

# **THE TRANSITION OF RHODES UNIVERSITY GRADUATES INTO THE SOUTH AFRICAN LABOUR MARKET: A CASE STUDY OF THE 2010 COHORT**

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

MASTER OF SOCIAL SCIENCE

Of

RHODES UNIVERSITY

By

KANYISO LUNGANI NTIKINCA

Supervisor: Professor Gilton Klerck

December 2014

## **ABSTRACT**

Recent studies have shown that graduates from historically White universities (HWUs) experience better labour market outcomes than graduates from historically Black universities (HBUs). This is a result of the legacy of apartheid which promoted racial inequality in all spheres of South African society, more especially in higher education and the labour market. Post-1994, government dedicated large amounts for the restructuring of the higher education sector of South Africa in order to level out the playing field. However, graduates from HWUs still experience better labour market success than graduates from HBUs. That said, there is limited information about the labour market outcomes and experiences of graduates from a former White university (especially graduates from Rhodes University). Therefore, the central aim of this dissertation is to show that graduates from a historically White university (Rhodes University) experience varying and unequal outcomes in the South African labour market on account of (among other factors) their chosen fields of study, race and sex. This study is informed by the heterodox labour market approach, which is partly inspired by the critical realist account of the labour market. As a result, this theoretical framework allowed the researcher to use the Labour Market Segmentation (LMS) theory as a tool to inform this analysis. The study has adopted a quantitative survey design and has incorporated some of the key methodological lessons learned from the collection of international graduate tracer studies. The findings from this study indicated that ‘field of study’ is a strong determiner of the outcomes of Rhodes graduates in the labour market. This was visible in the persistence of a skills bias towards commerce and science graduates. Evidently, even when we controlled for race and sex, graduates from the commerce and science faculties experience better labour market outcomes than humanities graduates. This is a result of a skills biased South African economy, which has a higher demand for certain skills over others. However, the findings from this study also show evidence of pre-labour market discrimination and inequality (based on race and sex) in the supply-side institutions such as the family, schooling and university. The findings also show continuities and discontinuities of labour market discrimination (based on race and sex) in the outcomes of Rhodes graduates in the South African labour market. More importantly, this dissertation indicates that Rhodes graduates experience varying outcomes in the labour market as a result of (among other factors) their chosen fields of study, race and sex.

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

First of all, I would like to thank God Almighty for giving me the opportunity and strength to conduct this research. Secondly, I would like to thank my family and friends for their encouragement and support throughout the period of this dissertation. Thirdly, I would like to thank Professor Gilton-Georg Klerck for his invaluable academic guidance and supervision during the last two years. I would also like to thank the Neil Aggett Labour Studies Unit (NALSU) for their financial assistance which funded this study. However, the opinions expressed and the conclusions arrived at, are those of the author and are not to be necessarily attributed to Rhodes University or the donor. Finally I would like to thank Professor Robert van Niekerk, Dr John Reynolds and Dr Michael Rogan, who are based at the Institute of Social and Economic Research (ISER) and the Neil Aggett Labour Studies Unit, for their consistent support throughout the period of this dissertation. To God be the glory.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>ABSTRACT</b> .....	ii
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</b> .....	iii
<b>LIST OF ACRONYMS</b> .....	xii
<b>LIST OF TABLES</b> .....	11
<b>CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION</b> .....	18
1.1 CONTEXT .....	18
1.2 MOTIVATION FOR THE STUDY .....	19
1.3 STRUCTURE OF THE DISSERTATION .....	23
 <b>CHAPTER TWO: A HETERODOX LABOUR MARKET APPROACH TO THE STUDY OF GRADUATES IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN LABOUR MARKET</b> .....	 26
2.1 INTRODUCTION .....	26
2.2 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK .....	27
2.2.1 CRITICAL REALISM .....	27
2.2.2 ORTHODOX APPROACHES .....	30
2.2.3 CRITIQUE OF THE ORTHODOX APPROACHES .....	32
2.2.4 HETERODOX APPROACHES.....	33
2.3 EMPLOYABILITY AND THE CHANGING LABOUR MARKET .....	36
2.3.1 INTERNATIONAL RESEARCH ON GRADUATE EMPLOYABILITY.....	41
2.4 HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT .....	43
2.4.1 HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT IN APARTHEID SOUTH AFRICA .....	45
2.4.2 HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT IN POST-APARTHEID SOUTH AFRICA .....	48
2.5 CHALLENGES IN THE POST-SECONDARY SCHOOL LANDSCAPE IN SOUTH AFRICA.....	50
2.5.1 ACCESS TO HIGHER EDUCATION.....	50
2.5.2 POOR QUALITY OF FIRST-YEAR ADMISSIONS INTO TERTIARY EDUCATION.....	52
2.5.3 LOW GRADUATION RATE.....	54
2.6 GRADUATE TRACER STUDIES IN SOUTH AFRICA .....	56
2.6.1 THE POST-APARTHEID GRADUATE EMPLOYMENT DEBATE .....	56

2.7 INFLUENTIAL FACTORS IN THE LABOUR MARKET DESTINATIONS OF RECENT UNIVERSITY GRADUATES IN SOUTH AFRICA .....	59
2.7.1 RACE .....	60
2.7.2 SEX .....	61
2.7.3 HISTORICALLY WHITE UNIVERSITIES VERSUS HISTORICALLY BLACK UNIVERSITIES.....	63
2.7.4 FIELD OF STUDY .....	65
2.7.5 GEORGRAPHICAL LOCATION .....	66
2.7.6 PERSONAL CONTACTS .....	67
2.7.7 AGE AND WORK EXPERIENCE .....	68
2.8 CONCLUSION .....	69

### **CHAPTER THREE: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY .....70**

3.1 INTRODUCTION .....	70
3.2 CONTEXT .....	71
3.3 SAMPLING .....	72
3.3.1 IDENTIFYING THE TYPE OF INFORMATION AVAILABLE ON GRADUATES.....	73
3.3.2 DETERMINING THE QUANTITY AND QUALITY OF GRADUATE DATABASE .....	73
3.3.3 SELECTING THE SAMPLE FRAME .....	73
3.3.4 FINALISING THE METHOD OF DATA COLLECTION .....	74
3.3.5 SAMPLE SIZE .....	74
3.4 RESPONSE RATES .....	76
3.5 THE QUESTIONNAIRE .....	76
3.6 DATA COLLECTION, CAPTURING AND CODING .....	77
3.7 DATA ANALYSIS .....	77
3.8 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS AND DATA STORAGE .....	78

### **CHAPTER FOUR: DEMOGRAPHICS AND SOCIO-ECONOMIC PROFILE OF GRADUATES.....79**

4.1INTRODUCTION.....	79
4.2 RACIAL, SEX, NATIONALITY AND AGE OF PARTICIPANTS.....	80
4.2.1 RACIAL COMPOSITION OF THE 2010 COHORT OF RHODES GRADUATES.....	80
4.2.2 GENDER AND RACIAL COMPOSITION OF THE 2010 COHORT OF RHODES GRADUATES.....	81

4.2.3	NATIONALITY OF THE 2010 COHORT OF RHODES GRADUATES.....	82
4.2.4	AGE OF THE 2010 COHORT OF RHODES GRADUATES .....	83
4.3	HOME PROVINCES, PROVINCES OF SCHOOLING AND PROVINCES WHERE RHODES GRADUATES ARE CURRENTLY LIVING IN.....	83
4.3.1	HOME PROVINCE .....	84
4.3.2	PROVINCES OF SCHOOLING .....	85
4.3.3	PROVINCES IN WHICH RHODES GRADUATES ARE CURRENTLY RESIDING.....	86
4.4	TYPE OF HIGH SCHOOL ATTENDED .....	87
4.5	PARENT'S EDUCATION.....	90
4.5.1	HIGHEST LEVEL OF EDUCATION OF FATHER/MALE GUARDIAN.....	91
4.5.2	HIGHEST LEVEL OF EDUCATION OF MOTHER/FEMALE GUARDIAN.....	93
4.6	PARENT'S INCOME.....	95
4.6.1	FATHERS'/MALE GUARDIANS' INCOME.....	96
4.6.2	MOTHERS'/FEMALE GUARDIANS' INCOME.....	98
4.7	BROTHERS OR SISTERS WHO ARE GRADUATES.....	100
4.8	CONCLUSION.....	101
 <b>CHAPTER FIVE: TRANSITION FROM SCHOOL TO UNIVERSITY.....</b>		<b>103</b>
5.1	INTRODUCTION.....	103
5.2	CHOICE OF UNIVERSITY.....	103
5.3	FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE.....	105
5.3.1	PARENTS/GUARDIANS.....	105
5.3.2	BURSARY FROM UNIVERSITY.....	106
5.3.3	NATIONAL STUDENT FINANCIAL AID SCHEME.....	107
5.3.4	BANK LOAN .....	108
5.3.5	SELF-FUNDED.....	109
5.4	WORK WHIST STUDYING.....	110
5.5	GRADUATION, BY FACULTY.....	112
5.6	POST GRADUATION.....	114

5.6.1 GRADUATES WHO ACHIEVED A FURTHER QUALIFICATION.....	115
5.7GRADUATES WHO ARE CURRENTLY ENROLLED FOR FURTHER QUALIFICATION .....	118
5.8 CONCLUSION.....	120

## **CHAPTER SIX: TRANSITION INTO THE LABOUR MARKET\_.....121**

6.1 INTRODUCTION.....	121
6.2 EMPLOYMENT STATUS .....	121
6.3 MEANS OF FINDING EMPLOYMENT .....	131
6.3.1 PRIVATE EMPLOYMENT AGENCY .....	131
6.3.2 RELATIVES .....	133
6.3.3 SOCIAL MEDIA .....	135
6.3.4 PERSONAL CONTACTS .....	137
6.3.5 NEWSPAPER ADVERTISEMENTS.....	139
6.3.6 MAKING TELEPHONE, EMAIL, FAX ENQUIRES AT ORGANIZATION.....	141
6.4 TYPE OF EMPLOYMENT.....	144
6.5 PERIOD SEARCHING FOR CURRENT EMPLOYMENT .....	151
6.6 FACTORS THAT INFLUENCED GRADUATES TO SECURE THEIR CURRENT EMPLOYMENT .....	155
6.6.1 QUALIFICATION INFLUENCED GETTING A JOB .....	155
6.6.2 ABILITY TO SPEAK INFLUENCED GETTING A JOB .....	157
6.6.3 REFERENCES INFLUENCED GETTING A JOB .....	159
6.6.4 PERSONAL CONTACTS INFLUENCED GETTING A JOB .....	161
6.7MONTHLY INCOME .....	163
6.8 WORK APPROPRIATE AND RELATED TO QUATIFICATION .....	169
6.8.1 WORK APPROPRIATEFOR LEVEL OF EDUCATION .....	169
6.8.2 WORK RELATED TO QUALIFICATION .....	172
6.9 LEVELS OF JOB SATISFACTION.....	175
6.9.1 SATISFIED WITH NATURE OF WORK .....	176
6.9.2 SATISFIED WITH WORKING CONDITIONS .....	179

6.9.3	SATISFIED WITH JOB SECURITY .....	182
6.9.4	SATISFIED WITH THE OPPORTUNITY TO USE KNOWLEDGE AND SKILLS.....	185
6.9.5	SATISFIED WITH INCOME .....	188
6.9.6	SATISFIED WITH THE OPPORTUNITY TO LEARN .....	192
6.9.7	CONCLUSION .....	196

## **CHAPTER 7: DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION .....198**

7.1	INTRODUCTION .....	198
7.2	THE STATE .....	200
7.3	SEGMENTED SUPPLY OF LABOUR .....	201
7.3.1	THE FAMILY .....	202
7.3.2	SCHOOLING .....	204
7.3.3	UNIVERSITY STUDY .....	204
7.4	SEGMENTED DEMAND OF LABOUR .....	207
7.4.1	EMPLOYMENT STATUS .....	209
7.4.2	SECTOR OF EMPLOYMENT .....	211
7.4.3	TYPE OF EMPLOYMENT .....	213
7.4.4	METHOD OF LOCATING EMPLOYMENT .....	214
7.4.5	PERIOD SEARCHING FOR EMPLOYMENT .....	217
7.4.6	MONTHLY INCOME .....	218
7.4.7	WORK APPROPROATE AND RELATED TO QUALIFICATION .....	219
7.4.8	LEVELS OF JOB SATIAFACTION .....	222
7.5	CONCLUSION .....	226
	<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY .....</b>	<b>228</b>

## LIST OF ACRONYMS

CATI	Computer-assisted telephone interviewing
CDE	Centre for Development and Enterprise
CESM	South African Classification of Educational Subject Matter
CHE	Council on Higher Education
CHEC	Cape Higher Education Consortium
CREST	Centre for Research on Evaluation, Science and Technology
CSV	Comma Separated Values
DEDEA	Department of Economic Development and Environmental Affairs
DHET	Department of Higher Education and Training
DMU	Data Management Unit
DOE	Department of Education
DPRU	Development Policy Research Unit
FET	Further Education and Training
HBU	Historically Black University
HEMIS	Higher Education Information Management System
HESA	Higher Education South Africa
HRD	Human Resource Development
HWU	Historically White University
ICT	Information Communication and Technology
ILO	International Labour Organization

ISER	Institute of Social and Economic Research
LMIP	Labour Market Intelligence System
LMS	Labour Market Segmentation
NALSU	Neil Aggett Labour Studies Unit
NCHE	National Council for Higher Education
NEET	Not in Education, Employment, or Training
NIH	National Institute of Health
NQF	National Qualifications Framework
NSFAS	National Student Financial Aid Scheme
NSDS	National Skills Development Strategy
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
RU	Rhodes University
SAQA	South African Qualifications Authority
SET	Science, Engineering and Technology
STATSSA	Statistics South Africa
UK	United Kingdom
USA	United States of America

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1: Methods and response rates from national South African graduate tracer studies .....	74
Table 4.1: Racial composition of respondents .....	80
Table 4.2: Sex of respondents .....	81
Table 4.3: Sex and racial composition of respondents .....	81
Table 4.4: Nationality of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduate .....	82
Table 4.5: Nationality of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates by race .....	82
Table 4.6: Age of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates .....	83
Table 4.7: Home provinces.....	84
Table 4.8: Home provinces by race .....	84
Table 4.9: Provinces of schooling .....	85
Table 4.10: Provinces in which Rhodes graduates are currently residing .....	86
Table 4.11: Provinces in which Rhodes graduates are currently residing by race .....	86
Table 4.12: Type of high school attended .....	87
Table 4.13: Type of high school attended by race .....	88
Table 4.14: Highest level of education of father/male guardian .....	89
Table 4.15: Highest level of education of father/male guardian by race .....	91
Table 4.16: Highest level of education of mother/female guardian .....	91
Table 4.17: Highest level of education of mother/female guardian by race .....	93
Table 4.18: Fathers’/male guardians’ income .....	93
Table 4.19: Fathers’/male guardians’ income by race .....	97
Table 4.20: Mothers’/female guardians’ income .....	98
Table 4.21: Mothers’/female guardians’ income by race .....	99
Table 4.22: Siblings who are graduates .....	100
Table 4.23: Siblings who are graduates by race .....	100

Table 5.1: First choice university .....	104
Table 5.2: Parents/guardians .....	105
Table 5.3: Parents/guardians by race .....	106
Table 5.4: Bursary from university .....	106
Table 5.5: Bursary from university by race .....	107
Table 5.6: National Student Financial Aid Scheme .....	107
Table 5.7: National Student Financial Aid Scheme by race .....	108
Table 5.8: Bank loan .....	108
Table 5.9: Bank loan by race .....	109
Table 5.10: Self-funded .....	109
Table 5.11: Self-funded by race .....	109
Table 5.12: Extra work whilst studying .....	111
Table 5.13: Extra work whilst studying by race .....	111
Table 5.14: Extra work whilst studying by sex .....	112
Table: 5.15: Faculty .....	113
Table 5.16: Faculty by race .....	113
Table 5.17: Faculty by sex .....	114
Table 5.18: Graduates who achieved a further qualification .....	115
Table 5.19: Graduates who achieved a further qualification by faculty .....	115
Table 5.20: Graduates who achieved further qualification by race .....	116
Table 5.21: Graduates who achieved a further qualification, by faculty by sex .....	117
Table 5.22: Graduates currently enrolled for further study .....	118
Table 5.23: Graduates currently enrolled for further study by faculty .....	118
Table 5.24: Graduates currently enrolled for further study by race .....	119
Table 5.25: Graduates currently enrolled for further study by sex .....	119
Table 6.1: Employment status .....	122
Table 6.2: Employment status by faculty .....	123
Table 6.3: Employment status by race .....	124

Table 6.4: Employment status of Black graduates by faculty .....	125
Table 6.5: Employment status by faculty (White graduates) .....	126
Table 6.6: Employment status by sex .....	127
Table 6.7: Employment status of male graduates by faculty .....	128
Table 6.8: Employment status of male graduates in humanities by race .....	129
Table 6.9: Employment status of female graduates by faculty .....	129
Table 6.10: Employment status of females in commerce faculty by race .....	130
Table 6.11: Private employment agency .....	131
Table: 6.12: Private employment agency by faculty .....	131
Table: 6.13: Private employment agency by race .....	132
Table: 6.14: Private employment agency by sex .....	133
Table 6.15: Relatives .....	133
Table 6.16: Relatives by faculty .....	134
Table 6.17: Relatives by race .....	134
Table 6.18: Relatives by sex .....	135
Table 6.19: Social media .....	135
Table 6.20: Social media by faculty .....	136
Table 6.21: Social media by race .....	136
Table 6.22: Social media by sex .....	137
Table 6.23: Personal contacts .....	137
Table 6.24: Personal contacts by faculty .....	138
Table 6.25: Personal contacts by race .....	138
Table 6.26: Personal contacts by sex .....	139
Table 6.27: Newspaper advertisements .....	140
Table 6.28: Newspaper advertisements by faculty .....	140
Table 6.29: Newspaper advertisements by race .....	140
Table 6.30: Newspaper advertisements by sex .....	141
Table 6.31: Telephone, email or fax enquires to prospective employers .....	142

Table 6.32: Telephone, email or fax enquires to prospective employers by faculty .....	142
Table 6.33: Telephone, email or fax enquires to prospective employers by race .....	143
Table 6.34: Telephone, email or fax enquires to prospective employers by sex .....	143
Table 6.35: Type of employment .....	145
Table 6.36: Type of employment by faculty .....	146
Table 6.37: Type of employment by race .....	146
Table 6.38: Type of employment of Black graduates by faculty .....	157
Table 6.39: Type of employment of White graduates by faculty .....	148
Table 6.40: Type of employment by sex .....	149
Table 6.41: Type of employment of male graduates by faculty .....	149
Table 6.42: Type of employment of female graduates by faculty .....	150
Table 6.43: Period searching for current employment .....	151
Table 6.44: Period searching for current employment by faculty .....	151
Table 6.45: Period searching for current employment by race .....	152
Table 6.46: period searching for current employment (White graduates by faculty) .....	152
Table 6.47: period searching for current employment (Black graduates) .....	153
Table 6.48: Period searching for current employment by sex .....	153
Table 6.49: period searching for current employment (female graduates by faculty) .....	154
Table 6.50: period searching for current employment (male graduates by faculty) .....	154
Table 6.51: Qualification influenced getting job .....	155
Table 6.52: Qualification influenced getting job by faculty .....	156
Table 6.53: Qualification influenced getting job by race .....	156
Table 6.54: Qualification influenced getting job by sex .....	157
Table 6.55: Language proficiency influenced getting a job .....	157
Table 6.56: Language proficiency influenced getting job by faculty .....	158
Table 6.57: Language proficiency influenced getting job by race .....	158
Table 6.58: Language proficiency influenced getting job by sex .....	159
Table 6.59: References influenced getting a job .....	159

Table 6.60: References influenced getting job by faculty .....	160
Table 6.61: References influenced getting job by race .....	160
Table 6.62: References influenced getting job by sex .....	161
Table 6.63: Personal contacts influenced getting a job .....	161
Table 6.64: Personal contacts influenced getting job by faculty .....	162
Table 6.65: Personal contacts influenced getting job by race .....	162
Table 6.66: Personal contacts influenced getting job by sex .....	163
Table 6.67: Monthly income .....	164
Table 6.68: Monthly income by faculty .....	165
Table 6.69: Monthly income by race .....	166
Table 6.70: Monthly income of Black graduates by faculty .....	167
Table 6.71: Monthly income by sex .....	167
Table 6.72: Monthly income of female graduates by faculty .....	168
Table 6.73: Work appropriate for level of education .....	169
Table 6.74: Work appropriate for level of education by faculty .....	169
Table 6.75: Work appropriate for level of education by race .....	170
Table 6.76: Black graduates' work appropriate for level of education by faculty .....	171
Table 6.77: Work appropriate for level of education by sex .....	171
Table 6.78: Male graduates' work appropriate for level of education by faculty .....	172
Table 6.79: Work related to qualification .....	172
Table 6.80: Work related to qualification by faculty .....	173
Table 6.81: Work related to qualification by race .....	173
Table 6.82: White graduates' work related to qualifications by faculty .....	174
Table 6.83: Work related to qualification by sex .....	174
Table 6.84: Male graduates' work related to qualifications by faculty .....	175
Table 6.85: Satisfied with nature of work .....	176
Table 6.86: Satisfied with nature of work by faculty .....	176
Table 6.87: Satisfied with nature of work by race .....	177

Table 6.88: White graduates satisfied with the nature of their work by faculty .....	177
Table 6.89: Satisfied with nature of work by sex .....	178
Table 6.90: Male graduates satisfied with the nature of their work by faculty .....	178
Table 6.91: Satisfied with working conditions .....	179
Table 6.92: Satisfied with working conditions by faculty .....	179
Table 6.93: Satisfied with working conditions by race .....	180
Table 6.94: White graduates satisfied with their working conditions by faculty .....	181
Table 6.95: Satisfied with working conditions by sex .....	181
Table 6.96: Male graduates satisfied with their working conditions by faculty .....	182
Table 6.97: Satisfied with job security .....	182
Table 6.98: Satisfied with job security by faculty .....	182
Table 6.99: Satisfied with job security by race .....	183
Table 7.1: White graduates satisfied with job security by faculty .....	184
Table 7.2: Satisfied with job security by sex .....	184
Table 7.3: male graduates satisfied with job security by faculty .....	185
Table 7.4: Satisfied with the opportunity to use knowledge and skills .....	185
Table 7.5: Satisfied with the opportunity to use knowledge and skills by faculty .....	185
Table 7.6: Satisfied with the opportunity to use knowledge and skills by race .....	186
Table 7.7: Black graduates satisfied with the opportunity to use knowledge and skills by faculty.....	187
Table 7.8: Satisfied with the opportunity to use knowledge and skills by sex .....	187
Table 7.9: Male graduates satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills by faculty .....	188
Table 7.10: Satisfied with income .....	188
Table 7.11: Satisfied with income by faculty .....	189
Table 7.12: Satisfied with income by race .....	189
Table 7.13: White graduates satisfied with income by faculty .....	190
Table 7.14: Satisfied with income by sex .....	191

Table 7.15: Male graduates satisfied with income by faculty .....	191
Table 7.16: Satisfied with the opportunity to learn .....	192
Table 7.17: Satisfied with the opportunity to learn by faculty .....	192
Table 7.18: Satisfied with the opportunity to learn by race .....	193
Table 7.19: White graduates satisfied with opportunity to learn by faculty .....	194
Table 7.20: Satisfied with the opportunity to learn, by sex .....	194
Table 7.21: Male graduates satisfied with opportunity to learn by faculty .....	195

# **CHAPTER ONE**

## **INTRODUCTION**

### **1.1 CONTEXT OF THE STUDY**

Employment trends since the transition from apartheid are a function of a variety of factors, such as structural changes in the composition of output as well as demand shifts within industries (see Bhorat, Hodge and Dieden, 1998; Edwards, 2001; Dunne and Edwards, 2006). Key changes include declining primary sector employment, increasing tertiary sector employment, and an increasingly large public sector employment role. The losers have been less skilled workers while the winners, invariably, have been better educated, skilled workers. This trend has been exacerbated by global economic interactions such as increased trade, global competition and technological spill overs (see Edwards, 2001; Bhorat, Hodge and Dieden, 1998). Within the context of a globalising workforce, high levels of youth unemployment, the growing demand for capital intensive products and the expansion of high skill sectors (often at the expense of low skill sectors), graduate tracer studies have come to be an important tool for understanding how new entrants to the labour market are adapting to these changes.

Internationally, such studies have been used to explore the transition from university to work as well as to investigate the role of institutions of higher education in meeting the demands of the labour market (see Teichler, 1999, 2007; Schomburg, 2007). In South Africa, there has been renewed interest in graduate employment and, more broadly, the role of higher education in addressing both high levels of youth unemployment and a perceived skills gap (see Kruss, 2004). To date, most work (DPRU, 2006; Pauw, Oosthuizen and van der Westhuizen, 2006; van der Berg and van Broekhuizen, 2012) on graduate labour market outcomes or the returns to tertiary education, more generally, have used nationally representative Labour Force Surveys, but there have now also been a handful of studies which have traced graduates from institutions of higher education to the labour market (Cosser, 2003; Moleke, 2005; Letseka, Breier and Visser, 2010; CHEC, 2013). Graduate tracer or destination studies provide critical information on labour market outcomes and the factors which are associated with these characteristics.

Labour Force Surveys paint a broad picture of employment and unemployment at the national level, but they are not always able to provide detailed information on smaller population groups such as university graduates (see van Broekhuizen, 2013). While graduate tracer studies have been used for a range of different objectives, one of their key strengths is that they can provide valuable information at the institutional level (see Teichler, 1999, 2007; Schomburg, 2007). So, while they are often not regionally or nationally representative, tracer studies are well placed to identify how particular institutions serve their graduates and how they align with the demands of the labour market (Teichler, 2007).

Rhodes University has lagged behind in terms of tracing the movement of their graduates into the labour market. It is this gap in knowledge that partly inspired the conception of this dissertation. This dissertation forms part of a larger graduate tracer study conducted by the Neil Aggett Labour Studies Unit (NALSU) and borrows some elements of the research methodology from this study. The resources to conduct this study were also made available at NALSU. However, this dissertation differs from the broader tracer study conducted by NALSU on a number of levels. Firstly, it takes the form of a case study tracing the 2010 cohort of graduates from Rhodes University. Secondly, this dissertation is not confined to the graduates based in the Eastern Cape, but it follows Rhodes University graduates into the South African labour market as a whole. Finally, this dissertation will not only present empirical data of the graduate outcomes, but will also discuss the empirical data in the context of the relevant theoretical framework.

## **1.2 MOTIVATION FOR THE STUDY**

Recent studies have shown that graduates from HWUs enjoy better labour market success than graduates from HBUs (see Moleke, 2005; CHEC, 2013; Van Broekhuizen, 2013). These findings are an indication of the enduring legacy of apartheid which created inequalities between HWUs and HBUs. This inequality was manifested through the unequal provision of academic resources, teaching staff and many other variables which are fundamental for the successful functioning of a university. HWUs had an added advantage in all these areas and also had strong connections to the labour market. Employers viewed HWUs as institutions which produced the best qualified and most competent graduates, whilst they viewed graduates from HBUs as inferior or less competent.

These discriminatory perceptions held by many employers in South Africa influenced the unequal labour market outcomes of graduates from HWUs and graduates from HBUs. Employers favoured graduates from HWUs and this trend is evident in the new South Africa. That is why, today, graduates from HWUs enjoy better labour market success than graduates from HBUs (see Moleke, 2005; CHEC, 2013; Van Broekhuizen, 2013). That said, there are very few studies focusing solely on the outcomes and experiences of graduates from a single HWU (that is, comparing graduates from a HWU against each other according to field of study, race and sex).

This thesis, however, is focusing solely on Rhodes graduates because Rhodes University is not only a HWU but is also one of South Africa's outstanding universities with a reputation as a 'scholarly university' (Badat, 2012). Located in Grahamstown in the Eastern Cape province of South Africa, Rhodes University was established 1904 and is a public English-medium university, predominantly offering contact undergraduate degrees. The University offers an extensive range of undergraduate and postgraduate degrees in the faculties of Humanities, Science, and Commerce. Rhodes University can be characterised as an institution specialising in the academic and professional disciplines within the humanities and social sciences (Chambers, 2010). The university does, however, offer vocational qualifications in Pharmacy, Law, Accounting, Journalism and Education (Chambers, 2010).

The demographics at Rhodes University are continually changing, as more individuals from previously disadvantaged population groups are enrolling at the University. For example, in 2002, White students constituted more than half of Rhodes' total headcount (52 percent) and African students 36 per cent (Chambers, 2010). The situation was quite different in 2013 with Black student enrolments constituting 51 per cent (including international African students) and White students 42 per cent, whilst Indian/Asians and Coloureds constituted 4 per cent and 3 per cent respectively (Rhodes University, 2013). This shows that there is an increase of Black student enrolments at Rhodes University. Rhodes University is the smallest university in the country with approximately 7,267 students enrolled in 2013, 1,614 of whom were first-year students (Kynaston, 2013). Although it is a small university, Rhodes enjoys the distinction of having among the best undergraduate pass and graduation rates in South Africa, outstanding postgraduate success rates, and the best research output per academic staff member. Rhodes is internationally recognized and has a good reputation amongst many of South Africa's top employers (see Chambers, 2010; Badat,

2012). However, the labour market outcomes of graduates from HWUs are not homogenous and are prone to vary and be unequal. This line of thinking is promoted by the heterodox labour market approach, which is grounded on critical realism. The heterodox approach rejects the orthodox labour market approach, which proposes that labour market outcomes are governed by the orthodox laws of supply and demand. The orthodox approach fails to recognize that labour markets are open systems and that there are geographical, social, economic and political factors which influence the outcomes of graduates in the labour market (see Lawson, 2006; Fleetwood, 2008). These factors make it impossible for graduates to experience homogenous outcomes in the labour market, even if they graduated from a HWU with a good reputation and strong labour market connections.

Inspired by the heterodox labour market approach, this dissertation seeks to show that graduates from a HWU do experience varying and unequal outcomes in the South African labour market, based on (among other factors) their chosen fields of study, race and sex. However, the study also examined a collection of ancillary themes which fed the broader research question. The study traced the socio-economic backgrounds, schooling and also highlighted the different experiences of the graduates throughout their university study. This is very important, because even if the majority of Rhodes graduates come from higher income households, there are inequalities that exist and these inequalities influence their journey from high school to university and ultimately into the labour market.

More importantly the study also examined the transitions made by these graduates into the labour market. It did this by analysing various themes such as: whether they had achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014 or whether they were still enrolled for further study; their employment status, incomes; sectors of employment; means of finding and securing their current employment; number of months searching for their current employment; factors which influenced them to secure their current employment; whether their jobs were appropriate or related to their qualifications and also examine their levels of job satisfaction. The study also looked at those graduates who were unemployed to determine: the length of their unemployment; the reasons for being unemployed and how they supported themselves. Throughout the analysis of the various themes, fields of study, race and sex were controlled in order determine whether graduates from a

HWU experienced varying and unequal labour market outcomes and experiences. A similar study was conducted by Chambers (2010) focusing mainly on the value of a Rhodes University degree in securing employment in the South African labour market. The study showed that Rhodes University's reputation appeared to serve graduates well in the job market. Reputation was cited by graduates who had found employment as being a factor which might have influenced their success in gaining employment. Graduates, whether employed or not, largely felt that having a Rhodes University degree was beneficial as it was considered to be of a high quality and provided them with the knowledge required by the labour market (Chambers, 2010). However, this study did not examine the differential experiences and outcomes of Rhodes University graduates in the labour market. The Chambers (2010) study left many unanswered questions and opened the door for this research. It did not examine the different socio-economic backgrounds and schooling of the Rhodes graduates. The Chambers (2010) study also did not analyse their transition from high school into university and experiences throughout their university years. All these factors are important as they play an influential role in the labour market outcomes of graduates (CHEC, 2013). The Chambers (2010) study merely highlighted a transition period of six months between leaving university and reporting on employment. It did this through the administration of a first-job destination survey administered at the 2009 Graduation Ceremonies held in Grahamstown. This period is too short to gain an in-depth look at the dynamics of the graduate labour market of South Africa. This dissertation, however, traced graduates who had been in the labour market at least four to five years. A lot can happen within this number of years in the labour market, and this study seeks to highlight the labour market outcomes and experiences of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates in those four/five years. Finally, Chambers (2010) did not explore the research findings at a deeper level. The study merely highlighted the value of a Rhodes University degree in the labour market and provided statistical findings on a number of graduates who were employed, unemployed and those graduates who were studying further. This dissertation, however, seeks to show that even though Rhodes University caters mostly to the middle class youth and has a good reputation in the labour market, the experiences and outcomes of the graduates are not similar and there are a number of reasons for this. This study seeks to highlight these differences and inequalities and to explain why these difference/inequalities occur using the heterodox theoretical framework.

### **1.3 STRUCTURE OF THE THESIS**

The structure of the thesis is as follows. Chapter One provides a contextual overview of the thesis and outlines the purpose of the research and the way in which the respective topics will be analysed. Chapter Two consists of a comprehensive review of the literature that is relevant to the research topic. This chapter begins with a discussion of the broad theoretical framework informing the dissertation. This is followed by an analysis of the literature dealing with the various sub-topics related to the main research topic. These sub-topics include: employability, Human Resource Development (HRD), the pre-1994 South African labour market, the post-apartheid labour market and the challenges in the post-secondary school landscape in South Africa. This is followed by a core section analysing graduate tracer studies (conducted in South Africa) and literature on recent trends in graduate employment and unemployment in post-apartheid South Africa.

Chapter Three describes the research design and methodology of the study. This chapter begins with a brief overview of the theoretical framework and context of the study. This is followed by a section on sampling, which covers the milestones and steps taken in finalizing the sample. These milestones included identifying the type of information available on graduates, determining the quantity and quality of graduate database, selecting the sample frame, finalising the method of data collection, and finalizing the sample size. The section on sampling is followed by a description of various components of the research methodology. The components that were taken into consideration include response rates, the questionnaire, data collection, capturing and coding, data analysis structure, ethical considerations, and data storage.

The final section of the thesis is dedicated to the analysis of data and is divided into four chapters. Chapter Four is dedicated to the demographics and socio-economic background of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates. The demographics section of this chapter describes the race, sex, age and nationality of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates. The socio-economic section of this chapter deals with the type of high school attended, the home provinces, the provinces of schooling and the provinces where the Rhodes graduates were currently located.

The socio-economic section of this chapter also deals with the parents'/guardians' highest levels of education, the parents'/guardians' income and whether the Rhodes graduates had siblings who

were also graduates. The demographics and socio-economic factors are very important, as they directly affect the outcomes of graduates in the labour market and this is revealed in later chapters.

Chapter Five is dedicated to the transitions made by the graduates from high school to university. This chapter deals with factors such as university choice, financial assistance, work whilst studying, graduates according to faculty, graduates who achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014, and those graduates who were enrolled for further study. The factors dealt with in this chapter also played an influential role in the outcomes of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates in the South African labour market.

Chapter Six is dedicated to the transitions made by the 2010 Rhodes graduates into the labour market. This chapter discusses the employment status of the graduates, their means of finding current employment, types of employment, number of months searching for current employment, factors that helped graduates to secure their current employment, monthly incomes, whether their work is appropriate for their level of education, whether their work is related to their qualifications, levels of job satisfaction and unemployed graduates.

Chapter Seven is the discussion and conclusion chapter. This chapter analyses the data from the interviews within the context of the theoretical framework. The chapter begins with a revision of the heterodox labour market approach, which is grounded in critical realism, which recognizes the segmented labour market theory. This revision of the theoretical framework sets the tone for the entire chapter as the different themes and findings from the study are analysed within the context of the relevant theoretical framework and literature. The first theme analysed is the demographics and socio-economic backgrounds, which includes race, gender, age, nationality, type of schooling, provinces of schooling, home provinces, provinces where graduates were currently living, parents highest level of education, parents income and whether graduates had siblings who are graduates. The second theme analysed is the transition from high school into university, which includes choice of university, financial assistance, extra work whilst studying, graduation by faculty, whether graduates achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014 or whether graduates were currently enrolled for further study.

The last theme analysed is the transition into the labour market which includes employment status, type of employment, number of months searching for employment, means of finding current

employment, factors which influenced graduates to secure their current employment, monthly income, whether graduates were employed in work which was appropriate for their level of education or related to their qualifications, levels of job satisfaction and unemployed graduates. All these themes are discussed in the context of the heterodox labour market approach which points to the segmented nature of labour markets. Basically this chapter seeks to show that the findings from the study are a reflection of the segmented nature of the South African labour market, and that graduates from HWUs are not immune to this segmentation.

## CHAPTER TWO

# A HETERODOX LABOUR MARKET APPROACH TO THE STUDY OF GRADUATES IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN LABOUR MARKET

### 2.1 INTRODUCTION

There are currently two main accounts of labour markets: the *orthodox* account, which avoids serious analysis of social structures, and a *heterodox* socioeconomic account, which recognises that labour markets are embedded in social structures. Augmenting the latter with a critical-realist approach allows us “to break completely with the idea that there are phenomena called ‘labour markets’ that are embedded in other phenomena called ‘social structures’ - and to move, instead, towards the realisation that labour markets just are, or are exhausted by, the very social structures that constitute them” (Fleetwood, 2006: 59). This chapter uses the heterodox labour market approach (grounded on critical realism) to discuss the literature on new graduates in the South African labour market. The central argument of this chapter is that labour markets are complex structures which are segmented into various units as a result of social, geographical, economic and political forces. These forces create the complexity of these labour markets and are the direct cause of the inequalities which exist within them. This means that the labour market outcomes and experiences of graduates are subject to these forces and will therefore vary as a result.

This chapter begins with a discussion of the theoretical framework informing this thesis. It is then followed by an analysis of the concept of employability and a discussion on international Human Resource Development (HRD). This is followed by a discussion of HRD in South Africa pre-1994 and post-1994. In this section the post-apartheid labour market is briefly analysed and some of the challenges plaguing the higher education sector in South Africa are discussed. This chapter concludes with a discussion of the findings from recent graduate tracer studies conducted in South Africa and their relevance to the research question. Throughout this chapter the literature is analysed and discussed in the context of the theoretical framework.

## **2.2 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK**

This dissertation is grounded in a critical realist perspective, which allows for a heterodox analysis of the labour market through labour market segmentation (LMS) theory. Critical realism is fundamentally concerned with the deeper analysis of phenomena, that is, it seeks to go beyond the empirical data to expose the nature of the real. This means that it does not denounce positivism, but proposes that the limit of positivism is its dedication to closed systems (see Bhaskar, 1978). Relating to social phenomena such as labour markets, critical realism proposes that they are open systems and are not confined to the orthodox economic vision of laws of supply and demand (see Fleetwood, 2006). This means that there are other factors and forces at play in the shaping of labour markets. This allows us to perceive the labour market from a heterodox approach. The heterodox labour market approach takes into account the social, economic, and political factors which shape the labour market. According to this approach, labour markets are far from homogenous, but are complex and fractured as a result of these factors (see Fleetwood, 2006). This provides a foundation for LMS theory, which confirms that labour markets are fractured into different segments and that there are unequal experiences for graduates in the labour markets as a result of social, economic, and political forces (see Peck, 1996). This framework is fitting for this research, as the prime interest of the study is not only to report the labour market outcomes of the Rhodes University graduates, but highlight the social structures and forces that influence these outcomes.

### **2.2.1 Critical Realism**

Critical realism originated in writings of the philosopher Roy Bhaskar and was inspired by Marx's view of science (Ehrbar, 1998). Critical realism seeks to be a more realistic substitute for positivism and social constructionism in offering principles and ideas for science. Critical realists propose that, to create valid theories, scientists have to analyse the underlying mechanisms and structures which cause the existence of observable phenomena (Alvesson and Skoldberg, 2009:39). The critical realists' philosophy of science stresses that it should not to be confused with that of positivism, which is solely interested in predictable patterns. Instead, critical realism seeks to identify those deeper, underlying mechanisms which create observable phenomena. According to Bhaskar (1978), reality consists of three domains, which are the empirical, the actual and the

real (which is central to critical realism). The empirical domain includes that which we can observe; things that happen and exist according to our experience.

The actual domain is a broader one, and refers to that which occurs independently of the researcher or any other observer who might record it. Finally, the domain of the real includes those mechanisms that are productive of different events and other 'surface phenomena' (Bhaskar, 1978:15). According to critical realists, the task of science is to explore the realm of the real and how it relates to the other two domains. The empirical domain can be seen as a manifestation of the other two domains. Critical realists propose that the primary task of scientists is to identify and analyse the underlying mechanisms and their interactions which cause the empirical to exist (Danermark, 2002).

It is interest in mechanisms of a 'deeper dimension' that motivates this study's adoption of a critical realist perspective. The dissertation seeks to uncover the real inequalities experienced by Rhodes graduates in the South African labour market as a result of (among other factors) their chosen fields of study, race and sex. These factors represent over-arching social structures which play a role in shaping the labour market experiences of graduates. Therefore, when we uncover these outcomes through critical realism, we also uncover the over-arching social structures which make their existence possible. The observable aspects are a representation or manifestation of the interaction of underlying mechanisms (see Bhaskar, 1978; Collier, 1994; Archer, 1998). That is why this study seeks to show that the unequal outcomes and experiences of Rhodes graduates in the labour market are a representation of social structures such as the neoliberalising economy, racism and patriarchy.

The real is central to critical realism (see Bhaskar, 1978; Collier, 1994; Archer, 1998). Something is real if it has a causal effect; that is, if it affects behaviour and makes a difference. For example, race, sex and age can explain patterns in the labour market, and they are real in the sense that they exist and work as mechanisms with causal effects (see Fleetwood, 2006). Critical realism emphasizes the ideal and possibility of causal explanation (see Bhaskar, 1978). However, as noted earlier, the approach is different from that of positivism, which seeks to establish predictable patterns and the exact relation between cause and effect. For critical realists, relations are complex and causality can exist on different levels. They generate tendencies rather than inevitable, specific and measurable conditions (see Collier, 1994:20). Critical realism examines the different

mechanisms which have implications in terms of different effects and events, the forces and characteristics that mechanisms produce, and the intricate connections between different structural levels that contribute to the complexity of causal forces, and that make possible the treatment of these as single, isolated factors (Archer, 1998). In terms of this study, the causal effects that will be analysed include key education and labour market pathways; demographic, socio-economic, spatial or institutional characteristics that influence graduates' decisions throughout their university education and how these factors influence their transition and experiences in the labour market.

Critical realism seeks to go beyond the orthodox explanations of the labour market, to expose the real labour market structure which is highly complex and is shaped by a plethora of social, economic and political forces (see Peck, 1996; Fleetwood, 2008). Neoliberal ideas on labour markets are inspired by the orthodox or the mainstream labour market (MLM) model or account (Weintraub, 1993). "According to critical realists, the MLM account is systematically rooted in a scientific meta-theory consisting primarily of an empirical realist ontology and the deductivist method wherein to 'explain' something is to deduce/predict a statement about that something from a set of initial conditions, assumptions, axioms and a covering law or some form of constant conjunction of events" (Fleetwood, 2006:6). This method is not suitable for the study of social phenomena which occur in an open system. The MLM model is suitable to studying cases where events manifest themselves as constant conjunctions; that is, in closed systems.

This means that critical realism takes into account the complex and unpredictable nature of social structures, such as labour markets. That is why critical realism has inspired heterodox economists such as feminists, Marxists, post-Keynesians and LMS theorists. Despite the diversity of these theories, they do unite around a common theme, which proposes that labour markets are embedded in or constituted by institutions or social structures (i.e. mechanisms, rules, resources, conventions, habits, powers, and so on). Therefore, when studying labour markets it is impossible to ignore the fact that they are open systems subject to unpredictable and complex social forces that shape their very existence (see Fine, 2003; Fleetwood, 2006). The labour market outcomes for individuals are also a manifestation of the interaction of these social forces (see Granovetter, 1985; Piore, 1993). This dissertation is grounded in a critical realist framework because it allows us to analyse the labour market from a heterodox approach. It seeks to highlight the inequalities experienced by

people in the labour market as a result of (among other factors) their chosen fields of study, race and sex.

That means that critical realism allows us to view the experiences and outcomes of graduates as representations of social structures at play in the labour market. Before discussing the heterodox approach in detail, it is important to indicate why this study rejects the orthodox approach (Peck, 2006:18).

### **2.2.2 Orthodox Approaches**

The orthodox approach is rooted in a neo-classical economic framework, which equates the labour market with the market for products (see Canning, 1984; Fevre, 2003; Berlinski and Manacorda, 2011). Neoclassical economics is a meta-theory, which is a set of implicit rules or understandings for constructing economic theories. It is a scientific research programme that generates economic theories (Weintraub, 1993). Orthodox economists perceive labour markets in the same way they perceive all markets: as platforms of exchange upon which prices are set. In the case of labour markets, their theories are largely about the effect of labour markets on wage rates (Fevre, 2003:26). Economic theory tells us that in such labour markets — as in any other market with buyers and sellers - the price of the thing being sold will be determined (or, at least, heavily influenced) by the ‘laws of supply and demand’ (Fevre, 2003:26).

‘All other things being equal’ is a major assumption made by orthodox economists (Fevre, 2003). The most important thing that has to be equal is competition. The laws of supply and demand work in this way because there is competition within each group: competition over labour between the buyers, and competition over jobs between the sellers of labour (see Ehrenberg and Smith, 1994; Berlinski and Manacorda, 2011). All other things being equal, supply and demand adjust to each other through the price. For example, if there are more sellers than buyers the price will fall so that less people find it an attractive idea to sell their labour and/or more people want to buy labour. A similar thing occurs where demand exceeds supply: more people want to sell labour and/or less people want to buy it because the price of labour is rising (see Berlinski and Manacorda, 2011). Eventually these adjustments will make supply and demand equal each other; the market will find just the right price at which the same number of people will want to sell and want to buy. This is the market’s ‘equilibrium point’. This approach assumes that the supply and demand of labour is

homogeneous and that all workers are interchangeable (see Borjas, 2000; Fevre, 2003; Berlinski and Manacorda, 2011).

Building on this concept, the human capital theory, coined by Theodore W. Schultz, follows an orthodox approach when it comes to skills differentiation in the labour market (Becker, 1962). The concept of human capital theory states that people possess skills, experience and knowledge, and therefore have economic value to organizations (Becker, 1962:11). These skills, knowledge and experience represent capital because they increase an individuals' productivity (Rosen, 1972). Human capital theorists believe that some labour is more productive than other labour simply because more resources have been invested into the training of that labour, in the same manner that a machine that has had more resources invested into it is apt to be more productive (Frias, 2002:5). Jobs demanding higher skills are assumed to be higher paid than less skilled jobs because the amount of training necessary makes that worker more valuable (Becker, 1962, Maglen, 1990; Mincer, 1996; Questia, 2013). Therefore according to this theory, for example, individuals who possess an MBA perform better in the labour market than those without it or those with less years of schooling because they invested more in their human capital. This is a critical point because for this study we will be comparing Rhodes graduates with diverse qualifications, so as to ascertain which qualifications are in demand in the South African labour market.

Although there is some truth to the human capital theory, it has short-comings, which are difficult to overlook when researching the graduate labour market. Generally, the human capital theory ignores some social barriers and inequalities that exist within the labour market (see Bowles and Gintis, 1975:78). The labour market is a highly complex formation and must not be viewed as a simple stock exchange, whereby the person with the most education gets the best jobs or has better labour market outcomes. There may be some truth to that but we have to take into account the various ideological and social factors that influence the labour market outcomes of graduates (Bowles and Gintis. 1975:78). Plus employers look for more than just an education qualification, but look for a combination of hard and soft skills, hard skills being those skills which are essential for executing work based tasks; and soft skills including various other competencies such as interpersonal skills (Krul, 2010). The human capital theory is an extension of the orthodox approach and, as such, is not suitable for this study. This study is searching for deeper labour

market realities, which is why it is inspired by the critical realist framework to analyse the labour market from a heterodox approach.

### **2.2.3 Critique of Orthodox Approaches**

The analysis of the labour market offered by orthodox labour economists is extremely inadequate and there are a number of factors that make this so. First, the orthodox labour market approach focuses solely on a positivist paradigm of analysis (see Fleetwood, 2008; White, 2010). Rather than using mathematics and statistics for deeper enquiry, orthodox economics are concerned solely with the outputs rather than the reasons why these outputs have occurred in the first place. This is seen more especially when orthodox economists seek to explain the processes of labour supply and demand (see Fleetwood, 2006). These laws are usually expressed as constant conjunctions of events and generalized in terms of functional relations. Theories of labour demand and supply assume closed systems (see Fleetwood, 2006). And this brings us to a fundamental problem. There appear to be very few spontaneously occurring closed systems in the natural world, and virtually none in the social world (see Fleetwood, 2006; Krul, 2010).

In natural science, the point of an experiment is to close the system by creating a particular set of conditions that will isolate the one interesting mechanism. This mechanism is then allowed to operate without interruptions and the results, the constant conjunctions, recorded. According to Fleetwood (2006), social scientists who adopt the deductivist method face the following problem, which is, outside closed systems, where constant conjunctions of events are not usually found, one would have to conclude that there are no laws. This would be similar to saying that nothing governs the events in open systems. However, there are laws which govern the events in open systems and they are complex and unpredictable, unlike those in closed systems which occur in constant conjunctions. In the social world, especially in labour markets, these events are influenced by a plethora of social forces. The orthodox approach supports the closed system idea and that is why it cannot be applied to this dissertation. Finally a major flaw of orthodox theory is found in its failure to take into account the inequality and discrimination experienced by some segments of the population (White, 2010:28). These inequalities experienced by certain segments of the population in the labour markets are very important because they reveal the nature of the socio-economic

forces which shape the labour market. This study seeks to show that Rhodes graduates experience unequal outcomes in the South African labour market as a result of their chosen fields of study, race and sex. Therefore, an alternative theoretical framework to the orthodox approach is essential.

#### **2.2.4 Heterodox Approaches**

Heterodox approaches reject the orthodox approaches, which perceive the labour market as markets for products which are governed by orthodox economic laws of supply and demand (Fevre, 2003; Berlinski and Manacorda, 2011). A strong representative of the heterodox approach is the LMS theory with diverse origins in institutionalist labour economics (see Peck, 1996). The conflict between the orthodox and heterodox approaches is not only based on empirical questions, but on deeper theoretical disagreements that concern the rules governing labour market behaviour (see Lawson, 2006). LMS theory states that the social space (see Granovetter, 1985) of the labour market is not only divided into sub-markets, but also that rules governing the behaviour of labour market actors differ from one segment of the labour market to the next (see Peck, 1996).

This does not deny the existence of competitive rules, but rather it represents the rejection of claims made by orthodox economists concerning this competitive state (Fevre, 2003; White, 2010). Segmentation theorists remain firm in their point that labour markets are social structures and are subject to the influence of various social forces. It is an interaction between the various social forces which segments the labour market and creates diverse and unequal experiences for individuals in the labour market (see Peck, 1996). This means that graduates from HWUs are also subject to the forces which shape the labour market and they are bound to experience levels of inequality in the labour market.

Peck (1996:48) identified four generations of the segmentation approach. The first generation segmentation approaches have their foundations in the notion of the 'dual labour market', which was developed by Doeringer and Piore (1971) to explain low pay and unemployment in 'ghetto' labour markets. Doeringer and Piore's work was an extension of Kerr's (1954) analysis of internal labour markets, and developed this approach by considering various groups excluded from internal labour markets. Therefore, the first generation segmentation theorists identified the fragmented nature of the labour market, and opposed the rather homogenous picture proposed by orthodox economists (Cain, 1976:5). Segmentation theorists argued that primary and secondary markets

existed within the labour market. In the upper or primary sector, workers enjoy relatively high wages, fringe benefits, satisfactory working conditions, access to training, good prospects for promotion and employment.

Primary sector workers face reasonably equitable workplace policies and receive regular wage increases and promotions. Additionally, primary sector jobs tend to offer some degree of worker autonomy. The primary labour market is also composed of industries or firms that have internal labour markets (see Edwards, Gordon and Reich, 1973:359; Watcher, 1974; Hagner, 2000; Mearman, 2007; Tucker, 2014). In the secondary sector, wages are low, benefits are minimal or non-existent, work conditions are poor, turn-over is high and periods of unemployment are more frequent (see Peck, 1996). Workers seldom experience any degree of autonomy. Secondary jobs also tend to be concentrated in the least prestigious occupations in the economy. The secondary market consists of firms with relatively undeveloped internal markets and workers with low wages. The firm has many entry points and few jobs are filled by promotions from within. Firms in this sector generally pay low wages and are largely in the service and wholesale and retail trade sectors. Low-wage firms can be found in any broad sector, however, including manufacturing (Watcher, 1974).

Firms in this sector also provide little specific or on-the-job training and relatively limited possibilities for career growth. More specifically, high levels of turn-over and unemployment maybe taken as the prominent characteristic of the secondary market (see Watcher, 1974). Therefore one could assume that Rhodes University graduates are most likely bound to occupy the primary and internal labour markets because of the reputation of Rhodes University as an institution that produces top graduates (Chambers, 2010). Even if that may be the case, from a heterodox perspective, we realize that the experiences and outcomes of the graduates are not going to be homogenous because of the many socio-economic forces at work in the labour market (Lawson, 2006). These socio-economic forces are bound to differentiate graduates' outcomes and experiences on account of (among other factors) their field of study, race and sex. The second generation of segmentation theories stems from the American radical economics school. This approach emphasized the role of LMS as a capitalist control strategy (see Reich et al., 1973). For the radical theorists, segmentation strategies were designed to de-skill and divide the work-force to maintain control over it (see Wilkinson, 2013). The dualist approach signified a shift in labour

market theory, as it focused on job characteristics and sought to bring an understanding of institutional processes to labour market theories (see Watcher, 1974; Peck, 1996). Access to labour market opportunities is usually systematically restricted for minority groups in many countries (Lang and Dickens, 1988).

According to the dualist approach, there are certain forces within the labour market which contribute to social inequality (see Edwards, Gordon and Reich, 1973). The third generation segmentation theorists focus attention on three areas of segmentation: segmentation of labour demand, segmentation of labour supply and the role of the state. The segmentation of labour demand focuses mainly on technology and power relationships (White, 2010:30). Labour demand is not homogenous, but is varied on a number of levels. Capital intensity and industry scale are particularly important sources of variation (see Peck, 1996). The segmentation of labour supply is socially produced and reproduced. In this case, various institutions play a role in segmenting the supply of labour (Peck, 1996:48). It starts with the family as the primary unit of production. Individuals are given different types of productive roles in the family, and the various expectations they need to meet. This starts from the type of school/university an individual attends to the career they will enter. The family's socio-economic status will have an impact on the career path an individual will take (see Ball, 2010).

The fourth generation of segmentation theorists are no longer concerned solely with patterns and processes of labour market inequality, but are increasingly moving to explore the fundamental dynamics and social foundations of the labour markets (see Wilkinson, 2013). Thus, labour market structures and dynamics are not coherent, as the orthodox model suggests (Mearman, 2007). There is no one set of competitive labour market rules, embedded within an over-arching (market) rationality. Rather, the labour market is a complex composite structure that is constantly being reshaped and influenced by a plethora of factors. The current generation of segmentation theorists also extend their focus to matters of causality, regulation, institutionalization and contingency (see Peck, 1996). A heterodox approach, which is grounded in a critical realist perspective, is therefore the most suitable framework of analysis for a study that seeks to investigate the divergent and unequal experiences of graduates within the context of a complex and dynamic labour market. This framework also allows for the analysis of the linkage between different underlying mechanisms, so as to provide a deeper understanding of the labour market. In general, LMS

theories focus on barriers to mobility, as opposed to human capital theorists who simply focus on the acquisition of human capital. As suggested by Watcher (1974) labour supply functions may differ amongst similar groups because of differences in education and training, work patterns, and residential location, whilst labour demand functions differ because of discrimination by race and sex, industrial structure and trade union barriers to entry.

Thus, an important contribution of LMS theory is that it distinguishes between the primary and secondary sectors and emphasises the lack of mobility between them. This suggests that the nature of such markets is more adequately explained by institutional and structural forces than narrow economic variables as in the neoclassical approach (Fleetwood, 2006).

When researching recent graduates in the labour market, the concept of employability always comes to the fore, and it is no different with this study. The concept of employability will form an overarching feature of the study, as this dissertation seeks to investigate the trajectories and experiences of Rhodes graduates in the South African labour market. It is therefore important to briefly analyse and unpack this concept within a heterodox framework. In essence, this study will enrich our understanding of the South African labour market through the experiences of this group of graduates. This will hopefully assist us in understanding what defines them as employable in the context of the South African economy.

## **2.3 EMPLOYABILITY AND THE CHANGING LABOUR MARKET**

The concept of ‘employability’ continues to be applied within different contexts and to both those in work and those seeking work (McQuaid and Lindsay, 2005: 199). Class and the reputation of a university play a major role in determining the successes of graduates in the labour market (see Gordon, 2013; Van Broekhuizen, 2013). Research shows that graduates from higher economic classes and from prestigious higher education institutions enjoy more success in the labour market than their working class counterparts (see Gordon, 2013). This means that in certain contexts graduates from higher socio-economic status and from top universities are perceived as more employable in the labour market. A graduate study conducted by Gordon (2013) traced the early graduate labour market experiences of 103 graduates from different class backgrounds and from three universities of differing status in Wales in the United Kingdom (UK). The study found that

middle class graduates were generally more successful in the graduate labour market than their working class peers, even amongst graduates with similar credentials and from the same universities. Middle class graduates were more likely to find graduate-level employment and to be employed in professional or managerial occupations.

Whilst academic barriers to the labour market affected all graduates equally, middle class graduates were able to augment their employability by drawing on economic, social and non-academic forms of cultural capital (Granovetter, 1974; Lin and Dumin, 1986; Gordon, 2013). Gordon (2013) found that students educated at public schools were most likely to embark upon early professional work experience, followed by other privately educated students and middle class students more generally. Students from working class backgrounds were more likely to have undertaken part-time, paid work but were unlikely to undertake work experience outside of their degree (law students were notable exceptions).

This is also the case in South Africa, where graduates from former White universities are seen as more employable and enjoy greater labour market success than graduates from former Black universities (Van Broekhuizen, 2013). However, this dissertation seeks to show (using a heterodox labour market approach) that even if graduates come from a higher socio-economic status and graduated from a former White university with a good reputation in the labour market, their experiences and outcomes in the labour market are bound to vary based on (among others) field of study, race and sex. According to the LMS theory, this inequality is a result of various socio-economic factors which continue to shape the labour market (see Doeringer and Piore, 1971; Peck, 1996; Wilkinson, 2013).

Therefore, we cannot simply reduce graduate employability to class and university reputation, even though they play a role. Employability is a highly complex phenomenon with a long history (McQuaid and Lindsay, 2005). Employability is commonly seen as one of the manifestations of the changing global economy of the past two decades (see Field, 2000). Universities are increasingly required to produce highly mobile graduates who able to respond to the ever-changing needs of the contemporary workplace (see McGrath, 2009). This has resulted in questions being raised about the quality of the graduate labour market and the ability of graduates to meet the needs of employers (see Hillage and Pollard 1998; Baruch, 2001; Andrews and Higson, 2008; McGrath, 2009).

Historically, the concept of employability embraced both labour supply and demand side factors. Gazier's (1998) work on employability provides a useful overview of the concept's development towards currently accepted definitions. He distinguished between seven versions of the concept of employability – namely: *dichotomic employability*, *socio-medical employability*, *manpower policy employability*, *flow employability*, *labour market performance employability*, *initiative employability*, and *interactive employability*. *Dichotomic employability* emerged at the beginning of the twentieth century in the United Kingdom (UK) and the United States of America (USA). Gazier (1998) described this concept of employability as 'dichotomic' due to its focus on the 'employable' and 'unemployable'. It made a distinction between those that are/can be employed and those that cannot be. *Socio-medical employability* emerged in the USA, the UK, Germany and elsewhere, referring to the distance between the existing work abilities of socially, physically or mentally disadvantaged people and the work requirements of employment.

*Manpower policy employability* developed mainly in the USA since the 1960s with the emphasis again on the distance between the existing work abilities of the disadvantaged and the work requirements of employment. *Flow employability* emerged in the French sociology literature of the 1960s, and focused on the demand side and the ability to access employment within local and national economies. In this case, employability was defined as "the objective expectation, or more or less high probability, that a person looking for a job can have of finding one" (see Gazier, 1998:38).

*Labour market performance employability* emerged internationally towards the end of the 1970s. This concept focuses on the 'measurable' labour market outcomes that result from specific policy interventions. These measures typically include period employed, hours worked and wage rates. *Initiative employability* emerged in the late 1980s in the North American and European Human Resource Development (HRD) literature. This account argued that successful career development required the development of skills and attitudes that could make workers both succeed in their current jobs and be able and motivated to get a better job in another organisation. The focus here is mainly on the individual's initiative and agency. *Interactive employability* emerged first in North America and then internationally from the end of the 1980s. This concept argued that the employability of the individual is partly relative to the employability of others in the labour market. The state of demand locally and nationally is also considered, as are the rules and institutions that

govern the labour market, reflecting the rise of institutional economics at this period. Therefore, interactive employability illustrates that employability is shaped by a combination of interactive factors (see Gazier, 1998; McQuaid and Lindsay, 2005; McGrath, 2009).

Employers (particularly in the USA) have tended to view employability as primarily a characteristic of the individual (Rajan, 1997:26). Other attempts to define the concept have used a more holistic approach, emphasising the impact of both individual characteristics and labour market conditions, i.e. both labour demand and supply factors (see McQuaid and Lindsay, 2005). A 'holistic' framework of employability is suggested to have three main inter-related components that influence a person's employability: individual factors, personal circumstances, and external factors (McQuaid and Lindsay, 2005). *Individual* factors include qualifications, skills and attributes, health and well-being, job seeking, adaptability and mobility (see Brown, Hesketh and Williams, 2003:20). *Personal* circumstances include household circumstances, work culture and access to resources. *External* factors include labour market factors such as the level of local and regional or other demand; nature and changes of local and regional demand (required skill levels, occupational structure of vacancies, sectors where demand is concentrated); location, centrality/remoteness of local labour markets in relation to centres of industry/employment; level of competition for jobs; actions of employer's competitors and changing customer preferences (see Gazier, 1998; McQuaid and Lindsay, 2005; McGrath, 2009).

The interaction between each component is important. For instance, employers may be willing to accept someone under one set of circumstances (e.g. during a labour shortage), but may not consider the same individual to have the minimum necessary skills under different circumstances (e.g. when there is a large supply of labour) (McQuaid and Lindsay, 2005). In this case, the individual has not changed (their 'narrow' employability in terms of employability skills and attitudes), but the external employment conditions have (see McGrath, 2009:4). According to McQuaid and Lindsay (2005) in many cases the interactivity supposedly at the centre of the concept appears to have been replaced by a singular focus on the individual and what might be termed their 'employability skills'. Lister (2001) added that governments are often primarily concerned with the supply side of 'employability' rather than the demand side of 'employment'. Macroeconomic factors also play a role in shaping the employability of graduates in the labour market. Finally, there are also the enabling support factors, which include employment policy

factors, accessibility of public services and job-matching technology, incentives within tax benefits system, accessibility and limitations on training, extent of local/regional development policies, measures to ease the school-work transition and address employability issues at school and university and many other factors (see McGrath, 2009:4-5).

The concept of employability is indeed ‘highly interactive’ and varies across the graduate labour market, in different countries, provinces, sectors, at different levels and between different organisations. As such, there is no singular definition of employability (see Brown, Hesketh and Williams, 2003). This is why Brown and Hesketh (2004) talk of the ‘duality of employability’. There are a myriad of factors which are involved in shaping the employability of an individual. This literature on employability confirms the views of the critical realists which indicate that the labour market is heterodox in nature and that labour markets are open systems subject to the influence of various social forces (see Lawson, 2006). The social forces are the direct cause of the segmented nature of labour markets and have also created inequalities within them. Therefore the competition between graduates in the labour market is also not equal because of the social institutions which constitute the labour markets (Fleetwood, 2006; Peck, 1996).

This dissertation will seek to show that the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates has unequal outcomes and experiences in the South African labour market as a result of (among others) their chosen fields of study, race and sex. Therefore, the concept of interactive employability fits well within the heterodox labour market approach, as it presents graduate employability as complex and dynamic. It indicates that graduate employability in the labour market is shaped by a range of forces and that it has no single definition (Brown et al., 2002: 20). The concept of employability is highly interactive and differs according to firm, sector, region and country. Employability now commands a central place in labour market policies in the UK, many other European states and beyond (see OECD, 1998; CEC, 1999; ILO, 2000; UN, 2001). To gain a global understanding of the interactive nature of employability and what it means for the South African context and particularly this dissertation, it is important to briefly analyse some international literature on graduate employability studies.

### 2.3.1 International Research on Graduate Employability

In an international graduate study conducted by Schomburg (2007), the following issues were analysed: the smoothness of the transitions process; status, income and other dimension of professional success; success with regard to the character of work, e.g. use of knowledge and the extent to which work is characterised by autonomy and challenging tasks; and overall appreciation of employment and work. This analysis confirmed the relevance of structural and cultural patterns for the professional successes of graduates in 11 European countries and Japan (see Schomburg, 2007). Fields of study played a major role in graduates' chances of working in related occupations in most of the countries. This study showed that both structural and individual factors played a role in the professional success of the graduates (see Teichler, 1999; Mora, Vila and Garcia-Aracil, 2005; Schomburg, 2007).

Schomburg (2007) reported that socio-biographical factors (e.g. sex, level of education of parents and age) were influential, as well as competencies, work orientations and work experiences. The study showed that there was no singular road to professional success that could be found. It was neither the country and the related cultural and structural conditions, nor the institutions and programmes of study which solely determined individual professional success. The socio-biographical background, such as sex and educational background of parents, the competences acquired up to graduation, the employment conditions (e.g. economic sector, size of organisation), and the experiences after graduation (e.g. further education and training) were all relevant for professional success. This highlights the interactive component of graduate employability; there is no single definitive factor which makes a graduate employable in the labour market (see Teichler, 1999; Mora, Vila and Garcia-Aracil, 2005; Schomburg, 2007).

In the developing world, in Africa to be exact, a graduate study was conducted by the National Council for Higher Education (NCHE, 2006) in Uganda. These results indicated that employment opportunities of graduates from Uganda's higher education institutions varied significantly across *disciplines and fields of study*. It was a firm conclusion of this study that field of study, subject area/specialisation, grades obtained at the institution of higher education, personality and reputation of the institution, together determined the graduate's employability. The study also established that degree holders were better placed to secure employment on merit (NCHE, 2006).

In terms of sexual divisions within the labour market, the study revealed that more men were found in agriculture, construction, electricity, gas and water industries. Men have traditionally dominated these sectors. In other sectors, there were more women than men. Encouragingly, the study revealed that both men and women have fairly equal opportunities for employment (NCHE, 2006). Sex was not identified as a major factor in securing, losing a job or as determinant of income levels. However, the major finding from this study was that field of study was the single most important factor for securing gainful employment.

The outcomes of these international graduate tracer studies confirm the heterodox view of the labour market and contradict the orthodox economic explanations. These accounts also move beyond the simplistic explanations of human capital theory, which emphasise academic qualifications as a key determinant of the labour market outcomes of graduates, by showing that there is a complex interrelation between structural and individual factors (see McQuaid and Lindsay, 2005; Fleetwood, 2006; Peck, 1996; Fevre, 2003). The concept of employability is dynamic and is subject to a number of interactive forces, both on an individual and structural level. The concept of employability is also at the centre of human resource development (HRD) policies around the globe. HRD aims to reduce poverty and unemployment through human capital investments to make citizens more employable (Alkire, 2002:183; Metcalfe and Rees, 2005; Garavan and McGuire, 2010; Kuchinke, 2010; Agra, 2013). It is therefore important to shed light on HRD before analysing the literature on graduate tracer studies and the South African labour market.

## **2.4 HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT**

HRD lies at the heart of economic and social development. It is also an important component for achieving internationally agreed sustainable development goals, including the Millennium Development Goals, and for expanding opportunities to all people, particularly the most vulnerable groups and individuals in society (Metcalfe and Rees, 2005). HRD has been defined as empowering people by equipping them with knowledge and skills in order to improve their own quality of life and that of their families, communities, enterprises and societies (see Alkire, 2002; Kuchinke, 2010). Over the years, the concept of HRD has evolved from solely focusing on individual capacity to also building institutional capacity at the national level, through socio-

economic policies and development plan and strategies (see Metcalfe and Rees, 2005). HRD is, therefore, regarded as facilitating the development of national human capacities to achieve sustainable, inclusive, equitable development and, at the same time, enhance the well-being of individuals. As such, HRD strategies are part of national development planning (see Alkire, 2002; Metcalfe and Rees, 2005; Garavan and McGuire, 2010; Kuchinke, 2010; Agra, 2013). One major trend with implications for HRD is globalisation which has influenced not only by technological change but also by the decisions of developing countries to embrace market oriented development strategies and to open their countries to the world economy (see ILO, 1996; Ashton and Green, 1996; Shangquan, 2000). The world is fast becoming one interdependent global market place. World-wide competition has increased, the pace of economic change has also increased and the processes of development have become less predictable. Competitiveness is largely decided on a country's or an enterprise's capacity to add value to global economic products, services and processes (Reich 1991). The education and skills of the workforce have become a key competitive weapon in the 21<sup>st</sup> century (see Reich 1991; OECD, 2000). Globalisation impacts on HRD in various ways. Intense global competition is reshaping the market place. As a result HRD strategies seek to balance the demands of new employment sectors with the supply of required skills. The need to enhance skills for these emerging sectors (i.e. green growth, knowledge economy, intellectual property policy evaluation and management, etc.) has become particularly important in developing countries (see ILO, 1996).

Globalization has also highlighted patterns of 'uneven' economic and social development and made more visible differences in education and skill levels (see Stiglitz, 2002; UNDP, 2003b). As a result, there has been a growth in comparative and international HRD scholarship, both in terms of highlighting global HRD systems, and in identifying the societal and cultural practices that shape HRD and learning in different geographic locations (see Cho and McClean, 2004). HRD has taken different forms to suit various national contexts around the globe. Many countries have created different HRD policies to meet the specific skills needs of that particular country as a result of globalization (see Ashton and Green, 1996). Education and vocational training are at the heart of HRD policies. Consequently, universities and colleges around the world are encouraged to produce the skills needed by their economies so as to reduce unemployment and poverty (Metcalfe and Rees, 2005). Graduates in their respective countries are subject to diverse labour market outcomes as a result of structural forces and individual choices. Because of its history of racial

discrimination, South Africa's concept of HRD was very one-sided during apartheid and this has had negative outcomes for the post-apartheid labour market structure. Due to limited literature available on graduate tracer studies in Apartheid South Africa, it is wise to paint a brief picture of the apartheid labour market as whole and how this structure shapes the current graduate labour market.

#### **2.4.1 Human Resource Development in Apartheid South Africa**

According to LMS theory, the divisions in the labour market are best understood from a historical perspective (see Doeringer and Piore, 1971; Kalleberg and Sorensen, 1979; Peck, 1996). During apartheid, racial discrimination occurred through systemic legislation and rules, and this was no less evident in the labour market structure. Though formal legislation supposedly eliminated race-based discrimination in respects from 1970s onwards, it is important to bear in mind that informal rules and customs still perpetuated racial employment patterns of the time (Knight and McGrath, 1977; Cassim, 1982). During apartheid, the South African labour market was characterised by racial dualism in that there existed a 'White' sector and a 'Black' sector (Cassim, 1982). This was the result of a historical process of segmentation in the labour market, in which the distribution of individual jobs and income had become dominated by race. The labour market showed major differences between White and Black workers. Income, occupation and training indicated that Black workers were confined to certain sectors of the labour market (see Cassim, 1982; Wolpe, 1990).

During apartheid, South Africa had two distinct labour markets, one for White labour and one for Black labour (See Cassim, 1982). Each market was governed by different laws, institutions and mechanisms for the recruitment, training and allocation of workers to jobs. During this period, the higher education sector in South Africa was designed to serve and validate the power and privilege of the ruling White minority (see Fiske and Ladd, 2004). This means that higher education institutions established during this period were immersed into a system which was shaped with a view to serving the goals and strategies of the apartheid government (see Nkomo, 1990; Wolpe, 1991; Bunting, 1994; Badat, 1998, 1999; Cooper and Subotzky, 2001; Reddy, 2004; Bunting, 2006).

The introduction of the 1984 constitution in South Africa solidified the apartheid divisions in education in South Africa. Therefore higher education institutions were divided according to the four race groups of the country, namely: African, Coloured, Indian and White. These new universities, the so-called “bush colleges,” were designed to serve as valuable vital instruments in the over-arching “grand Apartheid” political project based on the creation of ‘independent’ states in the African “tribal” reserves (see Nkomo, 1990; Wolpe, 1991; Bunting, 1994; Badat, 1998, 1999; Cooper and Subotzky, 2001; Reddy, 2004; Bunting, 2006).

The racial differentiation of universities reflected the racial organisation prevailing in the South African society as a whole, especially in the labour market. Society resembled a rigid hierarchical structure, designed like a pyramid with a minority classified as Whites at the top and a large majority of Blacks categorised by state policy as African, Coloured and Indian “groups” at the bottom (see Cassim, 1982). The Coloured and Indian groups were positioned on purpose to constitute what Van den Berghe (1987:137) calls “middle-man minorities”. The Africans were at the bottom of the social-economic order, as the majority of them were uneducated and poorly skilled, whilst those who were better educated were restricted by apartheid laws from competing equally with their White counter-parts. Systematic racial segregation in South Africa’s labour market was introduced by the end of the nineteenth century and remained intact throughout much of the twentieth (Wolpe, 1990; Nkomo, 1990; Mariotti, 2012).

The Black labour force acted as a pool of surplus labour, a large part of which was locked into jobs that were politically defined as ‘Black’ jobs. These jobs usually entailed low wages, little skill and education, and frequently suffered from seasonal or cyclical unemployment (see Cock, 1980). According to LMS theorists these jobs constitute the secondary labour market (see Peck, 1996). Segregation and inequality was maintained by a number of connected and supportive institutions whose total impact was much greater than each institution on its own. This racial division of labour was enhanced by barriers in other areas of society such as housing, education and transport, which affect an individual’s labour market position (see Downing, 1946; Cock, 1980; Cassim, 1982; Wolpe, 1990; Beinart, 2001; Crankshaw, 2002; Morris, 2012).

The inequality in educational opportunities between the races played a significant role in the segmentation of the South African labour market during apartheid. This resulted in entrenched structural relationships which still persist today. Hence, the differences in income, employment,

occupation, training and labour-force participation rates indicate the existence of a dual and segmented labour market (see Bhorat and Oosthuizen, 2004). This means that South Africa has a complex and segmented labour market which cannot be explained by the orthodox labour market theory (see Fleetwood, 2006). The racial dualism of labour could be seen operating at many levels such as those of occupation, industry, geographic area, firms and departments within firms (Cassim, 1982). According to Knight and McGrath (1977), once Blacks with equal efficiency took over so-called White jobs, this resulted in a downward pressure on the wage rates. Blacks were usually placed in certain job classifications and generally these included low paying and dirtier jobs. Thus, research showed a marked dualistic tendency in the South African labour market during apartheid (see Cassim, 1982). Furthermore, the fact that African workers were concentrated in certain sectors and regions affected their earnings in a significant way (see Cock, 1980). At the other extreme Whites were concentrated in manufacturing, commerce and finance and the professional service sectors, and these were the better paying sectors with fringe benefits and promotional opportunities (see Mariotti, 2012).

The LMS theorists would then propose that Whites during apartheid were mostly employed in the primary labour market, whilst Blacks were mostly employed in the secondary labour market. This literature clearly shows the racial discrimination which was deeply entrenched in the South African labour market. The labour market at the time was further segmented by sex, as during this period women were confined to certain occupations within the labour market. Although White women also experienced sexual discrimination, however, Black women were at the bottom of the occupational ladder during apartheid (see Cock, 1980). Unequal access to education perpetuated this reality for Black females. They were confined to domestic and other menial jobs or were employed in the public service as teachers, nurses and clerks (see Cock, 1980; Morris, 2012). This is a global issue and stems from the social construction of sex created within different cultures, where women assume submissive positions to men. In addition, the law at the time restricted and narrowed the possibilities for Black women in terms of access to education and the labour market. This legacy of sexual inequality continues to exist within the post-apartheid labour market. Likewise, the racial duality of the labour market during apartheid created a lasting legacy which also continues to exist (albeit in a modified form) in the post-apartheid labour market (see Beinart, 2001; Mariotti, 2012).

No matter how educated, Black university/college graduates during apartheid often occupied inferior job categories/positions as a result of the racial duality, which defined the South African labour market during apartheid (Downing, 1946). The entrenched racial dualism that defined the labour market during apartheid has persisted into the democratic South Africa, and further segmented the labour market into skilled and unskilled (Kraak, 2004b). The reality though, is that most of the unskilled still remain Blacks and Coloureds, because of the lack of access to quality education during the Apartheid regime (see Bunting, 2006).

Therefore amongst other factors, the South African labour market remains segmented on the bases of skills (qualifications), race and sex. However, skills are at the heart of new government policy, as it grapples with the problem of unequal/poor education, skills shortages and structural unemployment (see Bhorat and Oosthuizen, 2004). In this dissertation, the issue of race will also be thoroughly analysed to observe how Rhodes graduates from different racial groups perform in the labour market. This thesis using the LMS theory in part seeks to show that these racial inequalities in the South African labour market still persist, even for the graduates from a historically White university. The study will seek to uncover the bases of these inequalities in the post-Apartheid South Africa.

#### **2.4.2 Human Resource Development in Post-Apartheid South Africa**

When the African National Congress came to power in 1994, South Africa was already adjusting to the processes of globalization. Globalization brought many technological and workplace changes into the South African economy. The economy's move towards capital intensification that started in the 1970's (see Kraak, 2004b) led to a large demand for skilled workers (see Bhorat, Hodge and Dieden, 1998). Employers were demanding a more skilled and flexible labour force, which at the time was not a reality. As a result, many unskilled workers lost their jobs and now South Africa continues to struggle with the shortage of critical skills and structural unemployment (see Kingdon and Knight, 2004; Van Schalkwyk, 2002; Kraak, 2003; Moolman, 2003; Arora and Ricci, 2004; Kraak, 2004a; Bhorat and Oosthuizen, 2004; Dunne and Edwards, 2006). Research shows that South Africa's unemployment rate rose to 25.2% in 2013. However, at 25.2%, the unemployment rate is extremely high by global standards (Stanlib, 2013). One of the major factors contributing to structural unemployment is that the South African labour force is growing at higher

rate than the economy's capacity to create jobs. This means that there is a mismatch between the types of skills demanded by firms and those supplied by the labour market (see Bhorat, Goga, Ncube and van de Westhuizen, 2006). The unemployment rate in South Africa differs according to race and sex; the highest being for African women, and the lowest for White men (Kingdon and Knight, 2004; Bhorat, 2007). The massive backlog in Black education has magnified the skills mismatch in the economy and subsequently the racial employment gap rose between 1995 and 2004 (although this could be the result of an increasing skills premium in employment rather than implying increasing discrimination) (see Burger and Jafta, 2006; DPRU, 2006). This is evidence of the legacy of the racial dualism which was deeply entrenched in the South Africa labour market during apartheid (see Cassim, 1982). Unemployment, irrespective of the measure adopted, is extremely high, and has increased substantially since the African National Congress came to power after South Africa's first democratic elections in 1994 (Arora and Ricci, 2005). Evidence from international comparisons suggests that, even among African countries, South Africa performs poorly (see Banerjee, Galiani, Levinsohn, McLaren and Woolard, 2008). The official unemployment rate in South Africa is now at 25.2 per cent. This means that the unemployment rate is extremely high by global standards. As stated earlier the racial dualism entrenched in the labour market made sure that the majority of Blacks were confined in the secondary sector, that is, in jobs that required little to no skills (see Cassim, 1982). That is why Blacks constitute the majority of the unemployed people in South Africa, because with the shift in skills demand, many unskilled workers (who were mostly Black) were retrenched (see Bhorat and Goga, 2013).

In response to the 'skills shortage' and structural unemployment, the government drafted a HRD Strategy (see Rasool, 2010). The first comprehensive countrywide HRD strategy adopted by the Cabinet was launched in 2001 (DoE, 2010). The objective of the HRD Strategy was to maximise the potential of the people of South Africa, through the acquisition of knowledge and skills (DoE, 2010). The HRD, together with the National Skills Development Strategies (1, 2 and 3) are based explicitly on relevant, current and emerging education and training-related strategic frameworks (RSA, 1997; DHET, 2001; DoE, 2010; Rasool, 2010; DHET, 2010). Alongside these changes in the labour market, tertiary education in the post-apartheid period has seen a number of administrative and policy changes, as well as a significant re-organisation of the institutions of higher education (Ntshoe and De Villiers, 2008; Branson, Leibbrandt and Zuze, 2009b). The

Higher Education Act (1997) and the White Paper on Higher Education (1999) formed the basis for the transformation of the higher education sector through an institutional planning and budgeting framework (DHET, 2001). The White Paper stipulated that higher education in a knowledge-driven world must fulfil three important roles: human resource development, high level skills training and production and the acquisition and application of new knowledge. This culminated in the National Plan for Higher Education in 2001 (see Rasool, 2010).

The National Qualifications Framework was established as a certification framework, regulated by the state and responsible for organising, arranging, and recognising educational qualifications from pre-primary to tertiary level into a single system of certification (see DoE, 2010; DHET, 2010; Rasool, 2010). The aim of this restructuring has been to establish a system that is more capable of meeting current job market demands, redressing inequalities in access to higher education and sustaining student growth (HESA, 2009). Because of new legislation (among others), the higher education sector has undergone major transformations (see Reddy, 2004; Mouton, Louw and Strydom, 2013).

Universities have become accessible in South Africa, and as a result the demographics in these universities have become more representative of the country's population (see Fisher and Scott, 2011; Mouton, et al., 2013). In the Eastern Cape, this exercise saw the emergence of the Walter Sisulu University and the consolidation of the University of Fort Hare and Rhodes University (including the transfer of a city campus in East London from the latter to the former), and the transformation of the University of Port Elizabeth into the Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University. Policy and related institutional developments have seen the emergence of the Council for Higher Education (CHE) and linking of university qualifications to the National Qualifications Framework. The purpose of this restructuring was to increase access to higher education and also reduce the problem of youth unemployment. However, the post-secondary school sector is still haunted by problems of the past and also faces emerging ones.

## **2.5 CHALLENGES IN THE POST-SECONDARY SCHOOL LANDSCAPE IN SOUTH AFRICA**

The fractures within higher education landscape have an impact on the shape of the labour market, whether directly or indirectly. From a LMS perspective, higher education institutions have a profound influence on the state of the graduate labour market. This is not to minimize the role of employers or government, but because this dissertation is focusing on graduates, it is important to highlight some of the fractures within the higher education landscape which shape the destinations of graduates in the South African labour market. At the national level, evidence suggests that this restructuring has not necessarily been accompanied by meaningful transformation in access to higher education (see CHE, 1999, 2004; HESA, 2009; Branson, Leibbrandt, and Zuze, 2009c; Mouton, Louw and Strydom, 2013; Smith, 2013; HESA, 2014).

### **2.5.1 Access to higher education**

Related to the problem of slow transformation, access to tertiary institutions (i.e. low participation rates) has been one of the main concerns associated with higher education in South Africa (see CHE, 1999). The number of young people (age 16-24) who are not in employment, education or training (NEETs) has attracted much policy attention in recent years (see Cloete, 2009). Just over a third of all 16-24 year olds and an alarming 50.7 per cent of 23 and 24 year olds are classified as NEETs in South Africa (Cloete, 2009; Statistics South Africa, 2013). Moreover, the fact that a large number of these young unemployed people could be involved in some form of post-secondary study but are not, suggests that there are still a number of barriers to tertiary education in South Africa (Cloete, 2009; Elliott, 2005). One widely held conclusion from the literature on higher education in South Africa is that access to and success in tertiary education is still very closely associated with financial resources (Branson et al., 2009a; Sheppard and Cloete, 2009).

Despite the large unmet need for further education and training, particularly among 18-24 year olds, only about 30 per cent of those in tertiary education are enrolled in an FET college (see (Stumpf, Papier, Needham and Nel, 2009). Participation rates therefore are relatively low for this sector and compare poorly with other countries. From a global perspective South Africa lags behind in overall participation rates for tertiary education. The global average rate is estimated to be 25 per cent and South Africa is ahead only of South and West Asia as well as Sub-Saharan Africa with 22 per cent (see Steyn, 2009).

The number of students enrolled in tertiary institutions has only kept pace with population growth while the age, sex and racial profile of the higher education sector has seen minimal change (see Cross and Carpentier, 2004; Branson et al., 2009c; Cloete, 2009, Branson and Leibbrandt, 2013b). As a result, there has been very little change in the percentage of young people that has a tertiary education i.e. participation and completion rates for tertiary education seem to have changed very little since 2000 (Branson et al., 2009c). Perhaps the only significant change in tertiary enrolment has been the increase in university attendance relative to technikons (Cloete, 2009). However, young White South Africans are more likely to enrol in a university rather than a technical college as compared to Black students (Cloete, 2009; HESA, 2014).

Research indicates that the institutional sectors most affected as far as student enrolments are concerned are the historically Black universities and the specialized distance institutions (Letseka and Maile, 2008). The decline may have unfortunate social and economic consequences and it also raises strongly the question of the sustainability of the current institutional shape of higher education in South Africa. However, student enrolments at Rhodes University have been growing annually. For example, student enrolments grew from 5318 in 2009 to 5329 in 2013 (see Rhodes University, 2013). The humanities faculty has always dominated headcount enrolments and, in 2013, accounted for 60 per cent of enrolments (see Rhodes University, 2013). In an attempt to assist the country in meeting its national needs of skilled persons in the sciences, the University has undertaken to pursue a trajectory of enrolling a higher proportion of students in this area (Chambers, 2010).

According to the student enrolment head count of 2013 (by race), the proportions were as follows: 51 per cent Black, 42 per cent White, 4 per cent Indian and 3 percent Coloured (Rhodes University, 2013). This is an indication that there is an increase in Black student enrolments at Rhodes University. It will be interesting to see, however, if the graduation rates match the enrolment rates (according to race). In 2013 females constituted 59 percent of the student enrolments, whilst males constituted 41 percent. The problem of growing university enrolments and low completion rates feeds directly into the broader situation in the South African labour market (Moleke, 2005). Many of the students who enter the higher education sector do not complete their studies. The enrolment rate at higher education institutions in South Africa may be increasing, but it does not match the completion rate (see HESA, 2014).

Rhodes University has a high completion rate, highest in the country, but this dissertation also seeks to show whether there are racial disparities in the completion rates. This is because the national completion rate for Black graduates is very low, and is in fact the lowest compared to other race groups. White and Indian/Asian graduates have higher completion rates than Blacks and Coloureds (Smith, 2013; HESA, 2014). Therefore, LMS theory suggests that this finding (of racial inequality in the completion rates) is bound to be reflected at Rhodes University, even though it enjoys the highest undergraduate pass rate in the country.

### **2.5.2 Poor quality of first-year admissions into tertiary education**

The type of school attended by students is a proxy for socio-economic status (Cappellari, 2004, Ball, 2010 and CHEC, 2013). Children whose parents also have a post-school education will most likely be influenced strongly by their parents' academic achievements throughout their education life. The influence is even stronger when the children have siblings who are graduates (Goodman, Hurwitz and Smith, 2014). Educated parents always want the best possible education for their children. This means that they are most likely going to send their children to elite public and private schools (see Eccles, 2005; Eccles and Roeser, 2009). Therefore, children from higher income households have the opportunity to study at good public and private schools, which are able to prepare them for university study (Power, 2014). Problems facing first year admissions to tertiary education include the influence of the school system on tertiary education (Lewis and Naidoo, 2004). It is the inequality of schooling quality that influences the unequal outcomes of individuals in the labour market (see Kingdon and Knight, 2002).

All South African public ordinary schools are categorised into five groups, called quintiles, largely for purposes of the allocation of financial resources. Quintile one is the 'poorest' quintile, while quintile five is the 'least poor'. These poverty rankings are determined nationally according to the poverty of the community around the school as well as certain infrastructural factors. Schools in quintile 1, 2 and 3 have been declared no-fee schools, while schools in quintiles 4 and 5 are fee-paying schools (see Grant, 2013). Low cost private-aided schools are subsidised and regulated by the state. For these schools, there is no clear boundary between private and public education as they also cater for lower income households. Former Model-C high schools are public schools which only catered for White students during apartheid era (see Power, 2014). Some of the country's best schools fall into this category, and fees are somewhere between private and regular

government school fees (Power, 2014). These schools are close to private school status. To this day former Model-C schools typically have the best facilities, best teachers and best educational opportunities for children (see Power, 2014).

However on at a national level, the standardization of Grade 12 results is contributing to major inconsistencies in the context of the reliability of the schooling system (Lewis and Naidoo, 2004). This has a major influence on the type of students which are produced for university studies (Cross and Carpentier, 2009; Mouton et al., 2012). The 2014 matric pass rate of 75.8 per cent is lower than the 2013 pass rate of 78.2 per cent (see SAinfo, 2015). This is a concern, because the minimum pass requirement for grade 12 in South Africa remains at 30 per cent (see Allan, 2014). This pass requirement is very low and yet the pass rate is also low. More alarming is the fact that, of the total number of learners who wrote the NSC exam, only 28.3 per cent percent qualified for admission to bachelor studies (see SAinfo, 2015). This finding is an indication that the basic education sector in South Africa is incapable of equipping school leavers with the skills they need to qualify for further education or training or to obtain meaningful employment. Despite the fact that South Africa spends 18.5 per cent of its annual budget on education, the education system remains largely in a poor state of affairs. The system has failed to reverse unacceptably low exam results or to improve the standard of teaching.

The quality of education remains very poor and the output rate has not improved (see Modisaotsile, 2012:1). Furthermore, classrooms are still overcrowded: the ratio of teachers to learners is 1:32 in South African public schools (see Modisaotsile, 2012:2). The literacy and numeracy levels are also very low. According to Rademeyer (2014), 47 percent of high school students in South Africa quit school at Grade 10. Other challenges include poor teacher training; unqualified teachers; a lack of commitment to teaching by teachers; poor support for learners at home; and a shortage of resources in education despite the large budgetary commitments by government (see Fiske and Ladd, 2004; Van der Berg, 2007; Jansen, 2012; Modisaotsile, 2012; Gibson, 2015). It is clear, based on the facts, that there is a need to improve the quality and functionality of the basic education sector of South Africa. The main concern expressed by university officials is that the poor quality of the schooling system is producing poor students at university level (Mouton et al., 2012).

First-year students have difficulty in adapting to the university environment as they find themselves lacking the skills needed for university studies, and this is a result of a failing basic education sector (see Cross and Carpentier, 2009; Jansen, 2012). This is highly relevant because the majority of schools in South Africa are sub-standard and must have an effect on enrolments and completion rates (see Cross and Carpentier, 2009; Modisaotsile, 2012). The reality is that a vast majority of the sub-standard schools cater for Black and Coloured communities and this may be reflected in racial disparities in enrolment and completion rates at university. Research indicates that poor schooling has a negative effect on the employability of a graduate in the labour market (see Branson, Garlick, Lam and Leibbrandt, 2012). According to Bhorat and Oosthuizen (2005:2), there is a growing concern amongst South African employers about the quality of graduates entering their organizations. A large number of graduates are reported as having poor numeracy, literacy and communication skills (Yu, 2012:35). This is a major problem because graduates who lack basic skills place a significant burden on the employer in terms of having to finance further training. In the current turbulent economic times, employers are looking for graduates who are multi-skilled, flexible and able to produce results in a variety of work settings (see Griesel and Parker, 2009).

### **2.5.3 Low graduation rates**

An additional problem identified in the South African higher education sector is a relatively low graduation rate. South Africa's graduation rate is one of the lowest in the world and has ranged from 15 percent to 20 percent for several years now (see Mtshali, 2013). This means that there are large numbers of students who are not completing their university degrees and are dropping out of universities. South Africa's university dropout rates are high by international standards. They have been around 50 per cent since the 1990s, and the most recent statistics indicate a worrying further decline to 58 per cent. This compares poorly with the UK (16 per cent), France (19 per cent) and the United States (30 per cent) (Masicorp, 2014). Research indicates that the reasons for these low rates include financial constraints – where students enrol for courses but do not have funding to see them through – lack of academic preparedness and students not getting enough support from their universities. The highest failure rate was in mathematics and science programmes, which covered medicine, science, technology and business studies (see Mtshali, 2013).

Research indicates that students tend to struggle with mathematics and science. Students who regularly change courses also contribute to low graduation rates because they move to new courses without finishing the ones they had started (see Gibson, 2015). Black students are worst off in terms graduation rates. White student success rates in 2005 were 85 per cent, while African student rates were 70 per cent (HESA, 2009). This is a major problem and it contributes to the skills shortage in South Africa. Another dimension to this problem is that a shortage of Black professionals in specific sectors of the economy inevitably hampers the processes of employment equity (Letseka and Maile, 2008). Therefore, after more than a decade of implementing changes in the higher education sector of South Africa, issues of access, equity and quality in relation to the function remain substantial challenges (see Reddy, 2004; HESA, 2009; Mouton et al., 2013). Other challenges facing the sector include management of tertiary institutions, the changing roles of academics and funding controversies (Mouton, et al., 2013:287). In other words, all these factors have an impact on the labour market outcomes of graduates. Judged in terms of key performance indicators, Rhodes University is one of South Africa's outstanding universities with a reputation as a 'Scholarly University' and has the highest undergraduate pass rates in the country (Badat, 2012; Graduation Gateway, 2013).

With Rhodes University being one of the top universities in the country, one might assume that its graduates find themselves in quality employment and experience relatively short periods of unemployment. However, drawing on the heterodox approach, this research proceeds from the assumption that the labour market is not homogenous and that Rhodes graduates are to expect some variation (and inequalities) in the labour market experiences of graduates (even if they are from a top performing HWU). The human capital theory is very limited when it comes to critically analysing the labour market outcomes of graduates. This limitation goes back to what McQuaid and Lindsay (2005) termed 'interactive employability', which takes into account both structural and individual factors when studying graduate transitions into the labour market.

## **2.6 GRADUATE TRACER STUDIES IN SOUTH AFRICA**

Interest in graduate tracer studies in South Africa has increased over the past decade. The reasons for this interest are diverse and also form part of broader discussions on: the post-apartheid labour

market, high levels of youth unemployment, the restructuring of the higher education landscape as well as debates on the outcomes of affirmative action policies (see Mlatsheni and Rospabé, 2002; Yu, 2013; Rogan, Diga, and Valodia, 2013). There is also a strong interest in the movement of graduates into the labour markets. Recent work on graduate labour market outcomes in South Africa links with international discussions on the role of higher education in preparing graduates for the work-force and how the higher education curricula are aligned with the needs of employers (see Kruss, 2004; Teichler, 2007; van der Berg and van Broekhuizen, 2012; Campbell, 2012). Against the broad background of a changing workforce, high levels of youth unemployment, the growing demand for capital intensive products (Kraak, 2003), and the expansion of high skill sectors (often at the expense of low skill sectors), graduate tracer studies have become an important tool for understanding how new graduates are adapting to these changes (Teichler, 2007; Mugabushaka et al., 2003; Dudertadt and Emeritus, 2005; Schomburg, 2007; Griesel and Parker, 2009; CHEC, 2013). International tracer studies have been used to explore the transition from university to work as well as to investigate the role of institutions of higher education in meeting the demands of the labour market. In South Africa, there has been renewed interest in graduate employment and the role of higher education to address high levels of youth unemployment and the skills gap. Up to now, most research conducted (DPRU, 2006; Pauw et al., 2006; van der Berg and van Broekhuizen, 2012) on graduate labour market outcomes have used nationally representative Labour Force Surveys. Recently, however, there have only been a limited number of studies that have traced graduates from institutions of higher education to the labour market (Cosser, 2003; Moleke, 2005; Letseka et al., 2010; CHEC, 2013). This dissertation seeks to add to this body of work by showing how factors such as field of study, race and sex influence the labour market outcomes of graduates from a historically White educational institution, such as Rhodes University.

### **2.6.1 Post-Apartheid Graduate Employment Debate**

Much has been speculated about graduate unemployment in South Africa (see Pauw, et al, 2006). However, contemporary research (van der Berg and van Broekhuizen, 2012; Altbeker and Storme, 2013) suggests that the problem of graduate unemployment in South Africa has been greatly exaggerated. New research commissioned by the Centre for Development and Enterprise reveals that the unemployment rate for people with university degrees has consistently been below five

per cent (Altbeker and Storme, 2013:7). Rhodes graduates are expected to have a lower unemployment rate, but according to the LMS theory there are bound to be differences and inequalities based on their chosen fields of study, race and sex.

Altbeker and Storme (2013) also revealed that the unemployment rate for Black graduates is only about one sixth of the unemployment rate for all Blacks. This research suggests that Black graduates now experience far less unemployment than in the early 2000s. According to Altbeker and Storme (2013), unemployment for both Black and White graduates follows the business cycle, in that they both rise and fall with overall unemployment. Importantly, however, fluctuating economic conditions have less of an impact on graduate employment than on people without degrees (see van der Berg and van Broekhuizen, 2012). Even though graduate unemployment in South Africa is often exaggerated, some scholars have been concerned with understanding the root causes of graduate unemployment.

The general view according to this literature is that there is a mismatch between the skills demanded by employers and the training provided by universities and technikons (Kraak, 2003; DPRU, 2006; Ramdass and Kruger, 2006; Daniels, 2007; *The Sowetan*, 10/01, 2012; Bhorat and Goga, 2013). In addition there has been some suggestion in the literature that graduates from fields such as humanities and arts as well as education are less likely to find employment, compared with those from fields like engineering and medical sciences (du Toit and Roodt, 2008). Research indicates that the South African labour force has an over-supply of graduates with general degrees, rather than those which are demanded by the economy. Bhorat and Oosthuizen (2005) identify this as the skills mismatch phenomenon and suggest that it forms a critical barrier to the country's economic growth. This argument is supported by literature which specifically focuses on the perspectives of South African employers on the current state of skills of university graduates. Higher Education South Africa (HESA), for example, conducted a study to examine the views and expectations of employers (Griesel and Parker, 2009). The study found that employers also identified competence in English, Information, Communication and Technology (ICT) skills and a general understanding of the world of work as the most important attributes needed from new graduates (see Daniels, 2007; Bornheimer, 2010). ICT skills, however, remain the important attributes that employers are seeking (see Andrews and Higson, 2008; Mtshali, 2013). A reason proposed by some social scientists as to why ICT skills have become more in demand is due to

rise of an increasing knowledge-driven economy. The term 'knowledge-based economy' stems from the recognition of the role of knowledge and technology in economic growth (see OECD, 1996a). The OECD economies are becoming more dependent on the production, distribution and use of knowledge than ever before (see Brinkley, 2006). High-technology industries have stimulated the growth of the knowledge driven economy. 'Knowledge-intensive' service sectors, such as education, communications and information, are growing even faster (see Krueger, 1993; OECD, 1996a; Lauritzen, 1996; Duderstadt and Colloquium, 2005). According to this line of argument, investment is being directed towards high-technology goods and services, particularly information and communication technologies. Computers and related equipment are the fastest-growing component of tangible investment (see Coates and Warwick, 1999).

The growth of the knowledge driven economy has also stimulated interest in research and development, the training of the labour force, computer software and technical expertise. Therefore this change in the economy has increased the demand for graduates with specific ICT skills. However, as stated earlier, graduate unemployment in South Africa is exaggerated and the majority of graduates find work after graduating. But the main cause of graduate unemployment (even if the rate is small) is the skills mismatch (see Jenvey, 2012). Research indicates that the South African economy shed 36 290 jobs during January 2014, with the biggest losses occurring in permanent employment (Businesstech, 2014). Research also noted that in the face of significant job losses in January, highly skilled professions stood out as being the only sector in which new jobs were created. However, Loane Sharp, labour market economist at Adcorp, said that these vacancies could not be filled owing to a critical skills shortage in South Africa (see Businesstech, 2014).

According to Jenvey (2012) there were as many as 829 800 unfilled positions for high-skilled workers across a wide range of occupations in South Africa. More than half of these positions were in management and the remainder were largely professional positions in accounting, law, medicine, engineering and finance. Businesstech (2014) found that there were an estimated 470,000 vacancies in the private sector which could be filled almost immediately if the skills were available. More than half (52 per cent) of these positions were in management, and the remainder (37 per cent) were largely professional positions in accounting, law, medicine, engineering and finance. Although a tertiary qualification is the most successful indicator of finding employment,

the unemployed graduates fail to find employment because their qualifications do not match those sought by employers (also see Bhorat and Goga, 2013). The problem is that tertiary institutions continue to produce arts, humanities, social science and mid-level professional graduates (i.e. teachers and nurses), whereas employers seek managers and high-level professional graduates (i.e. accountants, lawyers, doctors and engineers) (see Van Schalkwyk, 2002; *City Press*, 16/06, 2011; *The Sowetan Live*, 10/01, 2012; Jenvey, 2012; *Businessstech*, 2014).

A change in the economy can render certain skills less important and the graduates with these skills may find themselves in employment that is not related to their qualifications (see *City Press*, 16/06, 2011). Against this backdrop one expects that humanities graduates, because of the general nature of their degrees, will be at a disadvantage compared to science and commerce graduates. The courses offered in the science and commerce faculties (more especially by the commerce faculty) at Rhodes University encompass the various ICT skills that the economy needs. That places the commerce graduates at an added advantage. This dissertation also seeks to reveal how fields of study contribute to the inequalities which are experienced by Rhodes graduates in the labour market.

## **2.7 INFLUENTIAL FACTORS IN THE LABOUR MARKET DESTINATIONS OF RECENT UNIVERSITY GRADUATES IN SOUTH AFRICA**

As identified earlier, much of the information on university graduates and their labour market outcomes stems from Labour Force Surveys, institutional surveys and exit interviews. A number of higher education institutions have been doing regular ‘exit-surveys’ at graduation ceremonies or attempt to track graduate progress through their alumni offices (CHEC, 2013). It is, therefore, important to discuss some of the research findings from previous graduate tracer studies conducted in South Africa (through the LMS theory framework) in order to provide a context for this dissertation. This section presents the research findings of tracer studies conducted in South Africa after 1994. These tracer studies highlight some of the factors that influence the graduates’ employability and positions within the labour market. Recent tracer studies have found that employment graduate labour market experiences are unequal in South Africa as a result of race, sex, field of study and type of institution (i.e. HWUs versus HBUs). However these studies also found that field of study was becoming a stronger determinant for labour market success in South Africa (Cosser, 2003; Moleke, 2005; Letseka and Maile, 2008; CHEC, 2013).

### **2.7.1 Race**

The recent tracer studies indicate that race is still very influential in determining the outcomes and experiences of graduates in the labour market (see Cosser 2003; Moleke, 2005; Letseka et al., 2010; CHEC, 2013). The results from these studies show that African graduates experience longer period of unemployment compared to graduates from other race groups. This trend was also validated in a tracer study conducted by Cosser and Letseka (2010). In this study, graduates from the following institutions were traced: the University of Fort Hare, the University of the Western Cape, Peninsula Technikon, Stellenbosch University, the University of the Witwatersrand, the University of the North and Pretoria Technikon (Cosser and Letseka, 2010). Once again, one of the key findings was that Black graduates and those who obtained a degree in the humanities, were more likely to be unemployed (Cosser and Letseka, 2010). The findings suggest that race is still one of the strongest indicators of both successfully completing a university degree and of finding employment, even after controlling for type of institution and field of study.

Another study conducted by CHEC (2013) traced graduates from four Western Cape universities and found that a very high proportion of all graduates were employed. However, according to this study (CHEC, 2013), race still remains the strongest indicator of whether a person will find work, especially in the private sector. Whites were more likely to have found work in the private sector and were far more effective in tapping into social networks to find employment (see CHEC, 2013; Paton, 2013). African graduates, on the other hand, were most likely to find their first job in the public sector (see Timeslive, 2012; Jenvey 2012; Paton, 2013; CHEC, 2013). This indicates that racial discrimination still pervades the South African labour market. This dissertation will show that even graduates from HWU experience racial inequalities and disparities in their employment experiences. Thus reflecting the South African labour market is still entrenched (in a modified way) in racial dualism (see Cassim, 1982).

According to dual labour market theorists, Black workers in America predominate in secondary and subordinate segments of the labour market and they are often confined to distinct segments within those sub-markets (see Lang and Lehmann, 2011). Certain jobs are 'race-typed' segregated by prejudice and by labour market institutions (see Reich, Gordon and Edwards, 1973; Braddock and McPartland, 1987). This is also true in the South African context; because of the racial prejudices of the past, many Black workers find themselves at the bottom end of the skills and

earning spectrum (Bhorat and Oosthuizen, 2004). As seen above, this even includes university graduates. Using LMS theory we can understand that racial inequality has a long history in South Africa (see Nattrass and Seekings, 2001). However, the studies also showed that once employed, the skills component became more of a differentiating factor than race and sex (see Moleke, 2005). This dissertation will explore the issue of race and will also investigate the labour market trajectories of Rhodes graduates from different racial groupings. These experiences are bound to reflect (in some aspects of their transitions into the labour market) the broader labour market reality of racial inequality (see Van den Berghe, 1987).

### **2.7.2 Sex**

According to LMS theory, certain jobs in the labour market are generally restricted to women (see Reich et al., 1973:360). Female-dominated jobs often require and encourage a serving mentality to provide services to other people and particularly to men (see Weisskoff, 1971; Zellner, 1972). These characteristics are encouraged by family and schooling institutions. This is a global reality and forms part of the broader structure of patriarchy and capitalism and is perpetuated by social and political institutions in our societies (see Hartmann, 1976). However, over the past quarter century, women have joined the labour market in increasing numbers, thereby slowly closing the participation gap between the sexes. These developments have created stronger market rewards for women's labour force participation. There is now a greater demand for female labour in certain sectors (see World Bank, 2012). However, while the sexual gap in schooling is closing around the globe, there are remaining sexual differences in pay and employment levels as well as in the types of activities that men and women perform in the labour market (see Anker, 1997; Hartmann, 1976; Brewer, 1999; Hinks, 2002; Budig, 2002; Azmat and Petrongolo, 2014).

Wage-based discrimination is a major factor as well (see Hinks, 2002). It occurs when men and women perform equal work yet women are paid less. In countries around the world, studies have shown that women generally earn less than men. The ILO reports that women earn 20-30 per cent less than men worldwide (ILO, 2004). Another way in which indirect, institutionalized discrimination in employment manifests itself is in labour market segregation. Segregation occurs when women and men are grouped in different occupations or in different sectors of the economy (see Zellner, 1972; ILO, 2004). The glass ceiling is a way of describing the phenomenon of an invisible barrier that keeps women from occupying the highest positions in the labour market (see

Bass and Avolio, 1994). In countries at varying levels of development, evidence shows that women are underrepresented at all levels of management (see Cotter, Hermsen, Ovadia and Vanneman, 2001; Budig, 2002; Radebe, 2013; Azmat and Petrongolo, 2014).

Studies on the South African labour market are often devoted only to racial comparisons (Kingdon and Knight, 2002). However, sexual discrimination has long been entrenched in the South African labour market (Shepherd, 2008). In 1999, Rospabe (2001) studied not only sexual wage gaps but also focused on employment and occupational discrimination by sex. She concluded that occupational attainment in particular is characterized by inequality and discrimination by sex. Inequality based on sex has clearly been a major part of the South African labour market. Apartheid acted to curb the participation of women in various aspects of life (see Cock, 1980). It had profound effects on what was possible both in the private and public lives of women through a patriarchy encouraged by the apartheid state (see Cock, 1980; Msimang, 2001; Grun, 2004). Grun (2004) found that more than half of African women remained unemployed, with an unemployment rate of 54 percent. This is in contrast to white males who, although experiencing an increase in unemployment, have an unemployment rate of only 6.4 percent. Within all race groups, female unemployment rates continue to be higher than those of their male counterparts (see Sheperd, 2008). Women also continue to make up a smaller portion of the labour force, despite rising female participation rates. Female participation in the South African labour market has increased, but there still remain stark differences in employment patterns for males and females. This is also reflected in the industries and sectors where females are predominantly employed (see Lee, 2005). Even within the same sexual categories, research indicates that there are disparities between the different race groups. According to Moleke (2005a), black female graduates with degrees in the humanities and graduates from historically black universities were more likely to experience longer periods of unemployment. The study also revealed that female graduates who hold qualifications with a professional focus tend to have more positive labour market prospects as compared to those who hold qualifications of a general nature (Moleke, 2005a).

This is an indication that field of qualification is a stronger measure of labour market success of graduates in the South Africa. Women saw an increase in their share of higher skilled jobs from 1995 to 2005 (see Van der Westhuizen, Goga and Oosthuizen, 2007). The share of women in managerial and professional occupations in South Africa has increased (CHEC, 2013). Shepherd

(2008) suggested that in every occupation women have managed to increase their share of jobs held in absolute terms, albeit to differing degrees. However, male domination of top-level jobs continues to occur in the South African labour market (see Radebe, 2013; Times Live, 2013). Women are not represented in top level jobs (see *Times Live*, 2013; Department of Labour, 2014). However, although a substantial amount of occupational movement has occurred especially within the Coloured and Indian race groups, white women continue dominate the jobs in more skilled occupations (see Sheperd, 2008). It is therefore clear that a high degree of inequality continues to exist in the labour market experiences of men and women in South Africa (see Grun, 2004; Hinks, 2002; Shepherd, 2008). Not discounting this finding, it seems that race and field of study are stronger determinants of labour market success in South Africa (see Moleke, 2005a). In a study conducted by Chambers (2010) tracking Rhodes graduates, she found that of the 200 respondents who were employed, 61 percent were female. This again does not tell us much about their employment patterns and experiences in the labour market. The study also does not explain the inter-racial differences within the same sexual groups, nor does it show what role their chosen fields of study play in the labour market outcomes of graduates. This lack of knowledge forms the motivation for this dissertation. In the data analysis chapters, race, sex and course of study will be controlled. However, recent studies have also identified another influential factor, which is the type of institution attended by graduates.

### **2.7.3 Historically White universities versus historically Black universities**

According to Bhorat et al. (2012), unemployment rates are much higher for non-completers than for graduates (a discrepancy is observed for Whites as explained below) and for Africans than for Whites. The unemployment rates for individuals from HWUs were significantly lower than for those from HBUs, under both the broad and the narrow definitions of unemployment. The largest gap exists between the unemployment rates for African graduates and non-completers at HBUs (40 per cent and 48 per cent respectively) compared to those of their White counterparts at HWUs (10 per cent and four per cent respectively).

One of the more recent graduate tracer studies conducted by CHEC (2013) confirms these findings eight years after the Moleke study which was conducted in 2005. Overall, the study found that 84 per cent of the interviewed cohort was employed at the time of the interview. Similar to other studies it was found that the burden of unemployment was concentrated among African graduates

and that the institutional differences were significant (difference between graduates from HWUs and graduates from HBUs). A broad picture emerging from these types of survey is that graduates from HWUs (such as the University of Cape Town and Stellenbosch University) report very low rates of unemployment while students from HBUs (such as the University of the Western Cape and the Cape Peninsula University of Technology) have a higher risk of unemployment and take longer to find their first job (CHEC, 2013).

This institutional difference in labour market outcomes is one of the key findings in a number of South African graduate tracer studies (CHEC, 2013). From a heterodox approach, one can deduce that these findings highlight the strong influence that institutions of higher learning have on the career trajectories of recent graduates in the South African labour market. In addition, the ‘perceived’ inferior quality of HBUs compared to HWUs has a major influence on employers’ decisions when it comes to recruiting graduates. During apartheid HBUs were viewed as inferior by most employers, partly due to the resource inequalities when compared to the HWUs (see Reddy 2004; Bunting 2006). After 1994, the African National Congress-led government implemented a number of policies and invested large amounts of money to restructure the higher education sector and to eliminate the institutional inequalities caused by apartheid policies (see HESA, 2009).

From another angle, these outcomes reflect the concept of institutionalized racism – i.e. the irrational belief in the intellectual inferiority of Blacks compared to other race groups which is still evident in many spheres of South African society (De Vos, 2012). This highlights and casts doubt on orthodox economic theories of the graduate labour market. Despite this, as research indicates, employers show more confidence in graduates from HWUs (see Moleke, 2005). This points to the dynamics of internal labour markets as proposed by LMS theorists, where barriers exist as a result of employers preferring certain group of graduates from a particular institution over others (see Braddock and McPartland, 1987).

#### **2.7.4 Field of study**

Even though race, sex and type of institution attended play a crucial role in the labour market outcomes of graduates, field of study has become a stronger determinant of the labour market outcomes of university graduates in the South African labour market. For example, graduates from

the humanities and social sciences (with the exception of law graduates) generally take longer periods to secure employment, because of the general nature of their qualifications (see Moleke, 2005). Building on the theme of unemployment among humanities graduates, one of the most comprehensive surveys of university graduates in South Africa was conducted by the Centre for Research on Evaluation Science and Technology (CREST) at Stellenbosch University (Mouton et al., 2010). The study captured information on the largest number respondents (12,064) of any graduate study in South Africa to date. The key finding from the study was that graduates from the humanities do not face a higher risk of unemployment compared with those from other disciplines (see Mouton et al., 2010). Humanities graduates however, do earn considerably less (between 30 and 35 per cent) than graduates with more technical degrees (e.g. engineers) (also see Businesstech, 2014).

While university graduates are generally categorized as skilled in the labour market, the demand for their skills is divergent. Certain graduates' skills are in greater demand than others. Research shows that programmes offered in faculties such as humanities are less demanded by employers and have a lower exchange rate in the market place, which puts students at a disadvantage (Maharasoia and Hay, 2001). For Bhorat et al. (2013), this is a reflection of the shift in the broader global economy and the skills demands that go along with it. Although graduates are likely to find employment, their experiences in the labour market are bound to vary. A number of studies on graduate employment in the post-apartheid period (Cosser, 2003; Moleke, 2005; CHEC, 2013) suggest that race, sex and type of institution (i.e. HWUs versus HBUs) are still significant determinants of labour market outcomes. There are also a variety of secondary factors that influence the labour market destinations of graduates, such as geographical location, personal contacts, age and experience.

#### **2.7.5 Geographical location**

Geography plays a significant role in the labour market outcomes of new graduates. In orthodox theory, the labour market is seen as a geographic reflection of the abstract competitive model. Orthodox theorists propose that labour markets are insulated from external influences (see Fleetwood, 2008). They also add that the rules of the local labour markets are fixed and operate in the same manner in every place they are situated in. LMS theories provide a more realistic explanation of local labour markets and the historical processes that shape them. LMS theorists

acknowledge the spatial unevenness in local labour markets (see Peck, 1996). This means that employability is also influenced by geography because graduates may struggle to find work in one location but find work easily in another area. This validates the point made by McQuaid and Lindsay (2005) that employability is highly interactive and that there are both internal and external factors which influence employability. Research indicates that graduates migrate to bigger urban centres to increase their career prospects (Miller, 2014). Urban and regional geographers also highlight the importance of young people's mental maps of jobs and mobility in contributing to their employability (Galster and Killen, 1995). This means that where graduates are located influences their chances of securing employment. There are evident geographical inequalities in so far as certain areas have better employment prospects than others (Bauder, 2001). Geographic areas vary in terms of the characteristics of the industries, jobs available, resident population, residential areas, public services and the nature of each area's access to transportation routes (see Hanson and Pratt, 1992). Gauteng is the smallest province in South Africa, geographically speaking, but is the second most populated province in South Africa. In addition, it has a greater percentage of in-migrants (migrants moving into Gauteng from other provinces) than any of the other eight provinces. This is because Johannesburg generates 17 per cent of the country's gross domestic product, mostly through the manufacturing, retail and service industry sectors. And with all the major banks and Africa's largest stock exchange - the Johannesburg Stock Exchange in Sandton - it is considered to be the seat of the financial sector in South Africa (City of Johannesburg, 2014). Therefore Gauteng continues to be perceived as offering greater job opportunities and associated improvement in standards of living than most of the other provinces (Oosthuizen and Pranushka, 2004). Many young graduates migrate to the Gauteng province in search of better career opportunities and livelihoods. By contrast, the Eastern Cape remains largely under-developed. Currently, economic activity is concentrated in Port Elizabeth, East London and Mthatha. Although there is economic growth, there are high levels of unemployment and poverty particularly in the rural areas where two thirds of the population resides (see Westaway, 2012).

According to StatsSA (2014b), Black Africans constituted 80.8 per cent of the Eastern Cape population. Coloureds made up 8.8 per cent of the Eastern Cape population, whilst Whites made-up 8.4 per cent. Indian/Asians constituted only 2.5 per cent of the population of the Eastern Cape. The province struggles to generate its own revenues: 98 per cent of provincial government revenue receipts are supplied by the national government (see DEDEA, 2011). Between the first quarter of

2012 and the first quarter of 2014, the official unemployment rate in the province increased from 28 per cent to 29.4 per cent (see NALSU, 2014). Research indicates that the Eastern Cape experiences a large number of people leaving the province in search of better opportunities in other provinces (see Miti, 2013). Because of low economic growth and limited job opportunities, graduates find themselves in areas where their skills are not in demand and may suffer unemployment or take jobs which are not related to what they studied. This may explain why graduates may want to migrate to provinces with more employment opportunities.

### **2.7.6 Personal contacts**

Numerous studies have examined the search methods used by job seekers ranging from jobs found through advertising, employment agencies and direct application to employee referrals or some other hiring channel (see Saloner, 1985; Lin and Dumin, 1986; Montgomery, 1991). A dominant theme running through this literature is the importance of friends and family as sources of employment information and as channels through which job seekers secure employment (see Saloner, 1985; Granovetter, 1995). There are significant advantages to having personal contacts who are in key positions in the labour market. Individuals from higher economic classes have better labour market connections and are able to secure employment faster than individuals from lower classes (see Berman, 2011; Gordon, 2013).

Because of the history of racial inequality in South Africa, Whites have better labour market connections than any other race groups in the country. Research does show that White graduates have a higher success rate in the labour market largely due to better connections in the labour market (see Timeslive, 2012; Paton, 2013; CHEC, 2013). This validates the concept of interactive employability because, according to McQuaid and Lindsay (2005), employability is not only governed by individual and educational attributes, but there are external and social forces which make certain graduates more employable than others. As stated above personal contacts also play a role in securing jobs for graduates. The orthodox approach does not take into account the various social forces which shape the labour market outcomes of graduates. The heterodox approach is more suitable as it acknowledges that labour markets are open systems influenced by a myriad of social forces (see Fleetwood, 2006). This means that the labour market outcomes and experiences of graduates are influenced by various social forces.

### **2.7.7 Age and work experience**

Recent findings of a few field experiments indicate the existence of ageism in the hiring process in some countries (see Ahmed et al., 2012). According to Ahmed et al., (2012), on average, the younger applicant receives over three times more responses from employers looking to hire than the older applicant. This finding is consistent with the findings of Bendick et al. (1999) in the United States, Riach and Rich (2006) in France, Riach and Rich (2007a) and Albert et al. (2011) in Spain, and Riach and Rich (2007b) in the United Kingdom.

This places new graduates at an advantage in the South African labour market. However, work experience is very important. It is common for university students to take up part-time jobs to earn money. Apart from the money, a major benefit that students gain while doing odd jobs is that they start gaining valuable experience which can help them later on in their careers. That means that they are able to learn about the basics of doing a job – being punctual, putting in sufficient hours to get decent pay, getting used to working as an employee and taking instructions from managers. In fact work experience can keep a graduate ahead of his or her competition (Lewis, 2013). This dissertation will also examine whether Rhodes graduates were engaged in some type of employment whilst they were still studying. It will also explore which race group and sex had the highest level of engagement in employment during their university study and consider whether this may have provided a particular group with an advantage in the labour market.

## **2.8 CONCLUSION**

This chapter has outlined and discussed the theoretical framework upon which the dissertation is based. The dissertation draws on a heterodox theoretical approach, which is grounded in a critical realist perspective, to analyse the outcomes and experiences of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates in the South African labour market. This approach rejects the orthodox labour market approach towards graduate employability and proposes an approach which takes into account the highly complex and interactive nature of employability. This chapter also highlighted the historical inequalities of the South African higher education sector and the labour market. This was followed by an analysis of the post-apartheid labour market, the HRD efforts of the government and the challenges in the higher education sector. This was followed by an analysis of the various factors that influence graduate trajectories and experiences in the labour market. These factors include (among others) type of higher education institution, race, sex and field of study. Secondary factors include geography, personal contacts, age and work experience. Against this backdrop, this dissertation seeks to show that graduates who attended a historically white university do experience differences and inequalities in the South African labour market as a result of (among others) their fields of study, race and sex.

# **CHAPTER THREE**

## **RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY**

### **3.1 INTRODUCTION**

This dissertation is grounded in critical realism and analyses the graduate labour market through a heterodox framework. According to critical realism, reality consists of three domains: the empirical, the actual and the real (see Bhaskar, 1978). The empirical domain includes that which we can observe – things that happen and exist according to our experience. The actual domain is a broader one, and it refers to that which occurs independently of the researcher or any other observer who might record it. Finally, the domain of the real includes those mechanisms that are responsible for the creation of surface phenomena (Bhaskar, 1978:15; Sayer, 1992, 2004; Archer, Collier and Porpora, 2004). The task of science is to explore the realm of the real and how it relates to the other two domains. This means that in order to critically analyse the empirical results, one has investigate the underlying mechanisms that produce them (Danermark, 2002).

It is an interest in the interrelation of ‘underlying mechanisms’ that this study is adopting a critical realist perspective. Because this dissertation seeks to analyse the transitions of graduates in the labour market, critical realism therefore allows the researcher to analyse the empirical results in a heterodox manner, taking into account the socio-economic, geographic and political forces at work in the labour market (Lawson, 1997; 2006). Critical realism does not commit to a single type of research method but rather endorses an extensive variety of research methods which are chosen according to the object and the aims of the study (see Sayer, 1992, 2000). Because of its nature and size (tracing graduates from 2010), this study takes the form of a quantitative survey design. Quantitative research involves the collection and analysis of data that is quantifiable. For data to be quantifiable, the data must be able to be counted or mathematically calculated. Also, quantitative research provides a means for researchers to be able to generate statistics with the data that is collected (see Creswell, 2002). The general idea of quantitative research is to obtain information that can be generalized to large populations of people. This concept is referred to as generalizability (see Creswell, 2002).

Critical realism, however, will assist the researcher to analyse the deeper mechanisms which generate empirical phenomena (Bhaskar, 1978). This study has incorporated some of the key methodological lessons learned from international graduate tracer studies (see Schomburg, 2003). In doing so, the main lessons on sampling, questionnaire design, data collection, refusals and non-response from both international graduate studies (Schomburg, 2003) as well as those conducted in South Africa (Moleke, 2005; CHEC, 2013) were considered. Because of the challenges associated with tracing graduates during the transition from university to the labour market, it was critical to absorb these lessons in order to ensure a low level of refusals and secure a good level of representivity.

### **3.2 CONTEXT OF THE STUDY**

In South Africa, there has been renewed interest in graduate employment and, more broadly, the role of higher education in addressing both high levels of youth unemployment and the skills gap (see DPRU, 2006; Pauw et al., 2006; van der Berg and van Broekhuizen, 2012). Graduate tracer or destination studies provide critical information on labour market outcomes and the factors which are associated with these characteristics. However, most work on graduate labour market outcomes or work on the returns of tertiary education in the labour market, have used nationally representative Labour Force Surveys. This means that there is only a handful of studies in South Africa which have traced graduates from institutions of higher education to the labour market (see Cosser, 2003; Moleke, 2005a; Letseka et al., 2010; CHEC, 2013). That said, Rhodes University has also lagged behind in terms of tracing their graduates into the labour market. There is very limited data available about the outcomes and experiences of Rhodes University graduates in the South African labour market. This gap in our knowledge inspired this dissertation

This dissertation forms part of the graduate tracer study conducted by NALSU and borrows some of its research methodology from the NALSU tracer study. The resources to conduct the study were also made available at NALSU. However, this dissertation differs from the broader tracer study conducted by NALSU. Firstly, this dissertation takes the form of a case study tracing the 2010 cohort of graduates from Rhodes University. Secondly, this dissertation is not confined to the graduates based in the Eastern Cape, but it follows Rhodes University graduates into the South African labour market as a whole. Finally, this dissertation will not only present empirical data of the graduate outcomes, but will apply a critical realist approach to analyse these findings whilst

interrogating them with relevant theory. Throughout the study certain themes will be compared and interrogated, including family backgrounds, schooling, experiences in higher education, post-graduate studies, period of unemployment, methods of job searching, type of employment, networks and references, salaries, and levels of job satisfaction. Many of these themes are interrelated and the researcher will link and draw out certain patterns from the empirical data. Using heterodox theory, which is grounded in a critical realist framework, allows the researcher to highlight the varying outcomes and experiences of Rhodes graduates in the South African labour market.

### **3.3 SAMPLING**

One of the most important methodological challenges with graduate tracer studies in the South Africa context has been the difficulty associated with compiling a reliable sample frame (CHEC, 2013; Rogan, 2013). Information on graduates is held by university alumni offices, data management units at both the national and university levels, and, for students who have received funding, by the National Student Financial Aid Scheme of South Africa (NSFAS) (CHEC, 2013). The main problem, however, is that these sources of information contain incomplete and often outdated records on graduates (CHEC, 2013). An additional difficulty is that the reliability of these records varies substantially both across institutions and graduate cohorts (CHEC, 2013). Information on graduates from alumni offices is also very incomplete and initial indications would suggest that alumni office records are also non-representative and largely out of date.

A related concern in conducting this research was that access to unit records for graduates is a sensitive matter and permission to use information to track down the alumni is not guaranteed. Initial correspondence with the data management unit at Rhodes University suggested that it was not possible to provide access to the unit record databases to a third party. It was suggested that such information is protected by the Protection of Personal Information Bill. Therefore, one of the first tasks in designing a sampling technique and compiling a sample frame for the study was to investigate further the ways in which graduates could be identified and contacted in a way which would not compromise their confidentiality. This approach involved working with the data management unit at Rhodes University to contact graduates. During this process the university data manager indicated that the university registrar usually has some authority to decide the level of access that researchers have to unit records.

At Rhodes University, information on graduates' email addresses is updated at the graduation ceremony and is uploaded into a central database so there is (at least) the possibility of contacting alumni through emails. The remainder of this section will discuss the key steps and milestones that had to be achieved prior to the final design of the sampling. These steps were identified as follows.

### **3.3.1 Identifying the Type of Information Available on Graduates**

This first milestone required that all possible sources of information on graduates (i.e., alumni office, data management unit, and NSFAS records at Rhodes University) were evaluated in detail. During this stage, the type and level of access to graduate contact details and other personal information at Rhodes University was determined. It was anticipated that this process would consist largely of further personal contact with the data management unit, university management and the NSFAS data manager.

### **3.3.2 Determining the Quantity and Quality of Graduate Database**

Once access to graduate information had been negotiated, the second milestone involved assessing the quantity and quality of the data. While HEMIS data provided an overall estimate of total graduates, the researcher examined the unit records to evaluate whether a sufficient number of graduates could be contacted based on the information provided in the database. It was at this stage that the researcher determined the quality of data for different years.

### **3.3.3 Selecting the Sample Frame**

The third milestone concerned selecting a sample frame based on the outcomes of the first two milestones. This determined whether: (a) graduates from a single year or several years would be included in the sample frame, and (b) whether graduates would be contacted and interviewed using online, telephonic, or a combination of online and telephonic methods. In addition, the 'feasibility' of drawing a probability sample from the graduate database was determined at this stage. The consideration of the final sample frame and the method of sampling were based on the limited time frame, resources, on the practical availability of information on graduates, by the research questions and the overall objectives of the dissertation.

### 3.3.4 Finalising the Method of Data Collection

Once the sample frame had been identified, a sample drawn and the method of contact (i.e. email and telephonic) with graduates had been finalised, the researcher decided the main method(s) of data collection. Because recent emails and phone numbers of graduates were made available by the data management unit, a combination of online and telephonic data capturing (as developed by CHEC, 2013) was considered a feasible option.

*Table 3.1: Methods and response rates from South African graduate tracer studies*

Study	Method of Data Collection	Response Rate
Cosser et al. 2003	Postal survey	35 per cent
Moleke 2005	Postal survey	---
Letseka et al. 2010	Postal survey	15 per cent
CHEC 2013	Online and telephonic	22.5 per cent

### 3.3.5 Sample Size

The sample size was determined largely by the sampling method and, to some extent, the response rate. However, given the desirability of a representative sample of graduates and the way in which field of study and year of graduation are likely to be associated with labour market outcomes, a stratified probability sample of graduates was drawn. The sample was calculated using the following formula:

**First step:**

$$SS^1 = \left( \frac{Z^2 x(p)x(1-p)}{C^2} \right)$$

Where:

SS = Sample Size

Z = Z-value from a cumulative normal probability table (e.g., 1.96 for a 95 per cent confidence level)

P = Percentage of population selecting a response

C = Confidence interval

**Followed by:**

$$AdjustedSS = \left( \frac{SS^1}{(1 + \frac{(SS^1 - 1)}{N})} \right)$$

Where:

$SS^1$  = Sample size from previous equation

$N$  = size of the target population

The sample is stratified by field of study and cohort year in order to be representative. Field of study is categorised by the South African Classification of Educational Subject Matter (CESM) manual. Categories include Science Engineering and Technology (SET), Business and Commerce, and Humanities. In the study these were termed as the: humanities, commerce and science faculties. Another consideration the researcher had to take into account was the sample size, which included determining whether to sample graduates from more than one year. International experience suggests that tracer studies which are being conducted for the first time should collect information on five recent cohorts (Schomburg, 2003). But considering the time and resource constraints, the researcher decided to trace only the 2010 cohort of Rhodes University graduates. At least these graduates had been in the labour market for almost five years. Much happens in the labour market within the space of three years, and this study seeks to highlight the experiences of Rhodes University graduates within this period. After intensive calculating the researcher drew a probability sample of 300 graduates for the study. This number yielded a representative sample of graduates, in terms of field of study, race and sex. (However, it is important to take note that even though all the race groups have been included in the study, we must be cognizant of the low response rates of the Coloured and Indian/Asian graduates in terms of highlighting their experiences in the labour market. Therefore the study compares mostly the Black and White graduates, because they yielded substantial numbers and have a higher response rate and thus provide for a more accurate result. The Coloured and Indian groups are not removed, but the focus is mainly between the Black and White graduates).

### 3.4 RESPONSE RATES

One of the most significant challenges associated with almost all graduate tracer studies is a general low response rate (Schomburg, 2003). The response rate for international graduate tracer studies is often below 50 per cent or, depending on the method of data collection, below 25 per cent (Schomburg, 2003). The main factors which usually affect response rates include: the time between graduation and the timing of the survey, the mode of data collection (postal surveys are often the least reliable) and the level of access that graduates have to the internet and the accuracy of contact details held by alumni offices (Rogan, 2013). In general, response rates are very difficult to anticipate in tracer studies and they usually depend on the context in which they are conducted (Schomburg, 2003). The response rate for this study yielded positive results. This due to the fact that the data management unit provided accurate contact details and the fact that Rhodes graduates had access to internet and telephone. This mode of data collection was inspired by the CHEC study which also used online and telephonic modes of data collection and also yielded positive results.

### 3.5 THE QUESTIONNAIRE

The questionnaire was inspired by the CHEC (2013) questionnaire, but recreated to fit the Rhodes University context. The advantage in adapting an already existing research instrument is that the questions have already been piloted and key labour market outcomes can be compared across contexts. In line with this dissertation's objectives, the core sections of the questionnaire include information on the following:

- *Demographics*: age, race, sex, place of birth, migration history (including reasons for migration), and place of current residence.
- *Education*: school and post-school education history (including institutions attended and transition between school and university), degrees and diplomas obtained, academic achievement, sources of finance of studies, exposure to employment possibilities while studying and views of the value of such exposure, additional training received (whether on-the-job, formal or informal) current university studies (whether full-time or part-time) and plans after completion of current studies.

- *Employment*: state of employment, time in current job, current job searching (if any), type of work, links between content of studies and current employment, employment sector, employer, geographical place of employment and pay (including debt).
- *Household dynamics*: household structure, financial and other support commitments between interviewee and parents and/or extended family.

A draft questionnaire was piloted with five graduates from Rhodes University who were then removed from the sample list.

### **3.6 DATA COLLECTION, CAPTURING AND CODING**

Data was collected both online and telephonically. In the case of the online questionnaire, *Survey Monkey* was utilized. The programme allowed for branching and yielded data that is compatible with a Comma Separated Values (CSV) format. With respect to telephonic interviews, the study combined the processes of data collection and data capturing by making use of a computer-assisted telephone interviewing (CATI) software programme (Survey System, 2013). CATI software supports a telephone surveying technique in which the interviewer follows a script provided by the software and, simultaneously, allows the researcher to enter the respondent's answers in real time (see Kelly, 2013). The questionnaire was imported into the software and, during the interview, it prompted the researcher to capture responses and automatically follows programmed branches and skip patterns. Data captured by CATI software can then be used to continually update the project database which, in turn, is easily exported into a CSV format or into a statistical software package. CATI is therefore a structured technique for the collection of micro data by telephone that consolidates the capturing, cleaning and editing of survey data.

### **3.7 DATA ANALYSIS**

Data from the interviews and online questionnaires was converted before being inserted into a statistical software package (STATA 12.0) for a final stage of cleaning and validation. Once the data was ready for analysis, statistical weights were calculated so that descriptive statistics from the sample were representative of graduates from Rhodes University. In addition to summary statistics on the key labour market outcomes by race, sex, field of study, the analysis tested for associations between key variables to identify statistical relationships. Because a number of

variables interact simultaneously to influence labour market outcomes, the analysis also included a multivariate econometric model. In order to control for some of the factors which may account for the deep and entrenched inequalities in accessing and benefiting from higher education in South Africa, the econometric analysis estimated the demographic, socio-economic, institutional, academic, spatial, and household variables in order to identify the relevance of key variables in explaining different labour market outcomes.

There are four chapters in the data analysis section. The first chapter is dedicated to the demographics and socio-economic backgrounds of Rhodes graduates. The second chapter is dedicated to the transitions the graduates made from high school and documents their journey through university. The third chapter is dedicated to the transition made by the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates into the South African labour market. The final chapter is the discussion and conclusion chapter. In each of these chapters race, sex and course of study are controlled. Throughout the data analysis section, the empirical data will be analysed using a critical realist framework, which speaks to the heterodoxy of the labour market outcomes of graduates. In addition, the researcher will link and highlight visible patterns of Rhodes graduates in the labour market. Using critical realism, the researcher will investigate and bring to the surface underlying mechanisms which may have generated the outcomes of the empirical data.

### **3.8 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS AND DATA STORAGE**

The research proposal was submitted for ethical clearance to the higher degrees committee at Rhodes University. After this, the researcher was trained at NALSU in obtaining informed consent from participants. In addition, the researcher completed an online ethical research course offered by the National Institute of Health (NIH) in the United States ([www.phrp.nihtraining.com](http://www.phrp.nihtraining.com)). Contact information, informed consent forms and any material containing the identities of study participants is stored in a secure room at the Institute for Social and Economic Research (ISER) at Rhodes University for a period of five years. For the duration of the study, the Rhodes University code of ethics was adhered to and the respondents were made aware of the voluntary nature of their participation. In no way were the respondents coerced for information and in no way was the data manufactured by the researcher.

## **CHAPTER FOUR**

# **DEMOGRAPHICS AND SOCIO-ECONOMIC PROFILE OF THE GRADUATES**

### **4.1 INTRODUCTION**

This chapter provides the demographic and socio-economic profile of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates. Demographics and socio-economic status are very important, as they provide a deeper insight into the backgrounds of the Rhodes University graduates. This chapter is divided into six sections, which are: (1) the race, sex, nationality and age of the 2010 cohort; (2) the home provinces, provinces of schooling and the provinces that the graduates were currently residing; (3) the type of high school attended; (4) the parent's highest level of education; (5) the parent's income, and (6) brothers or sisters who are graduates. This information gives us a better idea of who the Rhodes graduates are and where they come from. This information also plays an important role in their journey through university and into the labour market.

Critical realism stresses that labour markets are open systems and therefore are influenced by a myriad of social forces (see Fleetwood, 2006). These social forces make the labour market more heterodox than orthodox (see Lawson, 2006). So, in order to fully understand the labour market outcomes of Rhodes graduates, we have to take into account the interaction and relation of the social forces that generate them. The factors mentioned above represent social structures and also reveal the pre-labour market discrimination that occurs and how it influences the outcomes of graduates when they eventually enter the labour market (see Fleetwood, 2006). It is a combination of these factors that segments the experiences of graduates in the labour market. Because these social factors are unequal by nature (race, sex, income, schooling, levels of education), they are bound to influence unequal outcomes for Rhodes graduates. Therefore critical realism stresses the importance of understanding these factors in order to understand that outcomes of Rhodes graduates in the labour market. However, these factors only form a part of the social forces that that influence the labour market outcomes of graduates.

## 4.2 RACE, SEX, NATIONALITY AND AGE OF THE RESPONDENTS

Demographics and socio-economic factors are an important starting point when conducting graduate tracer studies, as they provide a clear picture of the population group being studied (see CHEC, 2013). The heterodox labour market approach, upon which the study is based, stipulates that graduate employability is a dynamic and interactive phenomenon. This means that the outcomes of graduates in the labour market are bound to vary as a result of both individual and external factors (McQuaid and Lindsay, 2005). For this reason, it is only fitting to provide a demographic and socio-economic background of the graduates. This section outlines the racial, sex, nationality and age of the 2010 cohort.

### 4.2.1 Racial Composition of the 2010 Cohort of Rhodes Graduates

*Table 4.1: Racial composition of respondents*

Population Group	Frequency	Percentage
Black African	105	29.75
Coloured	12	3.40
Indian/Asian	15	4.25
White	221	62.61
Total	353	100.00

Table 4.1 shows the racial composition of the 2010 cohort of graduates from Rhodes University. The results in this table indicate that White graduates, 62.61 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the 2010 graduates. They were followed by Black graduates who made up 29.75 per cent of the 2010 cohort. This means that White graduates constituted more than double the number of Black graduates. Next were Indian/Asian graduates with 4.25 per cent and Coloured graduates with 3.40 per cent. Interestingly, according to a head count of student enrolments at Rhodes University in 2010, Black Africans constituted the highest percentage with 50 per cent. They were followed by White student enrolments at 38 per cent. The lowest student enrolment rates by race were that of Indian/Asian students at 7 per cent and Coloured students at 5 per cent (Rhodes University, 2010). This is interesting because the figures in Table 4.1 do not represent the student enrolment head count of 2010 by race. Table 4.1 indicates that Black Africans had the highest non-completion rate compared to other race groups. Indian/Asian and Coloured rates remained near consistent to their respective percentages in the head count of student enrolments in 2010. White

graduates had the highest completion rate out of all the other race groups. There is a drastic variation between Black student enrolment and Black completion rates.

#### 4.2.2 Sexual and Racial Composition of the 2010 Cohort of Rhodes Graduates

*Table 4.2: Sex of respondents*

Sex	Frequency	Percentage
Male	156	38.71
Female	247	61.29
Total	403	100.00

Table 4.2 indicates the sex composition of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates. The results in this table show that females, 61.29 per cent, formed the greater percentage of the Rhodes graduates, followed by males with 38.71 per cent.

*Table 4.3: Sexual and racial composition of respondents*

Sex	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
Male	32.38	8.33	53.33	41.47	38.29
Female	67.62	91.67	46.67	58.26	61.71
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	105	12	15	218	350

Table 4.3 also shows that Black females, 61.29 per cent, constituted more than half the Black African population, followed by Black males with 32.38 per cent. Coloured females, with 91.67 per cent, also made up the majority of the Coloured population, followed by Coloured males with 8.33 per cent. Interestingly Indian/Asian males, with 53.33 per cent, made up just over half the Indian/Asian population, followed by Indian/Asian males with 46.67 per cent. White females, with 58.26 per cent, however, constituted the highest percentage of the White population, followed by White males with 41.47 per cent. Looking at each category (according to sex) while comparing race, we observe interesting results. This table shows that there is a higher percentage of White male graduates than Black male graduates.

Looking at the female graduates according to race, we also observe interesting results. The tables also shows Black female graduates constitute a slightly higher percentage than White female graduates.

#### 4.2.3 Nationality of the 2010 Cohort of Rhodes Graduates

*Table 4.4: Nationality of the respondents*

Nationality	Frequency	Percentage
Non-South African	66	16.18
South African	342	83.82
Total	402	100.00

Table 4 indicates the nationality of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates. South Africans constituted 83.82 per cent of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates. Non-South Africans only made up 16.18 per cent of these graduates.

*Table 4.5: Nationality of the respondents by race*

Nationality	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
Non-South African	29.52	8.33	26.67	8.14	15.30
South African	70.48	91.67	73.33	91.36	84.70
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	105	12	15	221	353

South African graduates made up the majority of the 2010 cohort of the Rhodes graduates. Table 4.5 also compares the different race groups according to nationality. The results indicate that a higher percentage of the non-South African graduates, 29.52 per cent, were Black Africans. This makes the completion rate for Black South Africans even lower. The fact that Black non-South Africans make up 29.52 per cent of the Black graduates means that the completion rate for Black South Africans is even lower. And this is a great concern, because it means a large number of Blacks at Rhodes University do not complete their degrees.

#### 4.2.4 Age of the 2010 Cohort of Rhodes Graduates

Research indicates that age is an important determining factor of the labour market outcomes of graduates (Ahmed, Andersson and Hammarstedt, 2010). Younger graduates are favoured in the labour market, because of their innovative thinking and the fact that they still want to prove themselves (see Riach and Rich, 2006; 2007a; 2007b).

*Table 4.6: Age of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates*

Age	Percentage
>30 Years	94.16
< 30 Years	5.84
Total	100.00

Table 4.6 shows that the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates, with 94.16 per cent, was younger than 30 years of age. This means that the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates was a fairly young population.

#### 4.3 HOME PROVINCES, PROVINCES OF SCHOOLING AND PROVINCES WHERE RHODES GRADUATES ARE CURRENTLY RESIDING

McQuaid and Lindsay (2005) indicated that it is not only individual factors and trait that make graduates employable. External factors such as geography, that is, where the graduates are located influence their success in terms of securing employment. Geographical areas are not the same and they differ according to the economy and various other opportunities (see Bauder, 2001). This stimulates the migration of graduates, in search of areas with better career opportunities. This section therefore outlines the home provinces of the graduates, the provinces of their schooling and the provinces where graduates were residing in 2014.

### 4.3.1 Home Province

*Table 4.7: Home province*

Province	Frequency	Percentage
Western Cape	31	10.47
Northern Cape	2	0.68
Eastern Cape	67	22.64
North West	3	1.01
Limpopo	8	2.70
Mpumalanga	35	11.82
KwaZulu-Natal	83	28.04
Free-State	26	8.78
Gauteng	41	13.85
Total	296	100.00

Table 4.7 indicates the home provinces of the Rhodes graduates. The highest percentage of Rhodes graduates, 28.04 per cent, listed KwaZulu-Natal as their home province. It is noteworthy that the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates came from KwaZulu-Natal and not the Eastern Cape, where the university is located.

*Table 4.8: Home province by race*

Province	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
Western Cape	0.00	9.09	9.09	15.10	10.73
Northern Cape	0.00	0.00	0.00	1.04	0.69
Eastern Cape	24.00	45.45	9.09	21.88	22.84
North West	4.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	1.04
Limpopo	5.33	0.00	0.00	2.08	2.77
Mpumalanga	8.00	9.09	9.09	14.06	12.11
KwaZulu-Natal	40.00	27.27	63.64	19.79	26.99
Free-State	6.67	0.00	9.09	10.42	9.00
Gauteng	12.00	9.09	0.00	15.63	13.84
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	75	11	11	192	289

Table 4.8 examines and compares the home province of Rhodes graduates by race. When we examine and compare the Rhodes graduates who were from the Eastern Cape by race, we observe

some revealing results. The results show that Coloured graduates constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates from the Eastern Cape. Indian/Asian graduates constituted the smallest percentage of the Rhodes graduates from the Eastern Cape. Interestingly, Black and White graduates from the Eastern Cape had similar percentages, with Black graduates having a slight numerical advantage.

#### 4.3.2 Province of Schooling

*Table 4.9: Province of schooling*

Province	Frequency	Percentage
Western Cape	44	12.87
Northern Cape	3	0.88
Eastern Cape	110	32.16
North West	10	2.92
Limpopo	5	1.46
Mpumalanga	7	2.05
KwaZulu-Natal	81	23.68
Free-State	5	1.46
Gauteng	77	22.51
Total	342	100.00

Table 4.9 indicates the province where Rhodes graduates completed their schooling. The results show that the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates, 32.16 per cent, attended their schooling in the Eastern Cape, followed by 23.68 per cent who attended their schooling in KwaZulu-Natal. This means that the majority of Rhodes graduates completed their schooling in the Eastern Cape. Therefore, even though the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates were from outside the province, the fact that they completed their schooling in the Eastern Cape indicates that they may have been exposed to Rhodes University during that period. It is custom for Universities to conduct exhibitions at schools to attract potential students.

### 4.3.3 Province in which Rhodes Graduates are Currently Residing

*Table 4.10: Province in which Rhodes graduates are currently residing*

Province	Frequency	Percentage
Western Cape	52	17.28
Eastern Cape	60	19.93
North West	2	0.66
Mpumalanga	54	17.94
KwaZulu-Natal	50	16.61
Free-State	18	5.98
Gauteng	65	21.59
Total	342	100.00

Table 4.10 indicates the province where the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates were living. The results show that the higher percentage of Rhodes graduates, 21.59 per cent, were living in Gauteng province. The second highest percentage of Rhodes graduates, 19.93 per cent, indicated that they were living in the Eastern Cape. The third highest percentage of Rhodes graduates, 17.94 per cent, was living in Mpumalanga province. This means that the top three provinces where the 2010 cohort were located are Gauteng, the Eastern Cape and Mpumalanga. The most important finding in this table is that the dominant percentage of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates was currently located in Gauteng province.

*Table 4.11: Provinces in which Rhodes graduates are currently residing, by race*

Province	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
Western Cape	8.05	9.09	10.00	21.51	16.67
Eastern Cape	19.54	36.36	20.00	19.89	20.41
North West	2.30	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.68
Mpumalanga	22.99	18.18	0.00	16.67	18.03
KwaZulu-Natal	21.84	18.18	40.00	12.90	16.67
Free-State	3.45	0.00	20.00	6.99	6.12
Gauteng	21.84	18.18	10.00	22.04	21.43
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	87	11	10	186	294

Table 4.11 indicates, according to race, where the Rhodes graduates were currently living. The results show that the highest number of Rhodes graduates living in Gauteng was White.

Indian/Asian graduates constituted the lowest percentage of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates who were currently living in Gauteng province. However, when we compare only Black and White graduates, it is evident that there were more White graduates residing in Gauteng than Black graduates. Coloured graduates constituted the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates currently living in the Eastern Cape. Black graduates constituted the lowest percentage of the 2010 cohort currently living in the Eastern Cape. Black graduates, constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates currently living in Mpumalanga province. There were no Indian/Asian graduates who were living in Mpumalanga province at the time of the interview. From this table the most important finding is the fact that Black graduates constituted the lowest percentage of Rhodes graduates who were based in the Eastern Cape. When we compare only Black and White graduates, we can observe that there were more White graduates residing in the Eastern Cape than Black graduates.

However, when comparing table 4.7 and table 4.10 (that is, the home provinces of the graduates and the provinces where the Rhodes graduates were currently living in), we can observe some interesting results. The results show (with the exception of Gauteng, the Western Cape and Mpumalanga) that all the other provinces experienced a loss of graduates to other provinces. However, KwaZulu-Natal province had the highest loss of Rhodes graduates to other provinces, whilst Gauteng province gained the highest number of Rhodes graduates. This shows that the majority of the 2010 cohort was currently living in Gauteng province

#### **4.4 TYPE OF HIGH SCHOOL ATTENDED**

The type of schooling attended is indicative of the family's socio-economic status (Cappellari, 2004). In South Africa, there is an inequality between schools (see Van der Berg, 2007). Elite public and private schools offer the best education and have the best facilities and yield high matric pass rates annually (see Power, 2014). Low cost public schools, which constitute the majority in this country, struggle to provide quality education because of a number of resource constraints in terms of equipment, stationery, facilities and qualified teachers (see Modisaotsile, 2012). Therefore the type of school attended matters because it determines (to a large extent) the choice of university, the courses studied and the transitions into the labour market (see Eccles and Roeser,

2009). This section describes the type of schooling attended by the Rhodes graduates. Because this study is based on the heterodox approach, we understand that the histories of the graduates are not singular and differ on account of a number of factors. That is why graduates have been compared according to race in this section, so as to see which race groups attended what schools, and who could afford certain schools and who could not. This is important as it plays a role in their choice of university courses and ultimately their outcomes in the labour market.

*Table 4.12: Type of high school attended*

Type of High School Attended	Frequency	Percentage
Public school/elite	177	48.36
Public school/low-cost	49	13.39
Private elite	122	33.33
Private low-cost	16	4.37
Home school	1	0.27
Farm school	1	0.27
Total	366	100.00

Looking at table 4.12, we observe that the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates, 48.36 per cent, attended elite public schools, which are known as former model-C schools in South Africa. Table 4.12 also shows that the second highest number of Rhodes graduates, 33.33 per cent, attended elite private schools. Attendance at a private school is also a proxy for socio-economic class status, as it is only the wealthier who can afford to send their children to private schools (CHEC, 2013). This figure is significantly above the national average as determined by Census 2011, which put the figure for attendance at private schooling nationally at 7.3 per cent (Stats SA, Fact Sheet: 3). An interesting outcome in Table 4.12 is that only a small minority of Rhodes graduates, 13.39 per cent, attended low-cost public schools. Table 4.12 also shows that 4.37 per cent of Rhodes graduates attended low-cost private schools. Graduates who attended home schooling and farm schooling constituted 0.27 per cent. Therefore, the bulk of the Rhodes graduates (81.69 per cent) attended elite public and private schools.

*Table 4.13: Type of high school attended, by race*

Type of School	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
Public school (former model-C/elite)	50.00	41.67	35.71	50.46	49.41
Public school (non-former model-C/low-cost)	20.21	25.00	28.57	8.26	13.02
Private independent (elite)	19.15	33.33	28.57	38.99	32.84
Private independent (low-cost)	9.57	0.00	7.14	1.83	4.14
Home schooling	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.46	0.30
Farm schooling	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	94	12	14	218	338

Table 4.13 indicates the types of high schools attended by the 2010 cohort by race. The results indicate that the highest percentage of the Black graduates, with 50.00 per cent, from Rhodes attended elite public schools, 20.21 per cent attended low-cost public schools. Interestingly, 19.15 per cent of the Black graduates attended elite private schools, which is far above the national average of 7.3 per cent, as determined by Census 2011 (Stats SA, Fact Sheet: 3). 9.57 per cent of the Black graduates attended low-cost private schools, 1.06 per cent attended farm schools and none were home schooled. This means that the majority of Black graduates attended elite public and private schools.

The higher percentage of Coloured graduates, 41.67 per cent, attended elite public schools and 33.33 per cent attended elite private schools. This is also above the national average for private school attendance. The rest of the Coloured graduates, 25 per cent, attended low-cost public schools. Indian/Asian graduates also followed this trend. This means that the majority of the Coloured graduates attended elite public and private schools. The highest percentage of Indian/Asian graduates, 35.71 per cent, attended elite public schools, followed by 28.57 per cent who attended elite private schools. This is also above the national average for private school attendance. 28.57 per cent of Indian/Asian graduates attended low-cost public schools. The rest of the Indian/Asian graduates, 7.14 per cent, attended low-cost private schools. This means that the majority of Indian/Asian graduates attended elite public and private schools. White graduates

mostly attended elite public and private schools, 50.46 per cent and 38.99 per cent respectively. Only 8.26 per cent of the White graduates attended low-cost public schools and 1.83 per cent attended low-cost private schools. Only 0.46 per cent of the White graduates indicated that they were home schooled. Another interesting observation in table 13 is the fact that the highest percentage of formerly disadvantaged population groups (that is, Black, Coloured and Indian/Asian) from Rhodes University attended elite public and private schools.

However, when comparing the race groups against each other we can observe that White graduates constituted the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates who attended model C/elite public schools. Indian/Asian graduates constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attended low-costs public schools. The results also show that White graduates constituted the highest percentage of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates who attended elite private schools. Black graduates constituted the lowest percentage of Rhodes graduates who attended elite private schools. However, Black graduates constituted the majority of the graduates who attended low-cost private schools. None of the Rhodes graduates indicated that they had attended farm schools. From these results one can conclude the majority of Rhodes graduates attended elite public and private schools and only a small minority attended low-cost public and private schools. In addition, when we only compare White and Black graduates, we can observe that there were more White graduates who attended elite public and private schools than Black graduates. On the other hand there were more Black graduates who attended low cost private and public schools than White graduates.

#### **4.5 PARENTS'/GUARDIANS' EDUCATION**

Levels of parental education serve as one of the most important proxies for socio-economic background (CHEC, 2013). Research indicates that there are great returns to university education in the labour market; therefore, parents with a university degree are most likely to be employed. Parental education is also a key influence on whether their children finish secondary school, gain admission to higher education and succeed (Ball, 2010). This section highlights the parents' educational backgrounds and qualifications. We have compared them according to race, so as to see the differences in the educational attainment of the parents according to race.

#### 4.5.1 Highest Level of Education of Father/Male Guardian

*Table 4.14: Highest level of education of father/male guardian*

Highest Level of Education	Frequency	Percentage
No formal education	6	1.75
Some primary schooling	7	2.04
Grade 7	3	0.87
Some secondary schooling	23	6.71
Matric/grade 12	64	18.66
Technical certificate	21	6.12
Technikon diploma	28	8.16
University diploma	15	4.37
Technikon degree	7	2.04
University degree	157	45.77
I don't know	12	3.50
Total	343	100.00

Table 4.14 shows that the majority of Rhodes graduates, 66.46 per cent, indicated that their fathers/male guardians had achieved a post-secondary school qualification.

*Table 4.15: Highest level of education of father/male guardian by race*

Highest Level of Education	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
No formal education	5.32	0.00	0.00	0.47	1.79
Some primary schooling	7.45	0.00	0.00	0.00	2.09
Grade 7	0.00	0.00	0.00	1.40	0.90
Some secondary schooling	12.77	18.18	13.33	3.26	6.87
Matric/grade 12	11.70	27.27	20.00	21.40	18.81
Technical college certificate	5.32	36.36	6.67	4.65	5.97
Technikon certificate	5.32	9.09	0.00	9.77	8.06
University certificate	5.32	0.00	0.00	4.65	4.48
Technikon degree	1.06	0.00	0.00	2.79	2.09
University degree	39.36	0.00	60.00	49.30	45.37
I don't know	6.38	9.09	0.00	2.33	3.58
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	94	11	15	215	335

Table 4.15 breaks down the results according to race. These results show that over half of the Black graduates, 56.38 per cent, indicated that their fathers/male guardians had achieved a post-secondary school qualification. There were equal percentages, at 45.45 per cent, of Coloured fathers/male guardians with a post-secondary school qualification with those who did not achieve a post-secondary school qualification. The highest percentage of the Indian/Asian graduates, with 66.67 per cent, indicated that their fathers/male guardians had achieved a post-secondary school qualification. The highest percentage of White graduates, 71.16 per cent, indicated that their fathers/male guardians had achieved a post-secondary school qualification. However, when we compare the different race groups against each other we can observe that White fathers/male guardians constituted the highest percentage of the fathers/male guardians who had achieved a qualification above a grade 12 certificate. Coloured fathers/male guardians had the lowest percentage of the fathers/male guardians who had achieved a post-secondary school qualification. This means that White fathers/male guardians were generally more educated than fathers/male guardians from other population groups.

This also means that Coloured fathers/male guardians were the least educated compared to fathers/male guardians from other race groups. However, an interesting result is that the highest percentage of the fathers/male guardians from previously disadvantaged population groups from Rhodes University (that is Black, Coloured and Indian/Asian) had achieved a post-secondary school qualification. Interestingly when we purely examine those graduates whose fathers had a university degree, we can observe some interesting results. Indian/Asian fathers/male guardians, with 60 per cent, had the highest percentage of the fathers/male guardians with a university degree. Interestingly, there were no Coloured fathers/male guardians with a university degree. However, even when we compare only Black and White fathers, we can observe that White fathers had higher levels of education than Black fathers.

#### 4.5.2 Highest Level of Education of Mother/Female Guardian

*Table 4.16: Highest level of education of mother/female guardian*

Highest Level of Education	Frequency	Percentage
No formal education	8	2.27
Some primary schooling	8	2.27
Grade 7	5	1.42
Some secondary schooling	33	9.38
Matric/grade 12	79	22.44
Technical certificate	19	5.40
Technikon diploma	38	10.80
University diploma	23	6.53
Technikon degree	8	2.27
University degree	126	35.80
I don't know	5	1.42
Total	352	100.00

Table 4.16 indicates the highest level of education achieved by the mother's/female guardians of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates. The results from table 16 show that the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates, with 60.80 per cent, indicated that their mothers/female guardians had achieved a post-secondary school qualification. When we examine those mothers/female guardians who had achieved a post-secondary school qualification, we can observe some trends. The highest percentage of the mothers/female guardians in this category, with 35.80 per cent, had achieved a university degree.

*Table 4.17: Highest level of education of mother/female guardian by race*

Highest Level of Education	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
No formal education	4.81	0.00	0.00	1.41	2.33
Some primary schooling	5.77	8.33	6.67	0.00	2.33
Grade 7	1.93	8.33	0.00	0.94	1.45
Some secondary schooling	20.19	8.33	13.33	4.23	9.59
Matric/grade 12	9.62	25.00	40.00	27.70	22.67
Technical college certificate	1.92	0.00	0.00	7.51	5.23
Technikon diploma	6.73	8.33	0.00	14.08	11.05
University diploma	7.69	8.33	6.67	6.10	6.69
Technikon degree	1.92	0.00	0.00	2.82	2.33
University degree	37.50	25.00	33.33	34.27	34.88
I don't know	1.92	8.33	0.00	0.94	1.45
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	104	12	15	213	344

Table 4.17 breaks down the results according to race. These results show that over half of the Black graduates, with 55.76 per cent, indicated that their mothers/female guardians had achieved a post-secondary school qualification. Fewer than half of the Coloured mothers/female guardians, with 41.67 per cent, had achieved a post-secondary school qualification. Less than half of the Indian/Asian graduates, with 40 per cent, indicated that their mothers's/female guardians had achieved a post-secondary school qualification. The highest percentage of White graduates, with 64.78 per cent, indicated that their mothers/female guardians had achieved a post-secondary school qualification. However, when we compare the different race groups against each other we can observe that White mothers/female guardians constituted the highest percentage of the mothers/female guardians in other race groups who had achieved a post-secondary school qualification. Indian/Asian mothers/female guardians had the lowest percentage of the mothers/female guardians who had achieved a post-secondary school qualification. This means that White mothers/female guardians were generally more educated than mothers/female guardians from other race groups. This also means that Indian/Asian mothers/female guardians were the least educated as compared to mothers/female guardians from other race groups.

Generally, the results in table 4.17 indicate that (with the exception of Black mothers/female guardian) the mothers/female guardians from previously disadvantaged groups had lower levels of education. However, even when comparing only Black and White mothers, it is evident that White mothers had higher levels of education than Black mothers. Comparing table 4.14 and table 4.16 (the fathers' and mothers' highest level of education) reveals some revealing results. The results showed that fathers/male guardians were generally more educated than mothers/female guardians. When comparing table 4.15 and table 4.17 (that is the parents'/guardians' highest levels of education by race) we can observe some more revealing results. The results show that Indian/Asians had the biggest gap between fathers'/male guardians' highest level of education and mothers'/female guardians' highest levels of education. Blacks had the lowest gap between fathers'/male guardians' highest level of education and mothers'/female guardians' highest levels of education.

#### **4.6 PARENTS' INCOME**

Parents' income is one of the most important determining factors of socio-economic status. Income determines the family's lifestyle and most importantly where the children will be educated (Ball, 2010 and CHEC, 2013). This section highlights the parents' income and we have compared them according to race. This is to gain a finer picture of the household income dynamics in South Africa. It will be interesting when we compare the income of the graduates by race in later chapters, to see whether the racial legacy in the parents' income exists in the graduates' incomes by race.

#### 4.6.1 Fathers' or Male Guardians' Income

*Table 4.18: Father's or Male Guardian's Income*

Father's Monthly Income	Frequency	Percentage
No income	10	3.82
R1 - R400	1	0.38
R801 - R1600	5	1.91
R1601- R3200	1	0.38
R3201 - R6400	3	1.15
R6401 - R12 800	12	4.58
R12801 - R25600	19	7.25
R25601 - R51 200	41	15.65
R51201 - R102 400	21	8.02
R102401 - R204 800	16	6.11
R204 801+	11	4.20
I don't know	122	46.56
Total	262	100.00

The entry salary into the South African middle class is R5600 per month (Visagie, 2013). Because of the structure of Table 4.18, which describes the fathers'/male guardians' income categories per month, we calculated percentages from the R6401 per month and above. The results show that the majority of fathers/male guardians of the Rhodes graduates, 45.81 per cent, earned more than R6400 per month. Only a small minority of the fathers/male guardians, 7.63 per cent, earned less than R6400 per month. This means that the highest percentage of the fathers/male guardians of Rhodes graduates earned above the South African middle class entry salary of R5600 per month (Visagie, 2013). The results from Table 4.18 do show that the bulk of Rhodes graduates come from higher income households and that there is a small number of graduates who come from low income households.

*Table 4.19: Fathers' or male guardians' income by race*

Father's Monthly Income	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
No income	10.67	0.00	0.00	1.25	3.91
R1 - R400	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.63	0.39
R801 - R1600	2.67	11.11	8.33	0.63	1.95
R1601- R3200	1.33	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.39
R3201 - R6400	1.33	11.11	0.00	0.63	1.17
R6401 - R12 800	5.33	11.11	0.00	3.75	4.30
R12801 - R25600	6.67	11.11	0.00	7.50	7.03
R25601 - R51 200	6.67	11.11	16.67	20.00	15.63
R51201 - R102 400	10.67	0.00	16.67	6.88	8.20
R102401 - R204 800	1.33	0.00	8.33	8.13	5.86
R204 801+	2.67	0.00	8.33	5.00	4.30
I don't know	50.67	44.44	41.67	45.63	46.88
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	75	9	12	160	256

Table 4.19 describes, according to race, the fathers'/male guardians' incomes per month. The results show that White fathers/male guardians generally earned more than fathers/male guardians from other race groups. Coloured fathers/male guardians earn the least compared to fathers/male guardians from other race groups. Interestingly all the fathers/male guardians from previously disadvantaged race groups (Black, Coloured and Indian/Asian) fall behind the White fathers/male guardians in terms of those fathers/male guardians who earn above R6400 per month. However, when we only compare Black and White fathers, we can observe that White fathers, with 51.23 per cent, earned more than Black fathers (33.33 per cent).

#### 4.6.2 Mothers' or Female Guardians' Income

*Table 4.20: Mothers' or female guardians' income*

Mother's Monthly Income	Frequency	Percentage
No income	43	15.64
R1 - R400	2	0.73
R801 - R1600	10	3.64
R1601- R3200	4	1.45
R3201 - R6400	11	4.00
R6401 - R12 800	19	6.91
R12801 - R25600	41	14.91
R25601 - R51 200	24	8.73
R51201 - R102 400	12	4.36
R102401 - R204 800	4	1.45
R204 801+	3	1.09
I don't know	102	37.09
Total	275	100.00

Table 4.20 describes the incomes of the mothers/female guardians per month. The results show that the greater number of mothers/female guardians, with 37.45 per cent, earned more than R6400 per month. Table 4.20 also shows that 25.46 per cent of the mothers/female guardians earned less than R6400 per month. This means that the highest percentage of the mothers/female guardians of Rhodes graduates earned above the South African middle class entry salary of R5600 per month (Visagie, 2013). The results from Table 20 do show that the bulk of Rhodes graduates come from higher-income households and that there is a small number of graduates who come from low-income households.

*Table 4.21: Mothers'/female guardians' income by race*

Mothers' Monthly Income	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
No income	12.50	11.11	8.33	18.75	15.99
R1 - R400	0.00	0.00	0.00	1.25	0.74
R801 - R1600	9.09	11.11	8.33	0.00	3.27
R1601- R3200	2.27	0.00	0.00	1.25	1.49
R3201 - R6400	6.82	11.11	16.67	1.25	4.09
R6401 - R12 800	3.41	22.22	0.00	8.13	6.69
R12801 - R25600	10.23	0.00	16.67	17.50	14.50
R25601 - R51 200	7.95	0.00	0.00	9.38	8.18
R51201 - R102 400	4.55	11.11	8.33	3.75	4.46
R102401 - R204 800	3.41	0.00	0.00	0.63	1.49
R204 801+	0.00	0.00	8.33	1.25	1.12
I don't know	39.77	33.33	33.33	36.88	37.55
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	88	9	12	160	269

Table 4.21 describes the mothers'/female guardians' monthly incomes by race. The results from this table show that White mothers/female guardians, with 40.62 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the mothers/female guardians who earned more than R6400 per month. Black mothers/female guardians, with 29.55 per cent, constituted the lowest percentage of the mothers/female guardians who earned more than R6400 per month. This means that White mothers/female guardians generally earned higher incomes than mothers/female guardians from other race groups. This also means that Black mothers/female guardians earned the least compared to mothers/female guardians from other race groups. All the mothers/female guardians from previously disadvantaged race groups (Black, Coloured and Indian/Asian) fell behind the White mothers/female guardians in terms of those mothers/female guardians who earn above R6400 per month. Comparing table 4.18 and table 4.20 (fathers' and mothers' incomes per month) we can observe some compelling results. Fathers/male guardians dominated the higher income categories, that is, those who earned more than R6400 per month. Therefore we can conclude that fathers/male guardians generally earned more than mothers/female guardians.

#### 4.7 BROTHERS OR SISTERS WHO ARE GRADUATES

Research shows that having a sibling who is a graduate in the family is not only an indicator of the family socio-economic status, but also a relatively strong predictor of success of other siblings through school and university (Hauser, and Wong, 1989; Eccles and Roeser, 2009). This section describes whether Rhodes graduates had siblings who were graduates. We have also compared them according to race so as to gain a deeper understanding of the household educational attainment in South Africa according to race.

*Table 4.22: Siblings who are graduates*

Siblings Who are Graduates	Frequency	Percentage
Yes	213	61.21
No	135	38.79
Total	348	100.00

Table 4.22 indicates whether the 2010 cohort of graduates had siblings who were graduates. The results from this table show that the majority of Rhodes graduates, with 61.21 per cent, had sibling/s who were graduates. Less than half of the Rhodes graduates, with 38.79 per cent, noted that they did not have sibling/s who were graduates.

*Table 4.23: Siblings who are graduates by race*

Siblings Who are Graduates	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
Yes	48.51	25.00	60.00	69.34	61.18
No	51.49	75.00	40.00	30.66	38.82
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	101	12	15	212	340

Table 4.23 compares Rhodes graduates from different race groups as it indicates whether they had siblings who were graduates. The higher percentage of Black graduates, with 51.49 per cent, indicated that they did not have siblings who were graduates. The higher percentage of Coloured graduates, with 75 per cent, indicated that they did not have siblings who were graduates. The

majority of Indian/Asian graduates, 60 per cent, indicated that they had siblings who were graduates. The results also showed that the greater number of White graduates, at 69.34 per cent, indicated that they had siblings who were graduates. From the results in table 23, we can conclude that White graduates constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who had sibling/s who were graduates. Coloureds graduates had the lowest percentage of Rhodes graduates who had siblings who were graduates. This means that White households had higher levels of education than other race groups. However, when we only compare White and Black graduates, it is evident that there were a higher number White graduates who had siblings who had a degree than Black graduates. This means that White households generally had higher levels of education than Black households.

#### **4.8 CONCLUSION**

This chapter examined the demographics and socio-economic composition of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes University graduates. The results indicate that White graduates constituted the highest percentage of the 2010 cohort, followed by Black and Indian/Asian graduates. Coloured graduates constituted the lowest percentage of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates. The results also showed that females constituted the highest percentage of the 2010 cohort. The findings showed that South African graduates constituted the highest percentage of the 2010 cohort. However, Black graduates constituted the highest percentage of the non-South African graduates in the 2010 cohort. The results also revealed that the dominant number of the 2010 cohort were younger than thirty years old. Another interesting finding was the fact that the greater number percentage of Rhodes graduates were not from the Eastern Cape. The majority of the Rhodes graduates came from KwaZulu-Natal. The second highest percentage of Rhodes graduates came from the Eastern Cape. However, when we compared the Black and White graduates from the Eastern Cape, it was evident that Black graduates had a slight numerical advantage over the White graduates from the Eastern Cape. The results also showed that the highest percentage of the graduates finished their schooling in the Eastern Cape. Interestingly, the majority of the 2010 cohort was living in Gauteng province.

The results also showed that the highest percentage of the graduates finished their schooling in the Eastern Cape. Interestingly, the majority of the 2010 cohort was living in Gauteng province. The findings indicated that the majority of Rhodes graduates attended elite public and private schools. However, Whites constituted the highest percentage of the graduates who attended elite public and private schools. Another interesting result was that most of the parents had a post-secondary school qualification and were in higher-income categories. However, fathers were more educated than mothers and also earned more than the mothers. White parents were more educated and earned higher incomes than Black parents. Finally, the results showed that majority of the 2010 cohort had siblings who were graduates. There were more White graduates who had siblings who had a university degree than Black graduates. This means that White households had higher levels of education than other race groups.

# **CHAPTER FIVE**

## **TRANSITION FROM SCHOOL TO UNIVERSITY**

### **5.1 INTRODUCTION**

This chapter examines the transitions made by the Rhodes graduates from high school to university. This transition is very important as it has a substantial influence on the labour market outcomes of the graduates. The chapter is divided into six sections: (1) the choice of university, (2) the source of financial assistance, (3) whether the graduates worked whilst studying, (4) the breakdown of Rhodes graduates according to faculty, (5) post-graduation, and (6) graduates who were currently enrolled for further qualifications. This chapter explores these issues and compares Rhodes graduates according to faculty, race and sex. This information provides the basis for a deeper understanding of the transitions made by the Rhodes graduates from high school to university and throughout their university careers. From a critical realist perspective, we understand that the journey through university (and the varying experiences) is indicative of the social forces which influence the trajectories of the graduates in the labour market. The fact that there are variations and inequalities at this stage signals that there will be further variations and inequalities in the labour market outcomes of the graduates.

### **5.2 CHOICE OF UNIVERSITY**

The type of university chosen for study plays an important determining role in the quality of education the individual will receive and also influences his or her success in the labour market. Research indicates that the type of institution attended is one of the most important factors that employers use to measure a graduate's competency (Van Broekhuizen, 2013). This section indicates which university the Rhodes graduates had initially wanted to study in whilst they were still in matric.

*Table 5.1: First choice university*

First Choice University	Frequency	Percentage
None	7	1.89
Medical University of SA	1	0.27
Rand Afrikaans University	1	0.27
Rhodes University	253	68.38
University of Cape Town	50	13.51
University of Durban-Westville	4	1.08
University of Fort Hare	8	2.16
University of Natal	1	0.27
University of Port Elizabeth	3	0.81
University of Pretoria	7	1.89
University of South Africa (UNISA)	1	0.27
University of Stellenbosch	9	2.43
University of Free State	2	0.54
University of the Western Cape	1	0.27
University of Witwatersrand	7	1.89
Monash SA	1	0.27
Lyceum	1	0.27
	0	0
Total	357	100.00

Table 5.1 provides the list of universities that the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates had initially wanted to enrol in whilst in grade 12. The results from this table indicate that the greatest number of the 2010 cohort, with 68.3 per cent, listed Rhodes University as their first choice for university. The second highest percentage of Rhodes graduates, with 13.51 per cent, indicated that they had initially wanted to study at the University of Cape Town. The percentage drops to 2.43 per cent of Rhodes graduates who noted that the University of Stellenbosch was their first choice university. Table 5.1 also indicates that 2.16 per cent of Rhodes graduates had initially wanted to study at the University of Fort Hare. This could be an indication of changing perceptions towards former Black universities, as individuals are considering these universities over former White universities. 1.89 per cent of the graduates listed the University of Pretoria as their first choice, followed by another 1.89 per cent, who initially wanted to study at the University of the Witwatersrand. Graduates who listed the University of Durban-Westville (now UKZN) as their first choice university constituted only 1.08 per cent.

Table 5.1 also indicates that 0.81 per cent of the graduates noted that they had initially wanted to study at the University of Port Elizabeth (now NMMU), followed by 0.54 per cent, who listed the University of Free State as their first choice. Those graduates who had initially wanted to study at the Medical University of South Africa (MEDUNSA), at the Rand Afrikaans University (now UJ), at the University of Kwa-Zulu Natal (UKZN), at the University of South Africa (UNISA), at the University of the Western Cape, at Monash and Lyceum, all constituted 0.27 per cent. However, from the results presented in table 5.1, we can conclude that the vast majority of Rhodes graduates had initially wanted to study at former White universities. Only a small minority of Rhodes graduates indicated that they had initially wanted to study at former Black universities. These results mean that former White Universities are still viewed as first choice universities for tertiary studies.

### 5.3 FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE

University fees are generally high in South Africa and many students to rely on loans, bursaries and other external sources to fund their studies (see Nkosi, 2014). It is mostly children from higher income households whose parents can afford to pay their tuition. This section outlines the various methods that Rhodes graduates funded their university studies. To gain a more nuanced picture of this matter, we compared graduates according to race. This is because the South African economy is still mostly racially segmented and class is almost synonymous with race to a large extent (see Cassim, 1982; Visagie, 2013). Therefore breaking down this section according race, will give us a deeper insight as to which race grouping were more able to afford university fees and which were not able to, and what other methods were used to finance their studies.

#### 5.3.1 Parents/Guardians

*Table 5.2: Parents/guardians*

Parents/Guardians	Frequency	Percentage
No	118	28.92
Yes	290	71.08
Total	408	100.00

Table 5.2 indicates whether the Rhodes graduates' study fees were paid for by their parents/guardians. The results from this table indicate that the majority of Rhodes graduates, with 71.08 per cent, indicated that their parents/guardians paid for their university fees.

*Table 5.3: Parents/guardians, by race*

Parents/Guardians	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
No	40.00	33.33	20.00	10.86	20.68
Yes	60.00	66.67	80.00	89.14	79.32
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	105	12	15	221	353

Table 5.3 indicates, according to race, whether the fees of the Rhodes graduates were paid for by their parents/guardians. The results also show that White graduates with 89.14 per cent constituted the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates whose parents paid their university education. Interestingly Black graduates, with 60 per cent, constituted the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates whose parents had paid for their university fees. This means that Whites were more able to pay for university fees than other race groups.

### 5.3.2 Bursary from University

*Table 5.4: Bursary from university*

Bursary from University	Frequency	Percentage
No	357	87.50
Yes	51	12.50
Total	408	100.00

Table 5.4 indicates whether Rhodes graduates had received a bursary from the university to fund their fees. The results from this table show that only a small percentage of Rhodes graduates, with 7.84 per cent, received a bursary from the university to pay for their fees.

*Table 5.5: Bursary from university, by race*

Bursary from University	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
No	89.52	91.67	86.67	84.16	86.12
Yes	10.48	8.33	13.33	15.84	13.88
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	105	12	15	221	353

Table 5.5 indicates whether graduates had received a bursary from the university, by race. The results from table show that White graduates, with 15.84 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who received a bursary from the university to pay for their fees. Interestingly, Coloured graduates, with 8.33 per cent, constituted the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates whose studies were funded by a university bursary. However, when we only compare Black and White graduates, it is clear that there were more White graduates who paid their university fees with a bursary than Black graduates.

### 5.3.3 National Student Financial Aid Scheme

*Table 5.6: National Student Financial Aid Scheme*

NSFAS	Frequency	Percentage
No	358	87.75
Yes	50	12.25
Total	408	100.00

The National Student Financial Aid Scheme (NSFAS) is the South African government student loan and bursary scheme. NSFAS provides loans and bursaries to students at all 23 public universities and 50 public TVET colleges throughout the country. NSFAS supports access to, and success in, higher education and training for students from poor and working class families who would otherwise not be able to afford to study. Overall, NSFAS identifies eligible students, provides loans and bursaries and collects student loan repayments to replenish the funds available for future generations of students (NSFAS, 2013). Table 5.6 indicates whether Rhodes graduates received funding from NSFAS whilst they were studying. The results from this table show that

only a small minority of Rhodes graduates, 12.25 per cent, received financial assistance from NSFAS.

*Table 5.7: National Student Financial Aid Scheme, by race*

NSFAS	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
No	66.67	66.67	93.33	97.29	86.97
Yes	33.33	33.33	6.67	2.71	13.03
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	105	12	15	221	353

Table 5.7 indicates whether graduates from different race groups had received financial assistance from NSFAS. The results show that Black and Coloured graduates, with 33.33 per cent respectively, constituted the highest percentages of Rhodes graduates who had received funding from NSFAS. White graduates, with 2.71 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates whose university fees were paid by NSFAS. Comparing only Black and White graduates, we can see that there were more Black graduates who paid their university fees through NSFAS than White graduates.

### 5.3.4 Bank Loan

*Table 5.8: Bank loan*

Bank Loan	Frequency	Percentage
No	376	92.16
Yes	32	7.84
Total	408	100.00

Table 5.8 indicates whether Rhodes graduates taken out a bank loan to fund their studies. The results from this table show that only a small percentage of Rhodes graduates, with 7.84 per cent, received a bank loan for their university fees.

*Table 5.9: Bank loan, by race*

Bank Loan	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
No	90.48	75.00	86.67	93.21	91.50
Yes	9.52	25.00	13.33	6.79	8.50
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	105	12	15	221	353

Table 5.9 indicates whether Rhodes graduates who had received a bank loan for university fees by race. The results from the table show that Coloured graduates, with 25 per cent, constituted the higher percentage of the Rhodes graduates who received a bank loan for university fees. Interestingly, White graduates, 6.79 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who had taken out a loan to pay for university fees. However, when we only compare White and Black graduates, it is evident that there were more Black graduates who funded their studies with bank loans than White graduates.

### 5.3.5 Self-Funded

*Table 5.10: Self-funded*

Self-Funded	Frequency	Percentage
No	376	92.16
Yes	32	7.84
Total	408	100.00

Table 5.10 indicates whether the Rhodes graduates had funded their studies themselves. The results from this table show that a small percentage of Rhodes graduates, with 7.84 per cent, had funded their own university studies.

*Table 5.11: Self-funded, by race*

Self-Funded	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
No	95.24	100.00	73.33	90.50	91.50
Yes	4.76	0.00	26.67	9.50	8.50
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	105	12	15	221	353

Table 5.11 indicates, according to race, whether the Rhodes graduates had funded their university fees. The results from this table show that Indian/Asian graduates, with 26.67 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who had funded their own university fees. Interestingly, there were no Coloured graduates who indicated having paid their own fees. Comparing White and Black graduates, it is clear that there were more White graduates who funded their studies themselves than Black graduates. However, when we compared the methods of financing university fees, we found some interesting results. The majority of Rhodes graduates indicated that their parents funded their university fees. The percentage drops dramatically to a smaller percentage of Rhodes graduates whose fees were funded through a bursary from the university. They were followed by those who were funded by NSFAS.

Only a small percentage of the 2010 cohort indicated that their fees were funded by a bank loan and another small percentage were self-funded. These are the top methods used by Rhodes graduates to fund their studies: through parents, university bursaries, NSFAS, bank loans and self-funding. Therefore, the most revealing result is that the majority of the Rhodes graduates indicated that their parents paid their university fees. However, Blacks and Coloureds were least able to afford university fees, whilst Whites and Indian/Asians were the most able to afford university fees.

#### **5.4 WORK WHILST STUDYING**

It is a standard norm for university students to take up part time jobs and earn money. Apart from the money, a major benefit that students receive while doing odd jobs is that they start gaining valuable experience which can help them later on to become thorough professionals. That means that they are able to learn about the basics of doing a job – being punctual, putting in enough hours to get decent pay, get used to working as an employee, and taking instructions from seniors. The experience can go a long way in building a career later on after graduating. In fact that work experience can keep the graduates ahead of the competition (Lewis, 2013). This section indicates whether Rhodes graduates had undertaken some form of employment whilst they were still studying at university. Graduates were also compared according to race and sex, so as to gain a finer understanding of the different experiences of the graduates whilst at university. This is also important as it does play a role in the labour market outcomes and experiences of graduates.

*Table 5.12: Extra work whilst studying*

Extra work whilst studying	Frequency	Percentage
Yes (full-time)	10	2.72
Yes (part-time)	104	28.34
Yes (odd jobs)	143	38.96
No	110	29.97
Total	367	100.00

Table 5.12 describes whether graduates worked full-time, part-time, or did odd jobs or never worked whilst they were studying. Interestingly, the results from this table show that the majority of Rhodes graduates, with 70.02 per cent, worked full-time, part-time, or did odd jobs whilst they were studying. Alternatively 29.97 per cent of Rhodes graduates had not been employed in any way whilst they were still studying.

*Table 5.13: Extra work whilst studying, by race*

Extra Work whilst Studying	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
Yes (full-time)	4.81	8.33	6.67	0.91	2.57
Yes (part-time)	26.92	0.00	33.33	30.59	28.57
Yes (odd jobs)	37.50	41.67	26.67	39.73	38.57
No	30.77	50.00	33.33	28.77	30.29
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	104	12	15	219	353

Table 5.13 indicates whether the Rhodes graduates had done some extra work (full-time/part-time/odd jobs) whilst studying, by race. The table shows that the dominant number of Black graduates, 69.23 per cent, had been in some type of employment whilst they were still students. Approximately 50 per cent of the Coloured graduates indicated that they were employed in some type job whilst they were studying at Rhodes University. The majority of Indian/Asian graduates, with 66.67 per cent, had been employed in some type of job whilst they were studying. The results from this table also show that a higher percentage of White graduates, with 71.23 per cent, had been in some type of employment whilst they were still studying. Comparing the different race against each other we can observe that White graduates constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were in some kind of employment whilst they were still studying. Coloured

graduates had the lowest percentage of all Rhodes graduates who were employed in some type of work whilst they were still studying. However, if we only compare Black and White graduates, it is evident that there were more White graduates who had been employed in some type of job whilst they were studying than Black graduates.

*Table 5.14: Extra work whilst studying, by sex*

Extra Work whilst Studying	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
Yes (full-time)	2.84	2.69	2.75
Yes (part-time)	32.62	25.56	28.30
Yes (odd jobs)	39.01	39.01	39.01
No	25.53	32.74	29.95
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	141	223	364

Table 5.14 indicates whether Rhodes graduates were in some form of employment whilst studying, by sex. The results in this table show that a dominant number of male graduates, 74.47 per cent, had been employed whilst they were still studying. Table 5.14 also shows that a high percentage of female graduates, 67.26 per cent, were also employed in some type of job whilst they were still students. Comparing the two sex groups against each other we can observe that male graduates constituted the higher percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were employed in some type of job whilst they were still studying.

## **5.5 GRADUATION BY FACULTY**

This section simply describes the proportion of graduates according to their faculties. This is important, because research has shown that the economy is biased and prefers certain skills over others. It also shows that graduates with the more general qualification (e.g. humanities/social science) struggle to find employment as compared to graduates with qualifications which are more vocational in nature (see Moleke, 2005).

However, to gain a finer understanding of this matter and because this study is also based on the heterodox labour market approach, we compared graduates according to faculty, race and sex.

Table 5.15: Faculty

Faculty	Frequency	Percentage
Humanities	166	46.37
Science	125	34.92
Commerce	67	18.72
Total	358	100

Table 5.15 indicates the make-up of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates by faculty. The results from this table show that the greatest number of Rhodes graduates, 46.37 per cent, were in the humanities faculty. The second highest percentage of Rhodes graduates, 34.92 per cent, came from the science faculty. The commerce faculty had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates, at 18.72 per cent. Therefore, graduates from the humanities faculty dominated the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates, followed by science graduates and then commerce graduates.

Table 5.16: Faculty, by race

Faculty	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
Humanities	51.46	54.55	46.67	43.69	46.57
Science	25.24	27.27	26.67	39.81	34.33
Commerce	23.30	18.18	26.67	16.50	19.10
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	103	11	15	206	335

Table 5.16 examines the racial composition of the Rhodes graduates by faculty. The majority of Black graduates, with 51.46 per cent, were from the Humanities faculty. The second highest percentage of Black graduates, with 25.24 per cent, was from the science faculty, followed by 23.30 per cent from the commerce faculty. The highest percentage of Coloured graduates, with 54.55 per cent was from the humanities faculty, followed by 27.27 per cent from the science faculty. The lowest percentage of Coloured graduates, with 18.18 per cent, was from the commerce faculty. The greater percentage of Indian graduates, with 46.67 per cent, was from the humanities faculty. The second highest percentage of Indian/Asian graduates, with 26.67 per cent, was from the science faculty. Indian graduates from the commerce faculty also constituted 26.67 per cent. The highest percentage of White graduates, with 43.69 per cent, was from the humanities faculty.

The second highest percentage of White graduates, with 39.81 per cent, was from the science faculty. The lowest percentage of White graduates, with 16.50 per cent, was from the commerce faculty. From these results we can conclude that graduates from the humanities faculty dominated all racial groups, followed by graduates from the science faculty. Commerce graduates constituted the lowest percentage in all racial groups. However, when we compare only Black and White graduates, we can observe that was a higher percentage of Black graduates in the commerce and humanities faculties than White graduates. On the other hand, there were more White graduates in the science faculty than Black graduates.

*Table 5.17: Faculty, by sex*

Sex	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Male	29.45	48.00	53.73	40.56
Female	70.55	52.00	46.27	59.44
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	163	125	67	355

Table 5.17 examines the faculties according to sex. The results from this table show that there were more female graduates, 70.55 per cent, from the humanities faculty than male graduates. Female graduates, 52 per cent, also have a slight majority over males in the science faculty. Interestingly, males dominate the commerce faculty with 53.73 per cent.

## **5.6 POST-GRADUATE STUDIES**

Research shows that Post graduate qualifications have an added value in the labour market and can give individuals an upper hand in the employment process (see Caulkin, 2002). However, the employment process is not solely based on the human capital theory's assumption that individuals with the highest level of education experience better labour market success (see Becker, 1962). The heterodox approach proposes that the labour market is more complicated than that, and that there are a myriad of factors which influence the employment process (see Lawson, 2006; Fleetwood, 2006). These factors include both individual and external factors (see Fleetwood, 2006). In addition the type of post graduate qualification a graduate possess is also important, as

the economy is highly biased in terms of the skills it demands (see Borat and Goga, 2013). This section describes whether Rhodes graduates had achieved a further qualification or were currently enrolled for a further qualification. In order to gain a finer understanding of this matter and to show the heterodox nature of the labour market, we compared graduates according to their field of study, race and sex.

### 5.6.1 Graduates who achieved a further qualification

A post-graduate qualification can further graduates' skills and knowledge in their chosen field. Employers value that experience and often entrust post-graduate qualified applicants with greater responsibilities (Jobs, 2014)

*Table 5.18: Graduates who achieved a further qualification*

Achieved Further Qualification after 2010	Frequency	Percentage
No	100	26.88
Yes	272	73.12
Total	372	100.00

Table 5.18 indicates whether Rhodes graduates had achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014. A high percentage of Rhodes graduates, with 73.12 per cent, indicated that they had achieved a further qualification post-graduation.

*Table 5.19: Graduates who achieved a further qualification, by faculty*

Further Qualification after 2010	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
No	36.81	18.85	23.88	28.13
Yes	63.19	81.15	76.12	71.88
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	105	12	15	353

Table 5.19 compares graduates from the three faculties as it determines whether they had achieved a further qualification between 2010 and the time of the interview. The majority of graduates from the humanities faculty, 63.19 per cent, achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014. The results also show that a higher percentage of science graduates, with 81.15 per cent, indicated

that they had achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014. The majority of graduates from the commerce faculty, with 76.12 per cent, achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014. This means that the greater number of graduates in every faculty achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014. Comparing the faculties against each other we can observe that the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates who achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014 were from the science faculty with 81.15 per cent. They were followed by commerce graduates with 76.12 per cent. Humanities graduates, 63.19 per cent, constituted the lowest percentage of all the Rhodes graduates who had achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014. This means that the science faculty had the most post-graduates from the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates, whilst the humanities had the lowest number of post-graduate degrees.

*Table 5.20: Graduates who achieved a further qualification, by race*

Further Qualification after 2010	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
No	33.33	33.33	46.67	22.62	27.20
Yes	67.67	67.67	53.33	77.38	72.80
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	105	12	15	221	353

Table 5.20 indicates whether graduates had achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014 by race. The majority of Black graduates, with 67.67 per cent, indicated that they had achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014. Coloured graduates yield identical results whereby the majority, with 67.67 per cent, had achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014. Just over half of the Indian/Asian graduates, with 53.33 per cent, achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014. The majority of White graduates, with 77.38 per cent, indicated that they had achieved a further qualification between 2010 and the time of the interview. This means that the greater number of graduates in all race groups had achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014. Comparing the different race groups against each other, we can observe that White graduates constituted the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates who had achieved a further qualification between 2010 and the time of the interview. Indian/Asian graduates had the lowest percentage of Rhodes graduates who had achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014. This means that Whites had higher levels of education than other race

groups. When comparing only White and Black graduates, it is also evident that there more White graduates who achieved a further qualification than Black graduates. This means that White graduates are more likely to have a further qualification than Black graduates.

*Table 5.21: Graduates who achieved a further qualification, by sex*

Further Qualification after 2010	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
No	25.00	28.44	27.10
Yes	75.00	71.56	72.90
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	144	225	369

Table 5.21 indicates whether graduates had achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014, by sex. The results show that the majority of male graduates, with 75 per cent, achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014. The results also show that the higher percentage of females, with 71.56 per cent, achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014. Therefore both sex groups had higher percentages of graduates who had achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014. Comparing the two sex groups against each other, we can observe that male graduates constituted the higher percentage of the 2010 cohort who had achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014. Therefore there were more male graduates than female graduates who achieved a further qualification between 2010. This means that males had higher levels of education than females.

## **5.7 GRADUATES WHO ARE CURRENTLY ENROLLED FOR FURTHER QUALIFICATION**

*Table 5.22: Graduates currently enrolled for further study*

Respondents Currently Enrolled	Frequency	Percentage
Yes	108	29.43
No	259	70.57
Total	367	100.00

Table 5.22 indicates whether the Rhodes graduates were currently enrolled for further study. The results from this table show that a smaller percentage of 2010 cohort, 29.43 per cent, were currently enrolled for further qualification.

*Table 5.23: Graduates currently enrolled for further study by faculty*

Respondents Currently Enrolled	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	21.88	33.06	37.88	28.82
No	78.13	66.94	62.12	71.18
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	160	121	66	347

Table 5.23 compares Rhodes graduates from different faculties as it determines whether they were currently enrolled at the time of the interview. The results from this table show that only a small percentage of humanities graduates, with 21.88 per cent, were currently enrolled. Only 33.06 per cent of the graduates from the science faculty were currently enrolled. The results also show that 37.88 per cent of Commerce graduates were currently enrolled for a further qualification. This means that there were generally smaller percentages of graduates in all faculties of graduates who were currently enrolled for further study. Comparing the faculties against each other we can observe that graduates from the commerce faculty had the higher percentage of Rhodes graduates who were currently enrolled for a further qualification. Interestingly, humanities had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were enrolled for further study.

*Table 5.24: Graduates currently enrolled for further study, by race*

Respondents Currently Enrolled	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
Yes	31.43	25.00	40.00	27.15	28.90
No	68.57	75.00	60.00	72.85	71.10
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	105	12	15	221	353

Table 5.24 indicates whether the Rhodes graduates were currently enrolled for further qualification, by race. The results from this table show that a small percentage of Black graduates, with 31.43 per cent, were enrolled for further a qualification. Only 25 per cent of the Coloured

graduates were enrolled for further qualification. Interestingly 40 per cent of the Indian/Asian graduates were enrolled for further study. The results also show that a small percentage of White graduates, with 27.15 per cent, were enrolled for further a qualification. Comparing the different race groups against each we can observe that Indian/Asian graduates had the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates who were currently enrolled for a further qualification. Interestingly, Coloured graduates had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were enrolled for further study. However, when we only compare Black and White graduates, it is clear that there were more White graduates who were enrolled for further qualification than Black graduates.

*Table 5.25: Graduates currently enrolled for further study by sex*

Respondents Currently Enrolled	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
Yes	25.53	31.84	29.40
No	74.47	68.16	70.60
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	141	223	364

Table 5.25 compares Rhodes graduates by sex as it determines whether they were enrolled at the time of the interview. The results show that a small percentage of male graduates, with 25.53 per cent, were enrolled for further a qualification. 31.84 per cent of female graduates were enrolled for a further qualification. Comparing the two sexes we can observe that females constituted the higher percentage of the 2010 cohort who are currently enrolled for a further qualification.

## 5.8 CONCLUSION

This chapter discussed the transition made by the Rhodes graduates from high school into university. The results showed that the majority of Rhodes graduates had initially wanted to study at former White universities. The greater number of Rhodes graduates indicated that their parents paid their university fees. However, White parents were more able to afford university fees than Black parents. The higher percentage of Rhodes graduates indicated that they were engaged in some kind of employment whilst they were studying. Again, there were more White graduates who were in some kind of employment whilst they were studying than Black graduates. There were more males than females who were engaged in some kind of employment whilst they were still studying. The highest percentage of the 2010 cohort was from the humanities faculty followed by the science faculty. Graduates from the commerce faculty constituted the lowest percentage. The majority of Rhodes graduates had achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014. The science faculties had the highest percentage of graduates who achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014.

The humanities faculty had the lowest percentage of graduates who achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014. However, when we compared this finding according to race, we found that White graduates had the higher percentage of the 2010 who had achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014. More female graduates than male graduates achieved a further qualification between 2010 and 2014. However, when we examined those who were enrolled for further study, we found that a small percentage (29.43 per cent) of the Rhodes graduates were enrolled for further study. When we examined this finding according to faculties, we found some distinct variations. Commerce graduates constituted the highest percentage of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates who were currently enrolled. Humanities graduates constituted the lowest percentage of the graduates who were currently enrolled. Again White graduates constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were enrolled for further study compared to Black graduates. Furthermore, there were more female graduates than male graduates who were currently enrolled for further study.

# **CHAPTER SIX**

## **TRANSITION INTO THE LABOUR MARKET**

### **6.1 INTRODUCTION**

This chapter examines the transitions made by the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates into the South African labour market. The chapter is divided into nine sections: (1) the employment status of the Rhodes graduates, (2) the means of acquiring employment, (3) the type of employment, (4) the number of months it took Rhodes graduates to secure their current employment, (5) the factors that influenced graduates to secure their current employment, (6) the monthly income, (7) whether their work is appropriate for their level of education, (8) the levels of job satisfaction, and (9) graduates who were unemployed. In each of these sections graduates were compared according to faculty, race and sex. The reason behind this is to determine how chosen fields of study, race and sex affect the outcomes of the Rhodes graduates in the labour market. Another reason is to highlight some of the similarities and differences in the labour market outcomes of Rhodes University graduates. This information is important, as it provides a clear picture of the different trajectories of the Rhodes graduates in the South African labour market. This data will also confirm the claims made by the LMS theorists that labour market outcomes of individuals in the labour market are segmented, on the account of the interplay of a number of factors.

### **6.2 EMPLOYMENT STATUS**

This section describes the employment status of the Rhodes graduates. This is very important as it essentially an indication of what the Rhodes graduates are currently doing and where they are employed. To gain a finer understanding of their employment situation, we compare the graduates according to field of study, race and sex. This is to show how these factors create differing and unequal outcomes for graduates in the labour market. The heterodox labour market approach stipulates that the labour market outcomes of graduates are not homogenous, but they vary and are

unequal on the bases of a variety of individual and external factors. Therefore this section seeks to highlight these differences in outcomes and experiences.

*Table 6.1: Employment status*

Employment Status	Frequency	Percentage
Studying and working part-time	10	2.73
Studying full-time	30	8.20
Employed in private sector	234	63.93
Employed in public sector	50	13.66
Employed informally	7	1.91
Self-employed in private sector	11	3.01
Unemployed and looking for work	18	4.92
Unemployed and not looking for work	3	0.82
Not employed and not looking for work	3	0.82
Total	366	100.00

Table 6.1 indicates the employment status of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates in 2014. Interestingly these results indicate that the greater number of Rhodes graduates, with 63.93 per cent, were employed in the private sector. The second highest percentage of Rhodes graduates, with 13.66 per cent, was employed in the public sector. Graduates who were studying full-time constituted only 8.20 per cent. A very important and profound result is that only 4.92 per cent of the Rhodes graduates were unemployed and looking for work. This percentage is lower than the national graduate unemployment rate which stands at 5.2 per cent (StatsSA, 2014a). Graduates who were self-employed in the private sector on March 2014 constituted only 3.01 per cent, followed by 2.73 per cent of graduates were studying and working part-time. The results in table 6.1 also indicate that 1.91 per cent of the Rhodes graduates were employed informally on March 21<sup>st</sup> 2014, followed by 0.82 per cent of graduates who were unemployed/not working and not looking for work. Therefore the interesting outcome in this table is the fact that the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates were employed in the private sector and that the unemployment rate is lower than the national graduate unemployment rate.

Table 6.2: *Employment status, by faculty*

Employment Status	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Studying and working part-time	1.26	3.31	1.52	2.02
Studying full-time	3.77	15.70	3.03	7.80
Employed in private sector	66.67	60.33	69.70	65.03
Employed in public sector	15.72	8.26	18.18	13.58
Employed informally	1.26	3.31	1.52	2.02
Self-employed in private sector	3.77	1.65	3.03	2.89
Unemployed and looking for work	5.66	4.96	3.03	4.91
Unemployed and not looking for work	0.63	1.65	0.00	0.87
Not employed and not looking for work	1.26	0.83	0.00	0.87
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	159	121	66	346

Table 6.2 shows the employment status of Rhodes graduates in 2014 by faculty. The majority of humanities graduates, with 66.67 per cent, were employed in the private sector. 15.72 per cent of the humanities graduates were employed in the public sector. 5.66 per cent of humanities graduates were unemployed and looking for work. This means that the unemployment rate for the humanities graduates in the 2010 cohort is slightly higher than the national graduate unemployment rate which stands at 5.2 per cent in 2014. The majority of science graduates, with 60.33 per cent, were also employed in the private sector. The results in table 6.2 also show that 8.26 per cent of the science graduates were employed in the public sector. Only 4.96 per cent of the science graduates were unemployed and looking for work, a lower rate than the national graduate unemployment rate of 2014 (StatsSA, 2014a). The majority of commerce graduates, with 69.70 per cent, were employed in the private sector. 18.18 per cent of the commerce graduates were employed in the public sector. Only 3.03 per cent of the commerce graduates were unemployed and looking work, a rate lower than the national graduate unemployment rate of 2014. When comparing the different faculties against each other, we can observe some interesting results. Firstly, commerce graduates constituted the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates employed in the private sector. Secondly, commerce graduates also constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates employed in the public sector. Thirdly, humanities graduates constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were unemployed and looking for work.

Table 6.3: Employment status, by race

Employment Status	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian or Asian	White	
Studying and working part-time	0.95	8.33	0.00	3.17	2.55
Studying full-time	4.76	8.33	13.33	9.50	8.22
Employed in private sector	56.19	41.67	60.00	70.14	64.59
Employed in public sector	25.71	25.00	20.00	7.24	13.88
Employed informally	0.95	0.00	0.00	2.26	1.70
Self-employed in private sector	2.86	0.00	6.67	3.17	3.12
Unemployed and looking for work	7.62	16.67	0.00	3.62	5.10
Unemployed and not looking for work	0.95	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.28
Not employed and not looking for work	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.90	0.57
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	105	12	15	221	353

Table 6.3 shows the employment status of Rhodes graduates in 2014, by race. The results show that the highest percentage of Black graduates, with 56.19 per cent, was employed in the private sector. 25.71 per cent of the Black graduates were employed in the public sector. The results in table 6.3 also show that 7.62 per cent of Black graduates indicated that they were unemployed and looking for work. The results also show that the greater number of Coloured graduates, with 41.67 per cent, was employed in the private sector. Twenty-five per cent of the Coloured graduates were employed in the public sector. Alternatively, 16.67 per cent of the Coloured graduates were unemployed and looking for work. The majority of Indian/Asian graduates, with 60 per cent, were employed in the private sector, followed by 20 per cent who were employed in the public sector. There were no Indian/Asian graduates who were unemployed and looking for work. The majority of White graduates, with 70.14 per cent, were employed in the private sector. Only 7.24 per cent of White graduates were employed in the public sector, followed by 3.62 per cent who were unemployed and looking for work. When we compare the different race groups against each other, we can observe some interesting results. Firstly, White graduates constituted the highest percentage of the 2010 cohort who were employed in the private sector. Secondly, Black graduates constituted the highest percentage of the 2010 cohort who were employed in the public sector. Thirdly, Coloured graduates constituted the highest percentage of the 2010 cohort who were

unemployed and looking for work. Therefore the main finding from table 6.3 is the fact that White graduates were mostly employed in the private sector, whilst the majority of the Black graduates were employed in the public sector.

*Table 6.4: Employment status of Black graduates, by faculty*

Employment Status	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Studying and working part-time	0.00	0.00	4.17	0.97
Studying full-time	1.89	11.54	4.17	4.85
Employed in private sector	62.26	50.00	54.17	57.28
Employed in public sector	30.19	15.38	0.00	0.97
Employed informally	0.00	3.85	0.00	0.97
Self-employed in private sector	1.89	3.85	4.17	2.91
Unemployed and looking for work	3.77	11.54	8.33	6.80
Unemployed and not looking for work	0.00	3.85	0.00	0.97
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	53	26	24	103

Table 6.4 outlines the employment status of the Black graduates according to their faculty. The figures in table 6.4 indicate that humanities graduates, with 62.26 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the Black Rhodes graduates who were employed in the private sector. They were followed by commerce graduates with 54.17 per cent. Science graduates, with 50 per cent, constituted the lowest percentage of Black Rhodes graduates employed in the private sector. The figures in table 6.4 also show that humanities graduates, with 30.19 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the Black Rhodes graduates employed in the public sector. They were followed by science graduates with 15.38 per cent. There were no Black graduates from the commerce faculty who indicated that they were employed in the public sector. The figures in table 6.4 also indicate that science graduates, with 11.54 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the Black Rhodes graduates who were unemployed and looking for work, followed by commerce graduates with 8.33 per cent. Humanities graduates, with 3.77 per cent, constituted the lowest percentage of the Black Rhodes graduates who were unemployed and looking for work.

*Table 6.5: Employment status by faculty (White graduates)*

Employment Status	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Studying full-time	0.00	16.67	0.00	9.09
Employed in private sector	33.33	50.00	50.00	45.45
Employed in public sector	0.00	16.67	0.00	9.09
Employed informally	0.00	0.00	50.00	9.09
Unemployed and not looking for work	33.33	16.67	0.00	18.18
Not employed and not looking for work	33.33	0.00	0.00	9.09
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	3	6	2	11

Table 6.5 outlines the employment status of White Rhodes graduates by faculty. The figures in table 6.5 show that science and commerce graduates, with 50 per cent respectively, constituted the highest percentages of the White Rhodes graduates who were employed in the private sector. Humanities graduates, with 33.33 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the White Rhodes graduates who were employed in the private sector. The figures in table 6.5 also indicate that (of the White graduates) only graduates from the science faculty (16.67 per cent) were employed in the public sector. The figures in table 6.5 also revealed that humanities graduates, with 33.33 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the White Rhodes graduates who were unemployed and looking work, followed by science graduates with 16.67 per cent. Interestingly, there were no White graduates from the commerce faculty who were unemployed and looking for work.

*Table 6.6: Employment status by sex*

Employment Status	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
Studying and working part-time	2.14	3.14	2.75
Studying full-time	7.14	8.97	8.26
Employed in private sector	68.57	60.99	63.91
Employed in public sector	10.71	15.25	13.50
Employed informally	2.14	1.79	1.93
Self-employed in private sector	3.57	2.69	3.03
Unemployed and looking for work	5.00	4.93	4.96
Unemployed and not looking for work	0.71	0.90	0.83
Not employed and not looking for work	0.00	1.35	0.83
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	140	223	363

Table 6.6 shows the employment status of Rhodes graduates in 2014 by sex. The results show that the highest percentage of male graduates, with 68.57 per cent, was employed in the private sector, followed by those who were employed in the public sector at 10.71 per cent. 5 per cent of the male graduates were unemployed and looking for work. The results also show that the highest percentage of female graduates, with 60.99 per cent, were employed in the private sector, followed by 15.25 per cent who were employed in the public sector. Only 4.93 per cent of female graduates were unemployed and looking for work. Interestingly, when we compare the two sex groups against each other, we can observe some interesting results. Firstly, male graduates constituted the higher percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were employed in the private sector. Secondly, female graduates constituted the higher percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were employed in the public sector. Thirdly, male graduates constituted the higher percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were unemployed and looking for work.

*Table 6.7: Employment status of male graduates, by faculty*

Employment Status	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Studying and working part-time	0.00	3.57	0.00	1.47
Studying full-time	4.44	8.93	5.71	6.62
Employed in private sector	71.11	69.64	68.57	69.85
Employed in public sector	11.11	8.93	11.43	10.29
Employed informally	2.22	1.79	2.86	2.21
Self-employed in private sector	4.44	1.79	5.71	3.68
Unemployed and looking for work	6.67	3.57	5.71	5.15
Unemployed and not looking for work	0.00	1.79	0.00	0.74
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	45	56	35	136

Table 6.7 indicates the employment status of male graduates by faculty. The figures in table 6.7 show that humanities graduates, with 71.11 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the male graduates who were employed in the private sector, followed by science graduates with 69.64 per cent. Commerce graduates, with 68.57 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the male graduates who were employed in the private sector. Commerce graduates, with 11.43 per cent, had the highest percentage of the male graduates who were employed in the public sector, followed by humanities graduates with 11.11 per cent. Science graduates, with 8.93 per cent, had the lowest percentage of male graduates who were employed in the public sector. The figures in table 6.7 also show that humanities graduates, with 6.67 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the male graduates who were unemployed and looking for work, followed by graduates from the commerce faculty with 5.71 per cent. Science graduates, with 3.57 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the male graduates who were unemployed and looking for work.

*Table 6.8: Employment status of male graduates in humanities, by race*

Employment Status	Race			Total
	Black African	Indian/Asian	White	
Studying full-time	7.14	0.00	3.70	4.55
Employed in private sector	64.29	33.33	77.78	70.45
Employed in public sector	28.57	33.33	0.00	11.36
Employed informally	0.00	0.00	3.70	2.27
Self-employed in private sector	0.00	33.33	3.70	4.55
Unemployed and looking for work	0.00	0.00	11.11	6.82
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	14	3	27	44

Table 6.8 outlines the employment status of male graduates from the humanities faculty by race. The figures in table 6.8 show that White male graduates, with 77.78 per cent, formed the highest percentage of the male graduates from the humanities faculty who were employed in the private sector, followed by Black graduates with 64.29 per cent. The figures in this table also reveal that Black male graduates, with 28.57 per cent, had the highest percentage of the male graduates from the humanities faculty who were employed in the public sector, whilst no White males were employed in the public sector.

*Table 6.9: Employment status of female graduates by faculty*

Employment Status	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Studying and working part-time	1.80	3.08	3.23	2.42
Studying full-time	3.60	21.54	0.00	8.70
Employed in private sector	64.86	52.31	70.97	61.84
Employed in public sector	17.12	7.69	25.81	15.46
Employed informally	0.90	4.62	0.00	1.93
Self-employed in private sector	3.60	1.54	0.00	2.42
Unemployed and looking for work	5.41	6.15	0.00	4.83
Unemployed and not looking for work	0.90	1.54	0.00	0.97
Not employed and not looking for work	1.80	1.54	0.00	1.45
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	111	65	31	207

Table 6.9 indicates the employment status of female graduates, by faculty. The figures in table 6.9 show that commerce graduates, with 70.97 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the

female graduates who were employed in the private sector, followed by humanities graduates with 64.86 per cent. Science graduates, with 52.31 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the female graduates who were employed in the private sector. Commerce graduates, with 25.81 per cent, had the highest percentage of the female graduates who were employed in the public sector, followed by humanities graduates with 17.12 per cent. Science graduates, with 7.69 per cent, had the lowest percentage of female graduates who were employed in the public sector. The figures in table 6.9 also show that science graduates, with 6.15 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the female graduates who were unemployed and looking for work, followed by graduates from the humanities faculty with 5.41 per cent. There were no female graduates from the commerce faculty who were unemployed and looking for work.

*Table 6.10: Employment status of female graduates in commerce faculty by race*

Employment Status	Race		Total
	Black African	White	
Studying full-time	8.33	0.00	3.23
Employed in private sector	58.33	81.25	70.97
Employed in public sector	33.33	18.75	25.81
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	12	16	28

Table 6.10 indicates the employment status of female graduates from the commerce faculty by race. The figures in table 6.10 reveal that White female graduates, with 81.25 per cent, had the highest percentage of the female graduates from the commerce faculty, followed by Black female graduates with 58.33 per cent. The figures from this table also show that Black female graduates, with 33.33 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the female graduates from the commerce faculty who were employed in the public sector, followed by White female graduates with 18.75 per cent.

### 6.3 MEANS OF FINDING EMPLOYMENT

This section outlines the various methods used by graduates to find their current employment. This is important because it shows that there are varying channels through which graduates find and secure their employment. This section will also show that both employers and graduates rely on institutional processes of recruitment and job search. This also shows that the labour market is an open system (see Fleetwood, 2006) and that there are various factors which come into play in the process of finding and securing employment. It is not a straight forward process as proposed by the orthodox approach.

#### 6.3.1 Private Employment Agencies

Private employment agencies are generally defined as any person/s engaged for gain or profit in the business of securing or attempting to secure employment for persons seeking employment or employees for employers (Jutalaw, 2012).

*Table 6.11: Private employment agency*

Private Employment Agency	Frequency	Percentage
No	381	93.38
Yes	27	6.62
Total	408	100.00

Table 6.11 indicates whether Rhodes graduates used a private employment agency to acquire employment. The results show that only 6.62 per cent of Rhodes graduates used a private employment agency.

*Table: 6.12: Private employment agency by faculty*

Private Employment Agency	Faculty			
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	Total
No	94.58	90.40	91.04	92.46
Yes	5.42	9.60	8.96	7.54
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	166	125	67	358

Table 6.12 compares graduates, according to faculty, in order to indicate whether Rhodes graduates used private employment agencies to secure their current employment. The figures from this table show that science graduates, with 9.60 per cent, have the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who used private employment agencies to secure their current employment. They were followed by commerce graduates, with 8.96 per cent. Science graduates, with 89.29 per cent, have the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who used private employment agencies to secure their current employment.

*Table: 6.13: Private employment agency, by race*

Private Employment Agency	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
No	94.29	100.00	100.00	90.50	92.35
Yes	5.71	0.00	0.00	9.50	7.65
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	105	12	15	221	353

Table 6.13 indicates, according to race, whether Rhodes graduates used private employment agencies to secure employment. The results show only 5.71 per cent of Black graduates indicated that they used the assistance of private employment agencies to secure their current employment. 9.50 per cent of White graduates indicated that they used the help of private employment agencies to secure their current employment. There were no Coloured and Indian/Asian graduates who indicated that they used the assistance of private employment agencies to secure their current employment. Comparing the race groups we can observe that White graduates constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who used private employment agencies. However, comparing White and Black graduates the results in table 6.13 indicate that there were more White graduates who used private employment agencies than Black graduates. This means that White graduates are more likely to use private employment agencies than Black graduates.

*Table: 6.14: Private employment agency, by sex*

Private Employment Agency	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
No	91.67	94.33	93.30
Yes	8.33	5.67	6.70
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	156	247	403

Table 6.14 compares graduates, according to sex, in order to indicate whether Rhodes graduates used private employment agencies to secure their current employment. The figures from this table show that male graduates, with 8.33 per cent, constitute the higher percentage of the Rhodes graduates who used private employment agencies to secure their current employment. Female graduates, with 5.67 per cent, constitute a lower percentage of the Rhodes graduates who used private employment agencies to secure their current employment.

### **6.3.2 Relatives**

Having relatives who are well connected in the labour market is a huge plus for new graduates. This is even more advantageous if the family connections are in line with the qualification of the graduates. However, it is usually the wealthier graduates who secure jobs through family ties in the labour market (see Berman, 2011). The less wealthy graduates are less likely to use this channel to secure employment.

*Table 6.15: Relatives*

Relatives	Frequency	Percentage
No	384	94.12
Yes	24	5.88
Total	408	100.00

Table 6.15 indicates whether Rhodes graduates had used their family contacts to secure employment. The results show that only a small percentage of Rhodes graduates, with 5.88 per cent, had used family contacts to secure employment.

*Table 6.16: Relatives, by faculty*

Relatives	Faculty			
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	Total
No	92.77	94.40	94.03	93.58
Yes	7.23	5.60	5.97	6.42
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	166	125	67	358

Table 6.16 compares graduates according to faculty as it indicates whether Rhodes graduates were assisted by their relatives to locate their current employment. The figures from this table show that humanities graduates, with 7.23 per cent, have the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were assisted by their relatives to find their current employment. They were followed by commerce graduates with 5.97 per cent. Science graduates, with 5.60 per cent, constitute the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were assisted by their relatives to secure their current employment.

*Table 6.17: Relatives, by race*

Relatives	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
No	97.14	91.67	80.00	92.31	93.20
Yes	2.86	8.33	20.00	7.69	6.80
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	105	12	15	221	353

Table 6.17 indicates, according to race, whether Rhodes graduates used their family contacts to search for and to secure employment. Only 2.86 per cent of Black graduates found their current employment through the help of their relatives. The results in table 6.17 also show that 8.33 per cent of Coloured graduates indicated that they used the help of their relatives to find their current employment. Alternatively, 20 per cent of the Indian/Asian graduates used the assistance of relatives to find their current employment. Only 7.69 per cent of White graduates secured their current employment through the help of relatives. However, when we compare only Black and White graduates, it is evident that there were more White graduates who used the assistance of

their relatives to find their current employment than Black graduates. This means that White graduates are more likely to use the help of their relatives to find and secure employment than Black graduates.

*Table 6.18: Relatives, by sex*

Relatives	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
No	92.95	95.14	94.29
Yes	7.05	4.86	5.71
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	156	247	403

Table 6.18 compares graduates, according to sex, to determine whether they were assisted by their relatives to find their current employment. The figures from this table show that male graduates, with 7.05 per cent, constitute the higher percentage of the Rhodes graduates who used the assistance of relatives to secure employment. Female graduates, with 4.86 per cent, constitute a lower percentage of the graduates who were helped by their relatives to find their current employment.

### 6.3.3 Social Media

Research shows that with the development of online social networks, graduates' personal collection of contacts is considerably larger than those of job hunters 10 years ago (Stamp, 2014). This enables graduates to network and have easier access to potential employers (Stamp, 2014).

*Table 6.19: Social media*

Social Media	Frequency	Percentage
No	376	92.16
Yes	32	7.84
Total	408	100.00

Table 6.19 indicates whether Rhodes graduates found their current employment through social media. 7.84 per cent of Rhodes graduates indicated that they had used social media as a means to secure employment.

Table 6.20: Social media, by faculty

Social media	Faculty			
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	Total
No	89.76	92.80	91.04	91.06
Yes	10.24	7.20	8.96	8.94
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	166	125	67	358

Table 6.20 compares graduates according to faculty as it indicates whether they used social media to find their current employment. The figures from this table show that humanities graduates, with 10.24 per cent, constitute the higher percentage of the Rhodes graduates who used social media to find their current employment. They were followed by commerce graduates with 8.96 per cent. Science graduates, with 8.96 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the graduates who used social media to find their current employment.

Table 6.21: Social media, by race

Social Media	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
No	89.52	91.67	93.33	91.86	91.22
Yes	10.48	8.33	6.67	8.14	8.78
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	105	12	15	221	353

Table 6.21 indicates, according to race, whether Rhodes graduates used social media as a means of finding their current employment. 10.48 per cent of the Black graduates used social media to secure their current employment. The results in table 6.21 also show that 8.33 per cent of Coloured graduates used social media to secure their current employment. The results also show that 6.67 per cent of Indian/Asian graduates used social media to find their current employment. 8.14 per cent of White graduates indicated that they found their current employment through social media. Comparing the different race groups against each other we can observe that Black graduates constitute the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who used social media to find their current employment. Indian/Asian graduates constitute the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who found their current employment through social media. However, when we compare White and Black graduates, we can observe that there were more Black graduates who located

their current employment through social media than White graduates. This means that Black graduates are more likely to use social media to locate employment than White graduates.

*Table 6.22: Social media, by sex*

Social media	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
No	94.87	90.28	92.06
Yes	5.13	9.72	7.94
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	156	247	403

Table 6.22 compares graduates according to sex as it indicates whether they used social media to secure employment. The figures from this table show that female graduates, with 9.72 per cent, constitute the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who used social media to find their current employment. Male graduates, with 5.13 per cent, constitute the lowest percentage of the graduates who used social media to find their employment.

### **6.3.4 Personal Contacts**

Numerous studies have examined the search methods used by job seekers ranging from jobs found through advertising, employment agencies and direct application to employee referrals or some other hiring channel (Montgomery, 1991). A dominant theme running through this literature is the importance of personal contacts (friends and family) as sources of employment information and as channels through which job seekers secure employment (see Saloner, 1985; Granovetter, 1995). There are significant advantages to having personal contacts who are in key positions in the labour market. Individuals from higher economic classes have better labour market connections and are able to secure employment faster than individuals from lower classes (see Gordon, 2013).

*Table 6.23: Personal contacts*

Personal Contacts	Frequency	Percentage
No	313	76.72
Yes	95	23.28
Total	408	100.00

Table 6.23 indicates whether Rhodes graduates had used their personal contacts to find their current employment. The figures in table 6.23 indicate that a significant number of Rhodes graduates, with 23.28 per cent, used their personal contacts to secure their current employment.

*Table 6.24: Personal contacts, by faculty*

Personal contacts	Faculty			
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	Total
No	74.70	76.80	73.13	75.14
Yes	25.30	23.20	26.87	24.86
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	166	125	67	358

Table 6.24 compares graduates according to faculty as it indicates whether they used their personal contacts to find their current employment. The figures from this table show that Commerce graduates, with 26.87 per cent, constitute the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who used their personal contacts to find their current employment. They were followed by humanities graduates with 25.30 per cent. Science graduates, with 23.20 per cent, constitute the lowest percentage of the graduates who used their personal contacts to find their current employment.

*Table 6.25: Personal contacts, by race*

Personal Contacts	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
No	87.62	91.67	86.67	65.61	73.94
Yes	12.38	8.33	13.33	34.39	26.06
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	105	12	15	221	353

Table 6.25 indicates, according to race, whether Rhodes graduates had used their personal contacts to find their current employment. The results show that 12.38 per cent of the Black graduates indicated that they had used their personal contacts to find their current employment. Only 8.33 per cent of Coloured graduates used their personal contacts to find their current employment. The results also show that 13.33 per cent of Indian/Asian graduates indicated that they used their personal contacts to find their current employment. Alternatively, 34.39 per cent of White

graduates indicated that they found their current employment through personal contacts. Comparing the different race groups against each other we realize that White graduates had the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who found their current employment through personal contacts. Coloured graduates have the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who found their current employment through personal contacts. When we compare the White and Black graduates, we can see that there were more White graduates who located their current employment through the help of their personal contacts. This means that White graduates had more personal contacts in the labour market than Black graduates.

*Table 6.26: Personal contacts, by sex*

Personal Contacts	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
No	74.36	78.14	76.67
Yes	25.64	21.86	23.33
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	156	247	403

Table 6.26 compares graduates according to sex as it indicates whether they used their personal contacts to find their current employment. The figures from this table show that male graduates, with 25.64 per cent, have the higher percentage of the Rhodes graduates who used their personal contacts to find their current employment. Female graduates, with 21.86 per cent, constitute the lower percentage of the graduates who used their personal contacts to secure their current employment.

### **6.3.5 Newspaper Advertisements**

Graduates have been using newspapers to find employment for decades, even before the use of the internet. This method is still commonly used by university graduates to find employment. Graduates who do not have family ties or personal contacts in the labour market or who do not have unlimited access to the internet use this method to search for work. Many employers still use this medium to advertise job openings.

*Table 6.27: Newspaper advertisements*

Newspaper Advertisements	Frequency	Percentage
No	373	91.42
Yes	35	8.58
Total	408	100.00

Table 6.27 indicates whether Rhodes graduates had used newspaper advertisements to search for and secure their current employment. The results show that only 8.58 per cent of the Rhodes graduates indicated that they had used newspaper advertisements to find their current employment.

*Table 6.28: Newspaper advertisements, by faculty*

Newspaper Advertisements	Faculty			
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	Total
No	86.75	95.20	89.55	90.22
Yes	13.25	4.80	10.45	9.78
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	166	125	67	358

Table 6.28 compares graduates according to faculty as it indicates whether they used newspapers to find their current employment. The figures from this table show that humanities graduates, with 13.25 per cent, constitute the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who used newspapers to find their current employment. They were followed by commerce graduates, with 10.45 per cent. Science graduates, with 4.80 per cent, have the lower percentage of the graduates who used newspapers to find their current employment.

*Table 6.29: Newspaper advertisements, by race*

Newspaper Advertisements	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
No	80.00	75.00	80.00	97.29	90.65
Yes	20.00	25.00	20.00	2.71	9.35
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	105	12	15	221	353

Table 6.29 indicates, according to race, whether the Rhodes graduates used newspaper advertisements to find their current employment. The results show that 20 per cent of the Black

graduates indicated that they had used newspaper advertisement to secure their current employment. Only 25 per cent of Coloured graduates used newspaper advertisements to find their current employment. 20 per cent of Indian/Asian graduates indicated that they secured their current employment through newspaper advertisements. The results also show that only 2.71 per cent of the White graduates found their current employment through newspaper advertisements. Comparing the different race groups against each other we can observe that Coloured graduates constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who had secured their current employment through newspaper advertisements. White graduates constituted the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who had secured their current employment through newspaper advertisements. In addition, when we compare Black and White graduates, we can observe that there were more Black graduates who located their current employment through newspaper advertisements than White graduates. This means that Black graduates are more likely to find employment through newspaper advertisements than White graduates.

*Table 6.30: Newspaper advertisements, by sex*

Newspaper Advertisements	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
No	92.31	91.09	91.56
Yes	7.69	8.91	8.44
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	156	247	403

Table 6.30 compares graduates according to sex as it indicates whether they used newspapers to find their current employment. The figures from this table show that female graduates, with 8.91 per cent, constitute the higher percentage of the Rhodes graduates who used newspapers to find their current employment. Male graduates, with 7.69 per cent, constitute a lower percentage of the graduates who used newspapers to find employment.

### **6.3.6 Telephone, Email or Fax Enquires to Prospective Employers**

When graduates have exhausted other channels to find employment, they often contact prospective employers through telephone, email or fax. Research shows that there is no single method of finding and securing employment (see Schomburg, 2007).

*Table 6.31: Telephone, email or fax enquires to prospective employers*

Telephone, eMail or Fax Enquires to Prospective Employers	Frequency	Percentage
No	381	93.38
Yes	27	6.62
Total	408	100.00

Table 6.31 indicates whether Rhodes graduates had made enquires via email, telephone and fax to find their current employer. Only 6.62 per cent of Rhodes graduates had made enquires through telephone, email and fax to their current employer.

*Table 6.32: Telephone, email or fax enquires to prospective employers, by faculty*

Telephone, eMail or Fax Enquires to Prospective Employers	Faculty			
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	Total
No	93.98	94.40	89.55	93.30
Yes	6.02	5.60	10.45	6.70
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	166	125	67	358

Table 6.32 compares graduates according to faculty as it indicates whether they contacted their current employers through telephone, email or fax to locate their current employment. The figures from this table show that commerce graduates, with 10.45 per cent, constitute the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who contacted their current employers through telephone, email or fax to locate their current employment. They were followed by humanities graduates, with 6.02 per cent. Science graduates, with 5.60 per cent, constitute the lowest percentage of the graduates who contacted their current employers through telephone, email or fax to locate their current employment.

*Table 6.33: Telephone, email or fax enquires to prospective employers, by race*

Telephone, eMail or Fax Enquires to Prospective Employers	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
No	92.38	100.00	100.00	92.76	93.20
Yes	7.62	0.00	0.00	7.24	6.80
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	105	12	15	221	353

Table 6.33 indicates, according to race, whether Rhodes graduates had made enquires via email, telephone and fax to find their current employment. The results show that only 7.62 per cent of Black graduates indicated that they had made mail, fax and telephone enquiries to potential employers to find their current employment. Only 7.24 per cent of White graduates found their current employment through making telephone, email, and fax enquires at potential organizations. There were no Coloured and Indian/Asian graduates who used this medium to find their current employment. Comparing the different race groups against each other, we can observe that Black graduates constituted the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates who had used this medium to find their current employment. However, when we compare Black and White graduates, we can observe that there were more Black graduates who located their current employment telephone, email or fax than White graduates.

*Table 6.34: Telephone, email or fax enquires to prospective employers, by sex*

Telephone, eMail or Fax Enquires to Prospective Employers	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
No	92.95	93.52	93.30
Yes	7.05	6.48	6.70
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	156	247	403

Table 6.34 compares graduates according to sex as it indicates whether they contacted their current employers through telephone, email or fax to locate their current employment. The figures from this table show that male graduates, with 7.05 per cent, constitute the higher percentage of the Rhodes graduates who contacted their current employers through telephone, email or fax to locate their current employment. Female graduates, with 6.48 per cent, constitute the lowest percentage

of the graduates who contacted their current employers through telephone, email or fax. When we examine the different means that Rhodes graduates used to find their current employment, we can observe compelling results. The highest percentage of Rhodes graduates found their current employment through personal contacts. The second highest percentage of Rhodes graduates found their current employment through newspaper advertisements. The third highest percentage of Rhodes graduates found their current employment through social media. The fourth highest percentage of Rhodes graduates found their current employment through private employment agencies.

The fifth highest percentage of Rhodes graduates found their current employment through making telephonic, fax, or email enquiries at potential employers. The sixth highest percentage of Rhodes graduates found their current work through relatives. The most interesting result is that the majority of Rhodes graduates found their current employment through personal contacts. When we examine the means that the different race groups used to find their current employment we can observe some more compelling results. The highest percentage of Black, Coloured and Indian/Asian graduates found their current employment through newspaper advertisements. The majority of White graduates found their current employment through personal contacts. This means that White graduates have greater access to personal contacts in the South African labour market than other race groups. Other race groups mostly found their current jobs through other means, such as responding to newspaper advertisements.

#### **6.4 TYPE OF EMPLOYMENT**

Generally, there are three types of employment, that is, permanent, fixed-term and casual employment. Research indicates that permanent employees are hired to work part-time or full-time hours, however full-time workers often receive more comprehensive benefit packages. Each company establishes its own employee benefits, but certain perks are common to most packages. Permanent employees enjoy benefits such as social security, job security and advancement opportunities (Tucker, 2014). However, a fixed term contract of employment is similar to a contract of permanent employment. The difference is that the fixed term contract will stipulate a starting date and an ending date. The duration of the contract is clearly specified between employer

and employee. In the fixed term contract the employer will state whether benefits are applicable or not applicable. Unfortunately some employers use the fixed term contract as a means to save money by denying an employee the opportunity of pension/provident fund benefits and medical aid benefits (Mywage, 2014). Casual workers may include seasonal workers or employees working for a company during a busy period. In terms of legal rights, they must also be given a contract by their employer by the end of the first day of employment and are also covered by labour legislation.

Casual workers usually do not receive benefits such as health insurance, sick leave, holiday pay or vacations. When they are not working, they earn no income and when an organization is downsizing they are the first to be retrenched (Angloinfo, 2014). This section describes the type of employment that the Rhodes graduates are employed in. In doing so it compares Rhodes graduates by field of study (faculty), race and sex. It does this to show that these factors create differing and unequal labour market outcomes for Rhodes graduates.

*Table 6.35: Type of employment*

Type of Employment	Frequency	Percentage
Permanent	218	72.67
Fixed-term contract	68	22.67
Casual	14	4.67
Total	300	100.00

Table 6.35 indicates whether Rhodes graduates were currently in permanent, fixed term or casual employment. The results show that the greater number of Rhodes graduates, with 72.67 per cent, were in permanent employment. The second highest number of Rhodes graduates, with 22.67 per cent, were in fixed-term contract employment. The lowest percentage of Rhodes graduates, with 4.47 per cent, were in casual employment.

Table 6.36: Type of employment, by faculty

Type of Employment	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Permanent	72.79	72.22	73.33	72.73
Fixed-term	22.06	22.22	23.33	22.38
Casual	5.15	5.56	3.33	4.90
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	105	12	15	353

Table 6.36 compares Rhodes graduates by faculty, as it indicates the type of employment Rhodes graduates were in at the time of the interview. The results show that the graduates from the commerce faculty, with 73.33 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were in permanent employment. Science graduates, with 72.22 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were in permanent employment. The results also show that commerce graduates, with 23.33 per cent, also constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were in fixed-term employment. Humanities graduates, with 22.06 per cent, constitute the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were in fixed-term employment. The results also show that science graduates, with 5.56 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were in causal employment. Commerce graduates, with 3.33 per cent, constitute the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were in causal employment. Therefore, from these results we can observe that commerce graduates dominated permanent and fixed-term employment more than graduates from other faculties.

Table 6.37: Type of employment, by race Type of Employment	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
Permanent	78.41	80.00	66.67	69.95	72.70
Fixed-term	18.18	10.00	33.33	25.14	22.87
Casual	3.41	10.00	0.00	4.92	4.44
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	88	10	12	183	293

Table 6.37 compares Rhodes graduates by race as it indicates the type of employment they were currently in. The results indicate that Coloured graduates, with 80 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were in permanent employment. Indian/Asian graduates,

with 66.67 per cent, constitute the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were in permanent employment. The results also show that Indian/Asian graduates, with 33.33 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were in fixed-term employment. Coloured graduates, with 10 per cent, constituted the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were in fixed-term employment. The results also show that Coloured graduates constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were in casual employment. There were no Indian/Asian graduates who were in casual employment. From this table we can observe that Coloured graduates dominated permanent and casual employment, whilst Indian/Asian graduates dominated fixed-term employment. In addition, when we compare Black and White graduates, we can observe that there were more Black graduates in permanent employment than White graduates. Also there were more White graduates in fixed-term and casual employment than Black graduates.

*Table 6.38: Type of employment of Black graduates, by faculty*

Type of Employment	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Permanent	86.63	66.67	80.00	78.16
Fixed-term	18.37	22.22	15.00	18.39
Casual	0.00	11.11	5.00	3.45
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	49	18	20	87

Table 6.38 indicates the type of employment that Black graduates were employed in, by faculty. The figures in table 6.38 show that humanities graduates, with 86.63 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the Black Rhodes graduates who were in permanent employment, followed closely by commerce graduates with 80 per cent. Science graduates, with 66.67 per cent, constituted the lowest percentage of the Black Rhodes graduates who were in permanent employment. The figures from this table also show that science graduates, with 22.22 per cent, formed the highest percentage of the Black graduates who were in fixed-term employment, followed by Humanities graduates with 18.37 per cent. Commerce graduates, with 15 per cent, constituted the lowest percentage of the Black graduates who were in fixed-term employment. The figures in table 6.38 also indicate that science graduates, with 11.11 per cent, had the highest

percentage of the Black graduates who were in causal employment, followed by commerce graduates with 5 per cent. There were no Black humanities graduates in casual employment.

*Table 6.39: Type of employment of White graduates, by faculty*

Type of Employment	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Permanent	65.79	73.44	71.88	69.77
Fixed-term	25.00	23.44	28.13	25.00
Casual	9.21	3.13	0.00	5.23
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	76	64	32	172

Table 6.39 outlines the type of employment that White graduates were employed in, by faculty. The figures in table 6.39 show that science graduates, with 73.44 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the White graduates who were in permanent employment, followed closely by commerce graduates, with 71.88 per cent. Humanities, with 65.79 per cent, constitute the lowest percentage of the White graduates who were in permanent employment. The figures from table 6.39 also show that commerce graduates, with 28.13 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the White graduates who were in fixed-term employment, followed by humanities graduates, with 25 per cent. Science graduates, with 23.44 per cent, constituted the lowest percentage of the White graduates who were in fixed-term employment. The figures from table 6.38 also indicate that humanities graduates, with 9.21 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the White graduates who were in causal employment, followed by science graduates with 3.13 per cent. There were no White commerce graduates in casual employment.

*Table 6.40: Type of employment by sex*

Type of Employment	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
Permanent	74.14	71.82	72.73
Fixed-term	19.83	24.31	22.56
Casual	6.03	3.87	4.71
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	105	12	353

Table 6.40 compares Rhodes graduates by sex as it indicates the type of employment they were currently in. The results show that male graduates, with 74.14 per cent, constituted the higher percentage of Rhodes graduates who were in permanent employment. Female graduates, with 24.31 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates who were in fixed-term employment. The results also show that male graduates, with 6.03 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates who were in casual employment. Therefore, there are more male graduates in permanent employment than female graduates. There were more female graduates in fixed-term employment than male graduates. Lastly, there were more male graduates in casual employment than female graduates.

*Table 6.41: Type of employment of male graduates, by faculty*

Type of Employment	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Permanent	68.42	78.26	79.31	75.22
Fixed-term	21.05	17.39	17.24	18.58
Casual	10.53	4.35	3.45	6.19
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	38	46	29	113

Table 6.41 indicates the type of employment that male graduates were employed in by faculty. The figures from this table illustrate that commerce graduates, with 79.31 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the male graduates who were in permanent employment, followed closely by science graduates, with 78.26 per cent. Humanities, with 68.42 per cent, constituted the lowest percentage of the male graduates who were in permanent employment. The figures from table 6.41 also indicate that humanities graduates, with 21.05 per cent, had the highest percentage of the male graduates who were in fixed-term employment, followed by science graduates, with 17.39 per cent. Commerce graduates, with 17.24 per cent, constituted the lowest percentage of the male graduates who were in fixed-term employment. The figures from this table also indicate that humanities graduates, with 10.53 per cent, had the highest percentage of the White graduates who were in causal employment, followed by science graduates, with 4.35 per cent. Commerce

graduates, with 3.45 per cent, constituted the lowest percentage of the male graduates who were in casual employment.

*Table 6.42: Type of employment of female graduates, by faculty*

Type of Employment	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Permanent	74.74	65.91	67.74	71.18
Fixed-term	22.11	27.27	29.03	24.71
Casual	3.16	6.82	3.23	4.12
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	95	44	31	170

Table 6.42 indicates the type of employment that female graduates were employed in, by faculty. The figures from this table show that humanities graduates, with 74.74 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the female graduates who were in permanent employment, followed by commerce graduates, with 67.74 per cent. Humanities, with 65.91 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the female graduates who were in permanent employment. The figures from table 6.42 also show that commerce graduates, with 29.03 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the female graduates who were in fixed-term employment, followed by science graduates, with 27.07 per cent. Humanities graduates, with 22.11 per cent, constituted the lowest percentage of the female graduates who were in fixed-term employment. The figures from this table also illustrate that science graduates, with 6.82 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the female graduates who were in casual employment, followed by commerce graduates, with 3.23 per cent. Humanities graduates, with 3.16 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the female graduates who were in casual employment.

## **6.5 PERIOD SEARCHING FOR CURRENT EMPLOYMENT**

The period it takes graduates to secure employment is indicative of their ability/inability to secure employment. This section outlines the period that the Rhodes graduates took to secure their current employment. Because this study is based on the heterodox approach and wants to show the differences and inequalities in the outcomes of graduates, the graduates' job search periods according to field of study, race and sex.

*Table 6.43: Period searching for current employment*

Period Searching for Current Employment	Percentage
>3 months	71.09
<3 months	28.91
Total	100.00

Table 6.43 indicates the number of months it took Rhodes graduates to find their current employment. The results from the table show that the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates, with 71.09 per cent, took less than three months to secure their current employment. Only 28.91 per cent took longer than three months to secure their current employment.

*Table 6.44: Period searching for current employment, by faculty*

Period Searching for Current Employment	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
>3 months	68.32	72.86	70.17	
<3 months	31.68	27.14	29.83	
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	117	70	57	244

Table 6.44 compares Rhodes graduates from the three faculties, as it indicates the duration of their job search. The results show that science graduates, with 72.86 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the 2010 cohort who took less than three months to secure their current employment. Interestingly, humanities graduates, with 31.68 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who took longer than three months to secure their current employment. This means that humanities graduates took longer to secure their current employment.

*Table 6.45: Period searching for current employment, by race*

Period Searching for Current Employment	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
>3 months	62.16	55.55	83.33	76.68	
<3 months	37.84	44.45	16.67	23.32	
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	74	9	12	155	250

Table 6.45 compares Rhodes graduates according to race as it indicates the number of months it took them to secure their current employment. The results show that Indian/Asian graduates, with 83.33 per cent, had the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who took less than three months to secure their current employment. Interestingly, Coloured graduates, with 45.45 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who took longer than three months to secure their current employment. Therefore, Indian/Asian and White graduates took the shortest period searching for employment compared to Black and Coloured graduates. However, when we compare White and Black graduates, we can observe that Black graduates took longer periods searching for their current employment than White graduates. This means that generally Black graduates are more likely to search longer periods to secure employment.

*Table 6.46: Period searching for current employment (White graduates, by faculty)*

Period Searching for Current Employment	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
> 3 months	76.11	64.00	79.31	76.03
< 3 months	23.85	36.00	20.69	23.97
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	67	50	29	146

Table 6.46 indicates the job search period of the White graduates by faculty. The figures from this table illustrate that commerce graduates, with 79.31 per cent, had the highest percentage of the White graduates who secured their current employment within less than three months, followed by humanities graduates with 76.11 per cent. Science graduates, with 64 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the White graduates who secured their work within less than three months.

*Table 6.47: Period searching for current employment (Black graduates, by faculty)*

Period Searching for Current Employment	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
> 3 months	60.00	69.23	60.00	61.65
< 3 months	40.00	30.77	40.00	38.35
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	36	13	20	69

Table 6.47 indicates the job search period of the Black graduates by faculty. The figures from this table show that commerce and humanities graduates, with 60 per cent respectively, had the highest percentages of the Black graduates who secured their current employment within less than three months. Science graduates, with 69.23 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the Black graduates who secured their work within less than three months.

*Table 6.48: Period searching for current employment, by sex*

Period Searching for Current Employment	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
>3 months	69.48	72.16	
<3 months	30.52	27.84	
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	95	158	253

Table 6.48 compares Rhodes graduates by sex, as it indicates the duration of their search for their current employment. The results show that female graduates, with 72.16 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who took less than three months to secure their current employment. Male graduates, with 30.52 per cent, had the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who took longer than three months to secure their current employment. This means that female graduates took less time searching for work than male graduates.

*Table 6.49: Period searching for current employment (female graduates by faculty)*

Period Searching for Current Employment	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
> 3 months	69.14	71.05	76.66	71.14
< 3 months	30.86	28.95	23.34	28.86
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	64	38	30	132

Table 6.49 indicates the job search period of the female graduates by faculty. The figures from this table show that commerce graduates, with 76.66 per cent, had the highest percentage of the female graduates who secured their current employment within less than three months, followed by science graduates with 71.05 percent. Humanities graduates, with 69.14 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the female graduates who secured their work within less than three months.

*Table 6.50: Period searching for current employment (male graduates by faculty)*

Period Searching for Current Employment	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
> 3 months	66.66	75.01	62.97	68.48
< 3 months	33.34	24.99	37.03	31.52
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	33	32	27	92

Table 6.50 indicates the job search period of the male graduates by faculty. The figures from table 6.50 show that science graduates, with 75.01 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the male graduates who secured their current employment within less than three months, followed by humanities graduates with 66.66 percent. Commerce graduates, with 62.97 per cent, constituted the lowest percentage of the male graduates who secured their work within less than three months.

## 6.6 FACTORS THAT ENABLED GRADUATES TO SECURE THEIR CURRENT EMPLOYMENT

The heterodox labour market approach suggests that the concept of employability is highly complex and multi-layered. That means that it is shaped by both individual and external factors (see McQuaid and Lindsay, 2005). This contradicts the human capital theory perspective, which is rooted in the orthodox labour market approach. This approach proposes that the individual with the highest level of education enjoys better labour market success than those with less. Although there are great returns for people with higher education qualification in the labour market (see Banerjee et al., 2008), the employment process is not singularly determined by qualifications. There are a number of factors which come into play when examining the employment process. This section outlines the different factors which the graduates thought influenced them in securing their current employment. In addition graduates were further compared according to field of study, race and sex. By doing this, we are able to gain a clear and realistic picture of what factors influence graduates to secure employment and therefore we also highlight the different thoughts and experiences of the Rhodes graduates regarding this matter.

### 6.6.1 Qualification Influenced Getting a Job

*Table 6.51: Qualification influenced getting a job*

Qualification Influenced Getting a Job	Frequency	Percentage
Yes	272	92.20
No	23	7.80
Total	295	100.00

Research indicates that there are greater labour market returns for people with higher education qualifications (Campbell, 2012; Banerjee et al., 2008). Table 6.51 indicates whether Rhodes graduates attributed securing their current employment to their qualifications. The results show that the majority of Rhodes graduates, with 92.20 per cent, attributed securing their current employment to their university qualification.

*Table 6.52: Qualification influenced getting a job, by faculty*

Qualification Influenced Getting a Job	Faculty			
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	Total
No	94.03	89.77	95.00	92.91
Yes	5.97	10.23	5.00	7.09
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	134	88	60	282

Table 6.52 compares graduates according to faculty as it indicates whether Rhodes graduates attributed securing their current employment to their qualifications. The figures from this table show that science graduates, with 10.23 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their qualifications. They were followed by humanities graduates, with 5.97 per cent. Commerce graduates, with 5 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their qualifications.

*Table 6.53: Qualification influenced getting a job, by race*

Qualification Influenced Getting a Job	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
No	8.05	10.00	8.33	6.70	7.29
Yes	91.95	90.00	91.67	93.30	92.71
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	87	10	12	179	288

Table 6.53 compares graduates according to race as it indicates whether Rhodes graduates attributed securing their current employment to their qualifications. The figures from this table show that the majority of White graduates, with 93.30 per cent, thought that their qualifications helped them secure their current employment. They were followed by Black graduates, with 91.95 per cent and Indian/Asian graduates with 91.67%. Coloured graduates followed behind, with 90 percent. Therefore comparing the race groups we can see that White graduates had the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their qualifications. Coloured graduates had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their qualifications. However, comparing White

and Black graduates, we can observe that there were more White graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their qualification than Black graduates.

*Table 6.54: Qualification influenced getting job, by sex*

Qualification Influenced Getting a Job	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
Yes	89.57	93.79	92.12
No	10.43	6.21	7.88
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	115	177	292

Table 6.54 compares graduates according to sex as it indicates whether Rhodes graduates attributed securing their current employment to their qualifications. The figures from this table show that male graduates, with 10.43 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their qualifications. Female graduates, with 6.21 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their qualifications.

### **6.6.2 Language Proficiency Influenced Getting a Job**

*Table 6.55: Language proficiency influenced getting a job*

Language Proficiency Influenced Getting a Job	Frequency	Percentage
Yes	262	92.25
No	22	7.75
Total	284	100.00

Research indicates that employers look for people who communicate well (Bornheimer, 2010). Table 6.55 indicates whether Rhodes graduates attributed securing their current employment to their language proficiency. Interestingly the majority of Rhodes graduates, with 92.25 per cent, indicated that language proficiency helped them to secure their current employment.

*Table 6.56: Language proficiency influenced getting job, by faculty*

Language Proficiency Influenced Getting a Job	Faculty			
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	Total
No	7.75	10.71	5.17	8.12
Yes	92.25	89.29	94.83	91.88
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N				

Table 6.56 compares graduates according to faculty as it indicates whether Rhodes graduates attributed securing their current employment to their language proficiency. The figures from this table show that commerce graduates, with 94.83 per cent, had the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their language proficiency. They were followed by humanities graduates, with 92.25 per cent. Science graduates, with 89.29 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their language proficiency.

*Table 6.57: Language proficiency influenced getting job, by race*

Language Proficiency Influenced Getting a Job	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
No	11.63	0.00	0.00	7.02	7.94
Yes	88.37	100.00	100.00	92.98	92.06
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	86	8	12	171	277

Table 6.57 compares graduates according to race as it indicates whether Rhodes graduates attributed securing their current employment to their language proficiency. The figures from this table show that Indian/Asian and Coloured graduates, with (100) per cent respectively, constituted the greater number of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their language proficiency. They were followed by White graduates, with 92.06 per cent. Black graduates, with 88.37 per cent, constituted the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their language proficiency. However, comparing

Black and White graduates, it is clear that there were more White graduates who attributed securing their current employment to language proficiency than Black graduates.

*Table 6.58: Language proficiency influenced getting job, by sex*

Language Proficiency Influenced Getting a Job	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
Yes	91.82	92.40	92.17
No	8.18	7.60	7.83
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	110	171	281

Table 6.58 compares graduates according to sex as it indicates whether Rhodes graduates attributed securing their current employment to their language proficiency. The figures from this table show that male graduates, with 8.18 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their language proficiency. Female graduates, with 7.60 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their language proficiency.

### **6.6.3 References Influenced Getting a Job**

*Table 6.59: References influenced getting a job*

References Influenced Getting a Job	Frequency	Percentage
Yes	175	62.50
No	105	37.50
Total	280	100.00

References play a huge role in the hiring process, because employers want to make sure they are hiring the right person for the job. References provide the employer with an idea of the type of person they are thinking of hiring. Good references can give graduates an advantage in the hiring process (Zupek, 2009). Table 6.59 determines whether Rhodes graduates indicated that their references helped them secure their current employment. A high percentage of Rhodes graduates, with 62.50 per cent, indicated that their personal references helped them secure their current employment.

*Table 6.60: References influenced getting job, by faculty*

References Influenced Getting a Job	Faculty			
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	Total
No	33.86	40.96	46.43	38.72
Yes	66.14	59.04	53.57	61.28
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	127	83	56	266

Table 6.60 compares graduates according to faculty as it indicates whether Rhodes graduates attributed securing their current employment to their references. The figures from this table show that Humanities graduates, with 66.14 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their references. They were followed by science graduates, with 59.04 per cent. Commerce graduates, with 53.57 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their references.

*Table 6.61: References influenced getting job, by race*

References Influenced Getting a Job	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
No	46.99	50.00	16.67	32.94	37.00
Yes	53.01	50.00	83.33	67.06	63.00
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	83	8	12	170	273

Table 6.61 compares graduates according to race as it indicates whether Rhodes graduates attributed securing their current employment to their references. The figures from this table show that Indian/Asian graduates, with 83.33 per cent, had the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their references. Coloured graduates, with 50 per cent, constituted the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their references. In addition, when comparing White and Black graduates, it is evident that there were more White graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their references than Black graduates.

*Table 6.62: References influenced getting job, by sex*

References Influenced Getting a Job	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
Yes	57.80	65.48	62.45
No	42.20	34.52	37.55
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	109	168	277

Table 6.62 compares graduates according to sex as it indicates whether Rhodes graduates attributed securing their current employment to their references. The figures from this table show that female graduates, with 65.48 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their references. Male graduates, with 57.80 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their references.

#### **6.6.4 Personal Contacts Influenced Getting a Job**

*Table 6.63: Personal contacts influenced getting a job*

Personal Contacts Influenced Getting a Job	Frequency	Percentage
Yes	118	42.29
No	161	57.71
Total	279	100.00

Networks matter in the labour market. Within both economics and sociology, it is well known that many workers find jobs through family, friends and other networks (Montgomery, 1991). Table 6.63 indicates whether Rhodes graduates had secured their current employment through the influence of personal contacts. Interestingly less than half of the Rhodes graduates, with 42.29 per cent indicated that they had secured their current employment through the influence of personal contacts. However, when we examined the factors that Rhodes graduates indicated had influenced them to secure their current employment, we can observe some interesting results. The results show that the majority of Rhodes graduates indicated that their language proficiency helped them secure their current employment. Close behind was the second highest percentage of Rhodes graduates who indicated that their qualification helped them secure their current employment.

The third highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates indicated that references had helped them secure their current employment. The lowest percentage of Rhodes graduates indicated that they secured their current employment through personal contacts.

*Table 6.64: Personal contacts influenced getting job, by faculty*

Personal Contacts Influenced Getting a Job	Faculty			
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	Total
No	58.73	56.10	61.40	58.49
Yes	41.27	43.90	38.60	41.51
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	126	82	57	265

Table 6.64 compares graduates according to faculty as it indicates whether Rhodes graduates attributed securing their current employment to their personal contacts. The figures from this table show that science graduates, with 43.90 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their personal contacts. They were followed by humanities graduates, with 41.27 per cent. Commerce graduates, with 38.60 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their personal contacts.

*Table 6.65: Personal contacts influenced getting job, by race*

Personal Contacts Influenced Getting a Job	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
No	65.48	71.43	58.33	52.07	56.99
Yes	34.52	28.57	41.67	47.93	43.01
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	84	7	12	169	272

Table 6.65 compares graduates according to faculty as it indicates whether Rhodes graduates attributed securing their current employment to their personal contacts. The figures from this table show that White graduates, with 47.93 per cent, had the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their personal contacts. They were followed by Indian/Asian graduates with 41.67 per cent and Black graduates, with 34.52 per cent. Coloured

graduates, with 28.57 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their personal contacts. However, when comparing White and Black graduates, it is clear that there were more White graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their personal contacts than Black graduates.

*Table 6.66: Personal contacts influenced getting job, by sex*

Personal Contacts Influenced Getting a Job	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
Yes	44.04	40.72	42.03
No	55.96	59.28	57.97
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	109	167	276

Table 6.66 compares graduates according to sex as it indicates whether Rhodes graduates attributed securing their current employment to their personal contacts. The figures from this table show that male graduates, with 44.04 per cent, constituted the higher percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their personal contacts. Female graduates, with 40.72 per cent, constituted the lower percentage of the Rhodes graduates who attributed securing their current employment to their personal contacts.

## **6.7 MONTHLY INCOME**

Monthly income is a very important unit of analysis in terms of the graduates' experiences in the labour market. From the heterodox labour market approach we understand that the labour market outcomes of graduates are bound to differ (to be segmented) as a result of a number of factors (see Lawson, 2006; Fleetwood, 2006). This section highlights the monthly income that graduates earn. It also goes further and compares the graduates according to field of study, race and sex. By doing this we are able to really show the differences and inequalities in the earnings of the Rhodes graduates and also validate the heterodox labour market approach, which emphasises the segmented nature of the experiences and outcomes of graduates in the labour market.

*Table 6.67: Monthly income*

Monthly Income	Frequency	Percentage
Nothing	4	1.90
R400 - R800	2	0.95
R801- R1600	2	0.95
R1601 - R3200	2	0.95
R3201 - R6400	4	1.90
R6401 - R12800	47	22.38
R12801 - R25600	108	51.43
R25601 - R51200	38	18.10
R51201 - R102400	1	0.48
R102401 - R204800	1	0.48
R204801 or more	1	0.48
Total	210	100.00

According to Visagie (2013), the relatively affluent middle class in South Africa actually lies in the upper ranges of the income distribution (but begins with a very moderate level of income, i.e. R5600 total income per household per month). Table 6.67 indicates the categories describing the monthly incomes of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates. The greater percentage of Rhodes graduates, with 93.35 per cent, earns more than R6400 per month. If we examine the categories, we can also see that the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates, with 51.43 per cent, earn between R12800 - 25600 per month. Therefore, we can conclude that the majority percentage of the 2010 cohort of graduates was in the higher income zone.

Table 6.68: Monthly income by, faculty

Monthly Income	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Nothing	2.15	3.17	0.00	3.01
R400 – R800	0.00	3.17	0.00	1.01
R801- R1600	2.15	0.00	0.00	1.01
R1601 – R3200	1.08	0.00	0.00	0.50
R3201 – R6400	1.08	3.17	2.33	2.01
R6401 – R12800	23.66	20.63	20.93	22.11
R12801 – R25600	54.84	44.44	51.16	50.75
R25601 – R51200	13.98	22.22	25.58	19.10
R51201 – R102400	0.00	1.59	0.00	0.50
R102401 – R204800	0.00	1.59	0.00	0.50
R204801 or more	1.08	0.00	0.00	0.50
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	93	63	43	199

Table 6.68 compares Rhodes graduates from the different faculties as it determines the income categories per month. The results show that the vast majority of humanities graduates, with 93.56 per cent, earn more than R5600 per month. The highest percentage of science graduates, with 90.47 per cent earn more than R6400 per month. The results also show that the vast majority of commerce graduates, with 97.67 per cent, earn more than R6400 per month. The results from this table indicate that a higher percentage of Rhodes graduates from all faculties earn more than R6400 per month. However, when we compare the different faculties against each other, we can observe that commerce graduates constituted the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates who earn more than R6400 per month. Science graduates had the lowest percentages of graduates who earn more than R6400 per month. If we examine the categories, we can see that commerce graduates, with 25.58 per cent, constitute the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who earn R25601 - R51200 per month. From this table we can conclude that commerce graduates earn more than graduates from other faculties. Interestingly, science graduates earn the least.

Table 6.69: Monthly income, by race

Monthly Income	Population Group				Total
	Black/African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
Nothing	1.64	0.00	0.00	2.34	1.94
R400 – R800	0.00	0.00	0.00	1.56	0.97
R801- R1600	0.00	0.00	0.00	1.56	0.97
R1601 – R3200	1.64	12.50	0.00	0.00	0.97
R3201 – R6400	1.64	12.50	0.00	1.56	1.94
R6401 – R12800	21.31	25.00	22.22	21.88	21.84
R12801 – R25600	50.82	37.50	22.22	54.69	51.46
R25601 – R51200	21.31	12.50	55.56	14.84	18.45
R51201 – R102400	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.78	0.49
R102401 – R204800	1.64	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.49
R204801 or more	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.78	0.49
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	61	8	9	128	206

Table 6.69 compares Rhodes graduates from different race groups as it indicates their earning categories per month. The results show that the highest percentage of Black graduates, with 95.08 per cent, earn more than R6400 per month. Interestingly, 75 per cent of the Coloured graduates earn more than R6400 per month. The results also show that there were no Indian/Asian graduates who earned less than R6400 per month. The highest percentage of White graduates, with 92.98 per cent, earned more than R6400 per month. Therefore, we can observe that generally all race groups had a higher percentage of graduates who earned more than R6400 per month. However, when we compare the different race groups against each other we can see that Indian/Asian graduates had the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates who earned more than R6400 per month. Coloured graduates had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who earned more than R6400 per month. Comparing the different race groups against each other we can observe that Indian/Asian graduates constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who earned more than R6400 per month. They were followed by Black graduates and White graduates. Coloured graduates constituted the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who earned more than R6400 per month. This means that Indian/graduates earn the most, followed by Black graduates and then White graduates. Coloured graduates earn the lowest monthly incomes. More importantly, however, is the fact that Black graduates earned slightly more than White graduates.

Table 6.70: Monthly income of Black graduates, by faculty

Monthly Income	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Nothing	0.00	8.33	0.00	1.64
R1601 – R3200	2.94	0.00	0.00	1.64
R3201 – R6400	2.94	0.00	0.00	1.64
R6401 – R12800	20.59	8.33	33.33	21.31
R12801 – R25600	52.94	66.67	33.33	50.82
R25601 – R51200	20.59	8.33	33.33	21.31
R102401 – R 204 800	0.00	8.33	0.00	1.64
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	34	12	15	61

Table 6.70 indicates the monthly incomes of Black graduates by faculty. The figures from this table show that commerce graduates, with 99.99 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of Black graduates who earned more than 6400 per month, followed by humanities graduates with 94.12 per cent. Science graduates, with 91.67 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the Black graduates who earned above R6400 per month.

Table 6.71: Monthly income, by sex

Monthly Income	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
Nothing	1.28	2.31	1.92
R400 – R800	1.28	0.77	0.96
R801- R1600	1.28	0.77	0.96
R1601 – R3200	2.56	0.00	0.96
R3201 – R6400	1.28	2.31	1.92
R6401 – R12800	11.54	29.23	22.60
R12801 – R25600	51.28	51.54	51.44
R25601 – R51200	28.21	12.31	18.27
R51201 – R102400	1.28	0.00	0.48
R102401 – R204800	0.00	0.77	0.48
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	78	130	208

Table 6.71 compares male and female graduates as it indicates their earnings categories per month. The results show that the majority of male graduates, with 92.32 per cent, earns more than R6400 per month. The greater number of female graduates, with 93.84 per cent, earns more than R6400 per month. Therefore, both sexes have higher percentages who earn more than R6400 per month. However, when we compare the two groups we can see that female graduates had the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who earn more than R6400 per month. Interestingly, when we examine the income categories, we can see that male graduates, with 28.21 per cent, had the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates who earn R25601 - R51200 per month. From this table we can see that there are more females who earn R6400 per month than males. Hence, it seems that female graduates earn slightly more than male graduates.

*Table 6.72: Monthly income of female graduates by faculty*

Monthly Income	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Nothing	1.49	6.25	0.00	2.48
R400 – R800	0.00	3.13	0.00	0.83
R801 – R1600	1.49	0.00	0.00	0.83
R3201 – R6400	1.49	3.13	4.55	2.48
R6401 – R12800	28.36	28.13	31.82	28.93
R12801 – R25600	56.72	37.50	50.00	50.41
R25601 – R51200	10.45	18.75	13.64	13.22
R102401 – R204800	0.00	3.13	0.00	0.83
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	67	32	22	121

Table 6.72 indicates the monthly incomes of female graduates by faculty. The figures from this table show that humanities graduates, with 95.53 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of female graduates who earned more than 6400 per month, followed by commerce graduates, with 95.45 per cent. Science graduates, with 87.49 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the female graduates who earned above R6400 per month.

## 6.8 WORK APPROPRIATE FOR AND RELATED TO QUALIFICATIONS

This section examines whether Rhodes graduates were employed in jobs that were appropriate for their level of education and whether their jobs were related to their qualifications. The former part seeks to determine whether they were employed in jobs that were suitable for a university degree holder. The latter part determines whether they were employed in jobs that were related to their qualification. This section is very important as it highlights the labour market experiences of the Rhodes graduates. In this section, we also compare Rhodes graduates according to field of study, race and sex. This is to show that the labour market experiences of the graduates in the labour market are going to vary and be unequal on the account of (among other factors) their field of study, race and sex. This will also validate the heterodox labour market approach, which places emphasis on the segmented nature of the outcomes and experiences of graduates in the labour market.

### 6.8.1 Work Appropriate for Level of Education

*Table 6.73: Work appropriate for level of education*

Work Appropriate for Level of Education	Frequency	Percentage
Yes	243	78.64
No	66	21.36
Total	309	100.00

Table 6.73 indicates whether Rhodes graduates thought that their current work was appropriate for their level of education. The results show that a greater number of Rhodes graduates, with 78.64 per cent, indicated that their current work was appropriate for their level of education.

*Table 6.74: Work appropriate for level of education, by faculty*

Work Appropriate for Level of Education	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	79.43	75.82	83.87	79.25
No	20.57	24.18	16.13	20.75
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	142	92	62	296

Table 6.74 compares Rhodes graduates from different faculties as it indicates whether they thought their current work was appropriate for their level of education. The results show that the highest percentage of humanities graduates, with 79.43 per cent, thought their current work was appropriate for their level of education. The majority of science graduates, with 75.82 per cent, indicated that their current work was appropriate for their level of education. The results also show that the highest percentage of commerce graduates, with 83.87 per cent, indicated that their current work was appropriate for their level of education. Comparing the different faculties against each other we can observe that commerce graduates constituted the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates who indicated that their current work was appropriate for their level of education. Science graduates have the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who thought their current work was appropriate for their level of education.

*Table 6.75: Work appropriate for level of education, by race*

Work Appropriate for Level of Education	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
Yes	79.12	66.67	100.00	78.31	79.14
No	20.88	33.33	0.00	21.69	20.86
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	91	9	13	189	302

Table 6.75 compares Rhodes graduates according to race as it indicates whether they thought their current work was appropriate for their level of education. The results show that the majority of Black graduates, with 79.12 per cent, thought that their current work was appropriate for their level of education. The highest percentage of Coloured graduates, with 66.67 per cent, indicated that their current work was appropriate for their level of education. Interestingly, there were no Indian/Asian graduates who thought their current work was not appropriate for their level of education. The highest percentage of White graduates, with 78.31 per cent, indicated that their current work was appropriate for their level of education. Comparing the different race groups against each other we can observe that Indian/Asian graduates have the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates who thought their current was appropriate for their level of education. Coloured graduates had the lowest percentage of Rhodes graduates who thought that their current work was appropriate for their level of education. In addition, when comparing White and Black graduates,

we can observe that there were more Black graduates who thought that their work that was appropriate for their level of education than White graduates.

*Table 6.76: Black graduates' work appropriate for level of education, by faculty*

Work Appropriate for Level of Education	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	72.00	89.47	90.48	80.00
No	28.00	10.53	9.52	20.00
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	50	19	21	90

Table 6.76 compares Black graduates by faculty as it indicates whether their work was appropriate for their level of education. The figures from this table indicate that the majority of the Black graduates (90.48 per cent) who thought their jobs were appropriate for their level of education came from the commerce faculty, followed by science graduates with 89.47 per cent. Humanities graduates, with 72 per cent, have the lowest percentage of the Black graduates who thought their work was appropriate for their level of education.

*Table 6.77: Work appropriate for level of education, by sex*

Work Appropriate for Level of Education	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
Yes	81.67	76.34	78.43
No	18.33	23.66	21.57
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	120	186	306

Table 6.77 compares male and female graduates as it determines whether they thought their current work was appropriate for their level of education. The results show that the majority of male graduates, with 81.67 per cent, indicated that they thought their current work appropriate for their level of education. The results also show that the majority of female graduates, with 76.34 per cent, thought their current work appropriate for their level of education. Comparing the two sex groups against each other we can observe that male graduates constituted the higher percentage of the Rhodes graduates who thought their current work was appropriate for their level of education.

*Table 6.78: Male graduates' work appropriate for level of education, by faculty*

Work Appropriate for Level of Education	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	75.00	86.96	87.10	82.91
No	25.00	13.04	12.90	17.09
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	40	46	31	117

Table 6.78 compares male graduates by faculty as it indicates whether they thought their work was appropriate for their level of education. The figures from this table indicate that commerce graduates, with 87.10 per cent, constituted the highest percentage of the male graduates who thought their work was appropriate for their level of education, followed by science graduates with 86.96 per cent. Humanities graduates, with 75 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the male graduates who thought their work was appropriate for their level of education.

## 6.7.2 Work Related to Qualification

*Table 6.79: Work related to qualification*

Work Related to Qualification	Frequency	Percentage
Yes	236	75.88
No	75	24.12
Total	311	100.00

Table 6.79 indicates whether Rhodes graduates thought that their current work was related to their qualification. The results show that a high percentage of Rhodes graduates, with 75.88 per cent, thought that their work was related to their qualification.

*Table 6.80: Work related to qualification, by faculty*

Work Related to Qualification	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	77.46	72.83	79.03	76.35
No	22.54	27.17	20.97	23.65
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	142	92	62	296

Table 6.80 compares Rhodes graduates from different faculties as it indicates whether they thought their work was related to their qualifications. The results show that a higher percentage of humanities graduates, with 77.46 per cent, thought that their work was related to their qualification. The majority of science graduates, with 72.83 per cent, indicated that their current work was related to their qualifications. The results also show that the highest percentage of commerce graduates, with 79.03 per cent, indicated that their current work was related to their qualifications. Comparing the different faculties against each other we can observe that commerce graduates had the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates who indicated that their current work was related to their qualifications. Science graduates had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who thought their current work was related to their qualifications.

*Table 6.81: Work related to qualification, by race*

Work Related to Qualification	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
Yes	74.73	60.00	84.62	77.37	76.32
No	25.27	40.00	15.38	22.63	23.68
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	91	10	13	190	304

Table 6.81 compares Rhodes graduates according to race, as it indicates whether they thought their current work is related to their qualifications. The results show that the majority of Black graduates, with 74.73 per cent, indicated that their current work was related to their qualifications. The majority of Coloured graduates, with 60 per cent, indicated that their current work was related to their qualifications. The results also show that a significant majority of Indian/Asian graduates, with 84.62 per cent, indicated that their current work was related to their qualifications. The greater number of White graduates, with 77.37 per cent, indicated that their current work was related to their qualifications. Comparing the different race groups we can observe that Indian/Asian

graduates had the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who indicated that their current work was related to their qualifications. Coloured graduates had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who indicated that their current work was related to their qualifications. In addition, when comparing Black and White graduates, we can observe that there were more White graduates who thought that their work was related to their qualifications than Black graduates.

*Table 6.82: White graduates' work related to qualifications, by faculty*

Work Appropriate for Level of Education	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	82.50	73.85	72.73	77.53
No	17.50	26.15	27.27	22.47
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	80	65	33	178

Table 6.82 compares White graduates by faculty as it indicates whether they thought their work was related to their qualifications. The figures from this table indicate that the majority of the White graduates (82.50 per cent) who thought their jobs were related to their qualifications came from the humanities faculty, followed by science graduates with 73.85 per cent. Commerce graduates, with 72.73 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the White graduates who thought that their jobs were related to their qualifications.

*Table 6.83: Work related to qualification, by sex*

Work Related to Qualification	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
Yes	76.86	75.40	75.97
No	23.14	24.60	24.03
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	121	187	308

Table 6.83 compares male and female graduates as it indicates whether their current work was related to their qualifications. The results show that the higher percentage of male graduates, with 76.86 per cent, indicated that their current work was related to their qualifications. The results also show that the majority of female graduates, with 75.40 per cent, indicated that their current work was related to their qualifications. Comparing the two sex groups against each other we can

observe that male graduates had the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who indicated that their current work was related to their qualifications.

*Table 6.84: Male graduates' work related to qualifications, by faculty*

Work Related to Qualifications	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	67.50	82.98	83.87	77.97
No	32.50	17.02	16.13	22.03
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	40	47	31	118

Table 6.84 compares male graduates by faculty as it indicates whether they thought that their work was related to their qualifications. The figures from this table illustrate that the majority of the male graduates (83.87 per cent) who thought that their jobs were related to their qualifications came from the commerce faculty, followed by science graduates, with 82.98 per cent. Humanities graduates, with 67.50 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the male graduates who thought that their work was related to their qualification.

## **6.9 LEVELS OF JOB SATISFACTION**

Examining whether graduates are satisfied with their jobs is a very important component of graduate tracer studies. It gives us an inside view of the real employment dynamics which are experienced by graduates in the labour market. The orthodox labour market approach does not take into account the socio-emotional component of the employment experience. This section highlights the levels of satisfaction of the Rhodes graduates with their jobs. Because this study is based on the heterodox approach, which proposes the varying and unequal experiences of graduates in the labour market, we compare the graduates according to field of study, race and sex. By doing this we are able to show the divergent and unequal experiences of the Rhodes graduates.

### 6.9.1 Satisfied with Nature of Work

*Table 6.85: Satisfied with nature of work*

Satisfied with Nature of Work	Frequency	Percentage
Yes	271	88.27
No	36	11.73
Total	307	100.00

Table 6.85 indicates whether Rhodes graduates were satisfied with the nature of their current work. The results show that the higher percentage of Rhodes graduates, with 88.27 per cent, indicated that they were satisfied with the nature of their current work.

*Table 6.86: Satisfied with nature of work, by faculty*

Satisfied with Nature of Work	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	84.29	90.22	93.44	88.05
No	15.71	9.78	6.56	11.95
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	140	92	61	293

Table 6.86 compares Rhodes graduates from different faculties as it indicates whether they were satisfied with the nature of their current work. The results show that the greater number of humanities graduates, with 84.29 per cent, indicated that they were satisfied with the nature of their current work. The results also show that the majority of science graduates, with 90.22 per cent, indicated that they were satisfied with the nature of their current work. The majority of commerce graduates, with 93.44 per cent, indicated that they were satisfied with the nature of their current work. Comparing the different faculties we can observe that commerce graduates had the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with the nature of their current work. Humanities graduates had the lowest percentage of Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with the nature of their current work. This means that commerce graduates were more satisfied with the nature of their work compared to graduates from other faculties. Humanities graduates were the least satisfied with the nature of their work, compared to graduates from other faculties.

*Table 6.87: Satisfied with nature of work by race*

Satisfied with Nature of Work	Population group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
Yes	82.22	90.00	84.62	91.53	88.41
No	17.78	10.00	15.38	8.47	11.59
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	90	10	13	189	302

Table 6.87 compares Rhodes graduates according to race as it determines whether they were satisfied with the nature of their current work. The results indicate that the higher percentage of Black graduates, with 82.22 per cent, indicated that they were satisfied with the nature of their current work. The overwhelming majority of Coloured graduates, with 90 per cent, indicated that they were satisfied with the nature of their current work. The results also show that the highest percentage of Indian/Asian graduates, with 84.62 per cent, indicated that they were satisfied with the nature of their current work. The majority of White graduates, with 91.53 per cent, indicated that they were satisfied with the nature of their work. However, when comparing the different race groups, we can observe that White graduates constituted the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with the nature of their current work. Black graduates constituted the lowest percentage of Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with the nature of their current work. This means that White graduates were more satisfied with the nature of their work than graduates from other race groups. Black graduates were the least satisfied with the nature of their work, compared to graduates from other race groups.

*Table 6.88: White graduates satisfied with the nature of their work, by faculty*

Satisfied with Nature of Work	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	91.25	92.31	90.63	91.53
No	8.75	7.69	9.38	8.47
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	80	65	32	177

Table 6.88 illustrates whether White graduates (by faculty) were satisfied with the nature of their work. The figures from this table show that science graduates, with 92.31 percent, had the highest percentage of the White graduates who were satisfied with the nature of their work. They were followed by humanities graduates, with 91.25 per cent. Commerce graduates, with 90.63 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the White graduates who were satisfied with the nature of their work.

*Table 6.89: Satisfied with nature of work, by sex*

Satisfied with the Nature of Work	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
Yes	91.67	86.41	88.49
No	8.33	13.59	11.51
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	120	184	304

Table 6.89 compares male and female graduates as it determines whether they were satisfied with the nature of their current work. The results indicated that the majority of male graduates, with 91.67 per cent, was satisfied with the nature of their current work. The results also show that the highest percentage of female graduates, with 86.41 per cent, was satisfied with the nature of their current employment. Comparing the two sexes against each other we can observe that male graduates constituted the higher percentage of Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with the nature of their current employment. This means that male graduates were more satisfied with the nature of their work than female graduates.

*Table 6.90: Male graduates satisfied with the nature of their work, by faculty*

Satisfied with Nature of Work	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	87.18	97.87	87.10	91.45
No	12.82	2.13	12.90	8.55
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	39	47	31	117

Table 6.90 indicates whether male graduates (by faculty) were satisfied with the nature of their work. The figures from this table illustrate that science graduates, with 97.87 percent, had the

highest percentage of the male graduates who were satisfied with the nature of their work. They were followed by humanities graduates, with 87.18 per cent. Commerce graduates, with 87.10 per cent, constituted the lowest percentage of the male graduates who were satisfied with the nature of their work.

## 6.9.2 Satisfied with Working Conditions

*Table 6.91: Satisfied with working conditions*

Satisfied with Working Conditions	Frequency	Percentage
Yes	263	85.39
No	45	14.61
Total	308	100.00

Table 6.91 indicates whether Rhodes graduates were satisfied with their current working conditions. The results indicate that the majority of Rhodes graduates, with 85.39 per cent, were satisfied with their working conditions.

*Table 6.92: Satisfied with working conditions, by faculty*

Satisfied with Working Conditions	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	78.57	88.04	95.16	85.03
No	21.43	11.96	4.84	14.97
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	140	92	62	294

Table 6.92 compares Rhodes graduates from different faculties as it indicates whether they were satisfied with their current working conditions. The results show that the greater number of humanities graduates, with 78.57 per cent, indicated that they were satisfied with their current working conditions. The majority of science graduates, with 88.04 per cent, were satisfied with their current working conditions. The results also show that the vast majority of commerce graduates, with 95.16 per cent, indicated that they were satisfied with their current working conditions. Comparing the different faculties we can observe that commerce graduates had the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with their current working conditions. Humanities graduates had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with their working conditions. This means that commerce graduates were more satisfied with their

working conditions than graduates from other faculties. Humanities graduates were the least satisfied with their working conditions compared to graduates from other faculties.

*Table 6.93: Satisfied with working conditions, by race*

Satisfied with Working Conditions	Population group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
Yes	77.78	80.00	84.62	90.00	85.81
No	22.22	20.00	15.38	10.00	14.19
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	90	10	13	190	303

Table 6.93 compares Rhodes graduates according to race as it indicates whether they were satisfied with their working conditions. The results show that the greater percentage of Black graduates, with 77.78 per cent, was satisfied with the working conditions of their current employment. The results also show that the highest percentage of Coloured graduates, with 80 per cent, was satisfied with their current working conditions. The majority of Indian/Asian graduates, with 84.62 per cent, were satisfied with their current working conditions. Only 15.38 per cent of Indian/Asian graduates were not satisfied with their current working conditions. The results also show that the highest percentage of White graduates, with 90 per cent, was satisfied with their current working conditions. Comparing the different race groups we can observe that White graduates constituted the higher percentage of Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with their current working conditions. Black graduates constituted the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with their current working conditions. This means that White graduates were more satisfied with their working conditions than all the race groups. Black graduates were the least satisfied with their working conditions compared to graduates from other race groups.

*Table 6.94: White graduates satisfied with their working conditions, by faculty*

Satisfied with Working Conditions	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	87.50	90.77	93.94	89.89
No	12.50	9.23	6.06	10.11
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	80	65	33	178

Table 6.94 illustrates whether White graduates (by faculty) were satisfied with their working conditions. The figures from this table show that commerce graduates, with 93.94 percent, constituted the highest percentage of the White graduates who were satisfied with their working conditions. They were followed by science graduates, with 90.77 per cent. Humanities graduates, with 87.50 per cent, constituted the lowest percentage of the White graduates who were satisfied with their working conditions.

*Table 6.95: Satisfied with working conditions, by sex*

Satisfied with Working Conditions	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
Yes	90.00	83.24	85.90
No	10.00	16.76	14.10
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	120	185	305

Table 6.95 compares male and female graduates as it indicates whether they were satisfied with the working conditions of their current employment. The results show that the majority of male graduates, with 90 per cent, indicated that they were satisfied with the working conditions of their current employment. The results also show that the majority of female graduates, with 83.24 per cent, was satisfied with their current working conditions. Comparing the two sexes we can observe that male graduates constituted the higher percentage of Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with their current working conditions. This means that male graduates were more satisfied with their working conditions than female graduates.

*Table 6.96: Male graduates satisfied with their working conditions by faculty*

Satisfied with Working Conditions	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	87.18	89.36	93.55	89.74
No	12.82	10.64	6.45	10.26
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	39	47	31	117

Table 6.96 illustrates whether male graduates (by faculty) were satisfied with their working conditions. The figures from this table show that commerce graduates, with 93.55 percent, constituted the highest percentage of the male graduates who were satisfied with their working conditions. They were followed by science graduates, with 89.36 per cent. Humanities graduates, with 87.18 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the male graduates who were satisfied with their working conditions.

### **6.9.3 Satisfied with Job Security**

*Table 6.97: Satisfied with job security*

Satisfied with Job Security	Frequency	Percentage
Yes	243	79.67
No	62	20.33
Total	305	100.00

Table 6.97 indicates whether Rhodes graduates were satisfied with their job security. The results show that a high percentage of Rhodes graduates, with 79.67 per cent, was satisfied with their job security.

*Table 6.98: Satisfied with job security, by faculty*

Satisfied with Job Security	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	77.86	76.92	90.00	80.07
No	22.14	23.08	10.00	19.93
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	140	91	60	291

Table 6.98 compares Rhodes graduates from different faculties as it indicates whether they were satisfied with their job security. The results indicate that the greater percentage of humanities graduates, with 77.86 per cent, was satisfied with their job security. The higher percentage of science graduates, with 76.92 per cent, was satisfied with their job security. The results also show that the majority of commerce graduates were satisfied with their job security. Comparing the different faculties we can observe that commerce graduates had the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with their job security. Humanities graduates constituted the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with their job security. This means that commerce graduates were more satisfied with job security than graduates from other faculties. Humanities graduates were the least satisfied with their job security compared to graduates from other faculties.

*Table 6.99: Satisfied with job security, by race*

Satisfied with Job Security	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
Yes	76.67	77.78	76.92	81.91	80.00
No	23.33	22.22	23.08	18.09	20.00
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	90	9	13	188	300

Table 6.99 compares Rhodes graduates according to race as it indicates whether they were satisfied with their job security. The results show that most of the Black graduates, with 76.67 per cent, was satisfied with their job security. The majority of Coloured graduates, with 77.78 per cent, was satisfied with their job security. The results also show that the majority of Indian/Asian graduates, with 76.92 per cent, were satisfied with their job security. The majority of White graduates, with 81.91 per cent, were satisfied with their job security. Comparing the different race groups against each other we can observe that White graduates had the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with their job security. Black graduates had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with their job security. This means that White graduates were more satisfied with their job security than graduates from other race groups. Black graduates were the least satisfied with their job security.

*Table 7.1: White graduates satisfied with job security, by faculty*

Satisfied with Job Security	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	78.75	83.08	90.32	82.39
No	21.25	16.92	9.68	17.61
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	80	65	31	176

Table 7.1 illustrates whether White graduates (by faculty) were satisfied with their job security. The figures from this table show that commerce graduates, with 90.32 percent, had the highest percentage of the White graduates who were satisfied with their job security. They were followed by science graduates, with 93.08 per cent. Humanities graduates, with 78.75 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the White graduates who were satisfied with their job security.

*Table 7.2: Satisfied with job security by sex*

Satisfied with Job Security	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
Yes	87.39	74.32	79.47
No	12.61	25.68	20.53
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	119	183	302

Table 7.2 compares male and female graduates as it indicates whether they were satisfied with their job security. The results show that most male graduates, with 87.39 per cent, were satisfied with their job security. The results also show that the higher percentage of female graduates, with 74.32 per cent, was also satisfied with their job security. Comparing the two sexes we can observe that male graduates had the higher percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with their job security. This means that male graduates were more satisfied with their job security compared to female graduates.

*Table 7.3: Male graduates satisfied with job security, by faculty*

Satisfied with Working Conditions	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	84.62	89.36	90.00	87.93
No	15.38	10.64	10.00	12.07
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	39	47	30	116

Table 7.3 indicates whether male graduates (by faculty) were satisfied with their job security. The figures from this table show that commerce graduates, with 90 percent, constituted the highest percentage of the male graduates who were satisfied with their job security. They were followed by science graduates, with 89.36 per cent. Humanities graduates, with 84.62 per cent, constituted the lowest percentage of the male graduates who were satisfied with their job security.

#### **6.9.4 Satisfied with the Opportunity to Use Knowledge and Skills**

*Table 7.4: Satisfied with the opportunity to use knowledge and skills*

Satisfied with Opportunity to Use Knowledge and Skills	Frequency	Percentage
Yes	240	78.18
No	67	21.82
Total	307	100.00

Table 7.4 indicates whether Rhodes graduates were satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills in their current employment. The results indicate that most of the Rhodes graduates, with 78.18 per cent, were satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills.

*Table 7.5: Satisfied with the opportunity to use knowledge and skills, by faculty*

Satisfied with Opportunity to Use Knowledge and Skills	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	77.14	78.26	81.97	78.50
No	22.86	21.74	18.03	21.50
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	140	92	61	293

Table 7.5 compares Rhodes graduates from different faculties as it indicates whether they were satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills. The results show that the majority of humanities graduates, with 77.14 per cent, were satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills. The results also show that the majority of science graduates, with 78.26 per cent, were satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills. The highest percentage of commerce graduates, with 81.97 per cent, was satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills. Comparing the different faculties we can observe that commerce graduates constituted the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills. Humanities graduates constituted the lowest percentage of Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills. This means that commerce graduates indicated that they were more satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills than graduates from other faculties. Humanities graduates were the least satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills compared to graduates from other faculties.

*Table 7.6: Satisfied with the opportunity to use knowledge and skills by race*

Satisfied with Opportunity to Use Knowledge and Skills	Population group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
Yes	81.11	80.00	84.62	76.72	78.48
No	18.89	20.00	15.38	23.28	21.52
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	90	10	13	189	302

Table 7.6 compares Rhodes graduates according to race as it indicates whether they were satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills. The results indicate that the majority of Black graduates, with 81.11 per cent, were satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills. Most Coloured graduates, with 80 per cent, were satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills. The results also show that the majority of Indian/Asian graduates, with 84.62 per cent, were satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills. The results also show that the highest percentage of White graduates, with 76.72 per cent, was satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills.

Comparing the different race groups we can observe that Indian/Asian graduates constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills. Interestingly, White graduates constituted the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills. This means that Indian/Asian graduates were more satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills than graduates from other race groups. White graduates were the least satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills than graduates from other race groups. However, we only compare Black and White graduates, it is clear that Black graduates were more satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills than White graduates.

*Table 7.7: Black graduates satisfied with the opportunity to use knowledge and skills, by faculty*

Satisfied with Opportunity to Use Knowledge and Skills	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	71.43	94.74	90.48	80.90
No	28.57	5.26	9.52	19.10
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	49	19	21	89

Table 7.7 illustrates whether Black graduates (by faculty) were satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills. The figures from this table show that science graduates, with 94.74 percent, had the highest percentage of the Black graduates who were satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills. They were followed by commerce graduates, with 90.48 per cent. Humanities graduates, with 71.43 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the Black graduates who were satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills.

*Table 7.8: Satisfied with the opportunity to use knowledge and skills, by sex*

Satisfied with Opportunity to Use Knowledge and Skills	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
Yes	78.33	78.26	78.29
No	21.67	21.74	21.71
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	120	184	304

Table 7.8 compares male and female graduates as it indicates whether they were satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills. The results show that the higher percentage of male graduates, with 78.33 per cent, was satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills. The results also show that the higher percentage of female graduates, with 78.26 per cent, was also satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills. Comparing the two sexes we can observe that male graduates constituted the higher percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills.

*Table 7.9: Male graduates satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills, by faculty*

Satisfied with Opportunity to Use Knowledge and Skills	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	71.79	87.23	74.19	78.63
No	28.21	12.77	25.81	21.37
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	39	47	31	117

Table 7.9 indicates whether male graduates (by faculty) were satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills. The figures from this table show that science graduates, with 87.23 percent, had the higher percentage of the male graduates who were satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills. They were followed by commerce graduates, with 74.19 per cent. Humanities graduates, with 71.79 per cent, constituted the lowest percentage of the male graduates who were satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills.

### 6.9.5 Satisfied with Income

*Table 7.10: Satisfied with income*

Satisfied with Income	Frequency	Percentage
Yes	170	55.37
No	137	44.63
Total	307	100.00

Table 7.10 indicates whether Rhodes graduates were satisfied with satisfied with their current incomes. The results indicate that just over half of Rhodes graduates, with 55.37 per cent, were satisfied with their current incomes.

*Table 7.11: Satisfied with income, by faculty*

Satisfied with Income	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	48.57	57.61	63.93	54.61
No	51.43	42.39	36.07	45.39
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	140	92	61	293

Table 7.11 compares Rhodes graduates from different faculties as it indicates whether they were satisfied with their current incomes. The results show that just below half of the humanities graduates, with 48.57 per cent, was satisfied with their current incomes. The results also show that a higher percentage of science graduates, with 57.61 per cent, was satisfied with their current incomes. The greater percentage of commerce graduates, with 63.93 per cent, was satisfied with their current incomes. Comparing the different faculties we can observe that commerce graduates had the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates who were satisfied their current incomes. Humanities graduates had the lowest percentage of Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with their current incomes. This means that commerce graduates were more satisfied with their incomes than graduates from other faculties. Humanities graduates were the least satisfied with their incomes.

*Table 7.12: Satisfied with income, by race*

Satisfied with Income	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
Yes	46.67	30.00	69.23	60.32	55.63
No	53.33	70.00	30.77	39.68	44.37
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	90	10	13	189	302

Table 7.12 compares Rhodes graduates according to race as it indicates whether they were satisfied with their current incomes. The results indicate that less than half of Black graduates, with 46.67 per cent, were satisfied their current incomes. Less than half of the Coloured graduates, with 30 per cent, were satisfied their current incomes.

The results also show that the higher percentage of Indian/Asian graduates, with 69.23 per cent, was satisfied with their current incomes. Only 30.77 per cent of Indian/Asian graduates were not satisfied with their current incomes. The higher percentage of White graduates, with 60.32 per cent, was satisfied with their current incomes. Comparing the different race groups we can observe that Indian/Asian graduates had the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with their current incomes. Coloured graduates had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with their current incomes. This means that Indian/Asian graduates were more satisfied with their incomes than graduates from other race groups. Coloured graduates were the least satisfied with their incomes compared to graduates from other race groups. When we categorise the findings, we can observe that White and Indian/Asian graduates were more satisfied with their incomes compared to Black and Coloured graduates. In addition, when we only compare White and Black graduates, we can observe that White graduates were more satisfied with their income than Black graduates.

*Table 7.13: White graduates satisfied with income, by faculty*

Satisfied with Income	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	57.50	60.00	59.38	58.76
No	42.50	40.00	40.63	41.24
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	80	65	32	177

Table 7.13 illustrates whether White graduates (by faculty) were satisfied with their incomes. The figures from this table show that science graduates, with 60 percent, constituted the highest percentage of the White graduates who were satisfied with their incomes. They were followed by commerce graduates, with 59.38 per cent. Humanities graduates, with 57.50 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the White graduates who were satisfied with their incomes.

*Table 7.14: Satisfied with income, by sex*

Satisfied with Income	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
Yes	60.00	52.17	55.26
No	40.00	47.83	44.74
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	120	184	304

Table 7.14 compares male and female graduates as it indicates whether they were satisfied with their current incomes. The results show that the majority of male graduates, with 60 per cent, was satisfied with their current incomes. The results also show that just over half of female graduates, with 55.26 per cent, was also satisfied with their current incomes. Comparing the two sexes we can observe that male graduates constituted the higher percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were satisfied their current incomes. This means that male graduates were more satisfied with their incomes than female graduates.

*Table 7.15: Male graduates satisfied with income, by faculty*

Satisfied with Income	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	56.41	65.96	58.06	60.68
No	43.59	34.04	41.94	39.32
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	39	47	31	117

Table 7.15 indicates whether male graduates (by faculty) were satisfied with their income. The figures from this table show that science graduates, with 65.96 percent, had the higher percentage of the male graduates who were satisfied with their incomes. They were followed by commerce graduates, with 58.06 per cent. Humanities graduates, with 56.14 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the male graduates who were satisfied with their incomes.

### 6.9.6 Satisfied with the Opportunity to Learn

*Table 7.16: Satisfied with the opportunity to learn*

Satisfied with Opportunity to Learn	Frequency	Percentage
Yes	268	87.01
No	40	12.99
Total	308	100.00

Table 7.16 indicates whether Rhodes graduates were satisfied with the opportunity to learn in their current employment. The results indicate that a higher percentage of Rhodes graduates, with 87.01 per cent, were satisfied with the opportunity to learn in their current employment.

*Table 7.17: Satisfied with the opportunity to learn, by faculty*

Satisfied with Opportunity to Learn	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	83.69	88.04	91.80	86.73
No	16.31	11.96	8.20	13.27
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	141	92	61	294

Table 7.17 compares Rhodes graduates from different faculties as it indicates whether they were satisfied with their opportunity to learn in their current employment. The results show that the majority of humanities graduates, with 83.69 per cent, was satisfied with their opportunity to learn in their current employment. The results also show that the majority of science graduates, with 88.04 per cent, was satisfied with their opportunity to learn in their current employment. The majority of commerce graduates, with 91.80 per cent, was satisfied with their opportunity to learn in their current employment. Comparing the different faculties we can observe that commerce graduates constituted the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with the opportunity to learn in their current employment. Humanities graduates constituted the lowest percentage of Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with their opportunity to learn in their current employment. This means that commerce graduates were more satisfied with the opportunity to learn at their places of employment compared to graduates from other faculties. Humanities graduates were the least satisfied with the opportunity to learn at their places of employment.

*Table 7.18: Satisfied with the opportunity to learn, by race*

Satisfied with Opportunity to Learn	Population Group				Total
	Black African	Coloured	Indian/Asian	White	
Yes	81.32	70.00	84.62	90.48	86.80
No	18.68	30.00	15.38	9.52	13.20
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	91	10	13	189	303

Table 7.18 compares Rhodes graduates according to race as it indicates whether they were satisfied with their opportunity to learn in their current employment. The results indicate that the majority of Black graduates, with 81.32 per cent, were satisfied with their opportunity to learn in their current employment. The higher percentage of Coloured graduates, with 70 per cent, was satisfied with their opportunity to learn in their current employment. The results also show that the higher percentage of Indian/Asian graduates, with 84.62 per cent, was satisfied with the opportunity to learn in their current employment. The higher percentage of White graduates, with 90.48 per cent, was satisfied with their opportunity to learn in their current employment. Comparing the different race groups we can observe that White graduates constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with their opportunity to learn in their current employment. Coloured graduates had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with their opportunity to learn in their current employment. This means that White graduates from the 2010 cohort were more satisfied, than other race groups, with the opportunity to learn at their places of employment. Coloured graduates were the least satisfied, of all the other race groups, with the opportunity to learn at their places of employment. In addition, when we only compare Black and White graduates, it is evident that White graduates were more satisfied with the opportunity to learn than Black graduates.

*Table 7.19: White graduates satisfied with opportunity to learn, by faculty*

Satisfied with Opportunity to Learn	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	87.50	89.23	96.88	89.83
No	12.50	10.77	3.13	10.17
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	80	65	32	177

Table 7.19 illustrates whether White graduates (by faculty) were satisfied with the opportunity to learn. The figures from this table show that commerce graduates, with 96.88 percent, had the highest percentage of the White graduates who were satisfied with the opportunity to learn. They were followed by science graduates, with 89.23 per cent. Humanities graduates, with 87.50 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the White graduates who were satisfied with the opportunity to learn.

*Table 7.20: Satisfied with the opportunity to learn, by sex*

Satisfied With Opportunity To Learn	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
Yes	90.00	84.86	86.89
No	10.00	15.14	13.11
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	120	185	305

Table 7.20 compares male and female graduates as it indicates whether they were satisfied with their opportunity to learn in their current employment. The results show that the majority of male graduates, with 90 per cent, were satisfied with the opportunity to learn in their current employment. The results also show that the greater percentage of female graduates, with 84.86 per cent, was also satisfied with the opportunity to learn in their current employment. Comparing the two sex groups we can observe that male graduates had the higher percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were satisfied with their opportunity to learn in their current employment. This means that male graduates from the 2010 cohort were more satisfied by the opportunity to learn at their places of employment.

*Table 7.21: Male graduates satisfied with opportunity to learn, by faculty*

Satisfied with Opportunity to Learn	Faculty			Total
	Humanities	Science	Commerce	
Yes	87.18	93.62	90.32	90.60
No	12.82	6.38	9.68	9.40
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
N	39	47	31	117

Table 7.21 indicates whether male graduates (by faculty) were satisfied with the opportunity to learn. The figures from this table show that science graduates, with 93.62 percent, constituted the highest percentage of the male graduates who were satisfied with the opportunity to learn. They were followed by commerce graduates, with 90.32 per cent. Humanities graduates, with 87.18 per cent, had the lowest percentage of the male graduates who were satisfied with the opportunity to learn. In addition, when we compare the different satisfaction levels of the Rhodes graduates, we can see interesting results. The highest percentage of Rhodes graduates was satisfied with the nature of their work. The second highest percentage of Rhodes graduates were satisfied with the opportunity to learn whilst working. The third highest percentage of Rhodes graduates was satisfied with the working conditions. The fourth highest percentage of Rhodes graduates was satisfied with job security, followed by those who were satisfied with the opportunity to use their knowledge and skills acquired at university. The lowest percentage of Rhodes graduates was satisfied with their income. Therefore, it is evident that Rhodes graduates were more satisfied with the nature of their work and were least satisfied with their incomes. The results show that commerce graduates were more satisfied with the all aspects of their work compared to graduates from other faculties. Humanities graduates were the least satisfied by the various aspects of their work. The results also show that White graduates were more satisfied with the all aspects of their work compared to graduates from other race groups. Black graduates were the least satisfied by the various aspects of their work. The results also show that male graduates were more satisfied with the all aspects of their work compared to female graduates. Female graduates were less satisfied by the various aspects of their work.

## 6.11 CONCLUSION

This chapter examined the transitions of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates into the labour market. The results showed that the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates was employed in the private sector. Commerce graduates constituted the highest percentage of the 2010 cohort of Rhodes graduates who were employed in the private sector. White graduates also constituted the highest percentage of the graduates who were employed in the private sector. Black graduates constituted the highest percentage of the graduates who were employed in the public sector. Male graduates also constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were employed in the private sector. Interestingly, only a small percentage of the graduates were unemployed. The unemployment rate was even lower than the national graduate unemployment rate of 2014. The results also showed that the majority of the Rhodes graduates found their current jobs through personal contacts.

However, when comparing White and Black graduates, we saw that White graduates mostly located their current employment through personal contacts, relatives and private employment agencies. Whilst Black graduates located their current employment mostly through social media, newspapers and contacting potential employers through telephone, email and fax. Interestingly, when comparing graduates according to sex, we found that male graduates located their employment through private employment agencies, relatives, personal contacts and contacting potential employers through telephone, email and fax. However, female graduates located their current employment largely through newspaper advertisements and social media. Interestingly, the highest percentage of the graduates was in permanent employment. Commerce graduates constituted the highest percentage of the graduates who were in permanent and fixed-term employment. Whilst science graduates constituted the highest percentage of the graduates who were in casual employment. Compared with White graduates, Black graduates constituted the higher percentage of the graduates who were in permanent employment. However, compared with Black graduates, White graduates constituted the higher percentage of the graduates who were in fixed-term and casual employment. The results also showed that male graduates constituted the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates who were in permanent and casual employment. Female graduates dominated fixed-term employment. The highest percentage of Rhodes graduates took

less than three months to secure their current employment. The results also showed that commerce graduates secured their current employment faster than graduates from other faculties. Humanities graduates took the longest period to secure their current employment. Compared with White graduates, Black graduates took longer periods searching for employment. The highest percentage of Rhodes graduates earned more than R5600, the entry salary for middle class status in South Africa. Interestingly, female graduates secured their employment faster than male graduates.

Commerce graduates earned more than graduates from other faculties. Interestingly, science graduates earned the lowest. Comparing White and Black graduates' earnings, we found that Black graduates earned slightly higher than White graduates. The results also showed that female graduates earned higher incomes than male graduates. The highest percentage of Rhodes graduates indicated that their jobs were appropriate for their level of education and that they were related to their qualification. Commerce graduates constituted the highest percentage of Rhodes graduates who were in work that was appropriate and related to their qualification. The same goes for male graduates versus female graduates. There were more Black graduates who thought that their work was appropriate for their level of education than White graduates. On the other hand, there were more White graduates who thought that their work was related to their qualification than Black graduates. The results also show that Rhodes graduates were more satisfied with the nature of their work and were least satisfied with their incomes.

The results also show that commerce graduates were more satisfied with the all aspects of their work compared to graduates from other faculties. Humanities graduates were the least satisfied by the various aspects of their work. The results also show that White graduates were more satisfied with the all aspects of their work (accept the ability to use their knowledge and skills) compared to Black graduates. Black graduates were the least satisfied by the various aspects of their work. The results also show that male graduates were more satisfied with the various aspects of their work than female graduates. Female graduates were less satisfied by the various aspects of their work.

# **CHAPTER SEVEN**

## **DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION**

### **7.1 INTRODUCTION**

This dissertation was inspired by the findings of recent graduate tracer studies conducted in South Africa, which suggested that graduates from historically White universities have an added advantage in the labour market and experience better labour market outcomes compared to graduates from historically Black universities (Cosser, 2003; Moleke, 2005; Letseka et al., 2010; CHEC, 2013). These findings raised a number of concerns that influenced the direction of this thesis. One of the most fundamental concerns was the extent to which the labour market outcomes and experiences of graduates from a historically White University are undifferentiated or homogenous. Even though these graduates may experience better labour market outcomes than graduates from historically Black universities, they are bound to be inequalities and differences in their labour market outcomes based on (among other factors) their chosen fields of study, race and sex.

This dissertation adopted a heterodox labour market approach, which is partly inspired by critical realism, to analyse the transitions made by Rhodes graduates (2010 cohort) into the South Africa labour market. Critical realism provides an effective framework of analysis when conducting any research which focuses on labour markets. The main concern of science, according to critical realism, is to uncover the underlying mechanisms that generate empirical surface phenomena. Bhaskar (1978) indicated that, in order for scientists to understand empirical phenomena, they have to uncover the underlying mechanisms which generate these phenomena. The major critique that critical realism has of positivists is their attempts at measuring and predicting phenomena in open systems, such as the labour market, where empirical regularities (that are unchanging) do not occur (see Bhaskar, 1978; Fleetwood, 2006). In open systems, unlike the artificially constructed closed system of an experiment, generative mechanisms do not operate uninterruptedly and in isolation. Generative mechanisms operate together with other generative mechanisms and produce a complex joint outcome (see Bhaskar, 1978). In open systems, therefore, a variety of mechanisms (at the level of the 'real') produce a series of events which are beyond any element of those

mechanisms. The series of events that occurs form part of the ‘actual’. Critical realism indicates that social scientists must search for the various mechanisms that produce the outcomes in the *open* systems of social life. The social sciences are therefore: (a) explanatory sciences; (b) sciences without closure; and (c) sciences with interpretative foundations (see Bhaskar, 1978; Sayer, 1992; Ehrbar, 1998; Sayer, 2000; Danermark, 2002; Archer, Collier, and Porpora, 2013). This also means that validation in the natural sciences is based on predictive power in closed systems; but in the social sciences it can only be grounded on explanatory power in open systems.

Fleetwood (2006) argues that labour markets are complex, co-determined social constructs and cannot therefore be examined and understood purely at an empirical level. Labour markets are open systems which are produced by a myriad of social relations (see Fleetwood, 2006). Therefore critical realists perceive the labour market as complex and differentiated, and this idea is largely compatible with a heterodox perspective. The heterodox approach rejects the orthodox account, which equates labour markets to markets for products (see Lawson, 2006). The orthodox labour market approach has not succeeded in explaining certain phenomena. These include the variations in the earnings of workers with similar educational attainments and the discrimination against some groups (even in countries which are supposed to be non-discriminatory) on grounds other than productivity (see Reich et al., 1973).

The LMS theory was developed to explain such complex social phenomena (see Piore, 1993). According to this theory, the labour market is divided into a number of segments which have their own unique characteristics and rules. Contemporary LMS theory has its roots in the dual labour market theory developed by Doeringer and Piore (1971), who noted the existence of primary and secondary markets. Primary markets contain skilled jobs and generally offer stable employment. Secondary markets, by contrast, generally contain unskilled jobs and offers unstable employment (see Watcher, 1974). However, the most important point raised by the dual labour market theory is that labour markets are segmented and unequal because of the discrimination against certain groups within the society (see Reich et al., 1973). Therefore, this theoretical framework provided the best tools for analysing the transitions of Rhodes graduates (2010 cohort) into the South African labour market. Research shows that there are increased rewards for people with higher education qualifications in the labour market. These people will also most probably be employed in the primary segments of the labour market (see Branson and Leibbrandt, 2013b). However, the

heterodox approach indicates that even within these segments of stable employment there are variations in the employment outcomes of individuals (see Barker, 2003). Studies have shown that the primary market is divided into a number of internal labour markets, which refer to individual businesses or occupations (see McConnell and Brue, 1989).

This dissertation shows that, even though graduates from historically White universities tend to experience better labour market outcomes than graduates from former Black universities, their employment experiences vary on account of (among other factors) their chosen fields of study, race and sex. LMS theory is most fitting to explain the context of the variations in the outcomes and experiences of Rhodes graduates in the South African labour market. The third generation LMS theorists emphasise that segmentation is the outcome of the interplay of several causal tendencies: the state, the supply of labour (sphere of social reproduction) and the demand for labour (sphere of production) (see Peck, 1996). For critical realists, understanding empirical phenomena requires scientists to uncover the interrelation of the underlying mechanisms that generate them (see Bhaskar, 1978). Therefore, the segmented outcomes (and experiences) of the Rhodes graduates in the labour market as shown in this study are a result of the interrelation between the state (largely in the form of statutory regulation) and the processes involved in the supply of and demand for labour.

## **7.2 THE STATE**

The state plays the role of the mediator between the supply of and demand for labour (see De Brunhoff, 1978). This relationship is complex and tense and the state is meant to facilitate and find balances between the two parties. However, research shows that in most cases the state has merely institutionalized the highly unequal relationship between supply and demand (see De Brunhoff, 1978). The apartheid system was not different as it institutionalized an extreme form of capitalism, racism and patriarchy. The demand side (capital) wanted a mass of unskilled and cheap labour to work in the farming, manufacturing and mining industries. This was ensured through legislation and policies which denied Black people upward mobility of any kind, thereby relegating them to the lowest occupations in these industries. The apartheid system entrenched strong biases in education, training, job access and networks in the South African labour market that have been difficult to transform (see Nkomo, 1990; Wolpe, 1991; Bunting, 1994; Badat, 1998, 1999; Cooper and Subotzky, 2001; Reddy, 2004; Bunting, 2006). The new democratic government faces the

daunting task of reversing the injustices and inequalities caused by the apartheid regime. The government has attempted to do this through the establishment and implementation of legislation and policies governing many spheres of South African life, especially education (both basic and higher education) and the labour market. These policies are progressive in nature, as they make it possible for previously disadvantaged groups to progress in the South African economy (Reddy, 2004; Rasool, 2010). The fruits of these progressive policies are seen in some of the labour market outcomes of Rhodes graduates in this study.

However, apartheid has left an enduring legacy in South Africa, despite efforts to integrate the historically racially-segregated education systems. The effects of the apartheid legacy are evident in the supply-side processes and institutions as they reflect a myriad of inequalities. LMS theorists have termed these inequalities pre-labour market discriminations (Peck, 1996). Pre-labour market discriminations are starkly evident in this study. Therefore, it is very important to distinguish between pre-labour market and labour market discrimination. Pre-labour market discrimination is an important contributor to persistent racial and sexual differentials. There are a number of dimensions to pre-labour market discrimination and these are highlighted in Moleke's (2005) study of school-to-work transitions. These include unequal access to, length and quality of schooling; access to tertiary education; networks, career information, information about education quality and bursaries/loans; and good learning conditions (young people working under substantial social stress and poor learning conditions). Pre-labour market discriminations are evident in the supply-side processes (institutions) in this study.

### **7.3 SEGMENTED SUPPLY OF LABOUR**

The first part of the study focused on the socio-economic backgrounds of the Rhodes graduates. Socio-economic backgrounds are an integral component of the processes that shape the supply of labour (see Dickens and Lang, 1988). Recent segmentation theories highlight the importance of various institutions that influence the supply of labour and essentially their outcomes in the labour market (see Peck, 1996). For the purpose of this study, the family, schooling and university were included, because they are institutions which play a crucial role in the supply of labour in the labour market. The third generation LMS theorists emphasise the fact that the experiences of

individuals within these institutions differ and perpetuate certain stereotypes and discriminatory practices that influence the outcomes in the labour market (see Lee, 2003).

### **7.3.1 The Family**

The third generation LMS theorists indicate that the family influences the labour market in three ways: first, it plays a role in the social conditioning and education of the youth; second, it provides a support for workers in the labour market; and third, the sharing of income within the family unit (see Rubery and Wilkinson, 1981). Basically the family structure and processes within it influence the type of individuals it produces in the labour market. More importantly, is the fact that families differ on the bases of economic class, race, levels of education, earnings, culture and so on. The findings in this study validated these claims made by the third generation LMS theorists. The findings indicated that there were racial inequalities and gender inequalities in the socio-economic backgrounds of the graduates. For example, White parents/guardians had higher levels of education and earnings than Black parents. This was evident when we observed in table 4.15 that White fathers (71.16 per cent) had high levels of education than Black fathers (56.38 per cent). Similar figures were observed (in table 4.17) for White mothers (64.78 per cent), who had higher levels of education than Black mothers (55.76 per cent). The disparities based on sex were also evident as fathers in both race groups had higher levels of education than mothers.

In terms of income figures from table 4.19, White fathers (51.23 per cent) earned more than Black fathers (33.33 per cent), whilst figures in table 4.21 showed that White mothers (40.62 per cent) earned more than Black mothers (29.55 per cent). Variations based on sex were also discovered in earnings in both race groups, where fathers earned more than mothers. These findings validate the claims of the third generation LMS theorists, who emphasise the inequalities that exist in the family structures of individuals. Third generation LMS theorists also emphasise the important role that the state and the demand side play in the labour market. In the case of South Africa, the state institutionalized an extreme form of capitalism and patriarchy during the apartheid era. The findings from this study, which showed that White parents had higher levels of education and earnings than Black parents, are a reflection of the legacy of the apartheid system (see Natrass and Seekings, 2001).

The apartheid system denied the majority of Blacks quality education, thereby reducing many to working in jobs that required very few skills (see Wolpe, 1990; Nkomo, 1990; Mariotti, 2012).

Only a small minority of the Black population had access to higher education institutions and they were given sub-standard education as compared to their White counterparts.

The intention of the apartheid government was to provide a small minority of Blacks with just enough education to serve the oppressive system's extensive bureaucracy (see Badat, 1998, 1999; Cooper and Subotzky, 2001; Reddy, 2004; Bunting, 2006). This unequal access to the labour market created a racial dualism which was institutionalised in the South African labour market during apartheid. This meant that Whites constituted the skilled (employed in the primary segments), whilst the majority of Blacks constituted the unskilled (employed in the secondary segments) (see Cassim, 1982). Although this was also true for women, however, it was mostly Black and Coloured women who were excluded from educational and labour market opportunities (see Cock, 1980). This inequality in terms opportunities in quality education during apartheid has had lasting effects in the new democratic South Africa. The findings from this study which showed that White parents had higher level of education and earned more than Black parents are a direct result of the apartheid system and its laws of discrimination. This also confirms the state's role in the segmentation of the supply of labour and the labour market as a whole.

Seccareccia (1991: 48) indicated that the “process of occupational socialisation is related to other social affiliations, with the effect being that career paths are highly compartmentalised and dependent upon the social milieu that originally moulded the individual participant”. Therefore, the family's levels of education and occupations can set a powerful example to follow (see Hauser and Wong, 1989; Eccles, 2005; Goodman, Hurwitz, and Smith, 2014). This study also examined whether the graduates had siblings who were also graduates, and the findings confirmed that the majority of Rhodes graduates had siblings who were university graduates. However, the findings revealed that there were variations between Black and White graduates. The findings in table 4.23 indicated that there were more White graduates (69.34 per cent) who had siblings who were also graduates than Black graduates (48.51 per cent).

### **7.3.2 Schooling**

Schooling is a central component in the processes that influence the supply of labour. The type of schooling attended can influence the choice of university, courses studies and their outcomes in the labour market. In South Africa there is a big gap between the quality of schools, with elite public (Model C ) and private schools provide top quality education, whilst low cost public schools

generally provide poor education (see Grant, 2013; Power, 2014). The result of this inequality is the fact that low cost public schools form the majority of the schools in South Africa, and therefore this has a negative effect on the quality of students entering the higher education sector and labour market (see Jansen, 2012; Branson, et al., 2012). However, the findings in table 4.12 indicated that the most of the Rhodes graduates (81.69 percent) attended elite public (Model C) (48.36 per cent) and private schools (33.33) and only a small minority attended low cost public (13.39 per cent) and private schools (4.37 per cent). This is a contributing factor in their outcomes and experiences in the in the labour market. The findings in table 4.13 also showed some variations in race, as there were more White graduates (89.45 per cent) who attended elite public and private schools than Black graduates (69.25 per cent). This means that Whites are more likely to send their children to elite public and private schools than Blacks. This is a product of the racial inequalities of the past and the dualism that was illustrated by Cassim (1982) which created earnings inequalities between Black and White households. These findings are part of the pre-labour market discrimination and can have an effect on the labour market outcomes. What we see here is the role of the apartheid state policies and their effects on the supply-side processes that have a segmenting effect in the labour market.

### **7.3.3 University Study**

The transition into university also plays a key role in segmenting the supply of labour into the labour market. The experiences and outcomes of graduates at university are the products of their familys' socio-economic backgrounds and the schooling they attended (see Eccles, 2005; Eccles and Roeser, 2009). Most importantly the courses chosen by the individual will play a crucial part in their outcomes in the labour market. The third generation theorists indicate that there is a strong relationship between various elements of the supply of labour and the demand for labour (see Peck, 1996). Demand can influence the types of decision made by individuals in terms of their choice of university study (see Daniels, 2007).

Research shows that employers favour graduates from HWUs over graduates from HBUs. This is a product of the historical legacy of the inequalities between White and Black universities during apartheid. HWUs are still perceived as the producers of the most competent graduates in the country (see Van Broekhuizen, 2013). These perceptions have a direct influence on the supply of labour in terms of the type of universities that individuals decide to enrol in. This was seen in the

findings in table 5.1 which indicated that the majority of the Rhodes graduates (90.26) had initially wanted to study at former White universities. Here we see an interaction between the state and demand. The fact that demand favours graduates from HWUs is a result of the state's role during apartheid, which perpetuated inequality in all spheres of South African society. This study also showed pre-labour market discrimination in the earnings of the Rhodes parents (by race), through their ability to afford university fees. The study also showed in table 5.2 that the majority of Rhodes graduates (71.08 per cent) indicated that their parents paid for their university fees. This is indicative of the class component at Rhodes University, the fact that the bulk of the student body come from higher income households. However, there were variations in terms of race. The findings in table 5.3 showed that, even though a large number of Black graduates (60 per cent) indicated that their parents paid their university fees, White parents (89.14 per cent) were more able to afford university fees than Black parents. An interesting fact (see in table 5.5) is that there were more Whites (15.84 per cent) who received university bursaries than Blacks (10.48 per cent). This indicates that Whites generally performed better at university than Blacks, because bursaries are usually granted to top performing students.

In addition, tables 5.7 and 5.9 indicated that there were more Blacks who funded their studies through NSFAS (33.33 per cent) and bank loans (9.52 per cent) than Whites (at 2.71 and 6.79 respectively). And the figures in table 5.11 showed that there were more Whites (4.50 per cent) who funded their own studies than Blacks (4.76 per cent). This finding validates the claims of the third generation LMS theorists, who indicated that there are inequalities in the processes that produce the supply of labour, especially when it comes to family backgrounds (earnings by race and sex) and schooling. They also noted that it was minorities (Blacks and women) who were the groups that were at a disadvantage in these processes (see Reich et al., 1973). The findings in table 5.13 also indicated that it was Whites (71.23 per cent) who were more exposed to the labour market whilst at university through undertaking extra jobs, than Blacks (69.23).

When comparing sex in table 5.14, males (74.47 per cent) were more exposed to the labour market through undertaking extra jobs whilst studying than females (67.26 per cent). Further racial inequalities were seen in the racial composition of the graduate completion rates. Although Blacks constitute the majority of the student headcounts at Rhodes University (52 per cent in 2013) (see Rhodes University, 2013), they had very poor completion rate (29.75 per cent) compared to Whites

(62.61 per cent) (see table 4.1). What makes the completion rate for Black South Africans at Rhodes even lower is the fact that a substantial number of the Black graduates were non-South African (29.52 per cent), whilst White non-South Africans constituted only a small percentage (8.14 per cent) of the White graduates from Rhodes (see table 4.5). This finding confirms recent findings that indicate that Blacks in South Africa have a poor completion rates compared to Whites (see Letseka and Maile, 2008; Fisher and Scott, 2011; Monama, 2013; HESA, 2014; Masicorp, 2014).

The findings in table 5.20 also showed that there more White graduates (77.38 per cent) who had achieved a further qualification than Black graduates (67.67 per cent). However, the findings in table 5.24 also showed that there were more Black graduates (31.43 per cent) who were currently enrolled for further qualifications than White graduates (27.15 per cent). Comparing graduates according to sex, the figures in table 5.21 showed that there were more male graduates (75 per cent) who had achieved a further qualification than female graduates (71.56 per cent). However, table 5.25 shows that there were more female graduates (25.53 per cent) enrolled for further study than male graduates (31.84 per cent). Another interesting finding was in table 5.19 and it showed that science graduates (81.15 per cent) had the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who achieved a further qualification, followed by commerce graduates (76.12 per cent). Humanities graduates (63.19) had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who had achieved a further qualification. Table 5.23 showed that commerce graduates (37.88 per cent) constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were enrolled for further study, followed by science graduates (33.06 per cent). Humanities graduates (21.88 per cent) had the lowest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who were enrolled for further qualifications.

This section has shown pre-labour market differences (unequal attainment in education) in terms of field of study. This plays a significant role in the segmented labour market outcomes and experiences of the graduates. However, when we analyse all three institutions (family, schooling and university) that influence the processes of the supply of labour, it is evident that there are variations and inequalities in terms of race and sex. This means that there is clear evidence of pre-labour market discrimination and inequality in the study of Rhodes graduates. LMS theories suggest that even though there are inequalities in the supply of labour, the transition into the labour market is also shaped by forces which may retain or reshape forms of discrimination and

inequalities (see Lawson, 2006). Discrimination in the labour market differs from that caused by pre-labour market discrimination. Discrimination arises where it can be shown that there are persistent and statistically significant differences in labour market outcomes for people of different race groups that have similar characteristics, particularly in educational attainment and years of work experience. Differential labour market outcomes, contrary to the claims of orthodox theorists, are therefore not only caused by pre-labour market discrimination. The labour market, itself, plays a key role in the differentiated outcomes experienced by the graduates.

#### **7.4 SEGMENTED DEMAND FOR LABOUR**

Although the supply-side factors are important to understand the segmented nature of the labour market, the third generation LMS theorists indicate that demand-side factors remain the primary determinant of segmented labour markets (see Peck, 1996). This means that demand-side factors determine the differentiated structure of jobs and the type of skills required to work those jobs. The processes involved in labour demand and segmentation are complex. Doeringer and Piore (1971) indicated that labour demand was determined largely by two factors, namely, technology and power relationships. They traced the causes of dualism in the labour market to the structure of technology and especially to the particular labour requirements of different production systems. The third generation segmentation theorists indicate that LMS is both an intra-industry and an intra-firm phenomenon, and that it differs between industrial sectors.

On the broader stage, globalization has generated drastic changes in labour market demand all over the world. Globalization refers to widening and deepening international trade, finance, information and culture into a single integrated world market (see Toukhy, 1998). For the last two decades, South Africa has been part of that process and has experienced various structural shifts in its economy and changes in production methods in different sectors. These structural shifts are represented by the shift in output away from the primary sectors and toward the services sectors. This does not mean that primary sectors are on the decline. Kraak (2003) argued that Fordist, labour-intensive production continues to grow alongside the new high-technology economy. These changes and advances in technology and production systems have been termed by many as the knowledge-based economy. The labour market consequences of these changes have been an increase in the demand for highly-skilled workers. The demand is mostly for vocational

qualifications in the sciences (medical sciences, engineering, etc.) and commerce (finance, IT, accountants, economists, etc.). There is also a demand for some fields in the humanities faculty (law, education). However, the greatest demand is for accounting, law, medicine, engineering and finance graduates (see *Businesstech*, 2014).

In this process of high skills demand, the state has continued to play a key role in the relationship between supply and demand for labour. In the mid-1990s the new democratic government was faced by hostile processes of globalization and dramatic skills shifts (see *Moolman*, 2003) while attempting to reverse the inequalities and injustices of the past. It attempted to execute this task by introducing various laws and policies which encouraged human resource development in South Africa (see *Kraak*, 2004a). This involved making education more accessible to the broader population of South Africa. These policies were also directed at organizations to reverse their discriminatory practices and to employ individuals on a non-racial and non-sexist basis (see *Rasool*, 2004). This was achieved through the implementation of various labour laws. As a result of these changes, we have seen a growth in the number of Black graduates and professionals in the labour market. However, research has shown that the legacies of inequality in the labour market still remain in terms of racial and gender inequalities (*Bhorat*, 2001). While not discounting the salience of racial and sexual differentials, a closer examination of these inequalities reveals the complex ways in which they are inter-related with skill differentials.

The apartheid system was also patriarchal as it restricted quality education to females (mostly Black) (see *Cock*, 1980). This system made sure that Whites were better educated and more skilled than Blacks; hence, the racial dualism of the apartheid labour market (see *Bunting*, 1994). Today, the legacies of racial dualism are still evident in the labour market. However, skills have become the major point of segmentation, which often reinforces and remakes racial and sexual hierarchies in the labour market. The growing demand for highly skilled workers has meant increased rewards for individuals with tertiary education (see *Branson et al.*, 2009a). Research shows that earnings and employment returns to post-secondary education remain high in South Africa (*Bhorat and Leibbrandt*, 2001; *Keswell and Poswell*, 2004; *van der Berg and van Broekhuizen*, 2012) and have probably even increased over time (*Branson et al.*, 2009a; *Cloete*, 2009). However, the LMS theory points out that the demand for labour is not homogenous, this means that university graduates will

also be segmented on the bases of their qualifications and (because of the history of the country) their race and sex will also play a role in their employment outcomes.

#### **7.4.1 Employment Status**

The findings from this study validate the claims made by the third generation LMS theorists. These showed that Rhodes graduates experienced varying and unequal outcomes in the South African labour market on the account of (among other factors) their chosen fields of study, race and sex. However, the interesting fact is that (even though there were racial and sexual variations in the labour market outcomes of graduates), the graduates' field of study (skills) was an important differentiating factor in these outcomes. This validated the claims of the LMS theorists and their emphasis on the role of the state in the labour market outcomes. The legislation and policies of the new government are evident in the fact that, even though there are racial and sexual disparities reflecting past legacies of inequality, skills have a significant influence in the labour market outcomes of graduates in South Africa. This is evident in table 6.1, where the figures indicate that the vast majority (93.44 per cent) of Rhodes graduates (2010 cohort) were in some kind of employment.

This finding links with studies that indicated that there are increased rewards for individuals with a tertiary qualification in the South African labour market (see Branson et al., 2009a). The findings in table 6.1 also showed that most Rhodes graduates were employed in the private sector (63.93 per cent), and only a small percentage was employed in the public sector (13.66 per cent). Interestingly, the findings also indicated that only a small percentage of the 2010 cohort were unemployed (4.92 per cent), which is lower than the national graduate unemployment rate, which is 5.2 per cent (see StatsSA, 2014a). This finding confirms the findings from recent studies which established that graduate unemployment in South Africa was exaggerated (see Van der Berg and van Broekhuizen, 2012; Altbeker and Storme, 2013). On closer examination, the findings in table 6.2 showed that the highest percentage of unemployed Rhodes graduates were from the humanities faculty (5.66 per cent), whilst commerce graduates had the lowest unemployment rate (3.03 per cent).

When this finding was broken down according to race, the result in table 6.3 showed that Black graduates (7.62 per cent) had a higher unemployment rate than White graduates (3.62 per cent). These findings correlate with the findings of Moleke (2005), who also indicated that Blacks were more likely to experience a higher unemployment rate. Therefore, a continuity of labour market disadvantage (based on race) is evident in this study, because Black graduates have a higher unemployment rate than White graduates.

When this finding is broken down according to field of study, figures from table 6.4 indicate that most of the unemployed Black graduates were from the science faculty (11.54 per cent), followed by those from the commerce faculty (8.33 per cent). Humanities graduates, with 3.77 per cent, constituted the lowest percentage of the unemployed Black graduates. This is interesting, because when we examined Rhodes graduates as a collective, graduates from the humanities faculty had the highest unemployment rate compared to graduates from other faculties. But when we break down the black unemployment rate, we see that humanities graduates constitute the lowest percentage and it is the commerce and science graduates who make up the bulk of the unemployed black graduates. This finding shows that although skills are becoming a strong determiner for graduate labour market outcomes, race still plays a significant role.

When we compare the graduates according to sex, the findings in table 6.6 indicate that male graduates (5 per cent) had a higher unemployment rate than female graduates (4.93 per cent). Interestingly, the higher percentage of the unemployed female graduates, with 6.15 per cent, were from the science faculty, followed by 5.41 per cent from the humanities faculty and none from the commerce faculty (see table 6.9). The higher percentage of the unemployed male graduates (6.67 per cent) were from the humanities faculty (see table 6.7). From these findings, we can also see a discontinuity in terms of labour market discrimination according to sex because male graduates had a higher unemployment rate than female graduates. On the supply-side, we saw women being in disadvantageous positions compared to men, especially when we investigated the household dynamics of education and income. However, the fact that female graduates had a lower unemployment rate than men signals a level of transformation in the labour market and a discontinuity in this aspect of pre-labour market discrimination. Part of this transformation must

be attributed to state intervention through its progressive labour policies which seek to empower women through employment opportunities.

#### **7.4.2 Sector of Employment**

Although university graduates are likely to secure employment (see Moleke, 2005), the major point in question is the quality of their employment. The findings of this the study reveal that science and commerce graduates are at the top of the skills demand hierarchy. The findings table 6.1 also indicated that the greater number of Rhodes graduates (2010 cohort) (66.67 per cent) were employed in the private sector and only a small minority (15.72 per cent) were employed in the public sector. When this finding was broken down according to race in table 6.3 it was clear that there were more White graduates (70.14 per cent) in the private sector than Black graduates (56.19 per cent). There were also more Black graduates (25.71 per cent) in the public sector than White graduates (7.24 per cent). This finding correlates findings from graduates tracer studies which indicated that White graduates are more likely to be employed in the private sector and Black graduates in the public sector (see Paton, 2013; Radebe, 2013). At face value, this could signal a continuity of labour market discrimination in terms of race as a product of the racial dualism of apartheid (see Cassim, 1982). While not discounting this fact, a closer examination of the figures in table 6.5 indicates that most of the White graduates, who dominated private sector employment, were from the commerce (50 per cent) and science faculties (50 per cent). Whereas the findings from table 6.4 show that a substantial number of the Black graduates, who dominated public sector employment, were from the humanities faculty (30 per cent).

Therefore, we are seeing a greater demand and preference in the private sector for commerce and science graduates. We cannot and should not discount the fact that this finding may be a product of the racialized history of the South African labour market. However, it does indicate the skills dimension to this racialized outcome by sector. This finding was also broken down according to sex in table 6.6 and it indicated that there were more male graduates (68.57 per cent) in the private sector than female graduates (60.99 per cent). Table 6.7 indicates that a dominant number of the male graduates, who occupy private sector jobs, were from the humanities faculty (71.11 per cent). Table 6.8 also indicates that most of those male graduates from the humanities were White (77.78

per cent). This also highlights the fact that, even though there is a greater demand for commerce and science graduates in the private sector, White graduates are still most likely to be employed in the private sector (even with general humanities degrees). This is not to say that there is no demand for humanities graduates in the private sector but evidence shows that there is a skills bias in terms of which skills the private sector is demanding (specialised commerce and science degrees). However, this also shows that White graduates (no matter their qualifications) are still more likely to be employed in the private sector. Table 6.6 also showed that there were more female graduates (15.25 per cent) employed in the public sector than male graduates (10.71 per cent). Interestingly, the figures in table 6.9 illustrate that the greater number of the female graduates employed in the public sector were from the commerce faculty (25.81 per cent).

At first sight, this finding seems to contradict the earlier statements that the private sector favours commerce and science graduates. However, upon closer examination in table 6.10, we found that the majority of those female graduates from the commerce faculty employed in the public sector were Black (33.33 per cent). This correlates with the findings that indicate that Blacks are still mostly employed in the public sector (see Paton, 2013), even though the majority of the Black females had commerce degrees. This shows the influence of pre-labour market discrimination in the supply-side processes in the segmented labour market outcomes of Rhodes graduates by race. These findings also show that even though commerce and science graduates are generally favoured in the private sector as compared to humanities graduates (see table 6.2), when we break it down according to race and sex, it is obvious that Whites (especially males) are favoured in the private sector, even when they have humanities degrees. This shows that pre-labour market discriminations (unequal supply side processes) have a strong segmentation effect on the sectors that graduates are employed in. Again, this is not to say that there is no demand for humanities graduates in the private sector, but there is a stronger demand for commerce and science graduates (with specialised degrees).

### 7.4.3 Type of Employment

Piore (1975) emphasized that demand-side factors play a crucial role in the segmentation which is manifested in the industrial structure of the economy and in the outcomes for individuals within the labour market. Piore added that the primary sector (occupied by skilled workers) is composed of two segments or the upper and the lower 'tiers' as he called them. Basically, he was highlighting the fact that the primary sector is not a homogenous entity which recruits only highly skilled workers and offers only stable employment. The upper tier of the primary sector consists of professional and managerial jobs, which involve high pay and status, great opportunities for advancement, but also high mobility and turnover patterns, which normally tend to describe those in the secondary sector. On the other hand, workers in the lower tier tend to have (in comparison to those in the upper tier) lower average pay, fewer opportunities for promotion and face more rigid administrative rules and procedures for wage setting and labour allocation (see Piore, 1975). This is an indication that primary sector employment is differentiated and that there are individuals who have better experiences in primary sector employment than others, largely as a result of their skills. This is confirmed by the skills bias phenomena illustrated by Bhorat and Goga (2013).

The claims made by the LMS theorists are confirmed in this study on Rhodes graduates, as we see a pattern that shows that commerce and science graduates experience better labour market outcomes than humanities graduates. This does not discount the influence of supply-side processes and pre-labour market discriminations in the segmented experiences of graduates in the labour market. However, the differentiated demand-side forces have a strong influence on the segmented outcomes for graduates in the labour market. Looking at the type of employment that the 2010 cohort were engaged in also reflected the skills segmentation and hierarchy that exists in the demand for labour in the South African labour market. The findings from table 6.35 indicated that the greater number of Rhodes graduates (72.67 per cent) were in permanent employment. However, there were clear variations when field of study, race and sex were compared. Most of the graduates who were in permanent employment were from the commerce faculty (73.33 per cent) (see table 6.36).

When we examined this finding by race in table 6.37 we found the Black graduates (78.41 per cent) constituted the highest percentage of the graduates who were in permanent employment, whilst Whites (25.14 per cent) constituted the majority of the graduates who were in fixed-term employment. Upon closer examination in table 6.38, the majority of the Black graduates who were in permanent employment were from the commerce (80 per cent) and humanities faculties (86.63 per cent). Table 6.39 illustrates that the greater number of the White graduates (28.13 per cent) who were in fixed-term employment were from the commerce faculty. Research shows that permanent and fixed-term employment have increased benefits (see Tucker, 2014), which means that commerce graduates experience the most beneficial employment. From this finding we can see a slight discontinuity (of labour market disadvantage) in the fact that there were more Black graduates in permanent employment than White graduates. This continuation reflects the role of the state and its progressive labour policies and the demand side of labour (and its skills bias for certain skills), which tends to make skills an increasingly significant segmenting mechanism.

Casual employment is unstable and offers less social security and often has lower wages (see Tucker, 2014; Mywage, 2014) than full-time employment. Interestingly, table 6.37 revealed that there were more White graduates (4.92 per cent) who were in casual employment than Black graduates (3.41 per cent). Figures from table 6.39 indicate that most of the White graduates (9.21 per cent) who were in casual employment were from the humanities faculty. This finding also shows a discontinuity of the pre-labour market discrimination (in terms of race), where one would expect that there would be more Blacks in casual employment than Whites because of the legacy of apartheid. However, this finding indicates the strong influence of the state's progressive policies and demand-side processes in segmenting the outcomes of graduates in the labour market. Again, this finding shows that humanities (with the exception of specific qualifications such as law) graduates tend to occupy the bottom of the skills hierarchy (in terms of demand) in South Africa.

#### **7.4.4 Methods of Locating Employment**

The process of searching for and acquiring employment is complex and multi-layered, as it includes both supply side and demand side factors. Third generation LMS theorists propose that segmentation is the result of the interplay between the supply, demand for labour and the state.

Research shows that family and personal contacts are a useful tool to locate and secure employment (see Lin and Dumin, 1986; Montgomery, 1991; Granovetter, 1995). However, it is usually the well to do who are connected to key people in the labour market, who can assist them with the process of securing employment (Berman, 2011). Research also shows that Whites are more likely to locate and secure employment through personal contacts (see Paton, 2013). This is because of the connections they have in the labour market (see Jenvey, 2012). The findings from table 6.25 confirmed the results from those studies as they showed that White graduates (34.39 per cent) were more likely to use personal contacts locate jobs than Black graduates (12.38 per cent). Plus table 6.65 indicates that White graduates (47.93 per cent) were more likely to secure employment through personal contacts than Black graduates (34.52 per cent).

The findings from table 6.17 confirmed that Whites (7.69 per cent) were more likely to locate their work through relatives than Black graduates (2.86 per cent). This is a reflection of the pre-labour market discrimination (and inequality) in the supply side of labour. That is, the evident racial inequalities in the family networks and connections in the labour market which favour Whites in South Africa (see Jenvey, 2012; Paton, 2013). This is also where the state comes into play again, because the apartheid legislation and policies were drafted in such a way that ensured that a substantial percentage of the economy would be in White hands (see Van den Berghe, 1987). After 20 years of democracy, Whites still own the bulk of the economy (see SACSIS, 2013). Hence, the ability of White graduates to locate and secure employment mostly through relatives and personal contacts. This shows that it is not solely the demand side of labour that segments the labour market experiences of the graduates, but it is also an inter-play between the state and supply-side factors. The findings in table 6.29 also showed that Black graduates (20 per cent) were more likely to use newspaper advertisements to locate employment than White graduates (2.71 per cent). Black graduates (10.48 per cent) were also more likely to use social media to locate employment than White graduates (8.14 per cent) (see table 6.21). These particular findings are an indication of the various channels used by the Black and White graduates. It is evident that Whites still mostly have an added advantage in the labour market, because most of the White graduates in this study were able to secure their employment through personal contacts. Whilst the majority of Black graduates depend on other channels such as social media, newspapers to locate and secure employment.

Table 6.13 illustrated that White graduates (9.50 per cent) were more likely to use private employment agencies than Black graduates (5.71 per cent). Black graduates (7.62 per cent) were more likely to contact potential employers through telephone, email, fax searching for employment than White graduates (7.24 per cent) (see table 6.33). Comparing the same findings by sex, we found that male graduates (25.64 per cent) were more likely to use personal contacts to locate employment than female graduates (21.86 per cent)(see table 6.26). Male graduates (7.05 per cent) were also more likely to use the assistance of their relatives than female graduates (4.86 per cent) (see table 6.18). Male graduates (8.33 per cent) were also more likely to use private employment agencies than female graduates (5.67 per cent) (see table 6.14). The findings also indicated that male graduates (7.05 per cent) were more likely to contact through telephone, email, fax potential employers to secure employment than female graduates (6.48 per cent) (see table 6.34). On the other hand, female graduates (9.72 per cent) were more likely to locate their employment through social media than male graduates (5.13 per cent) (see table 6.22).

The findings also show that female graduates (8.91) were more likely to find their employment through newspaper advertisements than male graduates (7.69 per cent) (see table 6.30). The state also has a role to play here, as during apartheid women (mostly Black) were also limited access to quality education and key positions in the labour market, hence hampering their chances of ownership (see Van den Berghe, 1987). Men on the other hand (especially White) were granted access to quality education, key positions in the labour market and ultimately opportunities at ownership (see Cock, 1980). The apartheid system and legislation did not only institutionalize extreme capitalism, but patriarchy also. The findings from this study also show that females still have less connection to key occupations to the labour market, as compared to men. This particular finding (which indicates how Rhodes graduates located and secured their employment) reflects a continuity of labour market discrimination based on racial inequality and sexual inequality. This finding also validates the claims made by the LMS theorists that the state and supply- and demand-side processes have a strong influence on the differentiated experiences of individuals in the labour market (see Peck, 1996).

#### **7.4.5 Period Searching for Employment**

Most of the findings in this study show that, although there are variations in terms of race and sex in labour market outcomes, field of study plays an increasingly prominent role in labour market segmentation. This skills bias was evident when we examined the job search periods of the Rhodes graduates. The findings in table 6.43 revealed that even though the majority of Rhodes graduates (71.09 per cent) secured their current employment within less than three months, there were variations in terms of chosen fields of study, race and sex. The findings (in table 6.44) showed that science (72.86 per cent) and commerce graduates (70.17 per cent) secured work faster (within three months) than humanities graduates (68.32 per cent). In other words commerce and science faculties had the highest percentages of the Rhodes graduates who secured work in less than three months as compared to graduates from the humanities faculty.

The findings in table 6.45 also indicated that White graduates (76.68 per cent) secured work faster than Black graduates (62.16 per cent). In other words, there was a higher percentage of White graduates who secured work in less than three months than Black graduates. This finding correlates with the findings of Moleke (2005), which state that Black graduates in South Africa are more likely to experience longer periods of unemployment while searching for work than White graduates. Moleke (2005) attributed this to skills bias and segmented demand for labour. Upon initial observation, the results from this study appear to be a product of pre-labour market discrimination. However, after close examination, it was found that skills are a significant determining factor of labour market outcomes, which at times seem to run contrary to racial and sexual hierarchies in society.

This was evident in the fact that a substantial number of White graduates (79.31 per cent), who secured work faster than Black graduates, were from the commerce faculty (see tables 6.4). Therefore, we could conclude that one of the main reasons why White graduates secured work faster than Black graduates was because a large percentage of them were from the commerce faculty. However, we cannot completely discount the fact that Whites have more labour market connections, the findings indicated earlier that the majority of White graduates located and secured their current employment through personal contacts.

At this point, we can see the significant weight of demand-side factors. When we analysed the same findings according to sex, we observed that female graduates (72.16 per cent) secured employment faster than male graduates (69.48 per cent). In other words, there was a higher percentage of female graduates who secured work in less than three months as compared to male graduates (see table 6.48). This particular finding is evidence of a discontinuity in labour market disadvantage in terms of sex. A demand-side analysis can explain this outcome. It shows that the majority of female graduates, who secured work faster than male graduates, were from the commerce faculty (76.66 per cent) (see table 6.49). This may provide an explanation for why females secured their work faster than male graduates. This particular aspect (period to secure work) again shows a discontinuity of male advantage in terms of access to the labour market, and points towards the importance of skills in securing employment. This also validates the proposition made by the third generation LMS theorists that demand-side forces have a strong influence in the segmentation of labour market outcomes.

#### **7.4.6 Monthly Income**

This claim was further validated when we compared the monthly incomes of the Rhodes graduates. Even though figures from table 6.67 show that a large majority of the Rhodes graduates (93.35 per cent) earned more than R6400 per month (above the South African middle-class entry income of R5600, according to Visagie (2013), the findings showed variations in terms of fields of study, race and sex. Commerce graduates (97.67 per cent) earned more than graduates from the humanities (93.56 per cent) and science (90.47 per cent) faculties (see table 6.68). However, when broken down according to race, the findings in table 6.69 showed that Blacks (95.08 per cent) earned more than White graduates (92.98 per cent).

This means that we must take into account the demand-side factors which create segmented labour market outcomes for graduates. The finding showed that the highest percentage of the Black graduates (99.99 per cent) who earned more than White graduates was from the commerce faculty (see table 6.70). When we compared graduates according to sex in table 6.71, we discovered similar findings, as female graduates (93.84 per cent) earned slightly more than male graduates (92.32 per cent).

This was another discontinuity in pre-labour market disadvantage (fathers had higher earnings than mothers). The demand side factor provides a better possible explanation for this finding. The result in table 6.72 showed that most of the female graduates who earned more than males were from the commerce (95.45 per cent) and humanities (95.53 per cent) faculties. There is 0.08 per cent difference between the two. Therefore, the general trend that is evident in this study is that graduates who experience better labour market outcomes are mostly from the commerce faculty. These findings show the influences of both state and demand side processes in promoting the segmentation of labour market outcomes of graduates (see Peck, 1996).

#### **7.4.7 Quality of Employment**

The segmentation in the demand for skills is a result of a growth in the service sectors. Research shows that the demand for skilled workers is increasing at a higher rate than that for unskilled workers (see Van Schalkwyk, 2002; Ramdass and Kruger, 2006:116). Businesstech (2014) reported in 2014 there was an estimated 470,000 vacancies in the private sector which were positions that could be filled almost immediately if the skills were available. More than half (52 per cent) of these positions were in management, and the remainder (37 per cent) were largely professional positions in accounting, law, medicine, engineering and finance. Interestingly the law degree was the only qualification from the humanities that is in high demand, whilst the rest of the critical skills demanded are from the commerce and science faculties. This is a reflection of the segmented skills demand that the third generation theorists were explaining (see Lang and Dickens, 1988; Peck, 1996). These findings also show that there is a lesser demand for individuals with humanities degrees. However, this is not to say that humanities graduates do not find employment, but this bias in skills demand explains the segmented outcomes and experiences of Rhodes graduates in terms of their fields of study.

These changes are in line with international trends and relate to two important changes. Firstly, as stated earlier, there has been a movement away from primary (i.e. mining and agriculture) and secondary (e.g. manufacturing) industries to tertiary or service. Secondly, there has also been a movement away from unskilled/semi-skilled occupations to those that require higher skills level sectors (see Mincer, 1996; Bhorat and Hodge, 1999; Edwards, 2001). In this sense, we can see evidence of what Piore (1975) meant by a segmented primary sector or the division of jobs in the

primary sector according to certain skills. The findings in this study of Rhodes graduates has confirmed these claims, as we see a pattern where commerce and science graduates experience better outcomes in the labour market than humanities graduates. Looking at the skills that the commerce and science graduates possess compared to the humanities graduates, this may explain the inequality of labour market outcomes and experiences. We must be also cognisant of the fact that table 5.19 showed that there were more science and commerce graduates who achieved a further qualification than humanities graduates.

This means that the majority of graduates in the science and commerce field were able to harness their skills by expanding their knowledge in their fields of study (becoming specialists), which are the skills demanded by the economy (i.e. accounting, finance, economics, management, pharmacy, geology, information systems, statistics, zoology and botany). In the humanities, only the law degree was in high demand. Again, this does not imply that humanities graduates do not obtain work, but this study is highlighting the inequality in labour market outcomes and the factors that influence these outcomes. Humanities degrees are very broad and general at undergraduate level, and even at honours level many are still broad. This may be contrasted with the science and commerce faculties which have vocational courses at honours level. This differentiation in skills obtained during university study will influence the type of jobs the graduates will secure.

This was validated when the Rhodes graduates were asked whether their jobs were appropriate and related to their qualifications. The majority of the Rhodes graduates indicated that their jobs were appropriate (78.64 per cent) and related (75.88 per cent) to their qualifications (see table 6.73 and table 6.79). However, the findings varied when we compared them by fields of study, race and sex. The findings in table 6.74 showed that commerce graduates (83.87 per cent) constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who thought that their work was appropriate for their level of education. When graduates were compared according to race, the result from table 6.75 found that it was Black graduates (79.12 per cent) who constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who thought that their work was appropriate for their level of education, compared to White graduates (78.31 per cent). This finding also indicates another example of the discontinuity of pre-labour market disadvantage in some of the labour market outcomes of Black graduates.

However, the findings from table 6.76 indicate that the highest percentage of the Black graduates in this category was from the commerce faculty (90.48 per cent), thereby indicating the strong influence of demand-side factors in explaining the differentiated experiences of graduates in the labour market. When comparing the sexes in table 6.77, it was found that male graduates (81.67 per cent), constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who thought that their work was appropriate for their level of education as compared to female graduates (76.34 per cent). The highest percentage of these male graduates (87.10 per cent) was also from the commerce faculty (see table 6.78). From these results we can see the trend that, (beyond the sex and racial variations), commerce graduates are more likely to find work that is appropriate for their level of education. Similar results were found when we compared Rhodes graduates according to field of study, race and sex to determine whether their work was related to their qualifications. Commerce graduates constituted the higher percentage (79.03 per cent) of the Rhodes graduates who thought their work was related to their qualifications (see table 6.80). Figures from table 6.81 indicated that White graduates (77.37 per cent) constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who thought their work was related to their qualifications, compared to Black graduates (74.73 per cent). Interestingly, the majority of the White graduates (82.50 per cent) who thought their work was related to their qualifications were from the humanities faculty (see table 6.82). Even though skills have become a more important determiner of labour market success in South Africa, this particular finding shows that Whites still have an advantage in various aspects of in the labour market.

Comparing sex in table 6.83 indicated that male graduates (76.86 per cent) constituted the highest percentage of the Rhodes graduates who thought their work was related to their qualifications, compared to female graduates (75.40 per cent). The highest percentage of these male graduates (83.87 per cent) was from the commerce faculty (see table 6.84). These findings are showing a common thread of favour towards graduates from the commerce faculty. This evident pattern of skills bias is a validation of the claims made by the third generation LMS theorists, who proposed that there are hierarchies even within the primary sector of the labour market. Reich et al (1973) argued that the existence of hierarchies in the primary sector means that the more routine jobs constitute a sub-ordinate primary sector, while those requiring a greater degree of discretion and initiative are assigned to an independent primary sector. This is a result of the demand-side processes that segment the labour market outcomes of individuals, even the 'skilled' (see Borat

and Hodge, 1999). The findings from this study reflect this skills-based differentiation, as it showed that graduates from the commerce and science faculties experience better labour market outcomes than graduates from the humanities faculty.

#### **7.4.8 Levels of Job Satisfaction**

The dualist models (see Doeringer and Piore, 1971) represent an important shift in labour market theory. Firstly, they focused on the characteristics of jobs rather than those of workers and secondly, they try to provide a deeper understanding of institutional processes in the labour market. The dualist model focuses on jobs as opposed to workers, because job structures are qualitatively different. The quality of jobs in the primary sector is not as uniform as assumed by orthodox theories (see Sorensen and Kalleberg, 1981). This claim by the dualist model is validated through the findings of this study, which showed clear differences in the satisfaction levels of Rhodes graduates with various aspects of their employment. These variations in job satisfaction levels (of graduates with their employment) reveal the underlying reality of the inequality in experiences of Rhodes graduates (2010 cohort) in the labour market. The findings from this study show that demand-side factors have a substantial influence in segmenting the outcomes of Rhodes graduates in the labour market.

The third generation LMS theorists state that the mechanisms of job creation are independent of the quality of the work force as measured in terms of education and skills. The dualist model does not discount that job allocation is responsive to some human capital considerations. Instead, the second generation LMS theorists emphasise that there are different selection criteria that exist in the labour market. Access to primary sector jobs is determined by employer discrimination amongst a myriad of other factors. This ties in with the proposition made by McQuaid and Lindsay (2005) that graduate employability is a highly interactive concept that takes into account both individual and external forces. However, the experiences of graduates, once they are employed, show a more complex segmentation process which is beyond the simplified explanation given by the human capital theory.

The findings from this study show variations in the experiences of graduates as a result of the skills bias. This will be shown below that commerce and science graduates experience higher level of satisfaction with their employment than humanities graduates. This was evident even when we compared graduates by race and sex, where it was mostly science and commerce graduates who were more satisfied with their employment than humanities graduates. However, we should not discount racial and gender biases to pure skills biases. The fact that White graduates were generally more satisfied with their employment than Blacks should take into consideration the entrenched legacies of pre-labour market discrimination on the basis of race. The same goes for sex, as it was the male graduates who were more satisfied with their employment than female graduates.

The last part of this study focused on satisfaction levels of the Rhodes graduates with the various aspects of their work. This section really gives us an insight into the actual experiences of the graduates in the labour market. The findings showed some variations in the satisfaction levels of graduates on the bases of field of study, race and sex. The first aspect analysed was the nature of their work. The results in table 6.86 showed that commerce graduates (93.44 per cent) were most satisfied with the nature of their work, followed by science graduates (90.22 per cent). Humanities graduates (84.29 per cent) were the least satisfied with this aspect of their work. When graduates were compared according to race in table 6.87 the figures showed that White graduates (91.53 per cent) were more satisfied with the nature of their work than Black graduates (82.22 per cent). However, the highest percentage of these White graduates was from the science faculty (92.31 per cent) (see table 6.88). When Comparing graduates according to sex in table 6.89, the results showed that male graduates (91.67 per cent) were more satisfied with the nature of their work than female graduates (86.41 per cent). Interestingly, upon closer examination, we found that the majority of these male graduates were from the science faculty (97.87 per cent) (see table 6.90).

The second aspect of work analysed was the working conditions. The results in table 6.92 revealed that commerce graduates (95.16 per cent) were the most satisfied with their working conditions, followed by science graduates (88.06 per cent). The results also showed that humanities graduates (78.57 per cent) were the least satisfied with their working conditions. When comparing race in table 6.93, we found that White graduates (90 per cent) were more satisfied with this aspect than Black graduates (77.78 per cent). However, the highest percentage of these White graduates were

from the commerce faculty (93.94 per cent)(see table 6.94). Comparing graduates according to sex in table 6.95, we found that male graduates (90 per cent) were more satisfied with their working conditions than female graduates (83.24 per cent). Upon closer examination, we found that the majority of these male graduates were from the commerce faculty (93.55 per cent) (see table 6.96).

The third aspect of work analysed was job security. The results in table 6.98 indicated that commerce graduates (90 per cent) were the most satisfied with job security, followed by humanities graduates (77.86 per cent). Science graduates (76.92 per cent) were the least satisfied with being secure in their employment. When comparing race in table 6.99 we found that White graduates (81.91 per cent) were more satisfied with job security than Black graduates (76.67 per cent). However, the highest percentage of White graduates came from the commerce faculty (90.32 per cent) (see table 7.1). Comparing graduates according to sex in table 7.2, we found that male graduates (87.39 per cent) were more satisfied with their working conditions than female graduates (74.32 per cent). Upon closer inspection, we found that the majority of these male graduates were from the commerce faculty (90 per cent) (see table 7.3).

The fourth aspect of work analysed was the opportunity to use knowledge and skills. The findings from table 7.5 showed that commerce graduates (81.97per cent) were the most satisfied with the opportunity to use knowledge and skills, followed by science graduates (78.26 per cent). Humanities graduates (77.14 per cent) were the least satisfied with this aspect of their work. When comparing race in table 7.6, we found that Black graduates (81.11 per cent) were more satisfied with the opportunity to use knowledge and skills than White graduates (76.72 per cent). However, the highest percentage of these Black graduates were from the commerce faculty (94.74 per cent) (see table 7.7). When graduates were compared according to sex in table 7.8, we found that male graduates (78.33 per cent) were more satisfied with the opportunity to use knowledge and skills than female graduates (78.26 per cent). Upon closer examination, we found that most of these male graduates were from the science faculty (87.23 per cent) (see table 7.9).

The fifth aspect of work analysed was income. The results in table 7.11 indicated that commerce graduates (63.93 per cent) were the most satisfied with their income, followed by science graduates (57.61 per cent). Humanities graduates (48.57 per cent) were the least satisfied with this aspect of

their work. Comparing graduates according to race in table 7.12, we found that White graduates (60.32 per cent) were more satisfied with their income than Black graduates (47.67 per cent). However, the highest percentage of these White graduates was from the science faculty (60 per cent) (see table 7.13). When graduates were compared according to sex in table 7.14, we found that male graduates (60 per cent) were more satisfied with their income than female graduates (52.17 per cent). Upon closer inspection, we found that the majority of these male graduates were from the science faculty (65.96 per cent) (see table 7.15).

The final aspect of work analysed was the opportunity to learn. The results in table 7.17 showed that commerce graduates (91.80 per cent) were the most satisfied with the opportunity to learn, followed by science graduates (88.04 per cent). Humanities graduates (83.69 per cent) were the least satisfied with the opportunity to learn. When graduates were compared according to race in table 7.18, we found that White graduates (90.48 per cent) were more satisfied with this aspect of work than Black graduates (81.32 per cent). However, the highest percentage of these White graduates was from the commerce faculty (96.88 per cent) (see table 7.19). Comparing graduates according to sex in table 7.20, we found that male graduates (90 per cent) were more satisfied with the opportunity to learn than female graduates (84.86 per cent). Interestingly, upon closer examination, we found that the majority of these male graduates were from the science faculty (93.62 per cent) (see table 7.21).

Generally, the findings in this study of Rhodes graduates leads to the conclusion that there is a clear preference among employers for commerce and science graduates to the detriment of humanities graduates. Even when we compared the same findings according to race and sex, this skills bias was clear. However, as the dualist model stated, we should not reduce these findings only to skills and discount racial and sex divisions in the labour market outcomes of Rhodes graduates. These variations can also be an indication of some continuities in pre-labour market discrimination.

## 7.5 CONCLUSION

This study's goal was to show that the outcomes and experiences of Rhodes University graduates (2010 cohort) in the South African labour market are bound to vary on account of their chosen fields of study, race and sex. This proposition was supported by the theoretical framework of the heterodox labour market approach, which was informed by a critical realist account of the labour market. This allowed for the use of LMS theory as a tool to inform the analysis. This theoretical framework was bolstered by relevant literature on and findings from recent graduate tracer studies conducted in South Africa and abroad. The findings from this study showed that the labour market outcomes of Rhodes University graduates (2010 cohort) varied in terms of their chosen fields of study, race and sex. The findings from this study also showed evidence of pre-labour market discrimination according to race and sex (inequalities in the supply side processes and institutions such as the family, schooling and university). Interestingly, the study highlighted continuities as well as discontinuities of labour market discrimination in the outcomes and experiences of Rhodes graduates in the South African labour market.

From the third generation LMS theorists' perspective we can see that these discontinuities are a direct result of the interaction of state and demand-side factors. The state in the new democratic South Africa has established new legislation and policies which have made the upward mobility of previously disadvantaged groups possible. Together with the state, the discontinuities of labour market discrimination were also a result of the stronger influence of the demand side factors, where skill explained the racial and sexual variations. However, these variations (race and sex) in the labour market outcomes of Rhodes graduates cannot be entirely attributed to skills. These variations in the labour market outcomes of Rhodes graduates are still fundamentally a reflection of the legacy of inequalities in supply-side processes and the persistence of more subtle forms of discrimination.

This study showed that the outcomes and experiences of Rhodes graduates in the labour market varied on account of (among other factors) their chosen fields of study, race and sex. The demand side factors exerted a stronger influence as we saw the persistence of skill bias even when we controlled for race and sex. This is reflected in the fact that commerce and science graduates had better labour market outcomes and experiences than humanities graduates. However, the findings in this study are not a validation of the human capital theory, which attributes labour market

success solely on the human capital of graduates. In fact this study actually shows that skills (as important a determiner of labour market outcomes as they are) are only one of many factors which co-determine the labour market outcomes of graduates in the labour market. An example of this was when the Rhodes graduates were asked to list the factors that they thought influenced them in securing their employment. The majority of the Rhodes graduates listed (besides qualifications) language proficiency, references and personal contacts as the main factors which influenced this process (see tables 6.51; 6.55; 6.59 and 6.63). Therefore on a broader scale, this study has proven the human capital theory wrong, as it has shown that race and sex (among other factors) have also strongly influenced the differentiated outcomes and experiences of Rhodes University graduates in the labour market. These segmented outcomes and experiences of Rhodes graduates are the result of the interaction between the state and supply- and demand-side processes in the labour market.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Agra, D. (2013), "Globalization and developing employability skills: challenges and their solutions with reference to NPSD and government's action plan and role of lifelong learning and extension departments". *Journal of Business Management and Social Sciences Research*, 2 (5): 1-4.
- Aigner, D. J. and Cain, G. G. (1977). Statistical theories of discrimination in labour markets. *Industrial and Labour Relations Review*, 175-187.
- Alkire, S. (2002). Dimensions of human development. *World Development*, 30 (2): 181-205.
- Allan, K. (2014). *Poor quality education trapping children in poverty*. Available at: <http://www.savethechildren.org.za/article/poor-quality-education-trapping-children-poverty>
- Altbeker, A. and Storme, E. (2013). *Graduate unemployment in South Africa - a much exaggerated problem*. Johannesburg: The Centre for Development and Enterprise (CDE).
- Alvesson, M. and Sköldbberg, K. (2009). *Reflexive methodology: New vistas for qualitative research*. London: Sage.
- Andrews, J. and Higson, H. (2008). Graduate employability, 'soft skills' versus 'hard' business knowledge: a European study. *Higher Education in Europe*, 33(4): 411-422.
- Anglo Info. (2014). *Types of employment contracts*. Available at: <http://southafrica.angloinfo.com/working/employment/employment-contracts>.
- Anker, R. (1997). Theories of occupational segregation by sex: An overview. *International Labour Review*, 136 (3): 136, 315-339.
- Archer, M. S. Collier, A. and Porpora, D. V. (2013). *Transcendence: Critical Realism and God*. London: Routledge.
- Arora, V. and Ricci, L. A. (2005). 'Unemployment and the labour market', in Nowak, M. and Ricci, L. A. (ed), *Post-apartheid South Africa: The first ten years*. International Monetary Fund.
- Arrow, K. (1973). Higher Education as a Filter. *Journal of Public Economics*, 2 (3): 193-216.
- Ashton, D. and Green, F. (1996), *Education, Training and the Global Economy*, Edward Elgar, Cheltenham.

Azmat, G. and Petrongolo, B. (2014). *Gender and the Labour Market: What Have We Learned from Field and Lab Experiments?*

Available at: [http://personal.lse.ac.uk/petrongolo/Azmat\\_Petrongolo\\_April2014.pdf](http://personal.lse.ac.uk/petrongolo/Azmat_Petrongolo_April2014.pdf).

Badat, S. (2012). *Toward becoming a postgraduate and Research-intensive university*. Available at: <http://www.ru.ac.za/vice-chancellor/latestnews/name.62264.en.html>.

Badat, S. (1999). *Black Student Politics: Higher Education and Apartheid from SASO to SANSCO 1968-1990*. Pretoria: Human Sciences Research Council.

Badat, S. (1998). *Higher Education: The Historically Disadvantaged Institutions. Briefing Paper*. EPU UWC/0053.

Ball, S.J. (2010). New class inequalities in education: why education policy may be looking in the wrong place! Education policy, civil society and social class. *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*, 30(3/4): 155–166.

Banerjee, A. Galiani, S. Levinsohn, J. McLaren, Z, and Woolard, I. (2008). Why has unemployment risen in the new South Africa?. *Economics of Transition*. 16 (4): 715-740.

Barker, F. (2003). *The South African Labour Market*. Pretoria. Van Schaik Publishers.

Bass, B. M. and Avolio, B. J. (1994). Shatter the glass ceiling: Women may make better managers. *Human resource management*, 33(4): 549-560.

Bauder, H. (2001). Culture in the labour market: segmentation theory and perspectives of place. *Progress in human geography*, 25(1): 37–52.

Becker, G. S. (1962). Investment in human capital: A theoretical analysis. *The Journal of Political Economy*, 70 (5): 9-49.

Beinart, W. (2001). *Twentieth-Century South Africa*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Berlinski, S. and Manacorda, M. (2011). *Economics of labour*. London: University of London.

Bendick, M. Brown, L. E. and Wall, K. (1999). No foot in the door: An experimental study of employment discrimination against older workers. *Journal of Aging & Social Policy*, 10(4): 5-23.

Berman, J. (2011). *Rich More Often Use Family Connections To Get Jobs: Study*. Available at: [http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2011/11/16/family-connections-rich-kids-jobs\\_n\\_1097813.html](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2011/11/16/family-connections-rich-kids-jobs_n_1097813.html).

Bhaskar, R. (1978). *A Realist Theory of Science*. Hassocks, U.K: Harvester Press.

Bhorat, H. and Goga, S. (2013). *Occupational Shifts and Shortages: Skills Challenges Facing the South African Economy*. Pretoria: Labour Market Intelligence Partnership. Also available at: [http://www.lmip.org.za/sites/default/files/events/LMIP\\_per\\_cent20Report\\_per\\_cent201\\_per\\_cent20Occupational\\_per\\_cent20Shifts.pdf](http://www.lmip.org.za/sites/default/files/events/LMIP_per_cent20Report_per_cent201_per_cent20Occupational_per_cent20Shifts.pdf).

Bhorat, H. Mayet, N. and Visser, M. (2012). *Student graduation, labour market destinations and employment earnings* (p. 97). Development Policy Research Unit, University of Cape Town.

Bhorat, H. Goga, S. Ncube, L. Pauw, K and Van der Westhuizen, C. (2006). Graduate unemployment in the context of skills shortages, education and training: Findings from a firm survey. *Development Policy Research Unit Working Paper*, 6, 115.

Bhorat, H. and Oosthuizen, M. (2004). *The post-apartheid South African labour market*. Development Policy Research Unit, University of Cape Town.

Bhorat, H. (2001). *Fighting poverty: Labour markets and inequality in South Africa*. Cape Town: UCT Press.

Bhorat, H. and Hodge, J. (1999). Decomposing shifts in labour demand in South Africa. *South African Journal of Economics*, 67(3): 155-168.

Bhorat, H. Hodge, J. and Dieden, S. (1998). The Impact of Structural and Production Method Change on Employment Growth of Occupational Groups in South Africa. *The Trade and Industry Monitor*, 6(2): 1-54.

Bornheimer, K. (2010). *Employers want “excellent verbal and written communication skills”; they mean it!* Available at: <http://www.localjobnetwork.com/a/t-employers-want-excellent-verbal-and-written-communication-skills-they-mean-it-au-bornheimer,-kathy-articles-a4521.html>.

Bowles, S. and Gintis, H. (1975). The problem with human capital theory – a Marxian critique. *American Economic Review*, 65(2): 74-82.

Braddock, J. H. and McPartland, J. M. (1987). How minorities continue to be excluded from equal employment opportunities: Research on labor market and institutional barriers. *Journal of Social Issues*, 43(1): 5-39.

Branson, N. and Leibbrandt, M. (2013b). *Educational attainment and labour market outcomes in South Africa*. (OECD Economics Department Working Paper No. 1022).

Branson, N., Garlick, J., Lam, D. and Leibbrandt, M. (2012) *Education and inequality: the South African case* (Southern Africa Labour and Development Research Unit (SALDRU) Working Paper No. 75). Cape Town: SALDRU.

Branson, N., Leibbrandt, M. and Zuze, T. (2009a) Chapter 3: What are the returns of tertiary education and who benefits? in: N. Cloete (ed), *Responding to the Educational Needs of Post-*

*School Youth: Determining the Scope of the Problem and Developing a Capacity-Building Model* (Cape Town: Centre for Higher Education Transformation (CHET)), pp. 45-60.

Branson, N., Leibbrandt, M. and Zuze, T. (2009c). *The demand for tertiary education in South Africa. Research report, Southern Africa Labour and Development Research Unit* (Research report, Southern Africa Labour and Development Research Unit). University of Cape Town.

Brewer, R. M. (1999). Theorizing race, class and sex: The new scholarship of Black feminist intellectuals and Black women's labour. *Race, Sex and Class*, 6 (2):29-47.

Brinkley, I. (2006). *Defining the knowledge economy*. London: The work foundation.

Brown, P. and Hesketh, A. (2004). *The mismanagement of talent: Employability and jobs in the knowledge economy*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Brown, P. Hesketh, A. and Williams, S. (2003). Employability in a knowledge-driven economy. *Journal of education and work*, 16(2): 107-126.

Budig, M.J. (2002). "Male advantage and the sex composition of jobs: who rides the glass escalator?" *Social Problems* 49(2): 258-77.

Bunting, I. (2006). The higher education landscape under apartheid. *In Transformation in Higher Education* (pp. 35-52). Springer Netherlands.

Bunting, Ian. (1994). *A Legacy of Inequality: Higher Education in South Africa*. Rondebosch: UCT Press.

Burger, R., and Jafta, R. (2006). Returns to race: Labour market discrimination in post-apartheid South Africa. *Department of Economics, Stellenbosch University, Working Papers*, 4, 2006.

Businesstech, (2014). *South Africa's critical skills shortage*. Available at: <http://businesstech.co.za/news/general/52918/south-africas-critical-skills-shortage/>.

Cain, G. (1976). The challenge of segmented labour market theories to orthodox theory: a survey. *Journal of Economic Literature*. 14(4): 1215-1257.

Campbell, D. (2012), *Is a university degree still key to finding a good job?* Accessed in September 2014 from: <http://www.theglobeandmail.com/report-on-business/economy/economy-lab/is-a-university-degree-still-key-to-finding-a-good-job/article620622/>.

Cape Higher Education Consortium (CHEC) (2013). *Pathways from university to work: a graduate destination survey of the 2010 cohort of graduates from the Western Cape Universities* (A Cape Higher Education Consortium (CHEC) Study). Cape Town: Cape Higher Education Consortium.

Cappellari, L. (2004). *High school types, academic performance and early labour market outcomes* (No. 1048). IZA Discussion paper series.

Cassim, F. (1982). *Labour Market Segmentation in South Africa*. African Studies Seminar Paper. African Studies Institute. University of the Witwatersrand.

CEC (COMMISSION OF THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES)(1999). *The European Employment Strategy: Investing in People; Investing in More and Better Jobs*. Luxembourg: Office for Official.

Chambers, T. (2010). *The value of a Rhodes University degree and securing employment*. Masters in Business Administration dissertation, Rhodes Investec Business School, Rhodes University.

Cho, E. and McLean, G. N. (2004). What we discovered about NHRD and what it means for HRD. *Advances in Developing Human Resources*, 6(3), pp. 382 – 93.

City of Johannesburg. (2014). *Economic hub*, Available at: [http://joburg.org.za/index.php?option=com\\_content&view=article&id=5612:economic-hub&catid=30&Itemid=58](http://joburg.org.za/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=5612:economic-hub&catid=30&Itemid=58).

City Press. (2011). *Young, jobless and desperate – Degrees with no guarantees*. Accessed August of 2013 from: <http://www.citypress.co.za/news/young-jobless-and-desperate-degrees-with-no-guarantees-20120616/>

Cloete, N. (2009), Chapter 1: Synthesis. in: N. Cloete (ed), *Responding to the Educational Needs of Post-School Youth: Determining the Scope of the Problem and Developing a Capacity-Building Model* (Cape Town: Centre for Higher Education Transformation (CHET), pp. 1-18.

Coates, D. and Warwick, K. (1999). The knowledge driven economy: analysis and background. In *Economics of the Knowledge Driven Economy” conference, organized by DTI & CERP, London 27th January*.

Cock, J. (1980). *Maids and madams: A study in the politics of exploitation*. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Cooper, D., and Subotzky, G. (2001). *The skewed revolution: Trends in South African higher education, 1988-1998*. Education Policy Unit, University of the Western Cape.

Council on Higher Education (CHE) (2004). *South African Higher Education in the First Decade of Democracy*. Pretoria: The Council on Higher Education.

Council on Higher Education (CHE) (1999). *South African higher education at the beginning of the new millennium: realities, problems and challenges*. Discussion paper. Kopanong Protea Hotel, Benoni. Council on Higher Education consultative conference.

Cosser, M. and Letseka, M. (2010). Introduction. in: M. Letseka, M. Cosser, M. Breier and M. Visser (eds), *Student Retention & Graduate Destination: Higher Education & Labour Market Access & Success* (Cape Town: HSRC Press), pp. 1-10.

Cosser, M. (2003). Graduate tracer study. *Technical college responsiveness: Learner destinations and labour market environments in South Africa*, HSRC Press, Cape Town.

Cotter, D. A. Hermesen, J.M. Ovadia, S. and Vanneman, R. (2001). The Glass Ceiling Effect. *Social Forces* 80(2):655–82.

Crankshaw, O. (2002). *Race, class and the changing division of labour under apartheid*. Routledge.

Creswell, J.W. (2002). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative and mixed methods approaches*. New York. Sage Publications.

Cross, M. and Carpentier, C. (2009). ‘New students’ in South African higher education: Institutional culture, student performance and the challenge of democratisation. *Perspectives in Education*. 27(1). 6-18.

Danermark, B. (Ed.). (2002). *Explaining society: Critical realism in the social sciences*. Psychology Press.

Daniels, R.C. (2007). *Skill Shortages in South Africa: A Literature Review*. DPRU Working Paper 07/121. University of Cape Town.

De Brunhoff, S. (1978). *The state, capital and economic policy*. University of Michigan. Pluto Press.

Department of Economic Development and Environmental Affairs (DEDEA) (2011). *The Eastern Cape socio-economic review and outlook*, Available at: [http://www.dedea.gov.za/Newsletters per cent20and per cent20Publications/EC per cent20Socio per cent20Economic per cent20Review per cent20and per cent20Outlook per cent202011.pdf](http://www.dedea.gov.za/Newsletters_per cent20and per cent20Publications/EC per cent20Socio per cent20Economic per cent20Review per cent20and per cent20Outlook per cent202011.pdf).

Department of Higher Education and Training (DHET). (2010). *National Skills Development Strategy 3*. Johannesburg: Department of Higher Education and Training (DHET).

Department of Higher Education and Training (DHET). (2001). *Draft national plan for higher education in South Africa*. Department of Higher Education and Training (DHET). Johannesburg.

Department of Labour (DoL, 2014). *14th commission for employment equity annual report*, Pretoria: Department of Labour.

Development Policy Research Unit (DPRU). (2006). *Graduate unemployment in post-apartheid South Africa: nature and possible policy responses*. Rondebosch. School of Economics, University of Cape Town.

Department of Education (DoE)(2010). Human Resource Development Strategy for South Africa (HRD-SA) 2010 – 2030. Available at: [file:///C:/Users/g09n2516/Downloads/DoE\\_HRDS-SA\\_22022010\\_per cent20\(1\).pdf](file:///C:/Users/g09n2516/Downloads/DoE_HRDS-SA_22022010_per%20cent20(1).pdf).

Doeringer, P. B. and Piore, M. J. (1985). *Internal labour markets and manpower analysis*. ME Sharpe.

Downing, D. (1946). *Apartheid in South Africa*. Oxford: Heinemann Library.

Duderstadt, J. J. and Colloquium, G. V. (2005), University-Industry-Government Partnerships for a 21st century global, knowledge-driven economy: An American perspective. In *Report for a Glion V Colloquium, Glion, Switzerland*.

Duderstadt, J. (2000). *A University for the 21st Century*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.

Dunne, J P and Edwards L (2006). *Trade, Technology and Employment: A Case Study of South Africa*. Discussion Paper 0602, School of Economics, University of the West of England.

Duderstadt, J. J. and Colloquium, G. V. (2005), University-Industry-Government Partnerships for a 21st century global, knowledge-driven economy: An American perspective. In *Report for a Glion V Colloquium, Glion, Switzerland*.

Dunne, P. and Edwards, L. (2006). Trade, technology and employment: A case study of South Africa. In *Centre for the Study of African Economics, University of Oxford, Conference on “Reducing Poverty and Inequality: How can Africa be included* (pp. 19-21).

Du Toit, R. and Roodt, J. (2008). Engineers, technologists and technicians. in: A. Kraak and K. Press (eds), *Human Resources Development Review 2008* (Cape Town: HSRC Press), pp. 452-475.

Eccles, J. and Roeser, R. (2009). Schools, academic motivation, and stage-environment fit. In R. Lerner, and L. Steinberg, *Handbook of Adolescent Psychology Third Edition* (Vol. 1, pp. 404-434). Hoboken, New Jersey: John Wiley and Sons, Inc.

Eccles, J. S. (2005). Influences of parents’ education on their children’s educational attainments: The role of parent and child perceptions. *London Review of Education*, 3(3): 191-204.

- Edwards, L. (2001). Globalisation and the skill bias of occupational employment in South Africa. *South African Journal of Economics*, 69 (1): 40-71.
- Edwards, R. C. Gordon, D. M. and Reich, M. (1973). *Labour Market Segmentation*. A Research Report to the U. S. Department of Labour.
- Ehrbar, H. G. (1998). Marxism and critical realism. *Presentation for the Heterodox Economics Students Association*, 25.
- Ehrenberg, R. and Smith, R. (1994). *Modern labour economics*. New York: Harper-Collins.
- Elliott, J. (2005). Merging right: questions of access and merit in South African higher education reform. 1994-2002. *Perspectives in Education*, 23(1): 69-76.
- Fevre, R. (2003). *The Sociology of labour markets*. Cardiff University.
- Fine, B. (1998). *Labour Market Theory: A Constructive Reassessment*. Routledge.
- Fisher, G. and Scott, I. (2011). *The role of higher education in closing the skills gap in South Africa*. Cape Town. The World Bank, Human development group, Africa region.
- Fiske, E.B. and Ladd, H.F. (2004). *Elusive Equity: Education Reform in Post-Apartheid South Africa*. Washington, D.C: Brookings.
- Fleetwood, S. (2008). *A Trans-disciplinary (Proto) Model of Labour Markets*. Bristol: Centre for Employment Studies Research. Working paper 12. University of the West of England
- Fleetwood, S. (2006), Re-thinking labour markets: A critical realist socio-economic perspective. *Capital and Class*, 30 (2): 59-89.
- Galster, G. C. and Killen, S. P. (1995). The geography of metropolitan opportunity: a reconnaissance and conceptual framework. *Housing Policy Debate*, 6(1), 7-43.
- Garavan, T.N. and McGuire, D. (2010). HRD and Society: HRD's Role in Embedding Sustainability, CSR and Ethics in Organisations. *Advances in Developing Human Resources*, Vol. 12, No. 6, p. 487-507.
- Gazier, B. (1998). Employability - definitions and trends, in: Gazier (Ed.) *Employability: Concepts and Policies*, pp. 37–71. Berlin: European Employment Observatory.
- Gibson, D. (2015). *Education: Can we really carry on in this way?* Available at: <http://www.politicsweb.co.za/politicsweb/view/politicsweb/en/page71639?oid=904251&sn=Detail&pid=71616>.

Goodman, J. M. Hurwitz, and J. Smith (2014). “*The Relationship Between Siblings’ College Choices: Evidence from One Million SAT-Taking Families*,” Harvard Kennedy School Working Paper 14-043. Available at: <http://www.luminafoundation.org/files/resources/the-relationship-between-siblings-college-choices.pdf>.

Gordon, D. A. (2013). *Employability and social class in the graduate labour market*. (Doctoral dissertation, Cardiff University).

Graduation gateway. (2013). *Rhodes tops graduation rates*. Available at: <http://www.ru.ac.za/graduationgateway/graduationnews/articles/name,81402,en.html>.

Granovetter, M. (1985). Economic action and social structure: the problem of embeddedness. *American journal of sociology*, 91 (3): 481-510.

Granovetter, M. (1995). *Getting a job: A study of contacts and careers*. University of Chicago Press.

Grant, D. (2013). *Background to the national quintile system*. Available at: [http://wced.pgwc.gov.za/comms/press/2013/74\\_14oct.html](http://wced.pgwc.gov.za/comms/press/2013/74_14oct.html).

Griesel, H. and Parker, B. (2009). *Attributes: a baseline study on South African graduates from the perspective of employers*. Johannesburg: Higher Education South Africa (HESA) and the South African Qualifications Authority (SAQA).

Grun, C. (2004). Direct and Indirect Gender Discrimination in the South African Labour Market. *International Journal of Manpower*, 25 (3): 321-342.

Hagner, D. (2000). Primary and secondary labour markets implications for vocational Rehabilitation. *Rehabilitation Counselling Bulletin*, 44(1), 22-29.

Hartmann, H. (1976). Capitalism, patriarchy, and job segregation by sex. *Signs*. 1(3): 137-169.

Hauser, R. M. and Wong, R. S. K. (1989). Sibling resemblance and inter-sibling effects in educational attainment. *Sociology of Education*, 62 (3):149-171.

Higher Education South Africa (HESA). (2009). *Insight – Higher Education South Africa*. Pretoria: Higher Education South Africa.

Higher Education South Africa. (2014). *South African Higher Education in the 20th Year of Democracy: Context, Achievements and Key Challenges*, Available at: [http://www.hesa.org.za/sites/hesa.org.za/files/HESA\\_Portfolio\\_per\\_cent20Committee\\_per\\_cent20Presentation\\_5\\_per\\_cent20March\\_per\\_cent202014\\_Final.pdf](http://www.hesa.org.za/sites/hesa.org.za/files/HESA_Portfolio_per_cent20Committee_per_cent20Presentation_5_per_cent20March_per_cent202014_Final.pdf).

Hillage, J. and Pollard, E. (1998). *Employability: developing a framework for policy analysis*. London: Department for Education and Employment.

Hinks, T. (2002). "Gender wage differentials and discrimination in the new South Africa", *Applied Economics*, 34 (16): 2043-52.

International Labour Organisation (ILO). (2004). *Breaking through the glass ceiling: women in management*. Available at: <http://www.ilo.org/dyn/sex/docs/RES/292/f267981337>.

International Labour Organisation (ILO), (1996), *Human Resource Development in Asia and the Pacific in the 21st century issues and challenges for employers and their organisations*. Paper presented at the ILO Workshop on Employers' Organizations in Asia-Pacific in the Twenty-First Century. Turin, Italy, 5-13 May 1997.

Jansen, J. (2012). *Matric razmatazz conceals sad reality*.

Available at: <http://www.iol.co.za/news/south-africa/western-cape/matric-razmatazz-conceals-sad-reality-1.1209349#.VKeqyU1O7Gg>.

Jeffries, B. (2011). *Critical Realism – an empirical realist critique*. Manchester Metropolitan University Business School Working Paper 11-01. Manchester.

Jenvey, N. (2012). *Graduate unemployment in a skills-short economy bedevils growth*. Available at: <http://www.universityworldnews.com/article.php?story=20121122140019904>.

Jobs.ac.uk. (2014). *Why you should study at postgraduate level*. Available at: <http://www.jobs.ac.uk/careers-advice/studentships/1291/why-you-should-study-at-postgraduate-level>.

Juta Law. (2012). *Employment services bill*. Available at:

[http://jutralaw.co.za/media/filestore/2012/11/b\\_38\\_-\\_2012\\_-\\_Employment\\_Services\\_Bill.pdf](http://jutralaw.co.za/media/filestore/2012/11/b_38_-_2012_-_Employment_Services_Bill.pdf).

Kalleberg, A. L. and Sorensen, A. B. (1979). The sociology of labor markets. *Annual review of sociology*, 5: 351-379.

Kerr, C. (1954). *Balkanization of labour markets*. University of California.

Kingdon, G. G. and Knight, J. (2004). Unemployment in South Africa: The nature of the beast. *World development*, 32(3): 391-408.

Kingdon, G. and Knight, J. (2002). *Quality of schooling and the race gap in South African unemployment*. Mimeographed, Centre for the Study of African Economies, Oxford.

Kraak, A. (2004a). *An overview of South African human resources development*. Cape Town: HSRC Press.

Kraak, A. (2004b). Training policies under late apartheid: the historical imprint of a low skills regime. In McGrath.S, Badroodien.A. Kraak.A and Unwin.L. (2004). *Shifting Understanding of skills in South Africa*. Cape Town. Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC) Press.

Kraak, A. (2003). HRD and the Skills Crisis. *Human Resources Development Review 2003: Education, Employment and Skills in South Africa*.

Krul, M. (2010). *A critique of 'Human Capital' theory*. Available at:

<http://mccaine.org/2010/10/11/a-critique-of-human-capital-theory/>.

Krueger, R.B. (1993). How Computers have Changed the Wage Structure: Evidence from Micro-Data, 1984-89, in: *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 108(1): 33-60.

Kruss, G. (2004). Employment and employability: Expectations of higher education responsiveness in South Africa. *Journal of Education Policy*, 19(6): 673-689.

Kuchinke, K. P. (2010). Human development as a central goal for human resource development. *Human Resource Development International*, 13(5), 575-585.

Kynaston, M. (2013). *Badat lays out the future for Rhodes*. Available at: <http://activateonline.co.za/badat-lays-out-the-future-for-rhodes/>.

Lang, K. and Dickens, W. T. (1988). The re-emergence of segmented labour market theory. *The American Economic Review*, 78 (2): 129-134.

Lang, K. and Lehmann, J. Y. K. (2011). Racial discrimination in the labour market: Theory and empirics. *Journal of Economic Literature, American Economic Association*, 50(4): 959-1006.

Lauritzen, F. (1996), "Technology, Education and Employment", in *Employment and Growth in the Knowledge-based Economy*, Proceedings of the Conference on "Employment and Growth in the Knowledge-based Economy", Copenhagen, November 1994.

Lawson, T. (2006). The nature of heterodox economics. *Cambridge journal of economics*, 30(4):483-505.

Lawson, T. (1997). *Economics and reality*. London: Routledge

Layder, D. (1990). *The Realist Image in Social Science*. New York: St. Martin's Press (pp. 1-189). New York: St. Martin's Press.

Lee, D. J. (Ed.). (2003). *Social differentiation: patterns and processes*. London: University of Toronto Press.

Leontaridi, M. (1998). Segmented labour markets: theory and evidence. *Journal of economic surveys*, 12(1): 103-109.

Letseka, M., Breier, M. and Visser, M. (2010), Poverty, race and student achievement in seven higher education institutions. in: M. Letseka, M. Cosser, M. Breier and M. Visser (eds), *Student Retention and Graduate Destination: Higher Education and Labour Market Access and Success*. Cape Town: HSRC Press), pp. 25-40.

Letseka, M., and Maile, S. (2008). *High university drop-out rates: A threat to South Africa's future*. Pretoria: Human Sciences Research Council.

Lewis, F. (2013), *Advantages of seeking employment while studying in colleges*, Accessed November 2014 from: <http://www.jobcluster.com/blog/advantages-of-seeking-employment-while-studying-in-colleges/>.

Lewis, S. G. and Naidoo, J. (2004). Whose theory of participation? School Governance policy and practice in South Africa. *Current Issues in Comparative Education*, 6(2): 100-112.

Lin, N. and Dumin, M. (1986). Access to occupations through social ties. *Social networks*, 8(4): 365-385.

Maglen, L. R. (1990). Challenging the Human Capital Orthodoxy: The Education-Productivity Link Re-examined. *Economic Record*, 66 (4): 281-294.

Maharasoia, M. and Hay, D. (2001). Higher education and graduate employment in South Africa. *Quality in Higher Education*, 7(2): 139-147.

Mariotti, M. (2012). Labour markets during apartheid in South Africa. *Economic History Review*, 65 (3): 1100–1122.

Masicorp. (2014). Higher Education Dropout Rates and the Masicorp Bursary Scheme. Available at: <https://masicorp.wordpress.com/tag/university-dropout-rate/>. McConnell, C.R. and Brue, S.L. (1989). *Contemporary labour economics*. New York: McGraw-Hill.

McGrath, S. (2009). What is employability. *Learning to support employability project paper*, 1.

McQuaid, R.W. and Lindsay, C. (2005). The concept of employability. *Urban studies*. 42(2): 197–219.

Mearman, A. (2007). Teaching heterodox economics concepts. *Handbook for Economics Lecturers*.

Metcalf, B. D. and Rees, C. J. (2005). Theorizing advances in international human resource development. *Human Resource Development International*, 8(4): 449-465.

Mlatsheni, C. and Rospabé, S. (2002). *Why is Youth Unemployment so High and unequally spread in South Africa?*. Development Policy Research Unit, University of Cape Town.

Miller, C.C. (2014). *Where young college graduates are choosing to live*. Available at: [http://www.nytimes.com/2014/10/20/upshot/where-young-college-graduates-are-choosing-to-live.html?\\_r=0&abt=0002&abg=0](http://www.nytimes.com/2014/10/20/upshot/where-young-college-graduates-are-choosing-to-live.html?_r=0&abt=0002&abg=0).

Mincer, J. (1996). Economic development, growth of human capital, and dynamics of the wage structure. *Journal of Economic Growth*, Vol. 1, No. 1, pp. 29-48.

Miti, S. (2013). *Eastern Cape mass exodus picks up pace*. Available at:

<http://www.dispatchlive.co.za/news/e-cape-mass-exodus-picks-up-pace/>.

Modisaotsile, B. M. (2012). The failing standard of basic education in South Africa. *Africa Institute of South Africa*, 72.

Moleke, P. (2005). *Finding Work: Employment Experiences of South African Graduates*. Cape Town: HSRC Press.

Monama, T. (2013). *University dropouts outnumber graduates*. Available at:

<http://www.timeslive.co.za/thetimes/2013/08/22/university-dropouts-outnumber-graduates>.

Montgomery, J.D. (1991). Social networks and labour market outcomes- toward an economic analysis. *American Economic Review*, 81(5). 1408-1418.

Moolman, E. (2003). An econometric analysis of labour demand at an industry level in South Africa. *Trade and Industrial Policy Strategies (TIPS)*.

Mora, J. Vila, L. E. and García-Aracil, A. (2005), European higher education graduates and job satisfaction, *European Journal of Education*, 40, pp. 35–44.

Morris. M. (1959). *Apartheid: an illustrated history*. Jeppesstown: Jonathan Ball.

Mouton, N. Louw, G. P. and Strydom, G. L. (2013). Present-day dilemmas and challenges of the South African tertiary system. *International Business and Economics Research Journal (IBER)*, 12(3): 285-300.

Mouton, J. Boshoff, N., James, M. and Treptow, R. (2010). *ASSAF tracer study of university graduates in the social sciences, humanities and arts*. Centre for Research on Science and Technology (CREST).

Msimang, S. (2000). Affirmative action in the New South Africa: The politics of representation, law and equity. *Women in Action*, (1-2): 38.

Mtshali. N. (2013). *Only 15 per cent of SA university students graduate*. Available at: <http://www.iol.co.za/lifestyle/family/kids/only-15-of-sa-university-students-graduate-1.1531809>.

Mugabushaka, A. Teichler, U. and Schomburg, H. (2003). Failed or self-hindering prophecies? Employment experiences of African graduates in the 1990s. *Journal of Higher Education in Africa*, 1(1): 57-77.

My Wage. (2014). *Fixed-term contract*. Available at: <http://www.mywage.co.za/main/decent-work/employment-security/fixed-term-contract>.

National Council for Higher Education (NCHE)(2006). *Graduate tracer and employers' expectations studies*. Kampala: National Council for Higher Education.

Nattrass, N. and Seekings, J. (2001). "Two Nations"? Race and Economic Inequality in South Africa Today. *Daedalus*, 130 (1): 45-70.

Neil Aggett Labour Studies Unit NALSU), (2014). *The Eastern Cape labour market at a glance: 2014 (1st quarter) Fact Sheet*, Available at:

[http://www.ru.ac.za/media/rhodesuniversity/content/iser/documents/2014\\_per\\_cent20\(1st\\_per\\_cent20Quarter\)\\_per\\_cent20Fact\\_per\\_cent20Sheet.pdf](http://www.ru.ac.za/media/rhodesuniversity/content/iser/documents/2014_per_cent20(1st_per_cent20Quarter)_per_cent20Fact_per_cent20Sheet.pdf).

Nkomo, M. (Ed.) (1990). *Pedagogy of domination towards a democratic education in South Africa*. Trenton, New Jersey Africa World Press.

Nkosi, B. (2014). *High fees keep students out of university*, Available at: <http://www.iol.co.za/news/south-africa/high-fees-keep-students-out-of-university-1.1647818#.VKZyHU1O7Gg>.

NSFAS, (2013). *Mission statement*. Available at:

[http://www.nsfas.org.za/NSFAS/ABOUT\\_US/MISSION\\_STATEMENT](http://www.nsfas.org.za/NSFAS/ABOUT_US/MISSION_STATEMENT).

Ntshoe, I. and De Villiers, P. (2008), Steering the South African Higher Education Sector towards transformation. *Perspectives in Education*, 26(4). 17-27.

Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) (2012). *Gender equality in education, employment and entrepreneurship: final report to the mcm 2012*. (Paris: OECD).

Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) (2000). *Knowledge Management in a Learning Society* (Paris: OECD).

Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) (1996a), *Employment and Growth in the Knowledge-based Economy*, Paris.

Oosthuizen, M. and Pranushka, N. (2004). *Internal migration to the Gauteng province*. Development Policy Research Unit, University of Cape Town.

Paton, C. (2013). *Race 'affects graduates' job chances'*. Available at:

<http://www.bdlive.co.za/national/labour/2013/08/30/race-affects-graduates-job-chances>.

Pauw, K. Oosthuizen, M. and van der Westhuizen, C. (2006). *Graduate unemployment in the face of skills shortages: a labour market paradox*. (Development Policy Research Unit DPRU Working Paper No. 06/114).

Peck, J. (1996). *Work-place: The social regulation of labour markets*. New York: Guilford Press.

Piore, M. J. (1993). The social embeddedness of labor markets and cognitive processes. *Labour*, 7(3): 3-18.

Piore, M.J. (1975). Notes for a theory of labour market stratification. In Edwards, R. et al, (eds.), *Labour Market Segmentation*. Lexington, Massachusetts: Health and Co.

Power, T. (2014). *Education and schools in South Africa*. Available at:

<http://www.expatarivals.com/south-africa/education-and-schools-in-south-africa>.

Questia. (2013). *Human Capital*. Available at: <http://www.questia.com/library/sociology-and-anthropology/labor-and-work/human-capital>.

Radebe, K. (2013). *The employment equity paradox*. Available at:

<http://www.moneyweb.co.za/moneyweb-empowerment/the-employment-equity-paradox>.

Ramdass, K. and Kruger, D. (2006). *The challenges facing education in South Africa*. Available at: <http://152.106.6.200/bitstream/handle/10210/5397/Kem.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y>.

Rasool, H. (2010). *Creating a National Skills Development Strategy (NSDS) that works- learning lessons from mistakes of NSDS 1 and 2*. Durban: Management College of Southern Africa (MANCOSA).

Reddy, T. (2004). *Higher Education and social transformation - South Africa Case Study*. Accessed in June 2013 at:

[http://www.che.ac.za/documents/d000066/HEandSocialTransformationReport\\_25Feb2004.pdf](http://www.che.ac.za/documents/d000066/HEandSocialTransformationReport_25Feb2004.pdf).

Reich, M. Gordon, D. M. and Edwards, R. C. (1973). A theory of labour market segmentation. *The American Economic Review*, 63 (2): 359-365.

Republic of South Africa. (1997). *Higher Education Act No. 101 of 1997*. Government Gazette No. 18515, Notice 1655, 19. Pretoria: Government Printers.

Rhodes University. (2013). Student enrolment planning: 2000 – 2013. Available at: <http://www.ru.ac.za/media/rhodesuniversity/content/institutionalplanning/documents/RhodesEnrolmentPla%202011-2013Tables%201-44%20-31Jan2011.pdf>.

Rhodes University. (2010). Assumptions/Notes regarding RU Enrolment Planning Tables 2006-2010. Available at:

<https://www.ru.ac.za/media/rhodesuniversity/content/institutionalplanning/documents/Enrolment%20plan%20notes%202006-2010.pdf>.

Riach, P. A. and Rich, J. (2006) An experimental investigation of age discrimination in the French labor market, *IZA Discussion Paper No. 2522*. Bonn: Institute for the Study of Labor.

Riach, P. A. and Rich, J. (2007a). An experimental investigation of age discrimination in the Spanish labor market. *IZA Discussion Paper No. 2654*, Bonn: Institute for the Study of Labor.

Riach, P. A. and Rich, J. (2007b). An experimental investigation of age discrimination in the English labor market. *IZA Discussion Paper No. 3029*. Bonn: Institute for the Study of Labor.

Rogan, M. (2013). *Proposed Eastern Cape study on transitions to the labour market by university graduates*, Neil Aggett Labour Studies Unit. Institute of Social and Economic Research. Rhodes University.

Rospabé, S. (2001). An empirical evaluation of gender discrimination in employment, occupation attainment and wage in South Africa in the late 1990s. In *DPRU/FES workshop on "Labour markets and poverty in South Africa"*, Johannesburg, November.

Saloner, G. (1985). The Old Boys' Network as a Screening Mechanism. *Journal of Labor Economics*, 3: 255-67.

Sayer, A. (2000), *Realism and social science*. London: Sage.

Sayer, A. (1992), *Method in social science: A realist approach*, (2nd ed.). London: Routledge.

Seccareccia, M. (1991). An alternative to labour-market orthodoxy: The post-Keynesian/institutionalist policy view. *Review of political economy*, 3(1): 43-61.

Schomburg, H. (2007). The professional success of higher education graduates. *European Journal of Education*, 42(1): 35-57.

Shangquan, G. (2000). Economic globalization: Trends, risks and risk prevention. *Economic and Social Affairs, CDP Background Paper, (1)*. Available at:

[http://www.un.org/en/development/desa/policy/cdp/cdp\\_background\\_papers/bp2000\\_1.pdf](http://www.un.org/en/development/desa/policy/cdp/cdp_background_papers/bp2000_1.pdf).

Shepherd, D. (2008). *Post-apartheid trends in sex discrimination in South Africa: Analysis through decomposition techniques*. Stellenbosch Economic Working Papers: 06/08.

Smith, D. (2013). *South Africa's universities 'racially skewed', claims watchdog*. Available at: <http://www.theguardian.com/global-development/2013/aug/22/south-africa-universities-racially-skewed>.

South African Civil Society Information Service (SACSIS). (2013). *Prof. Sampie Terreblanche: White South Africans Will Have to Make Some Sacrifices*. Available at:

<http://sacsis.org.za/site/article/1749>.

Sowetan Live. (2012). *Universities produce wrong kind of graduates*. Available at: <http://www.sowetanlive.co.za/news/business/2012/01/10/universities-produce-wrong-kind-of-graduates-analyst>.

Stamp, G. (2014). *The underestimated importance of personal networking*, Available at: <http://www.careercast.com/career-news/underestimated-importance-personal-networking>.

Stanlib, (2013). *SA unemployment rate rose to 25.2 per cent in Q1 2013. Employment is still 406 000 below the previous peak*, Available at:

<http://www.stanlib.com/EconomicFocus/Pages/SAunemploymentrateroseto252inQ12013.aspx>.

Statistics South Africa (StatsSa), (2014a). *Education is key to better labour market outcomes*, Accessed November 2014 from: <http://beta2.statssa.gov.za/?p=1377>.

Statistics South Africa (StatsSa), (2014b). *Mid-year population estimates*. Available at: <http://beta2.statssa.gov.za/publications/P0302/P03022014.pdf>.

Stiglitz J. (1975). The theory of 'screening', education and the distribution of income. *American Economic Review*, 65: 283-300.

Stumpf, R., Papier, J., Needham, S. and Nel, H. (2009) Chapter 4: Increasing educational opportunities for post NQF Level 4 learners in South Africa through the FET college sector. in: N. Cloete (ed), *Responding to the Educational Needs of Post-School Youth: Determining the Scope of the Problem and Developing a Capacity-Building Model* (Cape Town: Centre for Higher Education Transformation (CHET)), pp. 61-81

Survey System, (2013). Telephone Interviewing (CATI) Software and Survey Sample Management. Available at: <http://www.surveysystem.com/interviewing-cati.htm>.

Teichler, U. (2007). Does higher education matter? Lessons from a comparative graduate survey. *European Journal of Education*, 42(1): 11-34.

Teichler, U. (1999). Higher Education Policy and the World of Work: Changing Conditions and Challenges. *Higher Education Policy*, 12:285–312.

Times Live, (2013). *Not enough women CEOs in South Africa: survey*. Available at: <http://www.timeslive.co.za/local/2013/03/08/not-enough-women-ceos-in-south-africa-survey>.

Tucker, K. (2014). *Advantages of permanent employment*. Available at:

<http://work.chron.com/advantages-permanent-employment-8921.html>.

Van Broekhuizen, H. (2013). *Higher education institutions and graduate labour market outcomes in South Africa*. Paper prepared for the Biennial Economic Society of South Africa Conference, Bloemfontein.

Van der Berg, S. and van Broekhuizen, H. (2012). *Graduate unemployment in South Africa: a much exaggerated problem* (Stellenbosch Economic Working Papers No. 22/12).

Van der Berg, S. (2007). Apartheid's Enduring Legacy: Inequalities in Education. *Journal of African Economies*, 16 (5): 849 – 880.

Van den Berghe, P. L. (1987). *The ethnic phenomenon*. ABC-CLIO.

Van Schalkwyk, S. (2002). Dealing with the dilemma facing higher education in South Africa against the backdrop of economic globalisation – a technikon perspective. *South African Journal of Higher Education*, 16(1): 183-187.

Van der Westhuizen, Goga and Oosthuizen, M. (2007). *Women in the South African Labour Market, 1995-2005*. DPRU Working Paper No. 07-118. University of Cape Town.

Visagie, J. (2013). *Who are the middle class in South Africa? Does it matter for policy?* Available at: <http://www.econ3x3.org/article/who-are-middle-class-south-africa-does-it-matter-policy>.

Watcher, M.L. (1974). *Primary and secondary labour markets: a critique of the dual approach*. Pennsylvania. University of Pennsylvania.

Weintraub, E.R. (1993). "Neoclassical Economics." Available at:

<http://www.econlib.org/library/Enc1/NeoclassicalEconomics.html>.

Westaway, A. (2012). Rural poverty in the Eastern Cape Province: Legacy of apartheid or consequence of contemporary segregationism? *Development Southern Africa*, 29(1): 115-125.

White, G. (2010). Labour, Commodities and the Labour Market: A Heterodox Perspective. *The Economic and Labour Relations Review*, 21(1): 89-104.

Wolpe, H. (1990). *Race, class and the apartheid state*. Trenton, New Jersey: Africa World Press.

World Bank, (2012). *Gender differences in employment and why they matter*. Washington, DC: World Bank.

Yu, D., (2012). *Youths in the South African labour market since the transition: A study of changes between 1995 and 2011*. (Stellenbosch Economic Working Papers: 18/12).

Zellner, H. (1972). Discrimination against women, occupational segregation, and the relative wage. *The American Economic Review*, 62 (1/1):157-160.

Zupek, R. (2009). *Do references really matter?* Available at:

<http://www.careerbuilder.com/Article/CB-1428-Getting-Hired-Do-References-Really-Matter/>.