document and this has created the lack of understanding of the IDP processes and what is entail within the IDP document. Those who have the IDP document are still grappling with high powered language or jargon within the IDP document.

On the question of the ward councillor, calling meetings after the IDP/Budget has been adopted, the response was no, from most of the respondents. Some responded yes, but the meeting was disrupted by the disgruntled members of the Branch Executive Committee (BEC) for example, this happened at ward 23.

Some respondents answered yes on that question but did not give details. The ward councillor did not inform the constituencies on the priorities that
have been budgeted. Some people did not know of the ward councillors’ responsibilities to inform its constituency on the priorities that have been budgeted on ward allocations.

Gender relations within the context of Motherwell remain a huge problem. There are males that still cling to patriarchal tendency of wanting to dominate in terms of ideas and look down upon the input made by women. Women themselves tend to undermine their abilities to compete equally with their male counterparts in matters pertaining to the implementation of IDP.

In light of the above, the notion of patriarchy in Motherwell township also remains a problem because there are still cultural stereotypes which relegates the role of women in society as sub-ordinates.

**Recommendations**

This section suggests some of the recommendations with the view of contributing towards the alleviation of IDP problems as well as adding value towards the improvement of IDP and service delivery. The suggested recommendations are as follows:
There is a great need for municipalities to change the mind-set by taking the bottom-up approach route instead of a top-down approach in implementing the IDP. For example, in the case of Motherwell township, the NMBM needs to set aside a budget to organise forums that will build the bridges between all important stakeholders with the view to include everyone in decision making.

There are mixed feelings about the review mechanism of IDP in Motherwell and therefore there is a great need to review the IDP document every three years with the view of keeping a constant check as to whether the implementation process is moving in the right direction and it is also in line with the modern trends.

Since there is a lack of knowledge of the IDP document in Motherwell. There is a great need to allocate a budget with the view to organise a series of workshops, meeting and conferences at various levels with the view to empower all the important stakeholders about the IDP.

The first recommended workshops in Motherwell must involve the ward councillors and other key municipality officials to discuss their understanding of IDP.
– The second recommended workshops in Motherwell must involve the members of the community to discuss their understanding of IDP.

– The third recommended workshops in Motherwell must involve both the ward councillors and the members of the community to discuss and build a relationship with the view of finding a common ground towards an understanding of IDP.

– There is a great need to organise the road shows in Motherwell with the view of empowering the elders, women and the youth about the IDP.

– Ward councillors’ in Motherwell need to form partnership with schools, churches, sport bodies, departments of education, health and other departments with the view of popularising the IDP.

– The Motherwell community is still grappling with the issue of gender relations between both the ward councillor’s structures and community structures need to be addressed as a matter of urgency.

– There is also a great need in Motherwell township to address the issues of cultural stereotypes as well as patriarchal dominance tendencies.
● Within the context of Motherwell township, there is a great need to translate the IDP document to isiXhosa with the view to make it accessible to all people.

● There is a great need to come up with strategies that will enhance service delivery with the view of addressing the problems which include among others, infrastructure development, unemployment and so on.

● There is a great need to put aside funding with the view of conducting further research on IDP and its implantation.
Chapter 5 - Conclusion

This concluding chapter briefly outlines what has been captured in all the chapters of this study. In conclusion, with the view to guide the reader, an attempt has been made in chapter 1 to briefly outline what it entails in all the chapters of this study. An attempt has also been made in chapter 2 to outline the historical background of the study and also provided a context in which the study is based. Further, an attempt has been made in chapter 3 to outline the research techniques that were utilized to gather data for this study.

To be in line with the conventional way of conducting research in social sciences, an attempt has been made in chapter 4 to outline the perspectives from scholars who previously wrote about the success and the challenges facing IDP in different places within the context of South Africa and beyond.
Since issues and challenges were raised in earlier chapters and an attempt has been made in chapter 5 to outline the research findings from the interviews. Lastly, recommendations are provided with the view that if they are being utilised properly they might contribute meaningfully towards addressing the problems and adding to policy improvement.
Glossary

ANC – African National Congress


BEC – Branch Executive Committee.

BOTTOM UP APPROACH - it is a process in which all stake holders are included when crucial decision is taken.

CAPITALISM – is an economic system in which natural resources, as well as the means of producing and distributing goods and services, are privately owned.

COMMUNITY - is a social group of any side whose members reside in a specific locality, share government, and often have a common cultural and historical heritage.
**CULTURE** - is a set of rules or standards shared by members of a society, which, when acted upon by the members, produce behaviour that falls within a range of variation the members consider proper and acceptable.

**DEMOCRACY** – is the rule of government by the people, leadership is democratically elected.

**DEVELOPMENT** – is the process of improving the quality of all human lives by raising people’s living levels such as their incomes, medical services, housing, education etc, through relevant economic growth process.

**FEMINISM** – it is the belief that women are equal to men and should be have equal rights and opportunities.

**GAD** – Gender and Development.

**GENDER** – is the elaborations and meanings assigned by cultures to the biological differentiations of sexes.

**IDP** – Integrated Development Plan.

**NMB** – Nelson Mandela Bay
NMMM – Nelson Mandela Metropolitan Municipality.

PATRIACHAL SOCIETY - it is a society where males dominate in terms of taking political, cultural and socio-economic decisions.

POLITICAL ECONOMY – is an attempt to merge economic analysis with practical politics, namely: to view economic activity in its political context.

RDP – Reconstruction and Development Program.

SOCIETY - it is a group of people who occupy a specific locality and who share common cultural traditions.

TOP DOWN APPROACH – it is a process where the authorities make crucial decision without involving people at the grass root level.

WID – Women in Development.
Bibliography


Haralambos, M and Holborn, M (1990) Sociology Themes And Perspectives; Harper Collins Publishers ; London’

Hofisi, C (Unknown) Criticizing Participatory Integrated Development Planning in the Eastern Cape.

http://www.cogta.gov.za (Downloaded 18/04/2013)

http://www2.lse.ac.uk/geographyAndEnvironment/research/Researchpapers/rp63.pdf (Downloaded on 27/05/2013)


http://www.academia.edu/384839/ Integrated Development Planning in South Africa. lessons from the Durars River Valley (Downloaded - 28/05/2013).

http://www.dag.org.za/does/research/6pdf (Downloaded - 28/05/2013).

(Downloaded -28/05/2013).


REQUEST FOR PERMISSION TO CONDUCT RESEARCH IN MOTHERWELL

Dear Chief Whip Searl

My name is Mzimkhulu Mlele, and I am a Master’s student in Development Studies student at the Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University in Port Elizabeth. The research I wish to conduct for my Master’s treatise involves Integrated Development Plan (IDP) e.g. “CHALLENGES FACING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF INTEGRATED DEVELOPMENT PLAN (IDP) 2013/2014 : THE CASE OF MOTHERWELL TOWNSHIP IN NELSON MANDELA BAY ”. This project will be conducted under the supervision of [Mr David Bogopa NMMU, South Africa]

I am hereby seeking your consent to visit Motherwell wards as well as ward councillors to provide participants for this particular project that I have mentioned above.

Upon completion of the study, I undertake to provide the Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality with a bound copy of the full research report. If you require any further information, please do not hesitate to contact me on [079 504 1024, fax (041) 505 4537 and email (mmlele@mandelametro.gov.za]. Thank you for your time and consideration in this matter.

Yours sincerely,

Mzimkhulu Maxwell Mlele
APPENDIX 2

INTERVIEW SCHEDULE

SECTION A

BIOGRAPHICAL INFORMATION

1. GENDER: MALE FEMALE
2. HOME LANGUAGE
3. SECTION IN MOTHERWELL
4. HIGHEST LEVEL OF EDUCATION
5. FOR HOW LONG HAVE YOU BEEN STAYING IN MOTHERWELL
6. OCCUPATION

SECTION B

1. DOES THE MUNICIPALITY REVIEW ITS IDP ANNUALLY?

...............................................................................................................................

...............................................................................................................................

...............................................................................................................................

2. DOES THE MUNICIPALITY CONDUCT PUBLIC PARTICIPATION SESSIONS (IF YES, DO THEY DO PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ACCORDING TO WARDS?)

...............................................................................................................................

...............................................................................................................................

...............................................................................................................................

3. ARE WARD COMMITTEES IN PLACE (IF YES, ARE THEY FUNCTIONAL)?

...............................................................................................................................

4. DO YOU KNOW HOW MUCH MONEY HAS BEEN ALLOCATED TO YOUR WARD FOR THE 2013/2014 FINANCIAL YEAR?
SECTION C

1. DO YOU KNOW THE FIRST FIVE PRIORITIES OF YOUR WARD LISTED IN THE IDP?

2. ARE THE FIRST FIVE PRIORITIES THAT ARE IN THE IDP IMPLEMENTED (IF YES, WHAT IS YOUR INVOLVEMENT)?

3. DID THE WARD COUNCILLOR CALL MEETINGS AFTER THE 2013/14 IDP AND BUDGET WAS ADOPTED BY THE COUNCIL?

4. DID THE WARD COUNCILLORS INFORM THE WARD ABOUT THE PRIORITIES THAT HAVE BEEN BUDGETED FOR?

SECTION D

1. IN YOUR OWN OPINION, HOW CAN THE NELSON MANDELA MUNICIPALITY ENSURE THAT ITS IDP AND BUDGET GET IMPLEMENTED IN MOTHERWELL?
2. Is the municipality doing enough in terms of creating awareness and informing communities on IDP and budget issues?

3. Are councillors aware of the consequences of not spending their ward budget allocation?

4. Are there any measures in place to monitor the implementation of the IDP budgeted priorities in Motherwell wards (if yes, please name a few)?