University of Fort Hare
Together in Excellence

THE POWER DYNAMICS BETWEEN TRADITIONAL LEADERS AND COUNCILLORS: IMPLICATIONS FOR DEVELOPMENT AT TYOLOMNQA-NCERA IN THE EASTERN CAPE

A Mini Dissertation Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Masters of Social Science in Rural Development at the University of Fort Hare, South Africa.

BY

THANDEKA KHOWA

Student No: 200801300

Research Supervisor: DR S. KWIZERA

December 2013

Declaration

I, Thandeka Khowa, hereby declare that this mini-dissertation, submitted to the University of Fort Hare for the Degree of Masters of Social Sciences in Rural Development, has never been previously submitted by me for a degree at this or any other university, that this is my own work in design and execution, and that all material contained therein has been duly acknowledged by complete references, and that the responsibility for doing so, as directed by my supervisor and in terms of university's policy on plagiarism is my responsibility and mine alone. I absolve my supervisor and the university of any responsibility should this later be proved otherwise.

Signed: …………………………………………

Date: …………………………………………

Supervisor's statement

I hereby confirm that the dissertation of the following candidate has been submitted with my approval:

Name of candidate: Thandeka Khowa

Student Number: 200801300

Department: Department of Sociology

Abstract

This research study examined the extent to which the Eastern Cape local government has succeeded in integrating the institutions of traditional leadership into the existing structures of local government and the nature of relations between the traditional leaders and ward councillors and its impact on the delivery of development services. The study further examined the allocation of roles and responsibilities between the two categories of authority. The was conducted in the East London village of Tyolomnqa-Ncera in the Eastern Cape Province.

The data for study was collected through focus group discussions with community members; in-depth interviews with the two Traditional leaders and the ward Councillor of the studied area; and key informant interviews with the Speaker of the Council and the Deputy Director of (South African Local Government Association (SALGA).

The main findings of the study are that there is still a great deal of confusion regarding the different roles and functions of traditional leaders versus those of ward councillors particularly with regard to co-operation in the delivery of development services. The study further reveals that persistent power struggles among the officials of the two institutions are the order of the day as both sides clamor for recognition, relevance and operational space. The underlying factor behind these power struggles tends to be a lack of policy that clearly defines the roles and functions of each institution with the result that development services and processes are hindered.

Based on the findings of the study, recommendations are made that concern among others, the development of a policy framework that will clearly outline the roles and functions of each of the two institutions and hopefully bring an end to the destructive competition and hostile relations between the two interest groups.

Dedication

This work is dedicated to the two women, who raised me and made me what I am today.

My late grandmother, Lihlo Elsie Khowa,

And

My mother, Nomusa Khowa.

For their exemplary sacrifice, love and support

Acknowledgements

I would like to express my sincere gratitude and appreciation to:

Abbreviations

SALGA   South African Local Government Association

CONTRALESA   Congress of Traditional Leaders of South Africa

IDP   Integrated Development Plan

PRA   Participatory Rural Appraisal

ANC   African National Congress

UFHREC   University of Fort Hare Ethics Committee

Table of Contents

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY

1.1 Introduction

Historically, traditional leaders were custodians of the community. The institution of traditional leadership has always been an integral part of the African and South African society and history. With the advent of colonialism in Africa, the role of traditional leaders became compromised as some leaders were influenced and manipulated by colonial and apartheid governments. This radically affected the traditional authority institutions and leadership. Moreover, the introduction of democratic local government and the establishment of municipalities in South Africa resulted in power dynamics shift. The role played by traditional leaders has now taken a new form. Traditional Leaders are mere representatives of their communities in Council but are not members thereof (SALGA, 2012). Implying that, as cited in SALGA (2012), traditional leaders are not members of Council and as such have no voting powers. This has fuelled debate on the role and importance of traditional leaders. There are two main schools of thought that have debated the essence of the traditional leadership institute in the modern democratic South Africa. The two prevailing schools of thought are the democratic pragmatism and the organic democracy.

Democratic pragmatism proponents argue that traditional leadership as a system that allows for inheritance of leadership is incompatible with democracy. They further argue that traditional leadership should become extinct, but it continues to thrive because the local government institutions' changes in rural areas are lagging behind. This argument is on the basis that government support for traditional leadership is in contradiction with local democracy. In addition, these exponents argue that traditional leaders are an

ancient tool that the modern society needs to do away with. This school of thought further states that traditional leaders have no role to play as there is a general lack of trust from the people towards traditional leaders due to their involvement in the colonial era of South Africa (Beal et al., 2004; Ntsebenza, 2003). According to Sithole and Mbele (2008) overall, the proponents of the democratic pragmatism school of thought believe that traditional leadership should not be sustained in a political democracy, as it contradicts the core values of freedom and choice.

On the other hand, the organic democracy school of thought argues that traditional leaders are a valuable part of South African history. Scholars like Sithole and Mbele, who are proponents of organic democracy argue traditional leadership is a different, effective and grass-roots democracy, which is not necessarily a compromise or contradiction of democracy. These proponents state that before modernity, traditional leaders were there for the needs of their communities and for this reason, rural South African people still have a great deal of attachment to the traditional leaders. More so, they argue that traditional leadership as a system of governance, fulfils diverse development and governance needs of the people. The scholars that support this view argue that traditional leaders have the potential to perform functions that other institutions, especially local government, cannot perform (Coalition of Traditional Leaders, 2002; Holomisa, 2004). Sithole and Mbele (2008) further state that traditional leadership should possibly be seen as an alternative form of democracy that places less emphasis on how governance comes into being, but more emphasis on the rationalization of justice based on cultural moral principles and human feeling, all of which will be under vigorous negotiation on a case-by-case social basis. In addition,

they argue that, traditional leadership requires a facilitatory democracy more focused on issues of rigid governance processes. Some proponents from this school of thought propose a wider scope of roles and functions of traditional leadership as a form of enhancing development in rural areas. Generally, the organic democracy school of thought is not against the shift towards a democratized traditional leadership but it contests the assumption that traditional leadership is undemocratic and archaic thus irrelevant.

While the role and importance of traditional leadership remains in obscurity, and as a state of debate, the inclusion of ward councillors in the same area as traditional leaders makes it more complicated for development to be achieved in rural areas. The first democratic elections in South Africa in 1994 saw a lot of changes and new policies being introduced in the new South Africa. Amid these changes was the development of local government spheres and ward councillors. The work of councillors is stated and guided by the framework in the White Paper on Local Government (1998). Ward councillors are mandated to make sure that the concerns related to the wards they serve, are represented in Council. Part of the ward councillors job include giving ward residents a progress report, explaining the decisions of the council to community members about resources, development projects and programmes affecting them; assessing whether the municipalities' programmes and plans are having their intended impact; assessing whether services are being delivered fairly, effectively and in a sustainable way; conveying important information from council to residents, and determining whether capital projects are being committed in accordance with the IDP

Plan. Some of the roles and responsibilities of ward councillors are inferred and not demarcated.

The formation of new legislation after the democratic elections was meant to be a positive change. The launch of a new local government system in the new South Africa has promoted equality and development of rights for South African people. This has created a platform where the people of South Africa can express their ideas and have a right to a legal public voice. Traditional leaders also hoped to benefit from this transformation. The institution of traditional leadership was, for many years, at the centre of governance for the rural population in the former homelands or "Bantustans" (George, 2010). Therefore the traditional leaders' expectation for better treatment emanates from the position and contributions they previously held in rural communities, which has been a vital one.

Despite all the positives, there are some setbacks in the new governance. These setbacks are mainly around the issue of traditional leadership and its role on service delivery and development. Presently, traditional leadership is still a subject of debate and continues to present what seems to be an insurmountable problem (White Paper on Traditional Leadership and Governance, 2003). Questions have been asked on remuneration of the traditional leaders; on what roles do they precisely play and what are they being paid for. Since traditional leaders fusion into the democratic local government system the role and place of the institution of traditional leadership in municipalities has been fraught with tension, confusion and contradictory practices (SALGA, 2012). .

Several scholars have argued that the municipalities (local municipalities) should work together with traditional leaders to facilitate development in their communities or wards. Gildenhuys (1991) mentioned that in society there is conflict of interest which can hinder progress and development. According to these scholars, however, this can be prevented if the local government in this democratic system act as a mediator. They argue that the local government together with the institution of traditional leadership should find a way of working together towards achieving the main mandate of serving the community. However, for the ward councillors and traditional leaders to be able to work together, their roles and functions have to be clearly stated. It is against these complications that this study seeks to understand the roles and responsibilities of traditional leaders and ward councillors. The study further seeks to understand the power dynamics between these two and the impact of such dynamics on development in Tyolomnqa-Ncera village of East London, under the Buffalo City Municipality in the Eastern Cape Province, South Africa.

1.2 STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM AND STUDY RATIONALE

Nearly two decades have passed since the independence of South Africa. The first democratic elections held in 1994, marked a new democratic South Africa. This new era came with new changes in policies, governance and roles in different institutions. The new democratic system of governance brought about change in the institution of traditional leadership, which meant complying with the new democratic policies as well as the new Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996). With change in government, the traditional leaders in South Africa, specifically those in Kwa-Zulu and

Eastern Cape, hoped for better treatment. Several years have passed and the situation has not only become gloomier but also more complex for traditional leaders. As Cele (2008: 9) postulates, it is important to note that the Constitution does not assure traditional leaders powers beyond those that they exercise by virtue of their traditional role as custodians of tradition and culture. He also states that, by implication this means that chiefs (traditional leaders) have no Constitutional guaranteed role in local government.

Even though the new government made attempts to include the institution of traditional leadership in the new local government system, the inclusion has proved to be problematic in terms of determining their roles and responsibilities. Local government agents such as ward councillors seem to be clashing with the institution of traditional leadership even though the two are expected to cooperate. This working arrangement between the traditional leaders and the local government has proved to be very complex and unimplementable. Accordingly, most of the traditional leaders are of the view that their power to govern local matters is being taken away by ward councillors. The biggest challenge emanates from what the mandate for the traditional leaders is, what their role and function are. The parameters of their line of work are not clear. This has been a major setback that has derailed consistent service delivery.

Although the Constitution (Act 108 of 1996) acknowledges the importance of the institution of traditional leadership, it fails to outline the exact role and function of the institution at a local level. This creates a complex scenario, which was noted by Cele (undated) who states that, "consistent with its commitment to democratic government, the Constitution assigns to local government many of the service delivery

responsibilities that chiefs (traditional leaders) assume are theirs" Cele (2008: 9). Instead of providing clarity, the Constitution states, "national legislation may provide a role for traditional leadership as an institution at local level and matters affecting local communities" (section 212 (1)). This failure by the Constitution to clearly outline the role and function of traditional leaders from that of ward councillors is problematic as it builds a continuous series of complications at the local level.

Inherently, such complications are evident at the local level as noted in the White Paper on Local Government (1998) which also avoids taking any clear position on outlining satisfactorily the new roles and responsibilities of traditional leaders. The White Paper (1998) merely reproduces the roles and responsibilities as they were in the old dispensation. The absence of any new national policy on the definition of the roles and responsibilities of traditional leaders becomes an inherent conflict between traditional leaders and ward councillors in rural communities or wards.

This study therefore sought to explore and understand the power dynamics between traditional leaders and ward councillors of Tyolomnqa-Ncera village. It examines the roles and responsibilities of both institutions in order to understand their working relationship. Furthermore, it looks into the effects of these relations on service delivery and development in Tyolomnqa-Ncera community and explores the views of the community members on the above issues.

1.3 Research questions

- What role do the institutions of traditional leaders and ward councillors of Tyolomnqa-Ncera village play in the governance, development processes and the delivery of development services to their communities?

- How effective has the Eastern Cape local government been in managing the integration of the institutions of traditional leadership into the existing structures of governance?

- What is the nature of relations between the traditional leaders and ward councillor in Tyolomnqa-Ncera village and to what extent do these relations affect the delivery of development services in the area?

1.4 Research objectives

In accordance with the research questions above, the study seeks to achieve the following objectives:

- To understand the role presently played by traditional leaders and ward councillors in respect of governance and delivery of development and other services in Tyolomnqa-Ncera village;

- To examine the extent to which the Eastern Cape local government has succeeded in facilitating the integration of the institutions of traditional leadership and ward councillors to enable effective governance, development and service delivery; and

- To assess the impact of the relations between traditional leaders and ward councillors on the governance of and delivery of development and other services in Tyolomnqa-Ncera village.

1.5 Significance of the Study

The inherent conflict between the institutions of traditional leadership and ward councilors is an important issue as these institutions are supposed to be facilitators of change in their communities.

- This study will contribute to the body of knowledge, on the roles and functions of traditional leaders and ward councillors, and the effects that these institutions have on development in rural areas.(especially to the Tyolomnqa-Ncera community)

- This study provides valuable findings and information on the roles and responsibilities of traditional leaders and ward councillors in local government. It also highlights the impact and tensions in the working relationship between the two institutions on the governance of and the delivery of development services to their communities. This is done with the aim of providing information that can be used to solve the power dynamics challenges between traditional leaders and ward councillors in Tyolomnqa-Ncera and other communities like it.

- The study is also informative. The study will inform the Buffalo City Municipality or local government office of the different challenges that are hindering service

delivery and community development in rural communities like Tyolomnqa-Ncera. The study will look into the tensions in the working relations between traditional leaders and ward councillor and highlight the prominent negative effects on service delivery and development in Tyolomnqa-Ncera community. This will assist the responsible authorities to make informed decisions.

- The study also has policy implication significance as it serves to highlight the gaps in the policies such as the White Paper on Local Government and the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa in addressing clearly the question of the roles and functions of traditional leaders. The study seeks to help influence positive changes in policy with regard to the clarification of the roles and responsibilities of traditional leaders and ward councillors. In this regard, the study contributes to the debates around policy development and implementation in South Africa.

1.6 Theoretical Framework
1.6.1 The Pluralist and Liberal Theory
Pluralist theory is closely related to the liberal theory, in that, they both start from the premise of diversity and variety. These two theories are in agreement with each other as the former sees the need of diversity of interest amongst people, while on the other hand the latter states that this variety is a necessary and positive dimension of social life. Pluralism perceives the society through a modern society were people have different view and ideas on staff that affects them as a community. Popular power is realized through group activity, the working of political parties and pressure groups or

interest groups, each of which represents one of the many interests into which a developed society is split (Schwarzmantel, 1994:50). It is also a perspective seeking to analyse existing society and show the reality of power structure, and is also a general theory explaining how democracy can be a complex issue in some societies (Bevir, 2004).

In large complex societies, it is argued that it is unrealistic to continue with the assumption that the people form a single block or community, sharing common interests and acting collectively to decide on issues of common concern (Schwarzmantel, 1994). This is predominantly true in the situation of traditional institutional transformation in South Africa. While some parts of the South African society still find traditional leaders valuable, others think they are no longer valuable to communities as they have no role to play in community development. The same is true for traditional leaders, some of whom have embraced the changes brought about by the new legislation, and others are still reluctant to change because they feel disempowered by the changes.

Some traditional leaders were, initially, not keen to transform their traditional authorities into traditional councils in line with the new legislation. This in itself confirms the pluralist view that there is diversity and variety and that the view of people as a collective is impracticable (Gaus, 2000; Dunleavy, 1991). The new South African government after 1994 had aimed to integrate the institutions of traditional leaders and local government for the good of the communities and the South African people. However, this has not yielded expected results as both of these institutions seek to carry out their own agendas.

The question then is how can unity be achieved with this diversity? How can pluralism be prevented from ending in fragmentation and desegregation? The problem is one of - how variety can be contained within a consensus, an agreed framework of common rules. There is agreement that this is the role of the state to prevent diversity from ending up in fragmentation and desegregation.

Schwarzmantel (1994) states that, "pluralism depends on organised groups having a certain autonomy and independence. However, these independent organisations can also distort democracy". Government legislation and policies are supposed to ensure that, while diversity and variety are recognised, democracy is not distorted. According to section 151 (3) of the South African Constitution "a municipality has a right to govern, on its own initiative, the local government affairs of its community, subject to national and provincial legislation, as provided for in the Constitution" (RSA, 1996). The limited degree of autonomy of local government as entrenched in the Constitution confirms the control of diversity and variety through legislation and is one of the main contributors of South Africa's decentralised state structure and may still become its essential building block. There is agreement between both the pluralists and the liberals that there should be multiple and competing centres of power, within the state and outside it so that power is both fragmented and diffused (Gaus, 2000; Schwarzmantel, 1994).

This is thought to be desirable because it prevents the distribution of power in the hands of a single person or group leading to the misuse of power. Pluralism, therefore, views the desirable society as one in which power is dispersed and diffused, in which values of diversity are realised and celebrated. Pluralists perceive the state as being responsive to the wide range of interests expressed in civil society. For them a modern

liberal-democratic society is the one where no single dominant ideology or world view prevails (Dunleavy, 1991).

The liberal theory, on the other hand, is more concerned about concentration and possible abuse of power. Friedman (1956) observes that at the core doctrine of liberalism is the protection of the individual, and the rights of the individual. The state is seen as responsible for protecting those rights. According to Schwarzmantel, (1994) there is, "however, a danger, as the liberal view states, that the state might become too powerful". To prevent this, it is argued that the state should be strictly controlled to keep those vested with state power from overstepping the mark (Schwarzmantel, 1994). In a liberal view, individuals exist within a private sphere within which people can do as they wish.

The liberal's view of individual rights is also entrenched in the Bill of Rights as contained in chapter 2 sections 9 to 35 of the South African Constitution (RSA, 1996). The liberal theory states that the state is seen as responsible for protecting the rights of its people; this becomes a challenge when the state policies fail to clearly highlight the roles and responsibilities of traditional leaders which are greatly needed in areas where both these institutions exist so as to prevent any conflict that may arise. In the Tyolomnqa-Ncera village both the structure of traditional leadership and ward councillors exist but with no clear policy regarding the roles of these institutions, making conflict inevitable. Therefore, this can be understood as the failure of the state to protect its people and to ensure that power is not dominated by one institution and also to ensure that development of the area and its people are not compromised.

1.6.2 The Elitist Theory

The elitists look at power structures and argue that there is a hierarchy within groups and parties (Dunleavy, 1991). Elitists argue that there is always an elite group that rules and there are the masses that are ruled by the elite. The elite groups are said to be often minorities which are more cohesive and well-organized. Members of these groups also have some features that form a power base and have qualities that the rest of their group members do not have; these could be leadership skills, financial resources and power. Traditional leaders and ward councillors are seen as people who have these skills in the community and community members appoint them out of trust and faith that they will be great leaders who will bring developmental change to the community. It is often not clear who the members of the elite group are, how they became members of that particular group and the relationship of the decisions they take to the views of the rest of the community. This theory asserts that there will always be rivalry between the elite groups and the masses, and that minority power is inevitable. The elitist theory could well be applied in the current succession debate in South Africa, which sees local government as the custodians of development facilitation in their communities, thus the lack of identified roles of traditional leaders in policies (Dunleavy, 1991).

Clearly, the above discussed theories are relevant to the study as they depict explicitly the power relations in governance. The theories examine how roles and responsibility discrepancies within local governments and traditional leadership institutions come into existence. The study will therefore be pinned on the some of the aspects of these theories. The findings will be interpreted using the theories above, together with the legislative framework discussed below.

1.7 The Legislative Framework

The Traditional Leadership and Governance Framework Act of 2003 is one of the most pertinent piece of legislation aimed at outlining the roles and functions of the institution of traditional leadership within the broader thrust of the post-1994 democratic dispensation in South Africa (Sithole and Mbele, 2008). Prior to this, Chapter 12 of the South African Constitution (1996) particularly acknowledged the institution of traditional leadership and its place and role in the system of democratic governance. It presented the traditional leadership with continued authority and functions of leaders in accordance with traditional and customary law within the broader legal framework. The autonomy of traditional leaders however, is only limited to participation at local government level. Moreover, the Constitution also set up a Council of Traditional Leaders (The Constitution of South Africa, 1996: Cht 12). Other pieces of legislation that reflect the commitment of government towards the strengthening of the traditional leadership system include:

- *Council of Traditional Leaders Act which was passed in order to expound upon the composition of the Council of Traditional Leaders, the process of election of its representatives and specific powers and functions. This law was later repealed by the passing of the Council of Traditional Leaders Act of 1997.*

- *Traditional Leadership and Governance Framework (TLGF) Act (2003) which is primarily focused on providing recognition of traditional communities, traditional councils and traditional leaders as well as to provide a statutory framework for leadership positions within the institution of traditional leadership, and provide*

functions and roles of traditional leaders. The Act is aimed at giving clarity and substance to the role of traditional leaders in South Africa.

- *The Communal Land Rights Bill. The Communal Land Rights Bill was framed by the government as legislation that would offer redress to people "whose tenure of land is legally insecure as a result of past racially discriminatory laws or practices", as proclaimed in Section 25 (6) of the Constitution.*

The major objective of the TLGF Act (2003) is the setting up and recognition of traditional councils at a local level. This is done in order to align traditional rule and traditional councils more stalwartly with the principles of democracy and, hopefully, remove some of the negative sentiments associated with traditional rule and traditional councils which were enforced by the apartheid/colonial era in South Africa. Rugege (2009:173) states that, "traditional institutions were transformed into agencies (tribal authorities) of the alien state and more powers were given to these tribal authorities to control the African population in order to better serve colonial/apartheid interests". Under the apartheid or colonial laws, the Premier had authority to manipulate the setup of the traditional council in an area which he has nominated as a traditional community. Furthermore, the TLGF Act (2003) acknowledges a position for traditional leadership, not only within local government, but at the provincial and national levels as well.

A number of research studies have been conducted around the issues that revolve around traditional leaders and ward councilor's relationships. The next chapter hereby provides an analysis of the observations and views of other academics through articles and books that have been written on traditional leaders and ward councilors.

1.8 STRUCTURE OF THE DISSERTATION

Chapter 1: Introduction and Background of the Study

This chapter gives an introduction and a background to the study. The chapter briefly discusses the power dynamics involving the institution of traditional leadership and ward councillors. The chapter discusses the complications in relations involving power-sharing between traditional leaders and ward councillors and how this impacts communities. It also discusses how this complication creates problems leading to an outline of the statement of the problem, research questions, objectives of the study, and significance of the study. This chapter also discusses the theoretical and legislative framework used in this study.

Chapter 2: A Review of Literature

This chapter discusses international and local discourses on traditional leadership. It analyses the different challenges being faced by different countries due to power dynamics and change.

Chapter 3: Research Methodology and Methods

This chapter deliberates on the qualitative research methodology employed by this study. The chapter discusses the overall research design, sampling procedure and tools used in the data collection process. The chapter also discusses the merits and demerits of the research methodology and methods used.

Chapter 4: Data Findings, Presentation and Analysis

This chapter presents and analyses the empirical research findings. This empirical analysis is based on responses from the participants of Tyolomnqa –Ncera village, key informants, grey literature and published literature. The knowledge and policy contributions of this study are detailed in this chapter.

Chapter 5: Discussions of finding

This chapter focuses on the discussion of the finding of this study.

Chapter 6: Conclusions and Recommendations

This chapter consists of the conclusions and recommendations of the study.

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Introduction

The current status of the institution of traditional leadership does not reflect the ancient historical value of the institution. Historically, traditional leaders were highly recognized and valued as they played a vital role in African societies. For centuries the African people experienced no other form of governance (Meer & Campbell, 2007). Traditional leaders were important because they served as political, military, spiritual and cultural leaders. They were also regarded as custodians of the value systems of society. Traditional leadership was divided into kings (inkosi), chiefs (ikumkani), headman and advisors who helped as custodians of community values and beliefs. Traditional leaders played a role of governing communities by keeping a functional community through maintaining peace and order. They looked after the welfare of their people by providing them with land for their subsistence needs through agriculture and for grazing (Rugege, 2009). The traditional leaders also provided for the very poor and orphans (Rugege, 2002). Basically, traditional leaders were the governors and custodians of rural communities.

However, colonization and imperialism changed the institution of traditional leadership. Traditional leaders moved from being community leaders and custodians to agents of colonial governments. This made the institution of traditional leadership lose the essential role it had in African society. Following the colonial and apartheid eras in South Africa, the year 1994 marked a turnaround in the governing system in South Africa. The transition of South Africa into a democratic modern society resulted in several transformations especially in policies, structures and political mandates of

different institutions. As a result of this transformation, there was transition in the institution of traditional leadership and this has generated debates on the role and functions of this institution. As Maloka (1996) argues, in South Africa, "unlike in other African countries, the ANC government was not as reliant on the chiefs for governance because of the extent to which their (Chiefs') authority had been eroded by their involvement with the Bantustan system". With the introduction of local government and ward councillors, some of the roles and responsibilities of traditional leaders were assigned to these new structures of governance which has created complications.

2.2 The Concept of Traditional Leadership

The origins of traditional leadership are rooted in its role of governing African communities. Different views are suggested on the style of leadership in the present African society making it necessary to examine the origins of traditional leadership. The origins of the institution of traditional leadership have been a subject of debate. At the forefront of many discussions is the link of traditional leaders with ancestors and God. The Native Economic Commission (1930:32) states that: "the hereditary chief is the link between the living and the dead. He is a high priest and with certain tribes, he may become a 'god' during his lifetime…" Oomen (2005) also mentions that "traditional authority like any other (legitimate) authority comes from God and without it Africans would not have a community". These beliefs amongst Africans made traditional authorities to be highly respected and valued in their communities. This status that was accorded to traditional leaders shows the extent to which the institutions of traditional leadership were valued and how much autonomy they enjoyed over their subjects. Not

only did the traditional leaders have autonomy, they had a special relationship with their subjects. This relationship served a particular purpose in the African society of creating a functional community. This was achieved through the traditional leaders' ability to control the communities and shepherding the traditional values, beliefs and culture in general.

However, the concept of traditional leadership transformed with the advent of colonization. The custodianship of the community by the traditional leaders changed with the influence of imperialism and colonialism into agents of oppression. Imperialism and colonialism managed to weaken and disintegrate the power of African societies as well as the institution of traditional leadership. South Africa, like many other African countries, was firmly under the rule of traditional authority before colonization. As in many African countries, imperialism and colonialism affected the institution of traditional leadership in South Africa. More so, as stated by Nthai (2005), in South Africa the apartheid government weakened the role of traditional leaders by formulating laws which regulated and controlled traditional leadership which was advantageous to the apartheid racist regime.

Initially marginalized as a result of their heroic role in the fight against colonialism in the nineteenth century, traditional authorities had, by the 1950s largely been drawn into the administrative system of the apartheid regime as the latter's extended arm in rural areas (Ntsebeza, 2002). Traditional institutions were re-invented in the form of Bantu or Tribal Authorities and Bantustan governments (Ntsebeza, 2002). Consequently, due to

colonial and apartheid government structures, many traditional leaders turned to the government rather than their subjects for support. This 'puppet' position by traditional leaders made the institution of traditional leadership to lose trust, respect and to be feared by the people.

Further transformation was experienced by the institution of traditional leadership. In the new South Africa, after the 1994 democratic elections in South Africa, the country had to find a way forward to involve traditional leaders in the new governing system. However, the gap that was created by the apartheid government between the institution of traditional leadership and the community made it difficult for traditional leaders to be integrated into the governing system. Tshehla (2005) mentions that the main concern was how to involve the traditional leaders in the new governing system, what role and function were they going to play. Before colonialism and apartheid the role of traditional leaders was very clear. After elections and creation of the new democratic government there was a state of dilemma. Traditional leaders were the 'ex-government's' former agents but on the other hand their knowledge of rural communities could never be undermined.

Integration into the new governing system was never a question but their role and function was. As Ntsebeza (2003), asserts, the new democratic dispensation introduced a system of local government which resulted in the administrative and certain governance functions being moved from the institution of traditional leadership to a council of developmental local government. Having allocated the roles and functions of the traditional leadership institution to the local government, the traditional leaders' role

and responsibilities were no longer clear and still remain unclear to date. Without clear role and responsibilities, traditional leaders no longer have much contribution to make towards development and service delivery. As George (2002) noted, "traditional leaders in most instances are unable to play the significant developmental role in their areas that they used to play, because they no longer have control over government resources".

This three phase transformation of the concept of traditional leadership has fuelled debate in South Africa on the importance and value of traditional leaders in the country. Many critics of the institution of traditional leadership have argued that the role of traditional leaders is not relevant in the new democratic South Africa. These critics state that traditional leaders have little or no impact in society. This argument has been opposed by traditional authorities who claim that their fundamental cultural rights and the role they play within rural societies are unfairly compromised by the current democratic system (Tahehla, 2005). In addition, Meer and Campbell (2007) also mention that, although government has allowed traditional authorities partial political voice, traditional leaders claim that they have been excluded from the political arena and decision making. In the Council, even though, traditional leaders are representatives of the community, they are not members therefore cannot vote. Thus their role in contemporary South Africa has been negated.

2.3 The Evolution and Impacts of Traditional Leadership in South Africa

2.3.1 The Pre-colonial Era

In most of African countries, traditional leadership was the main form of governance throughout history. In the pre-colonial Africa, African societies were ruled by kings supported by a hierarchy of chiefs and councillors or advisors, who were either their close relatives or selected from their communities (Rugege, 2009). Primarily, these traditional leaders served as political, military, spiritual and cultural leaders and were regarded as custodians of the values of society (Rugege, 2002). They looked after the welfare of their people by providing them with land for their subsistence needs through agriculture and for grazing (Draft Discussion Document, 2006). Traditional leaders were responsible for leading their communities or people against external aggression and maintaining order in their communities. They ensured reconciliation by resolving disputes that arose among community members to ensure harmony (Rugege, 2009). Ntsenbeza (2001), states that chiefs were not merely the most important powerful member of the tribe, they were the tribe, the embodiment of all attitudes emotions and values that ensured the communities' solidarity. According to Zibi (1998), before colonization there was a form of democracy in African societies. Community members were allowed to participate in decision making on fundamental issues impinging the community. In a community where the members were not pleased with their traditional leaders they would abandon the leader for another or/and eventually overthrow the leader through civil war or assassination (Rugege, 2002). Traditional leaders in pre-colonial era are known to have ruled largely with the consent of their people (Zibi, 1998).

2.3.2 Traditional leadership in colonial and apartheid era

The advent of colonization resulted in seizure of the important and powerful institutions in the African societies by the colonial states. The institution of traditional leadership was one of those institutions that was seized and manipulated by colonizers. In South Africa, it was the apartheid era that weakened the roles and functions of the traditional leaders in governing African communities (Rugege, 2002). Rugege (2002) further avers that traditional leaders were no longer accountable to their people. The traditional leaders were now only reporting and were being accountable to the colonial masters and the apartheid government only. Traditional leaders were still responsible for the day to day running of government activities; however they were now acting as agents of the colonial government. Traditional leaders were used as a tool to enforce colonial activities in their communities. They who were willing to co-operate and work with colonial government were given more power and authority to control the African communities in order to safe guard the colonial and apartheid government's interests. It was expensive for the colonizers to bring personnel from their native countries to control the local communities. As a result the colonial government did not have enough personnel who could easily deal with the social control of the natives so it highly depended on traditional leaders. As Rugege (2002) remarks it was easier and more cost effective to use the existing administrative structures of the African people which was the institution of traditional leadership.

Many traditional leaders became oppressive towards their people, who could do nothing about it as the coercive machinery of the colonial state protected the leaders (Rugege, 2009). This steered most traditional leaders to losing their acceptability from their

people. Consequently, in many African countries, most liberation and nationalist movements that fought for independence marginalized the traditional leaders after independence as they regarded them as collaborators of the colonial governments. The make-up of traditional authority under colonialism and apartheid was disfigured, in that the right to office of traditional leaders was no longer automatically based on hereditary rights but it was now based on the principle of male primogeniture. Although this basic law (of inheritance) was largely kept, the state could appoint anyone to be a chief and could dismiss a chief who qualified as such according to custom if he did not agree with the requirements and did not serve the interests of the state (Draft Disscusion Document, 2006).

2.3.3 Post-colonial Period

Generally, traditional forms of governance and their incorporation into new structures of government have thus far proved to be complicated and problematic not only in South Africa but in other African countries as well (Khan, 2002). Like the rest of the African continent, indigenous local government in South Africa has been the centre of political manipulation and conflict before and after democracy (Khanu, *et al.*, 2001). Allocation and distribution of roles and responsibilities at local level has been the major challenge for many African states. With democracy as the main form of governance, many states in Africa are obliged to use elected government authorities as the main players in communities leaving traditional monarchy institutions out in the cold, with no roles or duties to perform.

Local government in South Africa has experienced radical changes since the first democratic local government elections which were held in 1994. It is generally known that local government in South Africa was based on radical fragmentation. The new South African government, therefore, has to fix the inherent challenges and make representation in the government purely democratic in order to solve the inequalities of the apartheid era. The Constitution of South Africa Act, (Act 108 of 1996) envisages a complete transformation of the local government system. Subsequently policy frameworks such as the Local Government White Paper have been formulated to give effect to a new vision of local government. One of the central policies of the Local Government White Paper of 1998 was that the basis of authority for the traditional leaders (chiefs and kings), and that of the local government are different (Ntsebeza, 2003:30).

The creation of a democratic government at local level by the African National Congress (ANC) has proven to be a difficult task, especially on issues of rural areas' development and service delivery. The official boundaries between the authority of local government and traditional leaders in terms of roles and responsibilites at the local level have not been as clear as the ANC anticipated. Rather than providing clarity, the establishment of rural local government in 1995 was a process that superimposed a new set of norms and rules onto a socio-political context where the chieftaincy or traditional leadership remained dominant, therefore creating more contradictions. One of the challenges experienced in these rural areas is that the authority of each institution overlaps in ways that tend to obscure rather than reinforce the boundaries that exist between the traditional leaders and local government institutions. One of the significant legacies of

the apartheid era was the multiple political boundaries that existed at the local level, especially in the rural areas. As government officials sought to implement local government institutions throughout South Africa, they had to come to grips with apartheid-era boundaries that remained meaningful to local residents.

2.4 Debates/Schools of Thought on Traditional Leadership

Essentially, three major divergent notions are evident in the current literature. There is the neo-traditionalist view of those who assert that traditional leadership is attuned with modern democratic governance because it embraces certain democratic fundamentals. The other school of thought, neo-liberalists, holds a contrary view to the neo-traditionalist arguing that the traditional leaders have no significant role to play and hamper the process of democracy in African societies. The final view is a combination of the two views, which is based on inclusion of traditional leadership in contemporary governance as such integration is an essential tool in development.

2.4.1 The Neo-Traditionalist Argument

Sakyi (2003) observes that traditional leaders once held a good solid grip on the social, economic, and political systems that presided over society. There were structures in place to control behaviour, and rules were well enforced to maintain a safe and orderly society. Through taxes, other donations and royalties they had enough revenue base to support families and meet their societal obligations. For Sakyi and other scholars, the hierarchical traits of most traditional governance systems were not only a means to ensure order and stability in society but it also promoted democratic principles in the sense that everything was transparent (Keulder, 1998).

Mokgoro (1994) argues that the hereditary nature of traditional leadership means that the institution is not subjected to the electoral procedure that typifies contemporary governance. He admits though that control was traditionally held only through traditional councils which helped to negate absolutism. This view, therefore, purports that traditional leaders have assisted to preserve a system of government built on accountability, consultation and decentralization. Supporting Mokgoro's view, Williams (2002) argues that the democratic aspects of traditional leadership and authority systems were instrumental in mediating the autocracy of the kingdom but were undermined by colonialism. Even though 'physical force' was a means by which African leaders exerted their authority it was, apparently, exceptional before colonialism in that the traditional leaders ruled with the people's consent. To this band of scholars, the two structures of governance, namely traditional leadership and the contemporary state are complementary.

2.4.2 The Neo-Liberal Argument

Various scholars have disagreed with the involvement of traditional governance structures in the new governing system. For them, traditional authority by its very make-up undermines the democratic project underway in many African countries (Mamdani, 1996). These scholars contend that chieftaincy was tarnished by the colonial state and by the 'clientelism' of the postcolonial type of governance. They further mention that the communities under traditional authorities lived as 'subjects' rather than as 'citizens' of the state and therefore democratic governance would not be achieved if such systems continue to exist. In addition, they argue that traditional institutions hamper the rate of development as they reduce the relevance of the state in the areas of social services;

and, moreover, they heighten primordial loyalties (Mamdani 1996; Ntsebeza, 2005). This contingent thus discards any chance of accommodating traditional leadership in a contemporary democracy.

2.4.3 The Integrationist Paradigm

A balancing view which tries to amalgamate the above two views is the integrationist paradigm. The point of departure of the integrated view is essentially the crisis of current government presently. This view is rooted in calls in recent years, by both African scholars and Western donor agencies, to include traditional authorities in the governance of 'modern' African states (Owusu, 1991). Owusu (1991) states that "these calls have arisen as a result of the social changes that have transformed the African social and political landscapes". A number of scholars have noted the combination of Western-style democracy, which is based on the idea of individualistic political and social rights, with the ethnic-based collectivism characteristic of African societies (Owusu 1991).

To such proponents, the problem of governance is to idenhtify and satisfy the goals and aspirations of diverse groups and their leaders. Some viewpoints have argued that the institutional crisis in Africa cannot be resolved by depending entirely on either external region transplant institutions or on purely traditional institutions, and that neither total 'institutional transplant' nor 'traditional fundamentalism' is a viable alternative for Africa (World Bank, 1992). Thus, the integrationists argue for the notion of incorporating traditional governance systems into current structures of governance to promote effective and efficient governance on the continent.

However, Skinner (2007) argues that the consensus of the 1960s was employed by the new African elite, and that, essentially this had involved an outright abolition of traditional leadership structures in some countries. Skinner (2007) further argues that these African nationalists ignored their own 'counter-racist' philosophies such as 'Negritude' and the 'African Personality' by paying only lip service to traditional political cultures; and that the post-colonial African leaders firmly rejected compromise with African traditional authorities (Lewis, 1967).

2.5 The Nature of Relations between Traditional Leaders and Ward Councillors in South Africa and its Effects on Development

It is essential to note that there are a great number of South Africans who are subjects of traditional leaders or live under customary law systems. The damage done by the apartheid era to the nature of traditional leadership in South Africa has had a negative impact on how some people view traditional leaders in the new era of a democratic South Africa. One of the most commonly raised questions about traditional leaders is 'whether traditional leadership is vital at all within a democratic state'.

The norm in answering this question for many people and scholars has been to assume two extreme positions, that "it is", or that "it is not", based on two schools of thought. One school of thought deemed as 'traditionalists' regard traditional chiefs and elders as the real representatives of their community or people, and are accessible, respected and legitimate. The other band of scholars, regarded as 'modernists', by contrast, see traditional leaders as a chauvinistic, authoritarian and an increasingly irrelevant form of authority. Research points out that traditional leaders, chiefs and elders still play a fundamental role in the lives of many Africans. Some ordinary Africans still frequently

contact their traditional authorities in their communities in an effort to help them solve their problems or express their views.

A large number of South Africans, regardless of their encounters during apartheid, still regard traditional leadership as part of their culture and identity. Consequently, as the ANC recognized in 1988, South Africa cannot discard traditional leadership but must look for a way to integrate the institution into its current system of government without inhibiting a gradual deepening of democracy.

According to Atkinson and Reitzes (1998), traditional leaders still have notable support within the rural population. They have constitutional fortification and have been vested with powers and responsibilities which cannot simply be salvaged from them. They will, therefore, continue to impact seriously on development in rural communities but their presence is also a recipe for conflict and violence, whereby the ultimate losers will be the rural communities themselves.

Bekke, Toonen and Perry (1996) argue that differences between traditional leaders and ward councillors are due to the level of representation with respect to societal views. Section 81 of Structures Act provides for a maximum of 20 percent of traditional leaders in municipal councils meetings, where there are traditional leaders in the municipality (SALGA, 2013). On the other hand, Botes, Brynard, Fourie and Roux (1996), argue that tribal authorities are certainly an integral part of the political, social and traditional activities in clearly defined communities.

Atkinson and Reitzes (1998) elaborate further that traditional leaders may acknowledge the authority of the council, but are likely to be hostile towards ward councillors and do

not acknowledge them. Traditional leaders consider the rendering of services or infrastructure without their inclusion as disrespecting their authority base. Usually they feel that councillors only check with them when they encounter problems and need the traditional leaders to mediate. The allocation of land by traditional leaders, within particular areas without the inclusion of ward councillors also steers conflict (Atkinson & Reitzes, 1998).

According to Kanyene (1997), traditional leaders claim stewardship power over municipalities as custodians of African traditions in some areas. Such a paradox of power relations is a possible reason for concern because, at times, the development hub of local government is hindered as municipal and tribal councillors do not always have the same opinion, whilst development is greatly anticipated by the communities they serve. He further states that traditional leaders are mainly concerned about the way in which municipal councillors behave in their approach to community development. To the traditional leaders, municipal councillors infringe on their traditional affairs by implementing developmental plans in their areas, without their consultation; therefore, these two often view each other with distrust.

In addition, Gildenhuys, Fox and Wissink (1991) mention that in any society conflict of interest is inherent and local government is mainly a process of merging these divergences. Conflict resolution, through local policy and decision-making, is important for the most regular collective needs and the equitable allocation and application of limited resources among competing needs. Therefore, the solitary function of local government is to serve communities. In South Africa, both these institutions of government are esential as they are diverse groups of people who believe in either both

or one of the institutions; also the institution of traditional leadership is popular amongst people in rural areas who are at the forefront of development needs; therefore, finding a way to incoperate the institution of traditional leadership into the new structure of local government can enhance and facilitate development of the people of this country.

2.6 Effectiveness of The Eastern Cape Local Government in Integrating the Institutions of Traditional Leaders and Ward Councillors

After the 1994 elections, a new South Africa was born. Since then, the traditional leaders of the Eastern Cape Province, as Pieres (2007) states "have found themselves in some form of purgatory awaiting their fate in a transitional limbo between heaven and hell". For many traditional leaders in the province like in other rural areas in South Africa, their fate as community leaders seems to be mystified and bleak. Peires (2000:97) shades light on the complex nature faced by the institute of traditional leadership in Eastern Cape in the contemporary South Africa when he mentions that:

"on the one hand, they have fallen from the heaven of the old Transkei 'homeland' or Bantustan' system, where traditional leaders had autocratic powers and did more or less as they pleased within their own administrative areas. On the other hand, they have not yet been condemned to damnation. They can reasonably hope that they, too, will be enabled to share in the glories of the African Renaissance, and that the new millennium will add a new gloss to the shop-soiled but ever adaptable vehicle now known as traditional leadership".

This situation facing the traditional leaders is not peculiar to the Eastern Cape but throughout most rural areas in South Africa. However, it is widely recognised that conflict between traditional leaders and local government officials is endemic in the rural Eastern Cape and is stifling development in communal areas. Development in the Eastern Cape has been lagging behind especially in rural areas. Several factors are pointed as causes for this adverse situation. It is alleged that chiefs and headmen often block development projects simply to discredit councillors, while municipalities are said to limit development projects in areas where traditional authorities are strong and well organised (Bank, 2009).

The problem for the Eastern Cape is that rural development has a long history of being neither participatory nor co-operative. Top-down development interventions have come in equal measure from tribal authorities and new democratic structures. In this context, councillors and chiefs often slug it out for a share of the consultant-driven development projects and this ultimately results in polarisation. In Transkei numerous attempts have been made to bring the chiefs and councillors together; however, each blames the other side for mutual hostility. The chiefs state that the councillors deliberately bypass and ignore them. The councillors say that the chiefs continue to cling to the undemocratic old order where they did what they pleased (Bank, 2009).

2.7 Roles and Responsibilities of Traditional Leaders and Ward Councillors in South Africa

Traditional leaders have mandates to fulfil in developmental local government. However, their roles and functions are not yet clearly defined which creates vagueness,

often resulting in confusion of roles and functions. This state of affairs always leads to suspicions and strained relations between traditional leaders and elected municipal councillors. Therefore, there is a necessity to outline the roles and functions of traditional leaders.

In order to produce significant and effective improvements and development in rural local communities the developmental local government and the traditional leaders should work together. To avoid confusion, each structure's roles and functions should be made distinct and be clearly defined in the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (Act No. 108 of 1996) and other acts of Parliament, but as of now, the roles and functions of traditional leaders are still indeterminate.

2.8 Roles of Ward Councillors

Each ward committee is chaired by a ward councillor. The ward councillor is mandated to represent the interests of his/her ward in the municipality and in other processes. According to the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996, every citizen who is qualified to vote in the local elections has the right to stand as a candidate in an election for that council.

Craythorne (1997:138) challenges this view stating that "unrehabilitated insolvents, people of unsound mind, those convicted and sentenced to more than 12 months imprisonment without an option of a fine, may be disqualified to be a member of the National Assembly". It is not clear whether the above conditions apply at the municipal level. The assumption is that a person who cannot handle his/her personal finances and has convictions has a big chance of being involved in corrupt and fraudulent activities.

Ward councillors ought to be in tune with the concerns of the area they are serving by understanding the key problems as well as checking development and service delivery.

Clarke and Stewart (1996:44-45) identify some roles of ward councillors, inter alia:

- *"They are elected representatives acting on behalf of their electors and a particular geographical arena.*

- *They ensure identification of priorities and resource allocation.*

- *They ensure policy development so as to shape and guide service delivery.*

- *They also monitor and review projects.*

- *They serve as community leaders.*

- *They are strategic in matters of local government".*

Van der Waldt *et al.* (2007:5) suggests that, in playing their role, municipal councils have a duty to:

- *"use their resources in the best interest of the communities;*

- *be democratic and accountable in the way they govern;*

- *encourage communities to be involved in the affairs of local government; and*

- *provide services to the community and make sure that the environment is safe and healthy".*

Moreover, Van der Waldt *et al.* (2007) further mentions that ward councillors should make sure that the means by which services are rendered match the preferences of the

community as to how these services should be delivered. Councillors are expected to epitomize the interests of the village in the council and to endorse the participation of citizens and community groups in the formulation and delivery of municipal programmes. Stewart and Stoker (1992) point out that traditional leaders should have considerable discretion in the discharge of services to their communities.

2.9 Roles of Traditional Leaders

The new democratic government made attempts to include the institution of traditional leadership into the local government system. Government structures, such as ward councillors and traditional councils, were formulated so as to create participation between these institutions. Conversely, it is still not clear what the roles and functions of traditional leaders are. Although the Constitution (Act 108 of 1996) recognises the importance of traditional leaders, it fails to outline their exact role and function at a local level.

The Constitution recognizes traditional leaders and envisages a role for them in local government. Thus section 21 (1) states:

- *"The institution, status and role of traditional leadership according to customary law, are recognized, subject to the Constitution.*
- *A traditional authority that observes a system of customary law may function subject to any applicable legislation and customs which includes amendments to or repeal of, that legislation or those customs".*

From the section, the details of the role are not expanded any further or defined more clearly. It is vague, what is meant by the "role of traditional leadership in accordance with customary law". Is it traditional customary law as it functioned before its corruption by colonialism and apartheid, or is it customary law as customized by statute and as developed in recent years? It has been contended that it is the latter which is referred to, that is, customary law based on the recent developments and statute. On the other hand, it is documented that traditional leaders under colonialism and apartheid were awarded authority they never had in pre-colonial times and that this kind of authority properly belongs elsewhere.

Traditional leaders have also argued that the stipulation in the constitution is too vague and that the role needs to be clearly spelt out, as has been done for elected local government officials. The failed interpretation of this Constitution provision is problematic as it suggests that the exact interpretation of what should be the role and responsibilities of traditional leadership rests with the central government.

This complex reality is also obvious in the White Paper on Local Government (1998), which avoids taking any strong position on what the new roles and responsibilities of traditional leaders should be within the new democratic order. The White Paper merely defines what the roles and responsibilities had been in the old dispensation. The absence of any new national policy on the definition of the roles and functions of traditional leaders, becomes the basis for conflict and power struggles between the institutions of traditional leaders and ward councillors. Clearly this issue needs to be addressed as both these institutions are said to be institutions of change in their communities.

2.10 Conclusion

In conclusion, it seems of great importance that traditional leaders be recognised as valuable stakeholders in rural areas; however, they must be incorporated into local government systems so as to reduce tensions in policy development processes and programmes. Moreover, a new strategy should be established, which will consist of traditional leaders and ward councillors, where issues/concerns relating to service delivery in their territories could be debated and agreed upon for enhanced improvement of the quality of life of the communities. Traditional leaders should constitute part of the team of leadership that is leading South Africa towards a better life for all. This will ensure that traditional leaders and ward councillors work together as agencies of change in their villages. In addition, a policy should be formulated to give effect to the Constitutional obligation on the role of traditional leaders so as to prevent conflict and better define the roles and functions of both institutions and how they correlate.

CHAPTER THREE: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

3.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter outlines the research design for the study, the methods and instruments used for data collection, the sampling procedure, data analysis techniques, as well as the ethical considerations observed in the study. The chapter elaborates on the research instruments used and the steps followed to ensure validity and reliability of the study. The chapter further highlights any weaknesses in the research process that could have a negative impact on the reliability and validity of the findings. The research was aimed at exploring and understanding the power dynamics between traditional leaders and ward councillors of Tyolomnqa-Ncera village. In order to ensure that the research aim was achieved, that the research problem adequately addressed, and the findings representative as well as reflective of the situation on the ground, data collection was guided by the following three main research questions as earlier stated:

- What role do the institutions of traditional leaders and ward councilors of Tyolomnqa-Ncera village play in the governance, development processes and the delivery of development services to its community?

- How effective has the Eastern Cape local government been in managing the integration of the institutions of traditional leadership into the existing structures of governance?

- What is the nature of the relations between the traditional leaders and ward councilor in Tyolomnqa-Ncera village and to what extent do these relations affect the delivery of development services in the area?

As indicated above, the whole process of data collection used in the study is explained and the choices made justified in line with Mouton's (1996) and Stevens' observation (2001), that traditions or approaches use different methods of collecting data, but no approach prescribes nor automatically rejects any particular method.

3.2 RESEARCH DESIGN

Research design is the overall plan of how one intends conducting a study (Opie, 2004:74). Additionally, according to Bless and Higson-Smith (1995:69), "*research design is the planning of a scientific research from the first to the last step. It is a programme to guide the researcher in collecting, analysing and interpreting observed facts*". The research design therefore serves as the plan for the study that provides the overall framework for collecting the data, outlines the detailed steps in the study and provides guidelines for systematic data gathering (Strauss & Corbin, 1990:17). The research design has the research's overall plan for obtaining answers to the research questions guiding the study. Bruns and Grove (2001:223) state that designing a study helps researchers to plan and implement the study in a way that will help them obtain the intended results, thus increasing the chances of obtaining information that could be associated with the real situation. This study uses a qualitative research design as this allows the researcher to interact and try and understand the meanings that people attach to their social being (an insider perspective).

3.3 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Research methodology is defined as a process to develop or refine methods of obtaining and analysing the data (Polit *et. al.,* 2004:2723). Research methodology is the tool of the actual research. This includes methods, instruments and procedures of sampling, data collection, and data analysis and the formulation and presentation of recommendations. According to Hysamen (1994:163), there are three different levels of research methodology:

- *"The creation and development of techniques and strategies to collect data;*

- *The development of methods to investigate and improve the psychometric properties, namely reliability and validity of data obtained by means of these techniques; and*

- *The statistical analysis of the data collected by means of such techniques".*

For the purpose of this study, an interpretative approach, using a qualitative methodological paradigm was chosen because as Creswell (2003) argues qualitative research explores and understands a central phenomenon which is under investigation. Shank (2002:5) defines qualitative research as "a form of systematic empirical inquiry into meaning". He further states that "systematic" means "planned, ordered and public", following rules agreed upon by members of the qualitative research community. More so, Shank states that this type of inquiry is grounded in the world of experience as the researcher tries to understand how others make sense of their experience. Additionally, Lincoln (2000) claims that qualitative research involves an interpretive and naturalistic approach. In this case Lincoln (2000) means that qualitative researchers attempt to

make sense of, or to interpret, phenomena in terms of the meanings people bring to them.

Qualitative approaches focus on phenomena that occur in natural settings (real world). This method unlike the quantitative method which uses figures to understand people's reactions or emotions, finds meaning in understanding people's reactions or emotions, attitudes, motivations, values, and perceptions (Singleton et al*.,* 1993:91). The advantages of using qualitative research for this study include the following which were mentioned by Conger (1998: 3)

- *"flexibility to follow unexpected ideas during research and explore processes effectively;*
- *sensitivity to contextual factors;*
- *ability to study symbolic dimensions and social meaning;*
- *increased opportunities"*

According to Bryman (et al, 1998) the following are the advantages of using qualitative research study.

> *"to develop empirically supported new ideas and theories;*

> *for in-depth and longitudinal explorations of phenomena; and*

> *For more relevance and interest for the researcher".*

In summary, the study will utilise data obtained through a qualitative methodology to understand better the views of the community members, the traditional leaders, ward councillors and municipal council officials of Tyolomnqa-Ncera village under Buffalo City

Municipality in East London, regarding the work relations between traditional leaders and ward councillor, their roles and the impact of their power dynamics on service delivery and governance of the area.

3.3.1 Population of study

The research site was chosen to be the community of Tyolomnqa-Ncera village which is situated 35 kilometres from East London City under the Buffalo City Municipality. Tyolomnqa is comprised of the tribal land area of Ncera, the proclaimed Reserve of Mount Coke and the coastal towns of Kidd's Beach and Kayser's Beach.

According to Bless and Higson-Smith (2000:85) the study population "is the entire set of objects or people which is the focus of the researcher and about which the researcher wants to determine". Tyolomnqa-Ncera area is bounded along the western and north-western edges of the demarcated Buffalo City Municipality; to the north by the Buffalo River; to the south-east by the Indian Ocean and to the East by the Gxulu River (Mudefi, 2011: 8). This territory includes: ward 1. Ward 21, a portion of ward 2 and a portion of ward 18 and 32. For the purpose of this study, the researcher selected one ward which is ward 32. Under ward 32 the researcher chose village 4, known as Ncera, village 1 known as Tyolomnqa and Kwa-Sandile all of which are under one councillor but have two different Traditional leaders ruling these villages. The area was selected for this study because it has two traditional leaders and a ward councillor, who are the target subjects of the study. The majority of the population are unemployed, with very little education and live in high levels of poverty. The researcher's aim was to understand the working relationship of the two leadership structures of this area and to solicit the views of the community members regarding the impact of the power dynamics

between the ward councillor and traditional leaders on the development of their communities and the provision of services to the area.

3.3.2 Sampling technique and Sample size

The target population of the study comprised of traditional leaders, ward councillors, municipal officials and community members of Tyolomnq-Ncera village. Due to limited resources and time constraints, it was not feasible for the researcher to study the whole population, so the study used a sample of the population. Sampling is one of the important steps in the research plan, because it determines the participants for the research. Sampling refers to a process of selecting a portion of the population to represent the entire population (Barbie, 1998:164). Terre Blanche et al (2006:105) states that *"sampling is the selection of research participants from an entire population, involves decisions about which people, settings, events, behaviours, and/or social processes to observe."* The sample provides data that is used as a basis for answering the research questions or testing of the hypothesis. Bless and Higson-Smith (1995:36) states advantages of sampling as follows:

- *"Gathering data on a sample is less time consuming;*

- *Gathering data on a sample is less costly, since the costs of the researcher are proportional to the number of hours spent on data collection; and*

- *Sampling may be the only practicable method of data collection".*

For the purpose of this study, purposive sampling was used to select respondents who satisfied the criteria to be included in the study. Barbie (1998:166) states that a purposive sampling technique is characterized by identifying access points or settings where subjects could be more easily reached, and by selecting especially

46

knowledgeable subjects. In purposeful sampling, the researcher selects particular elements from the population that will be representative or informative about the topic (Babbie 1998:166). This type of sampling was appropriate as the researcher sought to select respondents that were knowledgeable and well informed about the power dynamics issues between the ward councillor and the traditional leaders of the studied village. Purposive sampling was used to select respondents for the focus group discussions, in-depth interviews and key informant interviews. Three focus groups of ten respondents, were used by the study and their access and getting them together was facilitated by community members themselves. In-depth interviews were conducted with the two traditional leaders and the ward councillor of the area while key informant interviews were conducted with the council speaker of Buffalo city Municipality and the inter-governmental relations officer from South African Local Government Association (SALGA).

3.3.3 Data collection techniques
According to Mouton (1996:67) data collection involves applying the measurement to the sample or cases selected for the investigation.

"We must constantly remind ourselves that the human senses (our eyes, ears, and occasionally even our taste and touch) are our "first-order" measuring instruments if they are qualitative (ibid). On the basis of our visual auditory and tactile observations and perceptions, we begin to classify responses, people, actions and events".

The first qualitative data collection technique that was used was focus group discussions. Three focus group discussions were conducted with participants drawn from the community members (young and old, male and females) of Tyolomnqa-Ncera village under ward 32. Focus group interviews were held in the areas' community halls. According to Barbour (2008:134), focus groups are often used in order to access participants that are often viewed as difficult to access such as people who are out of touch with services, members of minority ethnic groups, among other things. The focus groups were used to examine the wide range of issues related to the institution of traditional leadership and local government. This technique also allowed respondents to elaborate in detail and build upon each other's responses. Therefore the respondents explained in depth their understanding of the roles of these institutions, their relations and the effects these have on the development and provision of services in the area. The focus groups also provided the researcher with the opportunity to observe the interaction of participants on the topic in a limited time frame (Babbie & Mouton, 2001:292). The researcher was able to assess the interaction of the participants picking up on the highly sensitive areas and controversial subject matter.

The other qualitative method that was used were in-depth interviews conducted with the two traditional leaders and ward councillor of the Tyolomnqa-Ncera village and key informant interviews with two municipal officials, the two municipal officers chosen for the study were relevant as they work closely with traditional leaders and are assigned to monitor both the institutions of traditional leaders and ward councillors. An interview guide was used as a form of guideline for the researcher. In-depth-interviews were important to this research as they unearthed rich insightful information on the

experiences of community members because of their flexibility and probing nature. Bryman (2004) asserts that qualitative interviews tend to be flexible, responding to the direction in which interviewees take the interview and perhaps adjusting the emphases in the research as a result of significant issues that emerge in the course of interviews. "In-depth interviews are vital techniques in the qualitative approach when conducting exploratory studies to reveal and fully understand certain phenomenon such as what, how and why" (scribed website, undated).

Relationship between research questions and methods used

Research Question	Methods and Data Sources	Justification
1. What role do the institutions of traditional leaders and ward councillors of Tyolomnqa-Ncera play in the governance and development of its community	FGD- three focus group discussions with community members of each of the selected areas which consisted of 10 participants.	FGD-enabled the researcher to gather rich, qualitative data-views, discussions and insight from the participants.
	Interviews- with traditional leaders and ward councillors. Key informants- two governmental officials. .	These participants are deemed to be knowledgeable about the roles and functions of these institutions on development of the community.
2. How effective has the (Eastern Cape) local government been in	interviews- participants who are more knowledgeable about the roles and functions of these	Interviews with key-informants were a suitable tool to investigate what local government office have

managing to integrate the institutions of traditional leadership into the existing structures of governance.	institutions that is- traditional leaders, ward councillors together with the key informants that is the two governmental officials	done in strengthening the relationship between these institutions to ensure that they work together for the good of their communities. Traditional leaders and ward concillors were also interviewed to get their perspectives on this issue
3. What is the nature of relations between traditional leaders and ward councillor and to what extent do these relations affect development in Tyolomnqa-Ncera.	Three FGD- with community members of Tyolomnqa-Ncera Village.	FGD- assisted the researcher to probe community members on their understanding of the roles and responsibilities of both these institutions, and also the effects on development of the community members.
	Interviews- with the traditional leader and ward councillors. Municipality official and an official from SALGA	Interviews-Traditional leaders and ward councillors were interviewed so as to get their view on the nature of the relationship between each other. Municipal official and SALGA official were interviewed so as to get their proposed solutions to the challenges experienced by both the institutions of traditional leaders and ward councillor.

3.4 DATA ANALYSIS

De Vos, Strydom, Fouche & Delport (2011:397) state that data analysis involves *"reducing the volume of raw information, sifting significance from trivia, identifying significant patterns and constructing a framework for communicating the essence of what the data reveal."* The data for this research study was analysed by means of interpretative analysis using thematic content analysis of the data collected. The researcher managed the data through a process of coding. This process involves "marking different sections as being instances of, or relevant to, one or more of your themes" (Terre Blanche, 2006:324). The data collected was then induced into themes by looking at the material or data collected and identifying the emerging principles that naturally underlie the material (Terre Blanche, 2006:323). This process assisted the researcher to generate themes emerging from the data collected and to group them into common themes pertaining to the research questions. This was achieved by looking at the research questions and the kind of answers that were given to each question and if there are any common ground between participants in answering the question.

The credibility and trustworthiness of the data was ensured through the use of various data collection instruments such as individual in-depth interviews, focus groups and key informant interviews also increased the credibility and trustworthiness of the study.

3.5 Ethical considerations

Babbie and Mouton (2001:520) describe ethics as associated with morality and dealing with matters of right and wrong.

The researcher asked the traditional leader and ward councillor of the village for permission to access the community before commencing data collection. All participants were informed about the aims of the research and that the study was being conducted for academic purposes. Participants were informed that their participation was voluntary. The researcher tried to minimize any kind of discomfort during and after interviews, including psychological or emotional harm by informing the respondents that they could terminate their involvement in the study in case of any form of discomfort. On anonymity, all respondents were assured that their identity and responses remained anonymous. On confidentiality, before participating in the research, the respondents were also assured that the information they would provide would be treated with confidentiality. All ethical considerations required by the UFHREC (University of Fort Hare Ethics Committee) were observed during the entire research process.

3.6 Limitations of the study

The research focused on the area of Tyolomnqa-Ncera Village which is under the Buffalo City Municipality regarding the clash of power, roles and responsibilities between traditional leaders and ward councillors. The shortcomings that were expected included unwillingness of both traditional leaders and ward councillor to participate without bias in the study. However, the researcher managed to interview both parties even though finding the right times to interview them was cumbersome due to their busy schedules. The researcher anticipated lack of cooperation in revealing information relating to their relations and its effects on service delivery due to power dynamics concerns but the researcher managed to interview both parties without much difficulty.

The researcher remained objective, despite the awareness of the possibility of both parties withholding information, at the same time trying to blame and point fingers at each other. In order to overcome these shortcomings, the researcher clearly informed the participants involved about the intentions of the study. A supporting declaration letter from the university was issued that clearly stated the objectives of the study.

3.7 Conclusion

This chapter has presented the research design and methodology of the study. The next chapter will present the findings of this study which sought to answer the question of the roles and functions of traditional leaders and ward councillors of the selected village/ ward.

CHAPTER FOUR: POWER DYNAMICS BETWEEN TRADITIONAL LEADERS AND WARD COUNCILLORS: IMPLICATIONS FOR DEVELOPMENT

4.1 Introduction

From the preceding chapter on literature review it is apparent that power struggles between traditional leaders and ward councillors exist and can hinder the development of their communities. This chapter presents the findings of the results of the study which sought to examine the power dynamics between traditional leaders and the ward councillor and its implication for development in Tyolomnqa-Ncera village.

The research questions the study sought answers to were:

- What role do the institutions of traditional leaders and ward councillors of Tyolomnqa-Ncera village play in the governance, development processes and delivery of development services to its community?

- How effective has the Eastern Cape local government been in managing the integration of traditional leaders into the existing structures of governance?

- What is the nature of relations between traditional leaders and ward councillors in Tyolomnqa-Ncera village and to what extent do these relations affect the delivery of development services in the area?

Data for the study was obtained through several different stakeholders. Structured interviews were conducted with key informants, including one South African Local Government Association (SALGA) officer, two local government officials (from the Local Government and Traditional Affairs Department); in-depth interviews were conducted with two traditional leaders for Tyolomnqa-Ncera village and the ward councillor

responsible for Tyolomnqa-Ncera village; and three focus group discussions were conducted which consisted of 10 community members from the village under study. Three villages of ward 32 under two traditional leaders and one ward councillor leadership were considered for this study, 10 community members in each of these three villages made up the focus group discussion, composed of ages ranging from mid-twenties and above. Focus group discussion members consisted of both males and females, young and old. This is because the researcher aimed at getting both genders' perspectives and also to gauge the views of the different generations. From the responses attained and presented below, the study revealed the ways in which the ongoing conflict between traditional leaders and the ward councillor of Tyolomnqa-Ncera village has hindered development in this area. This conflict has led to displeasure and confusion among community members, who are disillusioned with the new democratic South Africa that promised all South Africans a better quality of life through the Constitution of the country.

4.2 Results

The results reported below are organised according to the themes developed from the research questions. Some responses are reported verbatim in italics as provided by the participants.

4.2.1 Definition of traditional leaders and ward councilors

A clear understanding and identification of what constitutes a traditional leader and ward councillor needed to be established before trying to examine the structure and roles of the two institutions. A question in this regard (see Appendix A nos. 1 and 2) was posed

to the members of the focus groups so as to establish whether community members make a clear distinction between the two, as well as understanding the relevance of their structures in the new democratic dispensation of South Africa.

Community members could clearly distinguish between traditional leaders and ward councillors. Traditional leadership was defined as an ancient institution of governance. A traditional leader was said to be an individual who, by virtue of his ancestry, occupies the throne of an area and who has been appointed to it in accordance with the customs and traditions of the area and has traditional authority over the people of that area. Community members stressed that, unlike other government officials, traditional leaders are not elected but born and, in other words, the status of traditional leadership is ascribed not achieved.

"He is not elected but born into chieftaincy and they govern their people". (Respondent 8 interviewed at ward 32 Tyolomnqa village, 16/08/13).

"It is a kind of governance or leadership for rural areas". (Respondent 6 interviewed at ward 32, Ncera village, 16/08/13).

A ward councillor, on the other hand, was said to be an official elected to represent an area. A councillor is viewed as a person who represents a particular political party. Community members vote or elect people who will stand for them in terms of the municipal structures (Act no. 117 of 1998), and the person who receives the most votes in a ward is then awarded the position of councillor for the ward. It was stressed that, unlike traditional leaders, ward councillors are not born but elected (achieved status).

This is said to be the new structure of government that came about with the new democratic South Africa.

"Community members elect ward councillors and they serve for a certain period, then they move out of power after that period of time is over and we have to elect another person to be our ward councillor. Unlike chiefs, they are not elected; only when the chief passes away then his eldest son has to step into chieftaincy". (Respondent 07 interviewed at ward 32, Kwa-Sandile village, 16/08/13).

A general consensus from the participants showed that they could clearly distinguish between a traditional leader and what he stands for, and a ward councillor and what he stands for. Accordingly, the community members were aware of the roles of these structures in the governance of their areas.

4.2.2 Roles and functions of traditional leaders

After establishing the community members' understanding of what a traditional leader and a ward councillor are, the study was interested to find out what respondents saw the roles and functions of traditional leaders are in post 1994 South Africa. The respondents stated that the roles of traditional leaders were now too complicated to differentiate from those of ward councillors. Community members stated that the roles of traditional leaders were easy to pin-point in the past. One respondent went on to say that in the past traditional leaders regulated issues of land in rural areas; they dealt with peoples' personal problems; they were in charge of land distribution; they exercised legislative, executive and judicial powers; and they helped to maintain and ensure the

customs and culture of their people or village. However, in the present time it is difficult to clearly identify what traditional leaders do.

The following are the functions the community members identified as the roles and functions of traditional leaders in the present South Africa:

- They are responsible for any customary events/functions that take place in the village.
- They look after their people and assist them if they are facing challenges.
- They take care of community members and/or their people's social needs.

"Chiefs have to ensure development of their people and their village". (Respondent 3 interviewed in ward 32, Ncera village, 16/08/13).

Respondents particularly pointed out that traditional leaders still have exclusive rights over land, and that it is their role to allocate land to their people and to monitor anything that has to do with land.

"This is the chief's land and the chief has the right over it". (Respondent 2 interviewed in ward 32, Tyolomnqa village, 16/08/13).

Although they point out certain roles as mentioned above, the general observation was that there is a great deal of confusion among many of them in defining the roles of traditional leaders, which, they stated, were clearly defined in the past but have tended to get confusing with the coming of the present state of South Africa where government seeks to integrate traditional leadership with that of the ward councillors.

One respondent argued that traditional leaders should facilitate development:

"They should develop our area and bring change". (Respondent 1 interviewed in ward 32, Ncera village, 16/08/13).

Some community members felt that chiefs are also obligated to bring development to their people and take care of their people.

It can be concluded that the question of the functions of traditional leaders versus those of ward councillors still remains unanswered among many community members in Tyolomnqa-Ncera village. Therefore, if community members of this area, who are subjects of the rulership of these structures, remain confused as to what the roles of such structures are, issue is then taken with the effectiveness of the kind of leadership existing in these villages at present.

It was of great interest for the study to find out whether the traditional leaders of this area themselves understood what their roles are in the community. Accordingly, the same question was raised with them, especially on the issue of the delivery of development services. Confusion was also evident in both the responses of the traditional leaders. Both of them stated that their roles were more apparent and prominent in the past. With the new governing system of the country, their roles have been blurred. Their response has been to drift along with the system.

Traditional leader A stated:

"I don't know what I am supposed to do so I just follow our past roles and functions. I do what I feel is right and appropriate for my people". (interviewed on 16/08/13).

Both traditional leaders felt that their roles were to uplift their communities, deal with any problems that their community members experience be it petty offences or serious disputes, look for agricultural land "*amasimi*", allocate land to community members who want to practice farming, deal with customary issues that arise in the village, for example, pregnancy out of wedlock and child maintenance issues.

Traditional leader B stated*:*

"It is hard to work in this new era because as a traditional leader you don't know what to do or where to stop when trying to help your community members/people". (interviewed on 16/08/13).

An official from the South African Local Government Association (SALGA) stated that there is no clear policy or document that clearly defines the roles of traditional leaders and they recognise that this is a problem which needs attention, especially when these institutions are required to work together for the betterment of their communities, people and their country. "*What we as local government has done so far is to compile a small document which is called guidelines that govern both these institutions and somehow gives structure to how they operate".* (interviewed on 16/08/13). However, even in those guidelines which they have formulated it is still not clear what the roles of traditional leaders are. One set principle in these guidelines is that traditional leaders have to be present at council meetings to listen to what is being done; however, they do not have voting power and this poses a great challenge which needs attention.

The ward councillor's opinion on the same matter was:

"I don't know what the roles of traditional leaders are as this is not part of my scope of work, they do their stuff and I do mine". (interviewed on 16/08/13).

In conclusion, not the traditional leaders, the councillor nor the community members know the specific roles and functions assigned to the structure of traditional leadership in local government. They may have ideas here and there of what these roles may be but these are not official, nor are they unquestionable!

4.2.3 Roles and functions of ward councilors

Just as defining the roles of traditional leaders was confusing, so were those of the ward councillors. The greatest challenge was differentiating between traditional leaders' roles/functions and those of ward councillors. Community members saw no difference in the roles of these institutional local government structures. Respondents stated that these institutions do the same things and have the same roles.

Respondent four (4) of village Ncera Village stated that the ward councillor is also responsible for bringing development to his community and the people under his leadership.

"These people have to work together to develop their community". (Respondent 10 interviewed in ward 32, Ncera village on 16/08/13).

When respondents were asked to clearly differentiate the roles of ward councillors from those of traditional leaders, development services was the main subject. Although these roles were linked specifically to traditional leaders, many members of the focus group discussions and others could not distinguish those of the traditional leaders from those

of the ward councillors. Confusion seemed to be apparent on what the roles of traditional leaders and ward councillors are.

The ward councillor responded by stating that he knew his roles because they are stipulated in the policies and similar documents that guide him. He stated that councillors are the elected representatives of the people and are mandated as elected representatives to make decisions on behalf of their constituencies. He insisted that councillors have the responsibilities to encourage public participation in local government by providing their constituents with information and passing on people's concerns to the municipal council.

My roles and functions are stipulated in the South African Constitution and the Municipal Structures Act and are as follows:

- *"Giving ward residents progress report, explaining the decisions of the council in committing resources to development projects and programs affecting them.*
- *Assessing whether the municipalities' programs and plans are having their intended impacts.*
- *Assessing whether services are being delivered fairly, effectively and in a sustainable way.*
- *Determining whether capacity projects are being committed in accordance with the IDP.*
- *Conveying important information from council to residents".*

"What we do is we serve as the interface between the citizens we represent and the municipal officials who design and implement development". (interviewed 08/08/2013).

The speaker of the Buffalo City municipal council stated that a councillor's job is not only to serve as the voice of the people for the expression of their community needs but also to act as a watchdog and ensure the municipality implements policies to address the needs of citizens. The respondent further mentioned that the ward councillor acts as the chairperson of his/her ward and is required to raise concerns to council on behalf of ward members.

4.2.4 Relationship between traditional leaders and the ward councilor in Tyolomnqa-Ncera village

After discussions around the roles and responsibilities of both institutions, that is, traditional leaders and ward councillor, the study sought to find out the nature of relations between the two institutions and to examine the implications/effects of these relations on governance and the delivery of development services.

The focus group 1 respondents reported that traditional leaders and the ward councillor are supposed to be working together harmoniously as both aim towards developing their communities and the people thereof. They pointed out that relations between these institutions are negative as they seem to be pulling in two different directions.

Focus group 2 respondents stated that the relationship is so negative that a ward councillor would sometimes call a meeting on the same day and time as that scheduled by the traditional leader. This causes confusion as the same community members are supposed to attend both meetings and so they end up having to be divided such that some attend the councillor's meeting while others attend the traditional leader's meeting. The participant claimed that this has negative repercussions for development

63

because one has to attend one meeting which means missing out on the agenda of the other meeting yet both the agendas discussed in these meetings are important. In this regard community members miss out on other development activities as they are denied the opportunity to sign their names on the register of that meeting.

This seems to be the general consensus of the community members of Tyolomnqa-Ncera village.

"They are supposed to be working together but it's not happening here, I have never seen them together". (Respondent 9 interviewed in ward 32, in Kwa-Sandile village 16/08/13).

"He sometimes call meetings with us community members and yet there is a running meeting for that day, this means that these people don't communicate with each other". (Respondent 5 interviewed in ward 32, in Tyolomnqa village, 16/08/13).

The traditional leaders' response to this matter was that there is practically no relationship between them and the councillor. Traditional leader B stated:

"The councillor would hold meetings and I as traditional leader won't be invited let alone know about the meeting, therefore we would not attend, but what becomes a great challenge is that when things don't go well as the councillor might have planned for the people, the community members of the village would come to us as traditional leaders and complain and we would be confused because we were not part of the meeting in the beginning. Even when I call him to meetings, the councillor would say that he is busy therefore he cannot attend. He sometimes sends a delegate to stand in for him

and this becomes a problem as you find that some of the things we discuss need his presence and not a delegate".

The ward councillor's opinion on the matter was that the relationship is not good; however, this does not stop him from doing his job. He stated that this is because he is guided by the policies which do not force him to work with traditional leaders although he tries and involves them in decision making and when there are disagreements or tensions, he stays out of them and concentrates on his job. He says:

"You cannot please everyone, so I just do my job".

The local government official argued that the relationship between these institutions is not good and this is not a new thing to them as local government. This is, however, not a provincial matter that provincial officials can fix but is a central government problem, that is, policy makers need to look into this issue and formulate a guiding policy for traditional leaders clearly stipulating their roles as there is a need for both these institutions to be integrated.

He had the following to say about relations between traditional leadership and the ward councillor structure:

"Relations will never be smooth between these institutions unless their roles and functions are clearly defined. This struggle dates back to the past and it's not something that can be fixed overnight but it will take time and we as local government are working towards that". (council speaker 08/08/2013).

From the above reports, there is clear tension between the institutions of traditional leaders and ward councillors. As highlighted by one respondent, these institutions seem to be pulling in different directions. One of the community members pointed out that "*When both traditional leaders and ward councillors are present together on municipal council meetings one might be convinced that they work well together however this is not the case*".

In trying to explain the basis for these tensions, traditional leader A, stated that from her own perspective, the tension is based on the fact that the ward councillor does not want to work with traditional leaders because he solely wants to "claim glory from the people." She also believed that ward councillors do not understand or are not sure as to what the purpose of traditional leaders especially in the Eastern Cape is, or they don't 'see it'.

Traditional leader A indicated that it also seems as if ward councillors fear losing their power, so for them partnering with traditional leaders will jeopardize their power and their position in their communities. The traditional leader believes that this tension between the two institutions can also be caused by the fact that ward councillors are affiliated to political parties and they carry out specific political agendas which might be in conflict with those of the traditional leaders.

The ward councillor stated that there is tension between him and the traditional leaders because traditional leaders always raise the issue of ownership of land when it comes to implementation of developmental projects in the villages, and this becomes a challenge when working with them. He stressed again that he is not forced to work with them; therefore, when he senses resistance he just focuses on his work. He stated that

he recognises that traditional leaders are themselves fighting for recognition in the new democratic South Africa and that government should formulate a clear policy that guides both these institutions if they are to co-operate.

4.2.5 Traditional leaders and ward councilor relations and their impact on development service delivery

Due to the negative relations between traditional leaders and the ward councillor, focus group participants felt that development and delivery of services were hindered. The issue of holding more than one meetings on the same day and time, as highlighted above, had the implication that community members, especially the needy, miss out on being updated with regard to the list of development services they are entitled to and which would be on the agendas of the meetings they miss due to the clashes between those meetings. This means that they, as beneficiaries of the services, don't participate in the decisions taken at those meetings which concern their own development. They mentioned that some people will not receive certain beneficial information or/and resources, for example, an RDP houses, because their names were not included on the list or the service may be delayed. According to them:

We still do not have proper roads, houses, development projects; some of us don't even have water or electricity. This goes to show that development is indeed hindered and we need local government to intervene and help us. (respondent 5, ward 32, Ncera village, 08/08/2013).

The speaker of the municipal council said that development tends to be hindered or takes a long process in areas where both these institutions are present because they have to negotiate and clear out a lot of conflicting issues.

The ward councillor also added stating that development is hindered because, when they want to embark on development projects for the community, they clash with the traditional leader who claims that this is her land, so development becomes a long process.

Challenges:

The main challenge that the ward councillor experienced was reported to be the issue of demarcation. This is because, in many of the districts, a ward councillor might have about ten villages under his service, three of which may be under the ruler-ship of one king while the remaining seven are under another king. Accordingly, there will be one councillor for the ten villages but two chiefs, with ruling power of certain villages within these ten villages. This becomes a problem when facilitating development projects as one chief would be willing to work with the councillor to implement the required road or whatever project, yet the other would not. This leaves one in a situation where some villages, under the same councillor, have an area that is developed and the others don't. This sparks conflict amongst the community members.

The same issue of demarcation was raised by traditional leaders as a big challenge that they are facing. Traditional leader A portrayed demarcation as *paraffin that is added to the fire,* saying that *already "we are facing challenges but with this demarcation, things just got worse in their communities".*

4.2.6 Level of success in the integration of the two institutions by the Eastern Cape local government

Traditional leaders in this area stated that there has not been much done to integrate the institutions of traditional leaders with ward councillors. They acknowledge that an induction was conducted by the municipality together with SALGA where the ward councillor was introduced to their community/village; however, there was no further implementation of the integration approach initiated to reconcile these institutions. They also acknowledged that they do sit in council meetings where they participate but the argument they raised is that they do not have voting powers in these council meeting:

"We are just there so they can report to government that we participate but in actual fact there is nothing that we do there, we are there just to listen to what they say, all we can do is swallow it whether we like it or not" (SALGA official).

They pointed out that they want their voices to be heard. They also want their place in the new democratic government not just to attend meetings as observers but to participate fully in the decisions made. They mentioned that this could only be done if there was a policy guiding them as traditional leaders which they could refer to when fighting for their rights as the traditional house.

The ward councillor confirmed that, indeed, traditional leaders do sit in council meetings but added that this is a way to incorporate them within local government. However, to an observer, this does not appear to be enough. There is still a lot that needs attention regarding the roles and functions of traditional leaders, particularly regarding how these institutions could co-operate for purposes of development of their communities.

The SALGA official also stated that an induction was conducted with both these institutions to introduce the new councillor to the community members and traditional leaders. She also confirmed that traditional leaders do sit in council meetings and that this is what they have started doing in order to address the issue of integration of traditional leaders into local government. The induction in itself is not enough as it is merely an introduction or a way to introduce the new elected councillor to its community members and the traditional leaders. Besides that there is no other way in integrating and educating both these institutions on how to cooperate and work together. However, an argument raised by a SALGA official was based on the fact that the induction process is not a policy but a programme implemented only by the Eastern Cape local government to try and mend relationships between these institutions. Therefore, this highlights the failure of government in integrating the traditional leadership and ward councillor institutions. SALGA and municipal officials acknowledge that this is not enough but it is the start of a good relationship and they stress the need for a policy which will clearly define the roles and responsibilities of these institutions and how they are meant to cooperate together.

4.3 Conclusion

This chapter has presented the research results of the study. The next chapter will discuss and analyse the findings of this study which sought to reveal the challenges and conflict dynamics between traditional leaders and the ward councillor of Tyolomnqa-Ncera village. The results reveal that the issue of the roles and functions of traditional leaders and the ward councillor is a pressing issue that needs attention at Tyolomnqa-Ncera village. The issue of who is entitled to facilitate development between a traditional

leader and a ward councillor is a confusing matter as community members cannot differentiate between the function of a traditional leader from that of a ward councillor. This is a major hindrance to the delivery of services in this area, leaving community members disadvantaged. There is a lot that needs attention and local government's intervention is crucial. This study hopes to raise the issues that are of great concern to the community members of this village and, in the process, might point out possible solutions to these issues.

CHAPTER FIVE: DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS

5.1 Introduction

This chapter presents a discussion of the findings of the study. The discussion follows the thematic order as in the previous chapter (chapter four). The main themes were derived from the research questions and objectives of the study. A few were derived from participants' reports.

5.2 Definition of traditional leader and ward councilor

The findings regarding participants' understanding of traditional leaders and ward councillors revealed that there was clear knowledge of what a traditional leader and a ward councillor are, and that there was a clear definition of a traditional leader and a ward councillor. Traditional leadership was defined as an ancient institution of governance: a traditional leader was defined as an individual who, by virtue of his ancestry, occupies the throne of an area and is appointed in accordance with the customs and traditions of this specific area and has authority over the people of that area. Community members pointed out that traditional leader are not elected but born; in other words the status of traditional leadership is ascribed not achieved.

Community members defined a ward councillor as an official elected by the community members of an area or village to represent them in terms of the Municipal Structures Act No 117 of 1998. Unlike traditional leaders, ward councillors are not born but are elected to serve for a certain period.

Rural community members of the villages under study have immense attachment to the traditional leadership institution and view it as a notable aspect of their community.

This finding is in agreement with Atkinson and Reitzes (1998:107) who argue that traditional leaders still have notable support and recognition within rural populations. They further argue that failure to include them in meaningful ways will seriously impact on development in rural communities and is a recipe for conflict and violence.

For many South Africans, despite their experience of betrayal by traditional leaders when they collaborated with their white masters under the apartheid era, they still consider traditional leadership as part of their culture and identity. Thus, as the ANC recognised in 1988, South Africa cannot abandon traditional leadership but has to find a way to incorporate their leadership into its new system of government. Cele (2008:9) states that when dealing with the question of relevance of the traditional leadership system in South Africa, "there are three critical considerations that must be taken into account: the commitment of government to incorporate the traditional system and the establishment of the Department of Traditional Affairs, the question of identity and culture, and, lastly, the globalization factor" (Cele, 2008:9).

The above considerations highlight the ongoing debate between the neo-liberal and integration schools of thought as elaborated on earlier in the theoretical framework. Followers of the neo-liberal school of thought argue against the involvement of traditional structures in modern governance. To these scholars, traditional authority by its very nature compromises the democratic project under way in many African countries (Mamdani, 1996). These scholars contend that chieftaincy was corrupted by

the colonial state and by the clientelism of the postcolonial mode of governance, that the populations under traditional authorities lived as 'subjects' rather than as 'citizens' of the state, and that democratic governance cannot be achieved while such systems continue to exist.

The integration school of thought, on the other hand, argues that integrating traditional governance into modern structures of governance would ensure effective and efficient governance (Skinner, 2007).

Gildenhuys, Fox and Wissink (1991:124) state that traditional leadership and ward councillors are essential as there are different groups of people who believe in either both or one of these institutions. They further state that the institution of traditional leadership is popular amongst people in rural areas who are at the forefront of development. Therefore, finding a way to incorporate the institution of traditional leadership into the new structures of local government can enhance and facilitate development of the country. What these scholars touch on is a pressing issue of roles and functions of the two institutions in the new democratic South Africa.

However, an understanding of these institutions and how they come into power is not sufficient for development; the focal point is knowing the roles and functions of these institutions as a community member, and knowing who to turn to when needing help and development facilities, hence the emphasis on this subject as discussed below.

5.3 Roles and functions of traditional leaders and ward councillors

Distinguishing between the roles and functions of the two government institutions, namely those of traditional leaders and of ward councillors has proved to be a challenge to the community members and study participants of Tyolomnqa-Ncera village. When asked what the roles and functions of these institutions are, focus group discussion participants, traditional leaders, the ward councillor and key informants expressed confusion and could not clearly distinguish between the two sets of roles and functions. It was clear that participants felt it was easier to identify the past roles and functions of traditional leaders than the present ones. Some of these past roles were that traditional leaders were responsible for land allocation and dealing with community members' personal problems, etc.

In all focus groups, the role of traditional leaders was of great concern as it was claimed that all the power and dignity historically assigned to traditional leaders were removed by the legislative framework that came about after the 1994 elections. The older generation, that is, the traditional leaders, headmen and "indunas" noted the importance of recognising traditional leaders, stating that traditional leaders and ward councillors should be treated equally and be on the same podium as elected councillors. Participants feel that development in rural areas should be monitored by both traditional leaders and ward councillors; however, for this to take place it was stressed that government should intervene and integrate these institutions.

"These people have to work together to develop their community", it was reported. The South African Constitution recognises traditional leaders and envisages a role for them in local government but their roles and functions are not clearly defined. The White Paper on Local Government (1998) also recognises this institution but avoids taking any

strong position on what the roles and functions of traditional leaders are. The Traditional Leadership Government Framework Act No 41 of 2003 and other applicable legislation recognise and regulate the roles of traditional leaders but in an ambiguous manner.

5.3.1 The Traditional Leadership Government Framework

The Traditional Leadership Government Framework, Act No. 41 of 2003, states that a traditional leader performs the functions provided for in terms of the customary law and customs of the traditional community concerned, and in applicable legislation.

5.3.2 The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa

"The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa states that national legislation may provide for a role for traditional leadership as an institution at local level on matters affecting local communities. To deal with matters relating to traditional leadership, the role of traditional leaders, customary law and the customs of communities observing a system of customary law:

(a) National or provincial legislation may provide for the establishment of houses of traditional leaders; and
(b) National legislation may establish a council of traditional leaders".

5.3.3 The White Paper on Local Government

The White Paper on Local Government (1998) avoids taking any strong position on what the new roles and responsibilities of traditional leaders should be within the new democratic order. It merely highlights the roles and responsibilities as follows:

Acting as head of the traditional authority, and as such exercising limited legislative power and certain executive and administrative powers, such as:

- *"Presiding over customary law courts and maintaining law and order;*

- *Consulting with traditional communities through imbizos (meetings);*

- *Assisting members of the community in their dealings with the state;*

- *Advising government on traditional affairs through the houses and council of traditional leaders;*

- *Convening meetings to consult with the community on needs and priorities and providing information;*

- *Protecting cultural values and providing a sense of community in their areas through a communal social frame of references;*

- *Being a spokesperson generally for their communities;*

- *Being symbols of unity in the community; and*

- *Being custodians and protectors of the community's customs and general welfare".*

As the researcher, it is my opinion that much needs to be done in order to educate and empower traditional leaders and ward councillors to ensure co-operation and participation between the institutions so as to enhance development and service delivery. This unclear definition and understanding of the roles and functions of these institutions becomes a breeding ground for conflicting views and tensions amongst the leadership structures. Gildenhuys *et al, (1991)* argue that in any society conflict of interest does exist and local government is mainly a process of reconciling this conflict. Gildenhuys further states that conflict reconciliation through local policy and decision

making is vital for the most common collective needs and the equality allocation and application of scarce resources among competing needs, and to serve their communities these conflicting issues need to be resolved (Gildenhuys, 1991:124).

5.4 The relationship between traditional leaders and ward councillors and its implication for development

According to the responses of the interviewees there are clear negative relations between traditional leaders and ward councillors. The findings from the focus group participants indicate that there ought to be positive relations between these institutions of governance if they are to work together in bringing development or development programmes to their people. However, respondents state that it appears as if both these institutions are pulling in different directions.

It was highlighted that the relationship between traditional leaders and the ward councillor in this context is so negative to the point where a meeting can be called by the ward councillor on the same day and time as one scheduled by the traditional leader. This causes confusion among community members as to which meeting to attend. The general consensus regarding this negative relationship is that it emanates from the unclear definition of the roles and functions of both these institutions, particularly those of traditional leaders. A clear understanding of the roles of these institutions and how they are to co-operate and ensure participation of the community members is essential.

What one gathers from the area of study and from the researcher's observations is that between these institutions there is a communication breakdown or lack of

communication; both these institutions do what they feel is right for them with no participation from community members. This is evident when the ward councillor of the area states, "You can't please everyone and I am not forced to work with traditional leaders." He further states that he is not forced to work with traditional leaders yet he tries to involve them sometimes and when there seems to be conflict he stays out of it and does what the policies tell him to do.

Traditional leaders feel there is no relationship at all between them and the elected councillor and state that there is nothing they can do, so as leaders they do what they feel is right for them and their community members. Gildenhuys *et al.* (1991:125) argue that in any society conflict of interest will be there but local government should reconcile this conflict.

According to Kanyane (2007:318) traditional leaders claim stewardship power over municipalities as custodians of African traditions in some areas. This paradox of power relations becomes the potential cause of concern because at times the development focus of local government is obstructed as municipal and tribal councillors do not agree, while development is desperately expected by the communities they serve. Kanyane (2007) states that this conflict is based on the fact that traditional leaders are solely concerned about the way in which municipal councillors conduct themselves in their community development approach. To the traditional leaders, municipal councillors encroach on their traditional affairs by implementing development plans in their areas without consultation; therefore, these two often view each other with distrust.

In areas where both these institutions are present, development processes are affected, and this seems to be the case in the Tyolomnqa-Ncera village where community members feel that development in their area is hindered. One of the major issues raised was that of meetings being scheduled for the same time and date by the traditional leader and the ward councillor. This inconveniences the community members as they are confused as to which meeting to attend.

Community members state that they are still unable to access some of the basic facilities such as proper roads, RDP houses, water and electricity, and this shows the extent to which development is hindered, yet they have two government structures in their villages to oversee the delivery of these resources.

One of the perpetrators of this slow development is demarcation, which has been the main challenge of this area. This is because the community has two traditional leaders and one ward councillor. The ward councillor states that in most cases, he will have a development project which he feels is essential for the community members and he wishes to implement it in the villages. Traditional leader A might be willing to work with him on this project yet, traditional leader B might not be in favour of the project and, therefore, they cannot proceed until traditional leader B is convinced about the project. This sometimes leads to the termination of the project which means no development for the community members.

The negative impact of not having clear roles and functions of traditional leaders is affecting development, as is demarcation. There is clearly a need for local government officials and government as a whole to take note of the demarcation issue and the effect

it has on community development and as a contributor to the on-going conflict between both these government institutions: not looking only at Tyolomnqa-Ncera but focusing on all rural areas which are affected by the issue of demarcation.

5.5 Integration of traditional leaders and ward councillors by the Eastern Cape local government

The issue of power concentration and its potential abuse by the few that have control over it is a major issue of the liberal theory. The core doctrine of liberalism is the protection of individuals and their rights. The state is seen as responsible for protecting the rights of individuals. This liberal view of individuals' rights is entrenched in the Bill of Rights as contained in chapter 2, sections 9 to 35 of the South African Constitution. What the liberal theory says is that the state is seen as responsible for protecting the rights of its people and this becomes a challenge when the state fails to clearly highlight or enforce policies that define the roles and functions of traditional leaders.

The failure of the state to formulate a clear policy that clearly defines the roles and functions of traditional leaders and ward councillors can be viewed as a failure to protect its people and to ensure development. It is widely recognised that conflict between traditional leaders and ward councillors/local government is endemic in the rural Eastern Cape and is stifling development in communal areas. However, the question is what the Eastern Cape local government has done to try and mend this ongoing conflict and to integrate these governmental institutions.

According to the findings of this study the Eastern Cape local government has done little to integrate these institutions. Community members acknowledge an induction that was facilitated by municipal officials and the SALGA official when the ward councillors were appointed. In this induction ward councillors were introduced to their communities and community members and also to the traditional leaders; however, there has not been any programme implemented that focuses on integrating and reconciling these institutions.

Traditional leaders acknowledge that they sit in council meetings but they do not have voting power in these meetings. SALGA and the municipality office/local government have tried using the induction as their integration strategy. These officials from these sectors point out, though, that what is urgently needed is a policy which will clearly outline the roles and function of traditional leadership and ward councillors' institutions and also enforce cooperation between these institutions. This is said to be the only solution in curbing the ongoing conflict between these institutions.

The above findings and arguments highlight the failure of the Eastern Cape local government to integrate the institutions of traditional leaders and ward councillors. The role of local government is minimal as there are no platforms to engage and solve tensions between traditional leadership and ward councillor institutions.

Integration in these communities is essential, and government/local government needs to be the driving force. This is the argument raised by the integration school of thought and their view is essentially the crisis of governance. This position follows the calls in recent years, by both African scholars and Western donor agencies, to involve

traditional authorities in the governance of 'modern' African states. These calls have arisen as a result of the social changes that have transformed African social and political landscapes. Several scholars have observed the combination of Western-style democracy, which is based on the notion of political and social rights of individuals with the ethnic-based collectivism characteristic of African societies (Owusu, 1991: 369).

To such scholars, the problem of governance is to recognise and satisfy the goals and aspirations of different groups and their leaders as per Gildenhuys (1991: 69) argument that in a society people share different views or ideas which can sometimes leader in conflicts. Based on this assumption the World Bank argues that the institutional crisis in Africa cannot be resolved by relying exclusively either on external enclave transplant institutions or on purely traditional institutions, and that neither total 'institutional transplant' nor 'traditional fundamentalism' is a viable alternative for Africa (World Bank, 1992). Thus, the integrationists argue for the idea of integrating traditional governance structures into modern structures of governance to ensure effective and efficient governance on the continent.

5.6 Conclusion
The relationship between the traditional leaders and the ward councillor with regard to service delivery and community development in Tyolomnqa-Ncera village is a great challenge that needs new strategies of intervention by the Eastern Cape local government and relevant stakeholders. It is clear that the undefined role of both these institutions is a major challenge which acts as a catalyst to the already ignited fire in this village. The next chapter presents the conclusions and recommendations of the study at hand.

Chapter Six: Conclusions and recommendations

6.1 Introduction

This study set out to examine the power dynamics between traditional leaders and the ward councillor of Tyolomnqa-Ncera village in East London and the implications of such power dynamics for development and service delivery. The study paid specifically close attention to the roles and responsibilities of the two government institutions and the extent to which the two are integrated. From the findings and discussions provided in the previous chapters, the following conclusions and recommendations are made.

6.2 Traditional Leaders and Ward Councilors' Role and Function
6.2.1 Traditional Leader's Role

Traditional leaders in Tyolomnqa-Ncera village are still recognised and play a crucial role in the lives of rural communities just like in all other villages in South Africa. Based on the findings of the study the following conclusions can be drawn:

1. The findings show that community members from Tyolomnqa-Ncera village have a clear understanding of what traditional leaders and ward councillors are. The community members have understanding of the processes of getting these government institutions into office. The participants were able to differentiate between the processes of how traditional leaders assume power and how ward councillors are elected into office.

The concept of developmental local government is something new in rural communities so it is still not understood by many rural communities. Tyolomnqa-Ncera community

members have an understanding and a clear definition of what a traditional leader and ward councillor is, but they do not understand the concept of developmental local government. To this community and others like it, it is not clear what demarcations exist in terms of authority between traditional leaders and ward councillors. The challenge is in knowing where the role and function of each begins and ends. This then presses the need for intervention by the local government to assist by identifying and spelling out clearly the roles and functions of the two institutions in rural communities, and clearly demarcate their areas of jurisdiction.

6.2.2 Traditional Leader's Functions and Demarcations

2. Participants indicated that development in rural areas should be the responsibility of traditional leaders together with ward councillors. However, separating the roles and functions of traditional leaders and ward councillors is a challenging issue. Participants stated that it is difficult to point out the current roles and functions of the two institutions as they seem to overlap. They mentioned that it is difficult to decipher the roles and functions of traditional leaders from those of ward councillors. The study observes that this state of affairs was unknown in the past.

The role of traditional leaders is of great concern as it is claimed that all the powers and dignity, historically assigned to traditional leaders, have been removed by the current legislative framework that came into being in 1994. However, most participants emphasized the importance of recognizing traditional leaders who, as far as they are concerned, play a crucial role as custodians for communities. On the other hand, the role of ward councillors is to be representatives of their constituents and their immediate

needs. The participants felt that the two government institutions are not working well together and as a result they are not fully functional.

6.2.3 Ward Councillors' Role and Functions

3. From the findings, it is evident that the relations between the traditional leaders and ward councillors are strained. The study finds that the negativity of these relations is soaring to such an extent that the two cannot work together. The relationship is marked with undermining of authority noted in the absconding of each from the other's development meetings.

Community members felt that the traditional leaders and the ward councillor should be working together in developing their community but this is not the case in this village as these institutions are pulling to the opposite sides. This affects delivery of development services such as running water, electricity, proper roads and other basic service deliveries. Consequently, a large number of community members are still not accessing a number of basic services. Traditional leaders and the ward councillor ach do what they feel is right for them without consulting the other or community members. Demarcation seems to be the greatest factor influencing the tension between traditional leaders and the ward councillor. This tension under the ruler-ship of two traditional leaders and one ward councillor is having a negative effect on the villagers.

6.2.4 Power Sharing: Traditional Leaders and Ward Councillors

4. Integration is an essential tool in promoting development in communities even though it is not an easy task for the local developmental government. The

integration strategies that are being implemented by the Eastern Cape local government in this village have not been effective. Participants indicated that local government and SALGA have carried out an induction exercise which was meant to introduce the new ward councillors to traditional leaders of the village, but the responsibilities of the two were not clearly outlined. Traditional leaders admit to having sat in some council meetings. However, they expressed frustrations as they do not exercise any decision making since they are unable to vote in these meetings. This, therefore, reflects on the obscurity of the roles and function of traditional leaders and their position in local government.

6.3 Recommendations of the Study

The recommendations drawn from the findings of this research project are mainly aimed at identification of the roles and functions of the traditional leaders and ward councillors in the developmental local governance of the Buffalo City municipality, with specific focus on Tyolomnqa-Ncera village. This will aid the eradication of the existing tensions and conflicts between the two institutions and those representing them, thus promoting the needed co-operation between them for better service delivery. The following recommendations are made based on the conclusions above:

1. Although community members of Tyolomnqa-Ncera village have a clear understanding of what is and what makes a traditional leader and a ward councillor, they are not clear on the roles and functions of the two. Government should ensure clear identification of the roles of traditional leaders and elected ward councillors (Moloto, 2005:31; Contralesa, 1994:6). The only way co-operation between the two

institutions can be achieved is if the roles and functions of each are clearly defined, as failure to do so is creating tension and animosity between the two. This, in turn, creates confusion amongst the local rural community. The study, therefore, recommends that a policy document or framework be developed that, apart from highlighting a clear definition of what constitutes a traditional leader and a ward councillor, also clearly outlines the roles and functions of the two institutions. The document should also outline the Key Performance Areas of each institution.

2. For the purposes of development and proper delivery of services, traditional leaders and ward councillors of Tyolomnqa-Ncera village need to co-operate. It is recommended that traditional leaders as well as their authority be better recognised. This will promote co-operation and harmony in these rural villages. The local government should facilitate the co-operation of traditional leaders and ward councillors by promoting the respect due to each, for instance allowing views of traditional leaders to be heard and taken into consideration during meetings.

Traditional leaders should be reassured of their position as custodians of their rural local communities' interests. The local council should also allow traditional leaders to play a role similar to that of the National Council of the Provinces at national level, that is, traditional leaders participate in all deliberations on matters affecting their province and communities (South Africa, 1996:65).

This will assist in bridging the gap that currently exists between municipalities and traditional leaders and will encourage traditional leaders to participate in rural development. The relationship amongst traditional leaders should be fostered such that they can help with networking of ideas that help local government.

3. Empowerment programmes should be initiated for traditional leaders, ward councillors and rural community members so that all these stakeholders are able to utilise all resources within their communities and to prevent unnecessary competition between traditional leaders and ward councillors.

Municipalities should continuously provide appropriate training programmes and workshops that would capacitate traditional leaders and ward councillors to work together in developing their communities.

Community educational programmes should be arranged by municipalities with help from traditional leaders, ward councillors and other relevant stakeholders in rural areas aimed at improving co-ordination among these stakeholders to enhance development and promotion of service delivery.

Municipalities should also ensure that a monitoring and evaluation system, based on roles and functions, is formulated. This system will separately assess the performances of traditional leaders and ward councillors in serving their communities.

Drawing from pluralist theory which is based on accommodating different interests from different groups, the study recommends that consultation should be done with parties, traditional leaders and ward councillors, on all issues affecting development in the community.

The study also recommends that platforms should be awarded to both traditional leaders and ward councillors as promoted by the liberal theorist. To promote smooth partnership between the two, traditional leaders and ward councillors, both parties should be allowed to contribute and attend meetings of whatever magnitude.

References

Atkinson, D. & Reitzes, M. 1998. From tier to a sphere: Local government in the new South African constitution order. Johannesburg. Heinemann.

Barbour, R. (2008). Introducing qualitative research: a student's guide to the craft of doing qualitative research. London: Sage.

Beall, J., Mkhize, S. & Vawda, S. 2004. Navigating tradition, traditional authorities and governance in eThekwini Metropolitan Municipality, South Africa. International Development Planning Review, 26(4), pp. 457–476.

Bekke, G.M., Toonen, A.J. & Perry, J.L. 1996. Civil service system in corporative perspective. Bloomington: Indian University Press

Bevir, M .2004. Governance and interpretation: What are the implications of post foundationalism? Public Administration, 82 (3), pp. 605-624

 Bless, C. & Higson-Smith, C. 1995. Fundamentals of social research methods: An African perspective, (2nd ed.). Cape Town: Juta.

Botes, P.S., Brynard, P.A., Fourie, D.J. & Roux, N.L. 1996. Public administration and management: a guide to central, regional and municipal administration and management, (2nd edn.). Pretoria: Kagiso Publishers.

Cele, S.B.2008. Discussion paper on the role of traditional leaders in democratic SA: A closer look at the relations between the traditional leaders and local government councillors. Durban.

Craythrone, D.L.1997. Municipal administration: A handbook. Cape Town: Juta.

Cloete, J.J.N. 1996. Accountable government and administration for the Republic of South Africa. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

Creswell, J. 2009. Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed methods approachs. Thousand Oaks. Sage.

Conger, J. 1998. Qualitative research as the cornerstone methodology for understanding leadership. Leadership Quarterly, 9(1), pp. 107-121.

Denzin, N. K. and Lincoln, Y. S. 2000. Handbook of Qualitative Research 2nd Edition. Sage Publications Inc: Thousand Oaks, California, USA.

De Vos, A.S., Strydom, H., Fouché, C.B. & Delport, C.S.L. 2005. Research at grassroots – For the social sciences and human service professions. (3rd edn.). Pretoria: Van Schaik.

Dunleavy, P .1991. Democracy, bureaucracy & public choice: Economic explanations in political science. New York: Prentice Hall.

Fox, W. & Wissink, H.F. 1991. Macro-organisation of public institutions. Stellenbosch: University Publishers

Friedman, M. 1956. The Basic Principles of Liberalism. Wabash College.

Gaus, G. 2000. Political concepts and political theories. Boulder: Westview Press.

Gildenhuys, H.W. & Wissink, H. 1991. Public macro-organisation. Juta .

Kanyane, M.H. 2007. The paradox between local government and traditional leaders in South Africa: Bridging the divide, Journal of Public Administration.Volume 42: Issue 3; Publication Date: **2007**; Pages: 317 - 323;.

Keulder, C. 1998. Traditional leaders and local government in Africa: Lessons

for South Africa. Pretoria: HSRC.

Khan, S., and Lootvoet, B. 2001. Tribal Authority and Service Delivery in the Durban

Khan, S. 2002. Tribal Authority and Service in the Durban Uni-City.

Hysamen,G.K. 1994. Methodology for the social and behavioural sciences. Bloemfontein: Southern Book Publishers.

Lewis, A.W. 1967. Politics in West Africa. London: George Allen & Unwin.

Lincoln, Y. & Guba, E. 2000. Paradigmatic controversies, contradictions, and emerging confluences. In N. Denzin & Y. Lincoln, (eds.). Handbook of qualitative research. London: Sage.

Lutabingwa, J., Sabela, T. and Mbatha, J. S. 2006. Traditional Leadership and Local Governments in South Africa: Shared governance is possible. Politeia Vol 25 No1 pp 73-88. Unisa Press.

Mamdani, M. 1996. Citizen and subject: Contemporary Africa and the legacy of late colonialism. Cape Town: David Phillip.

Meer T. and Campbell C. 2007. Traditional Leadership in Democratic South Africa.

Mokgoro, Y. 1994. Traditional authority and democracy in the interim South African Constitution. Johannesburg: Occasional Papers.

Moloka, E.T.1996. "Populism and the politics of chieftancy and nation bulding in new South Africa. Journal of contemporary African Studies19, no.2:176-96.

Mouton, J. 1996. Understanding social research. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

Mudefi, E.2011. Consensus and Contentions Arpund Community Engagement in South African Tertiary Institution: University of Fort Hare.

Ncera Annual Report. 2013. Ncera Annual Report 2011/2012. Ncera Farms (Pty) Ltd.

Ntsebeza, L. 2003. Democracy in South Africa's countryside: Is there a role for traditional authorities? Johannesburg: Interfold.

Ntsebeza, L. 2001. Traditional authorities and rural development. In J. Coetzee, J. Graaff, F. Hendicks and G. Wood (eds)., Development Theory, Policy and practice, Oxford university press, pp. 316-29.

Nthai, S. (2005) Constitutional and legislative framework for traditional leadership in South Africa. In The Seventh Conference on Traditionalism, Political Parties and Democratic Governance in Africa. Pretoria: University of South Africa.

Oomen, B. 1996. Talking tradition: The position and portrayal of traditional leaders in present day South Africa M.A Thesis. University of Leiden.

Owusu, M. 1991. Democracy and Africa: A view from the village. The Journal of Modern African Studies, 30(3), pp. 369–396.

Peires, J.B. 2000. Traditional leaders in purgatory: Local government in Tsolo, Qumbu and Port St John's, 1990-2000. African Studies, 59, no. 1: 97-114.

Rugege, S. 2002. The institution of traditional leadership and its relation with elected local government. In Seminar Report No. 14, Constitution and Law IV: Colloquium on Local Government Law. Johannesburg: Konrad Adenauer Stiftung.

Rugege S. 2009. Traditional leadership and its future role in local governance. University of Western Cape. Sabinet Gateway.

Sakyi, E.K. 2003. Gone but not forgotten: Chieftaincy, accountability and state audit in Ghana, 1993–1999. African Sociological Review 7(1), pp. 131–145.

Schwarzmantel, J .1994. The state in contemporary society: an introduction. New York: Harvester Wheatsheaf.

Shank, G. (2002). Qualitative research: A personal skills approach. New Jersey: Merril Prentice Hall.

Singleton, Jr. R.A.; Straits, B.C. & Straits, M.M. 1993. Approaches to social research. New York: Oxford University Press.

Skinner, E.P. 2007. African political cultures and the problems of government. African Studies Quarterly. http://web.africa.ufl.edu/asq/v2/v2i3a3.htm

Strauss, S. & Corbin, R.G. 1998. Basic qualitative research techniques and procedures for developing grounded theory.(2nd ed). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Sithole, P. & Mbele, T. 2008. Fifteen year review on traditional leadership: A research paper. Pretoria: HSRC Publishers.

Terre Blanche, M., Durrheim, K. & Painter, D. (2006). Research in practice. Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press.

Uni-City'. Paper presented at Gouvernance et Gouvenement urbain en Afrique Australe, November 2001, Lusaka.

Van der Waldt, G., Venter, A., Van der Walt, C., Phutiagae, K., Khalo T., Van Niekerk, D. & Nealer, E. 2007. Municipal Management; serving the people 1st Edition, Juta & Company.

Yin, R.K. 2009. Case study research design and methods. London. Sage.

Williams, A. 2003. On the subject of Kings and Queens: Traditional African leadership and the Diaspora imagination. African Studies Quarterly, 6(4), p. 1 [online] URL: http://web.africa.ufl.edu/asq/v6/v6i3a1.htm

World Bank. 1992. Indigenous management practices: Lessons for Africa's management in the 1990s. Washington, DC: Africa Technical Department.

Yin, R.K. 1997. Case study research: Design and methods. Newbury Park: Sage.

Zibi, M.S. 1998. The future of traditional leaders in South Africa. Word and Action, (38), Spring 1998.

Legislative documents

Inkosi Patekile Holomisa, Discussion on Land Rights and Democracy: The Communal Land Rights Bill at the Harold Wolpe Forum Debate, 10 February 2004.

Republic of South Africa Traditional Leadership and Governance Framework Amendment Act, Act 41 of 2003. Pretoria: Government Printers.

Republic of South Africa White Paper on Local Government. 1998. Pretoria: Department of Constitutional Development.

Republic of South Africa. 1996. The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act 108 of 1996. Cape Town: Foremerset Printers.

Republic of South Africa. 1998. Municipal Structures Act 117 of 1998. Pretoria: Government Printers.

Research Interview guide

Focus Group Discussion Items

1. What is your understanding of a traditional leader?

2. What is your understanding of a ward councillor?

3. Do you know who your ward councillor and traditional leaders are?

4. According to your understanding what are the roles and functions of a traditional leader?

5. According to your understanding what are the roles and functions of a ward councillor?

6. Based on your understanding/ observation, how is the relationship between the traditional leaders and ward councillor of this area?

7. Is there any tension between the traditional leaders and ward councillor?

8. If yes, in your view, what are the issues that cause tensions?

9. How can you describe the relationship between the two traditional leaders of the area?

10. How can you describe the relationship between the traditional leaders and the ward councillor of the area?

11. Do these relations affect development and service delivery?

12. How do these relations affect development and service delivery; and to what extent?

13. In your own view how can the issues affecting the relationship between the ward councillor and traditional leaders be resolved, and what should government do to intervene?

Thank you for your valuable input

Research Interview guide

Questions

1. What is your understanding of the roles and functions of:
1.1 traditional leaders and;
1.2 Ward councillors?

2. Are these roles written down anywhere
    2.1 If yes, where

3. What policies are there guiding the institutions of traditional leadership and local government, and what do they say about the roles of these institutions?

4. In areas where both these institutions are present, how are their roles integrated to ensure that they work together in harmony for the good of the community?

5. Are there any problems in the integration of these roles?

    5.1 If yes, what problems are there?

6. What should be done about these problems and what are their effects on the delivery of services and development processes by these institutions?

7. Have there been any strategies implemented to integrate the institution of traditional leadership and ward councillors?

    7.1 If yes, are these strategies effective in integrating and amending conflict between these institutions?

8. What is your personal perceptions regarding these implemented strategies and the whole conflict between the two institutions?

<div align="center">Thank you for your valuable input</div>

TO WHOM IT MY CONCERN

RE: Request to participate in a Research Study on:..

I write to request your participation in the above mentioned research study to be conducted during the period of July and September. The study is being conducted as part of a Master's degree pursued at University of Fort Hare– East London. I appeal for your support towards the success of this worthwhile study, which aims at assessing the power dynamics with a purpose to improve delivery of development services and projects. Such support may include: being part of a focus group discussion or personal interview; granting permission for the study to be conducted in an area under your leadership or management, identifying potential interviewees etc.

In line with the ethical standards of social research, the information you provide in the interviews or focus group discussions will only be used for purposes of this study and will be treated anonymously and strictly confidential.
If you agree to participate in the study, kindly fill the consent form attached overleaf.

Your co-operation in this regard is highly appreciated.

Yours sincerely

THANDEKA KHOWA
UFH 50 CHURCH STREET
EAST LONDON
5201
Cell: 073 9783484

<div align="center">

CONSENT FORM

</div>

Title of research

THE POWER DYNAMICS BETWEEN TRADITIONAL LEADERS AND WARD COUNCILORS: IMPLICATIONS FOR DEVELOPMENT AT TYOLOMNQA-NCERA VILLAGE IN EAST LONDON

Please Initial Box

1. I confirm that I have read and understand the information sheet for the above study and have had the opportunity to ask questions. ☐

2. I understand that my participation is voluntary and that I am free to withdraw at any time, without giving reason. ☐

3. I agree to take part in the above study. ☐

_____   _____   _____

Name of Participant   Date   Signature

_____   _____   _____

Name of Researcher   Date   Signature